

**JOINT REVIEW PANEL FOR THE ENBRIDGE NORTHERN
GATEWAY PROJECT
COMMISSION D'EXAMEN CONJOINT DU PROJET
ENBRIDGE NORTHERN GATEWAY**



**Hearing Order OH-4-2011
Ordonnance d'audience OH-4-2011**

**Northern Gateway Pipelines Inc.
Enbridge Northern Gateway Project
Application of 27 May 2010**

**Demande de Northern Gateway Pipelines Inc.
du 27 mai 2010 relative au projet
Enbridge Northern Gateway**

VOLUME 45

**Hearing held at
Audience tenue à**

**Hudson Bay Lodge
3251 Highway 16
Smithers, British Columbia**

**April 24, 2012
Le 24 avril 2012**

**International Reporting Inc.
Ottawa, Ontario
(613) 748-6043**

Canada

© Her Majesty the Queen in Right of Canada 2012
as represented by the Minister of the Environment
and the National Energy Board

This publication is the recorded verbatim transcript
and, as such, is taped and transcribed in either of the
official languages, depending on the languages
spoken by the participant at the public hearing.

Printed in Canada

© Sa Majesté du Chef du Canada 2012
représentée par le Ministre de l'Environnement et
l'Office national de l'énergie

Cette publication est un compte rendu textuel des
délibérations et, en tant que tel, est enregistrée et
transcrite dans l'une ou l'autre des deux langues
officielles, compte tenu de la langue utilisée par le
participant à l'audience publique.

Imprimé au Canada

HEARING /AUDIENCE

OH-4-2011

IN THE MATTER OF an application filed by the Northern Gateway Pipelines Limited Partnership for a Certificate of Public Convenience and Necessity pursuant to section 52 of the *National Energy Board Act*, for authorization to construct and operate the Enbridge Northern Gateway Project.

HEARING LOCATION/LIEU DE L'AUDIENCE

Hearing held in Smithers (British Columbia), Tuesday, April 24, 2012
Audience tenue à Smithers (Colombie-Britannique), Mardi, le 24 avril 2012

JOINT REVIEW PANEL/LA COMMISSION D'EXAMEN CONJOINT

S. Leggett	Chairperson/Présidente
K. Bateman	Member/Membre
H. Matthews	Member/Membre

ORAL STATEMENTS/EXPOSÉS ORAUX

Kate Brook
Tenley Dahlie
Michael DesHarnais
Hélène Fleury
Joe Hug
Carlie Kearns
Jenny Lester
Lynnda McDougall
Dan Mesec
Ted Nugent
Jim Pojar
Kathleen Ruff
Tara Strauss
Patrick Williston
Roger Benham
Jean Boyce
Gill Cobb
Hans Duerichen
Paul Glover
Bill Goodacre
Mary-Etta Goodacre
Jay Hallman
Anne Havard
Meg Hobson
Monica Howard
Taisa Jenne
Haley Jonstyn
Peter Krause
Ev Person
Egon R. Rapp
Gordon Stewart
Linda Stringfellow
Frances Taylor
Joanne Voss

TABLE OF CONTENTS/TABLE DES MATIÈRES

(i)

Description	Paragraph No./No. de paragraphe
Opening remarks by the Chairperson	32512
Oral statement by Kate Brook	32528
Oral statement by Tenley Dahlie	32558
Oral statement by Michael DesHarnais	32599
Oral statement by H��l��ne Fleury	32616
Oral statement by Carlie Kearns	32649
Oral statement by Joe Hug	32676
Oral statement by Jenny Lester	32697
Oral statement by Lynnda McDougall	32711
Oral statement by Dan Mesec	32735
Oral statement by Ted Nugent	32769
Oral statement by Jim Pojar	32791
Oral statement by Kathleen Ruff	32815
Oral statement by Tara Strauss	32845
Oral statement by Patrick Williston	32892
Oral statement by Roger Benham	32944
Oral statement by Jean Boyce	32968
Oral statement by Gill Cobb	33004
Oral statement by Hans Duerichen	33026
Oral statement by Paul Glover	33060
Oral statement by Bill Goodacre	33089
Oral statement by Mary-Etta Goodacre	33120
Oral statement by Jay Hallman	33150
Oral statement by Anne Havard	33187
Oral statement by Meg Hobson	33236
Oral statement by Monica Howard	33259
Oral statement by Taisa Jenne	33295
Oral statement by Haley Jonstyn	33320
Oral statement by Peter Krause	33348
Oral statement by Ev Person	33365
Oral statement by Egon R. Rapp	33393
Oral statement by Gordon Stewart	33428
Oral statement by Frances Taylor	33439
Oral statement by Linda Stringfellow	33464

LIST OF EXHIBITS/LISTE DES PIÈCES

(i)

No.	Description	Paragraph No./No. de paragraphe
-----	-------------	---------------------------------

Opening remarks

--- Upon commencing at 9:00 a.m./L'audience débute à 9h00

32512. **THE CHAIRPERSON:** Good morning everyone. My name is Sheila Leggett and on my right is Mr. Kenneth Bateman ---

32513. **MEMBER BATEMAN:** Good morning.

32514. **THE CHAIRPERSON:** --- and on my left is Mr. Hans Matthews.

32515. We would like to give our appreciation to the Wet'suwet'en and for having welcomed us into the territory yesterday.

32516. Just before we get underway, give you some -- just logistical information about the room. There's a number of emergency exits, both on the back wall and on this side wall and over in this direction should we need to leave the room for whatever reason.

32517. There are two washrooms in the vicinity of this meeting room; the ladies' is just across the hall and the men's is up the stairs. And there's also another two -- another set of washrooms down by the restaurant. So go out this door, turn right and go down to the restaurant.

32518. Many of you have had the opportunity to already meet some of the staff members who are here today helping us as the Panel. They're all wearing their gold nametags and -- as a means of identifying themselves. If you have any process-related questions, they're the people to direct those questions to and they'll be able to help you out.

32519. In addition to that, we have two contractors; we have our court reporter as well as our sound IT person at the back of the room.

32520. Kenneth, Hans and I are all members of the National Energy Board and have been tasked to make decisions for the Northern Gateway Pipeline Limited Partnership Application. The National Energy Board is an independent quasi-judicial body, our decisions as a Panel will be based solely on the relevant information we obtain through this review process.

32521. The session today is being broadcast live on our website and that's our normal practice for the hearings. Our website also contains the entire written record for this file. So if you wanted to see any of that information that would be the place

to go and find it.

32522. The process for the joint review includes two sets of hearings and we're here today for the community hearings where interested participants, who registered in advance, will be providing us with oral statements.

32523. Oral statements are an opportunity for participants to provide their personal knowledge, views and concerns about the proposed project to the Panel in their own words.

32524. We have two maps that have been assembled by the staff from the written evidence that participants are welcome to refer to. And I believe you've been oriented to those, those of you who will be speaking today when you checked in this morning.

32525. The timeframe for each oral statement is a maximum of 10 minutes, after that time you'll be asked to end your statement. And we do this to be fair and make sure that we can hear from all the participants who are scheduled to speak today.

32526. And lastly, before we begin listening, which is what we're here to do, I just want to confirm that all the individuals who will be presenting oral statements to us today were either sworn or affirmed by Panel staff before getting into this room.

32527. So thank you all for being here and with that, Ms. Brook, we'll turn to you for your oral statement and begin whenever you're ready.

--- ORAL STATEMENT BY/EXPOSÉ ORAL PAR MS. KATE BROOK:

32528. **MS. KATE BROOK:** Good morning and thank you for this opportunity to speak.

32529. The dinner table conversation at my house has been challenging in the last months as we have studied the proposed Gateway Pipeline Project and tried to figure out what it would mean to us to have a pipeline constructed so close to where we live.

32530. My children are 13 and 10, and as a family my husband and I spend a lot of time with them reading articles in the press, following blogs and watching videos and DVDs on the proposal. We also spent time at the Enbridge website, since much of the press has been pretty unfavourable.

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

32531. As the statistics and reports added up, over 600 pipeline leaks in the past years, with a particularly bad one in the Kalamazoo River in Michigan, my children's questions began to pile up too; questions and statements for which we as parents had no answers.
32532. “Most of the pipeline leaks are old pipes, mom, so are they going to keep putting in new pipes on this pipeline or will these ones get old and leak too?”
32533. “Mom, the Queen of the North Ferry hit a rock while making a simple turn and it sank and it's still leaking oil. If the Queen of the North made a mistake, a supertanker can make one too.”
32534. “Yeah, dad, I watched Enbridge's video on all the safety features they have in place but how much will that help? I bet BP and Exxon promised there would no accidents when they set out their proposals and look what happened.”
32535. “Mom, the Kalamazoo River cleanup is a mess, when the engineer at the Enbridge website says he doesn't think there's going a problem, I think he's wrong and I don't believe him.”
32536. “So dad, the bears need the salmon, the trees need the bears eating the salmon; so what happens if a spill destroys the salmon. People are not the only ones with needs in the world you know.”
32537. “A leak is just one of the problems, mom, what about the construction? Won't it have hazards too? What about avalanches and earthquakes; won't it create a big mess?”
32538. “Dad, if I was in charge, I wouldn't let this pipeline be built.”
32539. “Mom, why are they sending the oil to China? We know there's going to be an oil crisis; I think they should save the oil for me.”
32540. My children are blessed to be living surrounded by wild space; there's always something to be aware of here. The eulachon are running, the salmon are running, the cranes are moving north, the geese are moving south, the loons are back, there's fresh bear poop on the path to the wild berry patch.
32541. The coyotes woke me up; they were so loud I thought they were in the driveway. The moose are in the driveway between us and the car and we need to get

to town.

32542. They appreciate the beauty and the wildness here. The spaciousness and the complexity even while they complain all the way up the trail to the breathtaking view. But they're now beginning to think that the only way to protect the place is to not let anyone in.

32543. Because as my 13-year old wrote in school report:

“The road to an oil spill is paved with any kind of intentions, good or bad. And while good intentions will certainly prevent a spill for a while, it won't forever. How would we feel if we were almost any animal on the pipeline route when a spill happened? Do we really want the coast -- the B.C. Coast -- to become known as the land of the black water? Why is this happening? To make money may be the clear answer.”

32544. He said:

“But our ecosystem is one of the most rare and precious on earth. We're already harming it with fish farms and over-fishing. Is money the only thing we need in the world? Do we need nothing to be proud of and protect?”

32545. It became clear after reading his words and listening to my children's discussions, we thought that the important issue for my children is to protect the landscape and home that they love and take pride in. But the important issue for me is safety.

32546. I want my kids and my family to be safe and healthy and one of the things I need for that is a clean environment.

32547. We were drawn to looking at the safety record of Enbridge because my kids want to protect the environment for themselves and all creatures. I want them to be safe and healthy and in the end it really amounts to the same thing.

32548. Perhaps because of their naïveté and innocence, they see what so many of us cannot; that money is not what truly sustains us. Wild land with wild creatures, clean air, soil and water and community; these are what truly keep us alive and these are what feed us.

32549. No amount of money will ever clean up a disaster. That has been shown

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

the world over. Despite millions of dollars that companies keep in the bank for that just in case scenario, it never covers the true cost, never. It takes lifetimes for the earth to heal.

32550. Part of my reason for speaking today was to ask for your help in protecting a place that's worth protecting. It's a healthy place and the risks of this project seem too great.

32551. And the other reason is to show my children the importance of standing up, whether nervous or not, and I'm incredibly nervous, to ask for that help.

32552. You, as a Panel and as individuals, have a huge responsibility and an opportunity, and that is the power to weigh all of the arguments. I ask you to please listen to the wildness of this land and everything and everyone that lives and thrives on it.

32553. Please go for a walk here and look at the big picture. Please weigh our concerns in at least equal measure, if not more, to profit.

32554. If we could, we'd like to pose one question. If Enbridge was told that the pipeline would be closed forever if there was even one leak, what would they do differently with their planning?

32555. Right now, we as a family have no confidence that Enbridge would be able to provide an acceptable answer, and until they can, we ask you to please say no to the Enbridge pipeline proposal.

32556. Thank you for your time.

--- (Applause/Applaudissements)

32557. **MEMBER MATTHEWS:** Good morning, Ms. Dahlie. Please go ahead and present.

--- **ORAL STATEMENT BY/EXPOSÉ ORAL PAR MS. TENLEY DAHLIE**

32558. **MS. TENLEY DAHLIE:** Good morning, members of the Joint Review Panel considering Enbridge's application to build a pipeline. Welcome to Smithers.

32559. I appreciate that I've been given the opportunity to speak to this process

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

and I truly hope all our collective voices will be heard and that due consideration to our evidence will be weighed in the decision.

32560. I was raised in Alberta but I've lived here all my adult life. Marrying into a local family, my surname is on mountain ski trails, Dahlie Creek that runs through town, and the road that now overpasses the busy railway.

32561. I enjoy the same attraction to the mountain that the original Scandinavian settlers did in the early 20th century, and many of my friends and neighbours are drawn to the great outdoors that this area offers.

32562. I've learned also to respect the Bulkley River fed by the Morice that runs into the Skeena. I'm surrounded by many cultures centred around salmon, and particularly the First Nations' heritage that so many generations is embedded in this land.

32563. I have embraced the very identity of British Columbia which to me is pristine wilderness, diverse cultures that worship this land. Our recreation is outdoors in every season, on the water, in the snow, in the forest, and up the mountains.

32564. I grew up in a family where science was -- guided critical thinking, not religion, not dogma, not politics and not money, but science; the truth about things. Understanding science comes through research, observation, thinking, thinking through a theory, discussion, more research, adjusting and proving theories.

32565. And by that process, through the best of our collective observations, we come to a consensus of an explanation of how the world works in all its natural, messy complexity and how it came to be that way.

32566. At a young age, I spent a summer with my family at the Burgess Shales, witness to slow, careful extraction of fossils from the pre-Cambrian era, very early life forms that had never been imagined or seen in fossils before.

32567. A century since that unique discovery, these fossils are still informing palaeontologists of lost mutations of early life forms, putting together more pieces of the puzzle to the history of life.

32568. You see, my father was a geologist, not a prospector looking for valuable resources, rather, a scientist who worked amongst his peers to explain a wee part of the natural forces that created the crust of our very earth. They were paid by the

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

Canadian government to do this critical work, as scientists are considered valuable contributors to the common good of this country.

32569. Geologists track the development and evolution of the earth, and of life itself, by studying the evidence that's left in the rocks. And yes, they can even explain how oil pockets, gas fields and tar sands were created from lives lived, the very sun's energy of the past synthesized into that rich resource that we take so for granted today.
32570. That resource is the reason that we're gathered here now. How can we make the best of it? Do we stop and ponder the ancient source of this wealth, energy preserved from the past? What are we putting by for the future? That should be the question that's being considered. How can we make the best use of this rich resource that we're blessed with?
32571. We should all be debating about the development of a national energy policy for the future of all Canadians. But no, that's not the question that I've been invited here to address. That's not even a thought in the everyday scramble to somehow better our standard of living. Here we are, sucking up, digging out and processing that precious finite resource just as fast as we can. We are greedy.
32572. And great minds have worked hard to figure out how -- a somewhat efficient process to extract it. And the growing populations of the world want it. What could be easier revenues; let's get it out faster.
32573. No. That's my personal global and historical view of this activity. To think that we're the most successful species ever to inhabit the earth, we who possess so much collective intelligence, such complex society and such amazing systems, and all we can come up with is to build a big pipeline and ship it across the sea? It's utter foolishness. That's my personal view on the question at hand.
32574. So here we are, back to the pipeline. To do or not to do; that is the question. This pipeline is a very real threat. I'm not a radical and I'm not a scientist, but I do understand community economic development. I'm a small business counsellor.
32575. In my world, a business plan includes a risk analysis. Part of this is achieved by the good old SWOT. When making your decision about go or no go, one considered S for the strengths, W for the weaknesses, O for the opportunities and T for the threats. A balance is needed. If the weaknesses and the threats outweigh the

strengths and the opportunities, then no go is the best decision.

32576. You'll be hearing evidence, amongst others, from eminent scientists, some of whose careers have been paid for by the Canadian and B.C. governments to do science and devote their best brain power to provide information to this review; scientific process, seeking the truth about the potential effects of the project; not spin, not politics, not money, just pure applied research.

32577. The experts who study fish, the ecosystems that support them, the modern geologist who knows about rock slides, those who study watersheds, the runoff and flows. How many creek and river crossings are we looking at?

32578. We've got a lot of brain power working out potential scenarios. I hope that you will listen.

32579. I'm focused about what I love about my home, the mountains, the rivers and the wilds, the creek that I draw my water from and the land that I grow my veggies in and graze our animals on. I read those studies and I'm scared, afraid that what I love, the centre of my life, may be threatened.

32580. My position is that it is too risky. I'm a settler here, and the is culture is threatened, as is that of all my neighbours. What would be lost for the First Nations, a culture so deeply tied to the land?

32581. These hearings have had a marvellous uniting effect. Imagine that all the 130-plus native groups have said no. You've witnessed the embracing of their culture, this after a few generations of strife, challenge and confusion. Old traditions are coming alive. What richness of life. And the salmon stories, you've seen and heard it. I've never witnessed such solidarity amongst the clans.

32582. The majority of B.C. citizens, as you know, are united too, more together with our native neighbours and each other than ever before, treasuring this special corner of the world, national treasure, indeed. I'm privileged to have this as my home. Some say of B.C. the greatest place on earth.

32583. I've also experienced our coast. I've sailed out there and seen how tricky those coastal waters are. It's fantastic, the islands, the rocks, the narrow passageways, the abundance, the life forms, the fish. The whole ecosystem is rich.

32584. I've also learned about Haida Gwaii and just a few years ago was one of

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

the very fortunate few to tour Gwaii Hanaas National Park by air and water, the only way to get there. What a special spiritual and historical place. What magic.

32585. We toured the ancient sites. We were guided by the watchmen. It was a transformational experience. Those villages were pillaged in the past. What is left is sacred and must not be threatened again.

32586. This finite earth seems to be growing smaller and smaller with the pressures of growing populations. Many mistakes have been made, resulting in environmental degradation all over the globe. This relatively untouched and sparsely populated wild watershed and coastline is still natural and free, and not yet dirtied by industrial spills. So much more important that we protect it from any threat that might spoil it.

32587. In a transient mortal life we have a responsibility to Mother Earth who endures. This project is a huge threat.

32588. Now to the opportunities; oh, what would we do without jobs? Go hungry and freeze in the dark? We've lost our ability to shelter, warm or feed ourselves. We're told we have to participate in this world economy-driven system of modern society. That's our best bet, to quickly sell all our resources and get rich.

32589. How did we get here and where will all this lead in the future? What will be left for my grandchildren? Yes, of course we need jobs now, sustainable jobs. Pipeline construction is temporary, and a transient workforce is actually more of a bother to our communities than a benefit.

32590. Oh, those tar sand jobs. Okay, they may last a few years. Will they even last a decade? Where is the evidence? Then what? How about listen to more eminent scientific experts regarding oil reserves. Is there really enough to ship out? How long will it last?

32591. How about some of our intelligent economists, some are saying that the revenue projections are overstated, that the project does not even make financial sense. Furthermore, their effect on the Canadian dollar and thereby on many other industries across the country is not good.

32592. Pretty soon we seriously will not have the capacity to manufacture any of the things that we need for the good life because we're giving it all up for the petro dollar. How will we sustain ourselves then?

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

32593. Take the money out of the conversation, and does this make sense? What is the strength of this crazy idea anyway? And what are the benefits for me? I see nothing but risk and threats to my well-being. On every level this project offers nothing to the average Canadian.

32594. I'm here because I must believe that joining with others, speaking out for a sensible decision that we can make a difference. I would be negligent not to speak up given this very opportunity to try and show another perspective. I hope that you, the Members of the Panel, will, in some deep part of yourselves, be moved by all the people who are taking time and care to share their passionate concerns about our home.

32595. You are listening, are you hearing? Will you be changed? Will you take your duties, your duties to the people and then speak the truth of all that you've heard here?

32596. There's too much at risk. We can and must harness our collective intelligence to make a better decision in the use of our precious resources.

32597. Respectfully, thank you.

--- (Applause/Applaudissements)

32598. **MEMBER BATEMAN:** Mr. DesHarnais, thank you for coming today. Please begin.

--- ORAL STATEMENT BY/EXPOSÉ ORAL PAR MR. MICHAEL DESHARNAIS:

32599. **MR. MICHAEL DESHARNAIS:** My name is Dr. Michael Brent DesHarnais. Thank you for giving me this opportunity to speak at this environmental review hearing. I have a Bachelor of Science in biochemistry and microbiology. And I'm a doctor of veterinarian medicine.

32600. I own and operate veterinary clinics in Smithers and Houston. I service the Bulkley Valley, providing veterinary care for pets, livestock and wildlife. I have a strong connection to the agricultural industry in the region.

32601. As a veterinarian, I'm a professional voice, a steward if you will, to the

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

animals of this area. My livelihood is dependent on the health and the wellbeing of the animals and the environment in which they feed, live and reproduce.

32602. There is overwhelming evidence that massive environmental contamination resulting from oil spills has a significant and prolonged negative impact on all ecosystems. When, not if, there is an ecological disaster resulting from the Enbridge Northern Gateway pipeline there will be a total collapse of this community and the entire northwest region.
32603. The damage would be irreversible, and life as we know it today in this beautiful part of the world would be changed forever.
32604. I do not consider myself a political activist, nor do I see myself as an environmentalist. However, I feel compelled to speak up against this project because there is something inherently wrong with this environmental review process.
32605. As a small business owner, landowner, and tax-paying citizen I am disgusted by the way the federal government is interfering with this process. There is clearly a significant majority of the population that opposes this project and yet the government, which represents the people, and is paid by the people, is pushing full steam ahead with a project that is not wanted.
32606. Who does the government represent, the tax-paying citizens of this country or the large corporations that buy them off? I thought we lived in a democratic society. Well, this, in my opinion, is a disgrace to democracy.
32607. To build a pipeline and transport oil through the diverse and rich ecosystems of the Pacific Northwest is ludicrous. The environmental risks associated with transporting oil via pipeline to Kitimat and shipping it to Asia in supertankers is too great. It is inevitable that a spill will occur on the land or water with devastating consequences.
32608. In my opinion, I can't see how you as a review Panel can come up with any other decision but to oppose the Enbridge Northern Gateway pipeline. To see it any other way is in contempt of what the people of British Columbia want.
32609. I believe we are at a crossroads in our world. Do we journey down the path where economic trumps -- where economics trump everything or do we cherish and protect the things that are priceless and irreplaceable if lost?

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

32610. I invite you as a Panel to see that preserving this part of the world is in the best interest of the nation, for all Canadians, and the entire world.

32611. Once again, thank you for your time and consideration. Sincerely,
Michael DesHarnais, Bachelor of Science and DVM. Thank you.

--- (Applause/Aplaudissements)

32612. **THE CHAIRPERSON:** Thank you very much to each of you for stepping forward to speak with us today.

32613. I think we'll make the transition to the next panel of speakers.

--- (A short pause/Courte pause)

32614. **THE CHAIRPERSON:** Good morning. Ms. Fleury. Please proceed when you're ready.

32615. Thank you.

--- **ORAL STATEMENT BY/EXPOSÉ ORAL PAR MS. HÉLÈNE FLEURY:**

32616. **MS. HÉLÈNE FLEURY:** Panellists, bonjour, hadi. I'd like to recognize that we are on the traditional land of the Wet'suwet'en First Nations. And I would like to thank the Panellists for coming all this way to listen to all these beautiful stories of our beautiful land.

32617. I recognize that you are in a very challenging position. I believe you will make a wise and sensible decision.

32618. My name is Hélène Fleury. I'm the mother of two girls, one of which is over there. I have a Master's Degree in Environmental Education. I was born in Quebec and I've been living in Smithers for 12 years. I plan to raise my family here; it's such a beautiful place.

32619. I stand here in opposition to the Enbridge pipeline. It's a project that I really do not support. I recognize that the chances of a spill in the freshwater rivers or the ocean are relatively low. I equally recognize that the consequences of a spill, whether by pipeline rupture or oil tanker accident are inevitably catastrophic.

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

32620. Therefore, no matter how small the chance of an accident I cannot accept any risk of a catastrophic spill. I therefore cannot accept a project that transports oil in pipelines or tankers through B.C., across our pristine rivers and through our coastal waters.

