



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales
(The Official Record)**

Dydd Mercher, 8 Hydref 2003

Wednesday, 8 October 2003

Cynnwys
Contents

- 3 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog Cyllid
Questions to the Finance Minister
- 14 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad
Questions to the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside
- 23 Datganiad ar Ymgynghoriad yr Adolygiad o'r Cynllun Datblygu Cynaliadwy
Statement on the Consultation on the Review of the Sustainable Development Scheme
- 37 Datganiad ar Ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i Ymchwiliad Victoria Climbié
Statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's Response to the Victoria Climbié Inquiry
- 50 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Diwygiadau ynghylch Rhagnodi gan Nyrsys Atodol ac Annibynnol) (Cymru) 2003
Approval of the National Health Service (Amendments Concerning Supplementary and Independent Nurse Prescribing) (Wales) Regulations 2003
- 53 Adolygiad Canol Tymor o Raglenni'r Cronfeydd Strwythurol
The Mid-term Review of Structural Funds Programmes
- 92 Gohirio Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.36
Suspension of Standing Order No. 6.36
- 93 Dadl Fer: Cau Swyddfeydd Post Trefol
Short Debate: The Closure of Urban Post Offices

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog Cyllid Questions to the Finance Minister

Gonestrwydd Ariannol Cyrff Cyhoeddus a Noddir gan y Cynulliad The Financial Probity of Assembly Sponsored Public Bodies

Q1 David Melding: Will the Minister make a statement on measures in place to ensure the financial probity of Assembly sponsored public bodies? (OAQ28518)

The Finance Minister (Sue Essex): All Assembly sponsored public bodies have a designated accounting officer with personal responsibility for the regularity and propriety of expenditure and for giving evidence to the Assembly's Audit Committee on these matters. ASPB chairs and board members also have a duty to ensure that ASPBs act in a way that promotes high standards of public finance.

David Melding: Do you agree that the way that the public purse is distributed and spent is vital to achieving the maximum benefit from public policies? This requires people to have the highest standards and professional competence when dealing with often vast sums of money.

Sue Essex: I agree. A degree of trust and responsibility is placed on both the officers employed by ASPBs and on council members and chairs. That is the answer as it stands. There are also systems that we, as an Assembly Government, through remit letters, guidance, regular monitoring and meetings with ASPBs, put in place to emphasise that degree of trust and responsibility.

Peter Black: Do you agree that, since the Assembly was established in 1999, there have been a number of incidents, which the Audit Committee has investigated, of failures of compliance on the part of ASPBs? That has raised serious questions about accountability and about clear lines of

C1 David Melding: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y mesurau sy'n bod i sicrhau gonestrwydd ariannol cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad? (OAQ28518)

Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex): Mae gan bob corff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad swyddog cyfrifo penodedig sydd â chyfrifoldeb personol dros reoleidd-dra a gwedduster gwariant a thros roi tystiolaeth i Bwyllgor Archwilio'r Cynulliad ar y materion hyn. Mae gan gadeiryddion ac aelodau bwrdd CCNC ddyletswydd hefyd i sicrhau bod CCNC yn gweithredu mewn ffordd sy'n hyrwyddo safonau uchel o ran arian cyhoeddus.

David Melding: A gytunwch fod y ffordd y caiff arian y wlad ei ddosbarthu a'i wario yn hollbwysig i gyflawni'r budd mwyaf posibl o bolisiau cyhoeddus? Mae hyn yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i bobl gyrraedd y safonau a'r cymhwysedd proffesiynol uchaf wrth ddelio â symiau mawr o arian.

Sue Essex: Cytunaf. Rhoddir rhywfaint o ymddiriedaeth a chyfrifoldeb ar y swyddogion a gyflogir gan CCNC ac ar aelodau'r cyngor a'r cadeiryddion. Dyna'r ateb fel y saif. Yr ydym ni hefyd, fel Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, drwy lythyrau cylch gwaith, canllawiau, monitro rheolaidd a chyfarfodydd â CCNC, yn rhoi systemau ar waith i bwysleisio'r ymddiriedaeth honno a'r cyfrifoldeb hwnnw.

Peter Black: A gytunwch, ers i'r Cynulliad gael ei sefydlu yn 1999, inni weld nifer o achosion o fethu â chydymffurfio ar ran CCNC, yr ymchwiliodd y Pwyllgor Archwilio iddynt? Mae hynny wedi codi cwestiynau difrifol ynghylch atebolrwydd ac am linellau atebolrwydd clir. A gredwch, yng

accountability. Do you believe that, in the light of that, we should consider bringing ASPBs closer to the Assembly, making Ministers more directly accountable for the way ASPBs behave?

Sue Essex: Since devolution and the advent of the Assembly, there is a closer relationship per se. The fact that ASPBs regularly come to Committee meetings to discuss corporate plans and other points emphasises that degree of closeness, as does the fact that we expect ASPBs to be part of our strategic delivery. As I said in answer to David, there is also a great deal of closeness between Assembly Ministers and ASPB chairs—certainly more so than in the days of the former Welsh Office. Quinquennial reviews, which we have introduced since devolution, also look at the form and nature of ASPBs.

Janet Davies: Could I push you further on the steps that you are taking to ensure that ASPB accounting officers fully understand the financial rules of the public sector? Also, what steps are you taking to ensure that new accounting officers have sufficient business acumen to be able to spot any difficult challenges with regard to financial probity that may lie with the schemes that they operate, or within any part of their organisation?

Sue Essex: The relationship with accounting officers is primarily conducted through our accounting officer, the Permanent Secretary. I understand that the Permanent Secretary has recently met accounting officers, and will further meet ASPBs later this week, to reinforce some of the lessons learned from Audit Committee findings and from wider observations. Your point about new accounting officers is a good one, and we may consider that to ensure that the rules of the game are understood. I would be happy to consider that further.

ngoleuni hynny, y dylem ystyried dwyn CCNC yn agosach at y Cynulliad, gan wneud Gweinidogion yn fwy uniongyrchol atebol am y ffordd y mae CCNC yn ymddwyn?

Sue Essex: Ers datganoli a dyfodiad y Cynulliad, mae perthynas agosach ynddi'i hun. Mae'r ffaith bod CCNC yn dod yn rheolaidd i gyfarfodydd Pwyllgorau i drafod cynlluniau corfforaethol a phwyntiau eraill yn pwysleisio'r agosrwydd hwnnw, fel y gwna'r ffaith ein bod yn disgwyl i CCNC fod yn rhan o'r gwaith o gyflawni ein nodau strategol. Fel y dywedais yn fy ateb i David, mae cryn agosrwydd hefyd rhwng Gweinidogion y Cynulliad a chadeiryddion CCNC—yn sicr mwy felly nag yn ystod oes yr hen Swyddfa Gymreig. Mae adolygiadau pum mlynedd, a gyflwynasom ers datganoli, hefyd yn edrych ar ffurf a natur CCNC.

Janet Davies: A allaf bwysu arnoch ymhellach ynglŷn â'r camau yr ydych yn eu cymryd i sicrhau bod swyddogion cyfrifo'r CCNC yn llwyr ddeall rheolau ariannol y sector cyhoeddus? Hefyd, pa gamau a gymerwch i sicrhau bod gan swyddogion cyfrifo newydd ddigon o grebwyll busnes i allu canfod unrhyw heriau anodd o ran gonestrwydd ariannol a allai fod yn y cynlluniau a weithredant, neu o fewn unrhyw ran o'u sefydliad?

Sue Essex: Cynhelir y berthynas â'r swyddogion cyfrifo yn bennaf drwy ein swyddog cyfrifo, yr Ysgrifennydd Parhaol. Deallaf fod yr Ysgrifennydd Parhaol wedi cyfarfod â swyddogion cyfrifo yn ddiweddar, a bydd yn cyfarfod â CCNC yn ddiweddarach yr wythnos hon, i atgyfnerthu rhai o'r gwersi a ddysgwyd o ganfyddiadau'r Pwyllgor Archwilio ac o arsylwadau ehangach. Mae eich pwynt ynghylch swyddogion cyfrifo newydd yn un da, ac efallai yr ystyriwn hynny er mwyn sicrhau bod rheolau'r gêm yn ddealliedig. Byddwn yn fodlon ystyried hynny ymhellach.

Y Portffolio Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol The Social Justice Portfolio Budget

Q2 Mick Bates: Will the Minister make a statement on the allocation of the social justice portfolio budget? (OAQ28520)

C2 Mick Bates: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y modd y dyrannwyd cyllideb y portffolio cyfiawnder cymdeithasol?

(OAQ28520)

Sue Essex: The allocation of resources within the social justice portfolio is primarily a matter for the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration.

Sue Essex: Mae dyrannu adnoddau o fewn y portffolio cyfiawnder cymdeithasol yn fater yn bennaf i'r Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio.

Mick Bates: Recent evidence has shown that many drug users are dying while waiting for rehabilitation treatment. In the words of one addict, Christopher Walter, you die before you get help. When will you seek advice from the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration and ensure that this desperate wait is ended by providing sufficient funds so that we can have rehabilitation treatment throughout Wales?

Mick Bates: Mae tystiolaeth ddiweddar wedi dangos bod llawer o ddefnyddwyr cyffuriau yn marw tra'n aros am driniaeth ailsefydlu. Yng ngeiriau un sy'n gaeth i gyffuriau, Christopher Walter, yr ydych yn marw cyn y cewch help. Pryd y byddwch yn gofyn i'r Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio am gyngor a sicrhau y daw'r aros enbydus hwn i ben drwy ddarparu digon o arian fel y gallwn gael triniaeth adfywio ledled Cymru?

Sue Essex: You raise a serious point about those in need of support. The drug and alcohol misuse budget has been put in the social justice portfolio. I know that the Minister, Edwina Hart, is aware of the needs across Wales and is listening to the points that you have raised.

Sue Essex: Codwch bwynt difrifol ynghylch y rhai y mae angen cymorth arnynt. Rhoddwyd y gyllideb camddefnyddio cyffuriau ac alcohol yn y portffolio cyfiawnder cymdeithasol. Gwn fod y Gweinidog, Edwina Hart, yn ymwybodol o'r anghenion ledled Cymru a'i bod yn gwrandao ar y pwyntiau a godwyd gennych.

Leanne Wood: There have been significant difficulties in tracking the amount of money spent on substance misuse within the health service. Can you outline the steps that you intend to take to ensure that that money is tracked and monitored to confirm that it is spent effectively?

Leanne Wood: Bu anawsterau sylweddol wrth olrhain yr arian a werir ar drin achosion o gamddefnyddio sylweddau yn y gwasanaeth iechyd. A allwch amlinellu'r camau y bwriadwch eu cymryd i sicrhau bod yr arian hwnnw yn cael ei olrhain a'i fonitro i gadarnhau y caiff ei wario'n effeithiol?

Sue Essex: I am aware of the concerns. The drug and alcohol money is used in various ways to address various needs, and I believe that it may have been used for physical provision as well as other support. I know that the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration is concerned that that tracking take place so that we can ensure that the money reaches those in need.

Sue Essex: Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r pryderon. Defnyddir yr arian ar gyfer cyffuriau ac alcohol mewn amrywiol ffyrdd i fynd i'r afael ag anghenion amrywiol, a chredaf iddo gael ei ddefnyddio efallai ar gyfer darpariaeth gorfforol yn ogystal â chymorth arall. Gwn fod y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio am sicrhau bod y gwaith olrhain hwnnw yn digwydd fel y gallwn sicrhau bod yr arian yn cyrraedd y rhai sydd mewn angen.

Mark Isherwood: The crisis in Welsh social housing, and in social rent and home ownership across Wales, was detailed in graphic terms to those Members who attended the North Wales Regional Committee meeting last Friday. Will the Minister allocate sufficient budget to the

Mark Isherwood: Eglurwyd yr argyfwng o ran tai cymdeithasol yng Nghymru a rhent cymdeithasol a pherchenogaeth ledled Cymru, yn fanwl gywir i'r Aelodau hynny a fynychodd gyfarfod Pwyllgor Rhanbarth y Gogledd ddydd Gwener diwethaf. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddyrannu digon o gyllideb i'r

social justice portfolio to allow a significant increase in Welsh social housing and in innovative schemes that can be used as a vehicle for wider social and economic regeneration?

Sue Essex: The draft budget will be available next week, so I will not go into detail about allocations now. The issue of affordable housing is complex, and I know that the Committee that Alun Ffred chairs discussed it this morning. It is not just a matter of money, but of using planning, planning conditions and housing need surveys. The Minister and the Committee have been discussing this issue—I think that Janice is present—and will be considering it further.

portffolio cyfiawnder cymdeithasol i ganiatáu cynnydd sylweddol mewn tai cymdeithasol yng Nghymru ac mewn cynlluniau arloesol y gellir eu defnyddio fel cyfrwng ar gyfer adfywio cymdeithasol ac economaidd ehangach?

Sue Essex: Bydd y gyllideb ddrafft ar gael yr wythnos nesaf, felly nid af i fanylu ar ddyraniadau yn awr. Mae tai fforddiadwy yn fater cymhleth, a gwn fod y Pwyllgor a gadeirir gan Alun Ffred wedi ei drafod y bore yma. Nid mater o arian yn unig ydyw, ond o ddefnyddio gwaith cynllunio, amodau cynllunio ac arolygon anghenion tai. Bu'r Gweinidog a'r Pwyllgor yn trafod y mater hwn—credaf fod Janice yn bresennol—a byddant yn ei ystyried ymhellach.

Blaenoriaethau'r Gyllideb Budget Priorities

Q3 Jenny Randerson: Will the Minister make a statement on budget priorities? (OAQ28489)

C3 Jenny Randerson: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar flaenoriaethau'r gyllideb? (OAQ28489)

Q4 Sandy Mewies: Will the Minister make a statement on her funding priorities for the next budget planning round? (OAQ28493)

C4 Sandy Mewies: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar ei blaenoriaethau cyllido ar gyfer y cylch cynllunio cyllideb nesaf? (OAQ28493)

Q7 Carl Sargeant: Could the Minister identify the Government's funding priorities over the next budget planning round? (OAQ28492)

C7 Carl Sargeant: A wnaiff y Gweinidog nodi blaenoriaethau cyllido'r Llywodraeth yn ystod y cylch cynllunio cyllideb nesaf? (OAQ28492)

Sue Essex: Allocations for next year, and indicative allocations for subsequent years, will be made in the draft budget, which I will publish on 14 October. The Government published its priorities last month in 'Wales: A Better Country'.

Sue Essex: Gwneir dyraniadau ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf, a dyraniadau dynodol ar gyfer blynyddoedd dilynol, yn y gyllideb ddrafft, a gyhoeddaf ar 14 Hydref. Cyhoeddodd y Llywodraeth ei blaenoriaethau y mis diwethaf yn 'Cymru: Gwlad Well'.

Jenny Randerson: You will be aware that the Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport made an announcement about funding for the arts outside Cardiff last week, in which he indicated that only £0.25 million will be available next year, and only £1 million in 2005-06. However, £2 million was allocated for this purpose in last year's budget, and that received widespread public support. What has happened to the rest of the money? Perhaps you could tell us whether it is still in the culture budget, allocated to other

Jenny Randerson: Byddwch yn ymwybodol bod y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon wedi gwneud cyhoeddiad ynghylch cyllido'r celfyddydau y tu allan i Gaerdydd yr wythnos diwethaf, lle y dynododd mai dim ond £0.25 miliwn fydd ar gael y flwyddyn nesaf, a dim ond £1 filiwn yn 2005-06. Fodd bynnag, dyrannwyd £2 filiwn at y diben hwn yng nghyllideb y llynedd, a bu cefnogaeth gyhoeddus gyffredinol i hynny. Beth sydd wedi digwydd i weddill yr arian? Efallai y gallech ddweud

activities, or whether it has been moved to another portfolio. Will you look again at plans for this £2 million? It is important to the confidence of people outside Cardiff in arts spending in Wales.

Sue Essex: Alun Pugh, the Minister for culture, gave a clear response to that. It is primarily his responsibility to deal with the allocation of money within his portfolio.

Sandy Mewies: I was fortunate to attend the opening of Ysgol Maes Glas recently. It is in Greenfield, in Holywell, which is in my constituency, and is a brand-new £3.2 million primary school. Such high-quality investment is indicative of Flintshire County Council's commitment to making high-quality education a county-wide priority. However, the council faces difficulties in funding such massive commitments. I hope that you will continue to make education a Government priority, and that, in doing so, you will work with the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning to keep under review the funding formula. Will you also continue to give your support to those councils that make good-quality education a top priority? While I understand how the formula works, my fear is that continued disparities in funding will have a detrimental impact on education in Flintshire.

Sue Essex: I am pleased to hear about the new school on your patch. However, revenue support grant funding in Flintshire was 7.2 per cent, which is a substantial uplift. I understand that Flintshire spent more than its allocated sum within that, at well over 10 per cent—the money is not hypothecated, but indicative sums are given. That indicates the priority that Flintshire has given to education. Members have asked many questions about education in Flintshire. On my recent visit I talked to the council about the situation. It is absolutely committed to education. I was pleased to see—looking at the outcomes, which we need to do in addition to looking at the inputs—that Flintshire's achievements in education are good.

wrthym a yw yn y gyllideb ddiwylliant o hyd, wedi ei ddyrannu i weithgareddau eraill, neu a gafodd ei symud i bortffolio arall. A edrychwch eto ar gynlluniau ar gyfer y £2 filiwn hyn? Mae'n bwysig i hyder pobl y tu allan i Gaerdydd o ran gwariant ar y celfyddydau yng Nghymru.

Sue Essex: Rhoddodd Alun Pugh, y Gweinidog dros ddiwylliant, ymateb clir i hynny. Ef sy'n bennaf gyfrifol am ymdrin â'r dyraniad arian o fewn ei bortffolio.

Sandy Mewies: Bùm yn ddigon ffodus i fynychu agoriad Ysgol Maes Glas yn ddiweddar. Mae ym Maes-glas, yn Nhreffynnon, sydd yn fy etholaeth i, ac mae'n ysgol gynradd newydd sbon a gostiodd £3.2 miliwn. Mae buddsoddiad o safon fel hyn yn arwydd o ymrwymiad Cyngor Sir y Fflint i wneud addysg o safon yn flaenoriaeth ar draws y sir. Fodd bynnag, mae'r cyngor yn cael anhawster i ariannu ymrwymadau mor fawr â hyn. Gobeithiaf y byddwch yn parhau i wneud addysg yn flaenoriaeth i'r Llywodraeth, ac wrth wneud hynny, y byddwch yn gweithio gyda'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes i barhau i adolygu'r fformiwla gyllido. A barhewch hefyd i gefnogi'r cynghorau hynny sy'n rhoi blaenoriaeth uchel i addysg o safon? Er fy mod yn deall sut mae'r fformiwla yn gweithio, fy mhryder yw y bydd anghyfartaleddau parhaus mewn cyllido yn cael effaith andwyol ar addysg yn sir y Fflint.

Sue Essex: Yr wyf yn falch o glywed am yr ysgol newydd yn eich ardal. Fodd bynnag, 7.2 y cant oedd cyllid grant cynnal refeniw yn sir y Fflint, sy'n gynydd sylweddol. Deallaf fod gwariant sir y Fflint yn fwy na'r swm a ddyrannwyd iddi o fewn hynny, sef ymhell dros 10 y cant—ni chlustnodir yr arian, ond rhoddir symiau dynodol. Mae hynny'n dynodi'r flaenoriaeth y mae sir y Fflint wedi ei rhoi i addysg. Mae Aelodau wedi gofyn llawer o gwestiynau am addysg yn sir y Fflint. Ar fy ymweliad yn ddiweddar siaradais â'r cyngor am y sefyllfa. Mae'n hollol ymrwymedig i addysg. Yr oeddwn yn falch o weld—wrth edrych ar y canlyniadau, rhywbeth y mae angen inni ei wneud yn ogystal ag edrych ar y mewnbwn—bod cyflawniadau sir y Fflint mewn addysg yn dda.

2.10 p.m.

Carl Sargeant: To follow on from the question of the other directly elected Member from Flintshire, I am proud that this Government is committed to improving the quality of school buildings in Wales. It is a welcome change from the years of neglect under Tory rule. In the last Assembly, £300 million was spent on improving school buildings across Wales. This Government is committed to spending an additional £560 million to finish the job. Will you prioritise this Welsh-flavour commitment and, with the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, target those schools across Wales, including those in north Wales and Flintshire, that are most in need of this valuable assistance?

Sue Essex: We have a proud record over the last four years of putting money into new school buildings, and a proud record on education overall. School buildings are a massive issue for people across Wales, because years of neglect and underinvestment have left many children in extremely unpleasant situations. Jane has allocated substantial sums in her budget for the school buildings improvement grant schemes. That money is distributed using a formula, which is interesting because we are able to refine it once the asset management plans have come in. They will be crucial to establishing a basis of need. Until you see the situation of local authorities and individual schools in this regard, you cannot measure need accurately. I will be interested, particularly wearing my local government hat, to see what comes forward. I emphasise the commitment that Jane has made to the phased and staged programme of substantial spend to all local authorities over the years up to 2010.

Alun Ffred Jones: Yn wyneb y newid yn y gyfradd gyfnewid rhwng y bunt a'r ewro, a fu i'r Llywodraeth ystyried cynyddu rhan o'r gyllideb ar gyfer arian cyfatebol y cronfeydd strwythurol? Os nad ydyw, o ble y daw'r arian angenrheidiol hwnnw?

Sue Essex: In terms of what we are trying to

Carl Sargeant: Yn dilyn cwestiwn yr Aelod arall a etholwyd yn uniongyrchol o sir y Fflint, yr wyf yn falch bod y Llywodraeth hon yn ymrwymedig i wella ansawdd adeiladau ysgolion yng Nghymru. Mae'n newid calonogol o'r blynyddoedd o esgeulustod o dan reolaeth y Torïaid. Yn y Cynulliad diwethaf, gwariwyd £300 miliwn ar wella adeiladau ysgolion ledled Cymru. Mae'r Llywodraeth hon yn ymrwymedig i wario £560 miliwn ychwanegol er mwyn gorffen y gwaith. A roddwch y flaenoriaeth i'r ymrwymiad Cymreig hwn a, chyda'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, dargedu'r ysgolion hynny ledled Cymru, gan gynnwys y rhai yn y Gogledd a sir y Fflint, sydd â'r angen mwyaf am y cymorth gwerthfawr hwn?

Sue Essex: Mae gennym hanes balch dros y pedair blynedd diwethaf o wario arian ar adeiladau ysgolion newydd, a hanes balch o ran addysg yn gyffredinol. Mae adeiladau ysgolion yn broblem enfawr i bobl ledled Cymru, gan fod blynyddoedd o esgeulustod a thanfuddsoddi wedi gadael llawer o blant mewn sefyllfaoedd eithriadol o amhleserus. Mae Jane wedi dyrannu symiau sylweddol yn ei chyllideb ar gyfer y cynlluniau grant gwella adeiladau ysgolion. Dosberthir yr arian hwnnw gan ddefnyddio fformiwla, sy'n ddiddorol am ein bod yn gallu ei mireinio unwaith y bydd y cynlluniau rheoli asedau gennym. Byddant yn hollbwysig i sefydlu sail angen. Hyd nes yr ystyriwch sefyllfa awdurdodau lleol ac ysgolion unigol fel hyn, ni allwch fesur yr angen yn gywir. Bydd diddordeb gennyf, yn arbennig o safbwynt fy swyddogaeth ym maes llywodraeth leol, i weld beth a gyflwynir. Pwysleisiaf yr ymrwymiad a wnaeth Jane i'r rhaglen o wariant sylweddol a gyflwynir fesul cam i bob awdurdod lleol hyd at 2010.

Alun Ffred Jones: In light of the change in the exchange rate between the pound and the euro, has the Government considered increasing part of the budget for structural funds match funding? If it has not, from where will those essential funds come?

Sue Essex: O ran yr hyn y ceisiwn ei wneud i

do to respond, and certainly to avoid decommitment, we have tried to be as innovative as possible in using budget lines to provide match funding. The primary responsibility for match funding lies with organisations. We are responding to the revaluation and we are—and have done—our best to cope with it.

Jonathan Morgan: The number of NHS beds continues to fall, waiting lists continue to rise, and bedblocking is also increasing because of the reduction in the number of care home beds and domiciliary care home packages. Is it not time for your Government to prioritise spending the health budget on what concerns people most, instead of wasting it on a raft of bureaucrats to help the Minister with her schemes?

Sue Essex: I do not recognise the assumption behind that question, Jonathan; it would be generous to call it a question. Many good things are happening—I am not saying that there are not problems; I would not say that, because to turn the difficulties in the NHS around in a few years would be impossible. It will take considerable time to do that. We said that we would make record investment in the NHS and we have done so. It is working. If you look at the statistics on accident and emergency treatment, you will see positive responses. It is too early for you to prejudge what we will do in the budget. We all feel confident about the changes that Jane has made in setting up the local health boards. I have talked to colleagues in England about this. We are confident that local health boards can bring the delivery of health and social care together. That is one of the most crucial issues.

Kirsty Williams: Given the Labour Government's failure to act upon the findings of the Royal Commission on Long Term Care for the Elderly, do you agree that it should be a priority in the budget-setting process to consider raising personal and capital limits to help people with the financial burden of paying for care? This will also affect the number of beds that are continually blocked in the health service in Wales.

Sue Essex: Jonathan also raised the subject

ymateb, ac yn sicr er mwyn osgoi dadymrwymo, yr ydym wedi ceisio bod mor arloesol â phosibl gan ddefnyddio llinellau cyllideb i ddarparu arian cyfatebol. Sefydliadau sy'n bennaf gyfrifol am arian cyfatebol. Yr ydym yn ymateb i'r adbriso ac yr ydym yn gwneud—ac wedi gwneud—ein gorau i ymdopi ag ef.

Jonathan Morgan: Mae nifer gwelyau'r GIG yn parhau i ostwng, mae rhestrau aros yn parhau i godi, ac mae blocio gwelyau hefyd yn cynyddu oherwydd y gostyngiad yn nifer y gwelyau cartrefi gofal a pheynnau gofal yn y cartref. Onid yw'n bryd i'ch Llywodraeth flaenoriaethu gwario'r gyllideb iechyd ar yr hyn sy'n gofidio pobl fwyaf, yn lle ei wastraffu ar lond gwlad o fiwrocratiaid i helpu'r Gweinidog gyda'i chynlluniau?

Sue Essex: Nid wyf yn cydnabod y dybiaeth y tu ôl i'r cwestiwn hwnnw, Jonathan; hael fyddai ei alw yn gwestiwn. Mae llawer o bethau da yn digwydd—nid dweud ydwyf nad oes problemau; ni fyddwn yn dweud hynny, oherwydd byddai troi'r anawsterau yn y GIG yn llwyddiannau ymhen ychydig flynyddoedd yn amhosibl. Bydd yn cymryd cryn amser i wneud hynny. Dywedasom y byddem yn gwneud y buddsoddiad gorau erioed yn y GIG a gwnaethom hynny. Mae'n gweithio. Os edrychwch ar yr ystadegau ar driniaeth damweiniau ac achosion brys, gwelwch ymatebion cadarnhaol. Mae'n rhy gynnar ichi ragfarnu'r hyn a wnawn yn y gyllideb. Teimla pob un ohonom yn hyderus am y newidiadau a wnaeth Jane i sefydlu'r byrddau iechyd lleol. Yr wyf wedi siarad â chyd-aelodau yn Lloegr ynglŷn â hyn. Yr ydym yn hyderus y gall byrddau iechyd lleol gyflwyno iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol gyda'i gilydd. Dyna un o'r materion pwysicaf.

Kirsty Williams: O gofio methiant Llywodraeth Lafur i weithredu ar ganfyddiadau'r Comisiwn Brenhinol ar Ofal Hirdymor i'r Henoed, a gytunwch y dylai fod yn flaenoriaeth yn y broses gosod cyllideb i ystyried codi terfynau personol a chyfalaf i helpu pobl â baich ariannol i dalu am ofal? Bydd hyn hefyd yn effeithio ar nifer y gwelyau a gaiff eu blocio'n barhaus yn y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru.

Sue Essex: Cododd Jonathan fater blocio

of bedblocking, which is a major issue. Many people across Wales are using hospital beds when they should either be at home or receiving other forms of care. Jane Hutt has made tackling this a priority and has given local authorities additional funding. The Wanless report also noted that this is a problem that we need to crack.

gwelyau hefyd, sy'n fater o bwys. Mae llawer o bobl ledled Cymru yn defnyddio gwelyau ysbyty pan ddylent naill ai fod gartref neu'n derbyn mathau eraill o ofal. Mae mynd i'r afael â hyn yn flaenoriaeth i Jane Hutt ac mae wedi rhoi cyllid ychwanegol i awdurdodau lleol. Nododd adroddiad Wanless hefyd fod hyn yn broblem y mae angen inni ei datrys.

Costau Dodrefnu Costs of Furnishings

Q5 The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne): Will the Minister give an update on the expected costs of furnishings and other non-budgeted aspects of the new Assembly building? (OAQ28476)

C5 Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne): A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am gostau disgwylidig dodrefnu ac agweddau eraill nad ydynt wedi'u cynnwys yn y gyllideb ar gyfer adeilad newydd y Cynulliad? (OAQ28476)

Sue Essex: The reception desk, fixed furniture within the debating Chamber, and general fixtures are included as part of the lump-sum contract awarded to Taylor Woodrow Construction Ltd. However, loose furniture for the building, such as that in the debating Chamber, Committee rooms and public areas, will be procured competitively by the Assembly. Members will be consulted prior to any decisions being made and orders placed.

Sue Essex: Cynhwysir desg y dderbynfa, dodrefn sefydlog o fewn y Siambr ddadlau, a gosodiadau cyffredinol fel rhan o'r contract cyfandaliad a ddyfarnwyd i Taylor Woodrow Construction Ltd. Fodd bynnag, caiff dodrefn rhydd ar gyfer yr adeilad, fel y dodrefn yn y Siambr ddadlau, yr Ystafelloedd pwyllgora a manau cyhoeddus, eu caffael yn gystadleuol gan y Cynulliad. Ymgynghorir ag Aelodau cyn gwneud unrhyw benderfyniad a chyn archebu unrhyw beth.

The cost estimates for furnishing the building must remain commercially confidential, as a competitive procurement process is currently in progress for the procurement of loose furniture. The other costs will become clearer once the scope and specification for the additional items have been reviewed in detail, and the procurement processes for furniture and information and communications technology have been concluded. I hope to be able to report on the costs that are out with the Taylor Woodrow Construction Ltd contract as soon as possible.

Rhaid i'r amcangyfrifon o gostau ar gyfer dodrefnu'r adeilad aros yn gyfrinachol yn fasnachol, gan fod proses gaffael gystadleuol ar waith ar hyn o bryd i gaffael dodrefn rhydd. Daw'r costau eraill yn gliriach unwaith y bydd y cwmpas a'r manylion ar gyfer yr eitemau ychwanegol wedi eu hadolygu'n fanwl, a'r prosesau caffael ar gyfer dodrefn a thechnoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu wedi eu cwblhau. Gobeithiaf y gallaf gyflwyno adroddiad ar y costau sydd y tu allan i gontract Taylor Woodrow Construction Ltd cyn gynted â phosibl.

Nick Bourne: I understand why the precise figures must remain confidential, although the Minister will realise that there is talk of millions of pounds being spent on additional furniture. Can she deny that the costs will include the provision of furniture in the homes of Members and senior civil servants? There is talk of that. Will she also comment of the visit of senior civil servants to

Nick Bourne: Deallaf pam mae'n rhaid i'r union ffigurau aros yn gyfrinachol, er bod y Gweinidog yn sylweddoli bod sôn am wario miliynau o bunnoedd ar ddodrefn ychwanegol. A all wadu y bydd y costau yn cynnwys darparu dodrefn yng nghartrefi Aelodau ac uwch weision sifil? Mae sôn am hynny. A wnaiff sylw hefyd ar ymweliad uwch weision sifil â Chaeredin i ymchwilio

Edinburgh to investigate the spending of money on furniture and other aspects of the project?

Sue Essex: I am sure that you made your first point in all seriousness, but it is an astonishing suggestion. I am looking around at other members of the project steering group. It is the first time that I have heard that suggested; it is not within any realm that I would consider. The procurement is purely for furniture in the new building. If you would like to provide me with any details you may have on the issue, I will look into it.

I believe that a party of eight civil servants went to look at the process in Edinburgh. I think that that included one person who was a member of the project steering team and who would therefore have paid for themselves. The total cost of the visit was £1,400. You have tabled many written questions on this subject, which I am in the process of answering. I hope, on behalf of the First Minister and myself, to give a composite and complete answer to the points you raised in the near future.

Lorraine Barrett: I had intended to ask if you were as disappointed as I was that the Conservatives continue to undermine this project, but Nick Bourne's question was fairly reasonable, even though I am suspicious of what lies behind it. Notwithstanding the procurement process, will you do all you can to ensure that local Welsh suppliers are given the opportunity to submit bids to provide the furniture and any other items needed in the building?

Sue Essex: I endorse your comment that Nick asked a reasonable question. Within the rules—*[Interruption.]*

The Presiding Officer: Order. In order to assist the Minister, I advise all Ministers to take no notice whatsoever of any attempts by Members to interject and thus ask additional supplementary questions.

Sue Essex: Thank you for that wise guidance. I will remember it.

We would hope that local procurement can be achieved within the relevant contract

i'r gwariant ariannol ar ddodrefn ac agweddau eraill ar y prosiect?

Sue Essex: Yr wyf yn siŵr ichi wneud eich pwynt cyntaf o ddifrif, ond mae'n awgrym rhyfeddol. Yr wyf yn edrych o amgylch ar aelodau eraill grŵp llywio'r prosiect. Dyma'r tro cyntaf imi glywed hynny'n cael ei awgrymu; nid yw o fewn unrhyw fyd y byddwn i yn ei ystyried. Caffaeliad ar gyfer dodrefn yn yr adeilad newydd yn unig ydyw. Os hoffech roi unrhyw fanylion a allai fod gennych ar y mater, ymchwiliaf i hyn.

Credaf i barti o wyth gwas sifil fynd i edrych ar y broses yng Nghaeredin. Credaf i hynny gynnwys un person a oedd yn aelod o dîm llywio'r prosiect ac felly a fyddai wedi talu drostynt hwy eu hunain. Cyfanswm cost yr ymweliad oedd £1,400. Yr ydych wedi cyflwyno sawl cwestiwn ysgrifenedig ar y pwnc hwn, yr wyf yn y broses o'u hateb. Gobeithiaf, ar ran y Prif Weinidog a fi fy hun, roi ateb cyflawn a llwyr i'r pwyntiau a godwyd gennych yn y dyfodol agos.

Lorraine Barrett: Yr oeddwn wedi bwriadu gofyn a oeddech mor siomedig â minnau bod y Ceidwadwyr yn parhau i danseilio'r prosiect hwn, ond yr oedd cwestiwn Nick Bourne yn eithaf rhesymol, er fy mod yn ddrwgdybus o'r hyn sydd y tu ôl iddo. Er y broses gaffael, a wnewch chi bopeth y gallwch i sicrhau y rhoddir y cyfle i gyflenwyr Cymru gyflwyno cynigion i ddarparu'r dodrefn ac unrhyw eitemau eraill sydd eu hangen yn yr adeilad?

Sue Essex: Cytunaf â'ch sylw bod Nick wedi gofyn cwestiwn rhesymol. O fewn y rheolau—*[Torri ar draws.]*

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Er mwyn cynorthwyo'r Gweinidog, cynghoraf bob Gweinidog i anwybyddu unrhyw ymdrech gan Aelodau i dorri ar draws a gofyn cwestiynau atodol ychwanegol.

Sue Essex: Diolch ichi am yr arweiniad doeth hwnnw. Byddaf yn ei gofio.

Byddem yn gobeithio y gellir caffael yn lleol o fewn rheolau perthnasol y contract.

rules.

Y Portffolio Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes The Education and Lifelong Learning Portfolio

Q6 Mark Isherwood: Will the Minister make a statement on the financial provision to the education and lifelong learning portfolio? (OAQ28523)

Sue Essex: The funding available to the education and lifelong learning portfolio for 2003-04 stands at £1.18 billion. Allocations for next year, and indicative allocations for subsequent years, will be made in the draft budget, which I will publish next week.

2.20 p.m.

Mark Isherwood: At a time when many educators in north-east Wales, who were referred to earlier, are complaining that excellent output cannot be sustained when they sit at the bottom of the funding league, when unhypothecated spending on school maintenance and repairs has been falling for those years up to 2002 for which records have been provided, when many Welsh further education colleges are running deficits and complaining that they are unable to fund the lifelong learning agenda, when our schools report a workload funding crisis, and when rural schools throughout Wales are threatened with closure, what extra provision is the Minister making for the estimated £4 million cost of piloting the Welsh baccalaureate?

Sue Essex: You paint a picture of education in Wales that I do not recognise, certainly not from my constituency. The word 'crisis' does not come into it. In terms of recent developments, there are around 1,000 new support staff in Welsh schools as a result of our action on teachers' workload. That is real growth and change. There has been a 7.8 per cent increase between 2002-03 and 2003-04. The education main expenditure group has increased by 56 per cent between 1999 and 2003-04, which is a short space of time in terms of governance. That figure does not include the increase through the revenue support grant to local government, which also makes an important contribution to education

C6 Mark Isherwood: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y ddarpariaeth ariannol ar gyfer y portffolio addysg a dysgu gydol oes? (OAQ28523)

Sue Essex: Y cyllid sydd ar gael ar gyfer y portffolio addysg a dysgu gydol oes ar gyfer 2003-04 yw £1.18 biliwn. Gwneir dyraniadau ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf, a dyraniadau dynodol ar gyfer blynyddoedd dilynol, yn y gyllideb ddrafft, a gyhoeddaf yr wythnos nesaf.

Mark Isherwood: Ar adeg pan fo llawer o addysgwyr yn y Gogledd-ddwyrain, y cyfeiriwyd atynt yn gynharach, yn cwyno na ellir cynnal canlyniadau rhagorol pan fyddant ar waelod y gynghrair gyllido, pan fydd gwariant nas clustnodwyd ar gynnal a chadw ac atgyweirio ysgolion wedi bod yn lleihau ar gyfer y blynyddoedd hynny hyd at 2002 y darparwyd cofnodion ar eu cyfer, pan fydd diffygion yng nghyllidebau llawer o golegau addysg bellach yng Nghymru a chwynion na allant ariannu'r agenda dysgu gydol oes, pan fydd ein hysgolion yn nodi bod argyfwng cyllido arnynt o ran baich gwaith, a phan fo bygythiad i gau ysgolion gwledig ledled Cymru, pa ddarpariaeth ychwanegol a wna'r Gweinidog ar gyfer y gost amcangyfrifedig o £4 miliwn i dreialu bagloriaeth Cymru?

Sue Essex: Yr ydych yn disgrifio addysg yng Nghymru fel rhywbeth nad yw'n gyfarwydd i mi, yn sicr nid yn fy etholaeth i. Nid yw'r gair 'argyfwng' yn berthnasol. O ran datblygiadau diweddar, mae tua 1,000 o staff cymorth newydd yn ysgolion Cymru o ganlyniad i'r camau a gymerasom mewn perthynas â baich gwaith athrawon. Mae hynny'n dwf a newid gwirioneddol. Bu cynnydd o 7.8 y cant rhwng 2002-03 a 2003-04. Mae'r prif grŵp gwariant addysg wedi cynyddu 56 y cant rhwng 1999 a 2003-04, sy'n gyfnod byr o ran llywodraethu. Nid yw'r ffigur hwnnw yn cynnwys y cynnydd drwy'r grant cynnal refeniw i lywodraeth leol, sydd hefyd yn gwneud cyfraniad pwysig i addysg

in relation to teachers' pay, superannuation, threshold pay and the workload agreement next year. Therefore, I do not accept the picture that you paint. We are making improvements in education. However, we can never be complacent, and everyone in education understands that.

There is a general sense of pride in the Welsh baccalaureate, given what it will achieve. You asked the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning about this last week and she answered your question. Let us support an initiative that is good for Wales, which will put us on the map and over which people can come together. Despite party-political differences, there are times when we should get together for the good of Wales; the Welsh baccalaureate is such an instance.

Catherine Thomas: Last week, I was delighted to open a new learning centre at Calsonic Kansei, an automotive plant and major employer within the Llanelli constituency. Do you agree that funding for work-based learning projects and centres such as this constitutes an important part of the education and lifelong learning budget? This new centre at Calsonic will benefit employees, their families and other members of the community, as well as the local economy.

Sue Essex: That is a great way forward. 'Lifelong learning' is called that for a reason. There are many people who did not get the right opportunities at school, or who did not make the most of them, and who need a second, or perhaps third, chance. We also know that we need to extend our skills and knowledge as we progress in the workplace. Embedding the concept of lifelong learning within the workplace is a tremendous idea. You also raised a good point on how that can spin out to families. Those families that learn together—and this was covered yesterday by the media—also grow together. That is not only about children learning in school, but about parents returning from work and sharing their knowledge, which gives every family member confidence. It is a good initiative.

mewn perthynas â chyflog athrawon, pensiwn, tâl trothwy a'r cytundeb baich gwaith y flwyddyn nesaf. Felly, nid wyf yn derbyn eich disgrifiad. Yr ydym yn gwneud gwelliannau mewn addysg. Fodd bynnag, ni allwn byth laesu dwylo, ac mae pawb ym maes addysg yn deall hynny.

Mae ymdeimlad cyffredinol o falchder ym magloriaeth Cymru, o gofio'r hyn y bydd yn ei gyflawni. Gofynasoch i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ynglŷn â hyn yr wythnos diwethaf ac atebodd eich cwestiwn. Gadewch inni gefnogi menter sy'n dda i Gymru, a fydd yn denu sylw pobl ac yn dod â phobl at ei gilydd. Er gwaethaf gwahaniaethau gwleidyddol, ceir adegau pan ddylem ddod at ein gilydd er budd Cymru; mae bagloriaeth Cymru yn enghraifft o hynny.

Catherine Thomas: Yr wythnos diwethaf, yr oedd yn bleser gennyf agor canolfan ddysgu newydd yn Calsonic Kansei, gwaith modurol a phrif gyflogwr o fewn etholaeth Llanelli. A gytunwch fod cyllido ar gyfer prosiectau dysgu sydd yn seiliedig ar waith a chanolfannau fel yr un hon yn rhan bwysig o'r gyllideb addysg a dysgu gydol oes? Bydd cyflogeion, eu teuluoedd ac aelodau eraill o'r gymuned, yn ogystal â'r economi leol yn elwa ar y ganolfan newydd hon yn Calsonic.

Sue Essex: Mae honno'n ffordd wych ymlaen. Fe'i gelwir yn 'dysgu gydol oes' am reswm. Mae llawer o bobl na chawsant y cyfleoedd iawn yn yr ysgol, neu na fanteisiodd i'r eithaf arnynt, pobl y mae angen ail, neu drydydd cyfle arnynt. Gwyddom hefyd fod angen inni ymestyn ein sgiliau a'n gwybodaeth wrth inni ddatblygu yn y gweithle. Mae ymgorffori'r cysyniad o ddysgu gydol oes o fewn y gweithle yn syniad rhagorol. Codwyd pwynt da gennyh hefyd ynglŷn â sut y gellir ymestyn hynny i deuluoedd. Mae'r teuluoedd hynny sy'n dysgu gyda'i gilydd—a rhoddwyd sylw i hyn ddoe yn y cyfryngau—hefyd yn tyfu gyda'i gilydd. Nid yw hynny'n golygu plant yn dysgu yn yr ysgol yn unig, ond rhieni yn dychwelyd o'r gwaith ac yn rhannu eu gwybodaeth, sy'n rhoi hyder i bob aelod o'r teulu. Mae'n fenter dda.

Jeff Cuthbert: I am sure that you agree that money spent on the Welsh baccalaureate pilot scheme is well spent, and that you will join me in urging all political parties to take an objective view of the outcomes of the pilot scheme.

Given the great importance of work-based learning to creating a world-class workforce, will you confirm whether your department has undertaken any cost-benefit analysis of delivering work-based learning in the workplace as opposed to by other means?

Sue Essex: That has not been done in my department; it would be done by the Education Department, and I will ask Jane Davidson about that. However, I endorse what you said about the Welsh baccalaureate.

Jeff Cuthbert: Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch fod arian a werir ar gynllun peilot bagloriaeth Cymru yn arian a werir yn dda, ac yr ymunwch â mi i annog pob plaid wleidyddol i arddel barn wrthrychol ar ganlyniadau'r cynllun peilot.

