

doi: 10.1093/femsec/fiaa026 Advance Access Publication Date: 30 March 2020 Research Article

## RESEARCH ARTICLE

# Elucidation of the rhizosphere microbiome linked to Spartina alterniflora phenotype in a salt marsh on Skidaway Island, Georgia, USA

Max Kolton<sup>1,†</sup>, José L. Rolando<sup>1</sup> and Joel E. Kostka<sup>1,2,\*</sup>

<sup>1</sup>School of Biological Sciences, Georgia Institute of Technology, Atlanta, GA 30332, USA and <sup>2</sup>School of Earth and Atmospheric Sciences, Georgia Institute of Technology, Atlanta, GA 30332, USA

\*Corresponding author: 310 Ferst Drive, Atlanta, GA 30332, USA. Tel: +1-404-385-3325; Fax: +1-404-894-0519; E-mail: joel.kostka@biology.gatech.edu One sentence summary: Smooth cordgrass, Spartina alterniflora, rhizosphere microbial community assembly is linked to plant phenotype and shaped by the availability of terminal electron acceptors.

Editor: Gary King <sup>†</sup>Max Kolton, http://orcid.org/0000-0002-8166-3572

## ABSTRACT

Smooth cordgrass, *Spartina alterniflora*, dominates salt marshes on the east coast of the United States. While the physicochemical cues affecting *S. alterniflora* productivity have been studied intensively, the role of plant–microbe interactions in ecosystem functioning remains poorly understood. Thus, in this study, the effects of *S. alterniflora* phenotype on the composition of archaeal, bacterial, diazotrophic and fungal communities were investigated. Overall, prokaryotic communities were more diverse and bacteria were more abundant in the areas colonized by the tall plant phenotype in comparison to those of short plant phenotype. Diazotrophic methanogens (*Methanomicrobia*) preferentially colonized the area of the short plant phenotype. Putative iron-oxidizing *Zetaproteobacteria* and sulfur-oxidizing *Campylobacteria* were identified as indicator species in the rhizosphere of tall and short plant phenotypes, respectively. Finally, while diazotrophic populations shaped microbial interactions in the areas colonized by the tall plant phenotype and proximity to the root zone are selective forces dictating microbial community assembly. Results further reveal that reduction–oxidation chemistry is a major factor driving the selection of belowground microbial populations in salt marsh habitats.

**Keywords:** salt marsh; Spartina alterniflora; plant microbiome; plant–microbe interaction; microbial diversity and composition; iron- and sulfur-oxidizing bacteria; indicator species

## **INTRODUCTION**

Salt marshes are highly productive ecosystems in which organic matter accumulates to high concentrations from root production and rhizodeposition (Bertness *et al.* 2008; Hopkinson, Cai and Hu 2012). Salt marshes provide numerous ecosystem services ranging from shoreline erosion protection (Williams, Coles and Primavera 2007) to the maintenance of water quality and prevention of eutrophication (Hopkinson and Giblin 2008). Additionally, a significant portion of commercial fish species in the United States utilize salt marshes as nursery habitats to complete their life cycle (Beck *et al.* 2001). Salt marshes along the Atlantic coast of North America are frequently characterized by extensive stands of smooth cordgrass, *Spartina alterniflora*, distributed in two main phenotypes: (i) a tall form (>1 m) that grows near estuarine tidal creeks and (ii) a short form (<50 cm)

Received: 17 November 2019; Accepted: 23 March 2020

<sup>©</sup> FEMS 2020. All rights reserved. For permissions, please e-mail: journals.permissions@oup.com

that dominates the high marsh (Valiela, Teal and Deuser 1978; Mendelssohn and Morris 2000).

High rates of carbon fixation and rhizodeposition are among the most notable characteristics of S. alterniflora. In comparison with other marsh grasses, S. alterniflora exhibits significantly higher carbon fixation rates (Howes, Dacey and Teal 1985; Liao et al. 2007), and deposits up to 55% of photosynthetically fixed carbon to the sediment within 24 h (Spivak and Reeve 2015), thereby supporting the development of the dense microbial biomass (Bu et al. 2015). Microbial communities in organicrich salt marsh sediments are regularly exposed to sulfate-rich tidal waters, resulting in rapid rates of anaerobic decomposition through the sulfate reduction pathway, which in turn produces hydrogen sulfide, a potent phytotoxin (Jørgensen 1982; Wasmund, Mussmann and Loy 2017; Jorgensen, Findlay and Pellerin 2019). The interaction of numerous abiotic factors creates stable chemical and physical gradients that impact plant physiology, extending from tidal creeks to the high marsh. The concentration of sulfur and iron forms, redox potential and salinity are among the most critical factors controlling salt marsh plant physiology and zonation (Bertness 1991; Mendelssohn and Morris 2000; Kostka et al. 2002; Kostka, Roychoudhury and Van Cappellen 2002; Lamers et al. 2013). In addition to nutrient availability, these abiotic factors are likely to affect sediment microbial community composition, activity and interactions with a plant host

Plant-associated microorganisms (bacteria, archaea and fungi) play an essential role in plant primary production through mediation of nutrient acquisition, regulation of stress hormones and detoxification of phytotoxins (Cytryn and Kolton 2011; Bardgett and van der Putten 2014; Fierer 2017; Rodríguez-Llorente et al. 2019). In return, plants actively secrete carbon sources that serve as substrates for microbial growth (Berg and Smalla 2009). Thus, the natural recruitment of surrounding microbial community members is one of the numerous mechanisms that plants have developed to deal with stressors such as nutrient limitation, salinity and the presence of phytotoxins (Dimkpa, Weinand and Asch 2009). The 'rhizosphere effect' on microbial communities is well documented among model and terrestrial plants (Berg and Smalla 2009; Bulgarelli et al. 2012; Lundberg et al. 2012; Tkacz et al. 2015). However, studies linking the microbial community to S. alterniflora phenotype in pristine salt marshes are scarce (Ravit, Ehrenfeld and Haggblom 2003; Angermeyer, Crosby and Huber 2016; Rietl et al. 2016; Zogg, Travis and Brazeau 2018), and environmental factors that affect the microbial recruitment processes by the salt-tolerant plants poorly understood.

Salt marsh ecosystems harbor dense microbial communities; however, because of the complex ecological interactions between microbial populations, the functional capacity of the overall communities may differ from the linear summary of the functional potential of the individual populations (Faust and Raes 2012; van der Heijden and Hartmann 2016). Network analysis can provide crucial information on microbial community interactions that cannot be obtained by traditional analysis of microbial community composition and calculation of diversity metrics (Deng et al. 2012). Moreover, understanding ecological interactions between community members may be used to identify keystone species of wetland ecosystems, which may be used to predict the consequences of environmental perturbations (van der Heijden and Hartmann 2016; Urakawa and Bernhard 2017; Banerjee, Schlaeppi and van der Heijden 2018). Network analyses have been successfully applied to explore the ecological interaction patterns among microbial species in a broad

range of soil and wetland ecosystems (Barberán et al. 2012; Hartmann et al. 2014; Lin et al. 2014; Hartman et al. 2018).

The overall goal of this work is to elucidate the compositional and structural diversity of the microbial communities that are intimately associated with the roots of S. alterniflora, and determine their potential roles in the health and productivity of the plant host. Thus, it was hypothesized that S. alterniflora phenotypes recruit distinct rhizosphere and bulk sediment microbial communities, varying in size and diversity, and guided by specific keystone species. To support this hypothesis, a next-generation sequencing approach was applied to investigate the composition of prokaryotic, diazotrophic and fungal communities in the rhizosphere and bulk sediments of tall and short forms of S. alterniflora from a pristine salt marsh on Skidaway Island, Georgia. Additionally, quantitative polymerase chain reaction (qPCR) analysis was employed to estimate the absolute abundance of bacterial, archaeal and diazotrophic communities. Finally, the ecological roles of and interactions between microbial community members were inferred from co-occurrence network analysis. The results here demonstrate that S. alterniflora phenotype and proximity to the root zone are indeed selective forces that shape microbial community abundance and diversity in salt marsh habitats.

#### MATERIALS AND METHODS

#### Site description

This study was conducted at the Saltmarsh Ecosystem Research Facility (SERF) on Skidaway Island in Savannah, Georgia, on 23 May 2017. The SERF marsh experiences daily tides and the air temperatures at this site range from 2°C in the winter to as high as 40°C in the summer, while overlying water temperatures vary between 12 and 25°C. The natural vegetation of the marsh is dominated by a nearly monospecific stand of smooth cordgrass, *S. alterniflora*, and the sediments are intensively bioturbated by fiddler crabs, mainly *Uca pugnax* (Kostka, Roychoudhury and Van Cappellen 2002).

#### Sample collection and DNA extraction

Three and six individual S. alterniflora plants were gently collected from the sediments colonized by tall or short plant phenotypes, respectively. Plant root systems were rinsed with filtered autoclaved saline solution 0.9% NaCl. Approximately, 10 g of roots were separated from rhizomes by tweezers, placed into 50 ml sterile tubes and washed twice in 20 ml of filtered autoclaved saline solution with gentle inversion. Sediment remaining attached to the root system was considered to be rhizosphere. Our sampling method cannot be used to discriminate between endophytes, epiphytes or root tightly associated with microbes; thus, we refer to these combined root-associated communities as 'rhizosphere'. Four bulk sediment cores per site (at 0-20 cm depth) were collected from the same locations using polycarbonate cores (Kostka, Roychoudhury and Van Cappellen 2002). Two independent DNA extractions were performed from each of the rhizosphere and bulk sediments using the DNeasy PowerSoil kit (Qiagen, Germantown, MD, USA) according to the manufacturer's protocol, and quantified with the Qubit HS Assay kit (Invitrogen, Carlsbad, CA, USA). Finally, 5 ng of the extracted DNA was used to generate small-subunit rRNA (SSU rRNA), nitrogenase subunit H (nifH) and nuclear ribosomal internal transcribed spacer region (ITS) amplicons.

## Quantitative polymerase chain reaction (qPCR) amplification

Three technical replicates were performed for each of the qPCR assays on a StepOnePlus machine using PowerUp SYBR Green Master Mix (Applied Biosystems, Austin, TX, USA). Bacterial, archaeal and diazotrophic community sizes were estimated based on the abundance of SSU rRNA genes, and *nifH* genes using standard primer sets 331F/518R, Arch787F/Arch1059R and PolF/PolR for quantification of bacterial, archaeal and nitrogenfixing microorganisms, respectively, according to previously described reaction conditions and standard curves (Warren *et al.* 2017; Carrell *et al.* 2019; Kolton *et al.* 2019). The specificity of PCR products was confirmed by melting curve analyses and gel electrophoresis of the amplicons. Bacterial, archaeal SSU rRNA and *nifH* gene copy numbers were calculated based on standard curves and presented as gene copy numbers per gram of wet sediment.

#### High-throughput libraries preparation and sequencing

The PCR reactions were performed in triplicates, and products were combined before barcoding. Microbial community composition was determined by applying a two-step high-throughput sequencing-based protocol (Green, Venkatramanan and Nagib 2015). The prokaryotic communities were determined by the amplification V4 variable regions of the SSU rRNA gene using the primer set 515F and 806R (Caporaso et al. 2011), as previously described (Wilson et al. 2016; Kolton et al. 2017, 2019). The diversity and composition of diazotrophic communities were assessed by amplification of the nifH gene fragment (encoding the nitrogenase reductase subunit) as a molecular marker for nitrogen-fixing microorganisms, using IGK3 and DVV primer set to generate 396 bp PCR products as previously described (Gaby et al. 2018; Carrell et al. 2019). The analysis of the fungal communities was performed based on the ITS1 region of the fungal rRNA gene using the primer set ITS1F (5'-AAGTCGTAA CAAGGTTTCC) and ITS2 (5'-GCTGCGTTCTTCATCGATGC) (White et al. 1990; Smith and Peay 2014). Resulting barcoded amplicon libraries were sequenced on an Illumina MiSeq 2000 platform using a 500-cycle v2 sequencing kit, paired-end 2  $\times$  250 cycle sequencing mode at the DNA Services Facility at the University of Illinois at Chicago as previously described (Green, Venkatramanan and Naqib 2015). The Illumina-generated SSU rRNA, nifH and ITS gene amplicon sequences were deposited in the BioProject database (www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/bioproject) under accession PRJNA589133, PRJNA589172 and PRJNA589257, respectively.