32621. I come here with three separate interests that are related to this project; I come here as an educator, I come here as an amenity migrant, and I come here as a mother of two daughters.

32622. First I would like to talk to you as an educator. I've worked in the elementary schools teaching students from kindergarten to grade seven. Everyday that I'm in the classroom I teach students to respect others, to respect themselves, and to respect the environment.

32623. Furthermore, as an educator I am mandated to cover certain learning outcomes. The British Columbia Ministry of Education provides learning outcomes that I must include in my lesson plans that relate to the environment.

32624. There's three that I find really interesting in the context of this presentation. To quote from the British Columbia Ministry of Education Curriculum Guide:

"Students must be able to demonstrate responsible behaviour in caring for their immediate environment."

32625. A second one I find interesting is:

"Students must be able to analyze how the Aboriginal concept of interconnectedness of the environment is reflected in responsibility for and caretaking of resources."

32626. A third one is;

"In the ecological view, students may come to know and understand more deeply that all human environments, societies, or cultures are all deeply dependent on natural systems, both for their development and ultimately, their survival."

32627. These are three examples that I fleshed out of the package that the Ministry sends us teachers. And I find they are very contradictory to the Enbridge Pipeline Project paradigm.

32628. Therefore I cannot in good conscience support a project like Enbridge that goes against these three learning outcomes and at the same time teach these environmental principles, as mandated by the provincial government. I as an educator would be in conflict if I had to teach these concepts while supporting a project like the Enbridge pipeline.
32629. I would now like to talk about myself as an amenity migrant. I am what is locally known as an amenity migrant. Like many of my peers, I came to Smithers looking for the wild, looking for experience in the mountains, in the rivers, in the ocean.
32630. In the late 1990s, I left Quebec searching for a new place to call home. I travelled for two years across Alberta, British Columbia, and the Yukon until I found the jewel that Smithers is.
32631. I came to this region because of the natural amenities it has to offer such as the lakes, the rivers, the mountains, and the ocean. I experienced many firsts in the Northwest, some of which I will share with you and some of which I will not share.
32632. I caught my first chinook, a 33-pound spring salmon just at the mouth of the Skeena River. It was amazing. I had to do the downriggers, and I had the big net, and the fish was flopping, and it was just a wonderful experience that everybody needs to experience at least once in their life.
32633. I also caught my first sockeye salmon on the Babine River. I had these oversize waders and big boots and didn't really know how to do this, but for some reason there's a fish that decided to be caught.
32634. I've also ocean-kayaked on Haida Gwaii, got stuck in the mud there, but that's okay too, and I have also started whitewater kayaking on the Bulkley River and a first trip on the Babine River, rafting.
32635. These firsts brought me to this part of the world. These are the activities that connect me to my community, my friends, and my family. In participating in these activities and living and working here, I contribute to society, to the local economy as a productive citizen.
32636. There are many, many, many other amenity migrants in the region. An oil spill would have a negative impact on the local economy as other amenity

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

migrants would not choose to come live here and myself and others would potentially choose to leave.

32637. I would now like to talk about myself as a parent. As a parent, I value time outside with my family. I really love seeing the enchantment in my older daughter's eyes and her being when she's in nature exploring and enjoying.
32638. Last summer, my daughter Sacha had a first herself, her first canoe camping trip on the Kispiox River. It was great. She was sitting on the dry bags and we had to tell her to lean in and lean out when we were eddying in and eddying out. She was just smiling and giggling.
32639. We were expecting her to experience her first ocean trip this July, and we are patiently waiting for the ice to melt on Tyhee so we can introduce canoeing to our new three-month old baby.
32640. In thinking of my legacy as a parent and of concepts like seven-generation sustainability, I wonder what I can leave my children and my children's children. What will they have? Do I want to leave them with the pressure and the fear that a pipeline might rupture or an oil tanker might have an accident?
32641. A pipeline would jeopardize these activities that I enjoy with my family as it would create so much pressure and fear. I do not want that background pressure and fear of the potential of an oil spill in this region.
32642. I do not want it upon me. I do not want it upon my daughters, and I do not want it upon my daughters' children. Rather, I petition you, the Panel, to make the decision that will enable future generations to have the freedom to experience clean waterways, healthy marine and aquatic ecosystems.
32643. In conclusion, I'm deeply connected to this natural environment that's around me, around this region. It is part of who I am as an educator, as an amenity migrant, and as a parent. I would love to catch another 33-pound chinook and I would love to catch more sockeye salmon without fear of having the salmon fishery compromised by an oil spill.
32644. I see my daughters learning how to fly-fish with oversize waders and big boots and learning how to catch a fish with a huge net. I see our family canoeing around here for years to come.

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

32645. This connection to nature is why I've chosen to stand before you on this panel to express my strong opinions that the Enbridge pipeline would run against all that I believe.

32646. Thank you.

--- (Applause/Aplaudissements)

32647. **MEMBER MATTHEWS:** Thank you.

32648. Ms. Kearns?

--- **ORAL STATEMENT BY/EXPOSÉ ORAL PAR MS. CARLIE KEARNS:**

32649. **MS. CARLIE KEARNS:** Good morning.

32650. I moved to Houston with my husband in August 1974. Our first adventures here were fishing trips along the Morice River. It is an amazingly beautiful, pristine, and powerful river. We've camped, canoed, boated, and fished most of the river from the Morice West Bridge to the Barrett Station Bridge.

32651. We've caught chinook, pink, and coho salmon, rainbow trout, and dolly vardon. We've seen abundant wildlife and birds along the river and picked berries and mushrooms nearby. It is idyllic. More people every year access this area for fishing and for the outdoor experience, locals as well as people from across Canada, the U.S., Asia and Europe.

32652. This prime fish habitat is downstream from where the proposed oil pipeline would parallel and cross the Morice and then the Gosnell. In the spring, when the Morice becomes a raging, brown torrent, our explorations eventually took us to Babine Lake and then Rainbow Alley. It's a world-renowned fly-fishing paradise.

32653. In the spring and summer, fishermen congregate in Rainbow Alley and Nilkitkwa Lake to fish for rainbow trout. As you know, that area is also at risk. Eighty (80) percent of the Babine rainbow trout spawn in the Sutherland River downstream from the pipeline crossing of that river, or proposed crossing.

32654. We've also enjoyed fishing and boating in the Douglas Channel, a wonderful, wonderful environment. The cycles of nature sustained by the rivers,

lakes, and ocean are immense, truly the lifeblood of this province.

32655. I am horrified by the thought of an oil pipeline through this area and oil supertankers in the Douglas Channel. Oil spills are inevitable.

32656. Last June I wrote a letter to the Houston Today newspaper expressing my concerns. The following week, Mr. John Carruthers, President of Northern Gateway Pipelines, responded, stating in his letter to the editor:

“Enbridge delivers almost a billion barrels of hydrocarbons a year through its pipeline system with a safety record of 99.99 percent.”

32657. So they do not safely deliver almost 100,000 barrels per year at their current volumes, a billion times .01. The planned pipeline would carry an average of 525,000 barrels every day.

32658. Using Mr. Carruthers’ statistics, we could then expect total spills or leaks of almost a hundred thousand barrels somewhere along this line within six years. Hopefully his statistics are wrong and his letter was meant to be reassuring; perhaps not. But at least he’s given us fair warning.

32659. I am aware of two Enbridge crude oil spills in 2011. Twenty-eight thousand (28,000) barrels northeast of Peace River, Alberta in May and 1,500 barrels from the Norman Wells line in June.

32660. There was also an Exxon Mobil rupture of a 12-inch pipe under the Yellowstone River spilling a 1,000 barrels and resulting in the evacuation of residents, closure of water intakes and the fouling of river banks for almost 50 miles downstream, just a small pipe.

32661. The Norman Wells pipeline spill was discovered by Dene hunters, a pinhole leak apparently. It wasn’t noticed by the Enbridge up-to-date monitoring technology. Most of the proposed Gateway pipeline traverses a remote wilderness and is under ice and snow for four months of the year.

32662. What damage -- how much damage would a pinhole leak or leaks cause along that line, and how far would the oil travel before it was discovered?

32663. At the hearings here in January, Elsie Tiljoe spoke of her experience of being shaken out of bed when she was a child. She lived in the Houston area. That

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

could have been the magnitude 8.1 earthquake centered in Haida Gwaii in 1949. I don't know if the tremors from the March 1964 Alaska earthquake were felt in Houston, but tsunamis caused damage in B.C., Oregon, and California.

32664. The magnitude 7.9 earthquake in Alaska in November 2002 was felt in the Houston area. An article written by Grace Halls and published in the Houston Today states:

“Workers at the Equity mine site noticed a strange thing in the main zone pit the morning of Monday, November 4th. A boat that is normally tied up about a foot out of the water was adrift among slabs of ice in the pit. The last time they had seen the pit it was frozen right over with a layer of ice four inches thick. You can see where a surge wave had come through and pushed the ice up said Mike Aziz, Operations Manager at the Equity site.”

32665. I have a photo here of the tailings pond taken the day after the quake. The shoreline is littered with slabs of ice that were washed up by the mini-tsunami. The proposed pipeline runs within a few kilometres of Equity Mines.

32666. The Natural Resources Canada website states that in an earthquake, quote: -- that's the Natural Resources' website.

“The plates can either slide past one another, they can collide or they can diverge. The west coast of Canada is one of the few areas in the world where all three of these types of plate movements take place, resulting in significant earthquake activity.”

32667. I hope you verify this additional hazard.

32668. I'd like to remind you of the Enbridge track record for spill cleanup. Remember the Kalamazoo spill of 2010? I have a quote from a newspaper -- a news release of October 6th, 2011. Quote:

“The U.S. Environmental Protection Agency issued a directive today requiring Enbridge to take additional steps to clean up the July 2010 oil spill that damaged over 36 miles of the Kalamazoo River system. The directive requires Enbridge to submit plans by October 20, 2011 for the cleanup and monitoring work expected to last through 2012. Failure to comply could result in civil penalties. The EPA directive lays out a performance-based framework for assessing and recovering submerged oil in the river and cleaning up oil contaminated river banks.”

32669. The Kalamazoo River spill happened in July 2010, the U.S. EPA found it necessary to give Enbridge a cleanup directive over a year later and they expect the cleanup to last through 2012; two and a half years after the rupture. Imagine how much irreparable damage has been done by this spill.

32670. Despite their up-to-date monitoring technology and their cleanup strategies, 36 miles of the Kalamazoo River is damaged, ecosystems destroyed. I hope you have additional damage (sic) about the damage, the costs, the cleanup efforts for the Kalamazoo, the Peace River and the Enbridge -- and the Norman Wells spills; all Enbridge spills. And there are probably more that I don't know about.

32671. I feel sickened that the Enbridge Pipeline Proposal is even being considered seriously and that it's being pushed by the Harper government. The risks to the B.C. fisheries, the First Nations' territories and culture, the tourist industry, the pristine wilderness and the ecosystems all along the pipeline route, the Douglas Channel and the Pacific coastline are not worth any amount of financial gain. The risks are clear, the benefits are not.

32672. Thank you for listening to the local people all along the line who are speaking out against this project. This is our home.

--- (Applause/Applaudissements)

32673. **MEMBER BATEMAN:** Mr. Hug, thank you for choosing to come and present your views to the Joint Review Panel.

32674. **MR. JOE HUG:** Thank you.

32675. **MEMBER BATEMAN:** Please proceed.

--- **ORAL STATEMENT BY/EXPOSÉ ORAL PAR MR. JOE HUG:**

32676. **MR. JOE HUG:** Yes, I am Joe Hug; I am owner/operator of Healthy Hugs Organic Vegetable Farm, located about two miles upstream on the Bulkley River from here. I grow over 30 different types of vegetables and herbs, and their very existence is 100 percent dependent on the purity of the Bulkley River.

32677. Now, I oppose the Enbridge Pipeline Plan not just because it makes bad economic sense, and it does, I mean I -- okay, I drive a car, I need oil for my tractor,

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

diesel for my tractor, so I'm not against oil. I know where the world is right now, we -- we're in need of it.

32678. We send raw logs out of Prince Rupert overseas, to me, sending raw oil -- which this is what it is -- in a pipeline to be shipped overseas is quite similar, except with the logs we don't have the danger effect, we don't have the destroying of our pristine wilderness. But that's of course a side issue I could talk about for quite a while.

32679. I oppose the pipeline and not only because of the risk of a tanker spill off the Canadian coast, my main issue -- my main issue is the rivers. It's probably already been mentioned -- and I'm sure you're aware -- and I have a document here, it states, from Enbridge's own records, the Polaris Institute calculated over 804 spills occurred on their pipelines between 1999 and 2010.

32680. Now, I was born on this river. My father moved here with his parents in 1937 where they started a farm. And my father used to take me fishing when I was a small boy and I have a very fond memory of catching a dolly vardon about this big, taking it home and cooking it up for lunch and feeding my family. And at that point, that river -- I just -- it just kind of ran through me from that point.

32681. And I always loved how visitors would come to our farm -- they'd come from Europe usually because my parents were of Swiss descent -- and they would comment on our beautiful and wonderful and clean our river is.

32682. And I didn't really know what that meant until I had the privilege of travelling the world on my own. I -- when I was younger I backpacked through what I counted over 57 countries and I walked along many, many riverbanks. And I don't know if there's ever been even once where I could have leaned over and picked up a handful of water and just drank. And that was back mainly in the eighties and nineties; I think it's probably worse now.

32683. Well, just this morning I went down to the river near my house and I collected some water, which I have right here. It has some silt in it from the runoff but I strongly believe that it's some of the healthiest water the world has to offer today.

32684. And I strongly believe that if anyone puts a bitumen sludge pipeline anywhere near one of its sources that it will no longer be able to quench my thirst or my family or for sure my vegetables. And anything in its path, any living creature in

its path would be sickened or destroyed.

32685. Now, I have a small list here of a few rivers around the world that have been pretty much destroyed, I could -- I could probably cite about 500 more rivers, but I have about 15 of them here and some major ones that most of us have probably heard of some of them.

32686. And here they are: The Citarum River in West Java; The Yamuna River in India; the Buriganga River in Dhaka, Bangladesh; the Sarno River in Italy; the Marilao River in the Philippines; the Ganges in India; the Songhua in China; the King river in Australia; and closer to home, the Ohio River, the Tennessee River, the Delaware River, and the Yamaska River right here in Canada.

32687. It saddens me that we, as human beings, have destroyed these rivers and many, many more.

32688. But anyway, back to my water here, as you can see I don't only have one container of water; I have two. One is from the Bulkley River and the other one is from a ditch behind a gas station/garage not that far from here.

32689. I had planned, actually, to obtain a sample of the water from the Kalamazoo River in Michigan, but I was unable to do that. But I'm sure most of us would probably agree that water from a ditch near an old gas station is probably fairly similar.

32690. So as it happens, I'm kind of thirsty right now, so I want to drink from one of these. I'm not quite positive which one is the one from the river and which one is the one from the -- anyway. But what I do know is that if I drink the wrong one, I might have to go to the hospital tomorrow. And if I drink the right one, it's probably good for my health, all these silts.

32691. So if we can observe them, there's very little difference in looking at them. It's really amazing the difference something can have to look so similar. But yeah, I think I can -- I think I remember which is which.

32692. Oh yes, nice and cold still. So I would like to take this opportunity to propose a toast to all those rivers that we have annihilated in the past and to the preservation of all the clean rivers, and may they flow naturally and with strength forever.

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

32693. And after this, I would like to observe a short moment of silence for all the living creatures, billions and billions of plants, animals, not to mention humans, that we've killed by undertaking senseless projects like the Enbridge pipeline and all the -- whatever we've dumped into these rivers over the decades.

32694. That's good water.

--- (A moment of silence/Un moment de silence)

32695. **MR. JOE HUG:** Thank you for your time. I feel honoured to be here.

--- (Applause/Aplaudissements)

32696. **THE CHAIRPERSON:** Thank you, Ms. Lester for being here with us today. Please proceed when you are ready.

--- ORAL STATEMENT BY/EXPOSÉ ORAL PAR MS. JENNY LESTER:

32697. **MS. JENNY LESTER:** Thank you very much for having me here for this opportunity to be able to speak to you directly. My name is Jenny Lester and I'm a musician who's lived in this valley my whole life. I live in a little log cabin up in Driftwood and love nature, and that's why I'm here.

32698. I feel a sense of beauty and wholesomeness to this area of the world and I really truly appreciate this opportunity to speak to you because I feel like you are our last chance. You are the ones, the Joint Review Panel, who have the power to stop the silliness.

32699. It's not totally silly. I understand that we are part of a fossil fuel addiction global community. We all are. I understand that. But we are also intelligent human beings who have had the ability to learn from mistakes from the past.

32700. I don't feel like we have a fair balance going on. It's very scary right now because this project, which is part of the global addiction to fossil fuels, is being run in a way that feels like I'm being bullied.

32701. And I feel like there's a government out there that is out of control and acting more in a way of a drug lord than a leader of a country who has everything. We have everything. We have health. We have education. We have hope. We have prosperity. We have nature. We are the protectors of it because people who don't

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

live here don't understand. They understand something different; they have something to teach us.

32702. But we have this instability of a government that is in the process of making me feel like by signing here to speak, I'm on a terrorist list. It's a weird process that I don't understand. And you are our only hope.

32703. I don't know anyone else who can stop it from happening. Can you be the reasonable conscience? Are you our conscience? Can you help hear all the voices of all the people who are saying that this does not feel right; it's being done for the wrong reasons?

32704. We need -- this is how I really feel. Canada is amazing. I am of the luckiest people in the world. I'm in the top 10 percent of financial stability even though I'm a musician.

--- (Laughter/Rires)

32705. **MS. JENNY LESTER:** And with this country being so strong in education, health, prosperity, freedom, liberty, we need to be world leaders in the right way. We need to be exploring avenues and enabling processes that take us into a greener, more sustainable balanced future. This feels so old-school. This feels so stupid. And they're smart. And you are our only hope.

32706. The Joint Review Panel is the only place we can turn to say, "Please make this all make sense. Please keep everyone aligned. Please listen to the voices of the people, be the balancing conscience. Listen to the economic government agenda. Listen to how it will benefit different things. Listen to the amount that it's going to hurt us. And think about the future and the way we want to go as a nation."

32707. And you have the power. You're the only ones who really have the power to make this go the direction that we can be proud of.

32708. Thank you.

--- (Applause/Aplaudissements)

32709. **THE CHAIRPERSON:** Thank you to each of you for being here.

32710. Let's take a 15-minute break. I've got 10 o'clock on my watch and we'll

come back at 10:15. Thanks.

--- Upon recessing at 9:56 a.m./L'audience est suspendue à 9h56

--- Upon resuming at 10:13 a.m./L'audience est reprise à 10h13

--- ORAL STATEMENT BY/EXPOSÉ ORAL PAR MS. LYNNDA McDOUGALL:

32711. **MS. LYNNDA McDOUGALL:** Welcome back to Smithers. I am Lynnda McDougall and I'm currently employed at the Smithers Public Library. But since I moved to the Bulkley Valley in 1971, I've been a substitute high school teacher, a bookkeeper and a business owner.

32712. I spent 20 years of my career in resource-based industries through both boom and bust cycles, first in forestry as a tree planter, a slasher buckler and ultimately as a stump to dump logging contractor.

32713. Then I was in mining exploration as an office manager/bookkeeper for a local diamond drilling firm. For eight years, I worked with First Nations at Dze l'kant Friendship Centre.

32714. Throughout this length of time and breadth of experience, I have never encountered an issue that has united and galvanized the people of the Pacific Northwest like the threat posed to our livelihood and our very way of life by the Enbridge Northern Gateway Project.

32715. I'm not a scientist, but you'll be hearing from many of them detailing the atrocious assault on our watersheds that a pipeline rupture or, worse yet, an oil tanker spill would deliver. I'm not a scientist, but I am a mother and grandmother and a 41-year resident of this beautiful country.

32716. And when I look at a map of the pipeline route, memories come flooding back, memories of activities and places that I assumed I would share with my grandchildren, but they're now under threat of degradation and extinction; Ootsa Lake camping, boating and trout fishing; a spill into the Morice River, gone.

32717. Homesteading on the banks of the Bulkley River at Quick and Telkwa; drawing drinking water like Joe this morning in water from buckets in summer and winter; swimming, tubing, rafting from Wolcott to Quick; not in bitumen-polluted water; swimming lessons at Round Lake with my daughter, not a chance.

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

32718. A family wedding on the beach at Grey Bay on Haida Gwaii; black tar balls don't enhance white bridal gowns and deformed, toxic seafood doesn't provide a delicious wedding dinner.

32719. I'm not an expert but I do recall a sudden storm in November of 1978 when hurricane force winds blew and over 10 inches of rain fell in Terrace in two days. The resulting floods and mudslides devastated the entire northwest.

32720. Forty-four (44) washouts on Highway 16 between Terrace and Hazelton alone. Bridges gone, CN Rail tracks, including a train with two crew members from Smithers swept into the Skeena River. Over 6,000 acres of timber blown down in the Chapman Lake area alone, and the Pacific Northern Gas natural gas line ruptured in the Telkwa Pass, cutting off the primary heating source to Terrace, Kitimat and Prince Rupert.

32721. This incident is relevant today because it highlights the difficulties in repairing the infrastructure and rugged terrain in poor weather and with few transportation options. From Smithers to the west coast we have one road and one rail line. When these are impassable or compromised the only alternative is aircraft. Mountain flying is hazardous at the best of times, and inclement weather simply makes it impossible.

32722. In 1978, the PNG crews were delayed first because of weather -- they couldn't fly in -- and then by conditions as described by PNG sales and service manager of the Terrace district, John Low, in a news story, and I quote:

"Unless the service is restored Wednesday, the area will find itself without a major source of home heating. Low said the major break in the line occurs about 26 miles upriver from Copper River Bridge on Highway 16. Twelve (12) men, as much as the site can hold, have been flown in by helicopter and they face the task of building a four-inch bypass line 200 feet up a 70 degree slope across 1,000 to 1,500 feet on top of the ridge and back down the slope. Machinery has no access to the area and Low said the men are doing all the work by hand. Two welding machines are the only equipment being used on the site."

32723. End quote.

32724. It took more than a week to restore natural gas services to tens of thousands of people, and a full two years to rebuild the roads, bridges and rails to

their previous state. These are the conditions facing anyone trying to repair an oil pipeline leak. And then it won't be natural gas dissipating into the air, but heavy, toxic bitumen poisoning our waterways, killing our fish and destroying our environment.

32725. We northerners are a sceptical lot. We have seen the results of projects built by those who don't live here or understand the realities of our climate and geography. The beautiful buildings designed by southern architects that are cold and draughty and leak, the mega projects that flood our farmland and dislocate our First Nations.

32726. We don't believe Enbridge's empty promises and smooth assurances. We've talked to the people affected by Enbridge's 2010 spill along the Kalamazoo River in Michigan and heard about the slow initial response, subsequent denial of compensation, the reprehensible treatment of Claimants and the continued ruination of sections of the river.

32727. We know that under Canadian law the total liability to Enbridge for oil tanker -- an oil tanker spill is a paltry \$40 million. The B.C. taxpayer will be paying the rest of the billions required. We don't believe the Harper government's argument that this project is in the national interest, at least not our nation. China will do very nicely.

32728. Greedy oil producers, many of them foreign-owned and controlled, will reap record profits to be shipped offshore, along with the bitumen and Canadian jobs. The Harper government would have us believe we need the revenue generated by the Northern Gateway to pay for our social programs, but we know that eliminating the billions of dollars in taxpayer subsidies to oil companies, already profitable, would provide that funding.

32729. We are astonished anew each day as the Harper government announced its proposed changes to the laws that will strip us of our environmental protection and regulatory review processes, including that of this very Panel.

32730. We urge -- no, we implore you as the people of conscience that we hope you are, to join the people of northern B.C. in condemning this project.

32731. I am a Northerner by choice and by temperament. Northerners can be fiercely proud, independent, resilient, responsible, rowdy and resourceful. We have our differences and divisions, but in the face of a common and pervasive threat, we

will work together to defeat this project.

32732. We love this country. It is our home, and we will protect it. We will become the radicals the Harper government accuses us of being, radically informed and radically involved. We will stop this pipeline.