O gofio pwysigrwydd mawr dysgu sydd yn seiliedig ar waith i greu gweithlu o'r radd flaenaf, a gadarnhewch a yw eich adran wedi cynnal dadansoddiad cost a budd o gyflwyno dysgu sydd yn seiliedig ar waith yn y gweithle yn hytrach na thrwy ryw ffordd arall?

Sue Essex: Ni wnaed hynny yn fy adran i; câi ei wneud gan yr Adran Addysg, a gofynnaf i Jane Davidson ynglŷn â hynny. Fodd bynnag, ategaf yr hyn a ddywedasochoch am fagloriaeth Cymru.

Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad Questions to the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside

Y Llywydd: Tynnwyd cwestiwn 1 (OAQ28549) yn ôl.

The Presiding Officer: Question 1 (OAQ28549) has been withdrawn.

Ariannu Cynlluniau Ailgylchu (Sir y Fflint) Funding Recycling Schemes (Flintshire)

Q2 Sandy Mewies: Would the Minister make a statement on the funding of recycling schemes in Flintshire? (OAQ28469)

C2 Sandy Mewies: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar ariannu cynlluniau ailgylchu yn sir y Fflint? (OAQ28469)

The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones): Flintshire County Council will receive £1,295,296 from the Assembly Government in 2003-04 in the form of sustainable waste management specific grant and credit approvals to help it achieve the recycling and composting targets set out in the Wales waste strategy. Flintshire has also recently been allocated £234,000 from the landfill tax credit scheme legacy fund to support the continuation of the kerbside collection scheme for recyclables.

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones): Bydd Cyngor Sir y Fflint yn cael £1,295,296 gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad yn 2003-04 ar ffurf cymeradwyaethau grant a chredyd penodol rheoli gwastraff cynaliadwy i'w helpu i gyrraedd y targedau ailgylchu a chompostio a nodwyd yn strategaeth wastraff Cymru. Yn ogystal, dyrannwyd £234,000 i sir y Fflint yn ddiweddar o gronfa etifeddiaeth y cynllun credyd treth dirlenwi i gefnogi'r gwaith o barhau â'r cynllun casglu ymyl ffordd ar gyfer nwyddau y gellir eu hailgylchu.

Sandy Mewies: Past and more recent funding from the Welsh Assembly Government has provided the resources to allow innovative recycling schemes to emerge and develop, especially in Flintshire.

Sandy Mewies: Mae cyllid yn y gorffennol ac yn fwy diweddar gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi darparu'r adnoddau i ganiatáu i gynlluniau ailgylchu arloesol ddod i'r golwg a datblygu, yn enwedig yn sir y

Last month, Flintshire County Council was able to expand its blue box recycling scheme by a further 16,000 households to 32,000 families. Early next year, the scheme will go county-wide. The extension of this scheme is welcome, and Flintshire council is confident that it will meet the targets laid down by the Government in 'Wise About Waste'. Will the Minister continue to give local authority recycling schemes the financial priority that they require to meet the targets that the Government has identified?

Carwyn Jones: The Flintshire scheme is a good indication of what can be done with the money that is awarded to county councils. With that kind of good example being translated across the whole of Wales, I will be more than happy to fund future projects that help to reduce the amount of waste in Wales.

Brynle Williams: It is nice to be back, First Minister. *[Interruption.]* The plane had been hijacked. I appreciate the Minister's comments. However, the Assembly has funded an excellent environmentally friendly compost-maker to help the area increase its recycling rate. Does the Minister plan to extend funding to facilitate such projects across the whole of Wales?

Carwyn Jones: It depends on what projects might be proposed across the whole of Wales, but any projects that help to reduce the amount of waste produced in Wales would inevitably be warmly considered.

Janet Ryder: I draw the Minister's attention to the North Wales Regional Committee's first report, which considered waste management across the region. Will you respond to the issues raised in that report, including that raised by north Wales local authorities? They stated that it would be difficult for them to meet their recycling targets. Will you use the new powers granted to you under the Household Waste Recycling Bill to enable those councils to raise their standards and hit those recycling targets?

Fflint. Fis diwethaf, yr oedd Cyngor Sir y Fflint yn gallu ymestyn ei gynllun ailgylchu blychau glas i 16,000 o gartrefi eraill gan gyrraedd 32,000 o deuluoedd. Yn gynnar y flwyddyn nesaf, bydd y cynllun ar waith ar draws y sir. Croesewir y gwaith o ymestyn y cynllun hwn, ac mae cyngor sir y Fflint yn hyderus y bydd yn cyrraedd y targedau a bennwyd gan y Llywodraeth yn 'Yn Gall gyda Gwastraff'. A wnaiff y Gweinidog barhau i roi'r flaenoriaeth ariannol i gynlluniau ailgylchu awdurdodau lleol sydd ei hangen arnynt i gyrraedd y targedau y mae'r Llywodraeth wedi eu nodi?

Carwyn Jones: Mae cynllun sir y Fflint yn arwydd da o'r hyn y gellir ei wneud gyda'r arian a ddyfernir i gynghorau sir. Gyda'r math hwnnw o enghraifft dda yn cael ei chyflwyno ledled Cymru, byddaf yn fwy na bodlon ariannu prosiectau yn y dyfodol sy'n helpu i leihau gwastraff yng Nghymru.

Brynle Williams: Mae'n braf bod yn ôl, Brif Weinidog. *[Torri ar draws.]* Herwgipiwyd yr awyren. Gwerthfawrogaf sylwadau'r Gweinidog. Fodd bynnag, mae'r Cynulliad wedi cyllido gwneuthurwr compost rhagorol sy'n ystyriol o'r amgylchedd er mwyn helpu'r ardal i gynyddu ei chyfradd ailgylchu. A yw'r Gweinidog yn bwriadu ymestyn y cyllid i hwyluso prosiectau o'r fath ar draws Cymru gyfan?

Carwyn Jones: Mae'n dibynnu ar ba brosiectau y gellid eu cynnig ar draws Cymru gyfan, ond byddai unrhyw brosiectau sy'n helpu i leihau'r gwastraff a gynhyrchir yng Nghymru yn anochel yn cael eu hystyried yn frwd.

Janet Ryder: Tynnaf sylw'r Gweinidog at adroddiad cyntaf Pwyllgor Rhanbarth y Gogledd, a ystyriodd reolaeth gwastraff ar draws y rhanbarth. A ymatebwch i'r materion a godwyd yn yr adroddiad hwnnw, gan gynnwys y rhai a godwyd gan awdurdodau lleol y Gogledd? Dywedasant y byddai'n anodd iddynt gyrraedd eu targedau ailgylchu. A ddefnyddiwyd y pwerau newydd a roddwyd ichi o dan Fesur Ailgylchu Gwastraff Domestig alluogi'r cynghorau hynny i godi eu safonau a chyrraedd y targedau ailgylchu hynny?

Carwyn Jones: I have not read the report, and the local authorities have not communicated any difficulties to me. Should they wish to do so, I will consider what can be done to assist them carefully.

Carwyn Jones: Nid wyf wedi darllen yr adroddiad, ac nid yw'r awdurdodau lleol wedi sôn wrthyf am unrhyw anawsterau. Os dymunant wneud hynny, byddaf yn ystyried yn ofalus yr hyn y gellir ei wneud i'w cynorthwyo.

Cnydau a Addaswyd yn Enetig a Chnydau Traddodiadol Genetically Modified and Traditional Crops

Q3 Eleanor Burnham: What discussions has the Minister had with his UK and European counterparts concerning the co-existence of GM and traditional crops in Wales? (OAQ28554)

C3 Eleanor Burnham: Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cynnal â'i gymheiriaid yn y DU ac yn Ewrop ynghylch cydfodolaeth bosibl cnydau GM a thraddodiadol yng Nghymru? (OAQ28554)

Carwyn Jones: The tabled question used the words 'possible existence', so I confirm that traditional crops grow in Wales, but that GM crops do not. I am engaged with UK and EU colleagues on a number of GM issues, including co-existence, and I take the view that the commercialisation of GM crops should not occur until such time as procedures and processes exist to protect Welsh organic and conventional farmers.

Carwyn Jones: Defnyddiodd y cwestiwn a gyflwynwyd y geiriau 'bodolaeth bosibl', felly cadarnhaf fod cnydau traddodiadol yn tyfu yng Nghymru, ond nid cnydau a addaswyd yn enetig. Yr wyf mewn cysylltiad â chyd-aelodau'r DU a'r UE ar nifer o faterion yn ymwneud â chnydau a addaswyd yn enetig, gan gynnwys cydfodolaeth, ac yr wyf yn arddel y farn na ddylid masnacheiddio cnydau a addaswyd yn enetig hyd nes bod gweithdrefnau a phrosesau yn bodoli i ddiogelu ffermwyr organaidd a chonfensiynol Cymru.

Eleanor Burnham: There was obviously a slight error in the tabling of my question, for which I am sure we all apologise. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh.'] I am not insinuating any slur on anyone. The European Health Commissioner has admitted that the proven threat to biodiversity would allow member states to ban GM crops unilaterally. I do not expect you to pre-empt the result of the farm-scale evaluations, which are due to be published on 16 October, which, according to reports, will recommend that GM sugar beet and oilseed rape are not grown because of the potential damage to biodiversity. However, do you agree that support from the European commissioner on the principle of banning GM crops would allow you, in the important forthcoming negotiations, to acquiesce to the Assembly's stated wish of following the most restrictive policy possible, and ensure a GM-free Wales?

Eleanor Burnham: Yn amlwg, yr oedd gwall bach yn y ffordd y cyflwynwyd fy nghwestiwn, yr wyf yn siŵr yr ydym oll yn ymddiheuro amdano. [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'O.'] Nid wyf yn bwrw sen ar neb. Cyfaddefodd y Comisiynydd Iechyd Ewropeaidd y byddai'r bygythiad profedig i fioamrywiaeth yn caniatáu i aelod wladwriaethau wahardd cnydau a addaswyd yn enetig yn unochrog. Nid wyf yn disgwyl ichi achub y blaen ar ganlyniad y gwerthusiadau ar raddfa fferm, y mae disgwyl iddynt gael eu cyhoeddi ar 16 Hydref, a fydd, yn ôl yr adroddiadau, yn argymhell na ddylid tyfu siwgrwr betys a rêp had olew a addaswyd yn enetig oherwydd y niwed posibl i fioamrywiaeth. Fodd bynnag, a gytunwch y byddai cefnogaeth y comisiynydd Ewropeaidd ar egwyddor gwahardd cnydau a addaswyd yn enetig yn eich galluogi, yn y negodiadau pwysig sydd ar droed, i ufuddhau i ddymuniad penodol y Cynulliad i ddilyn y polisi mwyaf cyfyngol posibl, a sicrhau Cymru sy'n rhydd o gnydau

a addaswyd yn enetig?

2.30 p.m.

Carwyn Jones: It is difficult to pre-empt the findings of either of the reports that will be published this month and next. However, it is useful for us that many people who work in Europe are now moving towards the view that we have held for the past three years.

Carwyn Jones: Mae'n anodd rhagweld beth fydd canfyddiadau'r naill adroddiad neu'r llall a gyhoeddir y mis hwn a'r mis nesaf. Fodd bynnag, mae'n ddefnyddiol inni fod llawer o bobl sy'n gweithio yn Ewrop yn awr yn dechrau arddel y farn yr ydym ni wedi ei harddel ers tair blynedd.

Lisa Francis: Recently leaked documents from Westminster suggest that Margaret Beckett plans to give GM crops the go-ahead in the UK. Is this why you will not declare Wales a GM-free zone?

Lisa Francis: Awgryma dogfennau o San Steffan a ddatgelwyd yn ddiweddar fod Margaret Beckett yn bwriadu caniatáu cynydau a addaswyd yn enetig yn y DU. Ai dyma pam nad ydych yn fodlon datgan bod Cymru yn barth sy'n rhydd o gnydau a addaswyd yn enetig?

Carwyn Jones: I do not comment on leaked documents. The UK Government has not yet put forward its view. It is waiting for the farm-scale evaluations to come through on 16 October and for the Agriculture and Environment Biotechnology Commission's report to be published in November. A final decision will be made after that. I cannot add anything to what I said yesterday on the Assembly's stated policy, and I cannot say any more to the Welsh public, with honesty, without misleading them.

Carwyn Jones: Nid wyf yn rhoi sylwadau ar ddogfennau a ddatgelwyd. Nid yw Llywodraeth y DU wedi cyfleu ei barn eto. Mae'n aros am y gwerthusiadau ar raddfa fferm ar 16 Hydref ac adroddiad y Comisiwn Biotechnoleg Amaethyddol ac Amgylcheddol a gyhoeddir ym mis Tachwedd. Gwneir penderfyniad terfynol wedi hynny. Ni allaf ychwanegu unrhyw beth at yr hyn a ddywedais ddoe ar bolisi penodol y Cynulliad, ac ni allaf ddweud rhagor wrth bobl Cymru, a bod yn onest, heb eu camarwain.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Y mae'n amlwg bod pobl yn pryderu ynglŷn ag agwedd Margaret Beckett a Tony Blair tuag at gnydau a addaswyd yn enetig. Weinidog, o ystyried yr amserlen cyn y penderfyniad, beth yw eich bwriad chi o ran trefnu trafodaethau gyda Margaret Beckett a Tony Blair—gan mai ef fydd yn gwneud y penderfyniad yn y pen draw—i sicrhau bod y farn a fynegwyd dro ar ôl tro gan y Cynulliad, ac a ategwyd yn y ddadl ddoe, yn cael ei datgan yn glir ac yn dylanwadu ar benderfyniad San Steffan?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: It is evident that people are concerned about Margaret Beckett and Tony Blair's attitude towards genetically modified crops. Minister, considering the timetable prior to the decision, what are your intentions with regard to arranging discussions with Margaret Beckett and Tony Blair—as it will ultimately be his decision—to ensure that the view that has been expressed time after time by the Assembly, which was endorsed in yesterday's debate, is declared unequivocally and that it influences Westminster's decision?

Carwyn Jones: Mae'r farn honno yn cael ei datgan yn glir gan swyddogion, a byddaf i'n siarad mewn cyfarfod gyda Gweinidogion o bob cwr o'r Deyrnas Unedig ym mis Tachwedd. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y mater hwn ar yr agenda gan y bydd yr ail adroddiad, adroddiad yr AEBC, yn cael ei

Carwyn Jones: That view is being stated clearly by officials, and I will be speaking at a meeting with Ministers from all parts of the United Kingdom in November. I am sure that this matter will be on the agenda, as the second report, the report of the AEBC, will be published to coincide with that meeting.

gyhoeddi tua'r un adeg â'r cyfarfod hwnnw.

Poblogaeth Gwyllanod Cymru The Gull Population in Wales

Q4 William Graham: Will the Minister make a statement on the environmental impact caused by the changes in habitat of the gull population in Wales? (OAQ28461)

Carwyn Jones: The environmental impact caused by gulls relates primarily to noise and aggressive behaviour while defending eggs and chicks. Although gull numbers have significantly decreased since 1969, in some towns and cities there has been an increase in numbers due to a reduction in natural feeding sources and an increase of inland human-made feeding sources, principally household waste.

William Graham: The Royal Society for the Protection of Birds has described heaven for a gull as any place where there is an open-top litter bin, discarded leftover fast food and roofs on which to nest. Unfortunately, this is a description of many of the urban areas of Wales. This means that gulls breed far more frequently than they previously did in the wild. What will you do to reduce the gull population that is becoming particularly aggressive in Newport and Cardiff?

Carwyn Jones: Short of culling them I am not sure what can be done. That would raise a host of issues, and I am not suggesting that that is a policy that we should pursue. I must draw you back to the fact that the number of gulls has dropped since 1969, but we are seeing the gulls shift further inland, away from the coastal areas. Ultimately, this concerns our waste strategy—the less waste that we produce, and leave out in the open, the less opportunity that there will be for gulls to proliferate.

Janet Davies: I draw your attention to a European Union directive of 1979, under article 235 of the Treaty of Rome, that requires member states to maintain their bird populations, their diversity and habitats. Have you taken any action under that directive, with the UK Government or within the powers of the Government of Wales Act

C4 William Graham: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar effaith newidiadau yng nghynefin poblogaeth gwyllanod Cymru ar yr amgylchedd? (OAQ28461)

Carwyn Jones: Mae'r effaith y mae gwyllanod yn ei chael ar yr amgylchedd yn ymwneud yn bennaf â sŵn ac ymddygiad ymosodol tra'n amddiffyn wyau a chywion. Er bod nifer y gwyllanod wedi gostwng yn sylweddol ers 1969, bu cynnydd mewn rhai trefi a dinasoedd o ganlyniad i leihad mewn ffynonellau naturiol o fwyd a chynnydd mewn ffynonellau mewndirol o fwyd a grëir gan bobl, sef gwastraff cartrefi yn bennaf.

William Graham: Mae'r Gymdeithas Frenhinol er Gwarchod Adar wedi disgrifio nefoedd i wylan fel unrhyw lle lle mae bin sbwriel heb gaead, bwyd brys wedi ei daflu a thoeon i nythu arnynt. Yn anffodus, mae hwn yn ddisgrifiad o lawer o ardaloedd trefol Cymru. Golyga hyn fod gwyllanod yn bridio yn llawer amlach nag yr arferent wneud yn y gwyllt. Beth a wnewch i leihau'r boblogaeth gwyllanod sydd yn arbennig o ymosodol yng Nghasnewydd a Chaerdydd?

Carwyn Jones: Ar wahân i'w difa nid wyf yn siŵr beth y gellir ei wneud. Byddai hynny'n creu llu o broblemau, ac nid wyf yn awgrymu bod hwnnw'n bolisi y dylem ei ddilyn. Fe'ch hatgoffaf eto o'r ffaith bod nifer y gwyllanod wedi gostwng ers 1969, ond yr ydym yn gweld y gwyllanod yn symud ymhellach i ganol y tir, i ffwrdd o'r ardaloedd arfordirol. Yn y pen draw, mae a wnelo hyn â'n strategaeth wastraff—po leiaf o wastraff a gynhyrchwn, a'i adael yn yr awyr agored, y lleiaf o gyfle fydd i wylanod fridio.

Janet Davies: Tynnaf eich sylw at gyfarwyddeb 1979 yr Undeb Ewropeaidd, o dan erthygl 235 Cytundeb Rhufain, sy'n ei gwneud yn ofynnol i aelod wladwriaethau gynnal eu poblogaethau adar, eu hamrywiaeth a'u cynefinoedd. A gymerasoch unrhyw gamau o dan y gyfarwyddeb honno, gyda Llywodraeth y DU neu o fewn pwerau

1998, to maintain diverse, non-polluting habitats for gulls, which seem to be declining rather than increasing?

Carwyn Jones: There are habitat directives that have been transcribed since 1979 and recent ones that have considered the particular issue of encouraging bio-diversity. We must ensure that we have a flourishing and varied wildlife, including bird-life, in Wales. Currently, the gulls are moving further inland and there has been a reduction in their numbers but, before we consider how many gulls there should be, there must be some further scientific work on the optimum level.

Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, i gynnal cynefinoedd amrywiol nad ydynt yn llygru i wylanod, sy'n ymddangos fel pe baent yn gostwng mewn nifer yn hytrach na chynyddu?

Carwyn Jones: Mae cyfarwyddbau cynefinoedd a drawsgrifiwyd ers 1979 a rhai diweddar sydd wedi ystyried mater penodol o ran annog bioamrywiaeth. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod gennym fywyd gwylt llewyrchus ac amrywiol, gan gynnwys bywyd adar, yng Nghymru. Ar hyn o bryd, mae'r gwylanod yn symud yn fwy i ganol y tir a bu gostyngiad yn eu niferoedd ond, cyn inni ystyried faint o wylanod yw'r ffigur cywir, rhaid gwneud rhywfaint o waith gwyddonol pellach ar y nifer optimaidd.

Llaeth Ysgolion School Milk

Q5 Mark Isherwood: What proportion of school milk is sourced from Welsh producers? (OAQ28530)

I ask the Minister to answer this question without recycling prehistoric soundbites. Last week, as I am sure that the Minister is aware, was School Milk Week in England and Wales.

The Presiding Officer: Order. Members must not add hidden supplementary questions.

Mark Isherwood: I apologise.

Carwyn Jones: This information is not available in the form requested. It is the responsibility of local education authorities to source supply under the Government's school milk scheme. The transportation element in the overall cost of providing school milk invariably results in supply from within the local area.

Mark Isherwood: Last week's School Milk Week in England and Wales highlighted the availability of milk in schools and the European Union subsidy. Conservative MEPs campaigned for this subsidy three years ago. Will the Minister support the leader of the largest group of UK MEPs, Welsh MEP

C5 Mark Isherwood: Pa ganran o laeth ysgolion a gynhyrchir yng Nghymru? (OAQ28530)

Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog ateb y cwestiwn hwn heb ailgylchu hen ddatganiadau bachog. Wythnos Llaeth Ysgolion yng Nghymru a Lloegr oedd hi yr wythnos diwethaf, fel yr wyf yn siŵr y gŵyr y Gweinidog.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Rhaid i Aelodau beidio ag ychwanegu cwestiynau atodol cudd.

Mark Isherwood: Ymddiheuraf.

Carwyn Jones: Nid yw'r wybodaeth hon ar gael ar y ffurf y gofynnwyd amdani. Cyfrifoldeb awdurdodau addysg lleol yw cael cyflenwadau o dan gynllun llaeth ysgolion y Llywodraeth. Mae'r elfen gludo yng nghost gyffredinol darparu llaeth ysgolion yn anochel yn arwain at gyflenwi o fewn yr ardal leol.

Mark Isherwood: Amlygodd yr Wythnos Llaeth Ysgolion yng Nghymru a Lloegr yr wythnos diwethaf argaeledd llaeth mewn ysgolion a chymhorthdal yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. Ymgyrchodd Aelodau Senedd Ewrop o'r blaid Geidwadol dros y cymhorthdal hwn dair blynedd yn ôl. A

Jonathan Evans, in his fight to stop Brussels from abolishing school milk subsidies in Europe?

Carwyn Jones: The Conservatives had nothing to do with the introduction of school milk in Wales. It was the Conservative Party that abolished it in the first place. School milk was re-introduced by the partnership Government and I have every intention of continuing this successful scheme.

The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German): School dinners are supposed to be another nutritious element of school life. The recent Soil Association report described school lunches as 'muck on a truck'.

The Presiding Officer: Order. I do not think so. The subject is milk.

Michael German: My question is about milk in schools.

The Presiding Officer: Indeed, but milk is not dinner.

Michael German: The rest of the question is relevant to the subject.

The Presiding Officer: We shall see.

Michael German: Schools are set targets on the amount of nutrition in the food and drink that they provide. Would it be appropriate for the Assembly to set those targets for local authorities?

Carwyn Jones: We must consider what goes into school meals. Also, under the principles of sustainability, which is today's strong theme, we must ensure that local producers can supply schools and other public bodies. There is still a fair amount to be done on that, which we can hopefully develop in future. However, the Government takes the question of nutrition for schoolchildren seriously. Milk is one way to ensure a supply of nutrition, and we shall consider if further work is necessary to improve nutrition in solid foods.

wnaiff y Gweinidog gefnogi arweinydd grŵp mwyaf ASE yn y DU, sef Jonathan Evans, un o ASE Cymru, yn ei frwydr i atal Brwsel rhag cael gwared ar gymorthdaliadau llaeth ysgolion yn Ewrop?

Carwyn Jones: Nid oedd gan y Ceidwadwyr unrhyw beth i'w wneud â chyflwyno llaeth ysgolion yng Nghymru. Y blaid Geidwadol a gafodd wared arno yn y lle cyntaf. Ailgyflwynwyd llaeth ysgolion gan y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth a'm bwriad yw parhau â'r cynllun llwyddiannus hwn.

Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German): Tybir bod ciniawau ysgol yn elfen faethlon arall o fywyd ysgol. Disgrifiodd y Gymdeithas Bridd giniawau ysgol yn ddiweddar fel 'muck on a truck'.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Go brin. Y pwnc yw llaeth.

Michael German: Mae a wnelo fy nghwestiwn â llaeth mewn ysgolion.

Y Llywydd: Yn wir, ond nid cinio yw llaeth.

Michael German: Mae gweddill y cwestiwn yn berthnasol i'r pwnc.

Y Llywydd: Cawn weld.

Michael German: Pennir targedau i ysgolion ar faint o faeth a ddarparant mewn bwyd a diod. A fyddai'n briodol i'r Cynulliad bennu'r targedau hynny ar gyfer awdurdodau lleol?

Carwyn Jones: Rhaid inni ystyried yr hyn a gynhwysir mewn prydau ysgol. Hefyd, o dan egwyddorion cynaliadwyedd, sef thema gref heddiw, rhaid inni sicrhau y gall cynhyrchwyr lleol gyflenwi ysgolion a chyrrff cyhoeddus eraill. Mae llawer o waith eto i'w wneud ar hynny, a gobeithio y gallwn ddatblygu hynny yn y dyfodol. Fodd bynnag, mae maeth i blant ysgol yn fater difrifol i'r Llywodraeth. Mae llaeth yn un ffordd o sicrhau cyflenwad o faeth, a byddwn yn ystyried a oes angen gwneud rhagor o waith i wella maeth mewn bwydydd solet.

Alun Ffred Jones: Dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf, mae pris llaeth yn y siop wedi cynyddu tua 10 y cant, ond mae'r pris y mae ffermwyr yn ei dderbyn wedi gostwng tua 30 y cant. A yw'r Gweinidog yn cefnogi protest ddiweddar y ffermwyr llaeth i gael codiad yn y pris maent yn ei dderbyn am eu cynnyrch?

Alun Ffred Jones: Over recent years, the price of milk in shops has risen by around 10 per cent, but the price that farmers receive has decreased by about 30 per cent. Does the Minister support the recent protest by dairy farmers to gain an increase in the price they receive for their produce?

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae hynny braidd yn bell o'r pwnc hefyd. Ni fu protestiadau mewn ysgolion hyd y deallaf. Fodd bynnag, os gall y Gweinidog roi ateb perthnasol, byddwn yn ddiolchgar.

The Presiding Officer: Order. That also is somewhat tangential. As far as I know there have been no protests in schools. However, if the Minister could give a relevant answer, I would be grateful.

Carwyn Jones: Ni allaf gymeradwyo protestio, wrth gwrs, ond yr wyf yn cydymdeimlo â sefyllfa'r ffermwyr. Rhaid i bawb sy'n ymwneud â'r gadwyn fwyd, sef archfarchnadoedd, cynhyrchwyr a phroseswyr, deimlo eu bod yn cael pris teg am eu cynnyrch. Ni ellid dweud hynny am ffermwyr llaeth Cymru. Fodd bynnag, mater masnachol ydyw, ac ni all y Llywodraeth wneud unrhyw beth amdano'n uniongyrchol.

Carwyn Jones: I cannot condone protests, of course, but I do sympathise with the farmers' situation. Everyone involved in the food chain, namely supermarkets, producers and processors, must feel that they receive a fair price for their produce. That cannot be said about Welsh dairy farmers. However, it is a commercial matter, and there is nothing that the Government can do about it directly.

Poblogaeth Moch Daear Cymru The Badger Population in Wales

Q6 William Graham: Will the Minister make a statement on the measures taken to ensure a healthy badger population in Wales? (OAQ28460)

C6 William Graham: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y mesurau a gymerwyd i sicrhau poblogaeth iach o foch daear yng Nghymru? (OAQ28460)

Carwyn Jones: Badgers are a protected species. The Assembly does not normally intervene in the day-to-day health of wild species.

Carwyn Jones: Mae moch daear yn rhywogaeth a ddiogelir. Nid yw'r Cynulliad fel arfer yn ymyrryd yn iechyd rhywogaethau gwyllt o ddydd i ddydd.

William Graham: The debate on the health of our badger population naturally focuses on instances of bovine tuberculosis. However, infected badgers also pass this disease on to other woodland and hedgerow animals. It is proposed that a healthy badger population will help to eradicate bovine TB and that that objective could possibly be achieved by an immediate cull of infected badgers in TB hotspots. Will the Minister give a commitment to such a cull?

William Graham: Mae'r ddadl ar iechyd ein poblogaeth moch daear yn naturiol yn canolbwyntio ar achosion o dwbercwlosis mewn gwartheg. Fodd bynnag, mae moch daear heintus hefyd yn trosglwyddo'r clefyd hwn i anifeiliaid eraill y goedwig a'r gwrychoedd. Cynigir y bydd poblogaeth moch daear iach yn helpu i ddileu TB mewn gwartheg ac y gallai'r amcan hwnnw gael ei gyflawni o bosibl drwy ddifa moch daear heintus mewn mannau lle y ceir TB ar unwaith. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ymrwymo i gynllun difa o'r fath?

Carwyn Jones: There is a possible link between badgers and bovine TB. However, it is unclear how TB is spread between species,

Carwyn Jones: Mae cyswllt posibl rhwng moch daear a TB mewn gwartheg. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n glir sut y lledaenir TB

whether as a two-way contamination process or as a cycle of infection between badgers and cattle that cannot be broken simply by removing one species of the infected animals since the cycle of infection may continue in the remaining species. The simple answer is that we do not know. We must endeavour to find options for dealing with bovine TB, and the Committee will consider the matter. The recent case in Anglesey illustrates that bovine TB can occur in badger-free areas.

rhwng rhywogaethau, pa un ai fel proses heintio ddwy ffordd neu fel cylch haint rhwng moch daear a gwartheg na ellir ei dorri yn syml drwy symud un rhywogaeth o'r anifeiliaid heintus oherwydd gall y cylch heintio barhau yn y rhywogaethau sy'n weddill. Yr ateb syml yw na wyddom. Rhaid inni ymdrechu i ganfod opsiynau ar gyfer delio â TB mewn gwartheg, a bydd y Pwyllgor yn ystyried y mater. Mae'r achos diweddar yn Ynys Môn yn dangos y gall TB mewn gwartheg ddigwydd mewn ardaloedd lle na cheir moch daear.

2.40 p.m.

Lorraine Barrett: Do you agree that no definitive scientific evidence exists to support badger culling in relation to bovine TB? Do you support the findings of the House of Commons's all-party Environment, Food and Rural Affairs Committee report, which insists that culling badgers is not the way to deal with bovine TB?

Lorraine Barrett: A gytunwch nad oes tystiolaeth wyddonol bendant ar gael i gefnogi'r gwaith o ddifa moch daear mewn perthynas â TB mewn gwartheg? A gefnogwch ganfyddiadau adroddiad Pwyllgor pob plaid yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig Tŷ'r Cyffredin, sy'n mynnu nad difa moch daear yw'r ffordd o ddelio â TB mewn gwartheg?

Carwyn Jones: Scientific evidence does not exist at present to suggest that culling badgers is the sole or an effective way of dealing with bovine TB. On the other hand, I suppose that I must say that there is not much evidence to the contrary either. We simply do not know. However, we cannot go ahead with culling badgers, based on what we do not know. There must be scientific evidence. All of these issues must be considered because bovine TB is an escalating problem and an escalating financial problem, and we cannot sit back and watch the incidences of it rise. We must consider all of these matters, but, at present, the scientific evidence does not exist to justify a cull.

Carwyn Jones: Nid oes tystiolaeth wyddonol ar gael ar hyn o bryd i awgrymu mai difa moch daear yw'r unig ffordd neu'r ffordd effeithiol o ymdrin â TB mewn gwartheg. Ar y llaw arall, tybiaf fod yn rhaid imi ddweud nad oes llawer o dystiolaeth i'r gwrthwyneb ychwaith. Yn syml, ni wyddom. Fodd bynnag, ni allwn fynd ati i ddifa moch daear, yn seiliedig ar yr hyn na wyddom. Rhaid cael tystiolaeth wyddonol. Rhaid ystyried yr holl faterion hyn gan fod TB mewn gwartheg yn broblem sy'n gwaethygu ac yn broblem ariannol sy'n gwaethygu, ac ni allwn laesu dwylo a gweld yr achosion yn cynyddu. Rhaid inni ystyried yr holl faterion hyn, ond, ar hyn o bryd, nid yw'r dystiolaeth wyddonol ar gael i gyfiawnhau difa.

David Lloyd: Pa wersi y gallwn ni yng Nghymru eu dysgu ynghylch ymdrin â TB mewn gwartheg o adroddiadau gweinyddiaeth amaeth Iwerddon, sy'n ystyried y cyswllt posibl rhwng twbercwlosis mewn moch daear a thwbercwlosis mewn gwartheg?

David Lloyd: What lessons can we in Wales learn about dealing with bovine TB from the reports of the agriculture ministry in Ireland, which consider the possible link between tuberculosis in badgers and bovine tuberculosis?

Carwyn Jones: Nid yw'r canlyniadau terfynol ar gael eto. Unwaith y byddant ar gael, bydd diddordeb gennyf weld sut y bu'r

Carwyn Jones: The final results are not yet available. As soon as they are available, I will be interested to see how the ministry has been

weinyddiaeth yn llwyddianus—os bu yn llwyddianus—a gweld a all gynnig gwersi inni yng Nghymru.

successful—if it has been successful—and to see if it has any lessons to offer us in Wales.

Trwyddedau Hela Game Licences

Q7 Brynle Williams: Will the Minister make a statement on discussions that he has had with his Westminster counterparts regarding the subject of game licences in Wales? (OAQ28467)

C7 Brynle Williams: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar unrhyw drafodaethau y mae ef wedi'u cael â'i gymheiriaid yn San Steffan ynghylch trwyddedau hela yng Nghymru? (OAQ28467)

Carwyn Jones: I have had no such discussions.

Carwyn Jones: Nid wyf wedi cael trafodaethau o'r fath.

Brynle Williams: You will be aware of the value of game in Wales, particularly in diversification and in supporting conservation work. Approximately £250,000 is currently collected in game licences, but over £350,000 is spent on administration. Therefore, there is a void that must be filled. Will you revisit this situation to consider how we could make the administration of licences profitable, so that those profits can be ploughed into the Wildlife Habitat Trust and into game conservancy schemes?

Brynle Williams: Byddwch yn ymwybodol o werth hela yng Nghymru, yn arbennig o ran arallgyfeirio ac wrth gefnogi gwaith cadwraeth. Cesglir tua £250,000 mewn trwyddedau hela ar hyn o bryd, ond gwerir dros £350,000 ar waith gweinyddol. Felly, mae bwlch y mae'n rhaid ei lenwi. A wnewch ailystyried y sefyllfa i weld sut y gallem wneud elw o weinyddu trwyddedau, fel y gellir ailfuddsoddi'r elw hwnnw yn yr Ymddiriedolaeth Cynefinoedd Bywyd Gwyllt ac mewn cynlluniau gwarchodaeth hela?

Carwyn Jones: The Act that deals with this matter has not been devolved, so we have no direct control over it. However, if you write to me with further details, I will consider the matter in greater detail.

Carwyn Jones: Nid yw'r Ddeddf sy'n ymdrin â'r mater hwn wedi ei datganoli eto, felly nid oes gennym reolaeth uniongyrchol drosto. Fodd bynnag, os ysgrifennwch ataf gyda rhagor o fanylion, rhoddaf ystyriaeth fanylach i'r mater.

Datganiad ar Ymgynghoriad yr Adolygiad o'r Cynllun Datblygu Cynaliadwy Statement on the Consultation on the Review of the Sustainable Development Scheme

The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones): In my statement on 24 June, I outlined the approach that I intended to take to revise the Assembly's sustainable development scheme, and explained how I would report on the effectiveness of the scheme so far. Revising the scheme is the responsibility of the whole Assembly, but the functions of reporting and consulting have been delegated to Ministers.

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones): Yn fy natganiad ar 24 Mehefin, amlinellais yr ymagwedd yr oeddwn yn bwriadu ei chymryd tuag at adolygu cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy'r Cynulliad, ac eglurais sut y byddwn yn cyflwyno adroddiad ar effeithiolrwydd y cynllun hyd yma. Cyfrifoldeb y Cynulliad cyfan yw adolygu'r cynllun, ond dirprwywyd y swyddogaethau cyflwyno adroddiadau ac ymgynghori i Weinidogion.

I am launching 'Starting to Live Differently' today, the formal consultation on revising the scheme, and I am announcing the publication of an independent report on the difference that the scheme has made. CAG Consultants prepared that report for us, based on its investigations, the Davidoff report that I drew to your attention in June, and other material.

The Welsh Assembly Government is committed to honest, open reporting. We wanted a warts-and-all report that would show how we could improve our scheme and implement it better. CAG Consultants have given us that, as it judged us against a high standard. These are some of its conclusions:

'There is no question that over the last four years the National Assembly has worked hard to mainstream sustainable development into its policies.... The Assembly can be proud of setting a standard that is rarely matched elsewhere.'

'Co-ordination mechanisms sit at the heart of the political and administrative structure of the Assembly.'

'At the same time the Assembly has succeeded in dispersing responsibility for the duty across the organisation.'

'The scheme has raised the profile of sustainable development across Wales, and has galvanised many organisations to start thinking more seriously about this issue. As the annual reports demonstrate, the Assembly has done much over the last four years to promote the duty.'

Those are not my words, but the independent judgment of a well-respected organisation with considerable experience in the field. All Members can take pride in that assessment, particularly Sue Essex, who did so much to earn it.

However, we did not ask to be congratulated: we wanted to know how we could improve. We have been told that:

'There are also areas in need of

Yr wyf yn lansio 'Dechrau Byw yn Wahanol' heddiw, yr ymgynghoriad ffurfiol ar adolygu'r cynllun, ac yr wyf yn datgan i adroddiad annibynnol gael ei gyhoeddi ar y gwahaniaeth a wnaeth y cynllun. Paratowyd yr adroddiad hwnnw inni gan CAG Consultants, yn seiliedig ar ei ymchwiliadau, adroddiad Davidoff y tynnais eich sylw ato ym mis Mehefin, a deunydd arall.

Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ymrwymedig i gyflwyno adroddiadau yn onest ac yn agored. Yr oeddem am gael adroddiad a fyddai'n cynnwys y da a'r drwg ac a fyddai'n dangos sut y gallem wella ein cynllun a'i weithredu'n well. Mae CAG Consultants wedi rhoi hynny inni, gan iddo ein beirniadu yn erbyn safon uchel. Dyma rai o'i ganlyniadau:

Nid oes amheuaeth i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol weithio'n galed dros y pedair blynedd diwethaf i brif ffrydio datblygu cynaliadwy i'w bolisiau... . Gall y Cynulliad ymfalchïo mewn gosod safon na welir ei bath bron yn unrhyw le arall.

Dulliau cydgysylltu sydd wrth wraidd strwythur gwleidyddol a gweinyddol y Cynulliad.

Ar yr un pryd mae'r Cynulliad wedi llwyddo i rannu'r cyfrifoldeb dros y ddyletswydd ar draws y sefydliad.

Mae'r cynllun wedi codi proffil datblygu cynaliadwy ledled Cymru, ac wedi symbylu nifer o sefydliadau i ddechrau ystyried y mater hwn yn fwy difrifol. Fel y dengys yr adroddiadau blynyddol, mae'r Cynulliad wedi gwneud llawer dros y pedair blynedd diwethaf i hyrwyddo'r ddyletswydd.

Nid fy ngeiriau i yw'r rheini, ond barn annibynnol sefydliad uchel ei barch sydd â chryn brofiad yn y maes. Gall pob Aelod ymfalchïo yn yr asesiad hwnnw, yn arbennig Sue Essex, a wnaeth gymaint i'w haeddu.

Fodd bynnag, ni ofynasom am gael ein llongyfarch: yr oeddem am wybod sut y gallem wella. Dywedwyd wrthym:

Hefyd mae meysydd y mae angen eu gwella:

improvement: efforts are dispersed, rather than focused on the key sustainability pressures and crunch issues facing Wales; it is not clear that the policy changes that have been introduced will amount to enough to turn round unsustainable trends; sustainable development has not been systematically fed down from policies into the Assembly's practice and the practice of other organisations; the Assembly's policies for leading by example need to be implemented more fully; and there is little evidence that real change is happening on the ground.'

That is not such welcome news. We are doing many good things, but we are not living up to our own aspirations yet. We need to focus our efforts, and deliver real change.

I am grateful to CAG, and to all the individuals and organisations whose views it reports, for its criticisms as well as its plaudits. That is what we wanted to help us formulate proposals for revising the scheme. That brings me to our consultation paper. In June, I spoke of informal discussions with stakeholders to help us develop our proposals. I thank the 33 representatives of the 29 organisations who took part in these discussions, and especially the five organisations—Carmarthenshire County Council, Groundwork Aberdare, the Centre for Alternative Technology, the Environment Agency Wales, and Shotton Paper Company plc—that hosted or offered to host them. These discussions helped us decide what proposals to put forward in our consultation. We have tried to make a distinction between the scheme itself, which is the whole Assembly's responsibility, and a plan of action to deliver change that will be the Welsh Assembly Government's responsibility.

We are proposing to strengthen and generalise the scheme's principles, clarify how it relates to the Assembly's partners, update the wording to reflect developments since November 2000, and provide more robust systems for monitoring and reporting. To achieve real change, the paper indicates the issues on which we believe we should concentrate our efforts. We will work to

mae'r ymdrechion yn wasgaredig, yn hytrach na chanolbwyntio ar bwysau cynaliadwyedd allweddol a materion hollbwysig sy'n wynebu Cymru; nid yw'n glir a fydd y newidiadau polisi a gyflwynwyd yn ddigon i wurdroi tueddiadau anghynaliadwy; nid yw datblygu cynaliadwy wedi cael ei fwydo'n systematig o bolisiau i arfer y Cynulliad ac arfer sefydliadau eraill; mae angen i bolisiau'r Cynulliad ar gyfer arwain drwy esiampl gael eu gweithredu'n llawnach; a phrin yw'r dystiolaeth bod newid gwirioneddol yn digwydd ar lawr gwlad.

Nid yw hynny'n newyddion cystal. Gwnawn lawer o bethau da, ond nid ydym yn cyflawni ein dyheadau ein hunain eto. Mae angen inni ganolbwyntio ein hymdrechion, a chyflawni newid gwirioneddol.

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i CAG, ac i bob unigolyn a sefydliad y mae'n adrodd eu barn, am ei feirniadaeth yn ogystal â'i ganmoliaeth. Dyna yr oedd ei eisiau arnom i'n helpu i ffurfio cynigion ar gyfer diwygio'r cynllun. Mae hynny'n fy arwain at ein papur ymgynghori. Ym mis Mehefin, siaradais am drafodaethau anffurfiol gyda rhanddeiliaid i'n helpu i ddatblygu ein cynigion. Diolch i'r 33 cynrychiolydd o'r 29 sefydliad a gymerodd ran yn y trafodaethau hyn, ac yn arbennig y pum sefydliad—Cyngor Sir Caerfyrddin, Groundwork Aberdâr, Canolfan y Dechnoleg Amgen, Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd Cymru, a Shotton Paper Company ccc—a'u cynhaliodd neu a gynigiodd eu cynnal. Bu'r trafodaethau hyn o gymorth inni benderfynu pa gynigion i'w cyflwyno yn ein hymgynghoriad. Yr ydym wedi ceisio gwahaniaethu rhwng y cynllun ei hun, sef cyfrifoldeb y Cynulliad cyfan, a chynllun gweithredu i gyflawni newid a fydd yn gyfrifoldeb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

Yr ydym yn bwriadu cryfhau a chyffredinoli egwyddorion y cynllun, egluro sut y mae'n berthnasol i bartneriaid y Cynulliad, diweddarar'r geiriad i adlewyrchu'r datblygiadau ers Tachwedd 2000, a darparu systemau mwy cadarn ar gyfer monitro a chyflwyno adroddiadau. Er mwyn cyflawni newid gwirioneddol, noda'r papur y materion y credwn y dylem ganolbwyntio ein

develop an action plan during and after the consultation period, in discussion with the Assembly's many partners. It will need to reflect the outcome of the consultation regarding the scheme.

It will be important to get the scheme right, as our overarching statement of principles, but I hope that debates and discussions during the consultation period will focus as much on the content of a realistic action plan as on the wording of the scheme itself. That will help us deliver real change on the ground. The consultation period will last for three months. I welcome the intention of the three Regional Committees to invite presentations from interested organisations. In addition, we have asked the Sustainable Development Forum for Wales to work with some key organisations to stage workshops focusing on possible actions in priority areas. At the same time, consultation on the draft Wales spatial plan will also be under way. That too is about putting sustainable development into effect, so there is an important link between the two consultations.