#### **Bioinformatic sequence analysis**

Initially, the forward and reverse amplification primer sequences were removed from the raw fastq files with Cutadapt v.1.8.1 (Martin 2011). Resulting sequences were quality-filtered and assembled into error-corrected amplicon sequence variants (ASVs) using DADA2 v1.10.0 (Callahan et al. 2016), and filtered to meet the expected lengths of 251–255 bp for V4 variable regions of the SSU rRNA gene, and 330–360 bp for nifH gene fragment. Chimera sequences were removed using the removeBimeraDenovo function of DADA2. These high-quality sequences were annotated to the SILVA SSU rRNA reference alignment (release 132), UNITE (release 7.2) or nifH reference alignment database (Quast et al. 2012; Koljalg et al. 2013; Gaby et al. 2018) using the RDP classifier (Wang et al. 2007) as implemented in Mothur v.1.40 software (Schloss et al. 2009) with a minimum confidence threshold of 50%. Sequences classified as 'plant', 'chloroplast', 'mitochondria', 'protist' or 'did not match any taxonomic Class' were excluded from the final dataset.

#### Data analysis in R

Statistical analyses were conducted in R v3.5 (R Development Core Team 2018). Alpha diversity indices were calculated based on the number of unique ASVs (richness) and Shannon community diversity. Randomly selected 22931, 1208 and 2123 sequences per sample were used to estimates alpha diversity indices for prokaryotic, diazotrophic and fungal communities, respectively. Alpha diversity indices of bulk and rhizosphere microbial communities were calculated for each S. *alterniflora* phenotype and tested for significant statistical differences using a two-sided Wilcoxon test.

The final datasets were filtered to remove ASV that appeared only once in the dataset and/or had <15 counts. After discarding rare ASVs, a total of 9249384 SSU rRNA, 149678 nifH and 356247 ITS sequences were normalized by cumulative sum scaling (CSS; Paulson et al. 2013) and used for the compositional and beta diversity analyses. Major variance components of beta diversity were determined using unconstrained principal coordinates analysis (PCoA) of Bray-Curtis distance matrices. The effect of S. alterniflora growth forms on community similarity was estimated with a permutational multivariate analysis of variance (PERMANOVA) and BETADISP statistical tests with 1000 permutations. Additionally, pairwise correlations between dissimilarity matrices generated from each of the analyzed genes were assessed by a Mantel test with 1000 permutations. Ordination and statistical analyses were carried out in phyloseq and vegan R packages (Dixon 2003; McMurdie and Holmes 2013).

To identify possible indicator species, we used a correlationbased approach employing the multipatt function with 9999 permutations in the Indicspecies package. This analysis integrates two species traits: exclusivity (exclusively present in the habitat) and fidelity (present in all samples of that habitat; De Caceres, Legendre and Moretti 2010). Additionally, a machine learning algorithm, random forests (RF; Breiman 2001), with 1000 trees followed by the Boruta algorithm for feature selection (average z-scores of 1000 runs; Kursa and Rudnicki 2010) was applied to predict specific ASVs that significantly segregated between S. alterniflora growth forms. Finally, ASVs that were selected by both approaches were coined 'indicator species'. The relative abundances of the selected ASVs were calculated at the taxonomic class levels, and heatmaps were constructed based on z-score transformed abundances to improve normality and homogeneity of variances.

Network analysis was applied to gain a better understanding of potential interactions of the indicator species. Metaco-occurrence networks were constructed to visualize interactions between bacterial, fungal and diazotrophic communities associated with tall and short Spartina phenotypes using the SpiecEasi R package (https://github.com/zdk123/SpiecEasi). SpiecEasi (Sparse InversE Covariance estimation for Ecological Association and Statistical Inference) infers direct microbial interactions from the community composition data with the Meinshausen-Buhlmann's ('mb') neighborhood selection. This selection method reduces the number of spurious interactions and outperforms other conventional methods used for assessing networks in microbial community datasets (Kurtz et al. 2015). The resulting adjacency matrices were converted into network objects, and network properties were estimated using the igraph package (Csardi and Nepusz 2006). Well-connected microbial taxa with other members in microbial co-occurrence networks potentially have a broad regulatory effect on their ecosystems. We identified keystone species as five ASVs with the highest number of connections ('degree centrality'). Keystone species were calculated separately for each of the *Spartina* phenotypes related networks.

#### RESULTS

High-throughput sequencing of small subunit ribosomal RNA genes, the fungal ITS1 region of rRNA operons and *nifH* gene fragments yielded a total of 924 938, 356 247 and 161 079 high-quality sequences, respectively. High-quality sequences were evenly distributed across all samples, resulting in 20 632–48 833 sequences per sample (median 34 730) for prokaryotic communities; 2088–45 026 sequences per sample (median 9730) for fungal communities; and 1138–10 782 sequences per sample (median 5413) for diazotrophic communities. Among the high-quality sequences obtained, 2699 prokaryotic, 266 fungal and 690 *nifH* unique ASVs were observed across all samples.

#### Microbial diversity analysis

Profound differences were observed in the diversity, abundance and composition of microbial communities associated with different S. alterniflora phenotypes and distance from the roots (Figs 1–3). Rarefaction curve-based species richness and Shannon diversity analyses support that microbial communities' alpha diversity is significantly affected by plant phenotype. More diverse prokaryotic and diazotrophic communities were established in the area dominated by the tall phenotype of S. alterniflora, whereas diversity indices of the bulk sediment did not differ from those observed in the rhizosphere (Fig. 1). Conversely, species richness and Shannon diversity revealed that the fungal community is more diverse in the area dominated by the short plant phenotype. Additionally, a clear diversity gradient from bulk to rhizosphere sediment was exhibited by the fungal community (Fig. 1).

To determine the influence of S. alterniflora phenotype and association with the rhizosphere on microbial communities' beta diversity, unconstrained PCoA and PERMANOVA based on the Bray-Curtis distance matrices were performed. These analyses underlined the important role of plant phenotype on the distribution of microbial communities. Accordingly, plant phenotype explained almost 50% of variation in prokaryotic ( $R^2 = 0.49$ , P < 0.001, Fig. 2A; Supplementary Data 1, Supporting Information) and  $\sim$ 35% of variation in diazotrophic (R<sup>2</sup> = 0.35, P < 0.001, Fig. 3A; Supplementary Data 1, Supporting Information) community composition. Furthermore, the rhizosphere was shown to be secondarily influential, explaining  $\sim$ 15% of the variation in the prokaryotic and diazotrophic communities composition (R<sup>2</sup> = 0.15, P < 0.005; R<sup>2</sup> = 0.18, P < 0.001, Fig. 2A, Fig. 3A; Supplementary Data 1, Supporting Information). While prokaryotic communities were selected mainly by plant phenotype, fungal community distribution was primarily determined by the influence of the rhizosphere. The rhizosphere explained nearly 23% of the variation in fungal communities ( $R^2 = 0.225$ , P < 0.001; Figure S1, Supplementary Data 1, Supporting Information), whereas only 8% of fungal community dissimilarity ( $R^2 = 0.079$ , P < 0.05) was attributed to plant phenotype (Figure S1, Supplementary Data 1, Supporting Information). Overall, S. alterniflora phenotype and the rhizosphere explained up to 71.1, 65.4 and 40.1% of the variance in the Spartina-associated prokaryotic, diazotrophic and fungal communities, respectively.

Since the PERMANOVA test is sensitive to differences in group dispersion, a permutation test for homogeneity of multivariate dispersions (BETADISP, Anderson 2006) was used to evaluate multivariate homogeneity of dispersions for each group. Accordingly, the results of the BETADISP analysis indicated that group dispersion of beta diversity, calculated with Bray–Curtis distances, were not significantly different for the prokaryotic and diazotrophic communities. These dispersion tests suggest that observed differences between microbial communities were primarily driven by true biological differences and not an artifact of within-group dispersion.

Finally, Mantel tests were applied to determine the correlation between the distribution patterns of the prokaryote, diazotrophic and fungal communities. Mantel tests revealed a significant correlation between the prokaryotic, diazotrophic and fungal communities. The distribution of fungal communities was significantly correlated with the distributions of the prokaryotic and diazotrophic communities ( $R_{Mantel} = 0.45$ , P < 0.001;  $R_{Mantel} = 0.53$ , P < 0.001, respectively), although these correlations were weaker than the correlation between the prokaryotic and diazotrophic communities ( $R_{Mantel} = 0.89$ , P < 0.001).

#### Prokaryotic community analysis

Microbial abundance and taxonomic composition varied with plant phenotype and proximity to the root system. Community size estimation at the domain level indicated contrasting trends in bacterial and archaeal populations. Significantly denser bacterial populations were observed in the sediment of the tall plant phenotype in comparison to the area colonized by the short plants (Fig. 2B; Supplementary Data 2, Supporting Information). In parallel, the relative abundance of the archaeal populations increased as a result of the transition from the tall to the short plant sediment (Fig. 2D; Supplementary Data 2, Supporting Information). The differences in microbial community composition, as revealed by a next-generation sequencing approach, correlated well with absolute abundance as estimated by qPCR of SSU rRNA genes. The abundance of bacterial SSU rRNA genes was nearly 15-fold higher in the bulk sediment of the tall plants  $(9.44 \pm 0.23$  gene copy numbers per gram of wet sediment) relative to the bulk sediment of the short plants  $[8.01 \pm 0.11 \log(\text{gene}$ copy numbers per gram of wet sediment)] (Fig. 2C). Conversely, the abundance of archaeal SSU rRNA genes was nearly 15-fold higher in the bulk sediment of the short plants [5.15  $\pm$  0.07 log(gene copy numbers per gram of wet sediment)] in comparison to the bulk sediment of the tall plants [3.94  $\pm$  0.53 log(gene copy numbers per gram of wet sediment)] (Fig. 2C).

The majority of retrieved bacterial sequences were affiliated with the phyla Proteobacteria, Chloroflexi, Bacteroidetes, Acidobacteria and Epsilonbacteraeota, which comprised up to 69 and 80% of bacterial sequences associated with short and tall plants, respectively (Fig. 2B; Supplementary Data 2, Supporting Information). Overall, Proteobacteria and Chloroflexi represented the dominant phyla. Furthermore, the relative abundance of Proteobacteria was significantly higher among the tall plants ( $51.7 \pm 4\%$ , P < 0.001) relative to the short plants ( $28.2 \pm 5.8\%$ ). In contrast, Chloroflexi were approximately twice as high (P < 0.001) in the area colonized by short plants with a relative abundance of  $26 \pm 3.6\%$  compared to around only 12.5% in the area colonized by tall plant phenotype (Fig. 2B; Supplementary Data 2, Supporting Information). Moreover, members of



Figure 1. Alpha diversity indices of the microbial communities associated with tall and short phenotypes of S. *alterniflora* from Skidaway Island, Georgia, USA. (A) Prokaryotic community; (B) diazotrophic community; and (C) fungal community. Alpha diversity indices were calculated based on a randomly selected 22931, 1208 and 2123 sequences per sample for prokaryotic, diazotrophic and fungal communities, respectively. The 'Bulk' and 'Rhizo' indicate bulk and rhizosphere sediments, respectively. 'Short' and 'Tall' define the S. *alterniflora* phenotype. The asterisks indicate statistically significant differences between observations based on a Wilcoxon signed-rank test. \*P < 0.05, \*\*P < 0.01 and 'ns' indicates no significant differences.

the Epsilonbacteraeota were specifically enriched in the rhizosphere sediments of both plant phenotypes (Fig. 2B; Supplementary Data 2, Supporting Information). The archaeal community was distributed across six phyla and contributed up to 16% of the total SSU rRNA gene sequences (Fig. 2D; Supplementary Data 2, Supporting Information). Generally, the relative abundance of archaeal phyla changed according to the plant growth form, with the vast majority of archaeal phyla showing a higher relative abundance in the area of short plants. An exception was the *Thaumarcheota*, which showed a significantly higher relative abundance (P < 0.001) in the area occupied by tall plants (Fig. 2D; Supplementary Data 2, Supporting Information).

