



UNITED STATES COAST GUARD

REPORT OF INVESTIGATION INTO THE CIRCUMSTANCES SURROUNDING THE INCIDENT INVOLVING SS FREDERICKSBURG - ALLISION

ON 11/04/2002



MISLE Activity Number: 1701064
ORIGINATING UNIT: MSO HOUSTON/GALVESTON
MISLE Activity Owner: COMMANDANT (G-MRI)
MISLE Activity Controller: COMMANDANT (G-MRI)
MISLE CASE NUMBER: 0

I. INCIDENT BRIEF

SS FREDERICKSBURG allided w/ Joe D. Hughes #2 @ 0524 on 04 Nov 02. Dock located at mouth of Greens Bayou on the Houston Ship Channel (HSC), a navigable water of the U.S, near lights # 151/152. Significant damage to port bow of vessel & dock; however, no injuries or pollution associated w/ incident. Houston Pilot [REDACTED] onboard vessel @ time of incident. Encl (1).

Estimated damage to dock, based on preliminary survey which included an underwater inspection, is approx \$1,000,000.00. Encl (2) & (16). Estimated damage to vessel, based on preliminary survey, is approx \$300,000.00. Encl (11).

SS FREDERICKSBURG was headed outbound HSC from Williams #1 in ballast when incident occurred. Accd to vessel master & crew, Houston Pilot onboard FREDERICKSBURG arranged to meet M/V ALAM MAKMUR, which was transiting inbound HSC to Bulk Load #1 from sea, "on two" or starboard to starboard. Until meeting, FREDERICKSBURG & ALAM MAKMUR were both transiting approx centerline of HSC, as is customary for most deep draft vessels in HSC. Encl (1) & (12).

Bulk Load #1, ALAM MAKMUR's destination, is directly across from Joe D. Hughes dock on Greens Bayou, where allision occurred. Encl (30).

Master of FREDERICKSBURG claims that ALAM MAKMUR, for whatever reasons, failed to honor the meeting arrangement & unexpectedly crossed in front of FREDERICKSBURG into berth @ Bulk Load #1 when FREDERICKSBURG was less than 1/4 NM away from ALAM MAKMUR after pilot on ALAM MAKMUR told FREDERICKSBURG pilot that he "couldn't hold it" any longer. This allegedly blocked FREDERICKSBURG's outbound transit & placed FREDERICKSBURG in a position of imminent peril. FREDERICKSBURG decided to maneuver towards Joe D. Hughes dock in Greens Bayou instead of maneuvering to green side (i.e. outbound lane) of HSC to avoid collision w/ ALAM MAKMUR.

Emergency full astern was ordered on FREDERICKSBURG and she dropped both port & starboard bow anchors (there are no other anchors on vessel) in an attempt to stop her forward motion & swing clear of dock; however, vessel's port side bow allided w/ south corner of dock. Estimated that vessel was traveling approx 1-2 knots at time of allision. Encl (12) - (15) & (7) - (9).

Master & crew of ALAM MAKMUR deny any knowledge of incident & claim that first they heard of incident was when CG boarded vessel @ approx 1300, i.e. almost 7 hrs after incident. All crewmembers onboard ALAM MAKMUR aver that there were no other vessels anywhere in vicinity when they approached & turned into Bulk Load #1. Crewmembers advised that the last vessel they saw on their inbound transit was before they passed under the Fred Hartman / Beltway 8 bridge @ approx 0507. They tied up to Bulk Load #1 @ 0536.

ALAM MAKMUR had 2 tugs tied fast that assisted w/ docking the vessel. UTV MARS made fast fwd off port bow @ 0512 & was not cast off until 0548. UTV JESS NEWTON made fast directly aft off transom @ 0506 & was not cast off until 0554. According to master of ALAM

Report of Investigation

MAKMUR, UTV MARS went to assist FREDERICKSBURG w/ docking @ Joe D. Hughes # 2 immediately after it cast off ALAM MAKMUR. Master denied any knowledge of why FREDERICKSBURG needed assistance & assumed that it was just a normal docking evolution. Houston Pilot [REDACTED] onboard ALAM MAKMUR during inbound transit to Bulk Load #1. Encl (20), (22), (24) - (25).