I shall report regularly to the Environment, Planning and Countryside Committee on how our consultation is going. I hope to meet Subject Committee Chairs and other parties' sustainable development spokespersons soon to discuss progress, and establish whether Subject Committees will wish to be involved in the consultation or in considering its outcomes. I said in June that I hoped to have a new scheme adopted by the Assembly in March 2004. That is still my hope and intention. We have a fund of goodwill to draw on, from organisations and individuals across Wales. Our independent experts have told us that:

'For a very new organisation the Assembly has made an excellent start'.

Now, we must press on.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Mae teitl y ddogfen ymgynghori, 'Dechrau Byw yn Wahanol', yn

hymdrechion arnynt. Byddwn yn gweithio i ddatblygu cynllun gweithredu yn ystod ac ar ôl y cyfnod ymgynghori, drwy drafod gyda phartneriaid niferus y Cynulliad. Bydd angen iddo adlewyrchu canlyniad yr ymgynghoriad ynghylch y cynllun.

Bydd yn bwysig cael y cynllun yn iawn, fel ein datganiad egwyddorion cyffredin, ond gobeithiaf y bydd dadleuon a thrafodaethau yn ystod y cyfnod ymgynghori yn canolbwyntio cymaint ar gynnwys cynllun gweithredu realistig ag y gwna ar eiriad y cynllun ei hun. Bydd hynny'n ein helpu i gyflawni newid gwirioneddol ar lawr gwlad. Bydd y cyfnod ymgynghori yn parhau am dri mis. Croesawaf fwriad y tri Phwyllgor Rhanbarth i wahodd cyflwyniadau gan sefydliadau â diddordeb. Yn ogystal, yr ydym wedi gofyn i Fforwm Datblygu Cynaliadwy Cymru weithio gyda rhai sefydliadau allweddol i gynnal gweithdai yn canolbwyntio ar gamau posibl mewn meysydd blaenoriaeth. Ar yr un pryd, bydd ymgynghoriad ar y drafft o gynllun gofodol Cymru yn mynd rhagddo. Mae hynny hefyd yn ymwneud â rhoi datblygu cynaliadwy ar waith, felly ceir cyswllt pwysig rhwng y ddau ymgynghoriad.

Byddaf yn cyflwyno adroddiadau rheolaidd i Bwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad ar hynt ein hymgynghoriad. Gobeithiaf gyfarfod â Chadeiryddion Pwyllgorau Pwnc a llefarwyr y pleidiau eraill ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy yn fuan i drafod y cynnydd, a sefydlu a fydd Pwyllgorau Pwnc am fod yn rhan o'r ymgynghoriad neu'n rhan o'r gwaith o ystyried ei ganlyniadau. Dywedais ym mis Mehefin fy mod yn gobeithio y byddai cynllun newydd wedi'i fabwysiadu gan y Cynulliad ym Mawrth 2004. Mae hynny'n parhau i fod yn obaith ac yn fwriad gennyf. Mae cryn ewyllys da ymhlith sefydliadau ac unigolion ledled Cymru y gallwn fanteisio arni. Dywedodd ein harbenigwyr annibynnol wrthym:

O ystyried mai sefydliad newydd ydyw, mae'r Cynulliad wedi cychwyn yn dda.

Yn awr, rhaid inni fwrw ymlaen.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: The title of this consultation document, 'Learning to Live

dweud y cyfan. Ar ôl dros bedair blynedd, mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn dechrau gweithredu ei chynllun datblygu cynaliadwy. Beth a ddigwyddodd dros y pedair blynedd diwethaf? Dywed y Gweinidog fod adroddiadau sy'n nodi bod gwaith pwysig wedi ei wneud, ac mae gwaith pwysig wedi ei wneud o ran ymgorffori datblygu cynaliadwy mewn polisiau. Fodd bynnag, pa ganlyniadau a welwyd dros y pedair blynedd? Oni fyddai'r Gweinidog yn disgwyl gweld rhywbeth diffiniol y gallem gyfeirio ato sydd wedi ei gyflawni yn y maes hwn?

Onid oes problem sylfaenol? Mae'r cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy hwn yn eiddo i'r Cynulliad, fel y dywedasoch. Fodd bynnag, mae'r cyfrifoldeb am ei weithredu, a'r cynllun gweithredu ei hun, yn eiddo i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Onid oes problem o ran dod â'r cyfan at ei gilydd? Sut mae'r Gweinidog yn bwriadu gwneud hynny ac adrodd yn ôl ar hynny i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru?

2.50 p.m.

Ar y dangosyddion, Weinidog, sut y cânt eu defnyddio er mwyn mynd i'r afael â'r broblem a nodir yn yr adroddiadau, sef diffyg monitro'r cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy? Pan sonia'r Gweinidog yn y cynllun am y weledigaeth, pam ei bod yn ymwneud â Chymru yn unig? Oni ddylai ymwneud â Chymru a rôl Cymru yn y byd? Onid oes elfen ryngwladol i ddatblygu cynaliadwy, os oes ystyr iddo o gwbl? Sonia'r Gweinidog am bwysigrwydd datblygu cynaliadwy o fewn ystod polisiau'r Llywodraeth. Pam felly, ym mhwynt 4.1 y ddogfen ymgynghori, y parhawn i sôn am bolisi datblygu economaidd ar sail twf economaidd? Sut y mae hynny'n gyson â datblygu cynaliadwy, Weinidog? Mae gennyf ddi-ddordeb mewn clywed eich sylwadau ar hynny.

Y mae angen arweiniad arnom. A yw'r Gweinidog yn awr yn dweud na fu gennym yr arweiniad hwnnw ers pedair blynedd, a'i fod yn bwriadu bod yn arweinydd a fydd yn dwyn y polisi hwn i ganol ffrwd polisiau a gweithgareddau Llywodraeth Cymru? Beth am y meini prawf yn y llythyron a anfonir i'r cyrff cyhoeddus a noddur gan y Cynulliad?

Differently', says it all. After over four years, the Welsh Assembly Government is starting to implement its sustainable development scheme. What has happened over the past four years? The Minister says that there are reports that note that important work has been done, and important work has been done in terms of incorporating sustainable development into policies. However, what outcomes have emerged over the four years? Would the Minister not expect to see something definitive to which we could refer as having been achieved in this area?

Is there not a fundamental problem? As you said, this sustainable development scheme is the Assembly's scheme. However, the responsibility for implementing it, and the action plan itself, lies with the Welsh Assembly Government. Is there not a problem in terms of drawing everything together? How does the Minister intend to do that and report back on that to the National Assembly for Wales?

On the indicators, Minister, how will they be used to tackle the problem noted in the reports, namely the lack of monitoring of the sustainable development scheme? When the Minister refers in the scheme to the vision, why does it relate only to Wales? Should it not relate to Wales and Wales's role in the world? Surely there must be an international element to sustainable development, if it is to have any meaning. The Minister mentioned the importance of sustainable development within the range of Government policies. Why then, in point 4.1 of the consultation document, are we still talking about an economic development policy on the basis of economic growth? How is that consistent with sustainable development, Minister? I am interested in hearing your comments on that.

We need leadership. Is the Minister now saying that we have been lacking that leadership for four years, and that he intends to be the leader who will mainstream this policy into all the Government of Wales's policies and activities? What about the criteria set out in the letters sent to Assembly sponsored public bodies? The report refers to

Cyfeiria'r adroddiad at y ffaith nad yw'r meini prawf hynny yn glir o ran datblygu cynaliadwy.

Beth am berthynas Llywodraeth y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ag awdurdodau lleol? Mae gwaith da yn mynd rhagddo mewn awdurdodau lleol o ran adnewyddu a delio â gwastraff. Fe'ch cyfeiriaf at bolisi blaengar Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf—un o'r awdurdodau sy'n arwain y ffordd yn y maes hwn. Fodd bynnag, nid oes cysondeb drwy Gymru. Sut y gall y Gweinidog sicrhau y bydd pob awdurdod yn ymateb i'r agenda hwn?

Yn ei chwestiwn ichi yn gynharach, Weinidog, gofynnodd Janet Ryder am ailgylchu gwastraff. Bu ichi roi'r argraff nad oeddech yn ymwybodol o'r Mesur sydd gerbron Tŷ'r Arglwyddi ar hyn o bryd, sy'n sôn am ailgylchu gwastraff. Er nad oedd sôn am Gymru yn y drafft gwreiddiol, y mae erbyn hyn. Pe nai bai rhai ohonom wedi atgoffa Llywodraeth Cymru o hyn, mae'n debyg na fyddai sôn am Gymru o hyd. Fodd bynnag, oherwydd inni gael ein cynnwys, dyma gyfle i bob awdurdod lleol ailgylchu gwastraff ochr y ffordd neu stepen y drws. Sut y caiff hynny ei weithredu yng Nghymru? Er bod angen deddfwriaeth gynradd i ddeddfu ar hynny, gyda Llywodraeth Cymru y mae'r cyfrifoldeb am ei weithredu.

Yn olaf, Weinidog, os oes cymaint wedi digwydd, ac os yw Llywodraeth Cymru wedi bod mor flaengar wrth hyrwyddo'r cysyniad o ddatblygu cynaliadwy, pam y mae Cyngor Defnyddwyr Cymru wedi adrodd bod canran helaeth o boblogaeth Cymru heb y syniad lleiaf o ystyr 'datblygu cynaliadwy', heb sôn am yr hyn sy'n digwydd yn y maes?

Carwyn Jones: Bu ichi ofyn sawl cwestiwn yna. O ran datblygu cynaliadwy, mae'n cymryd amser i bobl ddeall y cysyniad ac i ddeall y bydd yn aros. Cred rhai bod datblygu cynaliadwy yn gysyniad ffasiynol a fydd, ar ôl ychydig flynyddoedd, yn mynd allan drwy'r ffenestr. Nid felly y mae. Bydd yn cymryd amser i gyfleu'r neges mai polisi parhaol ac nid un dros dro ydyw. Y cyfan sydd angen ei wneud yw darllen yr

the fact that those criteria are unclear in terms of sustainable development.

What about the National Assembly Government's relationship with local authorities? Local authorities have undertaken good work in terms of renewal and waste management. I refer you to Rhondda Cynon Taf County Borough Council's innovative policy—one of the authorities leading the way in this matter. However, there is no consistency throughout Wales. How will the Minister ensure that all authorities respond to this agenda?

In her earlier question to you, Minister, Janet Ryder asked about recycling waste. You gave the impression that you were unaware of the Bill currently proceeding through the House of Lords, relating to recycling waste. Although Wales was not mentioned in the original draft, that has since been rectified. Had some of us not reminded the Government of Wales about this, it is likely that Wales would still have no mention. However, because we have been included, here is an opportunity for all local authorities to introduce roadside or doorstep recycling. How will that work in Wales? Although primary legislation is required to enact it, the responsibility for its implementation lies with the Government of Wales.

Finally, Minister, if so much has happened, and if the Government of Wales has been so innovative in promoting sustainable development as a concept, why has the Welsh Consumer Council reported that a significant proportion of the Welsh population has not the faintest idea of what 'sustainable development' means, let alone of what action is being taken?

Carwyn Jones: You posed many questions there. On sustainable development, it takes time for people to understand the concept and to understand that it is here to stay. Some believe that sustainable development is a trendy concept which, after a few years, will be discarded. That is not the case. It will take time to convey the message that this policy is here to stay, and is not transient. All that is required is for people to read the report. It is

adroddiad. Adroddiad annibynnol ydyw sy'n ystyried y gwallau a'r gwendidau yn ogystal â'r cryfderau. Dywed bod y Cynulliad yn sefydliad cymharol newydd, a bod gwaith sylweddol wedi'i wneud dros y tair neu bedair blynedd diwethaf. Rhaid inni gofio mai sefydliad newydd ydym.

Bydd yr adeilad newydd sy'n codi drws nesaf inni yn esiampl o ddatblygu cynaliadwy o ran sut y caiff ei adeiladu a'r adnoddau a ddefnyddir wrth wneud y gwaith adeiladu. Mae'n bwysig inni beidio â phregethu wrth asiantaethau ac awdurdodau lleol heb inni osod esiampl gadarn. Bydd yr adeilad newydd yn gosod esiampl o'r fath.

O ran y strwythur rhyngwladol, yr ydym yn arwain y Rhwydwaith o Lywodraethau Rhanbarthol ar Ddatbygu Cynaliadwy ac mae Cymru, ar y cyd â Gorllewin Awstralia, yn cadeirio'r rhwydwaith. Mae sawl rhanbarth Ewropeaidd yn rhan o'r rhwydwaith, megis Gwlad y Basg a Chatalonia, ac felly hefyd ranbarthau mewn rhannau eraill o'r byd. Mae'r holl ranbarthau hynny'n cydnabod y ffaith bod Cymru'n arwain yn Ewrop. Dywedwyd hynny wrthyf pan oeddwn yn Awstralia yn cadeirio'r gynhadledd a drefnwyd gan Lywodraeth Gorllewin Awstralia. Mae parch rhyngwladol mawr tuag at Gymru fel rhanbarth sydd yn arwain ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy, nid yn unig yn Ewrop ond ledled y byd.

O ran datblygu economaidd, mae'n bwysig holi a ddylem geisio twf o hyd, neu a ddylem ystyried ffon fesur arall. Bydd y cwestiwn hwnnw'n rhan o'r broses ymgynghori. Rhaid ystyried y cwestiynau hyn fel bod pobl yn deall beth yw datblygu cynaliadwy a sut yr eglurir y cysyniad yng nghyd-destun yr economi. Mae rhai'n credu mai mater amgylcheddol yn unig ydyw datblygu cynaliadwy. Nid yw hynny'n wir. Mae materion megis creu cymunedau cynaliadwy a chreu swyddi cynaliadwy na fyddant yn diflannu o Gymru wedi pum mlynedd yn rhan o ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Mae'n gysyniad eang, a bydd yn cymryd amser i bobl ddeall ei union ystyr.

Rhaid i gyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad dalu sylw i bolisi'r Cynulliad ac,

an independent report that considers the mistakes and weaknesses as well as the strengths. It states that the Assembly is a relatively new organisation, and that significant work has been achieved over the last three or four years. We must bear in mind that we are a new institution.

The new building being erected next door to us is an exemplar of sustainable development in terms of how it is being built and the resources used in its construction. It is important that we do not preach at agencies and local authorities without setting a strong example ourselves. The new building will set such an example.

In terms of the international structure, we lead the Regional Government Network for Sustainable Development, with Wales sharing joint chairmanship of the network with Western Australia. Several European regions, such as the Basque Country and Catalonia, are members of the network, as are regions in other parts of the world. All those regions acknowledge the fact that Wales is leading the way in Europe. That was communicated to me when I was in Australia chairing the conference arranged by the Government of Western Australia. There is much international respect for Wales as a region that is taking a lead on sustainable development, not only in Europe but throughout the world.

In terms of economic development, it is important to ask whether we should always aim for growth, or whether we should consider another yardstick. That question will form part of the consultation process. These questions must be considered so that people can understand what sustainable development is and how the concept can be explained in economic terms. Some people believe that sustainable development is only an environmental issue. That is not true. Issues such as creating sustainable communities and creating sustainable jobs that will not disappear from Wales after five years are a part of sustainable development. It is a vast concept and it will take time for people to understand its exact meaning.

Assembly sponsored public bodies must pay heed to the Assembly's policy and, in time,

mewn amser, bydd yn rhaid iddynt ystyried datblygu cynaliadwy fel rhan o'u gwaith o ddydd i ddydd. Yr ydym wedi cyfleu'r neges honno eisoes, a byddwn yn parhau i wneud hynny. Atgoffaf Aelodau'r Cynulliad y cynhelir cynhadledd fawr yng Nghaerdydd ym Mawrth 2004—cynhadledd a fydd yn denu pobl o bob rhan o'r byd. Mae'n cael ei chynnal yma oherwydd awydd pobl i ymweld â Chymru oherwydd ein bod yn arwain y blaen o ran datblygu cynaliadwy. Dylem ymfalchïo yn hynny, ond rhaid inni hefyd gofio bod gwendidau. Rhaid inni ganfod y gwendidau hynny a, chydag amser, sicrhau y cânt eu troi'n gryfderau.

Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey: I welcome the Minister's statement on the consultation exercise on the sustainable development scheme. I particularly welcome his response to the previous speaker. The only way in which we will achieve sustainable development in Wales is by adopting a bottom-up approach—that is, through individuals. I do not agree with the claim that individuals do not understand the concept of sustainable development. Perhaps Preseli Pembrokeshire is different to other areas of Wales in this, although I may be wrong. We seem to have innovative ideas and a dynamic belief in achieving sustainable development. You will be aware of the fact that we have low-impact housing; I believe that we should give further consideration to that and permit further such developments. This area can cause controversy, as it involves people who prefer to opt out of mainstream society and live in low-impact, sustainable housing that will naturally return to the soil, rather than in high-impact, concrete developments. I am thinking in particular of Brithdir Mawr. There are other examples of sustainable development at work in my constituency. You will be aware that a constituent of mine has driven from Land's End to John o'Groats in a vehicle powered by vegetable oil. We are trialling the use of different forms of biofuel in Pembrokeshire. We must all be aware of such developments and consider them.

Again, sustainable construction should be led

they must also consider sustainable development as part of their day-to-day work. We have already conveyed that message and we will continue to do so. I remind Assembly Members that a major conference will be held in Cardiff in March 2004—a conference that will attract people from all over the world. It is being held here as people are eager to visit Wales because we lead the way in terms of sustainable development. We should take pride in that, but we must also remember that there are weaknesses. We must identify those weaknesses and ensure that, in time, they become strengths.

Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey: Croesawaf ddatganiad y Gweinidog ar yr ymarfer ymgynghori ar y cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy. Croesawaf ei ymateb i'r siaradwr blaenorol yn arbennig. Yr unig ffordd y gallwn gyflawni datblygu cynaliadwy yng Nghymru yw drwy fabwysiadu ymagwedd o'r bon i'r brig—hynny yw, drwy unigolion. Ni chytunaf â'r honiad nad yw unigolion yn deall y cysyniad o ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Efallai fod Preseli sir Benfro yn wahanol i ardaloedd eraill yng Nghymru yn hyn o beth, ond gallwn fod yn anghywir. Ymddengys bod gennym syniadau arloesol a chred ddynamig o ran cyflawni datblygu cynaliadwy. Byddwch yn ymwybodol o'r ffaith bod gennym dai nad ydynt yn effeithio llawer ar yr amgylchedd; credaf y dylem roi ystyriaeth bellach i hynny a chaniatáu datblygiadau pellach o'r fath. Gall yr ardal hon achosi dadl, gan ei bod yn cynnwys pobl y mae'n well ganddynt eithrio o gymdeithas prif ffrwd a byw mewn tai cynaliadwy na chânt lawer o effaith ar yr amgylchedd a fydd yn dychwelyd i'r pridd yn naturiol, yn hytrach na datblygiadau concrit a gaiff effaith fawr ar yr amgylchedd. Meddyliaf yn benodol am Frithdir Mawr. Mae enghreifftiau eraill o ddatblygu cynaliadwy ar waith yn fy etholaeth. Byddwch yn ymwybodol i un o'm hetholwyr yrru o Land's End i John o'Groats mewn cerbyd wedi'i bweru gydag olew llysiau. Yr ydym yn treialu'r defnydd o wahanol fathau o fiotanwydd yn sir Benfro. Rhaid inni oll fod yn ymwybodol o ddatblygiadau o'r fath a'u hystyried.

Unwaith eto, dylai adeiladu cynaliadwy gael

from the bottom up. If people are responsible and want to see society change in the long run, and protected for their children and grandchildren, that can be achieved if we consider what we build and what we put on our land. Many responsible people already do this, but such thinking needs to be included in new developments, and must therefore be done in conjunction with the private housing market. Will the Minister consider including the development of low-impact housing and its role within the planning process in this scheme? Such housing has had a controversial birth, which has caused many difficulties. However, it deserves to be considered.

3.00 p.m.

Secondly, will the Minister recognise that residents are responsible for the long-term sustainable development of their communities, in which they can incorporate, for example, the use of renewable energy in their homes? We must support them through the planning process, and through ensuring that private developers and public sector bodies also use renewable energy in buildings.

Thirdly, will the Minister consider biofuels and work with Westminster on the reduction of licensing fees attached to the processing of biofuels, which can replace petrol, diesel and other carbon-based fuels. We must also consider the excise duty on biofuels, which at present makes it unsustainable for biofuels to become real alternatives to carbon-based fuels. That may be difficult to achieve, but I would like you to consider it as part of this exercise.

Finally, we need to work with people within our communities. Pembrokeshire has a lot to offer in terms of energy, building and innovation. Thank you, Minister, for this consultation.

Carwyn Jones: You raised a number of important issues that would take some time to work through. We would need to take up the issue of excise duty on biofuels at a UK level. There is no question that biofuels is a new

ei arwain o'r bôn i'r brig. Os yw pobl yn gyfrifol ac am weld cymdeithas yn newid yn yr hirdymor, ac yn cael ei diogelu ar gyfer eu plant a'u hwyrion a'u hwyresau, gellir cyflawni hynny os ystyriwn yr hyn a adeiladwn a'r hyn a roddwn ar ein tir. Mae llawer o bobl gyfrifol eisoes yn gwneud hyn, ond mae angen i feddylfryd o'r fath gael ei gynnwys mewn datblygiadau newydd, ac felly mae'n rhaid ei wneud ar y cyd â'r farchnad dai breifat. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ystyried cynnwys datblygu tai na chânt lawer o effaith ar yr amgylchedd a'i rôl o fewn y broses gynllunio yn y cynllun hwn? Cafodd tai o'r fath ddechrau dadleuol, sydd wedi achosi sawl anhawster. Fodd bynnag, mae'n haeddu cael ei ystyried.

Yn ail, a wnaiff y Gweinidog gydnabod bod preswylwyr yn gyfrifol am ddatblygu cynaliadwy hirdymor eu cymunedau, lle y gallant ymgorffori, er enghraifft, y defnydd o ynni adnewyddadwy yn eu cartrefi? Rhaid inni eu cefnogi drwy'r broses gynllunio, a thrwy sicrhau bod datblygwyr preifat a chyrrff y sector cyhoeddus hefyd yn defnyddio ynni adnewyddadwy mewn adeiladau.

Yn drydydd, a wnaiff y Gweinidog ystyried biotanwydd a gweithio gyda San Steffan i leihau'r ffioedd trwyddedu sy'n gysylltiedig â phrosesu biotanwydd, a all ddisodli petrol, disel a thanwydd arall sy'n seiliedig ar garbon. Rhaid inni hefyd ystyried y dreth doll ar fiodanwydd, sydd ar hyn o bryd yn golygu mai anghynaliadwy fyddai gwneud biotanwydd yn ddewis amgen gwirioneddol i danwydd sy'n seiliedig ar garbon. Gallai fod yn anodd cyflawni hynny, ond hoffem ichi ei ystyried fel rhan o'r ymarfer hwn.

Yn olaf, mae angen inni weithio gyda phobl o fewn ein cymunedau. Mae gan sir Benfro lawer i'w gynnig o ran ynni, adeiladu ac arloesedd. Diolch ichi, Weinidog, am yr ymgynghoriad hwn.

Carwyn Jones: Codasoch sawl mater pwysig y byddai'n cymryd peth amser i'w trafod. Byddai angen inni godi'r mater o dreth doll ar fiodanwydd ar lefel y DU. Yn ddi-au mae biotanwydd yn faes newydd a chyffrous. Nid

and exciting area. I am not sure at what speed your constituent drove from Land's End to John o'Groats, but the important thing is that he got there. The saying 'from little acorns great trees grow' comes to mind.

An important point to consider is how we seek to deliver a sustainable planning system. Historically, a planning system exists in order to provide a regulated supply of land. Does that fit in with our commitment to sustainability? The planning system is almost a completely devolved responsibility. Do we need to look at the area more seriously and ask how we can develop a planning system that maintains a regulated supply of sustainable land? We will face these questions over the next few years. To reiterate previous points, the first step in terms of implementing a new idea is ensuring that people accept that it will be around for a long time. The second step is ensuring that it is understood. We are in the process of taking those steps and, once they have been achieved, we will be able to consider how it will work in practice. Sustainable development has been mainstreamed through the work of the entire Assembly Government civil service, and our new building will be a fine example of what can be done when a building is constructed on the principle of sustainability. We will face a number of difficult and interesting questions over the next few years, which will include the planning system.

Glyn Davies: I welcome your report and the launch of the consultation. There is nothing in your statement with which I would wish to take issue. I support everything that you said and agree with the four proposals included in the report. I look forward to reading the CAG report. The references included in your statement are not surprising. On one hand, there is no question that the Assembly has been innovative in taking forward a sustainable development scheme, which is reflected in the report's positive comments to which you referred. The Assembly can be proud of its work, and there are co-ordination mechanisms of which we can all be proud.

I have one question to ask at the end of this short preamble, or at least reasonable

wyf yn siŵr ar ba gyflymder y teithiodd eich etholwr o Land's End i John o'Groats, ond y peth pwysig yw iddo gyrraedd. Daw'r dywediad 'daw dydd y bydd mawr y rhai bychain' i gof.

Pwynt pwysig i'w ystyried yw sut y ceisiwn gyflwyno system gynllunio gynaliadwy. Yn hanesyddol, mae system gynllunio'n bodoli er mwyn darparu cyflenwad o dir wedi'i reoleiddio. A yw hynny'n cyd-fynd â'n hymrwymiad i gynaliadwyedd? Mae'r system gynllunio bron yn gyfan gwbl yn gyfrifoldeb datganoledig. A oes angen inni edrych ar y maes yn fwy difrifol a gofyn sut y gallwn ddatblygu system gynllunio sy'n cynnal cyflenwad o dir cynaliadwy wedi'i reoleiddio? Byddwn yn wynebu'r cwestiynau hyn dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd nesaf. Er mwyn ailadrodd pwyntiau blaenorol, y cam cyntaf o ran rhoi syniad newydd ar waith yw sicrhau bod pobl yn derbyn y bydd yn bodoli am amser maith. Yr ail gam yw sicrhau bod pobl yn ei ddeall. Yr ydym wrthi'n cymryd y camau hynny ac, wedi iddynt gael eu cyflawni, byddwn yn gallu ystyried sut y bydd yn gweithio'n ymarferol. Mae datblygu cynaliadwy wedi cael ei brif ffrydio drwy waith gwasanaeth sifil cyfan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, a bydd ein hadeilad newydd yn enghraifft wych o'r hyn y gellir ei wneud pan gaiff adeilad ei adeiladu yn unol ag egwyddor cynaliadwyedd. Byddwn yn wynebu nifer o gwestiynau anodd a diddorol dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd nesaf, a fydd yn cynnwys y system gynllunio.

Glyn Davies: Croesawaf eich adroddiad a lansio'r ymgynghoriad. Nid oes unrhyw beth yn eich datganiad yr hoffwn ei godi. Cefnogaf bopeth yr ydych wedi ei ddweud a chytunaf â'r pedwar cynnig yn yr adroddiad. Edrychaf ymlaen at ddarllen adroddiad CAG. Nid yw'r cyfeiriadau yn eich datganiad yn fy synnu. Ar y naill law, nid oes amheuaeth bod y Cynulliad wedi bod yn arloesol o ran datblygu cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy, a adlewyrchir yn sylwadau cadarnhaol yr adroddiad y cyfeiriasoch atynt. Gall y Cynulliad ymfalchïo yn ei waith, a cheir dulliau cydgysylltu y gallwn oll ymfalchïo ynddynt.

Mae gennyf un cwestiwn i'w ofyn ar ddiwedd y rhagarweiniad byr hwn, neu o

preamble, Llywydd.

The Presiding Officer: It has been a fairly reasonable preamble so far.

Glyn Davies: My question relates to delivery. The report comments negatively that there is little evidence of real change on the ground. That is a strong statement. I looked at the comments you made on 24 June and you were right to say that

‘we are now expected to deliver tangible changes in the way Wales lives and works’.

We must focus on the actions that will deliver radical changes. I only have one question for you—it is more of a challenge at this stage because the detailed questions will follow later when we discuss this in the spring—namely, what are your ambitions for making tangible changes? I do not mean conceptual change and discussing co-ordination mechanisms. If this is to have the desired impact, there will have to be tangible changes on the ground that people can see and relate to. What changes do you want to see, and what will you consider to be a success at the end of your term as Minister?

Carwyn Jones: Work can be done in several areas, such as economic growth, building and local procurement. For example, a strong theme of ‘Farming for the Future’, is that we want to secure a sustainable farming industry. It makes clear that sustainability does not simply relate to the environment, but also social and economic sustainability in terms of our rural communities.

Following the CAP reforms, it is important that we have an opportunity to consider creating a sustainable farming industry that is in harmony with the environment—an industry that is not forced to produce animals at a rate beyond which many farmers are comfortable with. The farming industry must become economically sustainable—to sustain

leiaf y rhagarweiniad rhesymol hwn, Lywydd.

Y Llywydd: Bu’n rhagarweiniad eithaf rhesymol hyd yma.

Glyn Davies: Mae fy nghwestiwn yn ymwneud â chyflawni. Mae sylwadau negyddol yn yr adroddiad ynghylch y ffaith mai prin yw’r dystiolaeth o newid gwirioneddol ar lawr gwlad. Mae hynny’n ddatganiad cryf. Edrychais ar y sylwadau a wnaethoch ar 24 Mehefin ac yr oeddech yn iawn i ddweud

‘bod disgwyl yn awr...inni sicrhau newidiadau gwirioneddol yn y modd y mae Cymru’n byw ac yn gweithio’.

Rhaid inni ganolbwyntio ar y camau a fydd yn cyflawni newidiadau radical. Dim ond un cwestiwn sydd gennyf ichi—mae’n fwy o her yn awr gan y bydd y cwestiynau manwl yn dilyn yn nes ymlaen pan fyddwn yn trafod hyn yn y gwanwyn—sef, beth yw eich dyheadau ar gyfer gwneud newidiadau gwirioneddol? Nid wyf yn golygu newid cysyniadol a thrafod dulliau cydgysylltu. Os ydym am sicrhau bod hyn yn cael yr effaith a ddymunir, bydd angen newidiadau gwirioneddol ar lawr gwlad y gall pobl eu gweld ac uniaethu â hwy. Pa newidiadau yr ydych am eu gweld, a beth y byddwch yn ei ystyried yn llwyddiant ar ddiwedd eich tymor fel Gweinidog?

Carwyn Jones: Gellir gwneud gwaith mewn sawl maes, fel twf economaidd, adeiladu a chaffael lleol. Er enghraifft, un o brif themâu ‘Ffermio i’r Dyfodol’, yw ein bod am sicrhau diwydiant ffermio cynaliadwy. Gwna’n glir nad yw cynaliadwyedd yn ymwneud â’r amgylchedd yn unig. Mae hefyd yn ymwneud â chynaliadwyedd cymdeithasol ac economaidd mewn perthynas â’n cymunedau gwledig.

Yn dilyn diwygio’r PAC, mae’n bwysig ein bod yn cael cyfle i ystyried creu diwydiant ffermio cynaliadwy sydd mewn cytgord â’r amgylchedd—diwydiant na chaiff ei orfodi i gynhyrchu anifeiliaid ar gyflymder y tu hwnt i’r hyn y mae nifer o ffermwyr yn gyffyrddus ag ef. Rhaid i’r diwydiant ffermio fod yn economaidd gynaliadwy—i gynnal y rhai

those who live on the land and the communities in which farmers live. CAP reforms will make the whole of the rural economy more sustainable due to the prospects offered by decoupling, which will liberate farmers from having to produce animals that they often do not want to produce. That will be followed by the realistic prospect of prices rising in the market, which we have witnessed over the past two years, particularly with sheep meat, as the number of animals going to market has decreased because of the effects of the foot and mouth disease outbreak. CAP reform is a prime example of how we can make farming more sustainable on all three fronts: first, environmentally because it means that any problems with over-grazing will be reduced; secondly, in terms of the economy because it will help to ensure that farmers can drive a better income; and, thirdly, by ensuring that as farming prospers, our rural communities prosper in tandem.

Mick Bates: I am sure that there is cross-party support for the principle of sustainable development. We have already agreed that we have a strategic direction in this work. I also join you in paying tribute to Sue Essex for establishing these schemes. However, I am concerned that we will get bogged down in process, which will lead to a lack of action. I will cite three issues on which I want to hear your views. This morning, many of us heard Morgan Parry of the World Wildlife Fund on Radio Wales. He expressed concerns about our ASPBs and their delivery of the Assembly's commitment to sustainable development. Their culture appears to be opposed to our strategic direction for sustainable development. It is possible that our ASPBs and local authorities do not have the capacity to deliver our desired actions. What will you do to change that culture and improve that capacity? That is the most fundamental question in terms of delivery. I have previously suggested that a simple change of name from the Welsh Development Agency to the Welsh Sustainable Development Agency may strike a chord with people and change that culture.

Your statement makes no mention of enhancing the energies of the young people

sy'n byw ar y tir a'r cymunedau y mae ffermwyr yn byw ynddynt. Bydd y diwygiadau i'r PAC yn gwneud yr economi wledig gyfan yn fwy cynaliadwy oherwydd y cyfleoedd a gynigir drwy ddatgysylltu, a fydd yn rhyddhau ffermwyr rhag gorfod ffermio anifeiliaid nad ydynt yn aml am eu ffermio. Caiff hynny ei ddilyn gan y gobaith realistig y bydd prisiau'n codi yn y farchnad, rhywbeth yr ydym wedi bod yn dyst iddo dros y ddwy flynedd diwethaf, yn arbennig gyda chig dafad, gan fod nifer yr anifeiliaid sy'n mynd i'r farchnad wedi gostwng oherwydd effeithiau clwy'r traed a'r genau. Mae diwygio'r PAC yn enghraifft wych o sut y gallwn sicrhau bod ffermio'n fwy cynaliadwy o dair ongl: yn gyntaf, yn amgylcheddol gan ei fod yn golygu y bydd problemau gorbori yn lleihau; yn ail, o ran yr economi gan y bydd yn helpu i sicrhau y gall ffermwyr ennill gwell incwm; ac, yn drydydd, drwy sicrhau wrth i ffermio ffynnu, y bydd ein cymunedau gwledig yn ffynnu ar yr un pryd.

Mick Bates: Yr wyf yn siŵr bod cefnogaeth drawsbleidiol i'r egwyddor o ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Yr ydym eisoes wedi cytuno bod gennym gyfeiriad strategol yn y gwaith hwn. Ymunaf innau â chi hefyd i dalu teyrnged i Sue Essex am sefydlu'r cynlluniau hyn. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn pryderu y bydd y broses yn ein bodd, ac y bydd hynny yn arwain at ddiffyg gweithredu. Nodaf dri mater yr wyf am glywed eich barn arnynt. Y bore yma, clywodd llawer ohonom Morgan Parry o'r Gronfa Natur Fyd-eang ar Radio Wales. Mynegodd bryderon am y CCNC a'r modd y maent yn cyflawni ymrwymiad y Cynulliad i ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Ymddengys bod eu diwylliant yn groes i'n cyfeiriad strategol ar gyfer datblygu cynaliadwy. Mae'n bosibl nad oes gan ein CCNC ac awdurdodau lleol y gallu i gyflawni'r camau a ddymunwn. Beth a wnewch i newid y diwylliant hwnnw ac i wella'r gallu hwnnw? Dyna'r cwestiwn mwyaf sylfaenol o ran cyflawni. Yr wyf wedi awgrymu yn y gorffennol y gallai cam syml o newid enw Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru i Awdurdod Datblygu Cynaliadwy Cymru daro deuddeg gyda phobl a newid y diwylliant hwnnw.

Nid oes sôn yn eich datganiad am gynyddu brwdfrydedd pobl ifanc Cymru. Yr ifanc

of Wales. The young are the best people to educate their parents and others. There is no mention of support, for example, for an all-Wales youth sustainable development forum. You need to address that issue because young people will publicise our desires and philosophy in the best way possible, namely on the ground in their communities.

Others have referred to one of your comments regarding the CAG report, which states that there is little evidence that real change is happening on the ground. You admit that, and even identify the worst area in terms of lack of change, which is in your planning portfolio. For example, we discuss meeting our commitments on climate change and hitting targets, yet we are still waiting for the technical advice notes to let local authorities know how to develop renewable energy. The previous Minister told me that they would be ready last June; it is now October. When will TAN 8 be available to encourage local authorities to deliver a renewable energy commitment, which will help us to achieve our sustainable development aspirations?

3.10 p.m.

Finally, there are many good examples from around the country on footprint work, such as that on the Isle of Wight. The WWF has done work in Wales. When will we have an action plan based on the reduction of our footprint, particularly in terms of waste?

Carwyn Jones: You raised several issues. Much work is already being done on waste in terms of the 'Wise About Waste' strategy, but we must make improvements in several areas. Wales landfills between 90 and 95 per cent of its waste because, historically, that was the easiest option, given our geography. In the future, that will not be the case. We know that local authorities have been set a target of recycling 15 per cent of their area's waste by 2010. Some may say that that is ambitious, but it is important to strike a balance between setting a tough target and setting an achievable one. That will help to reduce our footprint, although that concept encompasses several different issues. I

yw'r bobl orau i addysgu eu rhieni ac eraill. Nid oes sôn am gymorth, er enghraifft, ar gyfer fforwm datblygu cynaliadwy i ieuenctid Cymru gyfan. Mae angen ichi fynd i'r afael â'r mater hwnnw gan y bydd pobl ifanc yn rhoi cyhoeddusrwydd i'n dyheadau a'n hathroniaeth yn y ffordd orau bosibl, sef ar lawr gwlad yn eu cymunedau.

Mae eraill wedi cyfeirio at un o'ch sylwadau ynghylch adroddiad CAG, sy'n nodi mai prin yw'r dystiolaeth bod newid gwirioneddol yn digwydd ar lawr gwlad. Yr ydych yn cyfaddef hynny, a hyd yn oed yn nodi'r ardal waethaf o ran diffyg newid, sydd yn eich portffolio cynllunio. Er enghraifft, trafodwn wireddu ein hymrwymiaidau ar newid yn yr hinsawdd a chyrraedd targedau, ond yr ydym yn parhau i aros am y nodiadau cyngor technegol i roi gwybod i awdurdodau lleol sut i ddatblygu ynni adnewyddadwy. Dywedodd y Gweinidog blaenorol wrthyf y byddent yn barod fis Mehefin diwethaf; erbyn hyn mae'n fis Hydref. Pa bryd y bydd TAN 8 ar gael i annog awdurdodau lleol i ymrwmo i ddatblygu ynni adnewyddadwy, a fydd yn ein helpu i gyflawni ein dyheadau o ran datblygu cynaliadwy?

Yn olaf, mae sawl enghraifft dda ledled y wlad o waith ôl troed, fel ar Ynys Wyth. Mae'r Gronfa Natur Fyd-eang wedi gwneud gwaith yng Nghymru. Pa bryd y bydd gennym gynllun gweithredu yn seiliedig ar leihau ein hól troed, yn arbennig o ran gwastraff?

Carwyn Jones: Codasoch sawl mater. Mae llawer o waith eisoes yn cael ei wneud ar wastraff fel rhan o'r strategaeth 'Yn Gall Gyda Gwastraff', ond rhaid inni wneud gwelliannau mewn sawl maes. Mae Cymru yn tirlenwi rhwng 90 a 95 y cant o'i gwastraff oherwydd, yn hanesyddol ac o gofio ein daearyddiaeth, dyna oedd yr opsiwn hawsaf. Yn y dyfodol, ni fydd hynny'n wir. Gwyddom fod targed wedi cael ei osod i awdurdodau lleol ailgylchu 15 y cant o wastraff eu hardal erbyn 2010. Efallai y bydd rhai yn dweud bod hyn yn uchelgeisiol, ond mae'n bwysig cael cydbwysedd rhwng gosod targed anodd a gosod targed y gellir ei gyrraedd. Bydd hynny'n helpu i leihau ein

attended an interesting lecture on the concept of the ecological footprint when I was in Perth, which gave me much food for thought.

I heard the interview this morning which suggested that, among the higher echelons of some ASPBs, there was open hostility to the idea of sustainable development. That is not a useful attitude, if it exists. ASPBs form a part of the government structure, and must be involved in the mainstreaming of sustainable development. There is no escaping from that. We cannot say that the Assembly, through what it controls directly, should pay heed to the principles of sustainable development, but that ASPBs should not. That is not a sustainable attitude for the future.

We would have to carefully consider how we encourage local authorities to deliver on their targets. There are many good officers in local authorities. I know of one in particular in my constituency who has a great knowledge of biodiversity and the environmental limb of sustainable development. However, these officers need encouragement, which brings us back to the need to ensure that people understand that sustainable development is a serious matter, which cannot be given short shrift. It is not about producing some kind of scheme and putting it on the shelf.

On involving young people, I do not recall that the issue of an all-Wales youth forum has been raised with me previously, but when the First Minister went to the Earth Summit in Johannesburg last year, he was accompanied by some young people—I cannot remember exactly how many—representing Welsh youth. Therefore, young people have been involved, and that visit was a great success in terms of demonstrating that young people are involved and interested in sustainable development. Ultimately, that summit led to the Gauteng declaration, which set up the network of regional governments for sustainable development that we co-chair.

As I mentioned in Committee this morning, I

hól troed, er bod y cysyniad hwnnw'n cwmpasu sawl mater gwahanol. Mynychais ddarlith ddiddorol ar y cysyniad o'r ôl troed ecolegol pan oeddwn yn Perth, a chefais cryn dipyn i feddwl amdano.

Clywais y cyfweiliad y bore yma a awgrymodd bod gelyniaeth agored tuag at y syniad o ddatblygu cynaliadwy ymysg haenau uwch rhai CCNC. Nid yw honno'n agwedd ddefnyddiol, os yw'n bodoli. Mae CCNC yn ffurfio rhan o strwythur y llywodraeth, a rhaid iddynt fod yn rhan o brif ffrydio datblygu cynaliadwy. Nid oes dianc rhag hynny. Ni allwn ddweud y dylai'r Cynulliad, drwy'r hyn y mae'n ei reoli'n uniongyrchol, dalu sylw i egwyddorion datblygu cynaliadwy, ond na ddylai CCNC wneud hynny. Nid yw hynny'n ymagwedd gynaliadwy tuag at y dyfodol.

Byddai'n rhaid inni ystyried yn ofalus sut y byddem yn annog awdurdodau lleol i gyflawni eu targedau. Mae sawl swyddog da mewn awdurdodau lleol. Gwn am un yn arbennig yn fy etholaeth a chanddo gryn wybodaeth am fioamrywiaeth ac ochr amgylcheddol datblygu cynaliadwy. Fodd bynnag, mae angen anogaeth ar y swyddogion hyn, sy'n dod â ni yn ôl at yr angen i sicrhau bod pobl yn deall bod datblygu cynaliadwy yn fater difrifol, na ellir ei anwybyddu. Nid yw'n ymwneud â chynhyrchu rhyw fath o gynllun a'i roi ar y silff.

O ran cynnwys pobl ifanc, ni chofiaf i'r mater yn ymwneud â fforwm ieuencid i Gymru gyfan gael ei godi gyda mi o'r blaen, ond pan aeth y Prif Weinidog i Uwchgynhadledd y Ddaear yn Johannesburg y llynedd, aeth rhai pobl ifanc gydag ef—ni allaf gofio yn union faint—yn cynrychioli ieuencid Cymru. Felly, mae pobl ifanc wedi cael eu cynnwys, ac yr oedd yr ymweliad hwnnw'n llwyddiant mawr o ran dangos bod pobl ifanc yn cymryd rhan ac yn dangos diddordeb mewn datblygu cynaliadwy. Yn y pen draw, arweiniodd yr uwchgynhadledd honno at ddatganiad Gauteng, a sefydlodd y rhwydwaith llywodraethau rhanbarthol ar gyfer datblygu cynaliadwy yr ydym yn ei gyd-gadeirio.

Fel y soniais yn y Pwyllgor y bore yma,

will report further on TAN 8 in the next Committee meeting; I hope that I will have further information for you then.

cyflwynaf adroddiad pellach ar TAN 8 yng nghyfarfod nesaf y Pwyllgor; gobeithio y bydd gennyf wybodaeth bellach ichi bryd hynny.

**Datganiad ar Ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru
i Ymchwiliad Victoria Climbié
Statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's Response
to the Victoria Climbié Inquiry**

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt): I draw Members' attention to the publication of the Assembly Government's response to the Victoria Climbié inquiry, which was discussed this morning by the Health and Social Services Committee. This is a matter that should be of concern to all Assembly Members, since the responsibility for protecting children touches on many aspects of public services and all our joint interests. As Lord Laming reported, Victoria was failed by all the services with which she came into contact. Our job, in the light of this inquiry, is to do all that we can to prevent such a systematic breakdown from ever happening again.