Since iron and sulfur biogeochemical cycles are closely associated and play an important role in the carbon and the nitrogen cycles of salt marshes, we screened our sequence data to investigate potential sulfate-reducing and iron/sulfur-oxidizing prokaryotes. In general, a significantly higher relative abundance of these functional groups was observed in the rhizosphere sediments in comparison to the bulk sediments, regardless of plant phenotype (Fig. 4A). Collectively, sulfate-reducing bacteria (SRB) accounted for ~12.5% of the prokaryotic community detected at the Skidaway salt marsh and showed a higher relative abundance in the areas colonized by the short plant phenotype (Fig. 4A; Supplementary Data 3, Supporting Information). Further, the dominant SRB families detected in our sequence database were Desulfarculaceae, Desulfobacteraceae and Desulfobulbaceae, which collectively contributed up to 9% of the prokaryotic communities (Supplementary Data 3, Supporting Information). Nevertheless, different niche preferences were observed for each SRB family. While the relative abundance of the Desulfarculaceae decreased ~2-fold from the short to the tall phenotype, an opposing trend was observed for the Desulfobacteraceae (Fig. 4D). The relative abundance of the Desulfobulbaceae increased almost 10-fold from 0.45  $\pm$  0.02% in the rhizosphere of short plants up to 4.76  $\pm$  0.32% in the rhizosphere of tall plants (Fig. 4D).

Plant phenotype did not appear to influence the relative abundance of either putative sulfur-oxidizing bacteria (SOB) or

putative iron-oxidizing bacteria (FeOB) in bulk sediments. However, a significant rhizosphere effect was observed, as SOB and FeOB were, in general, more abundant in the rhizosphere in comparison to the bulk sediments at the genus level (Fig. 4A). Whereas the relative abundance of SOB in the rhizosphere of tall plants (4.3  $\pm$  0.96%) was significantly lower (6  $\pm$  0.21%) than that in the rhizosphere of short plants (Fig. 4A; Supplementary Data 3, Supporting Information), the relative abundance of FeOB in the rhizosphere of tall plants (0.9  $\pm$  0.1%) was significantly higher than that in the rhizosphere of short plants (0.3  $\pm$  0.03%) (Fig. 4A; Supplementary Data 3, Supporting Information). Dominant SOB genera were taxonomically affiliated with the Campylobacterales and Desulfovibrionales orders (Fig. 4C). While SOB genera Sulfurovum and Sulfurimonas were significantly lower in the rhizosphere of tall plants in comparison with the rhizosphere of short plants, the relative abundance of Arcobacter and Desulfovibrio genera were substantially higher in the rhizosphere of the tall plants relative to the rhizosphere of short plants (Fig. 4C; Supplementary Data 3, Supporting Information). Members of the genus Mariprofundus, taxonomically affiliated with Zetaproteobacteria, were dominant FeOB at the Skidaway salt marsh. Moreover, Mariprofundus was exclusively detected in the rhizosphere sediments. Finally, a significantly higher relative abundance of Mariprofundus was present in the rhizosphere of the tall plants (0.55  $\pm$  0.07%) in comparison to the rhizosphere of the short phenotype (0.17  $\pm$  0.04%) (Fig. 4B; Supplementary Data 3, Supporting Information).

#### Diazotrophic community analysis

Diazotrophic communities showed similar trends in agreement with overall prokaryotic communities. Using a qPCR approach, a significantly higher abundance of putative diazotrophs was observed in rhizosphere sediments in comparison to the bulk sediments; however, no significant differences in the absolute abundances of putative diazotrophs were observed between short and tall plant phenotypes (Fig. 3B). The relative abundance of putative bacterial diazotrophs in bulk sediments of short plants comprised  $83.1 \pm 4.1\%$  and increased up to  $97.5 \pm 1\%$ 



Figure 2. Beta diversity and composition of prokaryotic communities associated with tall and short phenotypes of S. alterniflora from Skidaway Island, Georgia, USA. (A) PCoA of prokaryotic community compositions based on the Bray–Curtis distance matrices calculated from CSS normalization of the final data; (B) bacterial and archaeal absolute abundance determined by qPCR of SSU rRNA genes with domain level primers; (C) relative abundance of the dominant bacterial phyla; (D) relative abundance of the most abundant archaeal phyla. The 'Bulk' and 'Rhizo' indicate bulk and rhizosphere sediments, respectively. 'Short' and 'Tall' define the S. alterniflora phenotype. Diversity, composition and absolute abundances of the prokaryotic communities were assessed from the same samples collected from bulk and rhizosphere sediments of the tall and short forms of S. alterniflora. Triplicate samples were used to quantify the abundances of prokaryotes. The asterisks indicate statistically significant differences between observations based on a Wilcoxon signed-rank test. \*P < 0.05, \*\*P < 0.01, \*\*\*P < 0.001 and 'ns' indicates no significant differences.

in the rhizosphere of tall plants. Conversely, the relative abundance of putative archaeal diazotrophs increased from 2.45  $\pm$  1% in the rhizosphere of tall plants to 16.9  $\pm$  4.1% in the bulk sediment of short plants (Fig. 3C; Supplementary Data 4, Supporting Information). Approximately 84.3% of the diazotrophic community was distributed across three dominant classes, including Gammaproteobacteria, Deltaproteobacteria and Clostridia (Fig. 3C; Supplementary Data 4, Supporting Information). Specifically, members of the Teredinibacter genus within the Cellvibrionaceae, well known for their cellulolytic capabilities, were most abundant among diazotrophic populations (Fig. 5A; Supplementary Data 5, Supporting Information). The dominant genera Teredinibacter (13.7  $\pm$  2%) and Tolumonas (9.9  $\pm$  1.6%) collectively contributed up to 25% of the putative diazotrophic community in the rhizosphere of tall plants. Populations with documented capabilities to mediate the iron and/or sulfur cycles contributed 17.2  $\pm$  1.7% and 17.9  $\pm$  1% of the diazotrophic community in the area colonized by tall or short plants, respectively. More specifically, putative diazotrophic iron-oxidizing bacteria, taxonomically affiliated with autotrophic Sideroxydans (1.6  $\pm$  0.46%) and heterotrophic Bradyrhizobium (2  $\pm$  0.27%) genera, were significantly enriched in the rhizosphere of tall plants (Fig. 5B; Supplementary Data 5, Supporting Information). In contrast, putative diazotrophic sulfur-oxidizers, taxonomically belonging to Thioalkalispira genus ( $6.9 \pm 0.6\%$ ), were significantly enriched in the rhizosphere of short plants (Fig. 5B; Supplementary Data 5, Supporting Information). A comparative analysis of prokaryotic and diazotrophic communities revealed the potential for methanogenic archaea to mediate nitrogen input in the area colonized by short plants. While putative diazotrophic methanogens, taxonomically affiliated with *Methanomicrobiaceae*, comprised only  $0.0 \pm 0.0\%$  and  $0.1 \pm 0.09\%$  of overall prokaryotic communities in the bulk sediments and the rhizosphere, respectively, their relative abundance comprised up to  $15.5 \pm 3.5\%$  and  $8.5 \pm 1.2\%$  of diazotrophs (Fig. 5C; Supplementary Data 4, Supporting Information).

#### Fungal community analysis

In contrast to prokaryotic and diazotrophic communities, which appear to be shaped by plant phenotype as well as distance from the root system, fungal populations uniformly colonized bulk



Figure 3. Beta diversity and composition of diazotrophic communities associated with tall and short phenotypes of *S. alterniflora* from Skidaway Island, Georgia, USA. (A) PCoA of diazotrophic community compositions based on the Bray–Curtis distance matrices calculated from CSS normalization of the final data; (B) diazotrophic absolute abundance determined by qPCR of the nifH gene genes; (C) relative abundance of the dominant bacterial classes; (D) relative abundance of the most abundance daterniflora from Skidaway Island, Georgia, USA. (a) PCoA of diazotrophic community compositions based on the Bray–Curtis distance matrices calculated from CSS normalization of the final data; (B) diazotrophic absolute abundance determined by qPCR of the nifH gene genes; (C) relative abundance of the dominant bacterial classes; (D) relative abundance of the most abundance abundance daterniflora the 'Bulk' and 'Rhizo' indicate bulk and rhizosphere sediments, respectively. 'Short' and 'Tall' define the *S. alterniflora* phenotype. Diversity, composition and absolute abundances of the diazotrophic communities were assessed from the same samples collected from bulk and rhizosphere sediments of the tall and short forms of *S. alterniflora*. Triplicate samples were used to quantify the abundances of diazotrophs with the PoIF/PoIR nifH primer set. The asterisks indicate statistically significant differences between observations based on a Wilcoxon signed-rank test. \*\*P < 0.01 and \*\*\*P < 0.001.

and rhizosphere sediments of the Spartina plants. Beta diversity (Figure S1, Supporting Information) and taxonomic analyses of fungal communities suggest that Spartina phenotype and the distance from the root had a limited effect on the fungal community. Moreover, the observed distribution of the fungal community was mainly effected by changes in abundance within the community at lower taxonomic levels, most likely at the ASV level. Overall, fungal community composition remained stable, and no trends were observed across plant phenotype and/or distance from the roots. Members of the Ascomycota (69.9  $\pm$  1.1%) and Basidiomycota (29.3  $\pm$  0.8%) phyla accounted for nearly 100% of fungal sequences and their relative abundance did not appear to be influenced by plant phenotype and/or by the distance from the plant roots. Although we were unable to detect the significant differences in the relative abundances of fungal populations at the genus, family, class and phylum levels, members of the Venturiales order developed significantly denser populations in the rhizosphere sediments relative to the bulk sediments, regardless of plant phenotype. The relative abundance of the Venturiales in the rhizosphere sediments of the short and tall plants were 3.5  $\pm$  0.4% and 3.7  $\pm$  1.1%, respectively. In contrast,

their relative abundance in the bulk sediments were 1.2  $\pm$  0.2% and 1.2  $\pm$  0.4% for the short and tall plants, respectively (Figure S2, Supporting Information). On the other hand, the *Tremellales* order tends to establish a higher population in the bulk sediments. In the area colonized by the short plant phenotype, the relative abundance of the *Tremellales* were 18.1  $\pm$  0.9% and 12.1  $\pm$  0.9% in the bulk and rhizosphere sediments, respectively. Additionally, the relative abundance of the *Tremellales* in the area colonized by taller plants were 22.6  $\pm$  0.9% and 16.6  $\pm$  0.9% in the bulk and rhizosphere sediments, respectively. Supporting Information).

### Indicator species analysis

An indicator species analysis was applied to identify populations of prokaryotic, diazotrophic and fungal communities, whose occurrences varied significantly with plant phenotype and the distance from the root system. Additionally, we confirmed the selection by applying a machine learning approach with a random forest algorithm. The combined



Figure 4. Taxonomic composition of iron and sulfur-cycling communities associated with tall and short phenotypes of *S. alterniflora* from Skidaway Island, Georgia, USA. Prokaryotic SSU rRNA gene amplicon libraries were annotated to the SILVA SSU rRNA reference alignment (release 132), and putative iron and sulfur metabolizing bacteria were extracted. (A) The overall distribution of the iron and sulfur metabolizing bacteria: iron-oxidizing bacteria—FeOx; sulfide-oxidizing bacteria—SOB; sulfur/sulfate-reducing bacteria—SRB, (B) dominant putative iron-oxidizing bacteria, (C) dominant putative sulfide-oxidizing bacteria and (D) dominant sulfur/sulfate-reducing bacteria. The 'Bulk' and 'Rhizo' indicate bulk and rhizosphere sediments, respectively. 'Short' and 'Tall' define the *S. alterniflora* phenotype. The asterisks indicate statistically significant differences between observations based on a Wilcoxon signed-rank test. \**P* < 0.05, \*\**P* < 0.01, \*\*\**P* < 0.001 and 'ns' indicates no significant of the sulfate-reducing bacteria.

approach revealed 175 prokaryotic, 70 diazotrophic and 15 fungal unique indicator species. Accordingly, the 175 prokaryotic indicator species were distributed across 35 classes of 24 phyla, representing 14.2  $\pm$  0.94% and 21  $\pm$  1.34% of the prokaryotic community in the area colonized by the tall and short plant phenotypes, respectively. Moreover, cluster analysis of indicator species at the class level revealed distinct groups specifically associated with plant phenotypes and distance from the root system (Fig. 6). While heatmap groups 1 and 2 were explicitly associated with the tall plant phenotype, groups 3 and 4 were indicators of the short phenotype. Additionally, members of clusters 1 and 3 separate according to distance from the root system (Fig. 6). Therefore, in corroboration of taxonomic analysis, Zetaproteobacteria and Campylobacteria were indicator species for iron and sulfur oxidation in the rhizosphere sediments of the tall and the short plant phenotypes, respectively (Fig. 6). Finally, the indicator species belonging to archaeal classes Bathyarchaeia, Thermoplasmata and Woesearchaeia were exclusively observed in the bulk sediments of short plant phenotypes (Fig. 6). Indicator diazotroph species were distributed across six classes of four phyla, representing a relative abundance of 32.5  $\pm$  2.8% and  $28.4 \pm 1.1\%$  of diazotrophs in bulk and rhizosphere sediments, respectively. Diazotrophic indicator species predominantly clustered according to plant phenotype and distance from the root surface (Figure S2, Supporting Information). Moreover, in agreement with prokaryotic indicator species, methanogenic archaea *Methanomicrobia* with the potential for diazotrophy were explicitly observed in the bulk sediment of the short plant phenotype (Figure S2, Supporting Information).