Captain [REDACTED] largely corroborated FREDERICKSBURG's version of events w/ exception of distance between FREDERICKSBURG & ALAM MAKMUR when ALAM MAKMUR unilaterally changed the meeting arrangement & turned into Greens Bayou. Captain [REDACTED] claimed that he started to turn into Greens Bayou near the Ethel Ship dock & that he saw FREDERICKSBURG near Phillips # 9 as he was making turn. While he doesn't know the exact distance between Phillips # 9 & Ethel, it is more than .25 NM (1519'). Measurement of this distance on the nautical chart indicates that the distance is actually .51NM (2120').

Captain [REDACTED] felt that FREDERICKSBURG had sufficient time & distance to clear stern of ALAM MAKMUR on her (i.e. FREDERICKSBURG's) port side. Captain [REDACTED] commented that there is "good water" on green side of channel outside Green's Bayou & that he believes it would have been safer for FREDERICKSBURG to pass ALAM MAKMUR on the green side instead of veering into Greens Bayou towards the Joe D. Hughes dock; however, he advised that he was not on the FREDERICKSBURG so he really can not say w/ certainty that this is what FREDERICKSBURG should have done.

When asked to explain why he initially arranged a starboard to starboard meeting w/ FREDERICKSBURG notwithstanding fact that the navigation rules suggest most meetings should occur port to port (see Inland Navigation Rule 14), Captain [REDACTED] advised that he had to make a wide turn into Greens Bayou in order to safely clear the barge & dock at eastern edge of bayou where it empties into the HSC. ALAM MAKMUR is approx 622' long & 101' wide. Her draft was approx 21' fwd & 28' 3" aft.

He further advised that most inbound deep draft vessels turning into Greens Bayou make this same wide turn from the green side of HSC in order to safely clear the east bank of Greens Bayou. Since ALAM MAKMUR arrived at the Greens Bayou junction before FREDERICKSBURG, Captain [REDACTED] attempted to use his tugs to "hold" the position of the MAKMUR near the bank on the green side of the HSC in the vicinity of Ethel. He had the JESS NEWTON pulling on the stern & the MARS pulling on the port bow towards the bank; however, the MARS was unable to hold the bow against the bank, so the bow of the ALAM MAKMUR began swinging towards Greens Bayou across the HSC. The JESS NEWTON is 4300 horsepower, but the MARS, a smaller tug, is only 2000 horsepower.

Captain [REDACTED] observed a strong current flowing outbound (i.e. east) on the HSC coupled w/ a strong current flowing south out of Greens Bayou due to recent heavy rainfall. Captain [REDACTED] believes that the combination of these currents created an ebb current off the bank, pushing the bow of the ALAM MAKMUR towards Greens Bayou. This ebb current off the bank was too much for the underpowered MARS to hold, resulting in Captain [REDACTED] decision to unilaterally change the meeting arrangement w/ the FREDERICKSBURG by turning into Greens Bayou. Encl (35).

Report of Investigation

Captain [REDACTED], the pilot onboard the FREDERICKSBURG, largely corroborated Captain [REDACTED]'s version of the events. He confirmed that the FREDERICKSBURG was in fact at Phillips # 9 when the ALAM MAKMUR came off the green side & turned into Greens Bayou. Captain [REDACTED] advised that the FREDERICKSBURG was actually pointed toward the red side of the HSC, just off the centerline, when the ALAM MAKMUR suddenly changed the meeting arrangement & turned into Greens Bayou in front of the FREDERICKSBURG. He had the FREDERICKSBURG pointed towards the red side in anticipation of the previously agreed starboard to starboard meeting arrangement.

When the ALAM MAKMUR cut in front of the FREDERICKSBURG, Captain [REDACTED] tried to turn the FREDERICKSBURG to starboard - towards the green side of the HSC - but the vessel would not respond. Captain [REDACTED] believes that the confluence of the current coming south out of Greens Bayou coupled w/ the outbound / easterly flowing HSC current may have created a strong ebb current off the green side bank, pushing the bow of the FREDERICKSBURG towards the red side of the HSC. This kept the FREDERICKSBURG pointed at the Joe D. Hughes dock in Greens Bayou & ultimately lead to the allision. Encl (34).

Drug/alcohol testing completed for all relevant crewmembers on both vessels. Both Houston Pilots also drug/alcohol tested. All results [REDACTED]. No evidence that drugs/alcohol and/or fatigue played any role in casualty. Encl (3), (34) & (35).