Lord Laming made 73 recommendations for health and social care, most of which represent established good practice. In March, I wrote to all local authorities, health authorities, NHS trusts and local health boards in Wales, drawing their attention to these recommendations. The chief inspector of the Social Services Inspectorate for Wales issued guidance to all local authorities to assist them in auditing their position against these good practice recommendations. The inspectorate is now validating their responses. Work is currently in hand to take the remaining recommendations forward. Consultation with all child protection agencies in Wales began last Friday with a conference in south Wales, and one is planned for north Wales on 15 October.

In England, the Government has launched a consultation process on the proposals in its Green Paper, 'Every Child Matters'. While most of the proposals relate to devolved

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt): Tynnaf sylw'r Aelodau at gyhoeddi ymateb Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i ymchwiliad Victoria Climbié, a drafodwyd y bore yma gan y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Dylai hwn fod yn fater pryder i holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad, gan fod y cyfrifoldeb am amddiffyn plant yn cyffwrdd â sawl agwedd ar wasanaethau cyhoeddus a phob un o'n buddiannau cyffredin. Fel yr adroddodd yr Arglwydd Laming, methodd pob un o'r gwasanaethau y daeth Victoria i gysylltiad â hwy a gofalu amdani. Ein gwaith, yng ngoleuni'r ymchwiliad hwn, yw gwneud popeth o fewn ein gallu i atal methiant systematig o'r fath rhag digwydd fyth eto.

Gwnaeth yr Arglwydd Laming 73 o argymhellion ar gyfer iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol, y mae'r rhan fwyaf ohonynt yn arfer da cydnabyddedig. Ym mis Mawrth, ysgrifennais at bob un o'r awdurdodau lleol, awdurdodau iechyd, ymddiriedolaethau GIG a byrddau iechyd lleol yng Nghymru, gan dynnu eu sylw at yr argymhellion hyn. Rhoddodd prif arolygydd yr Arolygiaeth Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Cymru ganllawiau i bob awdurdod lleol i'w cynorthwyo i gynnal archwiliad o'u sefyllfa yn erbyn yr argymhellion arfer da hyn. Mae'r arolygiaeth ar hyn o bryd yn dilysu eu hymatebion. Mae gwaith ar y gweill ar hyn o bryd i weithredu ar yr argymhellion sy'n weddill. Dechreuodd ymgynghoriad gyda'r holl asiantaethau amddiffyn plant yng Nghymru ddydd Gwener diwethaf, gyda chynhadledd yn y De a bwriedir cynnal un yn y Gogledd ar 15 Hydref.

Yn Lloegr, lansiodd y Llywodraeth broses ymgynghori ar y cynigion yn ei Phapur Gwyrdd 'Mae Pob Plentyn yn Bwysig'. Er bod y rhan fwyaf o'r cynigion yn ymwneud â

matters, the consultation will include discussions with the Assembly Government on the extent to which we might wish to take advantage of any legislative opportunity to make changes in Wales. I began that process at a recent meeting with Margaret Hodge. In Wales, over the last four years, we have developed a distinctive approach to services for children and young people. One of our first priorities was to establish a commissioner for children in Wales who is required by law to have regard for the United Nations convention on the rights of the child. The Green Paper now proposes to establish a similar post for children in England. Our successful Welsh experience will provide a model for England to follow. I will shortly be meeting Peter Clarke to discuss arrangements for the presentation of his second annual report to the Assembly in Plenary.

We have also tackled the issue of co-ordination at all levels. As the Minister with responsibility for children, I chair a Cabinet sub-committee on children and young people. As well as focusing on the key issue of child protection, the sub-committee will focus its work this year on the themes of nutrition and exercise, transport, and transitions. These cut across the portfolios of all Ministers in the sub-committee.

Health authorities and local authorities are working with the voluntary sector to guarantee co-ordinated service planning and delivery through children and young people's framework partnerships. The statistics from yesterday on local authority personal social services showed that we are beginning to see improved performance on key indicators for children's services. Fewer children are leaving care without at least a basic GCSE qualification, almost every young person who leaves care aged 16 receives a suitable plan for his or her continuing care, and more child protection cases are being reviewed. We have invested heavily in Children First to improve services across Wales, but we know that some authorities still face challenges. The new partnerships aim to bring all services for children, wherever they live in Wales, up to the levels of the best, and to ensure that those services work together to meet children's

materion datganoledig, bydd yr ymgynghoriad yn cynnwys trafodaethau gyda Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ynglŷn â'r graddau y byddem yn dymuno manteisio ar unrhyw gyfle deddfu i wneud newidiadau yng Nghymru. Dechreuais ar y broses honno mewn cyfarfod diweddar gyda Margaret Hodge. Yng Nghymru, dros y pedair blynedd diwethaf, yr ydym wedi datblygu ymagwedd wahanol tuag at wasanaethau i blant a phobl ifanc. Un o'n blaenoriaethau cyntaf oedd sefydlu comisiynydd i blant yng Nghymru y mae'n ofynnol iddo yn ôl y gyfraith roi sylw i gonfensiwn y Cenhedloedd Unedig ar hawliau'r plentyn. Mae'r Papur Gwyrdd yn awr yn cynnig sefydlu swydd debyg ar gyfer plant yn Lloegr. Bydd ein profiad llwyddiannus yng Nghymru yn batrwm i Loegr ei ddilyn. Yn fuan byddaf yn cwrdd â Peter Clarke i drafod y trefniadau ar gyfer cyflwyno ei ail adroddiad blynyddol i'r Cynulliad mewn Cyfarfod Llawn.

Yr ydym hefyd wedi mynd i'r afael â mater cyd-drefnu ar bob lefel. Fel y Gweinidog â chyfrifoldeb dros blant, byddaf yn cadeirio is-bwyllgor plant a phobl ifanc y Cabinet. Yn ogystal â chanolbwyntio ar fater allweddol amddiffyn plant, bydd yr is-bwyllgor yn canolbwyntio eleni ar themâu maethiad ac ymarfer corff, trafndiaeth a chyfnodau pontio. Mae'r rhain yn gorgyffwrdd portffolio pob Gweinidog yn yr is-bwyllgor.

Mae awdurdodau iechyd ac awdurdodau lleol yn gweithio gyda'r sector gwirfoddol i sicrhau y caiff gwaith cynllunio a chyflwyno gwasanaethau ei gydgysylltu drwy bartneriaethau fframwaith plant a phobl ifanc. Dengys yr ystadegau a gafwyd ddoe ar wasanaethau cymdeithasol personol awdurdodau lleol ein bod yn dechrau gweld perfformiad gwell ar ddangosyddion allweddol ar gyfer gwasanaethau plant. Mae llai o blant yn gadael gofal heb o leiaf gymhwyster TGAU sylfaenol, mae bron pob person ifanc 16 oed sy'n gadael gofal yn cael cynllun addas ar gyfer ei ofal neu ei gofal parhaus, ac mae mwy o achosion amddiffyn plant yn cael eu hadolygu. Yr ydym wedi buddsoddi'n drwm yn Plant yn Gyntaf i wella gwasanaethau ledled Cymru, ond gwyddom fod rhai awdurdodau yn dal i wynebu heriau. Anela'r partneriaethau newydd at sicrhau bod pob gwasanaeth i blant, lle bynnag y maent

needs, especially the needs of those who face complex health or social problems, or who are at risk of harm or neglect. Driving up standards is a key target for us, and one which the national services framework will address head on.

We have appointed a director of children's healthcare for Wales, who will work with other professional advisers to focus on standards and outcomes for children. In the restructuring of my Department for Health and Social Care within the Assembly Government, there will be further strengthening at a senior level to ensure improved co-ordination and integration in policy-making for children's services, as well as in implementation. We are determined to tackle child poverty in Wales: an expert group is working with the Assembly to develop a strategy to tackle both its causes and effects. This will build on the impressive work being done across Wales through the major grant scheme, Cymorth, which totals nearly £40 million this year.

The social care workforce is central to all these initiatives. We have put in place a strategic framework, which will tackle some of the workforce issues identified in social care, including in children's services. Local authorities and other key employers, such as the NHS and the voluntary sector, are working together in partnerships: for example, to support the development of better training and development strategies. All local authorities are in regional social care partnerships, and are tackling issues such as recruitment and retention and the development of learning supply together. Later this year, I plan to publish our version of a Green Paper on the children's strategy for Wales, which will build on the foundations for partnership that we have already laid. I am determined that children and young people should remain at the heart of the Assembly Government's agenda, with the protection of our most vulnerable children at the forefront, and that we should continue to drive forward innovation and development

yn byw yng Nghymru, yn cyrraedd safon y gwasanaethau gorau a sicrhau bod y gwasanaethau hynny yn gweithio gyda'i gilydd i ddiwallu anghenion plant, yn enwedig anghenion y rhai hynny sy'n wynebu problemau iechyd neu gymdeithasol cymhleth, neu sydd mewn perygl o niwed neu esgeulustod. Mae codi'r safonau yn darged allweddol inni, ac yn un y bydd y fframwaith gwasanaethau cenedlaethol yn mynd i'r afael ag ef.

Yr ydym wedi penodi cyfarwyddwr gofal iechyd plant yng Nghymru, a fydd yn gweithio gyda chynghorwyr proffesiynol eraill i ganolbwyntio ar safonau a chanlyniadau i blant. Wrth ailstrwythuro fy Adran Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol o fewn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, bydd cryfhau pellach ar lefel uwch i sicrhau gwell cyd-drefnu ac integreiddio o ran llunio polisïau ar gyfer gwasanaethau plant, yn ogystal â'u rhoi ar waith. Yr ydym yn benderfynol o fynd i'r afael â thlodi plant yng Nghymru: mae grŵp o arbenigwyr yn gweithio gyda'r Cynulliad i ddatblygu strategaeth i fynd i'r afael â'i achosion a'i ganlyniadau. Bydd hyn yn adeiladu ar y gwaith trawiadol a wneir ledled Cymru drwy Cymorth, y prif gynllun grant, sy'n werth bron £40 miliwn eleni.

Mae'r gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol yn ganolog i'r holl fentrau hyn. Yr ydym wedi rhoi fframwaith strategol ar waith, a fydd yn mynd i'r afael â rhai o'r materion gweithlu a nodwyd mewn gofal cymdeithasol, gan gynnwys gwasanaethau plant. Mae awdurdodau lleol a chyflogwyr allweddol eraill, megis y GIG a'r sector gwirfoddol, yn gweithio gyda'i gilydd mewn partneriaethau: er enghraifft, i gefnogi'r broses o ddatblygu gwell strategaethau hyfforddiant a datblygu. Mae'r holl awdurdodau lleol mewn partneriaethau gofal cymdeithasol rhanbarthol, ac maent yn mynd i'r afael â materion megis recriwtio a chadw staff a datblygu cyflenwi dysgu ar y cyd. Yn ddiweddarach eleni, bwriadaf gyhoeddi ein fersiwn ni o Bapur Gwyrdd ar y strategaeth blant ar gyfer Cymru, a fydd yn adeiladu ar y sylfeini ar gyfer partneriaeth a osodwyd gennym eisoes. Yr wyf yn benderfynol y dylai plant a phobl ifanc barhau i fod wrth wraidd agenda Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, gydag amddiffyn ein plant mwyaf

for children and young people.

David Lloyd: I commend the Minister on bringing forward this report on the truly horrific circumstances that surrounded the death of Victoria Climbié. We had a comprehensive debate on this matter in the Health and Social Services Committee meeting this morning, so I will not go over old ground. However, some issues are worth fleshing out.

The horrific death of a child through neglect and abuse is, thankfully, a rare occurrence but, whenever it happens, it justifiably makes the headlines and we have a series of reports.

3.20 p.m.

We remember the case of Maria Colwell from 1974. As mentioned at this morning's Committee meeting, since the Assembly's inception we have had the Waterhouse report and the Carlile report, and now the Victoria Climbié report, as well as adverse joint reviews of social services. Despite years of such reports and many worthy recommendations, the reality is that much needs to be done and huge challenges remain. I am sure the Minister is aware of this, as just a brief scrutiny of some of the joint review reports would reveal that.

A main issue alluded to in your statement is the situation of the social care workforce. A central recommendation in many of these reports is an investigation into the state of the social care workforce, the recruitment and retention of social workers and Government action to raise workforce morale. The workforce is under pressure and demoralised, and is seemingly attacked from all corners, particularly when matters go disastrously wrong, as in this case. The workforce feels as though the mostly good work that is done goes unreported.

To cut to the chase, as I mentioned this morning, we want this report and those

diamddiffyn yn flaenaf, ac y dylem barhau i hybu gwaith arloesi a datblygu i blant a phobl ifanc.

David Lloyd: Canmolaf y Gweinidog ar gyflwyno'r adroddiad hwn ar yr amgylchiadau gwirioneddol ofnadwy ynglŷn â marwolaeth Victoria Climbié. Cawsom ddatl gynhwysfawr ar y mater hwn yn y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol y bore yma, felly nid af dros y tir hwnnw eto. Fodd bynnag mae'n werth ymhelaethu ar rai materion.

Mae marwolaeth frawychus plentyn o ganlyniad i esgeulustod neu gam-drin, diolch byth, yn ddigwyddiad prin ond, pan fo'n digwydd, mae'n cael sylw yn y cyfryngau, a hynny'n gyfiawn a chawn gyfres o adroddiadau.

Cofiw'n achos Maria Colwell o 1974. Fel y crybwyllwyd yn y cyfarfod o'r Pwyllgor y bore yma, ers cychwyn y Cynulliad cawsom adroddiad Waterhouse ac adroddiad Carlile, ac yn awr adroddiad Victoria Climbié, ynghyd ag adolygiadau ar y cyd o wasanaethau cymdeithasol sydd wedi bod yn anffafriol. Er gwaethaf blynyddoedd o adroddiadau o'r fath a llawer o argymhellion teilwng, y gwir yw bod angen gwneud llawer a bod heriau anferth o hyd. Yr wyf yn siŵr bod y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol o hyn, gan y byddai craffu'n fyr ar rai o'r adroddiadau ar cyd yn dangos hynny.

Un prif fater a grybwyllwyd yn eich datganiad yw sefyllfa'r gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol. Argymhelliad canolog mewn llawer o'r adroddiadau hyn yw ymchwiliad i gyflwr y gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol, recriwtio a chadw gweithwyr cymdeithasol a gweithredu'r Llywodraeth i godi morâl y gweithlu. Mae'r gweithlu o dan bwysau ac yn ddigalon, ac i bob golwg ymosodir arno o bob cyfeiriad, yn enwedig pan aiff pethau o'i le yn ofnadwy, fel yn yr achos hwn. Mae'r gweithlu yn teimlo fel pe bai'r holl waith a wneir, sydd ar y cyfan yn dda, yn mynd rhagddo heb iddo gael ei gydnabod.

I fynd at wraidd y mater, fel y soniais y bore yma, yr ydym am i'r adroddiad hwn a'r rhai

preceding it to result in a commitment, to which the Minister alluded in her statement, that such horrific events can never happen again. Obviously, it is impossible to guarantee that, but how will the Minister monitor the 73 recommendations that she has drawn up in response to this report? How will those recommendations be implemented? It is all very well to have the recommendations, but we need to know how they are being implemented and changing the situation on the ground. Also, how will the Minister make that monitoring information available to those of us who are here to scrutinise the Welsh Assembly Government's performance in ensuring that that monitoring and implementation occurs? We do not want the death of another child in horrific circumstances to trigger yet another report with another set of recommendations similar to all the previous recommendations. We need implementation and change on the ground.

Jane Hutt: That is why it was so important to have this statement this afternoon, as well as the full discussion by the Health and Social Services Committee this morning. In responding to that point this morning, I covered several issues in terms of how we are now monitoring and evaluating how local authorities, and, indeed, the health service, as key providers of services that protect children, are delivering. I mentioned that this is about established good practice. The test is whether the good practice guidance is being implemented. As discussed this morning, the most important route for that is the audit process. There are standards against which local authorities must assess their performance. A director of social services told us how he had found this a useful and valuable tool in assessing child protection services and the implementation of recommendations. I have agreed to bring the results of those audits back to Committee as they unfold. Also, consultation is ongoing. There was a conference last week in south Wales, and there will be another later this week in north Wales. That is part of the implementation process. Bringing information back to the Committee, and the whole Assembly, if that is appropriate, must be the way forward on monitoring and

blaenorol arwain at yr ymrwymiad, y cyfeiriodd y Gweinidog ato yn ei datganiad, na fydd digwyddiadau mor frawychus yn gallu digwydd byth eto. Yn amlwg, mae'n amhosibl rhoi sicrwydd o hynny, ond sut y bydd y Gweinidog yn monitro'r 73 o argymhellion y mae wedi eu paratoi mewn ymateb i'r adroddiad hwn? Sut y bydd yr argymhellion hynny yn cael eu rhoi ar waith? Mae'n hawdd iawn cael yr argymhellion, ond mae angen inni wybod sut y'u gweithredir a sut y maent yn newid y sefyllfa ar lawr gwlad. Hefyd, sut y bydd y Gweinidog yn darparu'r wybodaeth fonitro sydd ar gael i'r rhai ohonom sydd yma i graffu ar berfformiad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru o ran sicrhau bod yr argymhellion yn cael eu gweithredu a'u monitro? Nid ydym am gael marwolaeth plentyn arall mewn amgylchiadau brawychus i sbarduno adroddiad arall eto gyda chyfres arall o argymhellion sy'n debyg i'r holl argymhellion blaenorol. Mae angen gweithredu a newid ar lawr gwlad.

Jane Hutt: Dyna pam y mae mor bwysig cael y datganiad hwn y prynhawn yma, yn ogystal â'r drafodaeth lawn gan y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol y bore yma. Wrth ymateb i'r pwynt hwnnw y bore yma, trafodais nifer o faterion o ran sut yr ydym yn monitro a gwerthuso erbyn hyn y ffordd y mae awdurdodau lleol, ac yn wir, y gwasanaeth iechyd fel darparwyr allweddol gwasanaethau sy'n amddiffyn plant, yn gwneud gwahaniaeth. Soniais fod hyn yn ymwneud ag arfer da. Y prawf yw a yw'r canllawiau arfer da yn cael eu rhoi ar waith. Fel y trafodwyd y bore yma, y llwybr pwysicaf i hynny yw'r broses archwilio. Y mae safonau y mae'n rhaid i awdurdodau lleol asesu eu perfformiad yn eu herbyn. Dywedodd cyfarwyddwr gwasanaethau cymdeithasol wrthym sut y bu hyn yn offeryn defnyddiol a gwerthfawr iddo wrth asesu gwasanaethau amddiffyn plant a rhoi argymhellion ar waith. Cytunais i gyflwyno canlyniadau'r archwiliadau hyn i'r Pwyllgor wrth iddynt gael eu cyhoeddi. Hefyd, mae ymgynghori yn parhau. Cynhaliwyd cynhadledd yr wythnos diwethaf yn y De, a bydd un arall yn ddiweddarach yr wythnos hon yn y Gogledd. Mae hynny'n rhan o'r broses weithredu. Rhaid mai cyflwyno gwybodaeth i'r Pwyllgor, a'r Cynulliad

evaluation to ensure that this tragedy is not repeated.

Gwenda Thomas: There has been concern about the quality of the care provision for our most vulnerable children in many areas for many years. Many children taken into care in order to help and protect them have been neither helped nor protected. The case for a discrete focus on services for children in need at a national level in Wales has been made, but we are not close to achieving that. Do you agree that this suggestion should be considered urgently, as, without this specific focus, our most needy children will be more, rather than less, marginalised?

Jane Hutt: As the Minister with responsibility for children, I take that point very seriously. It is a challenge to the whole Welsh Assembly Government, as well as the Cabinet sub-committee. We have to demonstrate to you that the authority and clout exists to provide protection at a national level. I will make that point to my Assembly Government colleagues. However, it is also about ensuring—to respond to earlier points—that that is mirrored at a local level, in terms of the responsibilities within local government, and of cabinet members who lead on these matters. We must also ensure that we are not working in silos, but with our partners in the health service. It was good to hear practical examples this morning of the involvement of a director of social services and a local health board, which demonstrates that child protection is at the forefront, with social services and the health service working together.

Jonathan Morgan: I welcome this statement. As Dai Lloyd said, it follows a rigorous discussion this morning in the Health and Social Services Committee. I concur with your words at the beginning of the statement: many people who should have cared for Victoria Climbié's welfare and security failed her. In light of this appalling tragedy, it is important that Government departments throughout the United Kingdom

cyfan, os yw hynny'n briodol, yw'r ffordd ymlaen ar fonitro a gwerthuso i sicrhau na fydd y drasiedi hon yn digwydd eto.

Gwenda Thomas: Bu pryder am ansawdd y ddarpariaeth gofal i'n plant mwyaf diamddiffyn mewn sawl ardal am lawer blwyddyn. Ni chafodd llawer o blant a dderbyniwyd i ofal er mwyn eu helpu a'u hamddiffyn eu helpu na'u hamddiffyn. Mae'r ddadl dros ganolbwyntio ar wasanaethau i blant mewn angen ar lefel cenedlaethol ar wahân wedi'i chyflwyno, ond nid ydym yn agos at gyflawni hynny. A gytunwch y dylai'r awgrym hwn gael ei ystyried ar fyrder, oherwydd, heb ganolbwyntio'n benodol yn y fath fodd, bydd ein plant mwyaf anghenus wedi eu hymyleiddio yn fwy, nid yn llai?

Jane Hutt: Fel y Gweinidog sydd â chyfrifoldeb dros blant, credaf fod y pwynt hwnnw yn un difrifol iawn. Mae'n her i bob rhan o Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, ynghyd ag is-bwyllgor y Cabinet. Rhaid inni ddangos ichi fod yr awdurdod a'r dylanwad yn bodoli i amddiffyn plant ar lefel genedlaethol. Byddaf yn gwneud y pwynt hwnnw i'm cyd-Aelodau yn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, mae hefyd yn ymwneud â sicrhau—i ymateb i bwyntiau cynharach—bod hynny yn cael ei adlewyrchu ar lefel leol, o ran y cyfrifoldebau mewn llywodraeth leol, ac aelodau'r cabinet sy'n arwain ar y materion hyn. Rhaid inni hefyd sicrhau nad ydym yn gweithio mewn seilos, ond gyda'n partneriaid yn y gwasanaeth iechyd. Yr oedd yn dda clywed am enghreifftiau ymarferol y bore yma o ymwneud cyfarwyddwr gwasanaethau cymdeithasol a bwrdd iechyd lleol, sy'n dangos bod amddiffyn plant yn cael rhan flaenllaw, gyda gwasanaethau cymdeithasol a'r gwasanaeth iechyd yn gweithio gyda'i gilydd.

Jonathan Morgan: Croesawaf y datganiad hwn. Fel y dywedodd Dai Lloyd, mae'n dilyn trafodaeth drylwyr y bore yma yn y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Cytunaf â'r hyn a ddywedasoeh ar ddechrau eich datganiad: methodd llawer o'r bobl a ddylai fod wedi gofalu am les a diogelwch Victoria Climbié â gwneud hynny. Yn wyneb y drasiedi ofnadwy hon, mae'n bwysig bod adrannau'r Llywodraeth ar draws y Deyrnas

do everything possible to ensure that this does not happen again.

In light of that, will you respond to some of the issues that I raised this morning, particularly my concern that some of the paper lacks rigour? You say that many of the inquiry's recommendations represent established good practice. I do not know what process your department used to decide that that is the case, and I repeat what I said in Committee: I suspect that if you matched those recommendations against the findings of the joint service reviews of local authorities, you would find that many local authorities fail in relation to some of the issues teased out in those recommendations. Therefore, the response is not as rigorous as we would like it to be. A fair degree of it needs to be tightened up to ensure that those recommendations are fulfilled and are not just a wish list.

I also mentioned corporate responsibility in Committee. One of the most glaring findings of the joint service reviews, particularly of children's services, was that local authorities were not aware of, and did not prioritise, a strategic approach to providing social services, particularly for children. Sadly, that was the case in one of the most recent reports on Bridgend County Borough Council. However, Bridgend council performed better than other authorities in providing adult social services. Unless local authorities are made to understand corporate responsibility, this failure to prioritise social services, particularly those relating to children, will continue to contribute to these dreadful reports on local authorities. As I said in Committee, I am concerned that, unless the approach that you have taken to the recommendation on ensuring that corporate responsibility is firmed up, and a tangible direction set to ensure that those involved know what their responsibilities are, this will continue to happen. It is all very well having strategic partnerships, but it is unclear whether that will mean that local authorities are aware of their priorities and responsibilities, which is worrying.

Unedig yn gwneud popeth o fewn eu gallu i sicrhau na fydd hyn yn digwydd eto.

Yng ngoleuni hynny a wnewch ymateb i rai o'r materion a godais y bore yma, yn enwedig fy mhryder nad yw rhannau o'r papur yn ddigon cadarn? Dywedwch fod llawer o argymhellion yr ymchwiliad yn arfer da. Ni wn pa broses a ddefnyddiwyd gan eich adran i benderfynu bod hynny'n wir, ac ailadroddaf yr hyn a ddywedais yn y Pwyllgor: credaf pe baech yn cyfateb yr argymhellion hynny â chanfyddiadau'r adolygiadau ar y cyd o wasanaethau awdurdodau lleol, y byddech yn gweld bod llawer o awdurdodau lleol yn methu mewn perthynas â rhai o'r materion a nodwyd yn yr argymhellion hynny. Felly, nid yw'r ymateb mor gadarn ag yr hoffem iddo fod. Mae angen i gryn dipyn ohono gael ei dynhau i sicrhau bod yr argymhellion hynny yn cael eu cyflawni ac nad rhestr o ddymuniadau yn unig mohoni.

Hefyd cyfeiriais at gyfrifoldeb corfforaethol yn y Pwyllgor. Un o ganfyddiadau mwyaf amlwg yr adolygiadau ar y cyd o wasanaethau, yn enwedig y gwasanaethau plant, yw nad oedd awdurdodau lleol yn ymwybodol, o ymagwedd strategol tuag at ddarparu gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, yn enwedig i blant ac nad oeddent yn rhoi blaenoriaeth iddi. Yn anffodus, dyna oedd y sefyllfa yn un o'r adroddiadau mwyaf diweddar ar Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr. Fodd bynnag perfformiodd Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr yn well nag awdurdodau eraill o ran darparu gwasanaethau cymdeithasol i oedolion. Oni chaiff awdurdodau lleol eu gorfodi i ddeall cyfrifoldeb corfforaethol, bydd y methiant hwn i flaenoriaethu gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, yn enwedig y rhai hynny sy'n ymwneud â phlant yn parhau i gyfrannu at yr adroddiadau dychrynlyd hyn ar awdurdodau lleol. Fel y dywedais yn y Pwyllgor, yr wyf yn pryderu, os na chaiff yr ymagwedd a gymerwyd gennych tuag at sicrhau bod cyfrifoldeb corfforaethol yn fwy cadarn, a bod cyfeiriad clir yn cael ei osod i sicrhau bod y rhai dan sylw yn gwybod beth yw eu cyfrifoldebau, bydd hyn yn parhau i ddigwydd. Mae'n ddigon hawdd cael partneriaethau strategol, ond mae'n aneglur a fydd hynny'n golygu bod awdurdodau lleol

yn ymwybodol o'u blaenoriaethau, ac mae hynny yn achos pryder.

3.30 p.m.

Can you also assure me with regard particularly to recommendation 64 onwards in relation to the input of healthcare professionals, and particularly in relation to recommendation 67, that any guidance that is needed as a result of those recommendations will be published and issued as quickly as possible? I referred to recommendation 67 at this morning's Committee meeting, whereby there was a disagreement between health professionals as to whether a child had suffered an act of physical abuse. Worrying concerns were expressed in those recommendations, as well as a sense of urgency. Therefore, you need to issue this guidance as quickly as possible.

Finally, particularly in relation to the Carlile report and the 150 recommendations, which you accept, we know that there is a budget consequence, that resources will need to be identified and that there will need to be a timetable. However, all I ask is that you give the Assembly an assurance that you are doing everything possible to get that timetable together as quickly as you can, and that money will be identified quickly. There can be nothing more urgent in the social services provision than to get the social services provision for children spot on, so that we can prevent this sort of occurrence in future. Tying up all these matters as quickly as possible will ensure a safer future for our children.

Jane Hutt: Good practice is contained in procedures, protocols and policies, which have been developed as a result of reports and recommendations. We must now test whether that good practice is in operation. That is where this audit is important. As I said in reply to Dai's points, that audit is rigorous and considers the range of standards that we expect, which are contained in those good practice policies and procedures. We will be able to expose weaknesses and have already done so through the joint reviews. However, we do not want to do that only

A allwch hefyd fy sicrhau yn enwedig o ran argymhelliad 64 ymlaen mewn perthynas â mewnbwn gweithwyr proffesiynol gofal iechyd, ac yn enwedig mewn cysylltiad ag argymhelliad 67, y caiff unrhyw ganllawiau sydd eu hangen o ganlyniad i'r argymhellion hynny eu cyhoeddi a'u dosbarthu cyn gynted â phosibl? Cyfeiriais at argymhelliad 67 yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor y bore yma, lle yr oedd anghytundeb rhwng gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol pa un a oedd plentyn wedi cael ei gamdrin yn gorfforol ai peidio. Mynegwyd pryderon mawr yn yr argymhellion hynny yn ogystal â theimlad bod angen gweithredu ar fyrder. Felly, mae angen ichi ddosbarthu'r canllawiau hyn cyn gynted â phosibl.

Yn olaf, yn enwedig mewn perthynas ag adroddiad Carlile a'r 150 o argymhellion, yr ydych yn eu derbyn, gwyddom fod effaith o ran y gyllideb, y bydd angen dynodi adnoddau ac y bydd angen amserlen. Fodd bynnag, yr unig beth yr wyf yn gofyn amdano yw eich bod yn rhoi sicrwydd i'r Cynulliad eich bod yn gwneud popeth o fewn eich gallu i drefnu'r amserlen honno cyn gynted â phosibl, ac y nodir arian yn gyflym. Nid oes dim byd pwysicach ar hyn o bryd yn y ddarpariaeth gwasanaethau cymdeithasol na sicrhau bod y ddarpariaeth gwasanaethau cymdeithasol i blant yn hollol gywir, fel y gallwn atal y math hwn o ddigwyddiad yn y dyfodol. Bydd rhoi trefn ar yr holl faterion hyn cyn gynted â phosibl yn sicrhau dyfodol mwy diogel i'n plant.

Jane Hutt: Ceir arfer da mewn gweithdrefnau, protocolau a pholisïau, a ddatblygwyd o ganlyniad i adroddiadau ac argymhellion. Rhaid inni brofi yn awr p'un a yw'r arferion da hynny ar waith ai peidio. Dyna pam mae'r archwiliad hwn yn bwysig. Fel y dywedais mewn ymateb i bwyntiau Dai, mae'r archwiliad hwnnw yn gadarn ac mae'n ystyried yr ystod o safonau y gallwn eu disgwyl, a geir yn y polisïau a'r gweithdrefnau arfer da hynny. Byddwn yn gallu datgelu gwendidau ac yr ydym eisoes wedi gwneud hynny drwy'r adolygiadau ar y

when a joint review comes around. We need a continuous improvement of our social services, particularly in terms of children's services. That is why we now have performance evaluation, which is an annual assessment. As I mentioned this morning, because children's services plans have a statutory basis, Assembly officials and the inspectorate meet each local authority every year to assess their children's services plans. In improving the Children First plans, they must also be exposed to the rigour of assessment from the Assembly and the inspectorate. Therefore, the ongoing improvement of our services as a result of not only joint reviews, but also performance evaluation is key.

We discussed corporate responsibility this morning. Ultimately, accountability must lie with the chief executive. I made the point in my opening remarks this morning that lack of accountability was one of the Laming report's key concerns in terms of what happened, through to the lack of accountability, and right the way through organisations. Again, we had the opportunity to test this with representatives of elected members as well as the director of social services and the children's commissioner in Committee this morning. That was an important opportunity for you to express your concerns to them, as well as to me as the Minister who is ultimately responsible.

On issues such as the response to recommendation 67, we need clarity on that regarding interpretation and where more than one health professional is involved. I promised that I would answer your questions clearly. We now have a national service under the National Public Health Service. We have all our designated doctors and nurses in part of the National Public Health Service, and we have an all-Wales childcare protection service in the health service. That is important and is a welcome step forward.

You are right to question how we are moving

cyd. Fodd bynnag, nid ydym am wneud hynny pan fydd dim ond adolygiad ar y cyd ar fin digwydd. Mae angen inni sicrhau gwelliant parhaus yn ein gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, yn arbennig o ran gwasanaethau plant. Dyna pam mae gennym werthusiad perfformiad erbyn hyn, sydd yn asesiad blynyddol. Fel y soniais y bore yma, oherwydd bod sail statudol i gynlluniau gwasanaethau plant, bydd swyddogion y Cynulliad a'r arolygiaeth yn cyfarfod â phob awdurdod lleol bob blwyddyn i asesu eu cynlluniau gwasanaethau plant. Wrth wella cynlluniau Plant yn Gyntaf, rhaid iddynt hefyd gael eu hasesu'n gadarn gan y Cynulliad a'r arolygiaeth. Felly, mae gwelliant parhaus ein gwasanaethau o ganlyniad i, nid yn unig adolygiadau ar y cyd, ond hefyd werthusiad perfformiad, yn allweddol.

Buom yn trafod cyfrifoldeb corfforaethol y bore yma. Yn y pen draw, rhaid mai'r prif weithredwr sy'n atebol. Gwneuthum y pwynt yn fy sylwadau agoriadol y bore yma bod diffyg atebolrwydd yn un o brif bryderon adroddiad Laming o ran yr hyn a ddigwyddodd, hyd at y diffyg atebolrwydd a'r diffyg atebolrwydd ar bob lefel mewn sefydliadau. Eto, cawsom y cyfle i roi hyn ar brawf gyda chynrychiolwyr o blith aelodau etholedig yn ogystal â'r cyfarwyddwr gwasanaethau cymdeithasol a'r comisiynydd plant yn y Pwyllgor y bore yma. Yr oedd hwnnw'n gyfle pwysig ichi fynegi eich pryderon wrthynt, yn ogystal ag i minnau fel y Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol yn y pen draw.

O ran materion megis yr ymateb i argymhelliad 67, mae angen eglurder arnom ynglŷn â hynny o ran dehongliad, a lle y mae mwy nag un gweithiwr iechyd proffesiynol yn gysylltiedig. Addewais y byddwn yn ateb eich cwestiynau yn glir. Bellach mae gennym wasanaeth cenedlaethol o dan y Gwasanaeth Iechyd Cyhoeddus Cenedlaethol. Mae gennym ein holl feddygon a'n nyrsys dynodedig mewn rhan o'n Gwasanaeth Iechyd Cyhoeddus Cenedlaethol ac mae gennym wasanaeth amddiffyn gofal plant i Gymru gyfan yn y gwasanaeth iechyd. Mae hynny'n bwysig ac mae'n gam ymlaen i'w groesawu.

Yr ydych yn iawn i holi sut yr ydym yn

forward on the Carlile report. We must also refer to the Kennedy report. We had a full report to the Health and Social Services Committee in March on the Kennedy report and its recommendations and where we were moving forward, as well as on the Carlile report. There was an extensive report in March on the steps that have been taken by the health service, including good practice, as well as actions in responding to the recommendations.

It is not all resource-driven, as we discussed this morning. I will report back on the Carlile report, in terms of the timetable and resources as well as the outcomes. That is the key to ensuring not only that we have policies in place but that they are being implemented across the board, from local government to the health service. The Carlile and Kennedy reports are our litmus tests in terms of implementing policies on health.

Kirsty Williams: Minister, what steps will you take if, following the findings of the audit of established good practice, local authorities continue to fail to operate the policy? Will you consider making those policies and procedures statutory, thereby placing a legal duty on authorities to work in that manner? Could you confirm that a similar audit is being carried out of established good practice in NHS settings? Are you confident that the social-care workforce, as it is currently structured regarding financial and human resources, is able to implement the findings of the Climbié inquiry? Will you comment on the current qualified social-work vacancies arising in children's services? Could you tell the Assembly how much progress we are making with regard to children's cases not being allocated to a qualified social worker? Do you foresee legislative opportunities in this Queen's Speech and, should such opportunities arise, will you discuss with the Children's Commissioner for Wales whether we can use legislation proceeding through Westminster to enhance his role if necessary? Will you press for the inclusion of enabling clauses in any legislation presented to us, to allow the ban on the physical chastisement of children in Wales to proceed, affording Welsh children equal protection from assault under the law?

gweithredu ar adroddiad Carlile. Rhaid inni hefyd gyfeirio at adroddiad Kennedy. Rhoddwyd adroddiad llawn i'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ym mis Mawrth ar adroddiad Kennedy a'i argymhellion a lle yr oeddem yn gwneud cynnydd, yn ogystal ag ar adroddiad Carlile. Cafwyd adroddiad eang ym mis Mawrth ar y camau a gymerwyd gan y gwasanaeth iechyd, gan gynnwys arfer da, yn ogystal â chamau wrth ymateb i'r argymhellion.

Nid yw'r cyfan yn dibynnu ar adnoddau, fel y bu inni drafod y bore yma. Byddaf yn rhoi adroddiad ar adroddiad Carlile, o ran yr amserlen i'r adnoddau yn ogystal â'r canlyniadau. Dyna'r allwedd i sicrhau, nid yn unig bod polisiau gennym ar waith, ond eu bod yn cael eu gweithredu yn gyffredinol, o lywodraeth leol i'r gwasanaeth iechyd. Ein profion allweddol o ran gweithredu polisiau ar iechyd yw adroddiadau Carlile a Kennedy.

Kirsty Williams: Weinidog, pa gamau a gymerwch os bydd awdurdodau lleol, yn dilyn canfyddiadau'r archwiliad o arfer da cydnabyddedig, yn methu â gweithredu'r polisi? A wnewch ystyried gwneud y polisiau a'r gweithdrefnau hynny yn rhai statudol, a thrwy hynny osod dyletswydd gyfreithiol ar awdurdodau i weithio yn y modd hwnnw? A allwch gadarnhau bod archwiliad tebyg yn cael ei gynnal ar arfer da cydnabyddedig mewn sefyllfaoedd GIG? A ydych yn hyderus bod y gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol, fel y mae wedi'i strwythuro ar hyn o bryd o ran adnoddau ariannol a dynol, yn gallu gweithredu canfyddiadau ymchwiliad Climbié? A wnewch sylw ar y swyddi gwag ar gyfer gweithwyr cymdeithasol cymwys mewn gwasanaethau plant ar hyn o bryd? A allwch ddweud wrth y Cynulliad faint o gynnydd a wneir gennym o ran achosion lle na chaiff plant eu dosbarthu i weithiwr cymdeithasol cymwys? A ragwelwch gyfleoedd deddfu yn Araith y Frenhines eleni, ac a fyddwch, a bod y cyfryw gyfleoedd yn codi, yn trafod gyda Chomisynydd Plant Cymru pa un a allwn ddefnyddio deddfwriaeth sy'n mynd drwy San Steffan i gryfhau ei rôl os oes angen? A wnewch bwyso am gynnwys cymalau galluogi mewn unrhyw ddeddfwriaeth a gyflwynir inni, i ganiatáu i'r gwaharddiad ar gosbi plant yn gorfforol yng Nghymru fynd

rhagddo, gan roi'r un amddiffyniad i blant Cymru rhag ymosodiad o dan y gyfraith?

Jane Hutt: There were many questions there; I will attempt to cover them all, Kirsty. I have already responded to your first point about ensuring that weaknesses are identified through the audit. One route is to ensure that the statutory base is rigorously applied and used, as we have done for the children's services plan. However, through new legislation, we may have the opportunity to extend that. For example, it is recommended that Area Child Protection Committees could benefit from having a statutory base, and the Welsh Assembly Government wants to seriously consider that, through consultation. We can comb through the Green Paper for legislative opportunities to take forward, strengthening weaknesses that are due to a lack of statutory backing.

We must also remember that, where we have identified weaknesses, we are working with local authorities through joint reviews and follow-up social services inspections, particularly on children's services. That working relationship has given us a basis on which to improve standards. We have already seen some improvements in standards. The local authority social services performance statistics published yesterday show an increase from 64 to 72 per cent in the number of child protection cases that were appropriately reviewed. Improvements have also been made in creating suitable plans for children and young people leaving care. Therefore, although the statistics do not show as big a leap as we would like to see, it is a step forward.

I also mentioned this morning that, together with the audit tool used in social services, we asked the Commission for Health Improvement to develop a self-audit tool for the health service, which is now being developed for use at board level. That is as a result of the Carlile report. The tool will help to assess the ability of the NHS to protect children and young people. That is being used following the recommendation not only of Laming but of Carlile. We need a rigorous audit tool for the health service as well as for local government.

Jane Hutt: Codwyd llawer o gwestiynau gennyh; gwnaf ymdrech i'w trafod i gyd Kirsty. Yr wyf eisoes wedi ymateb i'ch pwynt cyntaf am sicrhau bod gwendidau yn cael eu nodi drwy'r archwiliad. Un llwybr yw sicrhau bod y sail statudol yn cael ei chymhwyso a'i defnyddio yn gadarn, fel y gwnaethom ar gyfer y cynllun gwasanaethau plant. Fodd bynnag, drwy ddeddfwriaeth newydd, efallai y cawn y cyfle i ehangu hynny. Er enghraifft, argymhellir y gallai'r Pwyllgorau Amddiffyn Plant Ardal elwa o fod ar sail statudol, ac mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru am ystyried hynny o ddifrif, drwy ymgynghoriad. Gallwn gribo drwy'r Papur Gwyrdd am gyfleoedd deddfu i weithredu arnynt, gan gryfhau gwendidau a gyfyd o ganlyniad i'r ffaith nad oes sail statudol.

Rhaid inni hefyd gofio, lle yr ydym wedi nodi gwendidau, ein bod yn gweithio gydag awdurdodau lleol drwy adolygiadau ar y cyd ag arolygiadau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol dilynol, yn arbennig ar wasanaethau plant. Mae'r berthynas waith honno wedi rhoi sail inni wella safonau. Yr ydym eisoes wedi gweld peth gwelliant mewn safonau. Dengys ystadegau perfformiad gwasanaethau cymdeithasol awdurdodau lleol a gyhoeddwyd ddoe fod cynnydd o 64 i 72 y cant yn nifer yr achosion amddiffyn plant a adolygwyd yn briodol. Gwnaed gwelliannau hefyd o ran creu cynlluniau addas i blant a phobl ifanc sy'n gadael gofal. Felly, er nad yw'r ystadegau yn dangos cynnydd mor fawr ag yr hoffem ei weld, mae'n gam ymlaen.

Hefyd crybwyllais y bore yma ein bod, ynghyd â'r offeryn archwilio a ddefnyddir mewn gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, wedi gofyn i'r Comisiwn Gwella Iechyd ddatblygu offeryn hunan archwilio ar gyfer y gwasanaeth iechyd, sydd yn cael ei ddatblygu ar hyn o bryd ar gyfer ei ddefnyddio ar lefel bwrdd. Mae hynny o ganlyniad i adroddiad Carlile. Bydd yr offeryn yn helpu i asesu gallu'r GIG i amddiffyn plant a phobl ifanc. Defnyddir hwnnw yn dilyn argymhelliad nid yn unig Laming, ond Carlile. Mae angen offeryn archwilio cadarn i'r gwasanaeth

I am glad that people have put the social care workforce at the top of the agenda. Yesterday, I met representatives of the Care Council for Wales, who are making great strides with the register, particularly in relation to social workers. In fact, more social workers are registered in Wales than in the rest of the UK.

It is making progress by way of a partnership approach, working with the regional social care partnerships, which bring local authorities together. This issue cannot be dealt with by one local authority only; it has an impact on all local authorities. The social care workforce is quite mobile, particularly in terms of children's services, depending on the situation, settings, morale and progress in terms of joint reviews. The social care workforce must therefore be at the forefront of our arrangements.

You mentioned other important issues relating to the physical punishment of children. Lord Laming did not mention this issue in his response to the tragedy. However, you mentioned it in Committee this morning and I know that other Members are also concerned about it. The Assembly has stated its opposition to physical punishment, or smacking, in all contexts, and we are at the forefront in terms of banning physical punishment in all types of public care. As you know, I have written to the UK Government to make our position clear and to state our desire for the defence of reasonable chastisement to be revoked. We have made that recommendation. On a practical level, we are providing resources and support for parenting initiatives and to promote the positive parenting approach. That is also being vigorously implemented through Cymorth and Sure Start. I think that that covers most of your questions, Kirsty.