#### Characteristics of microbial networks

The ecological roles and interactions between indicator species were inferred from co-occurrence network analysis. Accordingly, we constructed and characterized separate microbial cooccurrence networks for the tall and the short plant phenotypes. The tall plant network contained 177 nodes (106 prokaryotic, 59 diazotrophic and 12 fungal unique indicator species) connected by 514 edges, while the short plant network contained 147 nodes (106 prokaryotic, 28 diazotrophic and 13 fungal unique indicator species) connected by 491 edges. Moreover, the topological characterization of the microbiome networks revealed that the



Figure 5. Taxonomic composition of diazotrophic communities associated with tall and short phenotypes of S. alterniflora from Skidaway Island, Georgia, USA. (A) Dominant diazotrophic genera; (B) dominant putative iron-oxidizing diazotrophic bacteria; (C) relative abundance of methanogenic *Methanomicrobiaceae* in the prokaryotic and diazotrophic communities; and (D) dominant putative sulfide-oxidizing diazotrophic bacteria. The 'Bulk' and 'Rhizo' indicate bulk and rhizosphere sediments, respectively. 'Short' and 'Tall' define the S. alterniflora phenotype. The asterisks indicate statistically significant differences between observations based on a Wilcoxon signed-rank test. \*P < 0.05, \*\*P < 0.01, \*\*\*P < 0.001 and 'ns' indicates no significant differences.

area colonized by the short plant phenotype had a greater network density (0.046), node betweenness centrality (0.213) and lower mean distance (3.336) in comparison to the area colonized by the tall plant phenotype (Table 1). Additionally, while microbial interactions in the tall plants were mainly regulated by diazotrophic populations (Fig. 7A), microbial assembly associated with the short plant phenotype was governed by fungal populations (Fig. 7B).

Keystone taxa appear to play a vital role in interspecies interactions and ecosystem functioning (Banerjee, Schlaeppi and van der Heijden 2018). Moreover, their removal from the ecosystem may result in a drastic shift in the ability of the microbial community to support ecosystem functions (van der Heijden and Hartmann 2016). Here, we define keystone taxa as the five most connected indicator species (Table 2; Supplementary Data 6, Supporting Information). The central location of keystone taxa in the network and their taxonomic identity indicate that *Proteobacteria*-affiliated members of diazotrophic genera *Teredinibacter* and *Tolumonas* are functionally redundant and/or influence broad processes such as organic matter decomposition



Figure 6. The relative abundance of prokaryotic indicator species represented according to S. alterniflora phenotypes and distance to the root zone on Skidaway Island, Georgia, USA. Hierarchical clustering heatmap showing the correlation in abundance variation of prokaryotic indicator species. An indicator species analysis was applied to identify microbial populations, whose occurrences varied significantly between the plant phenotypes and with distance from the root system; analysis was confirmed using a machine learning approach with a random forest algorithm. This combined approach revealed 175 prokaryotic indicator species. The relative abundances of the indicator species were calculated at the taxonomic class levels, and heatmaps were constructed based on z-score transformed abundances to improve normality and homogeneity of variances. The 'Bulk' and 'Rhizo' indicate bulk and rhizosphere sediments, respectively. 'Short' and 'Tall' define the S. alterniflora phenotype.

Table 1.	Properties	of bulk and	rhizosphere	microbial	l meta co-occurrence	networks.
----------	------------	-------------	-------------	-----------	----------------------	-----------

	<sup>a</sup> Bacteria		a Archaea		<sup>a</sup> Fungi	Interactions		Network density	Mean distance	Centrality		
	16S	NifH	16S	NifH	ITS	Positive	Negative			Closeness	Betweennes	s Degree
Tall Short	100 92	58 27	6 14	1 1	12 13	229 193	61 58	0.033 0.046	4.084 3.336	0.022 0.019	0.115 0.213	0.240 0.297

<sup>a</sup>Number of indicator species in the network.

(Table 2). Additionally, network analysis underlines the importance of the *Crenarchaeta*-affiliated versatile *Bathyarchaeota* in the area colonized by the short plant phenotype.

## DISCUSSION

While a wealth of information is available on the structure and functioning of microbial communities in salt marsh sediments associated with *S. alterniflora* (Bowen *et al.* 2011, 2012; Kearns

et al. 2016), relatively few studies have focused on the role of plant phenotype or the rhizosphere. Using a DNA fingerprinting approach, Bowen et al. (2009) observed that bacterial composition in a New England salt marsh did not differ between *Spartina* growth forms early in the growing season (May–June), whereas a significant difference was observed later in the year (July–September). Differences in bacterial communities between growth forms were attributed to local environmental parameters such as benthic primary production and the source of organic carbon. Studies conducted in *Spartina*-dominated marsh



Figure 7. Microbiome networks. SpiecEasi network maps of the 175 prokaryotic, 70 diazotrophic and 15 fungal unique indicator species at the ASV level from: (A) the tall S. alterniflora and (B) short S. alterniflora forms. ASVs are color coded based on their taxonomic affiliation. Only indicator species with >7 interactions are presented.

Table 2. Identity	' and relative	abundance	of the l	keystone	microbes
-------------------	----------------	-----------	----------	----------	----------

Plant	Sequence ID	Gene	Class	Family	Genus	Number interactions	% of the interaction	Relative abundance (%)
Tall	NifH.ASV_374	NifH	Gammaproteobacteria G	Gammaproteobacteria	I	48	16.6	0.32 (0.1)
			S	р.	Gammaproteobacteria.	sp		
Tall	NifH.ASV_174	NifH	Gammaproteobacteria C	Cellvibrionaceae	Teredinibacter	38	13.1	0.37 (0.11)
Tall	NifH.ASV_284	NifH	Gammaproteobacteria C	Cellvibrionaceae	Teredinibacter	35	12.1	0.36 (0.11)
Tall	NifH.ASV_200	NifH	Gammaproteobacteria A	Aeromonadaceae	Tolumonas	33	11.4	0.34 (0.11)
Tall	NifH.ASV_274	NifH	Deltaproteobacteria S	yntrophobacteraceae	Syntrophobacter	21	7.2	0.44 (0.14)
Short	ITS.ASV_1	ITS	Leotiomycetes L	eotiomycetes	Leotiomycetes	50	19.9	4.74 (0.54)
Short	ITS.ASV_29	ITS	Tremellomycetes B	Bulleribasidiaceae	Vishniacozyma	49	19.5	0.31 (0.12)
Short	ITS.ASV_31	ITS	Leotiomycetes L	eotiomycetes	Leotiomycetes	32	12.7	0.31(0.12)
Short	ITS.ASV_124	ITS	Leotiomycetes L	eotiomycetes	Leotiomycetes	22	8.8	0.24 (0.09)
Short	16S.ASV_715	16S	Bathyarchaeia B	Bathyarchaeia	Bathyarchaeia	22	8.8	0.08 (0.03)

areas in Maine, USA (Zogg, Travis and Brazeau 2018) and in China (Lin et al. 2019) corroborated our results. Based on beta diversity analysis of SSU rRNA gene amplicons, these studies concluded that bacterial communities were distinct between Spartina growth forms, and a rhizosphere effect was observed. Zogg, Travis and Brazeau (2018) further linked plant genotype to bacterial community composition and suggested that root characteristics along with redox conditions in the rhizosphere could explain the differences observed between plant growth forms. In contrast to our results, rhizosphere alpha diversity did not differ significantly between tall and short plant phenotypes in previous work (Zogg, Travis and Brazeau 2018; Lin et al. 2019), and a higher diversity was observed in the rhizosphere in comparison to the bulk sediments (Zogg, Travis and Brazeau 2018). Although absolute abundance was not quantified in previous studies of bulk sediments associated with Spartina growth forms, higher bacterial abundance was observed in the rhizosphere of tall plants in comparison to short plants (Lin et al.

2019). Overall, our results confirm strong plant-microbe associations in the *Spartina* root zone by revealing contrasts in the community composition and abundance of archaea along with bacteria across gradients in plant growth form. Further, niche diversification in the tall plants appears to favor bacteria, whereas the short plant phenotype selects for archaea and fungi.

Although differences in the diversity and composition of bacterial communities have been established across *Spartina* growth forms in salt marsh sediments, phylogenetic analysis has generally been limited and comparable studies are not available for fungal or archaeal communities. Unlike prokaryotes, fungal communities did not appear to be structured by *Spartina* growth form as trends were not observed in beta diversity analysis (Figure S1, Supporting Information). In contrast, higher alpha diversity was observed for fungal communities in the bulk sediment in comparison to the rhizosphere (Fig. 1). This observation is surprising since most fungi are strict aerobes, dependent upon oxygen supply for growth, and *Spartina* roots release oxygen into

the rhizosphere (Sundby et al. 1998; Holmer, Gribsholt and Kristensen 2002; Koop-Jakobsen et al. 2018). Although our sequencing efforts were insufficient to recover anaerobic fungal communities, the obligate anaerobic fungi taxonomically affiliated with Neocallimastigomycota were observed in the bulk sediments of Spartina-dominated salt marshes of North Carolina, USA (Picard 2017). Members of the Neocallimastigomycota were considered as major contributors to the degradation of the recalcitrant plant polymers within the digestive tracts of many herbivores, including humans and mammals (Selinger, Forsberg and Cheng 1996; Ljungdahl 2008; Mar Rodríguez et al. 2015) and prone to frequent horizontal transfer of genes encoding polysaccharide degrading enzymes (Gruninger et al. 2014). Additionally, Neocallimastigomycota lack mitochondria and supply their energy needs by the NADH oxidation, leading to formation of bioavailable hydrogen (Gruninger et al. 2014), which may support symbiotic relationships with chemoautotrophic prokaryotes (Ivarsson et al. 2016). Higher bacterial diversity in the rhizosphere may be interpreted according to the 'resource island effect', whereby a plentiful supply of oxygen and labile carbon substrates produced by roots helps bacteria to combat a dynamic and stressful intertidal zone (Zogg, Travis and Brazeau 2018). Prokaryotes may outcompete fungi for these same substrates.

Although archaea were previously studied in Louisiana salt marsh sediments (Rietl et al. 2016), relatively few samples were analyzed, and neither plant phenotype nor distance from the root system was addressed. Here, we show that archaea are preferentially colonizing the area dominated by the short form of S. alterniflora. The majority of archaeal groups detected (Bathyarchaeota, Euryarchaeota, Asgardarchaeota, Crenarchaeota) are known for anaerobic metabolism and for colonizing anoxic habitats. For example, the Euryarchaeota are predominated by known methanogens, which are mostly strict anaerobes (Lyu et al. 2018), and the Bathyarchaeota are believed to carry out acetogenesis and dissimilatory nitrogen/sulfur reduction along with methane metabolism in anoxic environments (Zhou et al. 2018). Thus, our results indicate that the strongly reducing and sulfidic conditions found in short Spartina zones select for anaerobic archaea that are better adapted to these extreme conditions. More research is needed to define the role of archaea in salt marsh ecosystem function.