Apparent cause of casualty was unsafe starboard to starboard meeting arrangement in a bad location, as suggested by Captain [REDACTED] & agreed to by Captain [REDACTED], in contravention of Inland Navigation Rule 14. While the rule does make a provision for vessels to otherwise agree on different meeting arrangements, it strongly suggests that vessels should pass each other port to port when meeting.

In this case, Captain [REDACTED] chose a poor location to attempt to hold up the ALAM MAKMUR. He knew the limitations of the MARS on his port bow, and he knew that there were strong currents flowing outbound HSC & south out of Greens Bayou. The point of confluence of these 2 currents is not a safe place to attempt to hold up. They should have agreed to a normal port to port meeting well east of the Greens Bayou / HSC confluence, or the FREDERICKSBURG should have held up well west of the confluence to allow the ALAM MAKMUR to turn into Greens Bayou in front of her. Alternatively, the ALAM MAKMUR could have held up well east of the Greens Bayou / HSC confluence to allow the outbound FREDERICKSBURG to pass prior to approaching her turn into Greens Bayou.

Matter has been referred to Houston Pilot Board Investigation Review Committee (PBIRC) for further investigation as to pilots' role in casualty.

Case closed.

II. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Incident Summary

SS FREDERICKSBURG allided w/ Joe D. Hughes #2 @ 0524 on 04 Nov 02. Dock located at mouth of Greens Bayou on the Houston Ship Channel (HSC), a navigable water of the U.S, near lights # 151/152. Significant damage to port bow of vessel & dock; however, no injuries or pollution associated w/ incident. Houston Pilot [REDACTED] onboard vessel @ time of incident. Encl (1).

Estimated damage to dock, based on preliminary survey which included an underwater inspection, is approx \$1,000,000.00. Encl (2) & (16). Estimated damage to vessel, based on preliminary survey, is approx \$300,000.00. Encl (11).

SS FREDERICKSBURG was headed outbound HSC from Williams #1 in ballast when incident occurred. Acdd to vessel master & crew, Houston Pilot onboard FREDERICKSBURG arranged to meet M/V ALAM MAKMUR, which was transiting inbound HSC to Bulk Load #1 from sea, "on two" or starboard to starboard. Until meeting, FREDERICKSBURG & ALAM MAKMUR were both transiting approx centerline of HSC, as is customary for most deep draft vessels in HSC. Encl (1) & (12).

Bulk Load #1, ALAM MAKMUR's destination, is directly across from Joe D. Hughes dock on Greens Bayou, where allision occurred. Encl (30).

Master of FREDERICKSBURG claims that ALAM MAKMUR, for whatever reasons, failed to honor the meeting arrangement & unexpectedly crossed in front of FREDERICKSBURG into berth @ Bulk Load #1 when FREDERICKSBURG was less than 1/4 NM away from ALAM MAKMUR after pilot on ALAM MAKMUR told FREDERICKSBURG pilot that he "couldn't hold it" any longer. This allegedly blocked FREDERICKSBURG's outbound transit & placed FREDERICKSBURG in a position of imminent peril. FREDERICKSBURG decided to maneuver towards Joe D. Hughes dock in Greens Bayou instead of maneuvering to green side (i.e. outbound lane) of HSC to avoid collision w/ ALAM MAKMUR.

Emergency full astern was ordered on FREDERICKSBURG and she dropped both port & starboard bow anchors (there are no other anchors on vessel) in an attempt to stop her forward motion & swing clear of dock; however, vessel's port side bow allided w/ south corner of dock. Estimated that vessel was traveling approx 1-2 knots at time of allision. Encl (12) - (15) & (7) - (9).

Master & crew of ALAM MAKMUR deny any knowledge of incident & claim that first they heard of incident was when CG boarded vessel @ approx 1300, i.e. almost 7 hrs after incident. All crewmembers onboard ALAM MAKMUR aver that there were no other vessels anywhere in vicinity when they approached & turned into Bulk Load #1. Crewmembers advised that the last vessel they saw on their inbound transit was before they passed under the Fred Hartman / Beltway 8 bridge @ approx 0507. They tied up to Bulk Load #1 @ 0536.