Christine Chapman: Victoria's case involved the escalation of discipline and punishment. As the inquiry was told, she was first injured by little slaps. Do you agree that we can learn much from other countries that have banned the physical punishment of children? Like Kirsty, I would like an

iechyd yn ogystal â llywodraeth leol.

Yr wyf yn falch bod pobl wedi rhoi'r gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol ar frig yr agenda. Ddoe, cyfarfûm â chynrychiolwyr Cyngor Gofal Cymru, sy'n cymryd camau breision gyda'r gofrestr, yn arbennig mewn perthynas â gweithwyr cymdeithasol. Yn wir, mae mwy o weithwyr cymdeithasol wedi'u cofrestru yng Nghymru nag yng ngweddill y DU.

Mae'n gwneud cynnydd drwy bartneriaeth, yn gweithio gyda'r partneriaethau gofal cymdeithasol rhanbarthol, sy'n dwyn awdurdodau lleol at ei gilydd. Ni all un awdurdod lleol ymdrin â'r mater hwn yn unig; mae'n effeithio ar bob awdurdod lleol. Mae'r gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol yn eithaf symudol, yn arbennig o ran gwasanaethau plant, yn dibynnu ar y sefyllfa, y cefndir, y morâl a'r cynnydd o ran adolygiadau ar y cyd. Rhaid i'r gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol felly gael rhan flaenllaw yn ein trefniadau.

Cyfeiriasoch at faterion pwysig eraill sy'n ymwneud â chosbi plant yn gorfforol. Ni soniodd yr Arglwydd Laming am y mater hwn yn ei ymateb i'r drasiedi. Fodd bynnag, soniasoch amdano yn y Pwyllgor y bore yma a gwn fod Aelodau eraill hefyd yn pryderu amdano. Datganodd y Cynulliad ei wrthwynebiad i gosbi corfforol, neu daro, ym mhob cyd-destun, ac yr ydym ar flaen y gad o ran gwahardd cosbi corfforol ym mhob math o ofal cyhoeddus. Fel y gwyddoch, yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu at Lywodraeth y DU i wneud ein safbwynt yn glir ac i ddatgan ein hawydd i amddiffyniad cosbi rhesymol gael ei ddiddymu. Yr ydym wedi gwneud yr argymhelliad hwnnw. Ar lefel ymarferol, yr ydym yn darparu adnoddau a chymorth i fentrau rhianta ac i hybu rhianta cadarnhaol. Mae hwnnw'n cael ei roi ar waith yn frwd drwy Cymorth a Cychwyn Cadarn. Credaf fod hynny'n cwmpasu'r rhan fwyaf o'ch cwestiynau, Kirsty.

Christine Chapman: Yn achos Victoria, cafodd ei disgyblu a'i chosbi'n llymach dros amser. Fel y dywedwyd wrth yr ymchwiliad cafodd ei hanafu gyntaf drwy ei tharo'n ysgafn. A gytunwch y gallwn ddysgu llawer gan wledydd eraill sydd wedi gwahardd cosbi plant yn gorfforol? Fel Kirsty, hoffwn gael

assurance that you will do everything in your power to influence the Westminster Government to revoke the defence of reasonable chastisement and continue to make progress in the Assembly on the provision of parenting support as part of the child protection strategy in Wales.

Jane Hutt: You held a short debate on this issue. Following my statement, there was widespread support for this approach in the Assembly. I am committed to those actions, as I said in response to Kirsty. We have learnt from our colleagues in Sweden and in other countries. We must now find other ways in which we can take this forward, not only in terms of the UK Government but also in terms of initiatives in Wales.

David Melding: Will you assure the Assembly that sufficient funds are given to local authorities in order to enable them to deliver safe and effective children's services and to have in place appropriate and robust child protection procedures? Will you disassociate yourself from any talk that this area of Government activity is one that must compete with other priorities and is sometimes seen as not being popular with voters? We must be assured that, when you issue guidance and good practice recommendations, the resources required to implement them are available to the appropriate agencies.

Jane Hutt: The Assembly has demonstrated its commitment to making Wales a child-centred country. We must ensure that that policy commitment is backed by resource allocation to children's services, and particularly to the most vulnerable children and young people in Wales. It is a priority for the Assembly, so it must also be a priority in terms of our budget planning and for the Welsh Assembly Government. We have demonstrated that we are taking action in partnership with those who deliver at the sharp-end—not just local government, but also the health service and the voluntary sector. I welcome the commitment given by Members in Committee this morning and in Plenary to placing this at the forefront of the National Assembly's and the Welsh Assembly Government's agenda.

sicrwydd y gwnewch bopeth yn eich gallu i ddylanwadu ar Lywodraeth San Steffan i ddiddymu amddiffyniad cosbi rhesymol a pharhau i wneud cynnydd yn y Cynulliad ar y ddarpariaeth o gymorth rhianta fel rhan o'r strategaeth amddiffyn plant yng Nghymru.

Jane Hutt: Yr ydych wedi cynnal dadl fer ar y mater hwn. Yn dilyn fy natganiad, yr oedd cefnogaeth eang i'r ymagwedd hon yn y Cynulliad. Yr wyf wedi ymrwymo i'r camau hynny, fel y dywedais yn fy ymateb i Kirsty. Yr ydym wedi dysgu gan ein cyd-aelodau yn Sweden ac mewn gwledydd eraill. Rhaid inni ddod o hyd i ffyrdd eraill o ddatblygu hyn bellach, nid yn unig o ran Llywodraeth y DU, ond hefyd o ran mentrau yng Nghymru.

David Melding: A wnewch sicrhau'r Cynulliad y rhoddir digon o arian i awdurdodau lleol er mwyn eu galluogi i gyflwyno gwasanaethau plant diogel ac effeithiol a sefydlu gweithdrefnau amddiffyn plant priodol a chadarn? A wnewch ddatgysylltu eich hun rhag unrhyw sôn bod yn rhaid i'r maes hwn o weithgaredd y Llywodraeth fod yn un a fydd yn rhaid cystadlu gyda blaenoriaethau eraill ac y tybir weithiau nad yw'n boblogaidd gyda'r etholwyr? Rhaid ein sicrhau, pan fyddwch yn cyhoeddi canllawiau ac argymelliadau ar gyfer arfer da, bod yr adnoddau sy'n ofynnol i'w gweithredu ar gael i'r asiantaethau priodol.

Jane Hutt: Mae'r Cynulliad wedi dangos ei ymrwymiad i wneud Cymru yn wlad sy'n canolbwyntio ar y plentyn. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod yr ymrwymiad polisi hwnnw wedi ategu gan ddyraniad o adnoddau i wasanaethau plant, ac yn arbennig i'r plant a'r bobl ifanc fwyaf diamddiffyn yng Nghymru. Mae'n flaenoriaeth i'r Cynulliad, felly rhaid iddo hefyd fod yn flaenoriaeth o ran ein cynllunio cyllideb ac i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Yr ydym wedi dangos ein bod yn cymryd camau mewn partneriaeth â'r rhai sy'n darparu'r gwasanaethau'n uniongyrchol—nid llywodraeth leol yn unig, ond hefyd y gwasanaeth iechyd a'r sector gwirfoddol. Croesawaf yr ymrwymiad a roddwyd gan Aelodau'r Pwyllgor y bore yma ac yn y Cyfarfod Llawn i osod hyn ar frig agenda'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a Llywodraeth

Cynulliad Cymru.

Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Diwygiadau ynghylch Rhagnodi gan Nyrsys Atodol ac Annibynnol) (Cymru) 2003
Approval of the National Health Service (Amendments Concerning Supplementary and Independent Nurse Prescribing) (Wales) Regulations 2003

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt): I propose that

the National Assembly considers the principle of the National Health Service (Amendments Concerning Supplementary and Independent Nurse Prescribing) (Wales) Regulations 2003, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 9 September 2003. (NDM1640)

I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 23 September 2003 in relation to the draft Order, the National Health Service (Amendments Concerning Supplementary and Independent Nurse Prescribing) (Wales) Regulations 2003; and

2. approves that the National Health Service (Amendments Concerning Supplementary and Independent Nurse Prescribing) (Wales) Regulations 2003 is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 9 September 2003. (NDM1638)

This Order concerns the introduction of supplementary prescribing for nurses and pharmacists. Supplementary prescribing will allow these professionals to treat more complex conditions such as chronic disease and mental illness.

Supplementary prescribing will involve a voluntary partnership between the independent prescriber, the doctor or dentist, and the supplementary prescriber, the nurse or pharmacist, to implement an agreed patient-specific clinical management plan with the patient's agreement.

Following the successful implementation of

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt): Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Diwygiadau ynghylch Rhagnodi gan Nyrsys Atodol ac Annibynnol) (Cymru) 2003, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 9 Medi 2003. (NDM1640)

Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 23 Medi 2003, mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Diwygiadau ynghylch Rhagnodi gan Nyrsys Atodol ac Annibynnol) (Cymru) 2003; ac

2. yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Diwygiadau ynghylch Rhagnodi gan Nyrsys Atodol ac Annibynnol) (Cymru) 2003 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 9 Medi 2003. (NDM1638)

Mae'r Gorchymyn hwn yn ymwneud â chyflwyno rhagnodi gan nyrsys atodol a fferyllwyr. Bydd rhagnodi atodol yn ei gwneud yn bosibl i'r gweithwyr proffesiynol hyn ymdrin â chyflyrau mwy cymhleth megis clefydau cronig a salwch meddwl.

Bydd rhagnodi atodol yn golygu partneriaeth wirfoddol rhwng y rhagnodwr annibynnol, y meddyg neu'r deintydd, a'r rhagnodwr atodol, y nyrs neu'r fferylllydd, i roi cynllun rheoli clinigol cytûn sy'n benodol i'r claf ar waith gyda chytundeb y claf.

Yn dilyn rhoi'r cam cyntaf o ragnodi gan

the first phase of nurse prescribing, our next step will be to extend prescribing to specialist nurses and pharmacists. I ask Members to support this Order.

Jonathan Morgan: The Welsh Conservatives support these regulations. They are a valuable contribution to extending the way in which prescribing occurs in Wales. As a party, we look forward to more secondary legislation coming to the Health and Social Services Committee in the future.

Kirsty Williams: In supporting these regulations, the Liberal Democrats are mindful that if the Welsh Assembly Government is to make a success of its free prescription policy, we need to look urgently at permitting other professionals to prescribe from a limited formulary to ensure that doctors' surgeries are not engulfed by people trying to get free prescriptions. It is appropriate that this issue means that nurses and pharmacists will have an opportunity to help with GP workloads.

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt): The Welsh Assembly Government is leading the way in terms of enabling nurses and pharmacists to take on prescribing responsibilities. I am aware that they are eager and anxious to undertake this work, particularly as they are also eager and anxious to work within a free prescription regime in Wales.

nyrsys ar waith yn llwyddiannus, ein cam nesaf fydd ymestyn rhagnodi i nyrsys arbenigol a fferyllwyr. Gofynnaf i Aelodau gefnogi'r Gorchymyn hwn.

Jonathan Morgan: Mae Ceidwadwyr Cymru yn cefnogi'r rheoliadau hyn. Maent yn gyfraniad gwerthfawr at ymestyn y ffordd y mae rhagnodi yn digwydd yng Nghymru. Fel plaid, edrychwn ymlaen at weld mwy o is-ddeddfwraieth yn dod i'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn y dyfodol.

Kirsty Williams: Wrth gefnogi'r rheoliadau hyn, mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn ymwybodol os yw Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i wneud llwyddiant o'i bolisi ar bresgripsiynau am ddim, bod yn rhaid inni edrych ar fyrder ar ganiatáu i bobl broffesiynol eraill ragnodi o gyffurlyfr cyfyngedig i sicrhau na fydd meddygfeydd yn cael eu llethu gan bobl sy'n ceisio cael presgripsiynau am ddim. Mae'n briodol bod y mater hwn yn golygu y caiff nyrsys a fferyllwyr y cyfle i gynorthwyo gyda baich gwaith meddygon teulu.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt): Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar flaen y gad o ran galluogi nyrsys a fferyllwyr i ymgymryd â chyfrifodebau rhagnodi. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol eu bod yn frwd ac yn awyddus i ymgymryd â'r gwaith hwn, yn enwedig gan eu bod hefyd yn frwd ac yn awyddus i weithio o fewn cyfundrefn presgripsiynau am ddim yng Nghymru.

3.40 p.m.

*Cynnig (NDM1640): O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1640): For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David

Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Gibbons, Brian
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM1638): O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1638): For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa

German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

Adolygiad Canol Tymor o Raglenni'r Cronfeydd Strwythurol **The Mid-term Review of Structural Funds Programmes**

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 3 a 4 yn enw Jonathan Morgan, gwelliannau 2, 7, 8, 9 a 10 yn enw Jocelyn Davies, gwelliant 5 yn enw Kirsty Williams a gwelliant 6 yn enwau Jocelyn Davies, Kirsty Williams a Jonathan Morgan.

The Minister for Economic Development and Transport (Andrew Davies): I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

1. supports the proposed changes to the single programming document and programme complement as set out in the paper considered by the Economic

The Presiding Officer: I have selected amendments 1, 3 and 4 in the name of Jonathan Morgan, amendments 2, 7, 8, 9 and 10 in the name of Jocelyn Davies, amendment 5 in the name of Kirsty Williams and amendment 6 in the names of Jocelyn Davies, Kirsty Williams and Jonathan Morgan.

Y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Ecoomaidd a Thrafnidiaeth (Andrew Davies): Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. yn cefnogi'r newidiadau arfaethedig i'r ddogfen raglennu sengl ac i'r ddogfen ategol i'r rhaglen a nodir yn y papur a ystyriwyd gan y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a

Development and Transport Committee on 1 October 2003 entitled, 'Objective 1: Mid-term Evaluation and Mid-term Review; and Simplification';

2. invites the Minister for Economic Development and Transport to report to Plenary on the outcome of the negotiations with the European Commission. (NDM1639)

Structural fund programmes, in particular Objective 1, have a crucial role in delivering a strong, sustainable and more competitive economy in Wales. We are making excellent progress in utilising these funds to deliver for Wales. At the end of September, 46 per cent of the resources allocated to the Objective 1 programme had been committed. As we are now approaching the halfway point of the seven-year programming period, this is an opportune time to undertake the mid-term review. As I explained to the Economic Development and Transport Committee last week, this is not an opportunity to renegotiate the programme. However, it provides us with an important opportunity to tailor the programme to ensure that it remains relevant to the Wales of today and not the Wales of four years ago when the single programming document was written. We must effect change to ensure that the programme delivers even more effectively for the people of Wales, and we must ensure that it dovetails and links in with our strategy for the social and economic regeneration of our country.

Thrafnidiaeth ar 1 Hydref 2003, 'Amcan 1: Gwerthusiad Canol Tymor ac Adolygiad Canol Tymor; a Symleiddio';

2. yn gofyn i'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth gyflwyno adroddiad i'r cyfarfod llawn am ganlyniadau'r trafodaethau gyda'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd. (NDM1639)

Mae gan raglenni'r cronfeydd strwythurol, yn enwedig Amcan 1, rôl hollbwysig i'w chwarae i sicrhau economi gref, cynaliadwy a mwy cystadleuol yng Nghymru. Yr ydym yn gwneud cynnydd ardderchog o ran defnyddio'r cronfeydd hyn i gyflawni ein hymrwymiaid yng Nghymru. Ar ddiwedd Medi, yr oedd 46 y cant o'r adnoddau a ddyrannwyd i raglen Amcan 1 wedi ei neilltuo. Gan ein bod yn awr yn dynesu at hanner ffordd drwy'r cyfnod rhaglennu saith mlynedd, mae'n amser da i gynnal yr adolygiad canol tymor. Fel yr esboniais i'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth yr wythnos diwethaf, nid cyfle i ailnegodi'r rhaglen yw hwn. Fodd bynnag, mae'n gyfle pwysig inni deilwra'r rhaglen i sicrhau ei bod yn dal i fod yn berthnasol i Gymru heddiw ac nid y Gymru a oedd yn bodloni bedair blynedd yn ôl pan ysgrifennwyd y ddogfen raglennu sengl. Rhaid inni wneud newidiadau er mwyn sicrhau bod y rhaglen yn cyflawni ymrwymiaid yn fwy effeithiol byth dros bobl Cymru, a rhaid inni sicrhau ei bod yn cydweddu ac yn cysylltu â'n strategaeth ar gyfer adfywio cymdeithasol ac economaidd ein gwlad.

*Daeth Christine Gwyther i'r Gadair am 3.49 p.m.
Christine Gwyther took the Chair at 3.49 p.m.*

The proposals I am outlining today will put us on track to maintain the programme's momentum and allow us to deliver an improved second-half performance. This is particularly important in terms of providing expert advice on projects. I have proposed the creation of six thematic advisory groups, one for each priority of the programme. These would replace the existing strategy partnerships and the regional partnerships, and simplify the consultation arrangements on projects.

Bydd y cynigion yr wyf yn eu hamlinellu heddiw yn ein rhoi ar y trywydd cywir i gadw momentwm y rhaglen a rhoi cyfle inni sicrhau perfformiad gwell yn yr ail hanner. Mae hyn yn arbennig o bwysig o ran rhoi cyngor arbenigol ar brosiectau. Yr wyf wedi cynnig creu chwe grŵp ymgynghorol thematig, un ar gyfer pob un o flaenoriaethau'r rhaglen. Byddai'r rhain yn disodli'r partneriaethau strategaeth a'r partneriaethau rhanbarthol presennol, ac yn symleiddio'r trefniadau ar gyfer ymgynghori

ar brosiectau.

3.50 p.m.

These changes will ensure an improvement of standards and greater focus on the customer. They will enhance support during project development and project appraisal and will deliver better aftercare during the implementation of projects. I was delighted that, at its meeting on 15 September, the Objective 1 Programme Monitoring Committee endorsed these proposals. Work is now in hand to appoint members of the six thematic advisory groups to enable the new arrangements to take effect on 1 January 2004. However, the main focus of the mid-term review is the single programming document and three areas in particular: the continued relevance of the priorities and measures; the appropriateness of financial allocations to the priorities and measures, including the allocation of the performance reserve; and the appropriateness of the targets at SPD and priority level.

Earlier in the summer, I invited a broad range of partners to comment on these three areas. I was pleased that we received 70 responses, which will now form an important part of the evidence to the European Commission. I have also consulted the Economic Development and Transport Committee. Last week, we had a constructive discussion and I took note of the following issues: the need to improve the links between Communities First and Objective 1 and the problems caused by spatial targeting of priority 3; the lack of tourism projects in the Valleys and the difficulty in accessing funds to enhance town centres; the problems for projects in certain infrastructure measures due to the reference to peripherality; and the lack of childcare projects. I have taken these comments on board and they will be part of our submission to the European Commission. I was pleased that the Committee welcomed the proposals to merge measures, in particular in relation to energy. I was also pleased that the Committee supported the proposal to provide extra funds for sites and premises.

Bydd y newidiadau hyn yn sicrhau safonau gwell a mwy o ffocws ar y cwsmer. Byddant yn rhoi mwy o gymorth wrth i brosiectau gael eu datblygu a'u harfarnu a byddant yn rhoi gwell ôl-ofal wrth i brosiectau gael eu gweithredu. Yr oeddwn yn falch o nodi bod Pwyllgor Monitro Rhaglen Amcan 1, yn ei gyfarfod ar 15 Medi, wedi cymeradwyo'r cynigion hyn. Mae'r gwaith yn mynd rhagddo bellach i benodi aelodau o'r chwe grŵp ymgynghorol thematig er mwyn ei gwneud yn bosibl i'r trefniadau newydd ddod i rym ar 1 Ionawr 2004. Fodd bynnag, prif ffocws yr adolygiad canol tymor yw'r ddogfen raglennu sengl a thri maes yn arbennig sef: a fydd y blaenoriaethau a'r mesurau yn parhau i fod yn berthnasol; pa mor briodol yw'r dyraniadau ariannol o ran y blaenoriaethau a'r mesurau, gan gynnwys dyrannu'r gronfa perfformiad wrth gefn; a pha mor briodol yw'r targedau ar lefel y ddogfen raglennu sengl ac ar lefel blaenoriaethau.

Yn gynharach yn ystod yr haf, gwahoddais amrywiaeth eang o bartneriaid i wneud sylwadau ar y tri maes hyn. Yr oeddwn yn falch inni gael 70 o ymatebion, a fydd bellach yn rhan bwysig o'r dystiolaeth i'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd. Yr wyf hefyd wedi ymgynghori â'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth. Yr wythnos diwethaf, cawsom drafodaeth adeiladol a nodais y materion canlynol: yr angen i wella'r cysylltiadau rhwng Cymunedau yn Gyntaf ac Amcan 1 a'r problemau a achoswyd gan dargedu gofodol blaenoriaeth 3; diffyg prosiectau twristiaeth yn y Cymoedd a'r anhawster i gael gafael ar arian i wella canol trefi; y problemau a wyneba prosiectau mewn rhai mesurau seilwaith oherwydd y cyfeiriad at berifferoldeb, a'r diffyg prosiectau gofal plant. Yr wyf wedi ystyried y sylwadau hyn a byddant yn rhan o'n cyflwyniad i'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd. Yr oeddwn yn falch bod y Pwyllgor wedi croesawu'r cynigion i uno mesurau, yn enwedig mewn perthynas ag ynni. Yr oeddwn hefyd yn falch bod y Pwyllgor wedi cefnogi'r cynnig i ddarparu rhagor o arian ar gyfer safleoedd.

On my proposals, first in relation to the priorities and measures, I propose that the programme's structure is simplified and streamlined by merging some measures. For example, the two energy measures, the two ICT measures, two of the community regeneration measures and the business support and entrepreneurship measures.

There have been calls for the creation of additional measures for tourism as well as town centre regeneration in the Valleys. On town centre regeneration, I have asked officials to raise these issues during the forthcoming negotiations and discussions with the Commission, although I must say that, in the past, the European Commission has not supported this. Nevertheless, we will push the case hard.

On tourism, there is already sufficient scope, with the Wales Tourist Board and local partnerships being able to draw extensively on existing priorities and measures in the programme. It is unlikely that the European Commission would allow a separate tourism priority.

I recognise that the system of spatial targeting in priority 3, which supports community economic regeneration, has led to rigidities. In response, I propose to amalgamate two measures in priority 3 to move money into the social inclusion measure in priority 4, which is not spatially targeted, and to negotiate for the removal of the spatial targeting from the social economy measure. I have asked officials to make every effort to secure these changes during the negotiations with the European Commission.

Activity in some of the infrastructure measures is limited to the more peripheral areas of the region. In practice, the rigid application of this definition has restricted our ability to support good projects. That has also been true of the energy measures, which have received a low rate of commitment. Therefore, I have asked officials to discuss that with the Commission.

On financial resources, it is generally recognised that some measures require

O ran fy nghynigion, yn gyntaf mewn perthynas â'r blaenoriaethau a'r mesurau, cynigiau y dylid symleiddio strwythur y rhaglen drwy uno rhai mesurau. Er enghraifft, y ddau fesur ynni, y ddau fesur TGCh, dau o'r mesurau adfywio cymunedol, a'r mesurau cymorth i fusnesau ac entrepreneuraeth.

Bu rhai yn galw am greu mesurau ychwanegol ar gyfer twristiaeth yn ogystal ag adfywio canol trefi yn y Cymoedd. O ran adfywio canol trefi, yr wyf wedi gofyn i swyddogion godi'r materion hyn yn ystod y negodiadau a'r trafodaethau arfaethedig gyda'r Comisiwn, ond rhaid imi ddweud nad yw'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd, yn y gorffennol, wedi cefnogi hyn. Eto i gyd, byddwn yn dadlau'n gryf dros hyn.

O ran twristiaeth, mae digon o gyfle eisoes. Gall Bwrdd Croeso Cymru a phartneriaethau lleol wneud defnydd helaeth o'r blaenoriaethau a'r mesurau presennol yn y rhaglen. Mae'n annhebygol y byddai'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd yn caniatáu blaenoriaeth twristiaeth ar wahân.

Cydnabyddaf fod y system o dargedu gofodol ym mlaenoriaeth 3, sy'n ategu adfywio economaidd cymunedol, wedi arwain at ddiffyg hyblygrwydd. Mewn ymateb, cynigiau uno dau fesur ym mlaenoriaeth 3 i symud arian i'r mesur cynhwysiant cymdeithasol ym mlaenoriaeth 4, nad yw wedi'i thargedu'n ofodol, a negodi i ddileu targedu gofodol o'r mesur economi gymdeithasol. Yr wyf wedi gofyn i swyddogion wneud pob ymdrech i sicrhau'r newidiadau hyn yn ystod y negodiadau gyda'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd.

Mae gweithgaredd mewn rhai o'r mesurau seilwaith yn ymwneud ag ardaloedd mwy ymylol y rhanbarth yn unig. Yn ymarferol, mae'r ffaith i'r diffiniad hwn gael ei gymhwyso'n llym wedi cyfyngu ar ein gallu i gefnogi prosiectau da. Bu hynny yn wir hefyd am y mesurau ynni, y neilltuwyd swm bach o arian yn unig ar eu cyfer. Felly, yr wyf wedi gofyn i swyddogion drafod hynny gyda'r Comisiwn.

O ran adnoddau ariannol, cydnabyddir yn gyffredinol bod angen rhoi adnoddau

additional resources. Although I do not want to discuss specific figures today, as that is a matter for discussion with the Commission, I believe that the following activities justify additional funding: ICT, innovation, research and development, sites and premises, economic activity and social inclusion, and securing a sustainable countryside and transport system.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Given that you have set these priorities for the use of structural funds, how much Objective 1 money was used for the investment in the National Botanic Garden of Wales and the Biotechnium, and how many of the jobs created there were financed by Objective 1 money? Are those jobs in your figures?

Andrew Davies: I am open to correction, but to the best of my knowledge, the garden received European funding from the previous structural fund programme, not from the Objective 1 programme. That structural fund programme is now closed, and your question is therefore irrelevant to this discussion.

On the timetable of implementing these proposals, officials will be meeting their counterparts from the European Commission later this month. Once agreement has been reached, the revisions to the SPD and programme complement will be undertaken in November. They will then be submitted to the Objective 1 Programme Monitoring Committee in December. To guarantee a decision on changes to the programme by March 2004, final documentation will need to be submitted to the commission by 19 December. I will deal with the amendments in my closing remarks.

Nick Bourne: I propose the following amendments in the name of Jonathan Morgan. Amendment 1: in line 1 replace 'supports' with 'notes'.

I propose amendment 3. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

calls for a streamlining of the application process, with strict timescales for responses

ychwanegol i rai mesurau. Er nad wyf am drafod ffigurau penodol heddiw, gan mai mater i'w drafod gyda'r Comisiwn yw hynny, credaf fod achos cyfiawn dros roi arian ychwanegol i'r gweithgareddau canlynol: TGCh, arloesedd, ymchwil a datblygu, safleoedd, gweithgaredd economaidd a chynhwysiant cymdeithasol, a sicrhau cefn gwlad a system drafnidiaeth sy'n gynaliadwy.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: A derbyn eich bod wedi gosod y blaenoriaethau hyn ar gyfer defnyddio'r cronfeydd strwythurol, faint o arian Amcan 1 a ddefnyddiwyd ar gyfer y buddsoddiad yng Ngardd Fotaneg Genedlaethol Cymru a'r Biotechnium, a faint o'r swyddi a grëwyd yno a gafodd eu hariannu drwy arian Amcan 1? A yw'r swyddi hynny yn eich ffigurau?

Andrew Davies: Mae croeso ichi fy nghywiro, ond hyd y gwn i, derbyniodd yr ardd arian Ewropeaidd o un o raglenni blaenorol y cronfeydd strwythurol, nid o raglen Amcan 1. Mae'r rhaglen honno o dan y cronfeydd strwythurol wedi cau bellach, ac felly nid yw eich cwestiwn yn berthnasol i'r drafodaeth hon.

O ran yr amserlen ar gyfer gweithredu'r cynigion hyn, bydd swyddogion yn cyfarfod â swyddogion o'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd yn ddiweddarach y mis hwn. Unwaith y byddant wedi dod i gytundeb, caiff y Ddogfen Raglennu Sengl a'r ddogfen ategol eu diwygio ym mis Tachwedd. Yna cânt eu cyflwyno i'r Pwyllgor Monitro Rhaglen Amcan 1 ym mis Rhagfyr. Er mwyn sicrhau bod penderfyniad wedi'i wneud ar y newidiadau i'r rhaglenni erbyn Mawrth 2004, bydd angen cyflwyno'r ddogfennaeth derfynol i'r comisiwn erbyn 19 Rhagfyr. Ymdriniaf â'r gwelliannau yn fy sylwadau i gloi.

Nick Bourne: Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jonathan Morgan. Gwelliant 1: yn llinell 1 rhoi 'nodi' yn lle 'cefnogi'.

Cynigiaf welliant 3. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw am symleiddio'r broses ymgeisio, gydag amserlenni tynn ar gyfer ymatebion

by the Welsh European Funding Office.

I propose amendment 4. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

calls for a restructuring of the 'partnerships' to enable and encourage the private sector to play a full part.

The Welsh Conservatives will support all the amendments to the motion. We welcome this important debate on the mid-term review, which is about ensuring that Wales is able to punch its strength in this vital area. I have four principle concerns about the Objective 1 programme and matters that need to be fed into this mid-term review. I know that members of all parties are concerned about many of these issues—Lynne Neagle and Christine Chapman have raised some concerns about the Objective 1 programme in the Valleys. Some of these concerns will therefore be echoed elsewhere.

First, I do not believe that anybody would argue with the fact that the creation of jobs has been too slow in the first part of the Objective 1 programme. Secondly, the private sector's engagement with it has been minimal, and at times, virtually non-existent, particularly with regard to small and medium-sized enterprises, which have huge growth potential. Thirdly, the figures that we have seen to date confirm that the wealth gap with regard to the wealthier areas of Wales and England is static. Fourthly, this programme is a one-off opportunity for Wales. The entry of new states to the European Union—and I welcome the fact that all the candidate states voted in favour of entry to the EU—means that Wales will not be given this opportunity again. All of the new entrants qualify for Objective 1 assistance, in its present form, apart from Cyprus, Prague and Bratislava. Wales, therefore, without any internal change, goes from being relatively poor to relatively wealthy.

gan Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru.

Cynigiaf welliant 4. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw am ailstrwythuro'r 'partneriaethau' er mwyn galluogi ac annog y sector preifat i chwarae rhan lawn.

Bydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru yn cefnogi pob un o'r gwelliannau i'r cynnig. Croesawn y ddadl bwysig hon ar yr adolygiad canol tymor, sy'n ymwneud â sicrhau y gall Cymru ddangos ei chryfder yn y maes pwysig hwn. Mae gennyf bedwar prif bryder ynglŷn â rhaglen Amcan 1 a materion y bydd angen eu cynnwys yn yr adolygiad canol tymor hwn. Gwn fod aelodau pob plaid yn pryderu ynghylch llawer o'r materion hyn—mae Lynne Neagle a Christine Chapman wedi codi rhai pryderon ynglŷn â rhaglen Amcan 1 yn y Cymoedd. Felly bydd eraill yn ategu rhai o'r pryderon hyn.

Yn gyntaf, ni chredaf y byddai neb yn anghytuno â'r ffaith bod y broses o greu swyddi wedi bod yn rhy araf yn rhan gyntaf rhaglen Amcan 1. Yn ail, bach iawn fu rhan y sector preifat yn y rhaglen, ac ar adegau, ni chwaraeodd ran o gwbl bron, yn enwedig o ran busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint, sydd â photensial enfawr i dyfu. Yn drydydd, mae'r ffigurau yr ydym wedi eu gweld hyd yma yn cadarnhau nad yw'r bwlc cyfoeth o ran ardaloedd cyfoethocach Cymru a Lloegr wedi newid. Yn bedwerydd, mae'r rhaglen hon yn gyfle unwaith ac am byth i Gymru. Mae'r ffaith y bydd gwladwriaethau newydd yn ymuno â'r Undeb Ewropeaidd—a chroesawaf y ffaith bod pob gwladwriaeth a wnaeth gais i ymuno â'r Undeb Ewropeaidd wedi pleidleisio o blaid hynny—yn golygu na chaiff Cymru y cyfle hwn eto. Mae pob un o'r aelod wladwriaethau newydd yn gymwys i gael cymorth Amcan 1, ar ei ffurf bresennol, ar wahân i Gyprus, Prâg a Bratislafa. Felly, heb newid mewnol, bydd Cymru yn newid o fod yn wlad gymharol dlawd i fod yn wlad gymharol gyfoethog.

Some Labour MEPs occasionally say that there is a prospect of continuing Objective 1 assistance up until 2013. That is clearly not the case, other than some possible transitional assistance, and we must therefore realise the importance of this mid-term review. There is no realistic hope of continued funding beyond 2006. It is important, therefore, given this far from perfect situation, that we use this opportunity to push Wales's case further at this mid-term review stage. That is why I am pleased that all the opposition parties are meeting with Jan Royall to discuss these issues tomorrow. The Government must push Wales's case strongly. It is clear that repatriation is no longer a realistic option. It was voted down by MEPs in Brussels, and it will not happen now. Had it happened, the Conservative group would have been concerned that it might not be in Wales's best interest, but, as far as I can tell, it is now off the agenda. We must now engage in strengthening Wales's case in Brussels.

4.00 p.m.

There are revisions in the document that we welcome, but it is important that we strengthen Wales's case, engage the private sector and cut down on the bureaucracy. Even at this late stage, we can learn from experiences elsewhere, particularly those in Ireland and Finland where such a success has been made of Objective 1. They have been successful in cascading wealth down in a way that we have not yet achieved in Wales. It is also in jeopardy that we will be able to do so before 2006. I urge the Minister to address that and to comment on the possibility that this programme will continue beyond 2006. I think that it is unlikely, except for some transitional measures.

Elin Jones: Cynigiad y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 2: ym mhwynt 1, ychwanegu ar ôl 'symleiddio':

ac eithrio:

a. cyfeiriadau sy'n caniatáu i raglen Amcan 1 gael ei defnyddio i baratoi ar gyfer Cwpan Ryder 2010;

Mae rhai ASEau Llafur yn dweud weithiau bod siawns y bydd cymorth Amcan 1 yn parhau tan 2013. Mae'n amlwg nad yw hynny yn wir, heblaw am rywfaint o gymorth trosiannol o bosibl, ac felly rhaid inni sylweddoli pa mor bwysig yw'r adolygiad canol tymor hwn. Nid oes unrhyw obaith realistig y bydd arian yn parhau y tu hwnt i 2006. Mae'n bwysig, felly, o gofio'r sefyllfa sydd ohoni, sydd ymhell o fod yn ddelfrydol, ein bod yn achub ar y cyfle hwn i ddadlau'n gryfach dros Gymru ar y cam hwn o'r adolygiad canol tymor. Dyna pam yr wyf yn falch bod pob gwrthblaid yn cyfarfod â Jan Royall i drafod y materion hyn yfory. Rhaid i'r Llywodraeth ddadlau achos Cymru yn gryf. Mae'n amlwg nad yw ailwladoli yn opsiwn realistig mwyach. Pleidleisiodd ASEau ym Mrwsel yn ei erbyn, ac ni fydd yn digwydd bellach. Pe bai wedi digwydd, byddai grŵp y Ceidwadwyr wedi pryderu na fyddai hynny er budd Cymru o bosibl, ond, hyd y gwelaf, nid yw ar yr agenda mwyach. Rhaid inni fynd ati yn awr i gryfhau dadl Cymru ym Mrwsel.

Mae diwygiadau yn y ddogfen a groesawn, ond mae'n bwysig inni gryfhau dadl Cymru, cynnwys y sector preifat a chwtogi ar y fiwrocratiaeth. Hyd yn oed yn awr, gallwn ddysgu o brofiadau gwledydd eraill, yn enwedig brofiadau Iwerddon a'r Ffindir lle y bu Amcan 1 yn gymaint o lwyddiant. Maent wedi llwyddo i raeadr cyfoeth mewn ffordd nad ydym ni wedi'i gwneud eto yng Nghymru. Mae yn y fantol hefyd pa un a fyddwn yn gallu gwneud hynny cyn 2006. Apeliad ar y Gweinidog i fynd i'r afael â hynny a gwneud sylwadau ar y posibilrwydd y bydd y rhaglen hon yn parhau ar ôl 2006. Credaf fod hynny yn annhebygol, heblaw am rai mesurau trosiannol.

Elin Jones: I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 2: in point 1, add after 'simplification':

with the exception of:

a. references that allow Objective 1 to be used for the purposes of supporting the preparations for the Ryder Cup 2010;

b. cyfeiriadau sydd â'r bwriad o ddileu'r flaenoriaeth a roddir i 'ardaloedd ymylol', sydd wedi'u diffinio fel ardaloedd gwledig Amcan 5b a blaenau'r Cymoedd.

b. references that aim to delete the priority being given to 'peripheral areas, defined as the Objective 5b rural areas and the heads of the Valleys;

Cynigiaf welliant 7. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

I propose amendment 7. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

yn nodi â phryder ddechrau araf rhaglen Amcan 1 sy'n golygu mai dim ond 75 y cant o arian Amcan 1 hyd at ddiwedd 2003 sydd wedi'i neilltuo a dim ond 30 y cant sydd wedi'i dalu.

Notes with concern the slow start for Objective 1, which has led to only 75 per cent of the Objective 1 allocation up to the end of 2003 being committed and only 30 per cent being paid.

Cynigiaf welliant 8. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

I propose amendment 8. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

yn galw ar y Gweinidog i wneud datganiad misol i'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth ar unrhyw danwario yn rhaglen Amcan Un a'r posibilrwydd o arian yn cael ei ddadneilltuo ar ddiwedd 2003.

calls for the Minister to make a monthly statement to the Economic Development and Transport Committee on any Objective 1 underspend and the potential for decommitment at the end of 2003.

Cynigiaf welliant 9. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

I propose amendment 9. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

yn galw ar y Gweinidog i wneud datganiad ar y goblygiadau i gyllideb y Cynulliad o neilltuo £30 miliwn ychwanegol bob blwyddyn ar gyfer arian cyfatebol, yn dilyn ailbrisió'r ewro.

calls on the Minister to make a statement on the implications to the Assembly budget of allocating an extra £30 million per annum for match funding, following euro revaluation.

Cynigiaf welliant 10. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

I propose amendment 10. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

yn galw ar y Gweinidog i amlinellu'r cynnydd yn setliad Barnett plus y Trysorlys, ac i drosglwyddo'r arian Ewropeaidd ychwanegol sydd bellach ar gael i gyllideb floc Cymru.

calls on the Minister to outline increases to the Treasury's Barnett plus settlement and to transfer the additional European funding now available to the Welsh block budget.

Cymeraf y cyfle hwn i gywiro'r Gweinidog a'i gyfeiriad at y gerddi botaneg. Pe bai'n edrych ar wefan Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru, byddai'n gweld bod bron i £0.25 miliwn o arian Amcan 1 wedi ei glustnodi ar gyfer Technium yn Llanarthne.

I will take this opportunity to correct the Minister on his reference to the botanic gardens. If he looked at the WEFO website he would see that nearly £0.25 million of Objective 1 money was earmarked for the Technium in Llanarthne.

Pe na bawn i yma'r prynhawn yma yn siarad am Amcan 1 byddwn yn lansiad un o brosiectau Amcan 1 Ceredigion—prosiect trydaneiddio Cwm Brefi, ger Llanddewibrefi. Drwy gymorth Amcan 1, yn 2003, mae cwm cyfan o ryw 20 o dai yn cael ei gysylltu â'r

Had I not been here today discussing Objective 1, I would have been at the launch of one of Ceredigion's Objective 1 projects—the electrification of Cwm Brefi, near Llanddewibrefi. Through the assistance of Objective 1, in 2003, a whole valley of some

grid cenedlaethol. Er bod Cwm Brefi yn enghraifft go eithriadol, mae hyn yn ein hatgoffa o faint y dasg o adeiladu economi'r Gorllewin a'r Cymoedd, pa un ai a yw hynny oherwydd diffyg isadeiledd a chyfleoedd gwaith yng nghefn gwlad, neu oherwydd lefelau annerbyniol o uchel o anweithgarwch economaidd ym mlaenau'r Cymoedd.

Cefais fy nghyhuddo yr wythnos diwethaf yn y Siambr o ymfoddhau mewn hunanfflangellu o ran ystadegau economaidd. Yn y ddadl hon, nid oes angen agwedd hunanfflangellol nac ychwaith agwedd hunan foddhaus sy'n or-amlwg yn y Siambr ar adegau. Y mae ein profiadau ni oll a'r ystadegau yn dangos y bu Amcan 1 yn hynod o araf i ddechrau; mae gormod o bwyllgorau a phartneriaethau a dim digon o ymateb prydlon a rhagweithiol i brosiectau; mae'r sector preifat wedi cael llond bol ar yr holl broses; a'r ardaloedd mwyaf difreintiedig sy'n elwa leiaf ar Amcan 1. Mae'r pryderon hyn wedi eu codi dro ar ôl tro ac ateb y Gweinidog bob tro oedd y dylem aros am yr adolygiad canol tymor. A dyma ni, mae'r adolygiad wedi cyrraedd.

Â phob chwarae teg i'r Gweinidog, y mae wedi gwrando ar rai o'r pryderon. Bu'n rhaid iddo wrando, oherwydd pan yr ydych yn derbyn adroddiad canol tymor beiriadol, sy'n mynd mor bell â dweud bod yn rhaid i chi adolygu a lleihau eich targedau am nad oes gobaith y byddwch yn eu cyflawni, mae'n rhaid ei fod yn amlwg bod yn rhaid ymateb. Croesawaf ymdrech y Gweinidog i symleiddio proses Amcan 1; ni wn a fydd y drefn newydd yn gyflymach, ond gobeithiaf y bydd. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn amau na fydd cael gwared ar ryw ddwsin o bartneriaethau a sefydlu rhyw hanner dwsin o bartneriaethau newydd yn eu lle yn sicrhau'r newid sylweddol sydd ei angen ar Amcan 1. Mae gwir angen y newid hwnnw er mwyn osgoi dadneilltuo arian ar ddiwedd 2003 a'r blynyddoedd sydd i ddod. Yr oedd papur a gyflwynwyd yr wythnos diwethaf i'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth yn dangos bod yn rhaid gwario dros £50 miliwn o arian Amcan 1 cyn diwedd 2003 neu byddwn yn wynebu'r perygl o golli'r arian i Frwsel.

20 houses is being connected to the national grid. Despite the fact that Cwm Brefi is quite an exceptional example, it does serve to remind us of the scale of the task of building the economy of west Wales and the Valleys, whether because of the lack of infrastructure and employment opportunities in rural areas, or because of the unacceptably high levels of economic inactivity in the heads of the Valleys.

Last week in the Chamber, I was accused of indulging in self-flagellation over economic statistics. In this debate there is no need for a self-flagellatory attitude or for the self-satisfied attitude that is all too evident in the Chamber at times. Our own experiences and the statistics show that Objective 1 was excruciatingly slow to start; there are too many committees and partnerships and not enough timely and proactive responses to projects; the private sector is fed up to the back teeth with the whole process; and the most disadvantaged areas are benefiting the least from Objective 1. These concerns have been raised time and again and the Minister's answer on each occasion was that we should wait for the mid-term review. And here we are, the review has arrived.

Fair play to the Minister, he has listened to some of those concerns. He has had to listen, because when you receive a critical mid-term review that goes as far as to say that you must review and reduce your targets because you have no hope of achieving them, then it must be obvious that you have to respond. I welcome the Minister's efforts to simplify the Objective 1 process; I do not know whether the new regime will be swifter, but I hope so. However, I suspect that abolishing a dozen or so partnerships and establishing some half a dozen new partnerships in their place will not ensure the step change that Objective 1 needs. We need that step change to avoid decommitment at the end of 2003 and in subsequent years. A paper presented to the Economic Development and Transport Committee last week showed that we must spend over £50 million of Objective 1 money before the end of 2003 or we face the danger of losing that money to Brussels.