## Microbial populations mediating biogeochemical cycles in *Spartina*-dominated marshes

Previous research has revealed the dynamic interplay between the growth/physiology of macrophyte plants, macrofaunal bioturbation and microbially mediated processes that regulate biogeochemical cycles of carbon, sulfur, iron and nitrogen in salt marsh sediments. In the Spartina-dominated Skidaway marsh, sediments are rich in iron minerals and bathed in sulfaterich seawater. Thus, most organic matter decomposition occurs under anaerobic conditions through microbial respiration processes such as sulfate and iron(III) reduction, which produce sulfide and soluble Fe, respectively (Kostka et al. 2002; Kostka, Roychoudhury and Van Cappellen 2002; Gribsholt, Kostka and Kristensen 2003). Sediment anoxia and sulfide accumulation, in particular, limit nitrogen uptake and growth by Spartina (Mendelssohn and Morris 2000). Sulfide is toxic to plants and inhibits the microbial nitrogen cycle (nitrification, denitrification) in sediments (Dollhopf et al. 2005; Lamers et al. 2013). Through catalysis of sulfide and iron oxidation, microbial processes consume toxic sulfur and regulate redox poise in the root zone to benefit plants. These are just a few examples of how microbial processes may benefit plant health and productivity in salt marsh ecosystems.

A number of biological and geochemical parameters have been invoked to explain the contrasting microbial communities observed in the root zone of tall vs short Spartina plants, including plant productivity, oxygen concentration, root exudation and nitrogen limitation (Bowen et al. 2009; Zogg, Travis and Brazeau 2018; Lin et al. 2019). This study leverages extensive biogeochemical characterization of the same salt marsh sites at Skidaway Island. Our results point to reduction-oxidation chemistry, and the recycling of electron acceptors by multiple processes, as the major factors driving the selection of microbial populations in the root zone of Spartina. Substantial evidence collected from Georgia salt marshes indicates that biogeochemical cycles are enhanced in tall Spartina areas by a combination of tidal inundation, plant physiology and macrofaunal bioturbation (Kostka et al. 2002; Kostka, Roychoudhury and Van Cappellen 2002; Gribsholt, Kostka and Kristensen 2003; Hyun, Smith and Kostka 2007). In addition, similar relationships have been observed in the root zone of other intertidal plants (Hyun et al. 2009). In areas occupied by tall Spartina near large tidal creeks, chemical exchange, and especially oxygen supply, is enhanced by these processes resulting in the reoxidation of respiration products [sulfide, Fe(II), ammonium] and recycling of electron acceptors [oxygen, Fe(III), sulfate, nitrate]. Microbial activity is stimulated in parallel with plant productivity in the tall Spartina, resulting in higher rates of microbial respiration (Kostka, Roychoudhury and Van Cappellen 2002; Hyun, Smith and Kostka 2007). Conversely, the short Spartina root zone is highly reducing, with dissolved sulfide accumulating to high levels, and rates of microbial respiration are diminished along with plant production. The microbial nitrogen cycle, in particular, was shown to be inhibited in short Spartina zones, resulting in a lower abundance of nitrifying and denitrifying bacteria (Dollhopf et al. 2005).

In general, the prevalence of microbial processes inferred from the distribution of microbial groups paralleled with previous biogeochemical measurements. The Fe cycle, along with the nitrogen cycle, is impeded in the short *Spartina*, while microbial sulfate reduction and sulfur oxidation predominate. In agreement, both sulfate-reducing and sulfur-oxidizing microbial groups showed a higher relative abundance in short *Spartina* zones.

Nearly all taxa of known SRB showed a higher relative abundance in the short Spartina (Fig. 4; Supplementary Data 3, Supporting Information), where sulfate reduction was shown to be the predominant terminal electron-accepting process coupled to organic matter decomposition (Kostka, Roychoudhury and Van Cappellen 2002; Hyun, Smith and Kostka 2007). The most dominant members of the SRB in the rhizosphere of Spartina were affiliated with the genus Desulfatiglans of the Desulfobacteraceae family (Fig. 4D), previously known as Desulfobacterium (Suzuki et al. 2014). Metabolically diverse members of Desulfobacteraceae are chemoorganoheterotrophs that use sulfate as a terminal electron acceptor to oxidize numerous carbon sources such as ethanol, acetate, butyrate, pyruvate and aromatic compounds completely to CO<sub>2</sub> (Galushko and Kuever 2019). Desulfatiglans accounted for up to 8% of the total bacterial reads and contributed up to 65% of the SRB community (Fig. 4D). Members of the Desulfobacteriaceae family frequently dominate the SRB community in the salt marshes of the eastern coasts of the US and China (Hines et al. 1999; Klepac-Ceraj et al. 2004; Bahr et al. 2005; Lin et al. 2019). Collectively, these observations suggest that the Desulfatiglans group is comprised of generalist taxa that are adapted to a wide range of climatic conditions and maintain mutualistic interactions with S. alterniflora (Hines et al. 1999).

Past research in the Skidaway marsh demonstrated that the rhizosphere of tall Spartina plants represents a hotspot of Fe cycling, where Fe minerals are enriched and microbial Fe(III) respiration is closely coupled to Fe(II) oxidation (Gribsholt, Kostka and Kristensen 2003). Roots of Spartina plants act as efficient conduits of oxygen to the interior of the sediment because their well-developed aerenchyma system allows oxygen to diffuse from leaves to roots (Sundby et al. 1998; Holmer, Gribsholt and Kristensen 2002; Koop-Jakobsen et al. 2018). Oxygen supplied by roots and enhanced macrofaunal bioturbation associated with tall Spartina recycle reduced Fe, slowing down the turnover of S and impeding sulfate reduction (Gribsholt, Kostka and Kristensen 2003). The distribution of known SOB and Fe(II)-oxidizing bacteria (FeOB) agreed with biogeochemical evidence. Known FeOB showed three to four times higher relative abundance in the rhizosphere of the tall Spartina plants in comparison to the bulk sediment and the short Spartina (Fig. 4; Supplementary Data 3, Supporting Information). Interestingly, the Thaumarchaeota, which contains abundant nitrifying members, was the only archaeal group shown to be much more abundant in the tall Spartina rhizosphere and sediments (Fig. 2D; Supplementary Data 2, Supporting Information). Conversely, SOB, though present in the tall Spartina, had a higher relative abundance in the short Spartina rhizosphere (Fig. 4).

In previous studies employing a cultivation-based approach, iron plaques in the rhizosphere of wetland plants were shown to be colonized by a dense microbial community (Emerson, Weiss and Megonigal 1999), with FeOB estimated to account for up to 1% of the community (Weiss et al. 2003). However, few studies have applied culture-independent methods to quantify and to assess the ecophysiological properties of FeOB in salt marshes. Mariprofundus of the Zetaproteobacteria and Sideroxydans of the Betaproteobacteria were shown to predominate among FeOB communities associated with the Spartina rhizosphere (Fig. 3A and B), and a higher relative abundance was associated with the tall plant phenotype (Fig. 3A). Similarly, Mariprofundus was detected in association with Spartina plants exposed to restoration practices that enhance chemical exchange, thereby increasing redox potential (Thomas et al. 2019). Sideroxydans and Mariprofundus are microaerophilic chemolithoautotrophic bacteria that use iron as a sole energy source and are incapable of heterotrophic growth or oxidation of reduced S compounds common to the rhizosphere (Emerson et al. 2007, 2013; Weiss et al. 2007; Emerson, Fleming and McBeth 2010). These observations suggest that FeOB are uniquely adapted to Fe oxidation in the rhizosphere of salt marsh plants. Genomic and physiological analyses of FeOB revealed the potential for diazotrophy in Sideroxydans ES-1 and some strains of Mariprofundus (Kato et al. 2015). The presence of diazotrophic FeOB demonstrates a potential link between Fe oxidation, nitrogen and carbon fixation in Spartina-dominated salt marshes.

The dominant SOB observed, members of the *Campylobacter* aceae in the *Epsilonbacteraeota*, were significantly enriched in the rhizosphere of short plants (Fig. 4C). Members of the *Campylobacterales* support growth from the oxidation of reduced sulfur compounds coupled with the reduction of nitrate or oxygen (Takai et al. 2005; Campbell et al. 2006). In agreement with our observations, members of *Epsilonbacteraeota* were enriched in *Spartina* root-associated microbial communities in salt marshes of China (Hong et al. 2015; Huang et al. 2016; Lin et al. 2019) and Louisiana, USA (Rietl et al. 2016). The enrichment of *Epsilonbacteraeota* such as *Sulfurimonas*, *Sulfurovum* and *Arcobacter* on the root surfaces of

S. alterniflora suggests that the rhizosphere is a preferable niche for these microbial groups, and supports the hypothesis that plant recruitment of these particular bacterial populations can help overcome abiotic stresses in coastal environments through sulfide detoxification and sulfate assimilation. Previous work on the roots of Spartina (Mcclung and Patriquin 1980; Mcclung, Patriquin and Davis 1983), seagrass rhizomes (Elliott, Spear and Wyllie-Echeverria 2006) and the roots of rice seedlings (Joshi and Hollis 1977) implicated SOB in the detoxification of sulfides. Sulfur isotopic composition in Spartina and seagrasses point to a significant portion of S uptake derived from microbial sulfide oxidation occurring within the plant tissues (Carlson and Forrest 1982; Frederiksen et al. 2006; Holmer et al. 2009; Holmer and Kendrick 2013). In contrast, the chemical oxidation of sulfide is estimated to be approximately four orders of magnitude slower than biological (Jørgensen and Revsbech 1983; Millero 1986). These observations underline a crucial role for biological sulfur oxidation in sulfide detoxification and the supply of sulfur to the plants. Thus, the recruitment and maintenance of SOB in the rhizosphere appears essential for Spartina plant survival.

#### Diazotrophic prokaryotes associated with Spartina

The health and primary productivity of Spartina salt marsh ecosystems rely on the activity of nitrogen-fixing bacteria or diazotrophs. The presence and activity of diazotrophs are particularly important in young or restored marshes where rates of biological nitrogen fixation are sufficient to support plant growth (DeLaune, Feijtel and Patrick 1989; White and Howes 1994; Currin, Joye and Paerl 1996; Tyler, Mastronicola and McGlathery 2003). Diazotrophic community composition and rates of the nitrogen fixation in the salt marsh vary seasonally and with the distance from the root surface, and correlate with plant morphology (Fig. 2A; Gamble et al. 2010; Davis et al. 2011). In comparison with bulk sediment, the rhizosphere sediments frequently harbor more active diazotrophic communities (Patriquin 1978; Yoch and Whiting 1986). Moreover, diazotrophic activity is tightly associated with plant photosynthetic capacity (Whiting, Gandy and Yoch 1986) and bacterial sulfate reduction rates (Gandy and Yoch 1988).

Although we did not quantify diazotrophic activities, qPCRbased estimates indicated that the rhizosphere harbors a significantly more abundant diazotrophic community than bulk sediments (Fig. 3C). In contrast to past work (Bagwell et al. 1998; Piceno, Noble and Lovell 1999; Bagwell and Lovell 2000; Lovell et al. 2000, 2001, 2008; Gamble et al. 2010; Davis et al. 2011), we observed that both Spartina growth form and proximity to the root zone impacted the diversity of diazotrophic communities, with higher alpha diversity associated with the rhizosphere. This inconsistency is likely due to the low resolution of previously employed molecular methods. Further, we provide a detailed compositional analysis of diazotrophs in a pristine Spartina-dominated salt marsh. In agreement with previous field studies (Lovell et al. 2008; Gamble et al. 2010; Davis et al. 2011), Spartina diazotrophic communities were primarily composed of members of the Gammaproteobacteria, Deltaproteobacteria and Clostridia (Fig. 3B) that together comprised ~85% of the overall sequence abundance. Surprisingly, methanogenic archaea affiliated with the Methanomicrobiaceae along with Teredinibacter within the Cellvibrionaceae were the most abundant diazotrophic groups detected (Fig. 5B). Members of the Teredinibacter genus (Distel et al. 2002) have been linked to the degradation of complex polysaccharides in studies of decaying S. alterniflora in marshes on the Chesapeake Bay or Sapelo Island (Andrykovitch and Marx 1988; Gonzalez et al. 1997). Teredinibacter genomes contain genes that are primarily specialized in the degradation of terrestrial polysaccharides (Yang et al. 2009), and the group includes facultative endosymbionts with a rare ability to simultaneously use cellulose as a sole carbon source and fix nitrogen (Distel et al. 2002; Yang et al. 2009). The combination of cellulolytic and diazotrophic capacities is rare and was reported for several strictly anaerobic bacteria, such as *Clostridium hungatei* (Monserrate, Leschine and Canale-Parola 2001). The high relative abundance of the *Teredinibacter* and its unique abilities to digest cellulose and fix nitrogen indicate that this genus might play an important role in the coupling of the carbon and nitrogen cycles.