32733. Thank you.

--- (Applause/Applaudissements)

32734. **MEMBER MATTHEWS:** Good morning, Mr. Mesec. Please go ahead and present.

--- **ORAL STATEMENT BY/EXPOSÉ ORAL PAR MR. DAN MESEC:**

32735. **MR. DAN MESEC:** Thank you very much, and thank you for being here. Welcome to Smithers, and I'd just like to, as many others have today, recognize that we are on Wet'suwet'en land, and I thank them for allowing us to speak on their territory.

32736. I've seen your faces a few times, you've probably seen mine a few now and one word that I think keeps coming up a lot in these hearings is respect; the respect for the land, the respect for the people that live here, our respect in presenting at these hearings and the respect to the company, to the Proponent of this project.

32737. However, there is a lack of respect, I believe, on their part in terms of having consultation with communities, in terms of trying to close out discussion of the public.

32738. I recently attended a meeting that was held at the school with a couple of Enbridge representatives presenting to the students. And one thing that they presented there was the fact that they not only produce oil in -- or transport oil, but they also have solar farms, the biggest one in Canada, they mentioned. And they have windmill farms, some largest in Canada as well.

32739. And it seemed to me that they were trying to kind of sway the students, the young mouldable mind into believing that they are doing good things, good things in energy. However, when you come up with a project like this, you gotta wonder.

32740. Jenny mentioned earlier that we are a smart people and that we have very

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

-- you know -- interesting ways of producing energy. Why not turn the focus onto new, renewable energy, energy that will last us 30 years from now, not 10, not tomorrow. Not next week, but 30, 40, 50 years into the future.

32741. They have the projects going right now, they have the technology. They should be putting their billions into those projects and leave futile operations such as the tar sands and the Northern Gateway pipeline in the past and the books of history where it belongs.

32742. We need to reduce our dependency on oil, and that way is through renewable energy. And I think you will agree and many people at these proceedings would agree with that as well.

32743. The implications of this project, and particularly the northwest, are unspeakably huge. The loss of our rivers, our salmon, loss of tourism dollars which here in Smithers are quite a lot, First Nations -- damage to the First Nations, relationships with not only yourselves personally but as also a government that seems to support this project is going to happen as well.

32744. We talk about being one of the best countries for human rights, we're building a human rights museum in Ottawa, but we're willing to ship raw material to a country that has one of the worst human rights record in the entire world.

32745. Along with this we also have economic impact. And yes, okay, for sure, you know perhaps there will be a few thousand jobs during construction of the pipeline. Not many would be local, I would assume, these are specialized jobs. And last time I checked, there weren't any pipelines running through B.C., up here in the north at the moment.

32746. However, again, when we look at Enbridge's idea of shipping this material, this bitumen across an ocean, to again a foreign consumer, what are we really doing; I think we're actually exporting Canadian jobs.

32747. Why not build a pipeline to Ontario? Why not build a refinery, another refinery in Alberta for a few thousand jobs. We still import around 30 percent of our petroleum in Eastern Canada. Why not build a pipeline there? There's a huge market.

32748. Don't get me wrong, we still need to produce oil, manufacture oil, extract it. You know, we can't just turn it off tomorrow, we all need it. I drive a car too, you

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

know, we all do. But again, we have to wean ourselves off. And we are on the cusp here.

32749. We're at a time and a place -- we are on the 21st century and we should not be scraping, literally scraping the bottom of our planet for energy that we can come up with another solution. The electric car, the EV1, we had it, we let it go. And a big proponent of that operation were the oil companies. All for what; for a few extra dollars.

32750. Finally, I want to talk about the future. I'm 25, I have no kids, I don't have a wife. Supposedly, you know, the young generation is supposed to have the most optimistic outlook on life, you know. Everything is new; the world is yours if you want it.

32751. I seem to have a very hard issue believing that these days after seeing the kinds of production, industrialized production that I see in the world. Joe mentioned a lot of rivers being destroyed, that are not usable, even for irrigation anymore around the world, that have sustained life for thousands of years, are gone.

32752. And when I see that, and I see that kind of pristine wilderness that we have up here, some that is not found anywhere else in the world, here, right here in Canada I cringe and I wonder why, why would you want to build a pipeline here? Why would you even want to put even one ounce of this land at risk?

32753. I want to be able to bring my kids here, my grandkids here some day and show them, and say, "Yes, they wanted to put a pipeline here once and we stood up and we said no because I wanted you to walk this land, to fish these rivers, to hunt in these woods".

32754. It's sad to really see some of these folks that work for these corporations or work for these oil companies. You know, they make their living off destroying the planet really. We need energy, yes. But again, there are other ways; there are other means of producing it.

32755. We cannot let this kind of selfish political indulgence blind the real interests of Canadians. It's not about conservative idealism and a bunch of old white corporate executives wanting to secure their pensions, it's about the people on the ground, the people who live here everyday.

32756. And I can guarantee that quite a lot of people in the country do not know

what is going on here. And that's why we are trying to tell them.

32757. I think now to you and ask you to listen as you have been and as I've seen in the past few weeks and months, really listen to what these people are saying.

32758. I'm from Ontario, you know, and when I first came out here and it was a clear crystal day and I saw that mountain, I saw Hudson Bay Mountain coming up that highway. I just thought, "Man, this has got to be it. You know, this has got to be it".

32759. I got out of the car and I just stood and felt the cool air and looked at the glistening whitecap and thought, how could anybody not love this? How could anybody not want to climb these mountains and live here?

32760. I think that you folks have a very, very hard decision here. There's a lot of implications to recommendations that you're going to make to the government. Now, mind you, the government is going to end up doing what the government wants to do. However we're still here to speak our minds.

32761. But I ask you to think of myself, to think of the next generation that is going to have to clean up this mess when a pipeline does rupture. Because I don't see Enbridge going to be showing up in 30 years when there's oil all over these rivers. It's going to be me and my kin trying to clean it up.

32762. And on that point, I'm not a radical; I try to be an environmentalist to some degree. But when Harper comes out and calls us, people who stand up to this pipeline, enemies of the country and enemies of the Canadian people I take that very seriously. I try to be a peaceful person, but when I hear stuff like that, rage -- rage builds and I don't take those comments lightly.

32763. And I can guarantee that there are many up here who feel the exact same way. And I can also guarantee that if Harper has his way and puts this pipeline in, that he will be dealing with a very disobedient civil unrest in these parts. I can guarantee that much. From the people that I have spoken to and the things that I have seen here as a witness, I can guarantee that these people will not lay down.

32764. In closing, I'd just like to leave you with some words that my grandfather taught me when I was very young.

32765. (Speaking in native language). "Go with courage."

32766. You have a tough decision ahead, but I know that after these hearings you will make the right decision. So please, go with courage and do what is needed. Do what is needed for the future, for future generations to succeed and to sustain and live on these lands as their forefathers have lived for thousands of years.

32767. Thank you very much.

--- (Applause/Aplaudissements)

32768. **MEMBER BATEMAN:** Mr. Nugent, thank you for being here today. Please begin.

--- **ORAL STATEMENT BY/EXPOSÉ ORAL PAR MR. TED NUGENT:**

32769. **MR. TED NUGENT:** Good morning. My name is Ted Nugent, I'm a Canadian citizen. I make my home here in the Bulkley Valley and I'm raising a family here.

32770. I'm a journeyman carpenter with education in earth sciences. And I've owned and operated a contracting business in B.C. for 17 years. I also hold title to several holdings that will be affected by this proposed project.

32771. I would like to thank the Wet'suwet'en for welcoming you here and for so proudly upholding their position on this matter. I'm pleased to be able to register my opinion regarding this project.

32772. My grandfathers fought in both World Wars, risking their lives and wellbeing so that their children and fellow citizens could experience opportunities such as this; to have input on how their health and welfare will be treated by the state.

32773. I thank the Panel for recognizing the importance of such rights and participating in the project.

32774. Information and facts already presented to this Panel and that are readily available to any duly diligent individual researching this project speak for themselves. It comes down to ethics of whether you can accept degradation.

32775. I stand in opposition to this proposed pipeline. This proposal has been put forward by an independent for-profit organization that is using a risk-based

assessment process to justify their endeavour. They do not, however, eliminate the harm inherent in the project, but mitigate it to levels acceptable to themselves.

32776. My education and experience have taught me to think critically and beyond the immediate, to proceed with caution and that diversity is a fundamental quality in an economic, environmental or social system. Assessment through each of these ideas leaves the Enbridge Northern Gateway Project wanting, and even meagre shreds of justification.

32777. The proposal to run a twin pipeline through our seismically and geomorphologically unstable terrain has not been shown to be without failure. Documents submitted by Enbridge do not ever state that they can solve these problems, merely mitigate them.

32778. Any reasonable person assessing the situation with even moderate experience in these mountains or with a background in B.C. history or sciences or engineering recognizes this.

32779. When I reviewed Enbridge's responses to the JRP request for more information, it is clear that Enbridge has spent a lot of money doing assessments that ultimately show that risks were prevalent and they did not have complete prescriptions to fully address these hazards.

32780. They felt that they could -- that with further investigation, mitigate to an acceptable risk level, no real solutions but rather prescriptions for slightly altered routes or massive alterations to the landscape that needed further assessments and design.

32781. Lots of emphasis is being put into the potential contamination from spills, but the actual creation of the pipeline, the one-kilometre swath of clearing, blasting, excavation and bridge building will do irreversible damage to the watersheds it passes through.

32782. I've worked within the provincial parks system and understand the due diligence that is called for when working in sensitive areas, especially in and around streams. The disturbance created by burying a three-inch drain line is large. A three-foot diameter pipe cannot be buried in sensitive areas without creating permanent alteration and degradation to the surrounding natural systems.

32783. I assume this is why the *Fisheries Act* is being altered, as it would not

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

otherwise be able to be adhered to. I will not accept this environmental compromise to our environment.

32784. Now what about the spills? The financial risk mitigation measure in some of these hazard zones is to install automatic gate valves to isolate sections that will fail. These suggested gate valves are restricted to select consequence areas and they only restrict the spill event to a model maximum potential of 2,000 cubic metres. That is unacceptable as well.

32785. Further to that, I have not been able to find out what happens if that failure incorporates the valve housing itself. It would seem that the volume escalates back to the next area of consequence.

32786. I will not accept the release of bitumen into my landscape because it is a toxin, a persistent toxin, a toxin that cannot and will not be removed from the environment due to its very nature combined with the topography and weather patterns of the landscape it will be stuck to. It is not in our national interest to transport this resource in this manner.

32787. It is in our national interest to be stewards of this unique landscape and work together to get the most lasting benefit from this resource without undermining other resources. We can and have to do better than this proposal. My grandfather will roll over in his grave if we sell our country out like this.

32788. I realize the pressures that are weighing on each individual on this Panel. I urge you to be brave and act with integrity. Thank you.

--- (Applause/Applaudissements)

32789. **THE CHAIRPERSON:** Thank you.

32790. Mr. Pojar, please go ahead when you're ready.

--- **ORAL STATEMENT BY/EXPOSÉ ORAL PAR MR. JIM POJAR:**

32791. **MR. JIM POJAR:** I am Jim Pojar. I've lived in the Bulkley Valley since 1978. I'm an ecologist and I worked 25 years or so for the B.C. Forest Service. During that time, I did lots of field work throughout Northwestern B.C. from Prince George to Haida Gwaii, from Atlin to Bella Coola, and usually in the company of earth scientists.

32792. Over the years I've noticed that the physical scientists, the soil scientists, the geologists, the climatologists and engineers who've come from east of the Rockies initially don't get mountainous British Columbia.
32793. It often takes them several years to recalibrate, I mean in terms of topography, rapid changes over short distances, mass movements, peak flows, extreme events, really physically active landscapes and hydrogeomorphologically -- hydrogeomorphological processes. It takes them a while to recalibrate.
32794. Therefore, in light of threats to the terrestrial and especially the freshwater aquatic ecosystems of west central B.C., threats from pipeline construction and subsequent ruptures and leaks along the line, I recommend that the Panel and all the support staff review some photos of the severe erosion of roads, culverts, bridges caused just last summer by big rainstorms.
32795. These have been posted on the Flickr site of the B.C. Ministry of Transportation and Infrastructure. There's some really informative sequences.
32796. Now, Linda talked about a big honking storm 30 years or so ago. This one was just last summer, and it wasn't as big, but it caused incredible damage. There were severe rainstorms with surface erosion plus mass movements, which equals a potent combination for damage to all linear infrastructure, especially in mountainous terrain. And that's not just in the construction phase; it's when those -- that infrastructure is in place it's also threatened.
32797. So there was big damage in the Peace region, a late June rainstorm along Highway 97. From Chetwynd to Mackenzie more than 25 significant blow-out sites, said to be a one in 40 year event, but as the global climate continues to warm the frequency of such events will increase.
32798. And then in early September, after 12 centimetres of rain in a 24-hour period in the coast Mountains, there was massive erosion along Highway 37, especially the spur that goes through the mountains to Stewart, bridges and roadbed washed away, streams cutting new channels. So take a look at those photos.
32799. The conservation values of west central B.C. in a terrestrial context, the values, especially in the mountainous portions of west central B.C., centre on the region's rivers, especially the larger drainages, and the productive valley bottoms with riparian ecosystems and high fish and wildlife values.

32800. Now, stepping back for a broad continental view, the Bulkley ranges and the Kitimat ranges -- that's what's between us and Douglas Channel -- have some nationally and globally significant ecological attributes, including unregulated -- I mean undammed -- lake-headed salmon rivers with clean water and high quality aquatic habitat. Intact freshwater aquatic habitats is one of the rarest class of ecosystems in the world.
32801. We also have a more or less intact large mammal predator/prey systems, both interior and coastal, globally significant, continentally important habitat and populations of grizzly bear or kermode bear, mountain goat, wolf and wolverine, and a big chunk of coastal temperate rainforest, also known as the Great Bear Rainforest.
32802. But the really world class system occurs along the coast, the marine environment, B.C.'s globally significant North and Central Coast, 88,000 kilometres squared and marine ecosystems, archipelago, fjord and continental shelf environment.
32803. And the incredibly complex fractal land/water interface, that too is under threat, ecosystems like kelp forests, sea grass meadows, fertile estuaries, 9,000 year old glass sponge reefs, sea mounts, species including whales, porpoises, rock fish, sea otters, sea birds, herring, eulachon, and octopus -- and I'm quoting here from a scientific report:
- "The combination of complex oceanographic conditions and sea floor characteristics with channels, banks, deep troughs, eddies, up-wellings, estuaries and depths from zero to 2,000 metres creates a wide range of ecological niches and in turn supports a diverse array of species."*
32804. Nonetheless, much of the landscape along the proposed pipeline route has been industrialized; it's not pristine wilderness in the interior plateau, say between here and -- or between Houston and Mackenzie and Prince George.
32805. The natural environment has been subjected to extensive clear cut logging with numerous roads and stream crossings, a railroad and major highway, mines and their affluence, hydroelectric transmission lines, gas pipelines and agriculture.
32806. And all these "developments" have had environmental impacts. All effects or impacts are cumulative. They accumulate through time and over space. Cumulative effects do not represent a special class of impacts but they need special attention because a series of, apparently, minor effects can accumulate to result in a

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

significant overall effect, and the total impact can be greater than the simple sum of individual stressors.

32807. A few years ago when I was working in the Yukon a senior Yukon government manager, in the Department of Energy, Mines and Resources, assured me that dealing with the oil and gas industry was straightforward because -- and I'm quoting: "They're just looking for a bigger sandbox to play in". He actually said that.

32808. This was a dismaying but revealing remark that reveals the manifest destiny approach of the oil and gas industry and their servants in senior governments, the cavalier attitude to the natural and human environment of western Canada, places like the Fort Nelson Lowland, the Sacred Headwaters at Bulkley Valley. Each is apparently considered just another piece of bush.

32809. It also revealed the underlying assumption that the collateral damage from oil and gas exploration, development and transport will be insignificant because they occur in a sparsely populated hinterland. And it reminded me of the distinction between homeland and hinterland that Thomas Berger highlighted in the Mackenzie Valley pipeline hearings.

32810. In conclusion, because of the threats to the natural environment of west central B.C., in particular to the freshwater aquatic and marine systems, threats from pipeline construction and subsequent ruptures and leaks along the line, and from oil spills and other pollution from tankers along the coast, and because of the unacceptable attitude of the oil and gas industry and senior governments to the people who live along the proposed route, and because of the threats to our homeland, our quality of life and the stability and health of our communities, I am strongly opposed to this proposed pipeline.

32811. Thank you.

--- (Applause/Applaudissements)

32812. **THE CHAIRPERSON:** Thank you very much to each of you.

32813. Can we do the next panel change, please?

--- (A short pause/Courte pause)

32814. **MEMBER MATTHEWS:** Welcome everyone. Okay, so we have three

speakers. Ms. Ruff -- oh, Strauss. Okay, could you please present to the Panel?

--- ORAL STATEMENT BY/EXPOSÉ ORAL PAR MS. KATHLEEN RUFF:

32815. **MS. KATHLEEN RUFF:** Yes, my name is Kathleen Ruff, and I'd like

32816. **MEMBER MATTHEWS:** Oh -- oh, it's okay.

32817. **MS. KATHLEEN RUFF:** Is that okay?

32818. **MEMBER MATTHEWS:** Yes, that's fine. Okay.

32819. **MS. KATHLEEN RUFF:** And I'd like to thank the Wet'suwet'en for allowing us all to be here and I'd like to thank the Panel for the opportunity to speak.

32820. I'm here because I care about the environment I live in. We say we live in Smithers or Terrace or Hazelton or Moricetown, and we say this name as if it was a separate, isolated, self-contained entity, a separate reality, but this is untrue. There are no separate realities.

32821. We do not live in splendid isolation so that we can ignore and destroy the whole interrelated environment of which we are part and on which we depend for our survival and wellbeing.

32822. We are not a separate town of Smithers that can be cut off and disconnected from the health of the wider environment. We are part of a watershed, we are part of a rich complex living environment that is vulnerable and that can be damaged and that can be destroyed.

32823. If we ignore that rich complex living environment and allow it to be put in jeopardy and destroyed and harmed we are fools, and worse, we are traitors. We betray not only all the creatures who form part of that rich complex living environment, we also betray future generations.

32824. We have a sacred duty to act as stewards of the environment and to pass this heritage unharmed to future generations. Even our national anthem tells of this duty, "O Canada, we stand on guard for thee". We don't stand on guard for rich quick profits and dangerous projects that threaten our country, our environment, our national wellbeing.

32825. I want to express my concern to you, the Panel, about and what you are doing. I am concerned that you are treating and are perhaps only allowed to treat Enbridge Pipelines Project as an isolated issue and are not looking at the full picture of its impact and the cumulative impact.
32826. The pipelines would cross thousands of streams and rivers in remote areas, which are difficult to access, particularly in winter storm conditions. Two hundred (200) or more supertankers would be going up and down a hazardous coastline.
32827. Is this part of your review or is this defined as being outside your reality? Yet a spill from tankers on the coastline would affect the fish who come up our rivers. The fish don't have separate realities, saying that this water is coastline water and this water is river water. So this water is real and part of reality and this water is not real and not part of reality. It's all one; it's all interconnected -- interconnected.
32828. But my concern is that your review denies that reality, denies that interconnectedness and is being blind to the full picture and to the cumulative impact and I hope that my concern will not be shown to be true.
32829. I am concerned that Enbridge is talking from huge ignorance and just looks at the surface of things and is motivated and absorbed and intoxicated by attaining big quick profits and billions of dollars for itself.
32830. A report yesterday by Professor Andrew Whitehead, a biology professor who has studied the ongoing impact of the BP oil spill in the Gulf of Mexico, shows that the genetic makeup of a fish has been damaged permanently and so reproduction of the fish and the shellfish is being affected.
32831. BP says that they have done a terrific job in cleaning up the oil, just as Enbridge says it will do a terrific job in cleaning up the oil.
32832. When BP get reports of oil still existent on the surface of the water they go and disperse it and do their efforts to clean it, but this is just on the surface of the water.
32833. As the professor stated, they have no idea of what is happening underneath the surface of the water and no way of dealing with the effect of the oil spill on the vast majority of the water, which is water under the surface. They are now finding evidence of enormous ongoing destruction of shellfish and other life that is being

created below the surface.

32834. Enbridge is asking us to just look at the surface of this issue, and my appeal to you is to not do that, but to look at what the real implications are.

32835. I'm extremely concerned about the role of the Panel because your role is being gutted right now as we speak, a few days ago with a Harper government proposed legislation that takes away your independent authority to make a decision rejecting or approving the pipeline. That will not be a final decision anymore. Instead, the decision will be a political one by the Harper government.

32836. And Prime Minister Harper has already announced that decision. He and his Minister of Natural Resources have clearly stated that they support the Enbridge Pipelines and are determined that this will go ahead and that anyone who opposes it is an enemy of Canada.

32837. Furthermore, the Government of B.C. has abandoned its responsibility to have any B.C. environmental assessment done by the B.C. Environmental Assessment Office, saying the B.C. government will do nothing and has handed over all authority to let your Panel do an independent -- to do an environmental review, a review that the Harper government says it will ignore if it does not please them, if it's not the answer that they want.

32838. Thus, we are in a situation where our B.C. government has abandoned any environmental responsibility and the Harper government has said it will ignore what your Panel recommends and will take its own political decision on the Enbridge Project, decision they have already taken without bothering to hear the evidence.

32839. I feel that we are being betrayed, that democracy is being killed, that our right for there to be a proper independent environmental review has become a mockery and a sham. The mechanism for independent, binding environmental oversight has been gutted and our environment will not be protected.

32840. One could take from this well, it doesn't matter what you say. I take the opposite view. It matters even more that you do protect the environment and speak up on the basis of the evidence, and that you speak up and not allow it to be a charade.

32841. You have heard all the evidence of the harm and the risk and the opposition of people in this region to this project which threatens our livelihood, our

wellbeing for ourselves and for future generations.

32842. I call on you to show courage, to do the unexpected. The government expects you to be pleasing to it, to be complicit with it. I call on you to surprise the government, to show your loyalty to the environment, to future generations and to us in this region.

32843. Thank you.

--- (Applause/Applaudissements)

32844. **MEMBER BATEMAN:** Ms. Strauss, thank you for being with us this morning. Please present your statement.

--- **ORAL STATEMENT BY/EXPOSÉ ORAL PAR MS. TARA STRAUSS:**

32845. **MS. TARA STRAUSS:** Dear Members of the Joint Review Panel, thank you for giving us the time today to listen to my thoughts and my feelings around the Northern Gateway Project headed by Enbridge.

32846. I'm not one for public speaking and I'm not very politically motivated. I don't consider myself a radical and I'm not being funded by anyone foreign or otherwise to speak here today.

32847. However, this proposal has got my attention and I feel it is my responsibility to take this opportunity to share my perspective. This is a proposal for a large project that has large impacts and should be considered carefully, not rushed.

32848. This proposal has made me very aware of the current political climate in Canada and the importance of the choices we make, both as individuals and as a nation, at this point in time.

32849. I choose to be here today to speak to you as a resident of the Bulkley Valley, as a Canadian citizen, as a map maker and, most importantly, as a mother.

32850. I was born and raised in Mississauga. I've lived in Ottawa, Vancouver, Victoria, Kingston, Lindsay, and for the last 10 years, here in the Bulkley Valley. As well, I've travelled extensively throughout Mexico.

32851. Each place I have lived and visited has offered to me a unique experience

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

and a broadening perspective. I am here today speaking as a resident of the Bulkley Valley because of all places I've lived, the Bulkley Valley is where I choose to raise my family.

32852. I'm aware you've heard many stories of these lands and the connections to it, and will undoubtedly hear many more. That so many of us have taken the opportunity to share our thoughts speaks volumes of the people here and the land we inhabit. This is an incredible experience to hear firsthand how important and in fact how sacred this land and its resources are to the people who live here.

32853. I had the opportunity to be involved in a pilot mapping project called, "Place-based community values", in and around the area I live which is Quick. We collected information representing areas of value to the residents of Quick and Round Lake. The data was categorized as cultural, historical, biological or recreational. It was incredible to learn of these diverse and numerous places of interest.

32854. This project grew and spread across the valley from neighbourhood to neighbourhood, taking form in people's living rooms where people gathered, pouring over maps, pointing out special places and sharing their stories.