Er mor bwysig yw symleiddio proses Amcan 1, y mae sicrhau bod digon o gyllid cyfatebol yn y system lawn mor bwysig ar gyfer ei lwyddiant. Ni chafwyd ceiniog o arian cyfatebol o'r Trysorlys ar gyfer Amcan 1—bu'n rhaid dod o hyd i'r cyfan o fewn bloc Cymru. Bu hyn yn broblem fawr mewn rhai blaenoriaethau a mesurau, yn enwedig blaenoriaeth 3. Gwyddom oll am brosiectau sy'n ei chael yn anodd i ddod o hyd i arian cyfatebol. Wedi ailbrisió'r ewro, mae angen £25 miliwn o gyllid cyfatebol ychwanegol y flwyddyn ar Amcan 1. Gwyddom nad yw Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi ceisio sicrhau'r arian Ewropeaidd ychwanegol sydd ar gael o'r Trysorlys, yn ychwanegol at Barnett, ers ailbrisió'r ewro. Felly, yn dilyn ailbrisió rhaglen Amcan 1 Cymru, fe fydd y Trysorlys ar ei ennill o ryw £100 miliwn ond ni fydd ceiniog o hynny yn cyrraedd Cymru. Nid yw'r Llywodraeth hon wedi gwneud cais hyd yn oed am y £100 miliwn hynny.

Ar yr olwg gyntaf, mae gwelliant 2 yn edrych braidd yn ddibwys, ond i Blaid Cymru mae'n mynd at wraidd gwendid yn yr economi Gymreig, sef anghydraddoldeb rhwng cymunedau. Dengys ystadegau chwarterol WEFO fod swyddi, prosiectau a lefelau gwariant ar eu hisaf yn yr ardaloedd gwanaf yn economaidd, sef Merthyr Tudful, Torfaen, Blaenau Gwent ac Ynys Môn. Fodd bynnag, ar adeg pan ddylid ail-ddyblu ymdrechion i dargedu Amcan 1 i gyfeiriad yr ardaloedd mwyaf difreintiedig, bwriad y Llywodraeth yw dileu'r cyfeiriad yn nogfen Amcan 1 at roi blaenoriaeth i'r ardaloedd ymylol hyn, sef blaenau'r Cymoedd a chefn gwlad. Y rheswm a roddwyd, a ailadroddodd y Gweinidog, yw bod lleoli prosiectau yn yr ardaloedd hyn yn rhy lethwith.

Gofynnaf ichi gefnogi gwelliant 2 er mwyn sicrhau na fydd Amcan 1 yn cael ei ddefnyddio ar gyfer marchnata cwpan Ryder—er fy mod yn cefnogi cwpan Ryder ac yn golffwr newydd. Nid i ariannu paratoadau cwpan Ryder mae Amcan 1. Mae achosion mwy anghenus am fuddsoddiad Amcan 1.

I gloi, gofynnaf am ddau ymrwymiad

Although it is important that we simplify the Objective 1 process, equally as important for its success is that we ensure that there is sufficient match funding in the system. We did not receive a single penny in match funding from the Treasury for Objective 1—it all had to be found from within the Welsh block. This has been a great problem with many priorities and measures, especially priority 3. We all know of projects that are struggling to find match funding. Following the revaluation of the euro, an additional £25 million of match funding is required per year for Objective 1. We know that the Welsh Assembly Government has not attempted to secure the additional European funding that is available from the Treasury, over and above Barnett, following the revaluation of the euro. Therefore, following the revaluation of the Objective 1 programme in Wales, the Treasury will be some £100 million better off, but not a penny of that money will reach Wales. This Government has not even made a bid for that £100 million.

At first glance, amendment 2 seems rather insignificant, but to Plaid Cymru it points to the heart of a weakness in the Welsh economy, that of inequality between communities. WEFO's quarterly statistics show that jobs, projects and expenditure levels are at their lowest in the economically weakest areas of Merthyr Tydfil, Torfaen, Blaenau Gwent and Anglesey. However, when we should be redoubling our efforts to target Objective 1 to those most deprived areas, the Government intends to delete the reference in the Objective 1 document to prioritising these peripheral areas, namely the heads of the Valleys and rural areas. The reason given, and repeated by the Minister, is that locating projects in these areas is too awkward.

I urge you to support amendment 2 to ensure that Objective 1 is not used to market the Ryder cup—although I am a supporter of the Ryder cup as well as a new golfer myself. Objective 1 is not intended for funding the Ryder cup preparations. There are causes in greater need of Objective 1 investment.

In conclusion, I ask you to make two

gennyh, Weinidog. Yn gyntaf, a wnewch gais swyddogol, cyhoeddus i'r Trysorlys am y £100 miliwn mewn arian Ewropeaidd ychwanegol y mae Cymru'n gymwys amdano yn dilyn ailbrizio'r ewro? Yn ail, a wnewch sicrhau dyraniad tecach o adnoddau Amcan 1 yn y Gorllewin a'r Cymoedd drwy gefnogi gwelliant 2?

Jenny Randerson: I propose amendment 5 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

calls on the Assembly Government to ensure that Assembly match funds are sufficient to ensure that no worthwhile project fails because of a lack of matched funding.

This amendment emphasises the importance of the availability of sufficient match funding. However, to start with the mid-term review, a programme of this size is bound to have some wrinkles, some problems and be subject to changing circumstances. The mid-term evaluation and review is a valuable opportunity to deal with these aspects and make minor amendments that take account of policy changes. In general, we support the document's recommendations. The document has several important messages, however, that we must take on board. Minister, despite its title, this debate is only about Objective 1. I ask that the same opportunity be afforded to debate the Objective 2 and Objective 3 evaluations and reviews when the time comes. The recent changes at WEFO are an obvious early outcome from this report and review process. Bureaucratic simplification and reduction is key to spending this large sum of money effectively and efficiently. There is concern that some potential projects have been deterred by bureaucracy, or perceived bureaucracy, and the long-winded application process. The message is that capacity building is a key issue that must be addressed, with more attention to project aftercare following commencement.

At its last meeting, the Committee heard evidence of the different partnerships' variable track records and their ability to work together. North Wales was held up as

commitments, Minister. First, will you make an official, public bid to the Treasury for the £100 million in additional European funding for which Wales qualifies following the revaluation of the euro? Secondly, will you ensure a fairer distribution of Objective 1 resources in west Wales and the Valleys by supporting amendment 2?

Jenny Randerson: Cynigaf welliant 5 yn enw Kirsty Williams: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i sicrhau bod arian cyfatebol y Cynulliad yn ddigonol i sicrhau nad yw unrhyw brosiect da yn methu oherwydd diffyg arian cyfatebol.

Pwysleisia'r gwelliant hwn pa mor bwysig ydyw bod digon o arian cyfatebol ar gael. Fodd bynnag, gan droi at yr adolygiad canol tymor yn gyntaf, mae'n anochel bod rhaglen o'r maint hwn yn wynebu rhai anghysondebau, rhai problemau ac yn agored i amgylchiadau sy'n newid. Mae'r gwerthusiad a'r adolygiad canol tymor yn gyfle gwerthfawr i ymdrin â'r agweddau hyn a gwneud mân welliannau sy'n ystyried newidiadau polisi. Yn gyffredinol, cefnogwn argymhellion y ddogfen. Fodd bynnag, mae'r ddogfen hon yn cynnwys sawl neges bwysig y mae'n rhaid inni eu hystyried. Weinidog, er gwaethaf ei theitl, mae a wnelo'r ddadl hon ag Amcan 1 yn unig. Gofynnaf inni gael yr un cyfle i drafod gwerthusiadau ac adolygiadau Amcan 2 ac Amcan 3 pan ddaw'r amser. Mae'r newidiadau diweddar yn WEFO yn ganlyniad cynnar amlwg i'r adroddiad a'r broses adolygu hon. Mae symleiddio a lleihau biwrocratiaeth yn allweddol er mwyn gwario'r swm mawr hwn o arian yn effeithiol ac yn effeithlon. Mae pryder bod rhai wedi penderfynu peidio â bwrw ymlaen â phrosiectau posibl oherwydd biwrocratiaeth, neu'r canfyddiad o fiwrocratiaeth, a'r broses ymgeisio hirwyntog. Y neges yw bod adeiladu capasiti yn fater allweddol y mae'n rhaid mynd i'r afael ag ef, gyda mwy o sylw ar ofalu am brosiectau ar ôl iddynt ddechrau.

Yn ei gyfarfod diwethaf, clywodd y Pwyllgor dystiolaeth ynglŷn â record amrywiol y gwahanol bartneriaethau a'u gallu i gydweithio. Nodwyd bod y Gogledd yn

an example of good practice in cross-partnership working, while Valleys partnerships had taken much longer to work together. The evidence was in the number of jobs created and projects established. This document addresses some of the issues raised by that evidence. Another essential aspect is the increased involvement required of the private sector. That is difficult in Wales, which has many SMEs and relatively few large companies with the capacity to engage at this strategic level. I specifically support the proposals on tourism in the Valleys, which should help to encourage private sector involvement as well as providing valuable jobs.

On joint amendment 6, I was disappointed indeed to hear the Minister say in Committee:

'It is too soon to nail our colours to the mast on repatriation'.

Surely now is the time to make our views plainly known to the UK Government and the European Commission and to accept Commissioner Barnier's invitation for us to do so. On a cross-party opposition basis, we will be accepting that invitation tomorrow.

4.10 p.m.

The Welsh Liberal Democrats have serious concerns about repatriation. I am delighted with information from Europe that suggests that it is a non-starter, but we should not take that for granted. We believe that we would have more certainty, and would be more likely to get a better deal, if we received regeneration money from the EU as well as from the UK Government. The EU offers six years' certainty; the UK Government offers only three years' certainty, and that is subject to the vagaries of changes of Government. We do not want to put all our eggs in one basket in terms of regeneration funding.

On what is known technically as N+2, as you know, Minister, the changing value of the euro to the pound means that, in sterling

esiampyl o arfer da o ran gweithio ar draws partneriaethau, tra bod partneriaethau yn y Cymoedd wedi cymryd llawer mwy o amser i gydweithio. Gwelwyd y dystiolaeth yn nifer y swyddi a grëwyd a nifer y prosiectau a sefydlwyd. Mae'r ddogfen hon yn mynd i'r afael â rhai o'r materion a godwyd yn y dystiolaeth honno. Un agwedd hanfodol arall yw'r rhan helaethach y mae angen i'r sector preifat ei chwarae. Mae hynny yn anodd yng Nghymru, lle mae llawer o fusnesau bach a chanolig eu maint a nifer cymharol fach o gwmnïau mawr â'r gallu i gymryd rhan ar y lefel strategol hon. Cefnogaf y cynigion ar dwristiaeth yn y Cymoedd yn benodol. Dylai'r rhain helpu i annog y sector preifat i gymryd rhan yn ogystal â darparu swyddi gwerthfawr.

O ran cyd-welliant 6, yr oeddwn yn siomedig iawn i glywed y Gweinidog yn dweud yn y Pwyllgor:

Mae'n rhy gynnar i ddangos ein hochr o ran ailwladoli.

Onid dyma'r adeg inni ddweud wrth Lywodraeth y DU a'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd yn blwmp ac yn blaen beth yw ein barn a derbyn gwahoddiad y Comisiynydd Barnier i wneud hynny? Fel gwrthbleidiau gyda'n gilydd, byddwn yn derbyn y gwahoddiad hwnnw yfory.

Mae gan Ddemocratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru bryderon dybryd ynglŷn ag ailwladoli. Yr wyf yn falch o glywed y wybodaeth o Ewrop sy'n awgrymu na fydd yn mynd rhagddo, ond ni ddylem gymryd hynny yn ganiataol. Credwn y byddai mwy o sicrwydd gennym, ac y byddem yn fwy tebygol o gael gwell bargaen, pe baem yn cael arian adfywio oddi wrth yr UE yn ogystal â Llywodraeth y DU. Mae'r UE yn cynnig sicrwydd o chwe blynedd; dim ond sicrwydd o dair blynedd a gynigir Llywodraeth y DU, ac mae hynny yn dibynnu pa un a fydd y Llywodraeth yn newid. Nid ydym am ddibynnu ar un ffynhonnell o ran arian adfywio.

O ran yr hyn a elwir yn dechnegol yn N+2, fel y gwyddoch, Weinidog, mae'r newid yng ngwerth yr ewro o gymharu â'r bunt yn

terms, we have more money to spend. Will you comment on the likelihood that Objective 1 spending will be achieved at this new level? As a result of N+2, the availability of sufficient match funding in future years is vital, for example, via the pathways to prosperity fund. I hope that next year's budget will ensure that sufficient money is available.

We cannot support Plaid Cymru's amendment 2, which covers two different issues. We do not agree with Plaid Cymru's stance on the Ryder Cup. Why should its benefits not be spread beyond Newport and into the Valleys areas? Objective 1 would facilitate that. However, if the second part of the amendment were proposed separately, we would support it, as we support Plaid Cymru's view on peripherality.

Janet Davies: I propose amendment 6 in the names of Jocelyn Davies, Kirsty Williams and Jonathan Morgan. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

calls on the Minister to seek urgent talks with the European Commission to express views from Wales on the future of European structural funds and to make a statement on the Assembly Government's own position on this issue.

We have reason to be gravely concerned about our future. We must face the economic consequences for Wales of European Union enlargement. It is politically important that the last 50 years' stability in western Europe is extended eastwards, but it will mean that Wales will no longer qualify for as much assistance as at present. That is why it is important that we make the best use of what we have now. We can only view the UK Government's proposal to retain the contribution that it makes towards structural funds in return for distributing the money to qualifying areas with grave suspicion. It sounds good in theory, but past experience tells us that we usually get a better deal from the European Commission than we do from our own member state.

At a territorial cohesion commission meeting

golygu, o ran arian sterling, fod gennym fwy o arian i'w wario. A wnewch sylwadau ar y tebygolrwydd y bydd gwariant Amcan 1 yn cyrraedd y lefel newydd hon? O ganlyniad i N+2, mae'n hollbwysig bod digon o arian cyfatebol ar gael yn y dyfodol, er enghraifft, drwy'r gronfa ffordd i ffyniant. Gobeithiaf y bydd cyllideb y flwyddyn nesaf yn sicrhau bod digon o arian ar gael.

Ni allwn gefnogi gwelliant 2 Plaid Cymru, sy'n trafod dau fater gwahanol. Ni chytunwn â barn Plaid Cymru ynglŷn â Chwpan Ryder. Pam na ddylai ardaloedd y tu hwnt i Gasnewydd ac o fewn ardaloedd y Cymoedd elwa? Byddai Amcan 1 yn hwyluso hynny. Fodd bynnag, pe bai ail ran y gwelliant wedi'i gynnig ar wahân, byddem yn ei gefnogi, gan ein bod yn cefnogi barn Plaid Cymru ynglŷn â pherifferoldeb.

Janet Davies: Cynigiaf welliant 6 yn enwau Jocelyn Davies, Kirsty Williams a Jonathan Morgan. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar y Gweinidog i gynnal trafodaethau brys â'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd er mwyn cyflwyno sylwadau o Gymru ar ddyfodol y cronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd a gwneud datganiad ar safbwynt Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar y mater hwn.

Mae gennym achos i fod yn bryderus iawn ynglŷn â'n dyfodol. Rhaid inni wynebu'r canlyniadau economaidd i Gymru a ddaw yn sgîl ehangu'r Undeb Ewropeaidd. Mae'n wleidyddol bwysig bod y sefydlogrwydd a fu yng ngorllewin Ewrop ers y 50 mlynedd diwethaf yn ymestyn tua'r dwyrain, ond bydd yn golygu na fydd Cymru yn gymwys mwyach i gael cymaint o gymorth ag a gaiff ar hyn o bryd. Dyna pam mae'n bwysig ein bod yn gwneud y defnydd gorau o'r hyn sydd gennym ar hyn o bryd. Ni allwn ond bod yn hynod amheus o gynnig Llywodraeth y DU i gadw'r cyfraniad a wna tuag at y cronfeydd strwythurol yn gyfnewid am ddisbarthu'r arian i ardaloedd cymwys. Mae'n swnio'n dda mewn egwyddor, ond dengys profiad ein bod fel arfer yn cael gwell cynnig oddi wrth y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd nag a gawn oddi wrth ein haelod wladwriaeth ein hunain.

Yng nghyfarfod comisiwn cydlynad

of the Committee of the Regions, which I attended last month, there was unanimous opposition to the repatriation of funds. Following the meeting, Albert Bore, president of the Committee of Regions and an English Labour councillor, wrote to Romano Prodi to say that repatriation,

‘would singularly fail to attain the objectives of economic, social and territorial cohesion.’

It is now reported that the Welsh Local Government Association is joining forces with other Objective 1 regions to lobby European politicians to try to secure continuing cash aid after 2006. The Minister’s refusal to give any commitment on the Assembly Government’s views in last week’s Economic Development and Transport Committee does not inspire confidence. It has been said this afternoon that the European Parliament has made a decision, but I understand that the Council of Ministers makes the final decision.

*Daeth y Llywydd i’r Gadair am 4.13 p.m.
The Presiding Officer took the Chair at 4.13 p.m.*

We all know that bureaucracy is a problem with regard to structural funds, but an alternative method could be found whereby Wales could establish a confidence agreement with the European Commission to enable us to undertake our own monitoring and auditing.

Plaid Cymru considers it essential that peripheral areas continue to be a priority in the single programming document. Some parts of the Objective 1 area are making progress in economic development to a greater degree than others. For example, Bridgend and Rhondda Cynon Taf are among the areas of stronger growth, whereas in Merthyr Tydfil, which has only managed to access £6.9 million of Objective 1 funding, and Blaenau Gwent, which has only managed to access £7.4 million, employment levels have fallen. It is the parts of Bridgend and Rhondda Cynon Taf along the M4 and the A470 that are forging ahead economically. Merthyr Tydfil, Blaenau Gwent, the top of the Rhondda Valley, Ogmore, Garw and

tiriogaethol Pwyllgor y Rhanbarthau, a fynychais fis diwethaf, bu gwrthwynebiad unfrydol i ailwladoli cronfeydd. Yn dilyn y cyfarfod, ysgrifennodd Albert Bore, llywydd Pwyllgor y Rhanbarthau a chynghorydd Llafur yn Lloegr, at Romano Prodi, i ddweud y byddai ailwladoli,

yn methu’n lân â chyflawni amcanion cydlynad economaidd, cymdeithasol a thiriogaethol.

Erbyn hyn mae sôn bod Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru yn ymuno â rhanbarthau Amcan 1 eraill i lobio gwleidyddion Ewrop i geisio sicrhau y bydd cymorth ariannol yn parhau ar ôl 2006. Nid yw’r ffaith bod y Gweinidog wedi gwrthod gwneud ymrwymiad ynglŷn â safbwynt Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth yr wythnos diwethaf yn rhoi hyder inni. Dywedwyd y prynhawn yma bod Senedd Ewrop wedi gwneud penderfyniad, ond deallaf mai Cyngor y Gweinidogion fydd yn gwneud y penderfyniad terfynol.

Gwyddom oll fod biwrocratiaeth yn broblem o ran y cronfeydd strwythurol, ond gellid dod o hyd i ateb arall, gyda Chymru’n sefydlu cytundeb o hyder gyda’r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd i’n galluogi i wneud ein gwaith monitro ac archwilio ein hunain.

Ym marn Plaid Cymru, mae’n hanfodol bod ardaloedd ymylol yn parhau i fod yn flaenoriaeth yn y ddogfen raglennu sengl. Mae rhai rhannau o ardal Amcan 1 yn gwneud gwell cynnydd o ran datblygu economaidd nag eraill. Er enghraifft, mae Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr a Rhondda Cynon Taf ymhlith yr ardaloedd lle y ceir mwy o dwf, ond ym Merthyr Tudful, nad yw ond wedi llwyddo i hawlio £6.9 miliwn o arian Amcan 1, ac ym Mlaenau Gwent, nad yw ond wedi llwyddo i hawlio £7.4 miliwn, mae lefelau cyflogaeth wedi gostwng. Yn y rhannau o Ben-y-bont ar Ogwr a Rhondda Cynon Taf sy’n ffinio â’r M4 a’r A470 y ceir y cynnydd economaidd mwyaf amlwg. Mae Merthyr Tudful, Blaenau Gwent, blaen Cwm

Afan valleys, as well as other areas, are struggling hard against the challenges of distance, often poor roads and, sometimes, a lack of railways. Without the extra kick given by the peripherality provision, they will be in a worse situation in future.

I find it difficult to understand why a Labour Government wants to do this to these valleys. Do you want to close them down completely? If the old Tory Welsh Office had tried this, you would have screamed from the rooftops—

Christine Chapman: Do you agree, Janet, that we wanted to increase flexibility, and that there was never any intention that any of the Valleys areas would be put at a disadvantage? That was made clear in the Economic Development and Transport Committee.

Janet Davies: You are mistaken. If you take out the peripherality provision, you will do just that. Remote rural areas are also in difficulties. Consider the many job losses in Pembrokeshire in recent years, and add in the factor of people moving there for the landscape, which leads to rocketing house prices, and you will see that local people are getting a pretty raw deal. I hope that there will be sufficient support for amendment 6, because you must keep priority for those peripheral areas.

Christine Chapman: In debating this important milestone in the Objective 1 programme, we must acknowledge how far we have come. Despite a pretty rocky start to the programme there has been much progress. The next half of the programme is about sharpening up, based on the lessons learned so far, as well as building on the good foundations that we have. There are excellent building blocks. We have the 11,000 and the 22,000 plus jobs that have been created and safeguarded, which are making real changes in Welsh society. Many more people are now in work, with a far better future to look forward to; companies are expanding in Wales and given an incentive to stay here;

Rhondda, cwm Ogwr, cwm Garw a chwm Afan, yn ogystal ag ardaloedd eraill, yn gorfod ymdrechu'n galed yn wyneb yr heriau sy'n gysylltiedig â phellter, ffyrdd gwael yn aml ac, weithiau, diffyg rheilffyrdd. Heb yr hwb ychwanegol a roddwyd gan ddarpariaeth perifferoldeb, byddant mewn sefyllfa waeth yn y dyfodol.

Yr wyf yn ei chael yn anodd deall pam mae Llywodraeth Lafur am wneud hyn i'r cymoedd hyn. A ydych am eu dinistrio'n llwyr? Pe bai'r hen Swyddfa Gymreig o dan y Toriaid wedi ceisio gwneud hyn, byddech wedi gweiddi yn groch—

Christine Chapman: A gytunwch, Janet, ein bod am sicrhau mwy o hyblygrwydd, ac na fu unrhyw fwriad o gwbl y byddai ardaloedd y Cymoedd o dan anfantais? Eglurwyd hynny yn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth.

Janet Davies: Yr ydych yn camgymryd. Os cewch wared ar y ddarpariaeth ar gyfer perifferoldeb, dyna'n union y byddwch yn ei wneud. Mae ardaloedd gwledig anghysbell hefyd yn wynebu anawsterau. Ystyriwch y llu o swyddi a gollwyd yn sir Benfro yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf, ac ystyriwch hefyd y bobl sy'n symud i'r ardal oherwydd ei thirwedd, sy'n arwain at gynnydd sylweddol mewn prisiau tai, ac fe welwch nad yw pobl leol yn cael chwarae teg. Gobeithiaf y bydd digon o gefnogaeth i welliant 6, oherwydd rhaid ichi gadw blaenoriaeth i'r ardaloedd mymlol hynny.

Christine Chapman: Wrth drafod y garreg filltir bwysig hon yn rhaglen Amcan 1, rhaid inni gydnabod y cynnydd yr ydym wedi'i wneud. Er gwaethaf y dechrau eithaf sigledig a gafodd y rhaglen, gwnaed llawer o gynnydd. Y nod yn ail hanner y rhaglen yw cryfhau'n dull o weithredu, yn seiliedig ar y gwersi a ddysgwyd hyd yma, yn ogystal ag adeiladu ar y sylfeini da sydd gennym. Ceir sylfeini ardderchog. Mae gennym yr 11,000 o swyddi a grëwyd a'r 22,000 a mwy o swyddi a ddiogelwyd, sy'n gwneud newidiadau gwirioneddol i gymdeithas Cymru. Mae llawer mwy o bobl yn gweithio bellach, a gallant edrych ymlaen at ddyfodol llawer mwy llewyrchus; mae cwmnïau yn ehangu

and programmes are tackling the economic inactivity that has blighted Wales for too long. I do not subscribe to Nick Bourne's gloomy view of Wales. Economic inactivity will take a long time to tackle, but we are getting there.

There is a different atmosphere in Wales now. A confidence that had been lost over the years is starting to re-emerge. Objective 1 has not only increased jobs, it has fostered new ways of working. That element is sometimes forgotten or even dismissed. The private, public and voluntary sectors are working in ways that they have not before. This has not been easy, and there have been spats along the way. However, a mature attitude has developed, which acknowledges that, by working together with a healthy respect for each other's perspectives, the various sectors will come up with a far better product.

The impact of the structural funds will last longer because of good partnership working. I take issue with the Conservatives' amendment 4 on the private sector. There is an open door for the private sector. There has been a huge amount of progress on the number of private sector-led projects. Much of the Objective 1 programme is now benefiting the private sector. I agree with Jenny that there is still room for improvement. However, we have made progress, despite the knocks that this programme has taken. Those knocks are regrettable, because this is not only about money, but about people's efforts to create a better Wales.

I will quote from the Anglesey partnership, which attended the Economic Development and Transport Committee meeting last week. It noted that:

'Adverse, negative publicity is creating public apathy, and a 'what has it ever done for me' attitude. A positive campaign would do much to encourage the view that it is worth the hassle and that many positives are already being derived.'

yng Nghymru ac maent yn cael cymhelliant i aros yma; ac mae rhaglenni yn mynd i'r afael ag anweithgarwch economaidd a fu'n bla yng Nghymru ers gormod o amser. Nid wyf yn derbyn darlun du Nick Bourne o Gymru. Bydd yn cymryd cryn amser i fynd i'r afael ag anweithgarwch economaidd, ond yr ydym ar y trywydd cywir.

Mae awyrgylch gwahanol yng Nghymru bellach. Yr ydym yn dechrau ailennyn hyder a gollwyd dros y blynyddoedd. Nid creu mwy o swyddi'n unig a wna Amcan 1; mae wedi meithrin ffyrdd newydd o weithio. Mae pobl yn anghofio neu hyd yn oed yn diystyru'r elfen honno weithiau. Mae'r sector preifat, y sector cyhoeddus a'r sector gwirfoddol yn gweithio mewn ffyrdd newydd. Nid yw hyn wedi bod yn hawdd, a bu dadlau ar hyd y ffordd. Fodd bynnag, mae agwedd aeddfed wedi datblygu, sy'n cydnabod y bydd y sectorau gwahanol, drwy gydweithio a dangos parch dyladwy tuag at eu safbwyntiau ei gilydd, yn esgor ar ganlyniadau llawer gwell.

Bydd effaith y cronfeydd strwythurol yn parhau'n hwy oherwydd gwaith partneriaeth da. Anghytunaf â gwelliant 4 y Ceidwadwyr ar y sector preifat. Mae drws agored i'r sector preifat. Gwnaed llawer iawn o gynnydd ar nifer o brosiectau o dan arweiniad y sector preifat. Erbyn hyn mae'r sector preifat yn elwa ar sawl agwedd ar raglen Amcan 1. Cytunaf â Jenny fod lle i wella o hyd. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym wedi gwneud cynnydd, er gwaethaf yr ergydion i'r rhaglen hon. Mae'r ergydion hynny yn anffodus, gan nad sicrhau arian yn unig yw nod y rhaglen hon—mae a wnelo ag ymdrechion pobl i greu gwell Cymru.

Dyfynnaf bartneriaeth Ynys Môn, a fynychodd gyfarfod y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth yr wythnos diwethaf. Nododd:

Mae cyhoeddusrwydd negyddol, anffafriol yn arwain at ddifaterwch ymysg y cyhoedd, ynghyd â'r agwedd 'pa les a ddaeth i mi o hyn'. Byddai ymgyrch gadarnhaol yn gwneud llawer i annog pobl i feddwl ei bod yn werth trafferthu a bod llawer o bethau cadarnhaol eisoes wedi digwydd.

We need to take account of those.

On the mid-term review, I support the Government's recommendations, in particular the greater emphasis on childcare and disability targets. Apart from money, what most low-paid parents need to transform their lives is good childcare. That is still an aspiration in our poorer communities. Not having good childcare means that people cannot travel far, and are trapped in low-value, low-paid jobs. I agree with many of my colleagues that we also need to include town-centre enhancements, which is of particular value to Valleys communities. We need to encourage movement into, and the sustainability of, the Valleys areas. Attractive environments are essential if we are to create vibrant areas in which to live and work.

4.20 p.m.

Michael German: I ask your office, Llywydd, to be careful when titling debates. Item 6 on the agenda is listed as a debate on the mid-term review of structural funds programmes when, actually, it is about Objective 1. For those with an interest in the third of Wales that is not represented in it, the structural funds exist. We had two evaluations forming the mid-term review, which we are not debating today. That is an important issue for us all. The motion itself is correct, as it refers to Objective 1, but I want the Minister to address what happens to east Wales. Newport still exists, and has European funding—

The Presiding Officer: Order. I am grateful to the leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat group but, having taken further advice as to what I believe to be the case, I understand that these titles are normally provided by the Business Minister, and so I suggest that you direct your comments elsewhere. However, we will consult on these matters, as we always do.

Mae angen inni ystyried y rheini.

O ran yr adolygiad canol tymor, cefnogaf argymhellion y Llywodraeth, yn enwedig yr awgrym y dylid rhoi mwy o bwyslais ar ofal plant a thargedau anabledd. Ar wahân i arian, yr hyn y mae'r rhan fwyaf o rieni ar gyflogau isel ei angen os ydynt am drawsnewid eu bywydau yw gofal plant da. Mae hynny yn dal i fod yn ddyhead yn ein cymunedau tlotaf. Ni all pobl deithio ymhell os nad oes gofal plant da ganddynt, a chânt eu hunain yn gorfod aros mewn swyddi gwerth isel â chyflog isel. Cytunaf â llawer o'm cyd-Aelodau fod angen inni gynnwys gwelliannau i ganol trefi hefyd, sy'n werthfawr i gymunedau'r Cymoedd yn arbennig. Mae angen inni annog pobl i symud i mewn ardaloedd y Cymoedd a hyrwyddo cynaliadwyedd yr ardaloedd hynny. Mae amgylchedd deniadol yn hanfodol os ydym am greu ardaloedd bywiog i fyw a gweithio ynddynt.

Michael German: Gofynnaf i'ch swyddfa, Lywydd, fod yn ofalus wrth bennu teitlau dadleuon. Rhestrir eitem 6 ar yr agenda fel dadl ar yr adolygiad canol tymor o raglenni'r cronfeydd strwythurol, er mai Amcan 1, mewn gwirionedd, yw testun y ddadl. I'r rhai â diddordeb yn y traean o Gymru nas cynrychiolir ynddo, mae'r cronfeydd strwythurol yn bodoli. Cawsom ddau werthusiad fel rhan o'r adolygiad canol tymor, nad ydym yn eu trafod heddiw. Mae hynny yn fater pwysig i bob un ohonom. Mae'r cynnig ei hun yn gywir, gan ei fod yn cyfeirio at Amcan 1, ond yr wyf am i'r Gweinidog fynd i'r afael â'r hyn fydd yn digwydd yn nwyrain Cymru. Mae Casnewydd yn dal i fodoli, ac mae'n cael arian Ewropeaidd—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i arweinydd grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru ond, wedi imi ofyn am gyngor pellach ynglŷn â'r drefn y credaf sy'n cael ei dilyn, deallaf mai'r Trefnydd sy'n darparu'r teitlau hyn fel arfer, ac felly awgrymaf eich bod yn cyfeirio'ch sylwadau tuag at rywun arall. Fodd bynnag, byddwn yn ymgynghori ar y materion hyn, fel y gwnawn bob amser.

Michael German: I am deeply grateful for your advice and I hope that the Minister for Economic Development and Transport will pass the message on to his colleague. If not, I will.

I wish to raise several issues relating to the mid-term evaluations that are reflected in the mid-term review. The first is bureaucracy and the general issues emerging from many of the projects that I have visited. Many of the review and evaluation materials have also reflected upon it. There are two fundamental issues there. First, the unacceptable length of time between an application's being made and its being approved or rejected, although this does vary between local and regional bids. Secondly, the application form. I welcome the fact that you have streamlined the process and increased the speed with which applications move forward, but the main issue now relates to the application form itself. The Scottish Executive has refined the form and has made it easier to apply. While it may take time for this to happen in Wales, work must begin now if we are to make the application procedure simpler by simplifying the written forms.

The second issue relates to match funding. I have visited several embryonic projects whose staff have said to me that they know of other projects that could not submit their applications because they were unable to access match funding. There is a difference between people submitting an application that has match funding within it, and those who have not got to the stage of making the application because they do not have match funding. Clarity is now needed over the Assembly's match funding pot, namely the local regeneration fund and pathway to prosperity. There are two ways to provide that clarity. First, the criteria by which the Assembly grants money from its match-funding pots needs to be clear, and understood by all the prospective project bidders who want to participate in the programme. Secondly, the amounts of money remaining should be published, so that it is easy for people to see how much remains each year and to bid for it. That means that they must submit them before they embark

Michael German: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar iawn am eich cyngor a gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth yn trosglwyddo'r neges i'w gyd-Aelod. Os na wnaiff, fe wnaif fi hynny.

Hoffwn godi sawl mater yn ymwneud â'r gwerthusiadau canol tymor a adlewyrchir yn yr adolygiad canol tymor. Y cyntaf yw biwrocratiaeth a'r materion cyffredinol sy'n deillio o nifer o'r prosiectau yr wyf wedi ymweld â hwy. Ystyriwyd hyn hefyd mewn llawer o ddeunydd adolygu a gwerthuso. Mae dau fater sylfaenol yma. Yn gyntaf, y cyfnod annerbyniol o hir rhwng gwneud cais a chymeradwyo neu wrthod y cais, er bod hyn yn amrywio rhwng ceisiadau lleol a rhanbarthol. Yn ail, y ffurflen gais. Croesawaf y ffaith eich bod wedi symleiddio'r broses ac wedi sicrhau yr ymdrinnir â cheisiadau yn gyflymach, ond erbyn hyn y ffurflen gais ei hun yw'r brif broblem. Mae Gweithrediaeth yr Alban wedi mireinio'r ffurflen ac wedi'i gwneud yn haws i wneud cais. Er y bydd yn cymryd amser o bosibl i hyn ddigwydd yng Nghymru, rhaid dechrau yn awr os ydym am symleiddio'r weithdrefn ymgeisio drwy symleiddio'r ffurflenni ysgrifenedig.

Mae'r ail fater yn ymwneud ag arian cyfatebol. Yr wyf wedi ymweld â sawl prosiect yn ystod eu dyddiau cynnar, ac mae'r staff wedi dweud wrthyf eu bod yn gwybod am brosiectau eraill na allent gyflwyno eu ceisiadau am nad oeddent yn gallu sicrhau arian cyfatebol. Mae gwahaniaeth rhwng pobl yn cyflwyno cais sy'n cynnwys arian cyfatebol, a phobl nad ydynt wedi llwyddo gwneud cais am nad oes ganddynt arian cyfatebol. Mae angen eglurdeb ynglŷn ag arian cyfatebol y Cynulliad, sef y gronfa adfywio lleol a'r ffordd i ffyniant. Mae dwy ffordd o roi'r eglurdeb hwnnw. Yn gyntaf, mae angen i'r meini prawf a ddefnyddir gan y Cynulliad i roi arian o'i gronfeydd arian cyfatebol fod yn eglur, ac yn ddealladwy i bob darpar ymgeisydd sydd am gyflwyno prosiect fel rhan o'r rhaglen. Yn ail, dylid cyhoeddi faint o arian sy'n weddill, er mwyn sicrhau ei bod yn hawdd i bobl weld faint sy'n weddill bob blwyddyn a gwneud cais amdano. Mae hynny yn golygu bod yn rhaid iddynt eu cyflwyno

upon the application process. Therefore, speeding up the match-funding process will, in turn, help deal with applications more swiftly. Maybe an examination of more key funds might be a way of pre-match funding Objective 1 projects, which would make it speedier in terms of the final delivery.

My final point is about supporting projects throughout their development. What has become clear, from all the reviews of European funds in Wales before us, is that projects can feel abandoned without back-up during the course of their work. Having to meet tick-box targets for the end of the project is also a problem, although I know that soft outcomes are being reviewed. We were told that soft outcomes were a matter for the commission, although I understand that the commission is not as definitive as we made out about how to measure changes in attitude and treat them as targets for improvement. We need to make some changes when talking about economic inactivity.

I note your comments on Torfaen and Blaenavon. If you get your way, what will the changes mean for Blaenavon—the book town and the world heritage site—and its Objective 1 proposals? Will it enable the town to look forward to increasing prosperity—it is already on the way towards reaching that goal—thus making it an exemplar for heads of the Valleys towns?

Lynne Neagle: This is an opportunity to celebrate the fact that Objective 1 is working in Wales, and that it is making a difference on the ground. It is far from the disaster predicted by the opposition—jobs are being created, communities are being regenerated and opportunities are being extended. However, changes must be made to the programme to ensure that the Valleys get the greatest benefit from the second half of this programme. At present, the programme is not sufficiently geared towards benefiting the communities that face the greatest deprivation in Wales: the south Wales Valleys.

cyn iddynt ddechrau ar y broses ymgeisio. Felly, bydd cyflymu'r broses o roi arian cyfatebol, yn ei dro, yn helpu i ymdrin â cheisiadau yn gyflymach. Efallai y bydd archwiliad o ragor o gronfeydd allweddol yn ffordd o roi arian cyfatebol ar gyfer prosiectau Amcan 1 ymlaen llaw, a fyddai'n cyflymu'r broses gyflwyno yn y pen draw.

Mae fy mhwynt olaf yn ymwneud â rhoi cymorth i brosiectau yn ystod bob cam o'u datblygiad. Yr hyn sydd wedi dod i'r amlwg, o bob adolygiad o'r cronfeydd Ewropeaidd yng Nghymru ger ein bron, yw y gall prosiectau deimlo eu bod wedi'u hamddifadu o gymorth yn ystod eu gwaith. Mae'r gofyniad i fodloni targedau blychau i'w ticio ar ddiwedd prosiect hefyd yn broblem, er y gwn fod canlyniadau meddal yn cael eu hadolygu. Dywedwyd wrthym mai mater i'r comisiwn oedd canlyniadau meddal, er y deallaf nad yw'r comisiwn mor bendant ag yr oeddem wedi honni o ran sut i fesur newidiadau mewn agwedd a'u trin yn dargedau ar gyfer gwella. Mae angen inni wneud rhai newidiadau, wrth drafod anweithgarwch economaidd.

Nodaf eich sylwadau ar Dor-faen a Blaenafon. Os llwyddwch i gael eich ffordd, beth fydd y newidiadau yn ei olygu i Flaenafon—tref y siopau llyfrau ac un o safleoedd treftadaeth y byd—a'i chynigion Amcan 1? A fydd yn fodd i'r dref edrych ymlaen at fwy o ffyniant—mae eisoes yn prysur gyrraedd at y nod hwnnw—a thrwy hynny ei gwneud yn esiampl i drefi blaenau'r Cymoedd?

Lynne Neagle: Mae hwn yn gyfle i ddathlu'r ffaith bod Amcan 1 yn llwyddo yng Nghymru, a'i fod yn gwneud gwahaniaeth ar lawr gwlad. Mae ymhell o fod yn drychineb fel y'i rhagwelwyd gan y gwrthbleidiau—mae swyddi yn cael eu creu, mae cymunedau yn cael eu hadfywio ac mae cyfleoedd yn cael eu hestyn. Fodd bynnag, rhaid gwneud newidiadau i'r rhaglen er mwyn sicrhau bod y Cymoedd yn cael y budd mwyaf o ail hanner y rhaglen hon. Ar hyn o bryd, nid yw'r rhaglen wedi'i hanelu ddigon at fod yn fuddiol i gymunedau sy'n wynebu'r amddifadedd mwyaf yng Nghymru: Cymoedd y De.

This is our opportunity to get the programme exactly right, and to ensure that it delivers for the Valleys communities in the greatest poverty. Torfaen's success, with over 30 projects and over £13 million of funding, can only be built on if the required changes are made as part of this review. I commend the Minister for his open and responsive approach to this issue. He has shown that he is willing to listen, and I welcome the changes that he is proposing. The recommendation on sites and premises is particularly welcome, as are the proposals to remove spatial targeting in priority 3. It is right that priority 3 should be changed and the distortion towards rural areas ended. However, the changes made to priority 3 must lead to an improvement in the funding available to areas such as Torfaen and other Valleys communities. Access to funding is the only effective measure by which to judge whether this change will work.

We must also consider making it easier for Valleys partnerships to draw down funding for tourism infrastructure projects. This is one of the Torfaen partnership's key concerns, and understandably so—it looks at the excellent tourism product that we have in Blaenavon and wonders why it has difficulty drawing down resources to market it.

New resources must be allocated to fund the regeneration of town centres. In my constituency, the local authority is working hard to regenerate Cwmbran, Pontypool and Blaenavon, yet it cannot deliver its plans without external funding sources. If Objective 1 is to be a success, our town centres must be regenerated. We must make them places where people want to work and live, and we must ensure that they are the cultural and civic hearts of our communities. However, this cannot be achieved without support from structural funds. Funding should be made available within the single programming document to allow town centre regeneration initiatives to be funded and supported. I am grateful for Andrew's assurance today that he will do his best to ensure that the European Commission recognises this.

Dyma ein cyfle i sicrhau bod y rhaglen yn gwbl briodol, a sicrhau ei bod yn gwneud gwahaniaeth o ran cymunedau y Cymoedd sy'n dioddef y tlodi mwyaf. Dim ond os gwneir y newidiadau angenrheidiol fel rhan o'r adolygiad hwn y gellir adeiladu ar lwyddiant Tor-faen, gyda thros 30 o brosiectau a thros £1.3 miliwn o arian. Cymeradwyaf y Gweinidog am ei ymagwedd agored ac ymatebol tuag at y mater hwn. Dangosodd ei fod yn fodlon gwrando, a chroesawaf y newidiadau a gynigia. Rhaid croesawu'r argymhelliad ynglŷn â safleoedd yn arbennig, a hefyd y cynigion i ddileu targedu gofodol ym mlaenoriaeth 3. Mae'n briodol newid blaenoriaeth 3 a rhoi terfyn ar yr ystumio o blaid ardaloedd gwledig. Fodd bynnag, rhaid i'r newidiadau i flaenoriaeth 3 arwain at welliant o ran yr arian sydd ar gael i ardaloedd megis Tor-faen a chymunedau eraill yn y Cymoedd. Mynediad i arian yw'r unig ffordd effeithiol o fesur a fydd y newid hwn yn llwyddo.

Rhaid inni ystyried hefyd ei gwneud yn haws i bartneriaethau'r Cymoedd hawlio arian ar gyfer prosiectau seilwaith twristiaeth. Dyma un o brif bryderon partneriaeth Tor-faen, a gellir deall pam—mae'n edrych ar yr atyniad rhagorol i dwristiaid sydd gennym ym Mlaenafon ac yn meddwl pam mae'n cael anhawster i ddenu adnoddau i'w farchnata.

Rhaid neilltuo adnoddau newydd i ariannu cynlluniau i adfywio canol trefi. Yn fy etholaeth i, mae'r awdurdod lleol yn gweithio'n galed i adfywio Cwmbrân, Pontypŵl a Blaenafon, ac eto ni all gyflawni ei gynlluniau heb adnoddau ariannol allanol. Er mwyn i Amcan 1 fod yn llwyddiant, rhaid i ganol ein trefi gael eu hadfywio. Rhaid inni eu troi'n fannau lle mae pobl am weithio a byw ynddynt a rhaid inni sicrhau mai canol diwylliannol a dinesig ein cymunedau ydynt. Fodd bynnag, ni ellir cyflawni hyn heb gymorth o'r cronfeydd strwythurol. Dylid darparu arian o fewn y ddogfen raglennu sengl er mwyn ei gwneud yn bosibl i fentrau adfywio canol trefi gael eu hariannu a'u cefnogi. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am sicrwydd Andrew heddiw y bydd yn gwneud popeth o fewn ei allu i sicrhau y bydd y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd yn cydnabod hyn.

These changes will make the programme work better for the communities that it is supposed to serve. This is our best chance to get Objective 1 right, and to ensure that it works for the south Wales Valleys. There is much to celebrate, but there is also much that can be improved. Our communities depend on the Assembly to get this right, and we now have an opportunity to do that.