While accounting for <0.1% of prokaryotic communities, methanogens of the Methanomicrobiaceae comprised up to nearly 20% of diazotrophs (Fig. 5C). In support of our observation, a significant enrichment of Methanomicrobia was observed as a result of Spartina invasion in salt marshes of the Yangtze River estuary (Huang et al. 2016), and diazotrophic methanogens were also reported in wetlands of the Florida Everglades (Mehta, Butterfield and Baross 2003; Bae et al. 2018). Since methanogens are believed to be outcompeted by SRB in saline sediments (Oremland, Marsh and Polcin 1982), these high abundances are unexpected. Nevertheless, the availability of substrates might reduce the competition and support the coexistence of two functional guilds (Schubauer and Hopkinson 1984; Peng et al. 2011). To overcome salinity stress, S. alterniflora accumulates high concentrations of the methylated amines and releases them to the salt marsh sediment (Cavalieri 1983; Dacey and Wakeham 1986; Wang and Lee 1994), and methylated compounds are considered to be non-competitive substrates for methanogens since sulfate reducers do not utilize these compounds. Finally, it was estimated that up to 90% of the total methane production in salt marsh sediments could be originating from methylated compounds (Oremland, Marsh and Polcin 1982; King, Klug and Lovley 1983). Thus, methylotrophic methanogenesis is likely a substantial terminal electron-accepting process in salt marshes (Zeleke et al. 2013; Kelley et al. 2014; Yuan et al. 2016), whereby methanogens compete successfully with SRB. Although the role of methanogenic nitrogen fixation in the nitrogen budget is not clear, these results warrant further study.

Sedimentary microorganisms play a crucial role in nutrient cycles and ecosystem productivity (Bardgett and van der Putten 2014; Fierer 2017), and often respond quickly to changes in environmental conditions. Thus, variations in microbial communities and/or specific populations may be used as an indicator of the wetland ecosystem status (Urakawa and Bernhard 2017). Co-occurrence network analysis was applied to understand the ecological interactions of the microbial community and to reveal populations that can be used as biological indicators for the Skidaway Island salt marsh. The topological characterization of interaction networks revealed that keystone diazotrophic populations shape the microbial network in the area of the tall plant phenotype (Fig. 7A). Keystone species commonly play a disproportional important role in ecosystem functioning relative to their abundance (Power et al. 1996; Banerjee, Schlaeppi and van der Heijden 2018). We identify diazotrophic strains affiliated with Teredinibacter, Tolumonas and Syntrophobacter genera as a keystone species of the area colonized by the tall plant phenotype (Fig. 7A, Table 2; Supplementary Data 6, Supporting Information). The highly similar gammaproteobacterial nifH sequences were previously detected in the Spartina rhizosphere in South Carolina and Maryland salt marshes (Supplementary Data 6, Supporting Information; Gamble et al. 2010; Berthrong et al. 2014). Moreover, the positive contribution of keystone diazotrophic populations to plant productivity has also been observed in dune grasslands (Van Der Heijden et al. 2006). Although the relative abundances of these strains in the nifH sequence data were <0.4% and were undetectable in the SSU dataset, their central location in the network emphasizes their important role in salt marsh nutrient cycles. Low abundant taxa have been identified as keystone species in contaminated soils and wheat rhizosphere environments (Chao et al. 2016; Hartman et al. 2018). Interestingly, microbial assemblages of the short plant phenotype were governed by fungal and archaeal populations (Fig. 7B, Table 2; Supplementary Data 6, Supporting Information), which were characterized by low relative abundances. Selected keystone microbial species were affiliated with fungal Leotiomycetes and archaeal Bathyarchaeia classes (Table 2). Leotiomycetes comprise an ecologically diverse class that includes mycorrhizas, plant endophytes, plant pathogens and saprophytes (Johnston et al. 2019). Members of the Bathyarchaeota were recently shown to colonize coastal and intertidal sediments (Zhou et al. 2018). Moreover, genomic analyses indicate that Crenarchaeota-affiliated Bathyachaeota are generalists with a versatile metabolism and ability to utilize a variety of substrates, including dead plant material, aromatic compounds and methylated substrates (Zhou et al. 2018), and potentially interact with many members from the surrounding microbial community. Thus, it is not surprising to find them among keystone species. Although the relative abundance of the Bathyarchaeota keystone taxa in the area of the short plants was 0.076  $\pm$  0.03% (Table 2), the overall abundance of Bathyarchaeota was 5.9  $\pm$  0.34%, thus emphasizing the potential role of Bathyarchaeota as ecosystem engineer of the Skidaway Island salt marsh. Although co-occurrence network analysis is a useful tool to assess community structure and to reveal potential interactions among community members, it does not necessarily describe the direct physiological interactions between community members (Faust and Raes 2012). Thus, future experiments are required to interpret the ecophysiological role of the identified keystone species.

#### CONCLUSIONS

Our study shows that distinct microbial communities are associated with S. alterniflora phenotype and proximity to the root zone in salt marsh habitats. A strong effect of plant phenotype on microbial diversity and abundance was observed. Generally, areas colonized by the tall plant phenotype hosted more diverse and abundant microorganisms in comparison to areas colonized by the short plant phenotype. Redox chemistry, driven by a combination of tidal inundation, plant physiology and macrofaunal bioturbation, acts as a strong selective force in shaping microbial community structure. The rhizosphere, where oxygen is supplied by roots, serves as a hotspot of iron and sulfur oxidation processes, with Zetaprotobacterial iron oxidizers preferentially colonizing the rhizosphere of the tall plants, while a higher relative abundance of Epsilonbacteraeota-affiliated sulfur oxidizers was detected in the rhizosphere of the short plant phenotype. Finally, different community organizations were dictated by plant phenotype. While diazotrophic microorganisms appear to shape ecological interactions in the area colonized by the tall plant phenotype, the fungal community fills this role in the area occupied by the short Spartina phenotype. A better understanding of salt marsh microbial ecology and plant-microbe interactions will facilitate the development of future coastal restoration programs with the potential to simultaneously maximize

plant productivity while reinforcing the shoreline and maximizing carbon sequestration.

### SUPPLEMENTARY DATA

Supplementary data are available at FEMSEC online.

## **AUTHORS' CONTRIBUTIONS**

MK and JEK conceived the study; JEK collected samples from the field; and MK performed the experiment, the data analyses. MK and JEK wrote the manuscript. JEK and JLR provided valuable insight and ideas during numerous sessions of discussion. All authors provided critical comments on the manuscript and gave their final approval for publication.

#### **FUNDING**

This work was supported in part by an institutional grant (NA18OAR4170084) to the Georgia Sea Grant College Program from the National Sea Grant Office, National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration, U.S. Department of Commerce.

Conflicts of interest. None declared.

### **REFERENCES**

- Anderson MJ. Distance-based tests for homogeneity of multivariate dispersions. *Biometrics* 2006;62:245–53.
- Andrykovitch G, Marx I. Isolation of a new polysaccharidedigesting bacterium from a salt-marsh. Appl Environ Microb 1988;54:1061–2.
- Angermeyer A, Crosby SC, Huber JA. Decoupled distancedecay patterns between dsrA and 16S rRNA genes among salt marsh sulfate-reducing bacteria. Environ Microbiol 2016;18:75–86.
- Bae HS, Morrison E, Chanton JP et al. Methanogens are major contributors to nitrogen fixation in soils of the Florida Everglades. Appl Environ Microb 2018;84:e02222–17.
- Bagwell CE, Lovell CR. Microdiversity of culturable diazotrophs from the rhizoplanes of the salt marsh grasses Spartina alterniflora and Juncus roemerianus. Microb Ecol 2000;**39**:128–36.
- Bagwell CE, Piceno YM, Ashburne-Lucas A et al. Physiological diversity of the rhizosphere diazotroph assemblages of selected salt marsh grasses. Appl Environ Microb 1998;64:4276–82.
- Bahr M, Crump BC, Klepac-Ceraj V et al. Molecular characterization of sulfate-reducing bacteria in a New England salt marsh. Environ Microbiol 2005;7:1175–85.
- Banerjee S, Schlaeppi K, van der Heijden MGA. Keystone taxa as drivers of microbiome structure and functioning. Nat Rev Microb 2018;**16**:567–76.
- Barberán A, Bates ST, Casamayor EO *et al*. Using network analysis to explore co-occurrence patterns in soil microbial communities. ISME J 2012;6:343.
- Bardgett RD, van der Putten WH. Belowground biodiversity and ecosystem functioning. Nature 2014;515:505–11.
- Beck MW, Heck KL, Able KW *et al*. The identification, conservation, and management of estuarine and marine nurseries for fish and invertebrates: a better understanding of the habitats that serve as nurseries for marine species and the factors that create site-specific variability in nursery quality will improve conservation and management of these areas. *Bioscience* 2001;**51**:633–41.

- Berg G, Smalla K. Plant species and soil type cooperatively shape the structure and function of microbial communities in the rhizosphere. FEMS Microbiol Ecol 2009;68: 1–13.
- Berthrong ST, Yeager CM, Gallegos-Graves L et al. Nitrogen fertilization has a stronger effect on soil nitrogen-fixing bacterial communities than elevated atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>. Appl Environ Microb 2014;80:3103–12.
- Bertness MD, Crain C, Holdredge C et al. Eutrophication and consumer control of New England salt marsh primary productivity. Conserv Biol 2008;22:131–9.
- Bertness MD. Zonation of Spartina patens and Spartina alterniflora in New England salt marsh. Ecology 1991;**72**: 138–48.
- Bowen JL, Crump BC, Deegan LA *et al*. Salt marsh sediment bacteria: their distribution and response to external nutrient inputs. ISME J 2009;**3**:924–34.
- Bowen JL, Morrison HG, Hobbie JE *et al.* Salt marsh sediment diversity: a test of the variability of the rare biosphere among environmental replicates. ISME J 2012;6:2014–23.
- Bowen JL, Ward BB, Morrison HG et al. Microbial community composition in sediments resists perturbation by nutrient enrichment. ISME J 2011;5:1540–8.

Breiman L. Random forests. Mach Learn 2001;45:5-32.

- Bulgarelli D, Rott M, Schlaeppi K et al. Revealing structure and assembly cues for Arabidopsis root-inhabiting bacterial microbiota. Nature 2012;488:91–5.
- Bu NS, Qu JF, Li ZL et al. Effects of Spartina alterniflora invasion on soil respiration in the Yangtze river estuary, China. PLoS One 2015;10:e0121571.
- Callahan BJ, McMurdie PJ, Rosen MJ et al. DADA2: high-resolution sample inference from Illumina amplicon data. Nat Methods 2016;**13**:581.
- Campbell BJ, Engel AS, Porter ML et al. The versatile epsilonproteobacteria: key players in sulphidic habitats. Nat Rev Microbiol 2006;4:458–68.
- Caporaso JG, Lauber CL, Walters WA et al. Global patterns of 16S rRNA diversity at a depth of millions of sequences per sample. P Natl Acad Sci USA 2011;**108**:4516–22.
- Carlson PR, Forrest J. Uptake of dissolved sulfide by Spartina alterniflora—evidence from natural sulfur isotope abundance ratios. Science 1982;216:633–5.
- Carrell AA, Kolton M, Glass JB et al. Experimental warming alters the community composition, diversity, and N<sub>2</sub> fixation activity of peat moss (Sphagnum fallax) microbiomes. Glob Change Biol 2019;**25**:2993–3004.
- Cavalieri AJ. Proline and glycinebetaine accumulation by Spartina alterniflora Loisel. in response to NaCl and nitrogen in a controlled environment. Oecologia 1983;57:20–4.
- Chao YQ, Liu WS, Chen YM et al. Structure, variation, and co-occurrence of soil microbial communities in abandoned sites of a rare earth elements mine. Environ Sci Technol 2016;50:11481–90.
- Csardi G, Nepusz T. The igraph software package for complex network research. InterJournal Complex Systems 2006;1695:1– 9.
- Currin CA, Joye SB, Paerl HW. Diel rates of N<sub>2</sub>-fixation and denitrification in a transplanted *Spartina alterniflora* marsh: implications for N-flux dynamics. *Estuar Coast Shelf* S 1996;**42**:597– 616.
- Cytryn E, Kolton M. Microbial protection against plant disease. In: Rosenberg E, Gophna U (eds). Beneficial Microorganisms in Multicellular Life Forms. Berlin, Heidelberg: Springer, 2011, 123–36.