32855. All of this was recorded in an online GIS system which documented the location of these places special to the residents of this valley and the reasons why they hold value. A poster map and booklet were created to complement this research. I created the map and I brought one here today as a gift for the Panel Members, which I hope you accept.

32856. It became evident to me that this project -- that through this project -- that people of all kinds feel connection to this place, that people live here for reasons very much weaved to the landscape surrounding them.

32857. As a GIS tech and a map maker, I have mapped the cut locks of our forest for over seven years. I have seen the scale at which we log. I've seen how the forces of nature can have devastating effects on industry. I have spent the last few years mapping things like Ali Howard's swim down the Skeena, recreation sites and trails, mountain bike trails, and currently local food production.

32858. As a mapper, I see these various activities and resources as layers overlapping each other. They affect each other. I don't want to have to include a layer for an oil spill area.

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

32859. This area is rich in its resources and we mean to keep it that way.
32860. Here we share the land with the spirit bear, the grizzly, the wolf, the moose, the elk and the salmon. We live on plateaus, mountains and valleys. Here we cherish the land, the wildlife, the flora and fauna, and the rivers. We offer this to the people of Canada and of the world. We offer world class fishing and hunting, hiking and biking, skiing and boarding, and First Nations culture.
32861. This offering is of benefit to the people who live here and those who come to experience this part of the world. It is a mutually beneficial relationship which propels us healthily into the future. The love of the land here protects it for its own sake and enriches the lives of anyone who experiences it.
32862. As a resident of the Bulkley Valley, the proposed pipeline presents too many risks, environmentally, culturally and economically. We have fundamental rights to clean water, air and food, and this project puts those at risk. Not only would we be risking these fundamental rights, we are being asked to risk one of the most pristine wildlife areas left in the world.
32863. This area is a Canadian treasure, a piece of Canadian culture, one of the last coastal temperate rain forests, and we are talking about running a pipeline through what is made of rugged coastal mountains and over countless salmon-bearing streams and rivers; moving cargo ships the size of the Eiffel Tower through a labyrinth of fjords and islands and some of the most treacherous coastal waters. These are high-risk geographical areas.
32864. If this project were approved and built, even before a spill happens, it would be damaging the existing ecosystem and the ways of life for many people and animals. To support this project would be to risk the most important things to our healthy survival, clean water and food, not to mention job and opportunities already here in industries such as fishing and tourism, which rely on a healthy watershed.
32865. I cannot be proud of choosing to support a proposal that risks so much, not as a resident of the Bulkley Valley, not as a citizen of Canada, and especially not as a mother. There is too much here in the national interest to risk, the special ecosystem and the livelihood of the people who live here and all those who visit.
32866. This northwest portion of British Columbia, Canada, is a jewel and offers so much to the rich fabric which makes up our vast and diverse country.

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

32867. As a Canadian citizen, I don't want to lose the opportunity to remain a resource-rich country. This abundance of oil could carry us through while we invest in research and innovation, becoming world leaders in energy alternatives. I support growth and a healthy economy and, with that, jobs.

32868. To sell off our resources as fast as possible for as much profit as possible is not in the national interest. It is in the interest of buyers and investors. We are not acting in the interest of our nation to employ such a plan.

32869. To me, a strong economy doesn't just mean jobs and profits.

32870. We just need to look at forestry here in central and western B.C. to see what happens when we sell off our resources as fast as possible. Our forest industry has been gutted, facing a loss of 12,000 jobs and we're now considering harvesting areas previously set aside for wildlife corridors and visual assessment. To what end? A few more bucks.

32871. This short-sightedness will only leave us resource poor with a lack of jobs and money already spent. The Northern Gateway project is a huge economic risk for our country. I believe Canadians are a well-educated population and understand the benefits of sustainable business practice.

32872. Canadians want jobs but more than that we want meaningful work, work to be proud of, work that provides resources for our children and their children.

32873. We want to leave a legacy to be proud of, something our children are proud of. Given a choice, Canadians will choose the path of sustainability and long-term resource management providing many jobs over a gutting of any resource for temporary gains. For these reasons, it makes sense to slow down or, at most, just maintain production at current levels in the oil sands.

32874. From what I understand, the Chinese own many of the oil sands project, and so it seems it's already owned by foreign interests.

32875. We may not have control over that any more but we don't have to bend over backwards and risk all that we have to ship oil overseas as fast as possible.

32876. Apparently, our federal government thinks we should silence our researchers and innovators, that we should dismantle our *Environmental Act* and *Fisheries Act* to serve the short-sighted, narrow-minded goals of oil companies,

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

investors and federal government. These regulations were set up to prevent damage to our environment and fisheries due to over-commercialization. I feel insulted by my federal government.

32877. We are an educated country and we have a right to voice our opinions. The fact that those who speak out for the protection of our natural resources are being called radicals and enemies of Canada is outrageous.

32878. Our Natural Resource Minister, Joe Oliver, is a former investment banker and manages our resources with the perspective of an investment banker. I understand how there are a large group of people who invested in this, and their investments are all tied to the oil industry and how they are counting on returns on the short term. And from this perspective, and this perspective only, does the Gateway Project make sense.

32879. Let's be clear, though, short term gains do not make for sustainable resource management or a strong economy. I believe it is possible to manage our resources sustainably when short term profit is not the main objective and, instead, create a strong and innovative economy. Our resources are what make us a rich nation. If we sell them off too quickly what will we be left with?

32880. After researching and reading everything I could get my hands on, I have carefully considered the merits of the proposal for the Northern Gateway Project and I cannot find even one reason to support this project. There is not one advantage to this project that is worth the risk we have to take.

32881. Even if against all odds in this area of high-risk there was never a spill, I feel we would be doing wrong by simply risking too much. Not only would we be risking our environment, culture and economy, we would be risking our opportunity as a nation to shine on an international stage. This is a pivotal time in history; our choices will set the path for the future.

32882. We are treading water in a fragile economic system, and we have an opportunity to remain a rich nation full of diverse resources that provide us with the ability to focus on innovation in science and research, specifically in new energy.

32883. What we need is a plan, an energy plan to propel us forward into a future that values the oil sands for its role in a diverse energy supply system. I want to see an energy plan for the national interests that considers the future of all Canadians for generations to come.

32884. We all need energy, it's worth planning for. If we choose to support this pipeline project we would be buying into a system that is failing in various places simultaneously around the globe. I see a future if we make the right choices now, we will be prosperous for generations to come, a future we can be proud of.

32885. Thank you.

--- (Applause/Aplaudissements)

32886. **MEMBER BATEMAN:** Ms. Strauss, thank you for your presentation.

32887. You had referred to a map that you had brought with you. For transparency, the Panel does not receive gifts, but I do have a suggestion. If you felt that the map would be of benefit on the record, our process advisor could provide some guidance of how you might attach that as a letter of comment.

32888. **MS. TARA STRAUSS:** I've got the form here.

32889. **MEMBER BATEMAN:** Thank you.

32890. **MS. TARA STRAUSS:** Thanks.

32891. **THE CHAIRPERSON:** Mr. Williston, please proceed.

--- **ORAL STATEMENT BY/EXPOSÉ ORAL PAR MR. PATRICK WILLISTON:**

32892. **MR. PATRICK WILLISTON:** Thank you.

32893. I was born here and I'm raising my family here. And I feel a tremendous responsibility to take care of this place that I call home. It's the closest that I will come to understanding the relationships among the First Nations and the land, the power that comes with a deep and abiding connection to place.

32894. Today, Enbridge proposes to disturb the wilderness of this region in order to transport the bitumen to the coast in a pipeline that pretty much everyone recognizes will eventually fail. But to use this stretch of wilderness as a transportation corridor for bitumen and condensate is kind of like sawing up the monumental carved poles of the northwest First Nations for lumber. It fails to recognize the true value of this land and this water.

32895. Will Enbridge survive without the Northern Gateway Project? Sure. Enbridge has many other assets that deserve their full attention, as both Joe and Carlie alluded to earlier.
32896. Will the oil sands stop turning a profit? It's unlikely. In fact, it's possible that earnings may increase if the rate of expansion is moderated and the resource is managed to last longer.
32897. Does Canada need the Northern Gateway Project? Shipping unrefined energy overseas while importing energy from unstable countries is not the signature of sound energy policy. And with a pipeline largely funded by -- well, by foreign companies, it effectively means handing over control of our resources to other nations, which is not a good strategy for Canada.
32898. Does the world need the Northern Gateway Project? Only if the world needs more CO2 and if the world needs less wilderness, and if the world needs less unpolluted coastlines.
32899. Does northern British Columbia need the Northern Gateway Project? I don't think so. Here we value wilderness, wild salmon, clean rivers and healthy coastal ecosystems. These are the key and enduring assets of the north, all of which we stand to lose if this project goes ahead.
32900. In my view, the proposed route is not particularly rational. The terrain, as we've heard from several, is -- the terrain is unstable. The ecosystems are too valuable and the coastal route is just too dangerous. Existing transportation and energy infrastructures have experienced catastrophic failures in the recent past. We've heard about them already today.
32901. Gas line pipe -- or gas pipeline ruptures, massive landslides on highways and sunken motor vessels, we're all familiar with these things, so why would this project be any different?
32902. Like all Canadians, we have needs and we have choices, and we need to feed and clothe and shelter ourselves. And to meet these needs we usually choose employment. And we can choose employment that damages the land in exchange for rapid gains in financial wealth, though this often leads to -- ultimately leads to discontent and sometimes misery.

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

32903. Or, we can choose employment that does not necessarily make us rich or miserable but that supports healthy land and water. And by and large this is the choice of most of the folks in the northwest. We're not particularly rich, but the land and the water is healthy.

32904. The Enbridge proposal imperils our ability to live this way because it threatens to pollute the land and the water.

32905. As I said, I was born in the north and I moved to Vancouver as a youth, where I lived for some 15 years, always knowing that I'd come back. And the reason I did was the same reason why many others have come to call this place home. It's for the wilderness, it's for the mountains, the rivers and the great rugged coast.

32906. These same natural attributes draw thousands upon thousands of visitors every year, some bound for the Yukon and for Alaska, and I know several of whom abandoned their journey right here. They arrived at this place, just like Dan, Hélène, many others, some of whom you've heard of today -- heard from today. They arrived at this place and they decided it just doesn't get any better than this, and they're right.

32907. Spill oil on this land and in this water and the fundamental character of this land is forever changed. The allure of the pristine is forever erased.

32908. I cannot match the powerful and articulate voices of the First Nations Elders who have presented to the Joint Review Panel, and I will always be grateful for the wisdom that they have shared.

32909. Like many of them, I was born in the Skeena watershed and I've drunk from these waters for most of my life. My children have been raised on this land and with this water. My family eats the fish from these lakes and rivers.

32910. We eat the moose and deer from the forest. We pick mushrooms from up just -- well, just off your map, just somewhere just south of Houston there, kind of where that red cross is. That's where we picked mushrooms last year.

32911. My -- she was three years old and five years old, they just were in there picking mushrooms like crazy, and they love to eat these Morel mushrooms. We look forward to that in the next couple of weeks here.

32912. We eat the berries here. We grow food in this soil. We buy meat that's raised on the water, air and soil here.

32913. And if you ask -- if you were to ask my daughter where maple syrup comes from, she would not tell you that it comes from the store or from Quebec. It comes, she will tell you, from the maple trees on the trail behind our house. The trees we tap each spring, we just finished doing this, and we gather the sap and then we boil it down into syrup. It's delicious. I wish I had some to share with you to convince you.

32914. The protein, the minerals, the water that makes me who I am here, this person before you, is largely derived from this land, and when you fly in here for these meetings and you admire the majesty of the mountains and the rivers, you are also observing the land in the process of becoming the people because the people and the land are ultimately the same thing.

32915. This is true, and the First Nations here have known this for a long time. And when a company tells you they can build a pipeline through this land that will never fail, will never pollute our water, land, and air, and thus our bodies, well, that's simply not true.

32916. This is an intent; Enbridge intends not to pollute and ruin the land but it's simply a necessary part of the business because you can't make a pipeline that will not one day fail, as has been demonstrated many thousands of times, including many times by the company known as Enbridge.

32917. I have spent much of my life studying two groups of organisms, the lichens and the bryophytes. What are bryophytes? Bryophytes is a fancy word for mosses and their relatives, which are known as the liverworts and the hornworts. Very small plants.

32918. It turns out that this region of British Columbia is among the richest in North America for mosses and lichens, many of which are endemic, and endemic means they don't live anywhere else in the world.

32919. A few of these species are protected by national legislation, which is the *Species at Risk Act*, including the cryptic paw lichen, nephroma occultum, and frosted glass whiskers lichen, sclerophora peronella. These both occur in this region, they're protected by national law.

32920. Furthermore, back in 1987 W.S. Hung published a paper that showed that this same latitude and longitude -- the same latitude and longitude of this proposed

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

pipeline route, was the richest place in western North America for endemic species of liverworts, again these little small plants. In Hung's words: "This area has long been a centre of evolution and diversification".

32921. And only last year I collected two lichens from Twin Falls right here in Smithers which are undescribed and have never been before -- never before been recognized by western science. This area is incredibly rich for these organisms though survey efforts for them have been few.

32922. According to the Enbridge Vegetation Assessment, which I was reading last night, the northern Rocky Mountains have 10 species of lichens, 3 liverworts and 23 mosses, that's their own vegetation assessment. This obviously grossly understates the diversity of the northern Rocky Mountains.

32923. In Alberta, there are two liverworts, while in reality there are well over 100 species, though their surveys counted two.

32924. In the area where Hung suggests, which has long been a centre of evolution and diversification, the Pacific Mountains here, the vegetation assessment found a total of seven species of liverworts. In reality there are well over 100 and perhaps closer to 150 species. In other words, this \$6 billion project is accounting for less than 7 percent of the diversity in the study area -- in the survey area.

32925. The Enbridge assessment is inadequate, and so the Enbridge Gateway legacy may be the loss of populations of rare species, including some that are apparently supposed to be protected by national legislation and were never surveyed for, or even the loss of species we'll never get a chance to know.

32926. Other aspects of the rare plant survey submitted to the Northern Gateway Environmental Assessment are clearly deficient. For example, only one rare plant was documented in the Pacific Mountains in an area of 10,000 hectares that were apparently surveyed. One rare species. That probably unrepresents what's actually there.

32927. As someone who has conducted rare plant surveys for projects such as this, including several surveys on British Columbia's north coastal mountains, I have never seen an area so large report so few rare species.

32928. With a projected affects assessment area one kilometer wide, this rare plant survey was supposed to survey a total of 115,000 hectares, but nowhere in the

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

assessment does it report how many days were spent surveying or by how many people. I went through this last night. Couldn't find a total for the number of days actually spent surveying. And this is on your website, I believe.

32929. What could be more precious than the Lower Skeena River in the spring when the tide maroons sculptured birds of river ice on the Silk Flats and the sea lions, the seals, the eagles, and the gulls gather in the thousands to feast on spawning eulachon.

32930. This is the land that we call home. This water is our blood. This is the place that we are here to protect, not just for our children but for all things and for all time, and this is why the Enbridge Gateway Pipeline Project must not proceed.

32931. Let's get this project off the table. Or in the government's own language, let's fast track the rejection process ---

--- (Laughter/Rires)

32932. **MR. PATRICK WILLISTON:** --- so that the people of this region, including myself, can have their lives back and not live with this terrible dread of this disaster in waiting.

32933. Thank you.

--- (Applause/Aplaudissements)

32934. **THE CHAIRPERSON:** Thank you.

32935. **MR. PATRICK WILLISTON:** I have the paper in my pocket here to submit to you guys.

32936. **THE CHAIRPERSON:** Again, I'd encourage you to talk to the process advisor to find out processes for doing -- for considering doing that.

32937. Thank you to all the presenters who have prepared and come and spoken -- spoke to us this morning. We -- that finishes our morning session and we will sit again this afternoon at 1 o'clock.

32938. Thank you everyone.

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

--- Upon recessing at 11:22 a.m./L'audience est suspendue à 11h22

--- Upon resuming at 1:00 p.m./L'audience est reprise à 13h00

32939. **THE CHAIRPERSON:** Good afternoon. My name is Sheila Leggett, and on my right is Mr. Kenneth Bateman and on my left is Mr. Hans Matthews.

32940. For those of you who've been sitting through these sessions, you've heard these introductions before, but we know that we have new presenters coming in all the time, so I'd just like to make sure that you know who you're speaking with.

32941. There are a number of staff in the room as well, and they're all wearing gold nametags, so if you have any process-related questions they're the right people to speak to and can provide you with any information.

32942. I think that with that we'll just get going on listening to this afternoon's oral statements.

32943. So, Mr. Benham, we'll start with you.

--- ORAL STATEMENT BY/EXPOSÉ ORAL PAR MR. ROGER BENHAM:

32944. **MR. ROGER BENHAM:** Thanks to the Wet'suwet'en, and thanks to the Panel for letting us speak.

32945. I am a professional engineer with specialization including in piping design in earthquake zones. I -- I know something about how to protect equipment in earthquake zones.

32946. Frankly, I do not have a clue how to protect pipelines in earthquake zones; how to protect them against earthquake shearing forces which could move up and down or sideways. I have no knowledge of how to -- how we -- how you can solve that.

32947. We know that leaks have occurred in the existing Telkwa Pass gas pipeline. We know that leaks will occur in an oil pipeline.

32948. I'm kind of feeling that this is a David and Goliath situation and I'm just waiting for our corporate government to start relocating us all as the Chinese did for the Three Gorges Dam.

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

32949. The question is how much oil or condensate will leak? How much, if only a small hole starts spraying? How much loss in pressure will trigger a shutdown? In the event of a major break how much will or could be spilled before such shutdown? How quickly could cleanup occur in remote regions?
32950. Projecting Enbridge -- Enbridge's stated figures of average spillage rates, we can expect a spillage rate of about 94,000 litres per year, presumably per pipeline. Does anyone know the accumulating damage done by this? I rather doubt it.
32951. I've lived here for over 20 years, and I do so by choice, without employment, as I believe the beauty in society provide a better life. I once was the highest paid engineer for my age, in my field, in Calgary. I was a private consulting engineer.
32952. Another question is why does no one seem to respect the natives who have lived here for thousands of years? This is their land and they are saying no to this project. Why is there any question that this project can then proceed?
32953. I have another cap; I am a member of the Green Party of Canada. I've been a member of that for about 16 years and joined it essentially because it became obvious to me that global warming was occurring. Green's care about the next seven generations, let's say 150 years. What's it all going to look like in 150 years' time?
32954. Sometime during that time there is a high probability that there will be a leak in this oil pipeline if it is still going for all that amount of time. All those who would now benefit will likely be long dead. Now, what thanks will the residents alive, people who live here, what thanks will they give to us?
32955. A major reason for many of us who live here speaking is this consideration, we don't want our descendants looking at us and saying why didn't you do anything?
32956. Green's do not believe that one can push through someone else's land against their wishes. This requires negotiation. If the residents are adamant that this will not occur then there must be a really good reason for government to force it.
32957. Just for your information, the Green Party does not provide me with money, other than they give me \$100 to fight elections. I may be a radical but I'm not funded from elsewhere.

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

32958. Now, there's one really interesting point to me on all this and that's, as I understand it, your worthy Panel are to consider the environmental assessment. That's essentially all you're considering. Am I right?
32959. And if that is the case what is the environment? Is the environment where we live in our homes; is it the street outside; is it the town we live in; is it the province we live in; is it the country; is it the world? Just where does the environment begin and where does it end.
32960. We know -- most of us -- we don't like people smoking cigarettes in our homes, it disturbs our environment. We also don't like someone burning rubber tires as our next door neighbour. That's also environment. This oil is destined to go to China, they say, in which case it will be burned and it will pollute the air there. We know that. We know also that it will contribute further to global warming.
32961. So we know that in both cases it is harming the environment. So why is that not an environmental consideration for a pipeline?
32962. The environment is everything to do with our lives. It is the air that we breathe; it's the water we drink; it is everything. We are 70 percent water ourselves. We are dependent upon all aspects of the environment. There is nothing about this project which is supporting the environment.
32963. As I said, I joined because I am perfectly well aware that global warming is occurring. I'm also, since I joined, I'm aware that this valley has been experiencing, every month in the summer, temperatures four to even five degrees warmer than ever we experienced before.
32964. There is absolutely no doubt in my mind that global warming is occurring. Whether it might be occurring for other regions we don't know, but since 95 percent of climate scientists say it's being caused by man's burning of fossil fuels, I think this is rather an important consideration.
32965. So anything to do with this pipeline is to the detriment of the environment and why is that not the most important question, but also why is -- the other most important question, why is it okay to just push through a dangerous project through other peoples' lands?
32966. Thank you very much.

--- (Applause/Applaudissements)

32967. **MEMBER MATTHEWS:** Ms. Boyce, good afternoon. Please go ahead and present.

--- **ORAL STATEMENT BY/EXPOSÉ ORAL PAR MS. JEAN BOYCE:**

32968. **MS. JEAN BOYCE:** Thanks to you, Panel, for listening, and thanks to the Wet'suwet'en people for allowing this to happen here.

32969. I'm here to state my concerns about how this pipeline and the mega project that's behind it will affect me, my family and the communities in which I live and serve.

32970. As a proud citizen of Canada for all the years of my life I wish to tell you how distressed and ashamed I am to be a Canadian at this time. As a nurse, I want my government to start speaking truth to me about all aspects of the health of our nation and to start teaching me how to free myself from my addiction to oil.

32971. The Alberta Tar Sands Project is considered to be the dirtiest source of energy on the planet ever. The pipeline that is proposed to be built from Alberta to the mid-B.C. Coast would be carrying this oily thick slurry of bitumen across extremely rugged mountainous terrains. Footings, mountings and materials would be exposed to extreme temperatures, extreme weather conditions and not even potential, seismic activities.

32972. This land is moving and unstable. The Minister of the Environment says that in one year alone there were over 1,000 earthquakes measured between the Rockies and Haida Gwaii; that's from two to seven in magnitude.

32973. The danger of landslides, breaks and spills over the hundreds of kilometres of pipeline would be tremendous. For most of that distance there would be no one on the ground monitoring on an hourly or daily or weekly or even monthly basis. This is rugged land and hard to access. How often will there be patrols? How much oil would escape in an accidental break or seep before it was noticed?

32974. I understand from a local environmental scientist that there have been at least five major and generally unpublicized breaks in the gas pipeline along the Telkwa Pass, from Telkwa to Terrace.

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

32975. Imagine if that was liquid tar. What creeks and valleys and waterways and precious territories would be ruined forever?
32976. I understand that 700 rivers and creeks would be crossed. How many species and in what numbers would they be killed in the ecosystem or watersheds that would be affected? How many blades of grass and stones along the watercourse and how many pools of water would be covered in black slick and unavailable for life-giving purposes and dealing deaths for myriads of life forms wherever it lies?
32977. And this oil does not go away. Even now, 20 years after the Exxon Valdez went down, you'll find black oil within a foot of the surface sand. Only 5 percent or at most 10 percent of the oil was recovered.
32978. Whatever these people say at Enbridge, they cannot clean up after themselves. Whatever state-of-the-art equipment and strategies they have has been shown to be inadequate. Water tables and water courses have been destroyed with untold amounts and degrees of long-term damage.
32979. The State of Wisconsin sued Enbridge for 545 environmental violations and settled out of court for \$1.1 million. In some cases, taxpayers have had to pay for these inadequate clean-up costs.
32980. Using data from Enbridge's own reports, the Polaris Institute calculated that there have been 804 spills from 1999 to 2010. Approximately 170,000 barrels of crude oil were spilled on the land.
32981. So we know there would be spills and the spills would damage all life in its path. And the path goes on, and on, and on throughout the layers of earth and up and down the food chain. The question is how much oil would be involved in an accident? We are dealing with many thousands of barrels of dirty, mucky oil.
32982. I haven't started to talk about the coast and the tankers. I can barely manage to speak of the desecration that would occur with a tanker accident. I heard from Don yesterday that tankers in the Douglas Channel couldn't right themselves in the wind; they couldn't face themselves to the wind. Oh my God, I never thought of that.
32983. These waters and coastal lands are so precious to me and to my family and to my communities that it's unthinkable what it would be like to have a shipping accident like the Queen of the North or the Valdez.