Report of Investigation

ALAM MAKMUR had 2 tugs tied fast that assisted w/ docking the vessel. UTV MARS made fast fwd off port bow @ 0512 & was not cast off until 0548. UTV JESS NEWTON made fast directly aft off transom @ 0506 & was not cast off until 0554. According to master of ALAM MAKMUR, UTV MARS went to assist FREDERICKSBURG w/ docking @ Joe D. Hughes # 2 immediately after it cast off ALAM MAKMUR. Master denied any knowledge of why FREDERICKSBURG needed assistance & assumed that it was just a normal docking evolution. Houston Pilot [REDACTED] onboard ALAM MAKMUR during inbound transit to Bulk Load #1. Encl (20), (22), (24) - (25).

Captain [REDACTED] largely corroborated FREDERICKSBURG's version of events w/ exception of distance between FREDERICKSBURG & ALAM MAKMUR when ALAM MAKMUR unilaterally changed the meeting arrangement & turned into Greens Bayou. Captain [REDACTED] claimed that he started to turn into Greens Bayou near the Ethel Ship dock & that he saw FREDERICKSBURG near Phillips # 9 as he was making turn. While he doesn't know the exact distance between Phillips # 9 & Ethel, it is more than .25 NM (1519'). Measurement of this distance on the nautical chart indicates that the distance is actually .51NM (2120').

Captain [REDACTED] felt that FREDERICKSBURG had sufficient time & distance to clear stern of ALAM MAKMUR on her (i.e. FREDERICKSBURG's) port side. Captain [REDACTED] commented that there is "good water" on green side of channel outside Green's Bayou & that he believes it would have been safer for FREDERICKSBURG to pass ALAM MAKMUR on the green side instead of veering into Greens Bayou towards the Joe D. Hughes dock; however, he advised that he was not on the FREDERICKSBURG so he really can not say w/ certainty that this is what FREDERICKSBURG should have done.

When asked to explain why he initially arranged a starboard to starboard meeting w/ FREDERICKSBURG notwithstanding fact that the navigation rules suggest most meetings should occur port to port (see Inland Navigation Rule 14), Captain [REDACTED] advised that he had to make a wide turn into Greens Bayou in order to safely clear the barge & dock at eastern edge of bayou where it empties into the HSC. ALAM MAKMUR is approx 622' long & 101' wide. Her draft was approx 21' fwd & 28' 3" aft.

He further advised that most inbound deep draft vessels turning into Greens Bayou make this same wide turn from the green side of HSC in order to safely clear the east bank of Greens Bayou. Since ALAM MAKMUR arrived at the Greens Bayou junction before FREDERICKSBURG, Captain [REDACTED] attempted to use his tugs to "hold" the position of the MAKMUR near the bank on the green side of the HSC in the vicinity of Ethel. He had the JESS NEWTON pulling on the stern & the MARS pulling on the port bow towards the bank; however, the MARS was unable to hold the bow against the bank, so the bow of the ALAM MAKMUR began swinging towards Greens Bayou across the HSC. The JESS NEWTON is 4300 horsepower, but the MARS, a smaller tug, is only 2000 horsepower.

Captain [REDACTED] observed a strong current flowing outbound (i.e. east) on the HSC coupled w/ a strong current flowing south out of Greens Bayou due to recent heavy rainfall. Captain [REDACTED] believes that the combination of these currents created an ebb current off the bank, pushing the bow of the ALAM MAKMUR towards Greens Bayou. This ebb current off the bank was too much for the underpowered MARS to hold, resulting in Captain [REDACTED]'s decision to

Report of Investigation

unilaterally change the meeting arrangement w/ the FREDERICKSBURG by turning into Greens Bayou. Encl (35).

Captain [REDACTED], the pilot onboard the FREDERICKSBURG, largely corroborated Captain [REDACTED]'s version of the events. He confirmed that the FREDERICKSBURG was in fact at Phillips # 9 when the ALAM MAKMUR came off the green side & turned into Greens Bayou. Captain [REDACTED] advised that the FREDERICKSBURG was actually pointed toward the red side of the HSC, just off the centerline, when the ALAM MAKMUR suddenly changed the meeting arrangement & turned into Greens Bayou in front of the FREDERICKSBURG. He had the FREDERICKSBURG pointed towards the red side in anticipation of the previously agreed starboard to starboard meeting arrangement.