- Dacey JWH, Wakeham SG. Oceanic dimethylsulfide—production during zooplankton grazing on phytoplankton. *Science* 1986;**233**:1314–6.
- Davis DA, Gamble MD, Bagwell CE *et al*. Responses of salt marsh plant rhizosphere diazotroph assemblages to changes in marsh elevation, edaphic conditions and plant host species. *Microb Ecol* 2011;**61**:386–98.
- De Caceres M, Legendre P, Moretti M. Improving indicator species analysis by combining groups of sites. Oikos 2010;119:1674–84.
- DeLaune RD, Feijtel TC, Patrick WH. Nitrogen flows in Louisiana Gulf Coast salt marsh: spatial considerations. *Biogeochemistry* 1989;**8**:25–37.
- Deng Y, Jiang Y-H, Yang Y et al. Molecular ecological network analyses. BMC Bioinformatics 2012;13:113.
- Dimkpa C, Weinand T, Asch F. Plant-rhizobacteria interactions alleviate abiotic stress conditions. *Plant Cell Environ* 2009;**32**:1682–94.
- Distel DL, Morrill W, MacLaren-Toussaint N et al. Teredinibacter turnerae gen. nov., sp. nov., a dinitrogen-fixing, cellulolytic, endosymbiotic gamma-proteobacterium isolated from the gills of wood-boring molluscs (Bivalvia: Teredinidae). Int J Syst Evol Microbiol 2002;**52**:2261–9.
- Dixon P. VEGAN, a package of R functions for community ecology. J Veg Sci 2003;14:927–30.
- Dollhopf SL, Hyun JH, Smith AC et al. Quantification of ammoniaoxidizing bacteria and factors controlling nitrification in salt marsh sediments. Appl Environ Microb 2005;71:240–6.
- Elliott JK, Spear E, Wyllie-Echeverria S. Mats of Beggiatoa bacteria reveal that organic pollution from lumber mills inhibits growth of Zostera marina. Mar Ecol-Evol Persp 2006;27: 372–80.
- Emerson D, Field EK, Chertkov O et al. Comparative genomics of freshwater Fe-oxidizing bacteria: implications for physiology, ecology, and systematics. Front Microbiol 2013; 4:254.
- Emerson D, Fleming EJ, McBeth JM. Iron-oxidizing bacteria: an environmental and genomic perspective. *Annu Rev Microbiol* 2010;**64**:561–83.
- Emerson D, Rentz JA, Lilburn TG et al. A novel lineage of Proteobacteria involved in formation of marine Fe-oxidizing microbial mat communities. PLoS One 2007;2:e667.
- Emerson D, Weiss JV, Megonigal JP. Iron-oxidizing bacteria are associated with ferric hydroxide precipitates (Fe-plaque) on the roots of wetland plants. *Appl Environ Microb* 1999;**65**:2758– 61.
- Faust K, Raes J. Microbial interactions: from networks to models. Nat Rev Microbiol 2012;**10**:538–50.
- Fierer N. Embracing the unknown: disentangling the complexities of the soil microbiome. Nat Rev Microbiol 2017;15:579–90.
- Frederiksen MS, Holmer M, Borum J et al. Temporal and spatial variation of sulfide invasion in eelgrass (*Zostera marina*) as reflected by its sulfur isotopic composition. *Limnol Oceanogr* 2006;**51**:2308–18.
- Gaby JC, Rishishwar L, Valderrama-Aguirre LC et al. Diazotroph community characterization via a high-throughput nifH amplicon sequencing and analysis pipeline. Appl Environ Microb 2018;84:e01512–17.
- Galushko A, Kuever J. Bergey's Manual of Systematics of Archaea and Bacteria. Hoboken, NJ: John Wiley & Sons, 2019, 1–8.
- Gamble MD, Bagwell CE, LaRocque J et al. Seasonal variability of diazotroph assemblages associated with the rhizosphere of the salt marsh cordgrass, Spartina alterniflora. Microb Ecol 2010;**59**:253–65.

- Gandy EL, Yoch DC. Relationship between nitrogen-fixing sulfate reducers and fermenters in salt-marsh sediments and roots of Spartina alterniflora. Appl Environ Microb 1988;**54**:2031–6.
- Gonzalez JM, Mayer F, Moran MA et al. Microbulbifer hydrolyticus gen nov, sp nov, and Marinobacterium georgiense gen nov, sp nov, two marine bacteria from a lignin-rich pulp mill waste enrichment community. Int J Syst Bacteriol 1997;**47**:369–76.
- Green SJ, Venkatramanan R, Naqib A. Deconstructing the polymerase chain reaction: understanding and correcting bias associated with primer degeneracies and primer-template mismatches. PLoS One 2015;10:e0128122.
- Gribsholt B, Kostka JE, Kristensen E. Impact of fiddler crabs and plant roots on sediment biogeochemistry in a Georgia saltmarsh. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 2003;**259**:237–51.
- Gruninger RJ, Puniya AK, Callaghan TM et al. Anaerobic fungi (phylum Neocallimastigomycota): advances in understanding their taxonomy, life cycle, ecology, role and biotechnological potential. FEMS Microbiol Ecol 2014;**90**:1–17.
- Hartman K, van der Heijden MGA, Wittwer RA et al. Cropping practices manipulate abundance patterns of root and soil microbiome members paving the way to smart farming. *Microbiome* 2018;6:14.
- Hartmann M, Frey B, Mayer J *et al*. Distinct soil microbial diversity under long-term organic and conventional farming. ISME J 2014;**9**:1177.
- Hines ME, Evans RS, Genthner BRS et al. Molecular phylogenetic and biogeochemical studies of sulfate-reducing bacteria in the rhizosphere of Spartina alterniflora. Appl Environ Microb 1999;65:2209–16.
- Holmer M, Gribsholt B, Kristensen E. Effects of sea level rise on growth of Spartina anglica and oxygen dynamics in rhizosphere and salt marsh sediments. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 2002;225:197–204.
- Holmer M, Kendrick GA. High sulfide intrusion in five temperate seagrasses growing under contrasting sediment conditions. Estuar Coast 2013;**36**:116–26.
- Holmer M, Pedersen O, Krause-Jensen D et al. Sulfide intrusion in the tropical seagrasses Thalassia testudinum and Syringodium filiforme. Estuar Coast Shelf S 2009;**85**:319–26.
- Hong YW, Liao D, Hu AY *et al.* Diversity of endophytic and rhizoplane bacterial communities associated with exotic Spartina alterniflora and native mangrove using Illumina amplicon sequencing. *Can J Microbiol* 2015;**61**:723–33.
- Hopkinson CS, Cai WJ, Hu XP. Carbon sequestration in wetland dominated coastal systems—a global sink of rapidly diminishing magnitude. *Curr Opin Env Sust* 2012;**4**:186–94.
- Hopkinson CS, Giblin AE. Nitrogen dynamics of coastal salt marshes. In: Capone DG, Bronk DA, Mulholland MR, Carpenter EJ (eds). Nitrogen in the Marine Environment, 2nd edn. San Diego: Academic Press, 2008, 991–1036.
- Howes BL, Dacey JWH, Teal JM. Annual carbon mineralization and belowground production of *Spartina alterniflora* in a New England salt-marsh. Ecology 1985;**66**:595–605.
- Huang JX, Xu X, Wang M et al. Responses of soil nitrogen fixation to Spartina alterniflora invasion and nitrogen addition in a Chinese salt marsh. Sci Rep-UK 2016;6:20384.
- Hyun J-H, Mok J-S, Cho H-Y et al. Rapid organic matter mineralization coupled to iron cycling in intertidal mud flats of the Han River estuary, Yellow Sea. *Biogeochemistry* 2009;**92**:231– 45.
- Hyun J-H, Smith AC, Kostka JE. Relative contributions of sulfateand iron(III) reduction to organic matter mineralization and process controls in contrasting habitats of the Georgia saltmarsh. *Appl Geochem* 2007;**22**:2637–51.

- Ivarsson M, Schnürer A, Bengtson S et al. Anaerobic fungi: a potential source of biological  $H_2$  in the oceanic crust. Front Microbiol 2016;7:674.
- Johnston PR, Quijada L, Smith CA et al. A multigene phylogeny toward a new phylogenetic classification of *Leotiomycetes*. IMA Fungus 2019;**10**:1.
- Jorgensen BB, Findlay AJ, Pellerin A. The biogeochemical sulfur cycle of marine sediments. Front Microbiol 2019;10:849.
- Joshi MM, Hollis JP. Interaction of *Beggiatoa* and rice plant: detoxification of hydrogen sulfide in the rice rhizosphere. *Science* 1977;**195**:179–80.
- Jørgensen BB, Revsbech NP. Colorless sulfur bacteria, Beggiatoa spp. and Thiovulum spp., in O<sub>2</sub> and H<sub>2</sub>S microgradients. Appl Environ Microb 1983;**45**:1261–70.
- Jørgensen BB. Mineralization of organic matter in the sea bed the role of sulphate reduction. Nature 1982;**296**:643–5.
- Kato S, Ohkuma M, Powell DH et al. Comparative genomic insights into ecophysiology of neutrophilic, microaerophilic iron oxidizing bacteria. Front Microbiol 2015;6:1265.
- Kearns PJ, Angell JH, Howard EM et al. Nutrient enrichment induces dormancy and decreases diversity of active bacteria in salt marsh sediments. Nat Commun 2016;7:12881.
- Kelley CA, Nicholson BE, Beaudoin CS *et al.* Trimethylamine and organic matter additions reverse substrate limitation effects on the  $\delta^{13}$ C values of methane produced in hypersaline microbial mats. *Appl Environ Microb* 2014;**80**:7316–23.
- King GM, Klug MJ, Lovley DR. Metabolism of acetate, methanol, and methylated amines in intertidal sediments of Lowes Cove, Maine. *Appl Environ Microb* 1983;**45**:1848–53.
- Klepac-Ceraj V, Bahr M, Crump BC et al. High overall diversity and dominance of microdiverse relationships in salt marsh sulphate-reducing bacteria. Environ Microbiol 2004;6:686–98.
- Koljalg U, Nilsson RH, Abarenkov K et al. Towards a unified paradigm for sequence-based identification of fungi. Mol Ecol 2013;22:5271–7.
- Kolton M, Graber ER, Tsehansky L et al. Biochar-stimulated plant performance is strongly linked to microbial diversity and metabolic potential in the rhizosphere. *New Phytol* 2017;**213**:1393–404.
- Kolton M, Marks A, Wilson RM et al. Impact of warming on greenhouse gas production and microbial diversity in anoxic peat from a Sphagnum-dominated bog (Grand Rapids, Minnesota, United States). Front Microbiol 2019;10:870.
- Koop-Jakobsen K, Mueller P, Meier RJ et al. Plant-sediment interactions in salt marshes—an optode imaging study of O<sub>2</sub>, pH, and CO<sub>2</sub> gradients in the rhizosphere. Front Plant Sci 2018;9:541.
- Kostka JE, Gribsholt B, Petrie E et al. The rates and pathways of carbon oxidation in bioturbated saltmarsh sediments. *Limnol Oceanogr* 2002;**47**:230–40.
- Kostka JE, Roychoudhury A, Van Cappellen P. Rates and controls of anaerobic microbial respiration across spatial and temporal gradients in saltmarsh sediments. *Biogeochemistry* 2002;**60**:49–76.
- Kursa MB, Rudnicki WR. Feature selection with the Boruta package. J Stat Softw 2010;**36**:1–13.
- Kurtz ZD, Muller CL, Miraldi ER et al. Sparse and compositionally robust inference of microbial ecological networks. PLoS *Comput Biol* 2015;11:e1004226.
- Lamers LPM, Govers LL, Janssen ICJM et al. Sulfide as a soil phytotoxin—a review. Front Plant Sci 2013;4:268.
- Liao CZ, Luo YQ, Jiang LF et al. Invasion of Spartina alterniflora enhanced ecosystem carbon and nitrogen stocks in the Yangtze Estuary, China. Ecosystems 2007;**10**:1351–61.