32984. These waters are unique in all the world. There are flora and fauna that exist here that exist nowhere else on earth. It is one of the richest sea environments that exist in northern waters. It took thousands, millions of years to develop as it has. One accident and huge, irreparable damage, death and destruction occurs on a scale we cannot imagine.
32985. The coastal people gather their delicious, nourishing and beloved seaweed from their traditional family grounds each spring. Everyone loves to eat it and it's dried and frozen for consumption for the rest of the year.
32986. I was told that the Queen of the North -- that the year the Queen of the North went down, it was gathered, but no one could eat it because it tasted so bad. These people depend on the health of the sea to survive and stay healthy.
32987. And the fish -- oh, the fish -- how can we even think of endangering the fish when other fisheries have collapsed and we see the devastating effects on the people, both near and far. We must do all we can to protect the fish. We all have to eat. If we don't jeopardize the means to support the salmon, we could develop our fisheries to continue to feed the world and have a pristine environment.
32988. Other presenters will be able to talk about the science of the fish and the mammals and what must be done to support them. I want to say that fish are so important to me that it's scary, really, really scary to think about an oil spill that could travel to the river mouths at the time of migration of the salmon upstream to spawn. If the pipeline is allowed to go ahead, this is a possible scenario.
32989. This pipeline is proposed to be built into and over virgin, pristine, exquisite lands; lands that are legally still owned by the First Nations people. Roads would be multiple and routes would be created into these lands.
32990. Back country adventures would have new meaning to the motorized humans among us. More and more of us would go further and further into these hitherto private and sacred territories with our powerful gasoline machines to have fun, which often means to hunt and to desecrate.
32991. What do First Nations people say about this use of their territories? If their answer is no pipeline, then my understanding and knowledge is that the federal government should go no further with this process.

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

32992. My community includes the First Nations people and I stand for them and with them on many issues. My experience as a registered nurse working with the Elders tells me that we, as a dominant society, have wrecked unimaginable damage on their families and communities.
32993. As parents now, can you imagine having your children torn from your arms literally and taken away by men with guns? Imagine this happening to you now, here in Canada, your children, your home. Nothing to do with this current issue, think again.
32994. The First Nations people in the west central area of B.C. have been disrespected and violated to such an extent that we will never be able to make up for it. We cannot do enough to right the wrongs, but we can stop the perpetration of disrespect, violence and social genocide.
32995. If this project is stopped and oil spills do not threaten the land or the waters, then the First Nations people can live from their land and continue to grow and to heal.
32996. Another concern that I have is the social aspect of the building of the pipeline. There are many studies about the effects of the development of the gas and oil industry in Scotland and other areas of the world, showing the damage to stable societies.
32997. Clearly, the rapid rise in population, the wild but relatively brief increase in available jobs and wages, the influx of people who figure are helping the workers spend their money; all these will contribute to increased alcoholism, increased gambling, increased prostitution, increased and terrible drug addictions and drug-related crimes, increased sexually transmitted diseases, increased death rates, increased poverty, increased crime, increased violence in the home, increased and further breakdown of families and communities.
32998. How will Enbridge mitigate this predictable series of effects?
32999. A further concern involves political and economic perspectives. Corporate interests are not the same as national interests. Our government has confused the two. Enbridge offers 560 long-term jobs in B.C., but what about protecting the 45,000 jobs currently in existence along the B.C. coast?
33000. Will this tar be refined in China as the Prime Minister has apparently

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

decided? That will cost us 50,000 high quality jobs and then we'll be buying back the oil. To liquidate non-renewable resources as fast as possible is short-sighted at the great expense of long-term security of Canadians. In the long term, oil in the ground is a good asset.

33001. In the words of Ken Stewart:

“On the one hand, we have an oil industry-backed proposal to gamble our economic, social and ecological future on the rapid expansion of the tar sands in a world already suffering from global warming. On the other hand, we have those who want to ramp up our investment in green energy to meet our energy needs without frying the planet. Our grandchildren will thank us for only one of these.”

33002. Thank you.

--- (Applause/Applaudissements)

33003. **MEMBER BATEMAN:** Mr. Cobb, thank you for joining us this afternoon. Please present your oral statement.

--- **ORAL STATEMENT BY/EXPOSÉ ORAL PAR MR. GILL COBB:**

33004. **MR. GILL COBB:** I'm not -- bear with me -- I appreciate your being here. I think this is a very needed and valid process.

33005. My name is Gill Cobb. I'm a man of two countries. One side of my family is Canadian, and the other side of my family is American. I hold two citizenships. I'm privileged to live in this country. I've lived in this country more years than I've ever lived anywhere.

33006. My professional background, as a fact, I was a building inspector by profession in the Province of British Columbia for 20 years. I have an educational background in science, being engineering. I'm not licensed to practice in this country.

33007. I was on the executive of the BOBC, the Building Officials Association of the Province of British Columbia. I worked for several municipalities in that capacity. I've also worked in geotechnical field with geotechnical engineering firms who wrote the standards for this province on reclamation of coal mine sites, slope stabilities.

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

33008. In my work, doing geotechnical work in this province, we were always brought in after the fact. It was -- many of these catastrophes, as I would like to call them I guess, could have been avoided had there been more planning and had there been less involvement on a political basis.
33009. I've had the privilege of working on -- at one point I used to say, on every environmental unsound project in the Province of British Columbia after the fact -- Revelstoke Dam, the site CNE which is under consideration right now at this time, with the dam up the Peace River.
33010. I work for the firm that, in fact, did the studies on that site. I worked for the firm, the same firm that I work for we did Rogers Pass. The work now is just being undertaken or considered for expansion of railway tunnels and things of that nature.
33011. This work was done 20 years ago, 30 years ago. So we're just seeing the fruition of some of these proposed projects. Quite often we make decisions based upon economics opposed to -- opposed to the rational thing to do, without a view to the future. My work always required me to show due diligence. I spent lots of time in court proceedings quite often in my work because of bad decisions.
33012. I guess I'm feeling very vulnerable I guess right now in that I live in -- I'm privileged to live in this area and have been for many, many years of my life, but I see it being dismantled for a dollar. I see it being with no vision to the future for our children and our children's children, and it breaks my heart.
33013. As I came into these hearings today I walked across the parking lot and what did I see -- about 100 sandhill cranes which come each and every year here. And this is one of the few places that they stop in their flights between their wintering grounds and the Gulf of Mexico to their summer feeding and habitat areas which is, in fact, in the Porcupine River area.
33014. I feel privileged in living in a place that I can still see those things. My greatest fear is to see an industrial development of this size and magnitude come to an untouched area such as this.
33015. At one point in my career I had to quit a job because I refused to be involved in the construction of a nuclear power plant as an inspector on site. That power plant today is the Trojan Nuclear Power Plant that sits on the Columbia River.

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

It has been closed down for some time. It was a bad decision. It was a bad idea.

33016. Hanover and Washington State 40 years ago, 50 years ago, was a great idea. It was a new -- new method. It ended up being one of the hottest places in the world. You can see it from outer space; it glows in the dark.
33017. The Columbia River, I worked for the Army Corps of Engineers as a summer student surveying what is now the Dallas Dam, Celilo River or Celilo Falls and the people of the Celilo Nation were relocated 400 feet above where they lived at that time. And most of the salmon are gone from the greatest -- probably some of the greatest salmon runs of the world.
33018. I hope I don't live long enough to see the same happen here.
33019. As a building official I attended many court proceedings that didn't have to be and losses and life, properties that didn't have to be, because of bad decisions. So I implore upon you to make the right decision, somehow, for the future.
33020. I'd like to thank you for coming here and letting me speak. This is very difficult for me, but letting me speak.
33021. I read a book as a young man that changed my life. It was called "Silent Spring" written by a world renowned biologist by the name of Rachel Carson. It changed my life. I decided not, at that time, to proceed with my education in the field that I was in, and I decided to move home to Canada.
33022. I'm proud to be here, and I hope -- I hope my family, my sons, my grandchildren can live and have half the quality of life that I've been able to have in my life.
33023. So thank you once again for coming. You have a tremendous job ahead of you. I can only hope that you can say no in light of all of the knowledge that has been handed to you for this type of development. We can't afford it.
33024. Thank you.
- (Applause/Aplaudissements)
33025. **THE CHAIRPERSON:** Mr. Duerichen, when you're ready, please proceed with your oral statement.

--- ORAL STATEMENT BY/EXPOSÉ ORAL PAR MR. HANS DUERICHEN:

33026. **MR. HANS DUERICHEN:** I also want to say that I'm grateful to the Panel for the opportunity to say a few words and I hope I will be understood.
33027. I moved into this valley over 60 years ago with my parents, and we at that time, until now, came to really cherish its beauty and freedom.
33028. During subsequent years we seen a lot of change. My desire to keep Canada's northwest, a little paradise, is not only a selfish desire. The population of this region is miniscule compared to the rest of the country.
33029. However, I'm not only interested in today, and the time when our children's children's children are alive. If we can keep its' paradisaical condition that long, population-wise it will become much, much more important than it is now.
33030. Canada's recent budget is hailed as looking long-range into the future. I personally do not agree, as it relies too heavily on the sale of our precious resources. In one word, it is unsustainable, though many of us want to prove otherwise.
33031. There are innumerable reasons why this proposed pipeline does not fit into the long-range picture. I concur with the problems of pollution, global warming and inevitable spills, double-hulled tanker explosions and loss of life in rivers and streams, but today I will mention only two other reasons of concern.
33032. Number one, in January 2006, George Bush coined the phrase, "America is addicted to oil". Yes, things have really changed. When I moved into the valley we had no electricity, no running water, no car. But we were happy. Yes, our standard living has come up drastically, but at what cost?
33033. Sadly, I have some experience with the consequences of addictions. In order to satisfy cravings, an addict requires more and more and more.
33034. Recently, we've heard about the natives in northern Ontario where about 10,000 have legally become addicted to OxyContin. Well Purdue Pharma has gotten rich at the expense of ruining thousands of lives. This, to me, is criminal.
33035. It's also unsustainable. If not controlled in some way the addict eventually self-destructs. Well, why do I talk about this? I see a grave parallel between drug

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

addiction and fossil fuel addiction; we need more and more and more of this finite resource.

33036. You know, we try to put drug traffickers in jail. Drug traffickers are enablers. They help the drug addict get more and more. I see the pipeline being akin to the drug traffickers. The only difference is that we don't put pipeline companies in jail, yet.

33037. If we are to give future generations any kind of hope we need to invest the billions now used to get future oil to China, for finding and implementing ways to curb our fossil fuel appetite.

33038. As addicts progress in their addictions they become desperate and they will go to any length to get their fix. Why would we want to enable China, a much larger populated country than ours, to become more addicted?

33039. There is another addiction that plays together with this. We are addicted to goods made in China. Our addiction to Chinese goods has resulted in a Canadian trade deficit of 30 to \$40 billion a year with China. We realize it's a major problem.

33040. In my engineering studies at UBC, I learned about mathematical equations like $Ax^2 + By = C$. A constant. The left side of the equation has to equal the right side. Anything else just doesn't work; hence the pressure of giving our precious resources to China.

33041. That is a short term solution. However, in future do we really want heavily addicted Chinese as our neighbours? I mean, literally, with our dollars they're buying up our industry and our land.

33042. We sing "Oh Canada, the true north strong and free, keep our land glorious and free, we stand on guard". I ask -- excuse me -- are we standing on guard?

33043. I feel responsible, first to Canadians, including the First Nations, who were here way before us. I say let the Chinese become addicted from somewhere else. And let us buy "Made in Canada" before it's too late.

33044. Now, number two; in science we learn something about hysteresis loss. That may be new to some of you. It is the energy you lose when converting one form of energy into another.

33045. For instance, when you transform the energy of the gas in your tank to horsepower in your car, you get at most 20 percent, the rest is heat. Mind you, you may be happy for that heat when it's minus 30, but usually you don't need it.
33046. This is loss, this loss is usually irretrievable. It's lost forever. It is waste. You are of course aware how we have become a people of waste, a throw away society. But how bad is it really?
33047. Well, again, back to my family, my dad spent 25 years on this country. He did all he could not to be wasteful. Since we had no car we couldn't take our garbage very far. So we found a place to dump it on our land.
33048. When he died, this dump was a pile about eight foot in diameter and no more than 18 inches high. Well I ask you, how big your own pile would be in 25 years?
33049. Not only do we experience a hysteresis loss in the transformation of energy, but in the transporting of that energy. Let's take an example. It takes energy to make the machinery for taking the tar sands from the ground. Then it takes energy to transform it to a form you can run it through a pipeline. It takes a lot of energy to pump it to Kitimat.
33050. It takes energy to build the supertankers; it takes energy to load the supertankers, then it takes tons of fuel to run the supertankers to China.
33051. Then it still needs to be transformed into useful products like gasoline. And then wherever that goes, the gasoline needs to be transported to the customer. Then he just gets 20 percent of that energy that he buys. Is that wasteful? At least we could eliminate much waste by not transporting oil across the Atlantic for us and then send our oil halfway across the world.
33052. As an engineer I've spent many years searching alternative energies. These energy sources are more feasible than many believe. I have been involved extensively with energy from biomass. Thirty-four (34) years ago, I founded RSF Energy here in Smithers, which included a factory that built 50,000 wood burning furnaces and fireplaces over 20 years.
33053. Today, the BC Forest Service will confirm that we have enough dead pine in B.C. to heat every home and business in B.C. for the next 15 years. A tremendous

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

saving of fossil fuel usage compared to how we keep warm at the present. Another 15 years we'll have much more biomass. It is sustainable.

33054. Now, we worry about smoke from fossil fuels, we've already have technology to be smokeless. Some of which I have designed and installed, even in this area, smokeless boilers. Over 100 years, technology is also available. There is enough land in northwest farmers to produce all the fuel we need. And I won't go into that detail.

33055. There is the old saying, "Waste not want not". This is still true today. I say let us conserve our precious, finite energy resource and not give them away to China.

33056. Thank you.

--- (Applause/Applaudissements)

33057. **THE CHAIRPERSON:** Thank you to each of you for being here today with us.

--- (A short pause/Courte pause)

33058. **MEMBER MATTHEWS:** Okay good afternoon everyone. And we'll begin with Mr. Glover.

33059. Thanks.

--- **ORAL STATEMENT BY/EXPOSÉ ORAL PAR MR. PAUL GLOVER:**

33060. **MR. PAUL GLOVER:** Thank you, Sheila, Hans, and Ken, for coming here to hear us. Welcome back to Smithers. We appreciate the opportunity to take part in this process.

33061. I understand that you'd rather not hear things that you've already heard from other presenters so I'll try to tell you some things you haven't heard yet.

33062. My name is Paul Glover. I am 57 years old. I've lived in the Bulkley Valley for 37 years and have raised my three daughters here. I plan to spend the rest of my life here. I chose this area for its wild landscapes, its intact ecosystems and clean water. I greatly value that I can safely drink from any mountain stream, and I

do.

33063. I know that you've heard a lot about the instability of the land along the proposed pipeline's route. You've surely heard of the dozens of incidents where landslides in this region have cut power lines, closed roads, blocked rivers, taken out railways, even pushing a freight train into the Skeena in 1978, and severed pipelines.

33064. You know that we already have some pipelines in this area that carry natural gas to the communities and industries across the region, and you're no doubt aware that since the time they were built in the late 1960s, these pipelines have fairly routinely been ruptured by landslides. These include incidents where gas was cut off to communities for days at a time.

33065. You have probably heard that in late November 2003, the natural gas pipeline to Prince Rupert was washed out by a landslide. This is a different landslide than Linda McDougall described earlier today.

33066. But I doubt that you're familiar with the comments that Attorney General Rich Coleman delivered in the B.C. provincial legislature three days after the slide. This is what he said:

"The landslide actually took place on Friday. It was about 1,000 feet across, about 350 metres. It took out a natural gas pipeline. This is an event that takes place in this particular area of British Columbia about once every two to three years. There's a lot of unstable ground there and it does cause some difficulties. The gas line was taken out. Over the weekend, we were unable to actually get in there to repair the line because the unstable ground was still there and the weather was too severe for people to get in there. They are working on it now. They expect to try and get in there and finish this to get the gas line operating in the next three to five days."

33067. That's from Hansard of the B.C. legislature, Monday December 1st, 2003.

33068. It turned out that Prince Rupert was actually without natural gas for 10 days. That's how difficult it can be to get in and fix a pipeline.

33069. Now, when the gas pipeline was being planned, if someone had said, as someone surely must have, "I'm concerned that your gas pipeline will be hit by a landslide and break", do you think that Pacific Northern Gas would have replied, "Well, yes, that might happen; there are a lot of landslides around there"? No, of

course they would not say that.

33070. Any company in that position will assert that the very latest and best technology is being used; that thorough risk assessments have been done; that the route has been carefully chosen; that they can deal with any problems; that they care about the environment more than anything else, and so on. They might even say, “We have lots of pipelines in Alberta and Saskatchewan and they are never hit by landslides.”

--- (Laughter/Rires)

33071. **MR. PAUL GLOVER:** A company does what it needs to, to meet its objectives, which are primarily to make profits. I have no doubt that this is Enbridge’s primary objective too, and I believe that Enbridge is overlooking the obvious risks of operating in this terrain, blinded, as it is, by the pot of gold it sees waiting at the end of the rainbow in Kitimat.

33072. For this reason, I am not comforted by Enbridge’s reassurances of how its modern technology will make its pipeline safe through some of the most unstable terrain on earth.

33073. You, Panel Members, might know Don Thompson, past President of the Oil Sands Producer Group. You probably don’t know, though, that he was scheduled to speak to the Smithers Chamber of Commerce on October 21st last fall about the benefits of tar sands oil production.

33074. We could expect that he would also have put in a few good words for the Northern Gateway pipeline, but we actually don’t know what he would have said because he didn’t get to make his presentation. He had to drive from Terrace to Smithers that morning and the highway was blocked by a landslide.

33075. This landslide was cleaned up within a couple days, but it came down the same path as a much larger one had in 2007, blocking the highway for days and burying two people in their vehicle, killing them. If you have driven that stretch of road as you carry out your work during this review process, you will have passed the large pile of stones at the side of the road that is their memorial cairn.

33076. There’s no warning that one of these slides is about to occur except that precipitation is often a factor, something we have lots of in the coast mountains, and also almost all climate models predict increasing warmer and wetter weather for this

area. More landslides can be expected.

33077. Others have already brought up Enbridge's pipeline spill into Michigan's Kalamazoo River in the context of Enbridge's record of 804 pipeline spills between 1999 and 2010, most of them very small, Enbridge hastens to clarify, but not the Kalamazoo spill that the EPA estimates leaked more than a million gallons of Alberta crude into the river, but you already know this.

33078. The point I want to make is that the spill occurred in flat country, easy to access, with many resources nearby to draw from, yet it has still proved to be much harder to clean up than Enbridge or the EPA anticipated. By the time it is finally done to the satisfaction of the EPA, work will have been ongoing for more than two years straight.

33079. EPA on-scene coordinator Ralph Dollhopf says that Enbridge has struggled to locate all the oil. "Every time we go back to look we find more" he is quoted as saying. "The river is causing the oil we are targeting to always move."

33080. Please consider, Ken, Hans, and Sheila, that our waterways are quite different than the easily navigable Kalamazoo. If the river there is moving the oil around, imagine what our whitewater streams and rivers would do with it, particularly in the spring and fall freshet.

33081. And what else do I take from this? That Enbridge is quick to say how prepared they are in case there is a spill, how expert they are at cleaning one up, but really it's clear they don't have much of a handle on what's involved. No one does. It's a nearly impossible task. If oil gets into our rivers, it will be there for a long time.

33082. And, finally, you have certainly heard about the Enbridge pipeline outside Chicago that was ruptured and burst into flames when it was struck by a force of nature that is perhaps even more unpredictable than landslides; that is young men in cars.

33083. In this case, they were drag racing on a closed road. Most people don't realize that this pipeline is buried for most of its length except for a 30 or 40-foot stretch that is aboveground, and this is the part that happened to be hit. What are the chances of that? Quite slim, certainly.

33084. Do you think this possibility ever crossed anyone's mind during the risk assessment? It is very difficult to factor unpredictable human actions into these

assessments, and yet it is often just such actions that cause problems.

33085. My point here is that I take no comfort in a green-light risk assessment regarding oil pipeline infrastructure in an environment that we know is unpredictable and unstable. We can confidently predict that there will be floods and landslides. There may be earthquakes.

33086. What else could possibly occur that we cannot even imagine as we contemplate this project from our homes and offices, our coffee shops and our community halls, our riverbanks and our ocean beaches?

33087. Thank you.

--- (Applause/Applaudissements)

33088. **MEMBER BATEMAN:** Mr. Goodacre, thank you for joining us. Please present your oral statement.

--- **ORAL STATEMENT BY/EXPOSÉ ORAL PAR MR. BILL GOODACRE:**

33089. **MR. BILL GOODACRE:** Okay. And thank you, Panel, for coming here. And again, thanks to the Wet'suwet'en for participating and inviting us to be here as well.

33090. My name is Bill Goodacre. I was born in this town 60 years ago, just five or six blocks down the road in a hospital here.

33091. My Scottish and English ancestors arrived in the City of Victoria, which was just a little tiny village, in the 1850s. One of those ancestors, a fellow by the name of Black Jack McDonnell, had married a woman from one of the First Nations of that area and had 12 children.

33092. And when she died in 1897, he moved up to the Klondike and then made his way down into this area and ended up in this valley about the time that they were building the railroad. So we've got a long, long history in this community. And my grandfather started up a grocery business here in 1937 that operated until 2006. We have strong, strong ties in this community.

33093. Myself, I've been involved in public life. I'm on the Smithers Town Council right now. I'm serving my fifth term. And then for five years, from '96 to

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

2001, I served as the MLA for Bulkley Valley-Stikine which Smithers is part of.

33094. At that time, Bulkley Valley-Stikine ran from Prince -- from Atlin, in the north, to Burns Lake. So the route of the proposed pipeline went through the southern part of -- or the eastern part of this riding.
33095. And so I go to -- in that time, one of the main things that really appealed to me about being the representative for this area is that we have an incredible -- there's over 20 First Nations in an about this region. And in that particular session of the legislature, I was part of the government caucus at the time that passed the Nisga'a Treaty.
33096. So I was quite involved with the Nisga'a Treaty as part of the government caucus. As a matter of fact, we spent 40 hours in caucus going through the Treaty line by line.
33097. But one of the things about that particular process that really, really sticks in my mind was that an anthropologist gave us sort of a background on the Nisga'a people, their history and their culture. And he came to the point where he was explaining the clan system that the Nisga'a people have.
33098. And the Premier at the time was sitting around the table and he's, you know, a very strong proponent of the Treaty, but he asked the question, "Is the clan system still relevant to the Nisga'a people today?"
33099. Well, to many of us, that doesn't strike us as a really strange question to ask, but to a First Nations person who's familiar with -- and is living in this part of the world especially -- it's an absolutely ignorant question.
33100. I remember meeting with a group of Gitksan youth in the Hazelton area and the topic of their cultural sovereignty was coming up, and this one young lady said that everybody -- everybody knows we're Gitksan. And so I told her this little story about the Premier and the look on her face, she was absolutely flabbergasted. The rest of Canada doesn't understand how they live and what's important to them.
33101. In the -- you know, the time that I spent in public life working with First Nations, I made -- well, I learned so, so very much. And a story came up one time. A beautiful, beautiful woman from -- another Gitksan woman from the Hazelton area, Marie Wilson, was one of their speakers, and she wrote a little piece one time about this whole protected area strategy that we're so proud of in this part of the world.