When the ALAM MAKMUR cut in front of the FREDERICKSBURG, Captain [REDACTED] tried to turn the FREDERICKSBURG to starboard - towards the green side of the HSC - but the vessel would not respond. Captain [REDACTED] believes that the confluence of the current coming south out of Greens Bayou coupled w/ the outbound / easterly flowing HSC current may have created a strong ebb current off the green side bank, pushing the bow of the FREDERICKSBURG towards the red side of the HSC. This kept the FREDERICKSBURG pointed at the Joe D. Hughes dock in Greens Bayou & ultimately lead to the allision. Encl (34).

Drug/alcohol testing completed for all relevant crewmembers on both vessels. Both Houston Pilots also drug/alcohol tested. All results [REDACTED]. No evidence that drugs/alcohol and/or fatigue played any role in casualty. Encl (3), (34) & (35).

Apparent cause of casualty was unsafe starboard to starboard meeting arrangement in a bad location, as suggested by Captain [REDACTED] & agreed to by Captain [REDACTED], in contravention of Inland Navigation Rule 14. While the rule does make a provision for vessels to otherwise agree on different meeting arrangements, it strongly suggests that vessels should pass each other port to port when meeting.

In this case, Captain [REDACTED] chose a poor location to attempt to hold up the ALAM MAKMUR. He knew the limitations of the MARS on his port bow, and he knew that there were strong currents flowing outbound HSC & south out of Greens Bayou. The point of confluence of these 2 currents is not a safe place to attempt to hold up. They should have agreed to a normal port to port meeting well east of the Greens Bayou / HSC confluence, or the FREDERICKSBURG should have held up well west of the confluence to allow the ALAM MAKMUR to turn into Greens Bayou in front of her. Alternatively, the ALAM MAKMUR could have held up well east of the Greens Bayou / HSC confluence to allow the outbound FREDERICKSBURG to pass prior to approaching her turn into Greens Bayou.

Matter has been referred to Houston Pilot Board Investigation Review Committee (PBIRC) for further investigation as to pilots' role in casualty.

Case closed.

Incident Involved: Marine Casualty, Reportable

Report of Investigation

Level of Investigation: Informal

IMO Classification: Serious Incident

USCG Classification: Major Marine Casualty

Was this a Serious Marine Incident? Yes

Was a Marine Board Convened by Commandant? No

Personnel Casualty Summary

Total Missing (Active Search) = 0

Total Missing (Presumed Lost) = 0

Total Dead = 0

Total Injured = 0

Total Uninjured = 26

Total People at Risk = 26

Other Personnel (Not at Risk) = 23

Vessel(s) Status Summary

Actual Total Loss(es) = 0

Total Constructive Loss, Salvaged = 0

Total Constructive Loss, Unsalvaged = 0

Damaged = 1

Undamaged = 3

Property Damage Summary/Total Damage

Vessel(s) = \$300000*

Cargo = \$

Facility(s) = \$1000000*

Other = \$

* Includes estimates

Waterway Mobility Summary

Vessel Delays (including speed restrictions): None

III. ACTIONS IN RESPONSE TO THIS REPORT

Actions on Recommendations

NONE

Safety Alerts

NONE

IV. FINDINGS OF FACT

Subjects of the Investigation

Vessels. The following vessels were subjects of this investigation. Particulars for each vessel follow.

Vessel Name:	ALAM MAKMUR
Flag:	SINGAPORE
Vessel Identification Number:	9219458
Call Sign:	S6QS7
Status:	Undamaged
Role:	Sighted in Area
Vessel Class, Type, Sub-Type:	Bulk Carrier, General, General
Gross Tonnage(GRT):	
Net Tonnage(NRT):	
Deadweight Tons:	
Length:	
Home/Hailing Port:	
Keel Laid Date:	05/11/2000
Delivery Date:	11/15/2000
Place of Construction:	MITSUI ENGINEERING & SHIPBUILDING, , JAPAN
Builder Name:	
Propulsion:	Diesel Direct
Horsepower:	
Master:	
Classification Society:	
Owner:	
Operator:	
Inspection Subchapter:	
Most Recent Vessel Inspection Activity:	
Vessel Name:	FREDERICKSBURG
Flag:	United States of America
Vessel Identification Number:	629297
Call Sign:	KNJN
Status:	Damaged
Role:	Involved in a Marine Casualty
Vessel Class, Type, Sub-Type:	Tank Ship, Petroleum Oil Tank Ship, General
Gross Tonnage(GRT):	
Net Tonnage(NRT):	
Deadweight Tons:	
Length:	
Home/Hailing Port:	