- Lin L, Liu W, Zhang M et al. Different height forms of Spartina alterniflora might select their own rhizospheric bacterial communities in southern coast of China. Microb Ecol 2019;77:124–35.
- Lin XJ, Tfaily MM, Steinweg M *et al*. Microbial community stratification linked to utilization of carbohydrates and phosphorus limitation in a boreal peatland at Marcell experimental forest, Minnesota, USA. *Appl Environ Microb* 2014;**80**:3518–30.
- Ljungdahl LG. The cellulase/hemicellulase system of the anaerobic fungus Orpinomyces PC-2 and aspects of its applied use. Ann N Y Acad Sci 2008;**1125**:308–21.
- Lovell CR, Decker PV, Bagwell CE et al. Analysis of a diverse assemblage of diazotrophic bacteria from *Spartina alterniflora* using DGGE and clone library screening. J Microbiol Meth 2008;73:160–71.
- Lovell CR, Friez MJ, Longshore JW *et al.* Recovery and phylogenetic analysis of nifH sequences from diazotrophic bacteria associated with dead aboveground biomass of Spartina alterniflora. *Appl Environ Microb* 2001;**67**:5308–14.
- Lovell CR, Piceno YM, Quattro JM et al. Molecular analysis of diazotroph diversity in the rhizosphere of the smooth cordgrass, Spartina alterniflora. Appl Environ Microb 2000;**66**:3814–22.
- Lundberg DS, Lebeis SL, Paredes SH et al. Defining the core Arabidopsis thaliana root microbiome. Nature 2012;**488**:86–90.
- Lyu Z, Shao N, Akinyemi T et al. Methanogenesis. Curr Biol 2018;28:R727-32.
- Mar Rodríguez M, Pérez D, Javier Chaves F et al. Obesity changes the human gut mycobiome. Sci Rep-UK 2015;5:14600.
- Martin M. Cutadapt removes adapter sequences from highthroughput sequencing reads. EMBnetjournal 2011;17:3.
- Mcclung CR, Patriquin DG, Davis RE. Campylobacter nitrofigilis sp. nov, a nitrogen-fixing bacterium associated with roots of Spartina alterniflora Loisel. Int J Syst Bacteriol 1983;33:605–12.
- Mcclung CR, Patriquin DG. Isolation of a nitrogen-fixing Campylobacter species from the roots of Spartina alterniflora Loisel. Can J Microbiol 1980;**26**:881–6.
- McMurdie PJ, Holmes S. Phyloseq: an R package for reproducible interactive analysis and graphics of microbiome census data. PLoS One 2013;8:e61217.
- Mehta MP, Butterfield DA, Baross JA. Phylogenetic diversity of nitrogenase (nifH) genes in deep-sea and hydrothermal vent environments of the Juan de Fuca ridge. Appl Environ Microb 2003;69:960–70.
- Mendelssohn IA, Morris JT. Eco-physiological controls on the productivity of Spartina alterniflora Loisel. In: Weinstein MP, Kreeger DA (eds). Concepts and Controversies in Tidal Marsh Ecology. Dordrecht: Springer Netherlands, 2000, 59–80.
- Millero FJ. The thermodynamics and kinetics of the hydrogensulfide system in natural-waters. Mar Chem 1986;18: 121–47.
- Monserrate E, Leschine SB, Canale-Parola E. Clostridium hungatei sp. nov., a mesophilic, N<sub>2</sub>-fixing cellulolytic bacterium isolated from soil. Int J Syst Evol Micr 2001;**51**:123–32.
- Oremland RS, Marsh LM, Polcin S. Methane production and simultaneous sulfate reduction in anoxic, salt-marsh sediments. Nature 1982;**296**:143–5.
- Patriquin DG. Nitrogen fixation (acetylene reduction) associated with cord grass, Spartina alterniflora Loisel. Ecological Bulletins 1978;21:20–7.
- Paulson JN, Stine OC, Bravo HC et al. Differential abundance analysis for microbial marker-gene surveys. Nat Methods 2013;10:1200–2.
- Peng RH, Fang CM, Li B et al. Spartina alterniflora invasion increases soil inorganic nitrogen pools through interactions

with tidal subsidies in the Yangtze Estuary, China. Oecologia 2011;**165**:797–807.

- Picard KT. Coastal marine habitats harbor novel early-diverging fungal diversity. Fungal Ecol 2017;25:1–13.
- Piceno YM, Noble PA, Lovell CR. Spatial and temporal assessment of diazotroph assemblage composition in vegetated salt marsh sediments using denaturing gradient gel electrophoresis analysis. Microb Ecol 1999;**38**:157–67.
- Power ME, Tilman D, Estes JA et al. Challenges in the quest for keystones. Bioscience 1996;46:609–20.
- Quast C, Pruesse E, Yilmaz P et al. The SILVA ribosomal RNA gene database project: improved data processing and web-based tools. Nucleic Acids Res 2012;41:D590–6.
- Ravit B, Ehrenfeld JG, Haggblom MM. A comparison of sediment microbial communities associated with *Phragmites australis* and *Spartina alterniflora* in two brackish wetlands of New Jersey. Estuaries 2003;**26**:465–74.
- R Development Core Team. R: a language and environment for statistical computing. R Foundation for Statistical Computing, Viena, Austria. 2018.
- Rietl AJ, Overlander ME, Nyman AJ et al. Microbial community composition and extracellular enzyme activities associated with Juncus roemerianus and Spartina alterniflora vegetated sediments in Louisiana saltmarshes. Microb Ecol 2016;71:290– 303.
- Rodríguez-Llorente ID, Pajuelo E, Navarro-Torre S et al. Bacterial endophytes from halophytes: how do they help plants to alleviate salt stress? In: Kumar M, Etesami H, Kumar V (eds). Saline Soil-Based Agriculture by Halotolerant Microorganisms. Singapore: Springer Singapore, 2019, 147–60.
- Schloss PD, Westcott SL, Ryabin T et al. Introducing mothur: open-source, platform-independent, community-supported software for describing and comparing microbial communities. Appl Environ Microb 2009;**75**:7537–41.
- Schubauer JP, Hopkinson CS. Above-ground and belowground emergent macrophyte production and turnover in a coastal marsh ecosystem, Georgia. *Limnol Oceanogr* 1984;**29**: 1052–65.
- Selinger LB, Forsberg CW, Cheng KJ. The rumen: a unique source of enzymes for enhancing livestock production. *Anaerobe* 1996;2:263–84.
- Smith DP, Peay KG. Sequence depth, not PCR replication, improves ecological inference from next generation DNA sequencing. PLoS One 2014;9:e90234.
- Spivak AC, Reeve J. Rapid cycling of recently fixed carbon in a Spartina alterniflora system: a stable isotope tracer experiment. Biogeochemistry 2015;**125**:97–114.
- Sundby B, Vale C, Cacador I *et al*. Metal-rich concretions on the roots of salt marsh plants: mechanism and rate of formation. *Limnol Oceanogr* 1998;**43**:245–52.
- Suzuki D, Li ZL, Cui XX et al. Reclassification of Desulfobacterium anilini as Desulfatiglans anilini comb. nov within Desulfatiglans gen. nov., and description of a 4-chlorophenoldegrading sulfate-reducing bacterium, Desulfatiglans parachlorophenolica sp nov. Int J Syst Evol Micr 2014;64: 3081–6.
- Takai K, Campbell BJ, Cary SC et al. Enzymatic and genetic characterization of carbon and energy metabolisms by deep-sea hydrothermal chemolithoautotrophic isolates of *Epsilonproteobacteria*. Appl Environ Microb 2005;**71**: 7310–20.
- Thomas F, Morris JT, Wigand C et al. Short-term effect of simulated salt marsh restoration by sand-amendment on sediment bacterial communities. PLoS One 2019;14:e0215767.

- Tkacz A, Cheema J, Chandra G *et al*. Stability and succession of the rhizosphere microbiota depends upon plant type and soil composition. ISME J 2015;9:2349–59.
- Tyler AC, Mastronicola TA, McGlathery KJ. Nitrogen fixation and nitrogen limitation of primary production along a natural marsh chronosequence. *Oecologia* 2003;**136**:431–8.
- Urakawa H, Bernhard AE. Wetland management using microbial indicators. Ecol Eng 2017;**108**:456–76.
- Valiela I, Teal JM, Deuser WG. The nature of growth forms in the salt marsh grass Spartina alterniflora. Am Nat 1978;112:461–70.
- van der Heijden MG, Hartmann M. Networking in the plant microbiome. PLoS Biol 2016;**14**:e1002378.
- Van Der Heijden MGA, Bakker R, Verwaal J et al. Symbiotic bacteria as a determinant of plant community structure and plant productivity in dune grassland. FEMS Microbiol Ecol 2006;56:178–87.
- Wang Q, Garrity GM, Tiedje JM et al. Naive Bayesian classifier for rapid assignment of rRNA sequences into the new bacterial taxonomy. Appl Environ Microb 2007;**73**:5261–7.
- Wang XC, Lee C. Sources and distribution of aliphatic-amines in salt-marsh sediment. Org Geochem 1994;**22**:1005–21.
- Warren MJ, Lin X, Gaby JC et al. Molybdenum-based diazotrophy in a Sphagnum peatland in Northern Minnesota. Appl Environ Microb 2017;83:e01174–17.
- Wasmund K, Mussmann M, Loy A. The life sulfuric: microbial ecology of sulfur cycling in marine sediments. Environ Microbiol Rep 2017;9:323–44.
- Weiss JV, Emerson D, Backer SM et al. Enumeration of Fe(II)oxidizing and Fe(III)-reducing bacteria in the root zone of wetland plants: implications for a rhizosphere iron cycle. Biogeochemistry 2003;64:77–96.
- Weiss JV, Rentz JA, Plaia T et al. Characterization of neutrophilic Fe(II)-oxidizing bacteria isolated from the rhizosphere of wetland plants and description of Ferritrophicum radicicola gen. nov sp nov., and Sideroxydans paludicola sp nov. Geomicrobiol J 2007;24:559–70.
- White DS, Howes BL. Translocation, remineralization, and turnover of nitrogen in the roots and rhizomes of Spartina alterniflora (Gramineae). Am J Bot 1994;81:1225–34.
- White TJ, Bruns T, Lee S et al. Amplification and direct sequencing of fungal ribosomal RNA genes for phylogenetics. In: Innis MA, Gelfand DH, Sninsky JJ, White TJ (eds). PCR Protocols. San Diego: Academic Press, 1990, 315–22.
- Whiting GJ, Gandy EL, Yoch DC. Tight coupling of rootassociated nitrogen-fixation and plant photosynthesis in the salt-marsh grass *Spartina alterniflora* and carbon-dioxide enhancement of nitrogenase activity. *Appl Environ Microb* 1986;**52**:108–13.
- Williams MJ, Coles R, Primavera JH. A lesson from cyclone Larry: an untold story of the success of good coastal planning. Estuar Coast Shelf S 2007;71:364–7.
- Wilson RM, Hopple AM, Tfaily MM et al. Stability of peatland carbon to rising temperatures. Nat Commun 2016;7: 13723.
- Yang JC, Madupu R, Durkin AS et al. The complete genome of Teredinibacter turnerae T7901: an Intracellular endosymbiont of marine wood-boring Bivalves (shipworms). PLoS One 2009;4:e6085.
- Yoch DC, Whiting GJ. Evidence for NH<sup>4+</sup> switch-off regulation of nitrogenase activity by bacteria in salt-marsh sediments and roots of the grass Spartina alterniflora. Appl Environ Microb 1986;**51**:143–9.
- Yuan JJ, Ding WX, Liu DY et al. Shifts in methanogen community structure and function across a coastal marsh tran-

sect: effects of exotic Spartina alterniflora invasion. Sci Rep-UK 2016;6:18777.

- Zeleke J, Sheng Q, Wang JG et al. Effects of Spartina alterniflora invasion on the communities of methanogens and sulfatereducing bacteria in estuarine marsh sediments. Front Microbiol 2013;4:243.
- Zhou Z, Pan J, Wang F et al. Bathyarchaeota: globally distributed metabolic generalists in anoxic environments. FEMS Microbiol Rev 2018;42:639–55.
- Zogg GP, Travis SE, Brazeau DA. Strong associations between plant genotypes and bacterial communities in a natural salt marsh. Ecol Evol 2018;**8**:4721–30.