33102. As you go down the west coast of British Columbia, you've got the Tatshenshini; you've got the Khutzeymateen; you've got the Kitlope. You've got all these protected areas. You've got the Spatsizi further inland.
33103. And yet, she was saying that for people from western cultures, this idea of protecting things is really, really big news. But to the First Nations, what are you protecting? I mean, like this is -- they live out here. Everything is part of everything. And one of her fears was that perhaps we're protecting it from them, and maybe she wasn't wrong.
33104. And what I'm getting at in a roundabout way is that we live with images and that story of the Premier really relates to it. Like the education that we get in non First Nations society about First Nations is wholly inadequate and it feeds into certain stereotypes that allows us to marginalize First Nations.
33105. I was born in 1951 and that was the year that the Government of Canada repealed certain repressive legislation that prevented people -- First Nations people -- from celebrating their feasts, the Potlatch laws, prevented them from gathering in numbers more than three to discuss land claims, prevented them from hiring a lawyer to represent them in terms of land issues, 1951.
33106. It wasn't until early 1960s that the federal government permitted First Nations people in this country to vote. The residential schools weren't closed until the 1970s. I mean, the marginalization of this group of people is huge, but the thing is there's a resurgence amongst First Nations and you guys have really, really witnessed it. I mean, everywhere you go, you are being reminded that the First Nations people are both politically and culturally getting stronger.
33107. But the thing is what about the rest of us and what about our governments; what are we doing? The thing is, in 1997 the *Delgamuukw* case came through and I happened to be in the legislature at the time. I was really, really excited because the Gitksan and the Wet'suwet'en are, of course, in this riding. I was their representative in Victoria at the time when that court case came down.
33108. And I remember going to both the Premier and the Minister just really eager that this is an opportunity for us to do more and to get truly involved in making some real, real gains. And I was just shocked at the attitude that the political advisors, the lawyers, I mean, this is like, we will not recognize any land unless the First Nations can prove it in court.

33109. Well, we have a treaty process that does not allow the issue of title to be discussed at the treaty table. If you want to talk about title, you have to leave the treaty table holding a whole bunch of debts for being at that table for many, many years and take your chances with the court. The government will not deal directly with them.
33110. That is just -- so this worries me because the rights and title issue is germane to this and like we've had since *Delgamuukw*, this referral to First Nations, but the thing is it's become a routine checklist. Okay, did you get the laundry? Did you check with the First Nations? You know, I mean, like that's almost as bad as it is.
33111. When in fact what *Delgamuukw* was saying: "We're all here to stay." And the thing is we're supposed to be crafting a partnership because what *Delgamuukw* said is that Aboriginal title was not extinguished. But it went further; it created a test for what Aboriginal title is, but that's a test the government wants to stay away from.
33112. The closest they came to it was the case in the Nemaiah Valley where the judge ruled that perhaps they'd fit the criteria but that wasn't in their pleading. So on a technicality they turned it away.
33113. But within three months of that decision coming down, the Forest Service came right back to that First Nation and asked them if they had any rights and interests in the Nemaiah Valley because it was another -- you know, like three months after that case came down, just to indicate the level of interest and awareness that we have here. And I could go on, and on; I'm going to be running out of time.
33114. But the thing that really bothers me about this process is the short shift -- I mean, you folks are great. You're holding all the hearings; you're listening and I appreciate you're listening with good intentions and good faith.
33115. It's the government that concerns me, because the remarks coming out of the government, both at the provincial level when we're dealing with -- not the issue of the pipeline, but other resource-based issues, and in this case with the pipeline where there's very little serious concern directed towards the fact that we're supposed to be in a genuine partnership with the people whose title has not been extinguished, whose title is alive and it's a real thing, but there's two other levels of government that have to sit down and make it real.

33116. And my case here is it's window-dressing and this particular project is in the middle of this and it's clearly a tremendous insult to the *Delgamuukw* case. I mean, the Supreme Court of Canada has more or less instructed us about our responsibilities to the First Nations and we pay lip service at the government level, indeed we do.

33117. And with that, I'm thanking you again for being here and please, please turn this thing down until the government has the fortitude to sit down seriously with the First Nations about this issue.

33118. Thank you.

--- (Applause/Applaudissements)

33119. **THE CHAIRPERSON:** Ms. Goodacre, when you're ready, please proceed.

--- ORAL STATEMENT BY/EXPOSÉ ORAL PAR MS. MARY-ETTA GOODACRE:

33120. **MS. MARY-ETTA GOODACRE:** Thank you.

33121. I'm Mary-Etta Goodacre. I consider myself an amateur naturalist, an amateur everything actually. I'm humbled by the speeches that I got to hear and I believe everything they said. I'll try to mention a few things not mentioned just now.

33122. My family lives in Alaska. We know that the Exxon Valdez accident could have been prevented because the First Nations did not want that big Alaska pipeline and the tankers going out of Valdez.

33123. They were reluctant to sign, but they were told, "Look, we'll give jobs to your men to pilot tugs to direct the tankers through the narrow passage. And we will have radar on our ships. And we will have cleanup equipment to quickly take care of any spill."

33124. So they reluctantly signed. A few years later, you know, the company gets careless. They know the radars break down. They don't care. They don't repair them. And then Exxon Valdez accident happened.

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

33125. The radar wasn't working. They had stopped using the Natives to pilot the tugs. They had failed to put cleanup equipment on the nearby island that they had promised to do. They didn't keep their word.
33126. The corporations won't keep their word. The bottom line is all they have to think about. We do not require them to have a green bottom line. Corporations are psychopaths and we know that. You cannot trust them.
33127. I was living on a little float houseboat in the Turtle Island group between Bamfield and Ucluelet in 1971 -- no, the winter of '71- '72 when the Vanlene ship hit a rock in a very stormy, foggy winter. They thought they were in Seattle Harbour and they were way north. And 400 brand new Toyotas were aboard. They were able to helicopter off, I think 100, and the other 300 went down with the ship.
33128. And there again, probably that pilot told his boss, "The radar's broke." "Don't worry about it, just go anyway." I'm sure that's what happened. In other words, they get careless over time.
33129. So the tanker part of the route is very worrisome for me. You know, Enbridge can say, "We have good technology. We can make pipelines in the mountains, across the rivers."
33130. But they are not responsible for the tanker route. They'll be hiring any little tanker company from Haiti or whatever flag and we will not be in control.
33131. I don't even want the tar sands to be developed like a gold mine, expanding, expanding, Chinese money and I don't know who money, American, whatever. I would even say it's time that we think about closing it down.
33132. You know, I hear it takes 40 percent energy to get 60 percent, you know, by the time you heat up that sand and waste precious water. You're just getting a fraction. So it's energy, foolish to even do it, let alone the environmental damage and the cancers downriver, et cetera.
33133. I'm wishing our government would help us get off our fossil fuel addiction and start us taking steps down. I wish our government would have a symposium of what's our strategy for the next 100 years, maybe even 200 years. Let alone, you know, how long is an election? Three years. Not long enough to plan.
33134. So they want growth because they think, you know, that's how our

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

economy works. Well, maybe our economy needs to be revamped. Growth cannot continue.

33135. Our country thinks, "Oh we're doing okay." That's because we're selling our children's future. Will they have fossil fuel? I don't think we're thinking about that.

33136. And I don't like the idea that we're selling it to China when America's going to be wanting it. America won't go hungry and let us ship to China; let me tell you they won't.

33137. You know, that's the bully nation of the world. They crushed Iraq, a middle-class country, just because they hungered for their oil. They crushed Libya, Afghanistan. They want to go into Iran and Syria, the countries with oil.

33138. And they'll come in here too if they haven't already made a deal with Harper. I'm not sure if that might have happened, you know, that Harper be his little colony. I don't know. All I know is that America is evil and out of control these days, controlled by an evil cabal that's doing ghastly things.

33139. I wish we could find out what energy they used to pulverize the two twin towers. It seems to be they used the energy off of hurricane Erin. That's a new energy source. And here they used it for a weapon of mass destruction of their own people and 23 Canadians.

33140. If Cheney comes back, I'm going to have him arrested as the terrorist who did 9/11. I think he did, and he's guilty for 23 deaths of Canadians. He has property on Telkwa High Road here, and I mean it. I'm getting -- I want us to get strong and stand up to that insanity.

33141. My husband and I use our bicycles year-round. We burn wood. We try to reduce our lifestyle. We think of our grandchildren and hope that they will have fuel to have a comfortable life in our northern country.

33142. And I can do even more with the help of government. I want the government to help us. The northwest here is plagued with a lot of disease, diabetes, heart disease, high blood pressure. All that's related to not enough activity. And to stop using cars and to do a little more of our own walking and biking and using human power might make us healthier. And I wish the government would help us with that.

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

33143. So, let's see, the First Nations don't want this pipeline. I will stand beside them. I will put my life up. I really don't want it either. I'm so proud of them and they need our help to stand up with them.

33144. I want our country to be strong and economically sensible, but we don't have to be wealthy. We can be sustainable and use renewable resources and learn new ways of doing things.

33145. I lived on Long Beach before it was a park and I know that some winters, especially winter, the oil from the tankers' bilge water -- even bilge water would come ashore and leave gobs on the beach. You could not use the beaches without getting it all over your shoes. This was not even a spill; this was just bilge water.

33146. And to have all these tankers coming in the winter, what are they going to do with their bilge? I just know that this bitumen is very messy and it's kind of like selling raw logs to ship it to China to be processed. If we're going to dig it up, and I vote not to dig it up ---

33147. Yes, thank you.

33148. **THE CHAIRPERSON:** Thank you, Mrs. Goodacre.

--- (Applause/Aplaudissements)

33149. **MEMBER MATTHEWS:** Thank you. Mr. Hallman.

--- **ORAL STATEMENT BY/EXPOSÉ ORAL PAR MR. JAY HALLMAN:**

33150. **MR. JAY HALLMAN:** Ladies and gentlemen, Panel Members, thank you for this opportunity to speak.

33151. Is this loud enough here?

33152. My name is Jay Hallman. I came to this valley 30 years ago, and the reasons I came here, rather than any other place I could of moved to, are much the same reasons that most people that come here are -- it is far from the maddening crowds; it is -- the air is clean; the water is pristine, and there is much wilderness to experience here in just about any way that you want to experience it. And my two children love living here as well.

33153. A little bit about myself; I'm a surveyor by trade and lately, for the last 20 years or more, I've been working in the mining exploration industry which, you know, has its issues.

33154. I've been involved with some -- with various mining projects and one very large one for the last 10 years. It was a gold mine project in the Arctic, and you might ask what this got to do with this project here but nothing more than while I was working there, as part of this I was a part of a project that was consuming what I thought to be ridiculous amounts of fuel just building this gold mine.

33155. And it's a gold mine, so you have a gold mine in the Arctic. You know, what's that for? Do we need more gold? I'm not really that sure that we do but anyway, it's a job; it's life. And the project has come to a grinding halt here. Recently the company that owned the project decided that it could make better money in Africa and Indonesia.

33156. So five or 600 people lost their jobs. That was a 2 to \$3 billion project, just to give you an idea of the size of it. But it was nothing; it paled; it was a drop in the bucket compared to this project here that we're talking about.

33157. In terms of fuel consumption just, you know, just the fuel we'll use to mix with one pipeline load coming from Alberta to this coast is probably the annual consumption of the entire mine, and that was a big mine or going to be a big mine.

33158. This project could impact me in a financial way. I could possibly get a job working on it and my employees as well for a few months. That's not going to happen. I'm not interested in that and neither are my employees I've been told.

33159. For all the reasons that have been, you know, put forth by all the people previous to me and all the people you're about to hear, coming up here and describing in so many eloquent and passionate ways, this project is a bad idea. And I would not feel comfortable -- I don't think I could -- I don't think I'd have any respect in the community, and amongst my friends certainly if I did choose to work on it, unless it was working to help stop it.

--- (Laughter/Rires)

33160. **MR. JAY HALLMAN:** I have surveyed for the oil industry before, in Alberta, on pipelines in fact, little pipelines; pipelines that gather the oil from wells

and transport it to refineries and where it's processed.

33161. But after a year of that frenzied activity and life in Alberta -- I'd lived in Alberta previous to that as well working for the national parks. But at any rate, I escaped the frenzied activity of Alberta and moved back to B.C. where I was originally from and to Smithers. I'm not originally from Smithers.
33162. But anyway, on that refinery issue, I find it -- I am curious as to why this bitumen, this crude, would not be processed, if it must be exported and I'm not saying it should be. I'm not agreeing that that's a good idea.
33163. But if we are to go that route, why ship a raw material? Why ship any raw material from this country? That's a larger issue. You know, logs, shipping of raw logs, it's been described -- can folks hear me okay out there?
33164. It's been described as, you know, it provides jobs for British Columbians, and it still doesn't make any sense to me. I've had sensible, reasonable people describe how, yeah those logs -- well those trees wouldn't get cut, there wouldn't be those jobs if they didn't export them as raw logs.
33165. And my answer to that is well just leave them in the ground. Let 'em grow. Like, let 'em be there. We'll get to them when we get to them, you know. They'll be a wonderful ecosystem for all the other living creatures around them at the same time.
33166. Anyway, I digress here a little bit. But for the sake of our environment and our economy, and indeed our sovereignty, this whole exporting of raw materials has got to come to an end.
33167. I say our sovereignty because at this point, you know, we don't even own the trees. I mean they're already owned by foreign entities, probably Chinese companies, I don't know, certainly American companies, and it's the same with our oil, and often with our minerals as well.
33168. We've sold the country. Brian Mulroney, what did he say in New York many years ago? "Canada's open for business". You can paraphrase that by just saying Canada's for sale. And indeed globalization, that's our problem. You gotta love it.
33169. Anyway, much has been said about the environmental risks this pipeline is

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

going to have as it passes through our mountains and the destruction of ecosystems that could occur and the spills that will occur are going to destroy something. How big? How much? That's still the question.

33170. Half a million barrels of oil a day or more or something around that number, can you envision, can you picture what a half a million barrels of oil looks like?
33171. Was that my yellow light?
33172. Half a million barrels of oil is like -- imagine barrels laid end-to-end, that would be like from here to McBride. Okay, I'm just trying to convey a size of a spill that could be possible here in this valley if a pipe was to rupture. That amount of oil, I mean that's going from McBride to Kitimat in a day, that's pretty fast. This stuff is not just slowly oozing through that pipe.
33173. Then there's this matter of this other distillate going in the other direction. I want to ask some questions on that. This is supposedly a mixture of hydrocarbons and chemicals. And what chemicals and what hydrocarbons exactly, I'm not sure. I haven't been able to find that out.
33174. And I'm wondering if this is perhaps proprietary information, that is -- as in the fracking industry, they're not required to divulge because it's, you know, infringe on a patent. We've got to know what this stuff is. What's going to happen when that stuff hits the river? You know, it comes out of a pipe, is it just going to evaporate in thin air and blow on back to Alberta? I doubt it.
33175. Anyway, Panel, you want to know what my views on this project are regarding the public interest and that would be economic and environmental.
33176. The economic interest, it may be positive for a few months during the construction and that increased economic activity may be a good thing -- may be considered to be a good thing but it may not be a good thing.
33177. Others prefer a quieter level of activity around them and don't want that social upheaval that a large number of -- an influx of workers from outside the province would bring. You know then they're gone. A quieter level of activity is the reason I moved here and -- otherwise, I'd be in a city or back in Alberta.
33178. Once the pipeline is built, the economic driver is not there, there's not

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

going to be the jobs around to justify it, not that there would be anyway.

33179. And in terms of the economy nationally, not just locally here but nationally, we're far better off to be self-sufficient as far as our oil is concerned nationally. Why not burn this oil or use this oil in the eastern part of the country instead of importing it from OPEC. That would be also far more -- infinitely more sensible in terms of the use of -- production of carbon.
33180. And then transportation of this oil -- the transportation of this oil to China is beyond belief. Shipping, shipping through these -- there's going to be pollution. I'm rushing here. Sorry folks but.
33181. There will be air pollution, water pollution, noise pollution from these ships as they pass up and down these channels.
33182. It's not a maybe, like if there's going to be a spill, they're going to be pumping their ballasts or their tanks as they come back in, and I'm sure they don't have filters, you know, on these -- unless there's -- technology has certainly improved a lot since I've been, you know, walking on the beaches that are covered with balls of oil back in the Caribbean, but that's another story.
33183. Anyway, I'm red-lighted here already. I can't believe it. How did it happen?
33184. Thank you very much, Panel, ladies and gentlemen.
- (Applause/Aplaudissements)
33185. **THE CHAIRPERSON:** Thank you, to all of you, for presenting with us this -- presenting to us this afternoon.
- (A short pause/Courte pause)
33186. **MEMBER BATEMAN:** Hello, Ms. Havard, you're our first speaker on this set. Please begin.
- **ORAL STATEMENT BY/EXPOSÉ ORAL PAR MS. ANNE HAVARD:**
33187. **MS. ANNE HAVARD:** Hi. I'm Anne Havard. I was born and raised in the valley. I'm an artist, have been for about 30 years. And I've moved away many

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

times but I always -- I call it -- the Bulkley Valley the black hole because it keeps sucking me back in. It's such a wonderful place to live, very easy, not expensive, and as an artist that's fairly important to me.

33188. I have -- I spent four days working on a statement and then I got here and realized that most of what I had written down had already been said. So there are some things that haven't -- that I haven't heard said that I think come from another direction. So bear with me if I have to stop and think about things, I've got a messy paper here, everything crossed out.

33189. So I'd sort of like to discuss the energy trends around the world, which I see -- which are affecting more and more -- affected more and more by global warming. So I don't quite understand why we are trying to speed things up by building this huge pipeline, shipping things out as fast as possible, and as cheaply as possible to another country.

33190. I'm of the opinion that the Harper government is totally out of touch with these trends. We should be slowing down the bleeding of the earth's energy reserves not speeding it up.

33191. Then there's the sociological geography of the land that the pipeline is going to go through. There are extremely high wilderness values, tourism values and economic values because Canada has one of the lowest population densities, stablest political systems in the world, some of the best documented preserved and showcased ancient native cultural heritage sites, and many different land claims still in various stages of incompleteness. You've heard that many times.

33192. We have also one of the most pristine and well protected wilderness river systems, riparian systems and marine environments in the world.

33193. All of this is worth a lot of money to the rest of the world, which is becoming much more crowded and lacking in the values that we are so lucky to have here. Those values don't get added up on a financial bank statement.

33194. And, of course, these values will lose a whole lot if the Harper government manages to push through his newest proposed legislation, gutting the present environmental protection guidelines. So we're at a big risk of losing a whole lot of value -- financial value here.

33195. The political geography of the land that the pipeline is going through,

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

large multinational corporations that exist in the country have much more political clout than Canadian residents have or -- and that includes Canadian politicians, just because of the way the laws are set up, large multinational corporations also have much more financial clout than Canadian residents, including politicians, once more because of laws that have been put in place not -- that don't deal with present circumstances.

33196. And in spite of the company's publicly stated objectives, thousands of litres of dangerous fluids are going to be going into the environment every year with no legal recourse because of the lack of new laws being set up.

33197. Now, who has the potential to gain from this pipeline going through? Big banks have a lot to gain. The following is a list of Enbridge's main lead or co-lead underwriters. These are the banks that help Enbridge fund its major projects. So these bank loans are in millions of U.S. dollars.

33198. The Toronto Dominion Securities of Canada has loaned \$7,325 million U.S. to Enbridge; Scotiabank of Canada has lent \$5,286 million U.S. to Enbridge; the Bank of America has lent \$1,624 million U.S. to Enbridge; the Royal Bank -- sorry, Wells Fargo U.S. has lent \$1,233 million U.S. to Enbridge.

33199. Now these numbers are just staggering. I don't know if anybody can relate to them. The Deutch Bank of Germany has lent \$633 million to Enbridge; the Bank of Switzerland has lent \$603 million to Enbridge and the Bank of Britain has lent \$466 million to Enbridge. This data coming from the Rainforest Action Network.

33200. So there's lots of revenue coming into these -- or interest revenue coming into these banks that totally puts them in another whole area of power mongering or power, sort of being able to push things through.

33201. And the following are just a few of Enbridge's main buyers -- and there's a lot of political oomph here -- ExxonMobile or Imperial Oil, Husky, BP, which had that huge spill in the Gulf of Mexico, British Petroleum, Statoil Canada, Chevron, Shell and Syncrude; huge companies that have incredible political clout. How can we possibly, as citizens of Canada, stand up to that?

33202. Enbridge is pushing hard for the Gateway pipeline to proceed in order to create new markets for tar sands crude which will in turn create new opportunities for building more pipeline infrastructure elsewhere.

33203. So it all builds on itself. It's like a big snowball, that as it gets bigger it just has more and more power and more and more oomph and all the citizens around the world are left with nothing.

33204. Another reason for the Enbridge prioritizing the Gateway is that they fear the United States is rethinking its reliance on dirty oil from the Alberta tar sands. The company stated in its 2009 annual report that, quote:

“Flow restrictions of dirty oil sands products to the United States would increase interest in exports to Asia and consequently increase interest in projects like Enbridge’s Northern Gateway Project.”

33205. So you can see where the motivation is coming from.

33206. And then there are -- now coming from an artist's perspective, these numbers just -- I've been living on less than \$10,000 a year for the last 10 years of my life and I'm fine. I mean, I'm not starving, I'm not hungry, I've got decent clothing on my back, I have a decent vehicle, I go visit my son down in Southern Alberta at least once a year, I go on a holiday once a year and that's living on 10,000 to \$12,000 a year.

33207. Okay, here's the salaries of the Enbridge CEO's; Patrick Daniel, the President and CEO and a member of the Enbridge Board of Directors, his 2010 salary was 8 million -- I'll just leave it at 8 million, which is 230 average Canadian salaries.

33208. Richard Bird, the Executive Vice-President who is responsible for all financial affairs of the company, his 2010 salary was 2,703,311 or 77 average Canadian salaries. The average Canadian salary I figured out online was \$35,000. That's three times more than I make a year. Okay, so we just put things in perspective here.

33209. Stephen J. Wuori, Executive Vice-President, his 2010 salary, 2,700,000 or 77 average Canadian shares. Al Monaco, Executive Vice-President, Major Products, his 2010 salary was 2,648,979 or 75 annual Canadian salaries.

33210. And the last one, Steven Letwin, Executive Vice-President of Gas, Transportation and International Operations, his 2010 salary was \$2,590,922 or 74 average salaries.

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

33211. If you add up those five employees or those five executive salaries, that adds up to \$18,760,436 per year in salaries and bonuses or you can employ 536 people for a year with the average salary of \$35,000 a year.
33212. So, you know, I mean where are our priorities here? If all that oil, and that's where most of the money is going for this oil, these pipelines, is to keep those people in business. Those are only five. You know, like how many people does Enbridge employ? At what wages?
33213. Okay, but the many communities in which Enbridge pipelines have been operating note that due to the high degree of technical training needed for pipeline construction, local populations are usually integrated into the project either, (a) on the temporary term basis, (b) in the services sector i.e. taking care of motels, et cetera, or (c) not at all.
33214. For example, Service Canada's March 2008 southern Manitoba -- I'm just taking stuff off the internet here, but this is from the Southern Manitoba Labour Market Bulletin -- reported quote:
- "That there would be limited or no opportunity for local employment on the Alberta Clipper construction project (which was another Enbridge pipeline project). However, there would likely be ancillary jobs created from the additional business brought to local operations, such as restaurants."*
33215. Wow.
33216. Also, tensions often escalate in the area of pipeline construction due to divisions between resident's concerns with the impacts of the pipeline on their lives and on the surrounding environment and -- I'm almost finished -- and the effect of a better educated, better paid pipeline employee staying temporarily in the area.
33217. Workers can also be put in a difficult position when confronted by landowners who do not feel the consultation process was fair or inclusive. Many communities in which Enbridge pipelines have been operating note that Enbridge's Board of Directors are particularly well positioned to take advantage of the situation to further their own personal goals.
33218. Patrick Daniels is also on the Canadian Bank, CIBC Board. David Leslie, the Chair of Finance and Risk Committee is also the Chairman and CEO of Ernst Young LLP, Director of Crombie REIT and Sobeys.

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

33219. So huge multinational corporations as well. So they're just positioning themselves to make even more money. Charles Shultz, President and CEO, is also President and CEO of Golf Canada Resources and Director of Newfield Exploration, which is another gas and oil company.
33220. So it just, there's this huge network of people, again, the snowball effect of making, if you make more money, you make more money, you make more money.
33221. So I won't go ---
33222. **MEMBER BATEMAN:** Ms. Havard. Just your time has exceeded, if you could just wrap those thoughts up in just a sentence.
33223. **MS. ANNE HAVARD:** Okay. I'd just like to make a few personal things, it will take like two minutes.
33224. **MEMBER BATEMAN:** That's a little too long, just in two sentences please.
33225. **MS. ANNE HAVARD:** Okay. I'm going to read from a book called "The Corporation: Pathological Pursuit of Profit and Power" by Joel Bakan in 2004.
33226. **MEMBER BATEMAN:** Ms. Havard, could I just ---
33227. **MS. ANNE HAVARD:** One quotation and a sentence.
33228. **MEMBER BATEMAN:** One sentence please.
33229. **MS. ANNE HAVARD:** Okay.
- "Comparing the way corporations behave with the World Health Organization's checklist for personality types reveals its nature as psychopathic. And in law the corporation is considered a person." If it were in fact a human individual, the corporation would be considered extreme in psychopathic qualities which is, and the core test for anyone wishing to better understand both the legal structures and actual impacts of modern day corporation need to be understood through that."*
33230. We're not dealing with a nice person when you're dealing with these

corporations.