Lisa Francis: I will try to keep my comments brief. Given that we keep hearing that there is no cause for alarm about the progress of this regional aid programme, it was disappointing to learn from the mid-term evaluation at the beginning of the summer that, halfway through the programme, only 15 per cent of the projected new jobs had been created. The recent changes to the Welsh European Funding Office are, in effect, an admission that we have had a poor strategy for the first years of Objective 1. This will, hopefully, be put right. It is obvious that the programme needs to become more customer focused. We need more success stories such as those of the digital vale in Gwynedd and the Holyhead port development.

Last July, it also became apparent that not enough was being done to investigate the lack of private sector involvement in Objective 1, with Welsh businesses only being asked to contribute 17 per cent of funds to rejuvenate the Welsh economy over the last three years. This is because businesses have been put off as a result of cumbersome, clumsy and over-bureaucratic application procedures. This problem must be addressed and rectified as part of the mid-term review.

4.30 p.m.

It is not the case that businesses do not want to be involved; it is simply that red tape is stifling them and preventing their involvement. I am glad that Christine Chapman quoted the evidence given by the Anglesey Regeneration Partnership to the Economic Development and Transport

Bydd y newidiadau hyn yn sicrhau bod y rhaglen yn gweithio'n well i'r cymunedau y bwriedir iddi eu gwasanaethu. Dyma ein cyfle gorau i sicrhau bod Amcan 1 yn gweithio'n iawn, a sicrhau ei bod yn llwyddo o ran Cymoedd y De. Mae llawer i'w ddatlu, ond mae llawer i'w wella hefyd. Mae ein cymunedau yn dibynnu ar y Cynulliad i sicrhau bod y rhaglen hon yn gweithio'n iawn, ac mae gennym gyfle i wneud hynny yn awr.

Lisa Francis: Ceisiaf gadw fy sylwadau yn gryno. O ystyried ein bod yn clywed o hyd nad oes rheswm dros ddychryn ynglŷn â hyn y rhaglen hon o gymorth rhanbarthol, yr oedd yn siomedig cael gwybod o'r gwerthusiad canol tymor ar ddechrau'r haf mai dim ond 15 y cant o'r swyddi newydd a ragwelwyd sydd wedi cael eu creu hanner ffordd drwy'r rhaglen. Mae'r newidiadau diweddar i Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru yn gyfaddefiad, i bob diben, bod gennym strategaeth wael ar gyfer blynyddoedd cyntaf Amcan 1. Caiff hyn ei unioni, gobeithio. Mae'n amlwg bod angen i'r rhaglen ganolbwyntio'n fwy ar gwsmeriaid. Mae angen inni gael mwy o lwyddiant fel llwyddiant y dyffryn digidol yng Ngwynedd a datblygiad porthladd Caergybi.

Fis Gorffennaf diwethaf, daeth yn amlwg hefyd nad oedd digon yn cael ei wneud i ymchwilio i'r ffaith mai dim ond rhan fach yr oedd y sector preifat wedi ei chwarae yn Amcan 1. Dros y tair blynedd diwethaf dim ond 17 y cant o'r arian y gofynnwyd i fusnesau yng Nghymru ei gyfrannu er mwyn adfywio economi Cymru. Y rheswm am hyn yw bod busnesau wedi penderfynu peidio â chymryd rhan oherwydd y gweithdrefnau ymgeisio beichus, lletchwith a gorfiwrocraidd. Rhaid mynd i'r afael â'r broblem hon a'i hunioni fel rhan o'r adolygiad canol tymor.

Nid yw'n wir dweud nad yw busnesau am gymryd rhan; y gwir yw y cânt eu llesteirio a'u hatal rhag cymryd rhan gan fiwrocraatiaeth. Yr wyf yn falch bod Christine Chapman wedi dyfynnu o dystiolaeth a roddwyd gan Bartneriaeth Adfywio Ynys Môn i'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a

Committee last week. The partnership also said that,

‘There needs to be greater assistance for private sector and voluntary groups to access funding. Priority 3 is underspent and the general reason for this is that the voluntary sector is finding it too difficult to apply. There needs to be greater administrative back up too to take the pressure off these organisations, including assistance with audits, establishing evidence trails and rewarding outputs’.

This means relevant administration that is not too costly. Jenny Randerson was right to mention aftercare for projects. The Anglesey Regeneration Partnership also said that

‘Potential project applicants particularly from the voluntary and private sectors are being prevented from progressing because of a lack of clean match funding’.

Outside the public sector arena, there is little information on how to access sources such as the Pathways to Prosperity fund, and this hurdle prevents many ideas from coming forward. In restructuring partnerships to enable and encourage the private sector to play a fuller part in Objective 1, we must acknowledge and recognise that, in some cases, local partnerships have managed to build up substantial knowledge, experience and links with local providers. They have been able to reduce duplication and promote the programme positively to sectors not forthcoming with projects. In an effort to streamline the system and speed up the application process, the mid-term review recommends removing local partnerships from the consultation process for the majority of applications. However, this must be considered carefully as it may have a negative impact at a local level.

With regard to duplication, there is a great deal happening in local areas with multiple providers in every sector, and it is difficult to ensure that duplication does not happen. The Anglesey partnership referred to the fact that the public appeared to be suffering from initiative overload. Local input is vital to the

Thrafnidiaeth yr wythnos diwethaf. Dywedodd y bartneriaeth hefyd;

Mae angen rhoi mwy o gymorth i'r sector preifat a grwpiau gwirfoddol i'w helpu i gael arian. Ceir tanwariant ar Flaenoriaeth 3 a'r rheswm cyffredinol dros hyn yw bod y sector gwirfoddol yn ei chael yn rhy anodd i wneud cais. Mae angen mwy o gymorth gweinyddol hefyd i leihau'r pwysau ar y sefydliadau hyn, gan gynnwys cymorth gydag archwiliadau, sefydlu systemau olrhain tystiolaeth a gwobrwyo canlyniadau.

Mae hyn yn golygu dulliau gweinyddu perthnasol nad ydynt yn rhy gostus. Yr oedd Jenny Randerson yn gywir i sôn am ôl-ofal ar gyfer prosiectau. Dywedodd Partneriaeth Adfywio Ynys Môn hefyd:

Caiff darpar ymgeiswyr prosiect yn enwedig o'r sector gwirfoddol a'r sector preifat eu hatal rhag mynd ymlaen â'u ceisiadau oherwydd y diffyg arian cyfatebol glân.

Y tu allan i'r sector cyhoeddus, nid oes fawr o wybodaeth ar gael ynghylch sut i gael gafael ar adnoddau megis cronfa Ffordd i Ffyniant, ac mae'r rhwystr hwn yn atal llawer rhag cynnig syniadau. Wrth ailstrwythuro partneriaethau i alluogi ac annog y sector preifat i gymryd rhan helaethach yn Amcan 1, rhaid inni gydnabod bod partneriaethau lleol, mewn rhai achosion, wedi llwyddo i ddatblygu cryn dipyn o wybodaeth, arbenigedd a chysylltiadau â darparwyr lleol. Maent wedi llwyddo i leihau dyblygu gwaith ac wedi hyrwyddo'r rhaglen yn gadarnhaol i'r sectorau nad ydynt wedi cynnig llawer o brosiectau. Mewn ymdrech i symleiddio'r system a chyflymu'r broses ymgeisio, argymhellir yn yr adolygiad canol tymor y dylid cael gwared ar bartneriaethau lleol o'r broses ymgynghori ar gyfer y rhan fwyaf o geisiadau. Fodd bynnag, rhaid ystyried hyn yn ofalus oherwydd gallai gael effaith negyddol ar lefel leol.

O ran dyblygu gwaith, mae llawer yn digwydd mewn ardaloedd lleol gyda nifer o ddarparwyr ym mhob sector, ac mae'n anodd sicrhau na chaiff gwaith ei ddyblygu. Cyfeiriodd partneriaeth Ynys Môn at y ffaith bod y cyhoedd fel petai wedi diflasu ar yr holl fentrau gwahanol. Mae mewnbyn lleol

success of projects, and local mechanisms need to be involved in the delivery of a project so that messages are received from a constant source rather than a plethora of agencies, as has been the case.

At the Economic Development Committee on 9 July, the Minister agreed that we should focus on areas of greatest need, and it is clear that we cannot and should not move away from a commitment to making special provision to the most deprived areas, or peripheral areas, of Wales. We must not forget that this project is all about revitalising the economies of the poorest parts of our country. The following weaknesses have adversely affected economic development in many parts of north and west Wales in the past, and continue to have an adverse effect in some cases: the absence of an ICT infrastructure, which I was pleased to hear mentioned earlier; poor inward investment performance, which is relative to north and south-east Wales; and declining agricultural incomes hindered by a perceived lack of opportunity for diversification.

Objective 1 had a target of creating 68,200 jobs over seven years. In the last two and a half years, 10,500 jobs have been created.

The Presiding Officer: Order. You have had over five minutes. I thought that you were going to be brief.

Lisa Francis: May I finish?

The Presiding Officer: I am afraid not. Standing Orders impose a statutory limit of five minutes for all speeches in all debates.

Lisa Francis: I was not aware that I had overrun.

The Presiding Officer: There is a clock in the Chamber. Normally, I would not rigorously enforce the limit, but we need to protect the time allocated for the short debate, otherwise we will be in trouble.

Huw Lewis: I warmly welcome the

yn hollbwysig i lwyddiant prosiectau, ac mae angen cynnwys dulliau lleol wrth gyflwyno prosiect er mwyn sicrhau y daw negeseuon o ffynhonnell gyson yn hytrach nag o asiantaethau lu, fel sydd wedi digwydd yn y gorffennol.

Yn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd ar 9 Gorffennaf, cytunodd y Gweinidog y dylem ganolbwyntio ar yr ardaloedd â'r angen mwyaf, ac mae'n amlwg na allwn ac na ddylem gefnu ar ymrwymiad i wneud darpariaeth arbennig i ardaloedd mwyaf difreintiedig Cymru, neu ardaloedd mwyaf ymylol Cymru. Rhaid inni beidio ag anghofio mai nod y prosiect hwn yw adfywio'r economi yn y rhannau tlotaf o'n gwlad. Mae'r gwendidau canlynol wedi cael effaith andwyol ar ddatblygu economaidd mewn sawl rhan o'r Gogledd a'r Gorllewin yn y gorffennol ac maent yn parhau i gael effaith andwyol mewn rhai achosion: diffyg seilwaith TGCh, yr oedd yn dda gennyf glywed hyn yn cael ei grybwyll yn gynharach; perfformiad gwael o ran mewnfuddsoddi, y mae a wnelo â'r Gogledd a'r De-ddwyrain, a'r gostyngiad mewn incymau amaethyddol o ganlyniad i'r prinder canfyddedig o gyfleoedd i arallgyfeirio.

Targed Amcan 1 oedd creu 68,200 o swyddi dros saith mlynedd. Yn ystod y ddwy flynedd a hanner ddiwethaf, crëwyd 10,500 o swyddi.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Yr ydych wedi cael mwy na phum munud. Yr oeddwn yn meddwl eich bod yn mynd i siarad yn gryno.

Lisa Francis: A gaf fi orffen?

Y Llywydd: Na chewch, mae arnaf ofn. Mae'r Rheolau Sefydlog yn gosod terfyn statudol o bum munud ar gyfer pob araith ym mhob dadl.

Lisa Francis: Nid oeddwn yn ymwybodol fy mod wedi siarad am fwy na'r amser dyladwy.

Y Llywydd: Mae cloc yn y Siambr. Fel rheol, ni fyddwn yn gorfodi'r terfyn yn llym, ond mae angen inni ddiogelu'r amser a neilltuir ar gyfer y ddadl fer, neu fel arall byddwn mewn trafferthion.

Huw Lewis: Croesawaf yn frwd waith y

Minister's work on the mid-term review and congratulate him on it. He has conducted an open and listening process, and I am sure that the overall result will be constructive and will benefit the people who need it most. I do not know how the Minister feels about the voices of doom in this Chamber, but they remind me of the television characters Private Fraser, on the one hand, and Victor Meldrew, on the other. Private Fraser of Plaid Cymru tried to suggest that the impoverishment of Poland is part of a perfidious English plot to do down the Welsh. What will they stoop to next?

Then, we have Victor Meldrew from the Conservative Party, who bleats on behalf of the private sector in terms of the Objective 1 programme, while pouring poison in the ear of that private sector, destroying its morale and disengaging it from the process through the entire programme.

Janet Davies: I think you were talking about me in reference to a 'perfidious Poland'—

Huw Lewis: I said perfidious English.

Janet Davies: Sorry, I thought you were going for the alliteration in 'perfidious Poland'. Whatever you said, I want to make clear that it is politically important for more eastern states to become part of the European Union. Plaid Cymru supports that, and understands that it has a knock-on effect for us economically.

Huw Lewis: I am sure that you are sincere in whatever it is you are trying to say, Janet.

I wish to make three substantive points. First, I know that I am pushing at an open door on the issue of 'priority 3', which has already been mentioned, but Andrew was right to do away with the list 1 and list 2 rigidity within that aspect of the programme. It has disadvantaged the poorest areas as the programme has progressed. Eliminating that will help.

My second point, which has not been raised yet in this debate, is important and relates to

Gweinidog ar yr adolygiad canol tymor ac fe'i llongyfarchaf arno. Mae wedi cynnal proses agored lle y bu'n gwranddo, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y canlyniad cyffredinol yn adeiladol ac y bydd y bobl y mae ei hangen arnynt fwyaf yn elwa arni. Ni wn sut y teimla'r Gweinidog ynglŷn â'r proffwydi gwae yn y Siambr hon, ond maent yn fy atgoffa o'r cymeriadau teledu Preifat Fraser, ar y naill law, a Victor Meldrew, ar y llall. Ceisiodd Preifat Fraser Plaid Cymru awgrymu bod tloedi Gwlad Pwyl yn rhan o gynllwyn Lloegr fradog i wneud tro gwael â'r Cymry. Beth ddywedent nesaf?

Yna, clywsom Victor Meldrew y Blaid Geidwadol, sy'n achwyn ar ran y sector preifat o ran rhaglen Amcan 1, tra'n sibrwd pethau gwenwynig yng nghlust y sector preifat hwnnw, gan ddinistrio ei forâl a pheri iddo ddatgysyllu oddi wrth y broses drwy'r rhaglen gyfan.

Janet Davies: Credaf eich bod yn siarad amdanaf fi yn eich cyfeiriad at 'Wlad Pwyl fradog'—

Huw Lewis: Lloegr fradog a ddywedais.

Janet Davies: Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, meddyliais eich bod yn anelu at gytseinio drwy ddweud 'perfidious Poland'. Beth bynnag a ddywedaso, yr wyf am egluro ei bod yn bwysig yn wleidyddol bod mwy o'r gwladwriaethau dwyreiniol yn dod yn rhan o'r Undeb Ewropeaidd. Mae Plaid Cymru yn cefnogi hynny, ac yn deall y bydd sgil-ffeithiau i ni o safbwynt economaidd.

Huw Lewis: Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn ddiffuant o ran beth bynnag yr ydych yn ceisio ei ddweud, Janet.

Hoffwn wneud tri phwynt sylweddol. Yn gyntaf, gwn fod y drws ar agor o ran 'blaenoriaeth 3', a grybwyllwyd eisoes, ond yr oedd Andrew yn iawn i gael gwared ar y diffyg hyblygrwydd rhwng rhestr 1 a rhestr 2 yn yr agwedd honno ar y rhaglen. Bu o anfantais i'r ardaloedd tlotaf wrth i'r rhaglen fynd rhagddi. Bydd cael gwared ar hynny o gymorth.

Mae fy ail bwynt, nas codwyd eto yn y ddadl hon, yn bwysig ac mae'n ymwneud â rôl

the role to date of the ASPBs in the Objective 1 programme. The WDA's role offers the starkest illustration of how well and constructively an ASPB can support an Objective 1 programme in a region or sub-region when it proactively engages within the north Wales partnership area. The WDA has so far led on £16.5 million worth of projects. If you were to extend that over the life of the programme, you could, more or less, double that figure. Now compare that with the WDA's south-east regional team, which has, so far, drawn down just £800,000 as a lead partner in the programme. If you calculate that figure per capita, there will be £60 million draw-down gap for the south-east and the Valleys if the WDA does not learn from the north Wales experience and engage proactively, as a lead partner, with partnerships in that regard. That is particularly important in the Valleys because there is a capacity problem within small partnerships in the smaller Valleys areas.

The WDA has, at least, engaged proactively in some parts of the Objective 1 area. Other ASPBs have a worse record. The Wales Tourist Board has not engaged locally with a single partnership. There are all-Wales programmes going on, which are all to the good, but local engagement with partnerships, providing the capacity of the WTB to engage with the capacity of local partnerships can only be for the good. The Sports Council for Wales and Arts Council for Wales need to look urgently, at the very least, at a key fund for their work and engagement with the Objective 1 programme. As far as I can see, there is no engagement from those two ASPBs. Similarly, ELWa's all-Wales projects are worthy, but not sufficient. We need the local engagement that has only been achieved in one place in Wales, namely Gwynedd. We must learn from that example; that is the kind of engagement that is needed in the Valleys.

Finally, I welcome the fact that Andrew mentioned Communities First with regard to Objective 1. We have a unique opportunity, with the review of Communities First and Objective 1 going hand-in-hand, to lock these programmes together as much as possible to

CCNC hyd yma yn rhaglen Amcan 1. Mae rôl y WDA yn rhoi'r enghraifft amlycaf o ba mor dda ac adeiladol y gall CCNC gefnogi rhaglen Amcan 1 mewn rhanbarth neu is-ranbarth pan fo'n mynd ati i ymgysylltu ag eraill o fewn ardal bartneriaeth y Gogledd. Mae'r WDA hyd yma wedi arwain prosiectau gwerth £16.5 miliwn. Pe baech yn estyn hynny dros oes y rhaglen, gallech ddyblu'r ffigur hwnnw fwy neu lai. Cymharwch hynny yn awr â thîm rhanbarthol y WDA yn y De-ddwyrain, sydd, hyd yma, ond wedi hawlio £800,000 fel partner arweiniol yn y rhaglen. Os cyfrifwch y ffigur hwnnw yn ôl y pen, bydd gwahaniaeth o £60 miliwn yn y swm a hawliwyd ar gyfer y De-ddwyrain a'r Cymoedd os na fydd y WDA yn dysgu o brofiad y Gogledd ac yn dechrau ymgysylltu â phartneriaethau, fel partner arweiniol yn hynny o beth. Mae hynny yn arbennig o bwysig yn y Cymoedd am fod problem o ran capasiti o fewn partneriaethau bach yn ardaloedd llai y Cymoedd.

Mae'r WDA, o leiaf, wedi mynd ati i ymgysylltu ag eraill mewn rhai rhannau o ardal Amcan 1. Mae gan CCNC eraill record waeth. Nid yw Bwrdd Croeso Cymru wedi ymgysylltu â'r un bartneriaeth yn lleol. Mae rhaglenni i Gymru gyfan yn mynd rhagddynt, ac mae hynny'n fuddiol, ond dim ond daioni a ddaw hefyd o ymgysylltu â phartneriaethau yn lleol, gan roi'r cyfle i gapasiti bwrdd Croeso Cymru ymgysylltu â chapasiti partneriaethau lleol. Mae angen i Gyngor Chwaraeon Cymru a Chyngor Celfyddydau Cymru ystyried cronfa allweddol ar gyfer eu gwaith a'u hymwneud â rhaglen Amcan 1 o leiaf, a hynny ar fyrder. Hyd y gwelaf, nid yw'r ddau CCNC hynny yn cymryd rhan. Yn yr un modd, mae prosiectau ELWa ar gyfer Cymru gyfan yn glodwiw ond nid oes digon ohonynt. Mae angen ymgysylltu ag eraill yn lleol ond dim ond mewn un man yng Nghymru y mae hyn wedi digwydd, sef Gwynedd. Rhaid inni ddysgu o'r esiampl honno; dyna'r math o ymgysylltu y mae ei angen yn y Cymoedd.

Yn olaf, croesawaf y ffaith bod Andrew wedi sôn am Cymunedau yn Gyntaf mewn perthynas ag Amcan 1. Mae gennym gyfle unigryw, o gofio'r ffaith bod yr adolygiad o Cymunedau yn Gyntaf a'r adolygiad o Amcan 1 yn cael eu cynnal law yn llaw, i

get best value out of both. We need to look at match funding from source urgently, and I welcome the opportunity to discuss the available options regarding that; I am sure that there could be some great spin-offs. Overall, we should congratulate Andrew, the Objective 1 Programme Monitoring Committee and local partnerships on their work over the last few years.

Mark Isherwood: This simplification is warmly welcomed and much needed. It will only work on the basis of genuine bottom-up dialogue with Welsh business—large and small. I am concerned that some contributions from the Labour Members have led me to agree with David Prentiss, the leader of Unison, when he said that Labour was lost in a fog of spin. Like a flock of ostriches led by Pontius Pilate, you bury your heads in the sand, while he washes his hands of responsibility. It is time for an economic reality check, so that we can work in partnership with Welsh business to tackle the problems that they face, day in, day out. On 19 December, a north Wales development strategy was announced in St Asaph. The number of VAT registered businesses in north Wales have fallen by 9 per cent, and in Wales the fall is 7 per cent. Business stock declined in every local authority area, with the worse decline of 11 per cent in Denbighshire, and 5 per cent in Flintshire. The self-employment rate has fallen, with the largest decline in Anglesey. The Experian quarterly report, published in August, stated that business profitability in Wales has fallen by almost 90 per cent in five years. That is the second lowest level on record in Wales—only half the level of a year earlier, and barely one tenth of the profitability level of five years ago:

‘Business confidence has continued to fall almost everywhere. At the same time, manufacturing has continued to contract since the first quarter of the year, despite the recent weakening of sterling. Part of the

gyplysu’r rhaglenni hyn â’i gilydd gymaint â phosibl er mwyn cael y gwerth gorau o’r ddwy. Mae angen inni ystyried ffynonellau o arian cyfatebol ar fyrder, a chroesawaf y cyfle i drafod yr opsiynau sydd ar gael o ran hynny; yr wyf yn siŵr y gallai fod rhai manteision mawr. Yn gyffredinol, dylem longyfarch Andrew, Pwyllgor Monitro Rhaglen Amcan 1 a’r partneriaethau lleol ar eu gwaith dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf.

Mark Isherwood: Mae’r ymgais hon i symleiddio’r trefniadau i’w chroesawu’n gynnes ac mae ei hangen yn ddybryd. Dim ond drwy ddeialog gwirioneddol o’r bôn i’r brig gyda busnesau Cymru—yn fawr neu’n fach—y bydd yn gweithio. Pryderaf fod rhai cyfraniadau gan yr Aelodau Llafur wedi fy arwain i gytuno â David Prentiss, arweinydd Unsain, pan ddywedodd fod Llafur ar goll mewn niwl o sbin. Fel haid o estrysod o dan arweiniad Pontiws Peilat, yr ydych yn claddu eich pennau yn y tywod, tra ei fod yntau yn golchi ei ddwylo o bob cyfrifoldeb. Mae’n bryd inni ystyried y sefyllfa economaidd fel y mae, fel y gallwn gydweithio mewn partneriaeth â busnesau Cymru er mwyn mynd i’r afael â’r problemau a wynebant yn feunyddiol. Ar 19 Rhagfyr, cyhoeddwyd strategaeth ddatblygu ar gyfer y Gogledd yn Llanelwy. Mae nifer y busnesau sydd wedi’u cofrestru ar gyfer TAW yn y Gogledd wedi gostwng 9 cant, ac wedi gostwng 7 y cant ar draws Cymru. Bu gostyngiad mewn stoc busnes ym mhob ardal awdurdod lleol, gyda’r gostyngiad mwyaf, sef 11 y cant, yn sir Ddinbych, a 5 y cant yn sir y Fflint. Mae cyfradd y bobl hunangyflogedig wedi gostwng, gyda’r gostyngiad mwyaf yn Ynys Môn. Nododd adroddiad chwarterol Experian, a gyhoeddwyd ym mis Awst, fod proffidoldeb busnes yng Nghymru wedi gostwng bron 90 y cant o fewn pum mlynedd. Dyna’r lefel isaf ond un a gofnodwyd yng Nghymru—dim ond hanner y lefel a gofnodwyd flwyddyn ynghynt, a braidd degfed rhan o’r lefel proffidoldeb bum mlynedd yn ôl:

Mae hyder busnes wedi parhau i ostwng bron ym mhob man. Ar yr un pryd, mae’r sector gweithgynhyrchu wedi parhau i grebachu ers chwarter cyntaf y flwyddyn, er gwaethaf y ffaith bod y bunt wedi gwanhau yn

reason for lower profitability and lower business confidence lies in higher business cost. Capital investment is also a factor, with many companies freezing recruitment and investment plans down because of falling profits.'

That is the reality, and unless we can agree upon, and address the real problems, we will never deliver the solutions in partnership.

4.40 p.m.

Leighton Andrews: I declare interests that are recorded in the register of Members' interests, not because they prevent me from voting, but because they are relevant to this debate. My wife is an unremunerated director of an Objective 1 supported project, Better Business (Holdings) Wales Ltd, and a representative of the Confederation of British Industry on the Objective 1 Programme Monitoring Committee; she will be representing that Committee in the forthcoming discussions in Brussels in two weeks.

I welcome Andrew's announcements today and during the last few weeks in relation to WEFO, which respond to the mid-term evaluation and to many of the private sector's concerns. I particularly welcome his comments on business support and reviewing the role of the partnerships, and simplifying the process and reducing the bureaucracy of applications. In addition, some of the announcements in relation to Communities First confirm a better strategic direction for the overall programme. Huw, Lynne and Christine Chapman spoke about the impact in the Valleys in particular, and I am particularly concerned about the take-up in that area. I endorse other Members' comments about the need to give proper consideration to tourism schemes within the Objective 1 programme. A feasibility study for an equestrian scheme is being developed in Treherbert in my constituency, which is directly related this. Many historic buildings, miners institutes, welfare halls, and chapels in the Valleys are being restored for community use. They must be able to access funding, and we need to give community groups more encouragement to do so.

ddiweddar. Un o'r rhesymau pam mae llai o broffidioldeb a llai o hyder busnes yw'r gost fusnes uwch. Mae buddsoddi cyfalaf hefyd yn ffactor. Mae llawer o gwmnïau yn rhewi cynlluniau recriwtio a buddsoddi am fod elw yn gostwng.

Dyna'r realiti, ac oni allwn gytuno ar y problemau gwirioneddol a mynd i'r afael â hwy, ni fyddwn byth yn dod o hyd i'r atebion mewn partneriaeth.

Leighton Andrews: Datganaf fuddiannau a gofnodwyd yng nghofrestr buddiannau'r Aelodau, nid am eu bod yn fy atal rhag pleidleisio, ond am eu bod yn berthnasol i'r ddadl hon. Mae fy ngwraig yn gyfarwyddwr di-dâl prosiect a ariennir o dan Amcan 1, Better Business (Holdings) Wales Cyf, ac yn gynrychiolydd o Gyd-ffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain ar Bwyllgor Monitro Rhaglen Amcan 1; bydd yn cynrychioli'r Pwyllgor hwnnw yn y trafodaethau a fydd yn cael eu cynnal ym Mrwsel ymhen pythefnos.

Croesawaf gyhoeddiadau Andrew heddiw ac yn yr ychydig wythnosau diwethaf mewn perthynas â WEFO, sy'n ymateb i'r gwerthusiad canol tymor ac i lawer o bryderon y sector preifat. Croesawaf yn arbennig ei sylwadau am gymorth i fusnesau ac adolygu rôl y partneriaethau, a symleiddio'r broses a lleihau biwrocratiaeth ymgeisio. Yn ogystal, mae rhai o'r cyhoeddiadau o ran Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn cadarnhau cyfeiriad strategol gwell i'r rhaglen gyffredinol. Siaradodd Huw, Lynne a Christine Chapman am yr effaith yn y Cymoedd yn enwedig, a phryderaf yn arbennig am nifer y prosiectau yn yr ardal honno. Cefnogaf sylwadau'r Aelodau eraill ynglŷn â'r angen i roi ystyriaeth briodol i gynlluniau twristiaeth o fewn rhaglen Amcan 1. Mae astudiaeth ymarferoldeb ar gyfer cynllun marchogaeth yn cael ei datblygu yn Nhreherbert yn fy etholaeth i, sy'n ymwneud yn uniongyrchol â hyn. Mae llawer o adeiladau hanesyddol, sefydliadau glowyr, neuaddau lles, a chapeli yn y Cymoedd yn cael eu hadfer at ddefnydd y gymuned. Rhaid iddynt allu cael gafael ar arian, ac mae angen inni roi mwy o anogaeth i grwpiau

cymunedol wneud hynny.

I also stress the issues of town centre improvements, which are important to revitalising and regenerating communities within the Valleys area. This issue must be raised directly with the commission, and we must try to get support for the Valleys. I particularly welcome the recognition of a need to ensure greater linkage between the Communities First programme and Objective 1, particularly with regard to ensuring match funding. We must also encourage community organisations, which are not, in the words of the mid-term evaluation, 'professional form-fillers', to be involved in this process and be able to access the available resources. I pay tribute to those voluntary sector organisations in the Rhondda, which are already accessing money through Objective 1 and other funds, such as Valleys Kids. A number of my colleagues have mentioned the issue of childcare. Kathryn Williams, a female entrepreneur in my constituency has also raised the issue with me. She runs a company called, 'Completely Organised', and she was particularly concerned, not only about the provision of childcare support, but also its timing, because it must be more available to women who are trying to work, and not simply geared around school hours and holidays.

Andrew, I also echo Huw Lewis's comments about the role of the WDA in south-east Wales. There is a lack of joined-up thinking and it appears to be thinking in silos. I hope that you will raise with the WDA the work that it is doing in south-east Wales. I also urge you to look at the issue of when the WDA expects the Pop Factory café project to come on-stream as part of the wider development in Porth that it is meant to be supporting. That is obviously important to us. I welcome what the Minister has said today; this is a positive development and response to the criticisms and the concerns that have been raised.

Alun Ffred Jones: Y mae'n dda gweld y cynnydd yn rhaglen Amcan 1 a nodaf fod Cyngor Dinas a Sir Abertawe, Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf a Chyngor Gwynedd yn arwain yn y maes. Llwyddodd Prifysgol Cymru Abertawe i

Pwysleisiaf hefyd y materion sy'n ymwneud â gwella canol trefi, sy'n bwysig i ailfywiogi ac adfywio cymunedau yn ardal y Cymoedd. Rhaid codi'r mater hwn yn uniongyrchol gyda'r comisiwn, a rhaid inni geisio cael cymorth i'r Cymoedd. Croesawaf yn arbennig y gydnabyddiaeth bod angen sicrhau gwell cysylltiad rhwng rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf ac Amcan 1, yn enwedig o ran sicrhau arian cyfatebol. Rhaid inni annog sefydliadau cymunedol hefyd, nad ydynt, yng ngeiriau'r gwerthusiad canol tymor, yn 'professional form-fillers', i fod yn rhan o'r broses a'u galluogi i gael gafael ar yr adnoddau sydd ar gael. Talaf deyrnged i'r sefydliadau gwirfoddol hynny yn y Rhondda, sydd eisoes yn hawlio arian drwy Amcan 1 a chronfeydd eraill, megis Valleys Kids. Soniodd nifer o'm cyd-Aelodau am ofal plant. Mae Kathryn Williams, entrepreneur yn fy etholaeth, i hefyd wedi codi'r mater gyda mi. Mae'n rhedeg cwmni o'r enw, 'Completely Organised', ac yr oedd yn pryderu'n arbennig nid yn unig am y ddarpariaeth cymorth gofal plant, ond hefyd ei amseriad, am fod yn rhaid iddo fod yn fwy cyfleus i fenywod sy'n ceisio gweithio, ac nid wedi'i drefnu yn unol ag oriau a gwyliau'r ysgol.

Andrew, ategaf hefyd sylwadau Huw Lewis ynglŷn â rôl y WDA yn y De-ddwyrain. Mae diffyg cydgyssylltu ac ymddengys ei fod yn meddwl mewn seilos. Gobeithiaf y byddwch yn codi'r gwaith sy'n cael ei wneud yn y De-ddwyrain gyda'r WDA. Apeliaf arnoch hefyd i ystyried pryd y mae'r WDA yn disgwyl i brosiect caffi'r Ffatri Bop fod ar waith fel rhan o'r datblygiad ehangach yn y Porth y mae i fod i'w gefnogi. Mae hynny yn amlwg yn bwysig inni. Croesawaf yr hyn a ddywedodd y Gweinidog heddiw; mae hyn yn ddatblygiad ac yn ymateb cadarnhaol i'r sylwadau beirniadol a'r pryderon a godwyd.

Alun Ffred Jones: It is pleasing to see the progress in the Objective 1 programme and I note that the City and County of Swansea Council, Rhondda Cynon Taf County Borough Council and Gwynedd Council are leading the way. The University of Wales

ddenu llawer o arian ac y mae camp y ddwy ardal arall yn amlwg.

Gan fod Huw Lewis wedi cyfeirio at y mater, nodaf mai dim ond ychydig o arian Cymunedau yn Gyntaf a ddefnyddiwyd ar gyfer rhaglen Amcan 1. Mae hynny'n feirniadaeth ar y Llywodraeth. Y mae cynaliadwyedd nifer o gynlluniau rhaglen Amcan 1 yn fy mhoeni, ac nid yw'r arolwg yn wynebu'r broblem hynny. Dylai'r cynlluniau fod yn hyfyw pan ddaw'r grantiau i ben. Yr wyf yn pryderu nad yw hynny'n wir, ac, felly, pan ddaw'r arian i ben, bydd swyddi'n cael eu colli ac, yn waeth byth, byddwn yn colli rhai o'r gwasanaethau hanfodol a sefydlwyd. Dylem fynd i'r afael â hynny.

Ar y gronfa adfywio lleol, daeth aelod o gwmi cymunedol i'm gweld ar ddechrau'r wythnos hon, yn poeni bod y cynllun yr oedd ef yn ymwneud ag ef wedi cael ei rwystro. Mae'r sefyllfa yn gymhleth. Mae rhan gyntaf y cynllun, adeilad pwrpasol, a hyrwyddwyd gan gorff arall ond sydd wedi derbyn arian Amcan 1, wedi ei chwblhau. Fodd bynnag, mae ail ran y cynllun—gosod offer technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu a chyflogi swyddog datblygu—a hyrwyddir gan gwmi cymunedol, sydd ynddo'i hun yn gasgliad o gwmiâu llai, wedi ei rhewi. Fe'i cefnogwyd gan Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru ac yr oedd y gwaith i fod i ddechrau yr wythnos hon ond, oherwydd bod y gronfa adfywio lleol wedi ei rhewi, nid yw'n gallu symud ymlaen. Mae hyn yn effeithio ar bobl sy'n ceisio ennill bywoliaeth a chreu busnes. Mae'n fater difrifol a buaswn yn hoffi clywed y Gweinidog yn gwneud sylw arno.

Awgryma hyn, ac ateb annelwig Sue Essex heddiw, fod problem bellach o ran cyllido rhaglen Amcan 1. Nododd Elin Jones ac eraill bod angen cyllid ychwanegol ar gyfer y rhaglen ei hun oherwydd y newid yng ngwerth yr ewro. A ydyw'r Llywodraeth wedi gofyn i'r Trysorlys am arian ychwanegol, ac os nad ydyw, o ble y daw'r arian? Gan fod angen arian ychwanegol ar y rhaglen ei hun, o ble y daw'r arian cyfatebol? Mae Plaid Cymru wedi dweud droeon bod y

Swansea, has successfully attracted substantial funding and the achievements of the other two areas are obvious.

As Huw Lewis raised the matter, I note how little Communities First funding has been used for the Objective 1 programme. That it is a criticism of the Government. The sustainability of many of the Objective 1 schemes concerns me, and the review does not face up to that problem. The schemes should be viable once the grants come to an end. I am concerned that that is not the case, and, therefore, when the funding ceases, jobs will be lost and, worse still, we will lose some of the vital services that have been established. We should address with that.

Regarding the local regeneration fund, a member of a community-based company came to see me at the beginning of this week, concerned that the scheme in which he was involved had been barred. The situation is complex. The first part of the scheme, a purpose-built building, which was sponsored by another organisation but which received Objective 1 funding, has been completed. However, the second part of the scheme—installing information and communications technology equipment and employing a development officer—which is sponsored by a community-based company, itself a group of smaller companies, has been frozen. The scheme was supported by WEFO and work was supposed to start this week but it is unable to progress because the local regeneration fund has been frozen. This affects people who are trying to make a living and establish a business. It is a grave matter and I would like to hear the Minister's response.

This, and Sue Essex's vague response today, suggests that there is a further problem in terms of funding the Objective 1 programme. Elin Jones and others have noted that the programme itself needs additional funding because of the change in the value of the euro. Has the Government asked the Treasury for additional money, and if it has not, from where will that funding come? As the programme itself needs additional funding, from where will the match funding come?

mater hwn yn ganolog i'r drafodaeth a gwyddom y bydd yn rhaid i ni ddwyn arian o gyllidebau eraill sy'n hanfodol i raglenni'r Cynulliad, sef addysg ac iechyd, a phwy a wŷr o ble arall. Mae hwn yn fater sylfaenol a gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog wneud datganiad arno a gwneud sefyllfa'r cyllid ychwanegol yn glir.

4.50 p.m.

The Minister for Economic Development and Transport (Andrew Davies): It has been an interesting debate and I am not spinning in saying that most Members have welcomed my proposals. However, the contributions of some opposition Members show that they still want to tilt at windmills. Having accepted my proposals, they did not listen to my speech and the points that I made. They have raised issues that are well outside the remit of this debate.

I recommend that Members reject all of the amendments. I am not willing to support amendment 1 in the name of Jonathan Morgan to replace 'supports' with 'notes'. The proposals outlined today reflect extensive consultation with partners and there has been a broad consensus. I cannot support amendment 2 in the name of Jocelyn Davies regarding support for the Ryder cup and the priority given to peripheral areas. The Ryder cup is not eligible; it is outside the Objective 1 area and the period of the programme. However, we wish to spread the Ryder cup's economic and sporting benefits throughout Wales, particularly in the Objective 1 area. Removing the reference to peripheral areas would allow strategically led projects, such as clean energy for activities and support for small-scale local grid connectivity, to be funded. I assure those Members who raised concerns and echo Christine Chapman's point that this step allows us to be more flexible in the delivery. It will take nothing away from any particular area, but it will allow us to be more pro-active and flexible.

I also reject amendment 3 in the name of Jonathan Morgan to streamline the application process and restrict WEFO

Plaid Cymru has said time and again that this issue is central to the discussion and we know that we will have to take money from other budgets that are vital to the Assembly's programmes, such as education and health, and who knows from where else. This is a fundamental issue and I ask the Minister to make a statement on it and to clarify the situation on additional funding.

Y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth (Andrew Davies): Bu'n ddadl ddiddorol ac nid wyf yn rhoi sbin ar bethau drwy ddweud bod y rhan fwyaf o'r Aelodau wedi croesawu fy nghynigion. Fodd bynnag, dengys cyfraniadau rhai Aelodau o'r gwrthbleidiau eu bod am ymosod ar felinau gwynt o hyd. Ar ôl derbyn fy nghynigion, nid oeddent am wrando ar fy araith a'r pwyntiau a wneuthum. Codwyd materion sydd ymhell y tu hwnt i gwmpas y ddadl hon.

Argymhellaf y dylai Aelodau wrthod pob un o'r gwelliannau. Nid wyf yn barod i gefnogi gwelliant 1 yn enw Jonathan Morgan i roi 'nodi' yn lle 'cefnogi'. Mae'r cynigion a amlinellwyd heddiw yn adlewyrchu ymgynghori helaeth â phartneriaid a chafwyd cytundeb cyffredinol. Ni allaf gefnogi gwelliant 2 yn enw Jocelyn Davies o ran cymorth i gwpan Ryder a'r flaenoriaeth a roddir i ardaloedd ymylol. Nid yw cwpan Ryder yn gymwys; mae y tu allan i ardal Amcan 1 ac y tu hwnt i gyfnod y rhaglen. Fodd bynnag, hoffem ledaenu manteision economaidd a chwaraeon cwpan Ryder ledled Cymru, yn enwedig yn ardal Amcan 1. Byddai dileu'r cyfeiriad at ardaloedd ymylol yn ei gwneud yn bosibl i ariannu prosiectau a arweinir yn strategol, megis ynni glân ar gyfer gweithgareddau a chymorth o ran cysylltedd â'r grid yn lleol ar raddfa fach. Gallaf roi sicrwydd i'r Aelodau hynny a gododd bryderon ac ategaf bwynt Christine Chapman y bydd y cam hwn yn fodd inni fod yn fwy hyblyg wrth gyflwyno'r rhaglen. Ni fydd yr un ardal ar ei cholled, ond bydd yn ei gwneud yn bosibl inni fod yn fwy rhagweithiol a hyblyg.

Gwrthodaf hefyd welliant 3 yn enw Jonathan Morgan i symleiddio'r broses ymgeisio a chyfyngu ar amseroedd ymateb WEFO. Mae

response times. WEFO's ability to respond to an application relies on a range of factors that include—and I emphasise this—the quality of the application. However, I do not intend to impose rigid rules: that would be impractical and meaningless. It is important that we work with the existing local partnerships, as well as the proposed new thematic advisory groups, to develop quality projects. This will mean working more closely with project sponsors during the application process and aftercare. Several Members raised the issue of aftercare, the importance of which I made clear in my speech. We must work with project sponsors throughout the life of the project.

I reject amendment 4 in the name of Jonathan Morgan on partnership restructuring. The first half of the programmes was dominated by discussions on structures and process. There was much to be done in that regard, but the second half of the programme must focus on strategic delivery and achieving hard outputs. We hope that the best possible candidates apply for membership of the six new thematic advisory groups, including candidates from the private sector, which has indicated support for the new structure. We are engaging with the private sector: we established the Welsh social partner unit, WEFO has a dedicated unit that deals with the private sector and, increasingly, private-sector projects are coming forward.

I reject amendment 5 in the name of Kirsty Williams on match funding. The Assembly has created a number of specific match fund pots for the structural funds programme. I emphasise that further match funding is not the sole responsibility of the Assembly Government; a wide range of other match fund sources is available through the public, private and voluntary sectors. However, we will assist applicants to source match funding as well as we are able, which was Mike German's point. We will do anything we can to make the system more transparent and easier for applicants.

I also reject amendment 6. This debate is about current programmes, and the Assembly Government's position has not changed since

gallu WEFO i ymateb i gais yn dibynnu ar ystod o ffactorau sy'n cynnwys—a phwysleisiaf hyn—ansawdd y cais. Fodd bynnag, ni fwriadaf osod rheolau llym: byddai hynny yn anymarferol ac yn ddiystyr. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn gweithio gyda'r partneriaethau lleol presennol yn ogystal â'r grwpiau ymgynghorol thematig newydd arfaethedig, i ddatblygu prosiectau o safon. Bydd hyn yn golygu gweithio'n agosach gyda noddwyr prosiectau yn ystod y broses ymgeisio ac ôl-ofal. Cododd sawl Aelod ôl-ofal. Eglurais bwysigrwydd hynny yn fy araith. Rhaid inni weithio gyda noddwyr prosiectau drwy gydol oes y prosiect.

Gwrthodaf welliant 4 yn enw Jonathan Morgan ar ailstrwythuro partneriaethau. Yn ystod hanner cyntaf y rhaglenni bu llawer o drafod am strwythurau a phroses. Yr oedd llawer i'w wneud yn hynny o beth, ond rhaid i ail hanner y rhaglen ganolbwyntio ar gyflwyno'n strategol a chyflawni canlyniadau pendant. Gobeithiwn fod yr ymgeiswyr gorau posibl yn gwneud cais i fod yn aelodau o'r chwe grŵp ymgynghorol thematig newydd, gan gynnwys ymgeiswyr o'r sector preifat, sydd wedi nodi eu bod yn cefnogi'r strwythur newydd. Yr ydym yn ymgysylltu â'r sector preifat: sefydlwyd uned partneriaid cymdeithasol Cymru, mae gan WEFO uned benodol sy'n ymdrin â'r sector preifat ac, yn gynyddol, mae'r sector preifat yn cynnig prosiectau.

Gwrthodaf welliant 5 yn enw Kirsty Williams ynglŷn ag arian cyfatebol. Mae'r Cynulliad wedi creu nifer o gronfeydd arian cyfatebol penodol ar gyfer rhaglenni'r cronfeydd strwythurol. Pwysleisiaf nad cyfrifoldeb Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn unig yw arian cyfatebol ychwanegol; mae amrywiaeth eang o ffynonellau eraill o arian cyfatebol ar gael drwy'r sector cyhoeddus, y sector preifat a'r sector gwirfoddol. Fodd bynnag, byddwn yn helpu ymgeiswyr i ddod o hyd i arian cyfatebol hyd y gallwn, sef pwynt Mike German. Byddwn yn gwneud unrhyw beth o fewn ein gallu i sicrhau bod y system yn fwy tryloyw ac yn haws i ymgeiswyr.

Gwrthodaf welliant 6 hefyd. Testun y ddadl hon yw'r rhaglenni presennol, ac nid yw safbwynt Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi

the First Minister made a statement on future programmes to Plenary in July. However, as I informed the Economic Development and Transport Committee last week, I give an absolute assurance that we will use all means at our disposal—both formal and informal—to work strenuously to secure the best deal for Wales. That has always been our guiding light and we stand by it.

I cannot support amendments 7 and 8 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

Lisa Francis: In working for Wales's best interests, would you not concede that, to build long-term sustainable economic communities, Wales and the Government cannot afford to turn down invitations from the European Commission to comment on the decentralisation of decisions in Europe that may, in the longer term, result in greater centralisation in the UK?

Andrew Davies: We are aware of Commissioner Barnier's view, as we are aware of a range of views on this issue. However, we stand by our position that, if we want the best deal for Wales, it will not be us who negotiates on the post-2006 programme, but the UK Government as a member state. The Council of Ministers will make this decision and, therefore, as I stand by my position—[*Interruption.*] I do not have time to take another intervention.

The Presiding Officer: Order. You have one minute left, Minister.

Andrew Davies: I will not have time to deal with all of the amendments, but we reject them. However, I will respond in writing on the specific issues that Alun Ffred and others raised.

In conclusion, a Labour Government negotiated Objective 1 status for Wales. [*Interruption.*]

The Presiding Officer: Order. The Minister is coming to the end of his speech.

Andrew Davies: In case you have not heard

newid ers i'r Prif Weinidog wneud datganiad ar raglenni yn y dyfodol mewn Cyfarfod Llawn ym mis Gorffennaf. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedais wrth y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth yr wythnos diwethaf, rhoddaf bob sicrwydd y byddwn yn defnyddio popeth o fewn ein gallu—yn ffurfiol ac yn anffurfiol—i weithio'n ddygn i sicrhau'r fargen orau i Gymru. Dyna'r nod yr ydym wedi anelu ato o'r cychwyn ac yr ydym y glynu ato.

Ni allaf gefnogi gwelliannau 7 ac 8 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.

Lisa Francis: Wrth weithio er budd Cymru, oni fydddech yn cyfaddef, er mwyn adeiladu cymunedau sy'n economaidd-gynaliadwy yn yr hirdymor, na all Cymru a'r Llywodraeth fforddio gwrthod gwahoddiadau gan y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd i wneud sylwadau ar ddatganoli penderfyniadau yn Ewrop a all, yn y tymor hwy, arwain at fwy o ganoli yn y DU?

Andrew Davies: Yr ydym yn ymwybodol o farn y Comisiynydd Barnier, yn yr un modd ag yr ydym yn ymwybodol o amrywiaeth o safbwyntiau ar y mater hwn. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn glynu at ein safbwynt, er mwyn inni sicrhau'r fargen orau i Gymru, nad ni ddylai negodi'r rhaglen ar ôl 2006, ond Llywodraeth y DU fel aelod wladwriaeth. Bydd Cyngor y Gweinidogion yn gwneud y penderfyniad hwn ac, felly, yr wyf yn glynu at fy safbwynt—[*Torri ar draws.*] Nid oes gennyf amser i dderbyn ymyriad arall.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae gennych funud ar ôl, Weinidog.

Andrew Davies: Ni fydd gennyf amser i ymdrin â phob gwelliant, ond fe'u gwrthodwn. Fodd bynnag, ymatebaf yn ysgrifenedig i'r materion penodol a godwyd gan Alun Ffred ac eraill.

I gloi, Llywodraeth Leol a negododd statws Amcan 1 i Gymru [*Torri ar draws.*]

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae'r Gweinidog yn dirwyn ei araith i ben.

Andrew Davies: Rhag ofn nad ydych wedi

this, Presiding Officer, the Tories would not have delivered Objective 1 status. Plaid Cymru could not have delivered Objective 1. Labour has delivered the funds to make Objective 1 a success. The Tories would not have done that, and did not do so in the past, and Plaid Cymru could not have done it. Labour is delivering for all of Wales's communities.

clywed hyn, Lywydd, ni fyddai'r Torïaid wedi sicrhau statws Amcan 1. Ni allai Plaid Cymru fod wedi sicrhau Amcan 1. Llafur sydd wedi sicrhau'r arian i wneud Amcan 1 yn llwyddiant. Ni fyddai'r Torïaid wedi gwneud hynny, ac ni wnaethant hynny yn y gorffennol, ac ni allai Plaid Cymru fod wedi gwneud hynny. Mae Llafur yn cyflawni ymrwymïadau i holl gymunedau Cymru.

Gwelliant 1: O blaid 16, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 37.

Amendment 1: For 16, Abstain 0, Against 37.

Pleidleisiodd yr The following	Aelodau canlynol o Members voted	o voted	blaid: for:	Pleidleisiodd yr The following	Aelodau canlynol yn Members voted against:	erbyn: against:
-----------------------------------	-------------------------------------	------------	----------------	-----------------------------------	---	--------------------

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Laura Anne
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Janet
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment rejected.*

Gwelliant 2: O blaid 18, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 35.

Amendment 2: For 18, Abstain 0, Against 35.

Pleidleisiodd yr The following	Aelodau canlynol o Members voted	o voted	blaid: for:	Pleidleisiodd yr The following	Aelodau canlynol yn Members voted against:	erbyn: against:
-----------------------------------	-------------------------------------	------------	----------------	-----------------------------------	---	--------------------

Bourne, Nick
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Francis, Lisa
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Wood, Leanne

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, David
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Denise Idris
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 24, Ymatal 1, Yn erbyn 28.
 Amendment 3: For 24, Abstain 1, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid: Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted for: The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Davies, David
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Isherwood, Mark
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy

Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Jones, Elin

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 16, Ymatal 9, Yn erbyn 28.
Amendment 4: For 16, Abstain 9, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid: Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted for: The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Laura Anne
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Janet
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wood, Leanne

Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.

Amendment rejected.

Gwelliant 5: O blaid 25, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.

Amendment 5: For 25, Abstain 0, Against 28.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid: Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted for: The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Isherwood, Mark
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.

Amendment rejected.

Gwelliant 6: O blaid 25, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.

Amendment 6: For 25, Abstain 0, Against 28.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid: Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted for: The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Isherwood, Mark
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw

Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty
 Wood, Leanne

Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 7: O blaid 19, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 34.
 Amendment 7: For 19, Abstain 0, Against 34.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid: Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted for: The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick
 Davies, David
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Francis, Lisa
 Graham, William
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Isherwood, Mark
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Wood, Leanne

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Denise Idris
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 8: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.
 Amendment 8: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid: Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted for: The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick

Andrews, Leighton

Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Davies, David
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Isherwood, Mark
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty
 Wood, Leanne

Barrett, Lorraine
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 9: O blaid 25, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 27.
 Amendment 9: For 25, Abstain 0, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid: Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted for: The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Davies, David
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Isherwood, Mark
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty
 Wood, Leanne

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Gregory, Janice
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda

Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment rejected.

Gwelliant 10: O blaid 25, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.
Amendment 10: For 25, Abstain 0, Against 28.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid: Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted for: The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Isherwood, Mark
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment rejected.

Cynnig (NDM1639): O blaid 34, Ymatal 9, Yn erbyn 10.
Motion (NDM1639): For 34, Abstain 9, Against 10.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid: Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted for: The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane

Bourne, Nick
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Francis, Lisa
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Laura Anne
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Williams, Brynle

James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Denise Idris
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Janet
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

5.00 p.m.

Gohirio Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.36 Suspension of Standing Order No. 6.36

The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair): I **Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair):** Cynigiau fod
propose that

the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 34.4, agrees to suspend Standing Order No. 6.36 to enable the following topic, 'The Closure of Urban Post Offices', to be the subject of the short debate led by Jenny Randerson AM on Wednesday 8 October 2003. (NDM1641)

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 34.4, yn cytuno i ohirio Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.36 i alluogi'r testun canlynol, 'Cau Swyddfeydd Post Trefol', fod yn destun dadl fer gan Jenny Randerson AC ddydd Mercher 8 Hydref 2003. (NDM1641)

*Cynnig (NDM1641): O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1641): For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Chapman, Christine

Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Gibbons, Brian
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Daeth Christine Gwyther i'r Gadair am 5.04 p.m.
Christine Gwyther took the Chair at 5.04 p.m.*

Dadl Fer Short Debate

Cau Swyddfydd Post Trefol The Closure of Urban Post Offices

Jenny Randerson: I have agreed that Cath Thomas, Peter Black, Jonathan Morgan and Ieuan Wyn Jones can speak for a short time at the end of my contribution.

I will talk today about an issue that affects

Jenny Randerson: Yr wyf wedi cytuno y gall Cath Thomas, Peter Black, Jonathan Morgan ac Ieuan Wyn Jones siarad am gyfnod byr ar ddiwedd fy nghyfraniad.

Siaradaf heddiw am fater sy'n effeithio ar

each one of us. We all have urban areas in our constituencies, and we are all subject to the Post Office's interestingly named 'reinvention programme'. We have devoted much time in the Assembly over the years to the effects of post office closures on rural areas, and rightly so. However, there is funding in place to support rural post offices and to prevent closures. The First Minister referred to that only yesterday. However, so far, we have given relatively little attention to the impact of post office closures in urban areas, even though the only money available for these areas to prevent closures is for Communities First areas. So far, Communities First areas are addressing only the tip of the iceberg of social deprivation and exclusion.

First, I will address the history of this issue. How is it that Post Office Counters was making a healthy profit until the late 1980s but is now losing millions of pounds a week? One contributory factor is that the Tory Government siphoned off post offices' profits to pay for tax cuts. Therefore, the Post Office did not have the funds to invest in modernisation and new technology. However, that does not excuse the present UK Labour Government's approach. The Post Office remains a company wholly owned by the Government. It has not been privatised, but it is being treated as though it has been. The Government could call a halt to this process tomorrow if it wanted to, simply by changing its approach to the Post Office and treating it as a service rather than as a commercial operation. The phrase 'knowing the price of everything and the value of nothing' springs to mind.

Think about the service provided by the Post Office: not just stamps and parcels, but, crucially, pensions and benefit payments to the older and most vulnerable people in our society. It is not only in rural areas that Post Office staff provide a kind of unofficial community centre for regular clients; staff in urban post offices also check up on elderly people if, for example, they fail to collect their pensions when expected. They ensure that their customers are safe, as they do in rural areas.

bob un ohonom. Mae ardaloedd trefol yn etholaethau pob un ohonom, ac yr ydym oll yn destun 'rhaglen ailddyfeisio' Swyddfa'r Post, sy'n enw diddorol. Yr ydym wedi neilltuo cryn amser yn y Cynulliad dros y blynyddoedd i drafod effeithiau cau swyddfeydd post ar ardaloedd gwledig, a hynny'n briodol. Fodd bynnag, mae arian ar gael i gefnogi swyddfeydd post gwledig ac i'w hatal rhag cau. Cyfeiriodd y Prif Weinidog at hynny ddoe ddiwethaf. Fodd bynnag, hyd yma, prin yw'r sylw a roddwyd gennym i effaith cau swyddfeydd post mewn ardaloedd trefol, er mai'r unig arian sydd ar gael ar gyfer yr ardaloedd hyn i atal swyddfeydd post rhag cau yw ar gyfer ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Hyd yma, dim ond rhan fach o'r broblem amddifadedd ac allgáu cymdeithasol a ddatrysir gan ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf.

Yn gyntaf, ymdriniaf â hanes y mater hwn. Sut yr oedd Cownteri Swyddfa'r Post yn llwyddo i wneud elw mawr tan ddiwedd y 1980au ond ei fod bellach yn colli miliynau o bunnoedd yr wythnos? Un ffactor a gyfrannodd at hyn yw i'r Llywodraeth Doriaidd ddefnyddio elw'r swyddfeydd post i dalu am ostyngiadau mewn trethi. Felly, nid oedd gan Swyddfa'r Post yr arian i fuddsoddi mewn moderneiddio a thechnoleg newydd. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hynny'n esgusodi ymagwedd bresennol Llywodraeth Lafur y DU. Erys Swyddfa'r Post yn gwmni sy'n eiddo'n gyfan gwbl i'r Llywodraeth. Nid yw wedi ei breifateiddio, ond caiff ei drin felly. Gallai'r Llywodraeth roi terfyn ar y broses hon yfory pe bai'n dymuno, dim ond drwy newid ei hymagwedd tuag at Swyddfa'r Post a'i thrin fel gwasanaeth yn hytrach na busnes masnachol. Daw'r ymadrodd 'gwybod pris popeth a gwerth dim' i'r meddwl.

Meddylwch am y gwasanaeth a ddarperir gan Swyddfa'r Post: nid dim ond stampiau a pharseli, ond, yn hanfodol, pensiynau a thaliadau budd-dal i'r bobl hŷn a mwyaf diamddiffyn yn ein cymdeithas. Nid dim ond mewn ardaloedd gwledig y mae staff Swyddfa'r Post yn darparu math answyddogol o ganolfan gymunedol ar gyfer cwsmeriaid rheolaidd; mae staff mewn swyddfeydd post trefol hefyd yn cadw llygad ar bobl mewn oed os, er enghraifft, na fyddant yn casglu eu pensiynau yn ôl y

disgwyl. Maent yn sicrhau bod eu cwsmeriaid yn ddiogel, fel y gwnânt mewn ardaloedd gwledig.

Astonishingly, the Government has not only demanded purely commercial targets from the Post Office, it has actively worked to reduce its right to provide traditional services. The Government has changed the payment method for pensions and benefits under the banner of modernisation. In so doing, it has taken many steps to discourage people from collecting their money directly from the Post Office. All of the Government's literature, even its instructions to Post Office counter staff, insists on the promotion of bank accounts rather than direct Post Office payments. Undoubtedly, constituents will have complained to other Members as well as myself that, because of the format of the literature provided, those constituents have unwittingly signed up to having their money paid into a bank account, when they wanted to collect it directly. Many people have been forced to open a bank account for the first time. I have grave concerns about the side effects of this. Our banks bombard us with junk mail, and I have real concerns about such high-pressure tactics being applied to new bank customers on limited incomes.

In Wales, a higher-than-average number of people still collect their pensions and benefits directly from the Post Office. The latest figures show that, in Merthyr Tydfil, around 80 per cent do so. These people will be badly hit by post office closures. The Government's rush to modernise has disproportionately affected those post offices that rely most heavily on pensioners and benefit claimants for business. The post offices with the highest levels of such business find that their turnover is slashed and, therefore, they are the ones most likely to close. Yet, almost by definition, they are the post offices most needed in the community.

I turn to the Post Office's closure programme and the handling of it. The Government does not call it a closure programme, of course: it is 'network reinvention'. There is something

Yn rhyfeddol, mae'r Llywodraeth wedi gweithio'n ddyfal i leihau hawl Swyddfa'r Post i ddarparu gwasanaethau traddodiadol, yn ogystal â phennu targedau masnachol yn unig. Mae'r Llywodraeth wedi newid y dull talu ar gyfer pensiynau a budd-daliadau o dan faner moderneiddio. Wrth wneud hynny, mae wedi cymryd sawl cam i annog pobl i beidio â chasglu eu harian yn uniongyrchol o Swyddfa'r Post. Mae holl lenyddiaeth y Llywodraeth, hyd yn oed ei chyfarwyddiadau i staff cownteri Swyddfa'r Post, yn mynnu hyrwyddo taliadau i gyfrifon banc yn hytrach na thaliadau uniongyrchol o Swyddfa'r Post. Yn ddiau, bydd etholwyr wedi cwyno wrth Aelodau eraill yn ogystal â mi eu bod, oherwydd fformat y llenyddiaeth a ddarperir, wedi trefnu yn ddjarwybod i'w harian gael ei dalu i mewn i gyfrif banc, pan oeddent am ei gasglu'n uniongyrchol. Mae llawer o bobl wedi cael eu gorfodi i agor cyfrif banc am y tro cyntaf. Mae gennyf bryderon dybryd am sgîl-ffeithiau hyn. Mae ein banciau yn ein bombardio â phost papurach, ac mae gennyf bryderon gwirioneddol ynghylch y defnydd a wneir o dactegau dwyn pwysau o'r fath ar gwsmeriaid banc newydd sydd ar incwm cyfyngedig.

Yng Nghymru, mae nifer fwy na'r cyfartaledd o bobl yn parhau i gasglu eu pensiynau a'u budd-daliadau yn uniongyrchol o Swyddfa'r Post. Dengys y ffigurau diweddaraf bod tua 80 y cant yn gwneud hynny ym Merthyr Tudful. Caiff cau swyddfeydd post effaith fawr ar y bobl hyn. Mae rhuthr y Llywodraeth i foderneiddio wedi effeithio'n anghymesur ar y swyddfeydd post hynny sy'n dibynnu'n fawr ar bensynwyr a cheiswyr budd-daliadau ar gyfer busnes. Mae'r swyddfeydd post sydd â'r lefelau mwyaf o fusnes o'r fath yn canfod bod eu trosiant yn gostwng yn sylweddol ac, felly, y rhai sy'n fwyaf tebygol o gau. Ond, oherwydd eu natur, dyna'r swyddfeydd post sydd eu hangen fwyaf yn y gymuned.

Trof at rhaglen gau Swyddfa'r Post a'r ffordd yr ymdrinnir â hi. Nid yw'r Llywodraeth yn ei galw'n rhaglen gau, wrth gwrs: rhaglen 'ailldwyfeisio'r rhwydwaith' ydyw. Mae rhyw

of the night about that phrase, to paraphrase Ann Widdecombe. There is something of *Nineteen Eighty-four* about it. The Government's documents are littered with phrases such as 'restructure' and 'modernise', for which you can read 'closures'. For 'improved service' read 'you will have to go further to find a post office'. On behalf of all existing Post Office staff, I stress that most of them already provide a good service, according to the true meaning of the term.

The Post Office has a programme of closing up to 150 sub-post offices throughout Wales, out of a network of 440 branches—that is one in three. It affects us all. Cath Thomas, for instance, is concerned about the proposal to close one in four post offices in Llanelli. The Post Office proclaims that 95 per cent of the urban population will still live within 1 mile of a post office. What of the other 5 per cent, which is hundreds of thousands of people? Even a mile is a long way for a pensioner, say in her late 80s, to travel on a cold winter's day, when she has to go to a new neighbourhood with which she is unfamiliar, and where she may even feel unsafe.

There is a so-called consultation process. I am familiar with this from my constituency. However, when you read the small print, it is not a consultation on whether the branch should be closed. That decision has already been taken. The consultation is to do with the details of the closure, not the principle of it.

5.10 p.m.

I also take issue with the lack of a strategic approach in this process, which relies on sub-postmasters volunteering their branches for closure, in return for which they will receive a slice of the £20 million compensation set aside for the programme. Therefore, to a large extent, which post office branches will close is determined by franchise holders' desire to retire or move on, rather than by any definition of need or local demand for services. With business dwindling as a result of Government policies, and with money on offer, there are plenty of volunteers for

ddirgelwch ynghylch yr ymadrodd hwnnw, i aralleirio Ann Widdecombe. Mae rhywbeth Orwelliaidd yn ei gylch. Mae dogfennau'r Llywodraeth yn llawn ymadroddion fel 'ailstrwythuro' a 'moderneiddio', y gallwch eu cyfnewid am 'gau'. Ar gyfer 'gwell gwasanaeth' darllenwch 'bydd yn rhaid ichi fynd ymhellach i ddod o hyd i swyddfa bost'. Ar ran pob aelod o staff presennol Swyddfa'r Post, pwysleisiaf fod y rhan fwyaf ohonynt eisoes yn darparu gwasanaeth da, yn unol â gwir ystyr y gair.

Mae gan Swyddfa'r Post raglen ar gyfer cau hyd at 150 o is-swddfeydd post ledled Cymru, o blith rhwydwaith o 440 o ganghennau—mae hynny'n un o bob tair. Mae'n effeithio ar bob un ohonom. Mae Cath Thomas, er enghraifft, yn pryderu ynghylch y cynnig i gau un o bob pedair swyddfa bost yn Llanelli. Honna Swyddfa'r Post y bydd 95 y cant o'r boblogaeth drefol yn parhau i fyw o fewn 1 filltir i swyddfa bost. Beth am y 5 y cant arall, sef cannoedd ar filoedd o bobl? Mae hyd yn oed milltir yn ffordd hir i bensynwr, yn ei 80au hwyr dyweder, deithio ar ddiwrnod oer yn y gaeaf, pan fydd yn rhaid iddi fynd i gymdogaeth newydd sy'n anghyfarwydd iddi, a ble y gall hyd yn oed deimlo'n anniogel.

Mae proses ymgynghori fondigrybwyll. Yr wyf yn gyfarwydd â hyn o'm hetholaeth. Fodd bynnag, pan ddarllenwch y print mân, nid ymgynghoriad ar ba un a ddylid cau y gangen ydyw. Mae'r penderfyniad hwnnw eisoes wedi ei wneud. Mae a wnelo'r ymgynghoriad â manylion cau swyddfa bost, nid yr egwyddor.

Anghytunaf hefyd â'r ffaith nad oes ymagwedd strategol yn y broses hon, sy'n dibynnu ar is-bostfeistri yn gwirfoddoli i'w canghennau gau, ac yn gyfnewid am hynny cânt gyfran o'r £20 miliwn o iawndal a neilltuwyd ar gyfer y rhaglen. Felly, i raddau helaeth, penderfynir pa swddfeydd post fydd yn cau gan awydd y deiliaid masnachfrait i ymddeol neu symud ymlaen, yn hytrach nag unrhyw ddiffiniad o angen neu alw lleol am wasanaethau. Gyda busnes yn lleihau o ganlyniad i bolisiau'r Llywodraeth, a chydag arian yn cael ei gynnig, mae digon o

closure. The vast majority of the money being made available by the Post Office for reinvention of the network is being swallowed up by closures. Relatively little—up to £10,000 per branch—is being invested in upgrading the branches that will remain.

At least the Post Office has decided to tackle closures on an area basis, rather than one by one. I would like to think that this is due to strategic thinking, but I suspect that the Post Office has been daunted by the strength of opposition to individual closure plans and has decided to try to minimise the effectiveness of opposition by announcing all the bad news at once. Postwatch, the consumer watchdog, is meant to evaluate all closure plans, but there must be serious doubt as to its capacity to deal with the scale of the task given the size of the closure programme. In my experience, concerns expressed by Postwatch seem to be brushed aside.

Up to five sub-post offices will close in any one constituency. However, the dismantling of the network does not stop there. There is also the downgrading of existing Crown offices, which will instead become sub-post offices. In my constituency, Cardiff Central, we used to have three Crown offices. The decision has recently been taken to downgrade Albany road post office from a Crown office to a sub-post office. This is a busy post office, and public opposition to the downgrading was massive, as was opposition from the trade unions. The decision leaves Cardiff, our capital city, with only one Crown office whereas, a year ago, we had three. The other Crown office was closed down entirely a few months ago. The remaining Crown office, in the Hayes, will soon be subjected to the upheaval of city centre redevelopment, and could end up being housed in temporary buildings. So much for the concept of service, particularly in our capital city.

Until January of this year, we did not even know what the Post Office's plans were at a UK level. They were kept secret until Liberal Democrat MP Vince Cable managed to obtain details from Postwatch, not from the

wirfoddolwyr yn barod i gau. Mae mwyafrif helaeth yr arian sydd ar gael gan Swyddfa'r Post ar gyfer ailddyfeisio'r rhwydwaith yn cael ei lyncu gan y swyddfeydd post hynny sy'n cau. Prin iawn yw'r arian a fuddsoddir mewn uwchraddio'r canghennau fydd yn weddill—hyd at £10,000 fesul cangen.

O leiaf mae Swyddfa'r Post wedi penderfynu mynd i'r afael â chau fesul ardal, yn hytrach na fesul swyddfa. Hoffwn feddwl bod hyn yn deillio o feddwl yn strategol, ond tybiaf fod Swyddfa'r Post wedi cael ei dychryn gan gryfder y gwrthwynebiad i gynlluniau cau unigol ac wedi ceisio lleihau effeithiolrwydd y gwrthwynebiad drwy gyhoeddi'r holl newyddion drwg ar unwaith. Dylai Postwatch, y corff gwarchod buddiannau defnyddwyr, werthuso'r holl gynlluniau cau, ond mae'n rhaid bod amheuan dybryd ynghylch ei allu i ymdrin â maint y dasg o gofio maint y rhaglen gau. O'm profiad i, ymddengys y caiff pryderon a fynegir gan Postwatch eu rhoi i'r naill ochr.

Bydd hyd at bum is-swyddfa bost yn cau mewn unrhyw etholaeth. Fodd bynnag, nid dyna ddiwedd y broses o ddatgymalu'r rhwydwaith. Yn ogystal caiff swyddfeydd presennol y Goron eu hisraddio, a deuant yn is-swyddfeydd post yn lle hynny. Yn fy etholaeth i, Canol Caerdydd, yr oedd gennym dair swyddfa'r Goron. Yn ddiweddar, penderfynwyd israddio swyddfa bost heol Albany o swyddfa'r Goron i is-swyddfa bost. Mae hon yn swyddfa bost brysur, ac yr oedd y gwrthwynebiad cyhoeddus i'r israddio yn enfawr, yn ogystal â'r gwrthwynebiad gan yr undebau llafur. Mae'r penderfyniad yn gadael Caerdydd, ein prifddinas, gyda dim ond un swyddfa'r Goron, ond flwyddyn yn ôl yr oedd gennym dair. Caewyd y swyddfa'r Goron arall yn gyfan gwbl ychydig fisoedd yn ôl. Yn fuan bydd y swyddfa'r Goron sy'n weddill, yn yr Aes, yn dod yn destun cynnwrf ailddatblygu canol y ddinas, a gallai gael ei leoli mewn adeiladau dros dro. Dyna ben ar y cysyniad o wasanaeth, yn arbennig yn ein prifddinas.

Tan fis Ionawr eleni, ni wyddem beth oedd cynlluniau Swyddfa'r Post ar lefel y DU hyd yn oed. Fe'u cadwyd yn gyfrinachol hyd nes i AS y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Vince Cable lwyddo i gael manylion gan Postwatch, nid

Post Office—and that, in itself, causes concern. The area-by-area closure plan has not reached Cardiff Central yet—that is due next spring. However, as Members know, the programme is already being rolled out across Wales and, I assume, in many of your constituencies.

The Welsh Liberal Democrats accept that change is needed, that many people find it more convenient to have their pensions paid into their bank and that some closures are probably necessary. However, the sheer scale of the destruction of the urban post office network in Wales is unacceptable and takes no account of the elderly and the most vulnerable people in our society.

I will finish with a quotation:

‘Britain’s post offices are a vital part of the fabric of our country.... Especially in rural areas, and in disadvantaged parts of our towns and cities, post offices play an important role in communities across the country: keeping services going, supporting the vulnerable, acting as a focal point.’

Who said that? Not a Liberal Democrat, but the Prime Minister himself, in his introduction to the performance and innovation unit report on the post office network. Among other recommendations, that report recommended that post offices be allowed to provide a greater range of Government services and a wider range of banking services. Yet the Government has not acted on this and has, instead, been swimming in the opposite direction, effectively narrowing the range of services that post offices can provide.

The purpose of my short debate is to raise public awareness of what is about to happen throughout Wales. The Post Office plans to complete its network reinvention by the end of next year. Will you look again at the funding available to support urban post offices and consider widening the scheme so that it also covers post offices outside Communities First areas, as there are many communities that will suffer serious damage

gan Swyddfa'r Post—ac mae hynny, ynddo'i hun, yn achosi pryder. Nid yw'r cynllun cau fesul ardal wedi cyrraedd Canol Caerdydd eto—disgwylir hynny y gwanwyn nesaf. Fodd bynnag, fel y gwyr Aelodau, mae'r rhaglen eisoes yn cael ei chyflwyno ledled Cymru a, thybiaf, yn nifer o'ch etholaethau.

Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn derbyn bod angen newid, ei bod yn fwy cyfleus i bensiynau pobl gael eu talu i mewn i'w banc a bod angen cau ambell i swyddfa bost o bosibl. Fodd bynnag, mae graddfa'r dinistr o ran y rhwydwaith swyddfeydd post trefol yng Nghymru yn annerbyniol ac nid ystyria'r henoed a phobl fwyaf diamddiffyn ein cymdeithas.

Gorffennaf gyda dyfyniad:

Mae swyddfeydd post Prydain yn rhan hanfodol o wneuthuriad ein gwlad.... Yn arbennig mewn ardaloedd gwledig, ac mewn rhannau difreintiedig o'n trefi a'n dinasoedd, mae swyddfeydd post yn chwarae rhan bwysig mewn cymunedau ledled y wlad: yn sicrhau parhad gwasanaethau, yn cynorthwyo'r diamddiffyn, yn gweithredu fel canolbwyt.'

Pwy a ddywedodd hynny? Nid Democrat Rhyddfrydol, ond y Prif Weinidog ei hun, yn ei gyflwyniad i adroddiad yr uned perfformiad ac arloesi ar y rhwydwaith swyddfeydd post. Ymysg yr argymhellion eraill, argymhellodd yr adroddiad hwnnw y dylid caniatáu i swyddfeydd post ddarparu ystod ehangach o wasanaethau'r Llywodraeth ac ystod ehangach o wasanaethau bancio. Ond nid yw'r Llywodraeth wedi gweithredu ar hyn ac, yn lle hynny, bu'n nofio i'r cyfeiriad arall, gan leihau'r ystod o wasanaethau y gall swyddfeydd post eu darparu.

Pwrpas fy nabl fer yw codi ymwybyddiaeth y cyhoedd o'r hyn sydd ar fin digwydd ledled Cymru. Bwriada Swyddfa'r Post gwblhau ei gwaith o ailddyfeisio'r rhwydwaith erbyn diwedd y flwyddyn. A edrychwch eto ar yr arian sydd ar gael i gefnogi swyddfeydd post gwledig ac ystyried ehangu'r cynllun fel ei fod hefyd yn cwmpasu swyddfeydd post y tu allan i ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, gan fod llawer o gymunedau a fydd yn dioddef

as a result of urban post office closures?

Catherine Thomas: Last week's announcement that between 100 and 150 post offices are to close throughout Wales has been met with grave concern and anger. Eight post offices are to close in Llanelli, the first constituency to be targeted. This has caused deep feelings of anxiety among the many senior citizens who will be affected by these closures. On Monday, I spent time with some senior citizens who regularly use the Bynea post office. If closure plans go ahead, they will be expected to visit either Llwynhendy post office, which is a mile away, or go to the Loughor branch in the Gower constituency, which is 1.4 miles away. Most of the senior citizens I met do not enjoy good health and a number suffer visual impairment. Imagine how upsetting it was to witness their distress and worry about the distances they may be expected to travel if their local post office, which is their lifeline, closes. The Assembly Government is responsible for initiating and developing the older persons' strategy. The strategy makes a clear commitment to respecting and safeguarding our older citizens—a commitment, I fear, that the Post Office management clearly does not share.

Peter Black: I congratulate Jenny on an excellent speech, which covered the topic widely. The legitimate concern felt by people in Catherine's constituency is shared by all Members, as we will all suffer the loss of post offices. We must be clear about the fact that, even though the Post Office is to blame, the Westminster Labour Government is also to blame for the policies it has pursued. For example, it penalised the Post Office for a computer project that was abandoned, and its pursuance of the direct payment of pensions and other benefits into bank accounts is one of the prime causes of post office closures.

Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Yr wyf am ddiolch i Jenny am godi'r pwnc pwysig hwn. Cyfeiriodd at bwysigrwydd cadw swyddfeydd post ar agor mewn ardaloedd gwledig a threfol, ac ategaf ei galwad ar i'r Llywodraeth ailedrych ar y

niwed difrifol o ganlyniad i gau swyddfeydd post trefol?

Catherine Thomas: Mynegwyd pryder a dicter yn dilyn y cyhoeddiad yr wythnos diwethaf y bydd rhwng 100 a 150 o swyddfeydd post yn cau ledled Cymru. Bydd wyth swyddfa bost yn cau yn Llanelli, yr etholaeth gyntaf i gael ei thargedu. Mae hyn wedi achosi cryn bryder ymysg y nifer o bensiynwyr yr effeithir arnynt o ganlyniad i gau'r swyddfeydd post hyn. Ddydd Llun, treuliais amser gyda rhai pensiynwyr sy'n defnyddio swyddfa bost Bynia yn rheolaidd. Os â'r cynlluniau i'w chau yn eu blaen, bydd disgwyl iddynt fynd i swyddfa bost Llwynhendy, sydd filltir i ffwrdd, neu i gangen Casllwchwr yn etholaeth Gŵyr, sydd 1.4 milltir i ffwrdd. Nid yw nifer o'r pensiynwyr y cyfarfûm â hwy yn iach ac maent yn dioddef o nam ar eu golwg. Dychmygwch pa mor ddigalon oedd gweld eu gofid a'u pryder ynghylch y pellteroedd y gall fod disgwyl iddynt deithio pe bai eu swyddfa bost leol, sy'n hanfodol iddynt, yn cau. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gyfrifol am ysgogi a datblygu'r strategaeth pobl hŷn. Yn y strategaeth ceir ymrwymiad clir i barchu a diogelu ein dinasyddion hŷn—ymrwymiad, yr wyf yn ofni, nad yw rheolwyr Swyddfa'r Post yn amlwg yn ei rannu.

Peter Black: Llongyfarchaf Jenny ar araith ragorol, a gwmpasodd y pwnc yn eang. Rhennir y pryder dilys a deimlir gan bobl yn etholaeth Catherine gan bob Aelod, gan y bydd pob un ohonom yn dioddef yn sgîl colli swyddfeydd post. Rhaid inni fod yn glir ynghylch y ffaith, er bod bai ar Swyddfa'r Post, bod Llywodraeth Lafur San Steffan hefyd i'w beio am y polisiau a ddilynwyd ganddi. Er enghraifft, bu iddi gosbi Swyddfa'r Post am brosiect cyfrifiadurol y rhoddwyd y gorau iddo, ac mae'r ffaith iddi fynd ar drywydd talu pensiynau a budd-daliadau eraill yn uniongyrchol i gyfrifon banc yn un o brif achosion cau swyddfeydd post.

The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones): I thank Jenny for raising this important topic. She referred to the importance of keeping post offices open in rural and urban areas, and I endorse her call for the Government to reconsider the funding

cyllid sydd ar gael i gynnal rhwydwaith swyddfeydd post trefol. Pwysaf ar y Gweinidog i wneud datganiad clir ar y pwnc pwysig hwn, cyllido swyddfeydd post.

Jonathan Morgan: I agree with the sentiments expressed by Jenny Randerson in that the Blairite terminology of modernisation is a cover for a reduction in the level of service. This has been reflected in the way in which post offices have been dealt with. I hope that the Minister will be able to offer some sort of lifeline to post offices, particularly those in urban areas, which are all too often forgotten when post offices are considered more generally, as the attention is often on rural branches. I also hope that that lifeline will be forthcoming, because many elderly people throughout Wales will be severely affected by these decisions.

The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration (Edwina Hart): Post Office policy is a non-devolved matter, but it is an issue that I have taken seriously as Minister; it falls within my portfolio. With the cross-party support of the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee, I have made several representations on the issue of post office services across Wales in urban and rural areas. Post offices are the lifeblood of many of our deprived and rural communities, and it is key that they continue to provide a valuable service to communities across Wales. Those are my sentiments on the system in general.

*Daeth y Llywydd i'r Gadair am 5.19 p.m.
The Presiding Officer took the Chair at 5.19 p.m.*

Jenny referred to the term 'reinvention', which I also think is an unusual term to use for what is actually a decimation of the service in Wales. It is estimated that between 100 and 120 post offices will close and, with the 30 branches that have already been closed as part of the review, the total number of closures will reach 150. That will be 150 post offices out of 440 urban branches. The 900 rural post offices are only protected until—

available to maintain the urban post office network. I urge the Minister to make an unequivocal statement on the important topic of post office funding.

Jonathan Morgan: Cytunaf â'r teimladau a fynegwyd gan Jenny Randerson yn yr ystyr bod y derminoleg foderneiddio Blairaidd yn cuddio gostyngiad yn lefel y gwasanaeth. Adlewyrchwyd hyn yn y ffordd yr ymdriniwyd â swyddfeydd post. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn gallu cynnig rhyw fath o gymorth i achub swyddfeydd post, yn arbennig y rhai mewn ardaloedd trefol, sydd yn aml iawn yn mynd yn angof pan ystyrir swyddfeydd post yn fwy cyffredinol, gan fod y sylw yn aml ar ganghennau gwledig. Gobeithiaf hefyd y bydd modd eu hachub, gan y caiff y penderfyniadau hyn effaith ddifrifol ar lawer o bobl hŷn ledled Cymru.

Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Edwina Hart): Mae polisi Swyddfa'r Post yn fater heb ei ddatganoli, ond mae'n fater yr wyf wedi'i gymryd o ddifrif fel Gweinidog; mae o fewn fy mhortffolio. Gyda chymorth trawsbleidiol y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio, yr wyf wedi gwneud sawl sylw ar wasanaethau swyddfeydd post ledled Cymru mewn ardaloedd trefol a gwledig. Swyddfeydd post yw enaid nifer o'n cymunedau difreintiedig a gwledig, ac mae'n allweddol eu bod yn parhau i ddarparu gwasanaeth gwerthfawr i gymunedau ledled Cymru. Dyna fy nheimpladau am y system yn gyffredinol.

Cyfeiriodd Jenny at y term 'ailddyfeisio'. Yr wyf innau hefyd o'r farn ei fod yn derm anarferol i'w ddefnyddio am yr hyn sydd mewn gwirionedd yn broses o anrheithio'r gwasanaeth yng Nghymru. Amcangyfrifir y bydd rhwng 100 a 120 o swyddfeydd post yn cau a, chydâ'r 30 o ganghennau sydd eisoes wedi cau fel rhan o'r adolygiad, bydd cyfanswm y swyddfeydd post a fydd yn cau yn 150. Bydd hynny'n 150 o swyddfeydd post allan o 440 o ganghennau trefol. Caiff y 900 o swyddfeydd post gwledig eu diogelu dim ond tan—

5.20 p.m.

Eleanor Burnham: Are you giving way?

The Presiding Officer: Order. It is not for you to ask the Minister if she is giving way. I will ask her and she will indicate if she is giving way; she is not.

Edwina Hart: Rural post offices are safeguarded until 2006, but will a review then follow? Jenny mentioned the pressures on the post office network. The Department for Work and Pensions announced that, over the next two years, the recipients of state pension benefits and other credits must receive that money through direct payments into their accounts. At the same time, in Committee, we were well aware that sub-post offices could not even advertise the fact that people could have accounts with the post office. That raises many key issues. If these changes occur, it is estimated that postmasters and mistresses will lose around 40 per cent of their annual income.

I will continue to press on these matters. I have already written to Don Touhig, the Parliamentary Under-Secretary of State for Wales, to press for various meetings. I also met trade union representatives this week, who are concerned about the impact on postal services across Wales. I have written to the Minister for Energy, E-Commerce and Postal Services, Stephen Timms. I will certainly correspond on the issue of Crown post offices in Cardiff. It will be left with only one Crown post office, while other cities have not been so adversely affected by these closures. Having one Crown post office for the capital city of Wales raises serious issues.

I invited Members' comments on my post office development fund. I will present my ministerial report to Committee next week. I have looked at that fund and considered the type of review that I could undertake. I will probably strengthen that review mechanism, if Members are happy with that, because I am also aware that if the Post Office continues to close offices, I will need to consider practical

Eleanor Burnham: A ydych yn ildio?

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid eich lle chi yw gofyn i'r Gweinidog a yw'n ildio. Gofynnaf fi iddi a bydd yn dangos a yw'n ildio: nid yw'n ildio.

Edwina Hart: Diogelir swyddfeydd post gwledig tan 2006, ond a fydd adolygiad yn dilyn? Soniodd Jenny am y pwysau ar rwydwaith y swyddfeydd post. Cyhoeddodd yr Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau fod yn rhaid i'r rhai sy'n derbyn budd-daliadau pensiwn y wladwriaeth a chredydau eraill dderbyn yr arian hwnnw drwy daliadau uniongyrchol i'w cyfrifon dros y ddwy flynedd nesaf. Ar yr un pryd, yn y Pwyllgor, yr oeddem yn dra ymwybodol na allai is-swyddfeydd post hyd yn oed hysbysebu'r ffaith y gallai pobl gael cyfrifon gyda swyddfa'r post. Mae hynny'n codi sawl mater allweddol. Os bydd y newidiadau hyn yn digwydd, amcangyfrifir y bydd postfeistri a phostfeistresi yn colli tua 40 y cant o'u hincwm blyneddol.

Byddaf yn parhau i ddwyn pwysau ynghylch y materion hyn. Yr wyf eisoes wedi ysgrifennu at Don Touhig, Is-ysgrifennydd Seneddol Cymru, i bwysu am amrywiol gyfarfodydd. Cyfarfûm hefyd â chynrychiolwyr undebau llafur yr wythnos hon, sy'n pryderu ynghylch yr effaith ar wasanaethau post ledled Cymru. Yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu at y Gweinidog dros Ynni, E-Fasnach a Gwasanaethau Post, Stephen Timms. Byddaf yn sicr yn gohebu ynghylch swyddfeydd post y Goron yng Nghaerdydd. Dim ond un swyddfa bost y Goron fydd yn weddill, ond nid yw effaith y cynlluniau cau cynddrwg ar ddinasoedd eraill. Mae cael un swyddfa bost y Goron ar gyfer prifddinas Cymru yn codi materion difrifol.

Gwahoddais sylwadau gan Aelodau ar fy nghronfa datblygu swyddfeydd post. Cyflwynaf fy adroddiad gweinidogol i'r Pwyllgor yr wythnos nesaf. Yr wyf wedi edrych ar y gronfa honno ac wedi ystyried y math o adolygiad y gallwn ei gynnal. Byddaf fwy na thebyg yn cryfhau'r dull adolygu hwnnw, os yw Aelodau yn fodlon ar hynny, gan fy mod hefyd yn ymwybodol os bydd

issues such as whether I should issue grants to those which are likely to close in 12 months' time. Therefore, it is an opportune time for a review.

I support the postal system and the network. It is a lifeline for many people and is also the only visible business in some communities, providing a variety of services. Through our grant system, we have been able to introduce innovative measures such as installing coffee shops, internet facilities, video libraries and bakeries in post offices. This is about creating community businesses, not decimating them. I am glad that I have received Members' support and I will keep the Committee fully updated.

Y Llywydd: Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

Swyddfa'r Post yn parhau i gau swyddfeydd, y bydd angen imi ystyried materion ymarferol megis a ddylwn roi grantiau i'r rhai sy'n debygol o gau ymhen 12 mis. Felly, mae'n amser da i gynnal adolygiad.

Cefnogaf y system bost a'r rhwydwaith. Mae'n hanfodol i lawer o bobl a dyna'r unig fusnes gweladwy mewn rhai cymunedau, sy'n darparu amrywiaeth o wasanaethau. Drwy ein system grantiau, yr ydym wedi gallu cyflwyno mesurau arloesol fel rhoi siopau coffi, cyfleusterau rhynggrwyd, llyfrgelloedd fideo a siopau bara mewn swyddfeydd post. Mae a wnelo hyn â chreu busnesau cymunedol, nid eu dinistrio. Yr wyf yn falch fy mod wedi cael cefnogaeth Aelodau a byddaf yn hysbysu'r Pwyllgor yn rheolaidd.

The Presiding Officer: That brings today's proceedings to a close.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.23 p.m.
The meeting ended at 5.23 p.m.*

Aelodau a'u Pleidiau Members and their Parties

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)

Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)

Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)

Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)

Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)

Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)

Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)

Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)

Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)

Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)

Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)

Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)

Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)

Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)

Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)

Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)

Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)

Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)

Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)

Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)

German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)

Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)

Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)

Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)

Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)

Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)

Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)

Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)

Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)

Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)

James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)

Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)
Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)
Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Law, Peter (Llafur – Labour)
Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)
Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)
Marek, John (Annibynnol – Independent)
Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)
Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)
Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)
Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)
Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)
Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)