33231. That's all I have to say. Thanks.

--- (Applause/Applaudissements)

33232. **THE CHAIRPERSON:** I'm having trouble seeing your name tag. Are you Ms. Hobson?

33233. **MS. MEG HOBSON:** I am.

33234. **THE CHAIRPERSON:** Okay. Terrific. Please proceed.

33235. Thank you.

--- **ORAL STATEMENT BY/EXPOSÉ ORAL PAR MS. MEG HOBSON:**

33236. **MS. MEG HOBSON:** Okay, I'm taking a little bit of a different bent, but anyway. I don't think you've heard what I've got to say.

33237. So my Canadian name is Meghan Hobson, but I was born as Meghan Roberts. I'm an Australian at heart and I currently hold both citizenships in Australia and Canada.

33238. I'm sadly a citizen of two wealthy countries that colonize their lands and systematically destroyed and deconstructed their indigenous peoples in the name of civilization and progress.

33239. I'm a mother of four children, age 17, 15, 13, and 11, all born in this country, in fact born in Smithers. And thus I am bound here by their needs to grow up in a safe, -- sorry -- clean and democratic country.

33240. According to the Conservative government, I'm also a radical environmentalist. And to boot, I'm a foreigner. But I'm not the good kind of foreigner, I don't invest in pipelines. I'm a radical foreigner because I speak out for our environment.

33241. Radical means one who advocates fundamental or evolutionary change in current practices, conditions or institutions. So on one hand, I guess I am a radical. But on another, I am asking for no change here. No change to our environment, to

our culture, our way of life.

33242. The Conservative government and Enbridge, and the push for this pipeline are truly radicals. I choose to live in this part of the country because of its incredible beauty, its abundance of clean water; something that Canadians I think take very much as a normalcy, as an Australian, it is pure, it's extraordinary.

33243. I choose to live here as well because of the community, the incredible culture, both non-native and native, and lastly for the spirit of this region is very strong and it is very powerful.

33244. If the Enbridge pipeline does go through, the impact on myself will be the same for all who live in this country. I think the impact will be that we no longer live in a democratic country.

33245. For the concept of democracy, as stated by the English philosopher, and pardon my pronunciation, it is Alexander Meiklejohn, when advising on such matters in regards to our neighbours, the U.S.A. was that:

“Democracy is that of a self-government by the people. For such a system to work, an informed electorate is necessary. In order to be appropriately knowledgeable, there must be no constraints on the free flow of information and ideas. Democracy will not be true to its essential ideal if those in power are able to manipulate the electorate by withholding information and stifling criticism.”

33246. Meiklejohn also acknowledge that the desire the manipulate opinion can stem from the motive of seeking to benefit society, i.e. the national interest that we keep being told that this is what the pipeline is for. However, choosing to manipulate, choosing manipulation negates the democratic ideal.

33247. This government, in my view, is both manipulating and stifling criticism coming from its own people. I ask how many times do we as citizens, First Nations, mayors, councils, towns, mothers, fathers, children, Canadians, and immigrants, how many times do we have to say no?

33248. The definition of no is to express a strong refusal, a disbelief and doubt. And we as a cohesive group of peoples in the northwest have said no to this project many times. In fact, I think about 4,000.

33249. When we raise our children, and I have raised four, we teach them the

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

meaning of no. It's quite easy when you understand what the consequences are. I do not believe the Conservative government understands the consequences.

33250. How can they? Has Mr. Harper or Mr. Oliver visited the northwest? Have they personally consulted our MPs, our community leaders, our First Nations Hereditary Chiefs to learn and become informed and knowledgeable?
33251. Mr. Harper has managed to visit the Chinese leaders on this issue, why not us? He's even invested \$10 million in two panda bears. I don't think he's invested \$10 million in two polar bears.
33252. Through the Joint Review Panel process, I have learned that we have strong families, strong communities, and most of all, a vibrant culture. Culture is not about economies or growth or greed. It's about a way of life. The knowledge that we have here based on our experiences, both non-Native and Native, as families of man in this area in regards to this project have led us to say no.
33253. It is my greatest fear that in another 50 years, if this project goes through, that some poor Prime Minister will stand up and create another sorry speech and perhaps another truth and reconciliation commission to say sorry for the environmental and cultural damage done to all its peoples for the sake of what was to be thought in the national interest, for the sake of one government's greed.
33254. Is the culture of oil, is the culture of resource extraction for a global economy more important than the culture of our people in the northwest, both indigenous and non-indigenous, and the culture of Canadians? Is it really? I say no.
33255. If this pipeline goes through, I will be ashamed to be a Canadian. And I'm going to read to you -- and this is a little book, and this is -- I think it's -- I'm not sure. It's a visual aid. This is the book that I swore to become a Canadian on. It's by a beautiful Australian poet, and I'm going to read you a poem. And it's a poem to God, and this is non-denominational:

"Dear God. All God, all gods. We pray for another way of being, another way of knowing. Across the difficult terrain of our existence, we have attempted to build a highway and, in doing so, have lost our footpath. God, lead us to our footpath. Lead us there where, in simplicity, we may move at the speed of natural creatures and feel the earth's love beneath our feet. Lead us there where, step by step, we may feel the movement of creation in our hearts and lead us there where, side by side, we may feel the

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

*embrace of the common soul. Nothing can be loved at speed.
God, lead us to the slow path, to the joyous insights of the pilgrim
to another way of knowing and another way of being."*

33256. Thank you.

--- (Applause/Aplaudissements)

33257. **MEMBER MATTHEWS:** Thank you.

33258. Good afternoon, Ms. Howard. Please go ahead and give your presentation.

--- **ORAL STATEMENT BY/EXPOSÉ ORAL PAR MS. MONICA HOWARD:**

33259. **MS. MONICA HOWARD:** Hi. My name is Monica Howard. I'm extremely nervous. From listening yesterday and today, I'm so proud of my community. You have done excellent. Everyone has done excellent.

33260. And to answer a question that Anne Havard just asked, how do we stand up against oil and gas? We stand up and we sing the anthem. That was my plan today. So if anyone wants to join me, please do.

33261. **THE CHAIRPERSON:** Would you -- Ms. Howard, would you mind sitting down, please? We're here to hear an oral statement about the potential ---

33262. **MS. MONICA HOWARD:** But I want to sing the anthem.

33263. **THE CHAIRPERSON:** Well, you can sing the anthem at some other point, but right now we're listening to your oral statement, which is about the potential ---

33264. **MS. MONICA HOWARD:** It's part of my oral statement.

33265. **THE CHAIRPERSON:** And we want to hear about your personal opinions on the potential effects.

33266. **MS. MONICA HOWARD:** I'm watching the hockey game ---

33267. **THE CHAIRPERSON:** Excuse me?

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

33268. **MS. MONICA HOWARD:** I'm watching the hockey game last week and I listened to the anthem, and the words hit me. O Canada, our home and native land, true patriot love, in all thy sons command.
33269. I'm only going to read it because if I'm going to sing it, I should be standing. With glowing hearts, we see thee rise, the true north, strong and free. From far and wide, O Canada, we stand on guard for thee. God keep our land, glorious and free, O Canada, we stand on guard for thee. O Canada, we stand on guard for thee.
33270. I've known this since I was very, very little, and to only have it struck me last week at a hockey game or watching the hockey game, I find it amazing. But that is why all these people have come to give their words. We are standing on guard for our country, for our land, for our people. If we do not do it, nobody will do it for us. So that's why I am here.
33271. I would have rather sung it, but it's okay.
33272. Now, my name is Monica Howard. I live in Telkwa, just outside of Smithers here. I oppose this proposed pipeline on behalf of myself, my daughter, Joanna, my other daughter, Michelle, and my husband, Dave.
33273. I elected officials in my region to speak for me to oppose this pipeline, Nathan Cullen and Doug Donaldson, and I will leave it to them to speak as well as all these other excellent citizens have spoken.
33274. I have brought salmon here today to share with you because that was the thing I knew I could share with you. I caught the fish with my family. It was either myself or my husband who caught it. I don't know because we caught so much chinook last year.
33275. And my sister swam the Skeena River in 2009, and she was welcomed in every single community she came to with music and celebration and open arms. And I welcome this Panel and all of the Energy Board staff. Welcome to my community, share some salmon with us. I would be honoured if you ate all of it and I don't have to take any of it home.
33276. And I would like everybody in this gallery who's either participating or just observing to help yourself to a snack. It's chinook. It was caught on the -- no, sorry, it was caught on the Bulkley above Rainbow Ranch where the Seskwa comes

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

in to the Bulkley Labour Day weekend last year, and it's a chinook at Labour Day weekend.

33277. And if you know about the fish runs, that's a bit late. And so I felt like we were blessed with chinook.

33278. And by sharing food, by sharing a meal, we have our common ground with one another. We are all people. We all need food, water and clean air, whether we're Mr. Millionaire with Enbridge or Anne Havard on 10 grand a year. We all need the same things.

33279. And by sharing, we come together. We have dialogue; we have discussion, and maybe we can find common ground.

33280. Talking with my peers, my friends, my community members, there's language that's used such as craziness or it seems insane to want to do this kind of thing when all the odds are stacked against it, what Paul Glover said. I mean, it's insane.

33281. And yet, what seems incredibly sane and makes complete sense is this process, you hearing from us, 4,600 people signing up. Not maybe everybody speaking because it is really nerve-wracking to speak.

33282. But we live in a free country that we can do this in, and it is marvellous. We are so, so lucky and you are so privileged to be the people to look at all the stuff. It's amazing.

33283. And I think you will do the right thing. I have complete faith in this environmental process. I am not cynical one bit. You are sitting here; you are listening. And I admire that and I am so appreciative of it.

33284. My fifth point, I want to speak about time. We have been talking about 10 minutes. My God, it seems like an eternity to talk for 10 minutes. And so why not? So it's taken an extra year of people talking to do this environmental review. Is that such a big deal?

33285. I do not think it is a big deal. It's a big project; let's get it right. Let's take our time. And I thank you for taking your time.

33286. The salmon do not need us, but we need the salmon. We need our

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

environment. Our environment doesn't need us, so let's treat it for the long haul because, in closing, I want to grow old in this valley, sharing the resources that we have with all the people who will come after me, 19-year old tree planters like myself who came out to the Bulkley Valley -- Prince George first, but eventually I got here to tree plant, to go back to school, to learn, to live.

33287. First steps in a lifetime. And maybe in 80 years a 19-year old like myself will come out and set down her roots here. And there will be a river here for her to fish at with her family, and I'll be that old person on the river -- because I hope somebody carts me out -- and so I can watch people catch the fish. Because it's not easy to catch the fish; that's the fun thing.

33288. It's not a given you will be able to eat out of the river, and to share it with descendants of my family and new people who will come here, that's what I want. And that is why I oppose this proposed pipeline.

33289. And I thank you for listening to me.

--- (Applause/Aplaudissements)

33290. **THE CHAIRPERSON:** We're just going to take a break now. We'll be back in 15 minutes.

33291. Thank you.

--- Upon recessing at 2:53 p.m./L'audience est suspendue à 14h53

--- Upon resuming at 3:08 a.m./L'audience est reprise à 15h08

33292. **THE CHAIRPERSON:** Just while we're getting ready to get underway, I wonder is Ms. Joanne Voss in the room? Ms. Joanne Voss?

33293. Okay, thank you.

33294. We'll continue on with the oral statements. Thank you very much. Ms. Jenne.

--- **ORAL STATEMENT BY/EXPOSÉ ORAL PAR MS. TAISA JENNE:**

33295. **MS. TAISA JENNE:** Thank you.

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

33296. So I'd like to acknowledge that we're sitting here on the land of the Wet'suwet'en, the Gitgumden clan, and to thank them for allowing us to speak here today on their territory.
33297. My name is Taisa Jenne. I am a teacher, a farmer, a mother and I am adamantly opposed to the Northern Gateway Project. I feel that this proposal should be withdrawn for the sake of our natural environment and for the health and safety of our children.
33298. I'm a mother to two small children, ages three and five. They're active, vibrant, joyful little beings who are happy to call this land their home. My children are being raised here on this land. They live and breathe, eat and drink of this land.
33299. Their little bodies are growing healthy and strong from the clean water they drink, the clean mountain air they breathe, the clean food we grow on our farm or gather from our forests and rivers.
33300. For my children there's little separation between themselves and the landscape they're growing up in. Their world is animated by the sounds, sights, tastes and smells of this natural landscape.
33301. When we cross the bridge into town, my three-year old calls out his greetings to the Bulkley River. When the birds begin to arrive back in the spring, my five-year old shouts with glee that his friends, the sand hill cranes, are back.
33302. For my children this land is both magical and wholly real, a land that nurtures them, holds them, feeds them. This landscape is mapped out in their very beings, and every hike in the mountain, every paddle down the river, every walk along its shores deepens this connection.
33303. Children, not just my children but all children are healthier, happier and more secure when they're able to connect to a healthy natural environment. Studies have shown that exposure to nature reduces the symptoms of many childhood disorders, protects children against stress and allows them to be more adaptable, better socialized and to learn better.
33304. This is known in the scientific literature as biophilia, the restorative power of nature on humans, especially children who have an innate affinity with the natural world which is thought to be integral to our development as individuals.

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

33305. Solastalgia is another term in the scientific literature regarding our human connection to the natural world. Solastalgia occurs when the environment you call home changes unrecognizably for reasons beyond your control. Solastalgia is known to cause symptoms of extreme distress, depression, sense of alienation and loss of hope.
33306. There's a widening circle of research that concludes that the loss of nature has enormous implications for human health and child development. It is thought that the quality of exposure to nature affects children's health at a profound level.
33307. The children who live on the lands that this pipeline is being proposed to cross are at great risk. The cost of a spill on this landscape would be the loss of the physical and emotional health of our children.
33308. I cannot imagine the anguish and grief in the hearts of my children, who love this land so deeply, if it became contaminated and unsafe for themselves and the animals and plants they know and love.
33309. I can only imagine that the loss would be even more profound for the children whose ancestors have been here since time immemorial, the children of the Wet'suwet'en First Nation, the Kispiox First Nation, the Gitksan, Gitxaala Takla and the more than 50 First Nations groups whose territories this pipeline would cross.
33310. I cannot imagine the anguish and grief in the hearts of all parents of this land if we had to stand by and watch our children's health deteriorate because of a breach or a spill on our lands or in our waters. Because we all know that if this pipeline is built, there will be a spill. The location and magnitude are unknown but the fact of a spill is certain.
33311. Enbridge's attempt to convince us of the safety of this pipeline reminds me of a small child trying to convince others that he's able to fly despite regular, obvious and rather painful evidence to the contrary.
33312. We all know that Enbridge cannot fly. It cannot build a perfect, safe pipeline here when it has been unable to do so elsewhere. It cannot tell us that our 1,000 rivers and streams will remain unspoiled while it continues to contaminate rivers and streams on its other projects.
33313. I'm not against development when it is done with responsibility, care and reason, but this proposal is not reasoned or responsible. It is instead a disaster

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

waiting to happen and I stand with the many who are not willing to sit back and wait for disaster to strike. We must stop this project before it heaps disaster upon our children.

33314. Many of us here feel a sense of responsibility to our lands and waters similar to the responsibilities of a parent. We'll protect these lands because they're precious, vulnerable and loved. We will not allow harm to come to them. We will do whatever it takes to keep them safe, healthy and unharmed for the sake of ourselves and our children.

33315. For me, my husband and I chose to settle here and raise a family for the unspoiled landscape, the strong community and the possibility to live wholesome, healthy lives as a family on this land. Watching this unfold for our children has been one of the greatest gifts imaginable. This pipeline threatens everything we hold dear.

33316. I ask Enbridge and the Harper government to pack up your plans, take your pipelines and tankers and be on your way. This is not your land to denigrate. This land belongs to our children.

33317. Thank you.

--- (Applause/Applaudissements)

33318. **MEMBER MATTHEWS:** Thank you.

33319. Ms. Jonstyn, welcome and we look forward to hear what you have to say.

--- **ORAL STATEMENT BY/EXPOSÉ ORAL PAR MS. HALEY JONSTYN:**

33320. **MS. HALEY JONSTYN:** Thank you. Thank you for making this possible. I really appreciate it.

33321. I'm a registered nurse and I came to work at Bulkley Lodge two and a half years ago. I came for a three-month position. My best friend since grade eight lived here and so I knew of the beauty in the valley. Well, it was a three-month maternity leave that I came to work and then it was extended into 10 months, and at the end of the 10 months, I really wanted to get a position so that I could be here longer.

33322. The beauty that is around us every moment of every day is just so incredible. I was born and raised in the Peace River country and that's where I

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

learned to form my roots with the earth. I walked many creek beds and had lots of wildlife around me.

33323. And then when I was 10 years old, they put in the Williston Dam. We used to go deer hunting in Hudson Hope. The deer left. They flooded acres and acres to make a lake because the lower mainland needed power, and later we found out that they sold the power to the U.S. or gave it away.

33324. Then I moved to Vancouver Island, and I lived on Vancouver Island for about 20 years. And I was there when they were clear-cut logging in the Clayoquot Sound and people were arrested. Don't clear-cut on mountain sides; that sounded like a reasonable thing.

33325. And then I hear they built another dam in the Peace River country and they want to build Site C, they want to dam the Peace River again. The power is needed to pump the tar sands dirty oil over two mountain ranges, dam another river.

33326. I lived in the Kootenays for 10 years. There was only one river in the Kootenays that wasn't dammed, and I learned to feel the energy of a natural land as opposed to walking along a river that's dammed. The whole ecosystem is different, what grows on the bank sides.

33327. The one river -- what was it called now -- Slokan River, is just one of the most beautiful rivers but the Bulkley River is even more beautiful and more wild.

33328. When I was 10 years old my parents came from the Dawson Creek area, and we camped at the campgrounds in Moricetown. And we were there for about 10 days. My mom and dad and older brother fished every day and we took lots of salmon home. But that was when I first really fell in love with the Bulkley Valley.

33329. There's many people I've met here who say "I came for three months and that was 32 years ago" and they go "Shhh, don't speak to other people how nice it is here".

33330. So as a nurse I look at health and look at my patients holistically. I was taught to look at the physical, emotional, mental and sacred and spiritual part of any person. And I also carry that to any living thing.

33331. I think of -- I think of Mother Earth and what she provides for us with the sun energy of course. But, you know, it's our clothing, it's our food; it's the beauty

that surrounds us, it's the water.

33332. And so I ask, what would her emotional component be? Well, when you walk on creek beds or you see Northern Lights, you know that you're touched just by such incredibly raw beauty.
33333. So her physical body would be the rivers and the oceans and the mountains and the plains and right down to the core of the earth. And her mental body I consider is all the diversity that she has; the biosphere which is the global sum of all ecosystems.
33334. How about migrations? Wow. You know, and communication, the way animals communicate and how they can migrate over huge areas. The seasons, the solstices, the equinoxes, and how the earth revolves around the sun would be her mental body.
33335. What would her sacred and spiritual body be? Who is not touched by a rainbow on the whole planet? Ahh, look at that rainbow.
33336. Mountain tops; it was 20 below last winter and I went up on Bluff Road because I wanted to see what the sun was like when it hit the mountain top of Hudson Bay Lodge and I have this photograph. It went liquid, electric, fuchsia right on the top for about two minutes. It was like wow.
33337. And spring time, how sacred and spiritual is that; all the newborn babies, the new beginnings, our four-legged friends, our feathered friends and our finned friends, including the elementals.
33338. There was a story that was widely circulated a few days after 9/11 attacks. A native-American grandfather was speaking to his grandson about violence and cruelty in the world and how it comes about. He said it was as if two wolves were fighting in his heart. One wolf was vengeful and angry, and the other wolf was understanding and kind.
33339. The young man asked his grandfather which wolf would win the fight in his heart and the grandfather answered, "The one that wins will be the one that I choose to feed".
33340. I'm speaking from my heart about how much I love our earth and that's the wolf that's going to survive, is the one that I feed, the one that I nourish and take

care of.

33341. I've -- I've -- you know the Peace River country now has 7,000 souring gas wells. There's cows that bleed from their noses and eyes every day. They've been fracking wherever they can frack and there is even one oil company that somehow built an oil well on the Kiskatinaw River which is the water source for the whole City of Dawson Creek. It just gets crazier and crazier and crazier.

33342. So as we go down this path of gambling the environment with development the scale is tipping more and more to increased environmental destruction which will eventually be our destruction.

33343. What is wrong with slowing down? Where is our wisdom, the wisdom to choose what is for the highest good of all; our present existence and future existence. What are we leaving for our grandchildren, our great-grandchildren and our great-great-great-grandchildren? Would we not be wise to be patient with the process, to keep our resources in our country and for our future? Would it not be wise to invest in alternative energies?

33344. Chief Seneca was -- I lost a word there -- he was known for having said to white men -- and this was like over 200 years ago, "When you eat the last fish and when you pollute the last river, do you think you're going to be able to eat your dollar bills".

33345. I have a vision that civilization, mankind, economics, industry will no longer be noticed as a growth national product, the GNP, but it will become the HG of A, the highest good of all.

33346. Thank you.

--- (Applause/Aplaudissements)

33347. **MEMBER BATEMAN:** Mr. Krause, thank you for coming today. Please present your oral statement.

--- **ORAL STATEMENT BY/EXPOSÉ ORAL PAR MR. PETER KRAUSE:**

33348. **MR. PETER KRAUSE:** Thank you for coming, all the people here that are speaking and the supporters and the Energy Board.

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

33349. I've lived in Smithers now for over 30 years and consider myself a Smithereen I would say. My wife's side of the family has been here since the twenties, so feel pretty strong roots here.
33350. And this is why my family and I do not support the Enbridge Pipeline Project. The risk of an accident is too high for the benefits. My family hunts and fishes and we grow a large garden. Even though we live in a town we live off the land. Our whole sustenance is dependent on a clean and healthy Skeena River watershed.
33351. My wife and I operate a sporting goods business that has been here for over 20 years. Our customers are people that live in or visit the Bulkley Valley because of the great outdoors our area has to offer. People come from all over the world to experience what we have here.
33352. The pipeline route runs along and crosses the Morice River, which is part of the Skeena River watershed. The risk of a leak or a rupture at or near the Morice River is too high. It is not a matter of if, but when, it will happen. If there is a leak into the Morice River, the whole Skeena watershed system could be destroyed.
33353. When this disaster occurs, the economic impact on our businesses and many others in towns from Houston to Prince Rupert will be immense.
33354. The Skeena River system is the second-largest salmon-producing watershed in British Columbia. Just the salmon fishing industry, commercial and recreational, creates over \$100 million a year. These salmon don't just affect the humans; they play a role in the whole lifecycle of much of the wildlife for hundreds of miles.
33355. The fish feed the bears, the fish remains feed the insects and they fertilize the plants. The plants feed the herbivores. The fish and hunt guiding industries are a big part of our local economy. The Skeena River system is one of only a few in the world which has non-transplanted steelhead. This brings people from all over the world to come here and fly fish or fish in other means for these huge sea-running trout.
33356. Non-transplanted means that these fish have not been brought here from another river system. Our area is known for the biggest fish in this species.
33357. People that have the most to gain are the people that have the least to lose

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

in this project. The people that have the most to lose are the people that have the least to gain. The communities that live along this pipeline have short term benefits, but the long-term losses are for them to suffer.

33358. The people running the oil companies have the most to gain and the economic benefit. They will have no long-term issues or their back yards destroyed when there is an oil spill. The people that live in this area have very little to gain, but risk generations of health issues because of contaminated water and our whole river system could be destroyed. You say "Not in my back yard"; we don't want this project in our back yard.

33359. In the April 23rd issue of "McLean's Magazine", which just came out, there's a story on "Oil has been discovered in Calgary's Royal Oak neighbourhood" and Kaiser Exploration wants to start drilling. The people that live there, many of whom work in the oil industry, are concerned about air, water and noise pollution. Does that water pollution issue sound familiar?

33360. Not even the people that work in the industry want it in their back yard. Why should we want it in our back yard?

33361. So why should we have this pipeline in our back yard when the risks are too high and the communities have very little to gain? We want our rivers and our drinking water to stay clean, clear and Enbridge oil-free. We don't want or need this pipeline.

33362. Thank you very much.

--- (Applause/Applaudissements)

33363. **THE CHAIRPERSON:** Mr. Person, please proceed when you're ready.

33364. Thank you.

--- **ORAL STATEMENT BY/EXPOSÉ ORAL PAR MR. EV PERSON:**

33365. **MR. EV PERSON:** Thank you for coming. My name is Ev Person; I am 79 years old and have lived and fished in this area most of my life.

33366. My father, Pete Person, was fishing the Skeena in 1914, at the same time as they were building the Grand Trunk Railroad along the Skeena. My brother,

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

Harry, was fishing the Skeena during the Second World War, and the Douglas Channel up until the 1980s. My other brother, John, fished the Skeena from 1946, and they all fished the Fraser as years went by.

33367. I fished with my family from 1942 until I graduated in 1950, and trained as a machinist before I became a teacher. And in 1957 I moved to Smithers as a shop teacher.

33368. In 1957 we had a diverse economy, a diverse economic base with farming, small lumber mills, some mining and the area was growing. Smithers put a sewage system allowing sewage to flow into the Bulkley River.

33369. In 1958, changes such as this and other impacts to natural systems led a citizens' coalition called CAP, (Citizens Against Pollution) to address issues affecting our environment and rivers.

33370. I provide this background to demonstrate that the people of the area have been actively trying to protect and maintain our environment for many years. Some of the issues we were trying to address were a pulp mill proposal for Houston in 1970, the Kemano project, which proposed diverting a portion of the Upper Morice system and outletting these waters into the Fraser system.

33371. This project and the Kemano 2 project galvanized local groups like Save the Bulkley in an effort to protect the Skeena as a free-flowing river system that provide the myriad of resources you've probably heard much about from previous presenters.

33372. I provide this background to familiarize the Panel with the efforts of local communities over the years to actively protect the resource that sustains us and our way of life in this region.

33373. Interesting enough, in those days the Department of Fisheries were free to provide an opinion on proposed developments, which doesn't seem to be the case today. So our Agency experts that we pay to protect our interests in the federal government and the provincial government have been effectively muzzled in this process.

33374. By the designs of our current political masters, that leaves it up to us to plead our case to you and for your Panel to determine where the values lie.

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

33375. As an active angler, my focus in the late 1980s turned to salmon and salmon habitat. I became the -- involved with the Toboggan Creek Salmon Enhancement Project as a Director and volunteer, and I'm still active in the organization.
33376. In 1998 through to 2011, I was a member of the Salmon Enhancement Habitat Advisory Board, which advised DFO on salmon and habitat issues. I was also active as a member and Chairman with the local Sports Fish Advisory Board, which was another advisory process with DFO on salmon management.
33377. As a member of all these processes I have learned that much the change and adoption of recommendations is very slow, painstakingly slow, and in many cases, it takes years before good ideas and measures are implemented. Often processes, such as this, are little more than lip service and the present government, by all appearances, has already decided the fate of this area and its population. This was way too often the case.
33378. For those of us that live here, this proposed development strips us of democratic process. The people of this area should have a say prior to local resources threatened by mega projects from other areas.
33379. Ultimately the -- if this project goes ahead we will be left to clean up and deal with the impacts to fish and habitat that we have fought so long and hard to sustain.
33380. After over 65 years of commercial and mostly sports fishing, consuming and preserving the catch and passing this passion on to my children and grandchildren, the legacy of connection to resource is now in jeopardy.
33381. In fact, the proposed pipeline and tanker traffic is the biggest threat to the ecosystems of the Skeena watershed, the north coast tidal areas and our way of life in the area we have ever seen and it should not go ahead.
33382. There's a major pipeline through parts of this watershed and it has been there for about 30 years. There has also been about 10 pipeline breaks, some in the Copper River and some in the Skeena. So let's admit that, yes, there will be pipeline failures, but a pipeline failure with natural gas is very different than an oil and condensate pipe failure into our headwaters or coastline.
33383. The truth is none of us even know what the impact to the country will be.

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

This part of the country was not built on oil and oil will not sustain the way of life we hold so dear. We need our fish and streams to sustain us as we have for years and hopefully into the future for our grandchildren and their grandchildren.

33384. As Panel Members you have been charged with assessing or judging the value of this watershed, this coastline and the way of life of the people here against the perceived value of the pipeline to the rest of Canada.

33385. One is valued in only money, much of which will never stay here for sure, let alone in Canada. The other, the Skeena, is a piece of the world that has sustained us for thousands of years, could be for thousands more, and is home to communities that are forever linked to the environment that sustains our way of life.

33386. Surely that aspect has come through loud and clear. How can you, as a Panel, and our only recourse, put a value on the future of an area such as this?

33387. Thank you.

--- (Applause/Aplaudissements)

33388. **THE CHAIRPERSON:** Thank you to each of you.

33389. As we change out the panel, I'd just ask if Ms. Joanne Voss is here.

--- (A short pause/Courte pause)

33390. **MEMBER MATTHEWS:** Good afternoon everyone and we look forward to hearing your comments.

33391. And so we'll start off with Mr. Rapp, please.

33392. Thanks.

--- **ORAL STATEMENT BY/EXPOSÉ ORAL PAR MR. EGON R. RAPP:**

33393. **MR. EGON RAPP:** Good afternoon and thank you for the opportunity to present my views.

33394. My wife and I have been living in the Bulkley Valley, in the Buck Valley south of Houston since 1980 when we bought our home on five acres. Our land

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

borders on Buck Creek, five kilometres below where the Enbridge pipeline would cross the creek.

33395. Even since arriving in the Bulkley Valley 35 years ago, I have felt an attraction to this beautiful area like in few other places before. I knew this would not just be a place to come and go for me, but a place to settle down and call home. Since then, my connection to the land and the surrounding area has only grown deeper.

33396. And now that I am close to retirement my wife and I were looking forward to many years -- many happy years on our land amidst the wild animals and countless birds that bring us enjoyment year round, to watch and listen to while we're going about our activities on our land.

33397. Living here has taught us a deeper understanding of the special relationship to the land that First Nations speak of; a give and take based on need and not on greed. All this is threatened by a potential oil spill from the proposed Enbridge pipeline.

33398. When we first became aware of the Northern Gateway Project in 2008, we had no knowledge about pipelines and we were wondering what it would mean for us rather than being concerned.

33399. We attended a couple of open houses organized by Enbridge, as well as a private meeting between Enbridge and four Buck Flats families. It was the beginning of a learning curve and the more we found out about the scope of this project and the associated potential hazards the more concerned we became.

33400. In 2009 Enbridge conducted a public meeting with Buck Flats residents during which many concerns were brought forward by residents. Some of these concerns were area-specific and requests were made for route changes in order to reduce the risks for Buck Flats residents.

33401. During the meeting Enbridge's representatives committed to evaluate possible route changes but the company subsequently rejected any route changes in our area, primarily because it would lead to increased costs.

33402. Enbridge claims they can build and operate this pipeline safely and with minimum risk; but their track records prove otherwise. The terrain this pipeline has to cross is far more difficult than that of the Kalamazoo River where Enbridge had the devastating oil spill in 2010.

33403. There are no provisions for a bond to pay for damages caused by an oil spill. And the people of B.C. may be left with a legacy of damages and costs for years to come.
33404. I have walked parts of Buck Creek with a GPS and after comparing my tracks with a topographical map of the area I found that the creek has changed its course by as much as 400 metres.
33405. What is a docile creek in summertime becomes a raging torrent during the spring freshet, causing erosion and a threat to anything in its path, including an oil pipeline. And there are hundreds more creeks and rivers this pipeline would cross in some of the most challenging terrain possible, practically inaccessible in winter to deal with a spill.
33406. Enbridge promises jobs, although few permanent, and I am keenly aware of the need for good, long-term sustainable jobs in our communities, jobs that allow families to remain together.
33407. Having lived in and around Houston and worked at the local sawmill since 1978, I have seen many local jobs disappear over the last two decades. Many of us in the forest industry were quick to blame environmentalists for the job losses, when it was obvious that most of these jobs disappeared due to technological change.
33408. The reason that communities in the region grew or remained stable during the years prior, is that previous governments required corporations who wanted access to resources to invest in infrastructure and process the resources locally.
33409. Since then, this appurtenance rule has been abolished and raw log exports have dramatically increased. Now, we are seeing the same thing happening again with the planned export of unrefined crude oil.
33410. We have the opportunity of developing the oil sands at a reasonable pace which would allow for community and infrastructure growth and which could provide for prosperous and stable towns for family to live and work, now and in the future. This would be in the Canadian public interest.
33411. When somebody like Peter Lougheed warns of rapid and uncontrolled expansion of the oil sands we should pay attention. This pipeline project would contribute to a planned tripling of oil sands output with no chance to develop refining

in Canada and Canadian jobs.

33412. The infrastructure of towns like Fort McMurray is bursting at the seams with transients, bringing increased crime and drug use. With no local accommodation available, families will be torn apart while parents fly into work camps from other regions of Canada. There is already a severe shortage of workers in the oil and gas sector.

33413. With Chinese investors standing by with billions, they would surely be eager to bring in their own workers whom they may treat in customary Chinese fashion.

33414. There seems to be an expectation that this environmental assessment will provide a clear-cut result based on science. But while science can assist with technical issues and risk assessment, it cannot provide an answer.

33415. The decision about whether this project is in the Canadian public interest will be based on values. We all have different levels of risk tolerance and different values about how much risk is acceptable and the generally accepted values within Canadian society have changed over the years.

33416. While it was quite acceptable a few decades ago to consume several drinks and still get behind the wheel, this is clearly no longer an acceptable risk.

33417. A few decades ago this pipeline likely would have been approved as another example of man conquering nature, but since then our values have changed, worldwide and in Canada. I believe the risks far outweigh the benefits.

33418. The recommendations received in preparation for oral statements suggested that there was no need to say what had been said before. I couldn't disagree more. It is not enough to leave it to David Suzuki to speak about the values that hopefully a majority of Canadians share and then quickly move on to the next item on the agenda.

33419. It is essential and, in my view, the purpose of these oral statements, that each and every one of us communicates our values to you, the Panel, who must ultimately make a decision about the Canadian public interest as an expression of Canadian public values.

33420. Repetition of the same values emphasize how widely they are shared and I

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

am hopeful that a message will be heard by this Panel about our responsibilities to provide a healthy and vibrant environment for our children and grandchildren and all creatures' needs within that environment, a message that we will join First Nations in defence of the land which brings nourishment and life to all of us.

33421. And I am hopeful we will reject the notion that greed is good because it drives the economy, so as not to confirm the view of Agent Smith in "The Matrix", that our species is like a virus which invades and ravages an organism only to move on to the next one.

33422. In closing, I would like to voice some concerns about the process itself. Sadly, the Harper government has already severely undermined this process through statements by Mr. Harper and Joe Oliver which suggests an approval of this project by Cabinet regardless of this Panel's decision.

33423. Their statements are disrespectful of this process, and of this Panel, and of the Canadian people. It will be up to the Canadian people to judge this arrogance at the ballot box.

33424. The other concern I have stems from what I've read in the CAEPLA Landowners Journal which states that the NEB CO Gaétan Caron often uses the word "partnership" when referring to the relationship between NEB and industry. Whatever partnership may exist between the NEB and industry, I would urge this Panel to set it aside during this assessment process.

33425. There can only be one partner for this Panel during this process and that is the Canadian people and First Nations of Canada and the Canadian public interest must be paramount.

33426. Thank you.

--- (Applause/Applaudissements)

33427. **MEMBER BATEMAN:** Mr. Stewart, please proceed.

--- **ORAL STATEMENT BY/EXPOSÉ ORAL PAR MR. GORDON STEWART:**

33428. **MR. GORDON STEWART:** I'll take this opportunity to speak to the Panel here. I think we're here to talk about black gold.

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

33429. Now, it seems to be that the Chinese came to the federal government and said, "Look, we're going to buy a whole bunch of that black gold up there in Alberta, but we need a pipeline." Well, Mr. Harper said, "Well that's no problem, we'll just build a pipeline, let you build a pipeline all the way to Kitimat and ship it to the Chinese."

33430. You see, the Chinese are building 3,000 vehicles a day to accommodate their people over there. Now, if that's not putting CO₂ into the atmosphere, I don't know what it is.

33431. And why is it in Eastern Canada we are importing oil? I mean, does the left hand not know what the right hand's doing? Why don't we ship it to the east instead of importing oil?

33432. It's the same as we're shipping oil to the United States. They sell it in the gas pumps for \$1.50 a gallon cheaper than us. There's something wrong here.

33433. Now, I've been to Valdez. I've talked to the fishermen. I've gone out and turned over the big rocks there and here's this black mud still there after over 20 years. That company were fined \$500 billion. You know what they paid? Nine hundred (900) million. Nine hundred (900) million against 5 billion? That just shows you what they can get away with.

33434. Now, just this whole thing just -- I mean, I've ridden all over this province with horses. I've hunted; I've fished. I've seen the slide up here, the gas pipeline, I've seen it. I know the damage it can do, rip out a whole side of a mountain. Can you guarantee that that will not happen? I don't think so.

33435. Now, my family's been in this province -- between the wife and I -- 280 years. That's a long time. You know, when I'm out there on a horse and I want to have a drink, this is what I want to have a drink out of, a clean water oil-free creek.

33436. Now, somewhere between B.C. and Alberta on the border is a bridge, and that's where I think the pipeline should end at the bridge.

33437. Thank you.

--- (Applause/Applaudissements)

33438. **THE CHAIRPERSON:** Ms. Taylor, please proceed when you're ready.

--- ORAL STATEMENT BY/EXPOSÉ ORAL PAR MS. FRANCES TAYLOR:

33439. **MS. FRANCES TAYLOR:** My name is Francis Taylor. And I'd like to recognize that we're on traditional Wet'suwet'en territory.

33440. I have been born and raised in the Bulkley Valley and we are all the product of our experiences, and I am who I am because of this valley. I was raised in this valley with its beauty, with its nature, with the diversity of ecosystem and people, and I was raised to listen, learn, observe, think for myself and speak up for what matters. It is for these reasons that I am here today.

33441. It's my understanding that you are an environmental review panel only. I have many political things I could talk to you of and economic things, but that's not why you're here, so I will focus on the environment.

33442. Water. I'm a history teacher. I teach about history and historical significance to students. I ask them to think for themselves, to analyze information. And for thousands of years the basic needs of people have been water, food, clothing and shelter. That is what has sustained human beings throughout time immemorial.

33443. In this valley we have an abundance of clean water. We need to value it and protect it. As an environmental review board, it is critical when we have a resource that is of such paramount importance to everyone around the world.

33444. We spend money to other countries trying to help them protect their water, clean their water up from diseases, from problems. We have this valuable resource right here and I can't believe that we are thinking of endangering it with an oil pipeline.

33445. If -- that's what always gets said -- well, if it happens. I was on the last successful sailing of the Queen of the North from Port Hardy up to Prince Rupert. It had a lasting effect on me because its very next trip returning down to Port Hardy, it sunk. I am irrevocably changed by that because I was on that piece of metal that I thought was so solid and so dependable that I put my life on and travelled up through that channel.

33446. And I remember being out on the deck and looking out at all the rocks and thinking, "Well, the crews got this under control and this is a massive boat and they've all the technology in the world, relax," and my wise husband said, "Well,

let's just look where the safety things are" because that's just who he is.

33447. And then I hear on the radio a few mornings later it's at the bottom of the ocean. It's been there now for six years and it was a minimal amount of oil if you consider what could happen with a large tanker transporting oil and yet that hasn't been dealt with.

33448. So what is to say that if we had a tanker spill, how would it be dealt with? Would it be more efficient, the clean-up process? It's a huge amount of oil.

33449. I fish; I hunt. I love British Columbia. I went away to school; I came back here so that I can enjoy the riches of this area that I grew up with. I've been down the Kitimat Channel many times and it is full of rocks. It is a narrow channel, it is a narrow channel like what the Queen of the North went down in when it was coming up a small, little tiny portion on its way up.

33450. I've been in and paddled through Bella Coola and out along. I'm avid about the water resources of our area. As an environmental review panel you must look at the value of water to mankind, to humankind. As the environmental review panel you must be aware of the value of this ecosystem and all that it has to offer.

33451. Slides -- I'm one of those oil-dependent people, I suppose. I ride my quad, I go up on different quad areas. I've gone up through the Telkwa Pass on my quad, along where the natural gas line runs. I've seen the avalanches, I've seen the places where the pipelines have broken and been repaired.

33452. I've seen the gravestones of the people that died going in there in difficult conditions to try and fix the pipelines. I am aware of the cost to the ecosystem and to the humans that go in and try to repair these pipelines when they have to go in in these difficult times, seasons, terrain. We do not live in a simple environment.

33453. Slides occur even within untouched areas. I've hiked over various mountains in the area. There is a slide up on Goat Mountain, it has no logging or anything that I can see where man has touched it and yet there's a massive slide. It's the nature of our changing geography. It's a geologically active area, just simply for the fact of gravity. Never mind earthquakes along the coast.

33454. You have an environmental job ahead of you as the review panel to look very carefully at all of the issues. You also have to take into consideration that prior pipelines that have natural gas reacts very differently than the bitumen that is being

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

proposed to go through this pipeline. It will react very differently. Natural gas reacts very differently to the other chemicals that are flowing back the opposite way.

33455. I have tried to research this for months now to prepare for today and it is difficult to get accurate information and to verify. I have read from every side's propaganda, if you can put it that way, trying to get to the bottom of what is the truth.

33456. I am voicing to you that I want you as the Review Panel to say "no" to this project. There are so many environmental considerations that we must recognize. If you take the statistical amounts of freshwater of the ecosystem, the salmon industry, the tourism industry, all those things that come from the environmental richness we have right now, it cannot compare. Enbridge is not justifiable.

33457. In historical perspectives, again the history teacher coming to mind, in studying past events it often comes clear, in hindsight, that not all change is progress. It is important to always carefully analyze all aspects of a decision and not rush a process.

33458. It is important in a democracy that all voices of the people are heard. It is important as we look at this issue, as we look at the environmental considerations, that we err on the side of the caution.

33459. My grandmother, who came to this valley and taught and did many volunteer activities for this community, would often say "An ounce of prevention is worth a pound of cure" and saying "no" to Enbridge is the ounce of prevention, we need you, as a Panel, to make.

33460. Because I don't think any pound of cure would manage to restore our waterways and our fisheries and what we value, what I value in this valley as a resident, as a person who fishes and hunts and lives here by choice and intend to live here the rest of my life.

33461. Thank you.

--- (Applause/Applaudissements)

33462. **MEMBER MATTHEWS:** Thank you.

33463. Welcome Ms. Stringfellow.

--- ORAL STATEMENT BY/EXPOSÉ ORAL PAR MS. LINDA STRINGFELLOW:

33464. **MS. LINDA STRINGFELLOW:** First of all I'd like to recognize that I am speaking on traditional Wet'suwet'en land. And I would like to say thank you to all of you for coming to my community and listening to me speak about my concerns regarding a proposed pipeline full of tar sands oil travelling from Alberta to B.C. north coast and then to be taken by tanker ships to China.

33465. This is hard because I've been having a great deal of difficulty trusting this process. However, I think it would be harder for me to not speak today, even if all that I said was dismissed.

33466. As a visual artist, telling you in words is also difficult because I want to paint you a picture. Yet that picture would be larger than what would fit in this room. However, they do say that a picture is worth a thousand words. So what I'd like to do is tell you a few of my stories so that you can form some pictures in your head.

33467. I wish to take you back in time, back to 1970, when I was a young teenager. I moved with my parents to the Pleasant Valley also known as Houston. There wasn't much to do as a teenager in Houston as you can well imagine. But on the other hand there was a world of nature to explore, and I turned to the outdoors rather than to the shopping malls.

33468. This was the start of my personal value system. I became a skilled canoeist and spent much of my developmental years paddling on the Morice River.

33469. There's a lot to be said about being taught through experiences and much I did learn. Like the time my principal came into my grade 10 classroom to announce that my outdoor education teacher was missing and presumed drowned on the Bulkley River.

33470. And though there was a great deal of grief with this news, there was also a great deal of respect for the Bulkley and in knowing that rivers are unpredictable and even stronger than the most skilled can be broken. The wax wings can melt when too close to the sun and pipelines can break too.

33471. As we've all seen in the recorded evidence from Enbridge and what people have been speaking about today. It just so happens that the 1,500 litres of oil spilled from a broken pipeline near Virden, Manitoba leaking into the Assiniboine

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

River is where my great-grandfather built a stone house when he emigrated from Scotland in the mid-1800's.

33472. I wish I could take you back to the beach where the Copper River meets Copper Bay, which turns into the Hecate Strait. The Hecate is so named for the triple goddess, maiden, mother, and crone who rules the earth, the sea, and the sky. She primarily is seen as the crone or the Elder and represents the dark, the dark side of things we wish to ignore. She is stern and swift, not really a goddess anyone would want to mess with. I've been on the Hecate in storms at night and its hell.

33473. Anyways, it was 1990 and if you were there you would have seen my son at age 10 running the length of the beach holding with all his strength the winning salmon of the local coho derby. You would have seen and heard the cheers from the members of our community of Sandspit as they baited their hooks and cast out to see if they too could catch a prize.

33474. The idea of a place like that being spoiled for life, and of life, due to an oil tanker spill of tar sands oil is devastating. The risk to the sea life, the birds, the plants, the salmon, the Haida peoples, is too high.

33475. I wish that I could take you to my home with me, 1621 Riverside Street in Telkwa. We could sit on the front porch and drink tea and watch the Bulkley River as it rises. If we stood up and looked to the South, we could see where the Telkwa River, aka Morice River, joins the Bulkley.

33476. Looking left we could see Hudson's Bay Mountain and the right we could feast our eyes on the Telkwa Range. We would see that there's quite a lot of snow up in those hills.

33477. We could talk about how the rise of the water changes year to year and how Mother Nature rules this game and the amount of snow pack she dumps is not in control of any man, or big corporation, or government, or country. There are just some things that man cannot control.

33478. A high river can cause a lot of damage in pipelines embedded along riverbanks or even close to riverbanks could be washed away. Again, Enbridge provides us with this evidence. Leaking pipelines spills 844,444 U.S. gallons of crude oil into a creek that leads to the Kalamazoo River only 16 months ago.

33479. If the tar sands muck broke out of a pipeline in front of my house, it would

Oral statements
Exposés oraux

be me out there trying to clean it up and save the river, but if it was somewhere high in the wilderness, it would take too long for people to get to, and much damage could be done and things would never be the same again.

33480. I've been in the Pacific Northwest for 42 years. I've seen changes in the weather. I've been in winters when the temperatures drop to -60 below Fahrenheit and stayed steady there at -30 to now having winters where I don't even plug in my car.

33481. I don't want this pipeline, but even more than that, I don't want us using or supporting others to use methods of dirty oil to create energy. There's too much greed and wanting a quick fix when there is so many alternatives to explore and so many creative people, many right here in this valley, who could and would help find sources of energy that would not destroy the environment. This environment is a part of who I am.

33482. When my son was 13 and we lived in Smithers, he said to me one day, "Mom, me and my friends have narrowed it down and we feel that this is the best place in the whole world to live."

33483. One day I want to have the chance to hear my grandchildren say, "Grandma, you live in the best place in the world."

33484. Thank you.

--- (Applause/Aplaudissements)

33485. **THE CHAIRPERSON:** Is Ms. Joanne Voss here?

--- (No response/Aucune réponse)

33486. **THE CHAIRPERSON:** Then that concludes our afternoon sitting today.

33487. Tomorrow we're going to be sitting in the afternoon and the evening and so we will begin tomorrow at 1:00 o'clock in the afternoon.

33488. Thank you, everyone.

--- Upon adjourning at 4:10 p.m./L'audience est ajournée à 16h10