Report of Investigation

Keel Laid Date: 07/29/1957
Delivery Date: 10/10/1958
Place of Construction: PASCAGOULA, MS, UNITED STATES
Builder Name: THE INGALLS SHIPBUILDING
COPORATION
Propulsion: Steam Turbine
Horsepower:
Master:
Classification Society:
Owner:
Operator:
Inspection Subchapter: D
Most Recent Vessel Inspection Activity: 1605219, 04/16/2002 7:53:00 AM
Current Certificate of Inspection: Issued on 04/26/2001, by MSO
CHARLESTON

Vessel Name: JESS NEWTON
Flag: UNITED STATES
Vessel Identification Number: 1104825
Call Sign:
Status: Undamaged
Role: Sighted in Area
Vessel Class, Type, Sub-Type: Towing Vessel, General,
Gross Tonnage(GRT):
Net Tonnage(NRT):
Deadweight Tons:
Length:
Home/Hailing Port:
Keel Laid Date:
Delivery Date:
Place of Construction: HOUMA LA, , UNITED STATES
Builder Name: MAIN IRON WORKS INC.
Propulsion:
Horsepower:
Master:
Classification Society:
Owner:
Operator:
Inspection Subchapter:
Most Recent Vessel Inspection Activity:

Vessel Name: MARS
Flag: UNITED STATES
Vessel Identification Number: 510374
Call Sign: WX9922

Report of Investigation

Status:	Undamaged
Role:	Sighted in Area
Vessel Class, Type, Sub-Type:	Towing Vessel, General,
Gross Tonnage(GRT):	
Net Tonnage(NRT):	
Deadweight Tons:	
Length:	
Home/Hailing Port:	
Keel Laid Date:	
Delivery Date:	
Place of Construction:	HOUSTON, TEXAS, , UNITED STATES
Builder Name:	BLUDWORTH SHIPYARD INC
Propulsion:	
Horsepower:	
Master:	
Classification Society:	
Owner:	INTRACOASTAL TOWING & TRAN CO INC 2777 ALLEN PKWY STE 1165 HOUSTON, TX, 77019 SUDERMAN & YOUNG TOWING COmpany, lp 2777 ALLEN PKY ste 900 HOUSTON, TX, 77019 US
Operator:	
Inspection Subchapter:	
Most Recent Vessel Inspection Activity:	

Facilities. The following facilities were subjects of this investigation. Particulars for each facility follow.

Facility Name:	JOE D. HUGHES INC.
Type:	Waterfront Facility
Status:	Damaged and Not Repaired - Operational
Role:	Site of Incident
Contact Phone:	
Location:	Latitude: 29 45.0 N Longitude: 095 10.0 W

Parties and Organizations. The following people and organizations were subjects of this investigation.

Report of Investigation

[REDACTED]

Status:
Role:
Gender:
Age:
SSN:
Birth Date:
Email Address:
Phone Number(Home):
Address(Home/Primary Residence):

Not at Risk
Eye-Witness
M

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

Comments:

Crewmember onboard UTV MARS who witnessed allision.

[REDACTED]

Status:
Role:
Gender:
Age:
SSN:
Birth Date:
Email Address:
Phone Number(Work):
Address(Work):

Not at Risk
Investigator
M

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

713-671-5194
USCG Marine Safety Office Houston-
Ga;veston
P.O. Box 446
Galena Park, TX 77547-0446
US

Comments:

[REDACTED]

Status:
Role:
Gender:
Age:
SSN:
Birth Date:
Email Address:
Phone Number(Phone Number):
Address(Home/Primary Residence):

Not at Risk
Eye-Witness

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

Comments:

Crewmember onboard UTV MARS who witnessed allision.

Report of Investigation

[REDACTED]

Status:
Role:
Gender:
Age:
SSN:
Birth Date:
Email Address:
Phone Number(Home):
Address(Home/Primary Residence):

Not at Risk
Eye-Witness
M

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

Comments:

Crewmember onboard UTV MARS who witnessed allision.

[REDACTED]

Status:
Role:
Gender:
Age:
SSN:
Birth Date:
Email Address:
Phone Number(Home):
Address(Home/Primary Residence):

Not at Risk
Other
M

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

Comments:

US
Houston pilot onboard SS FREDERICKSBURG at time of allision.

[REDACTED]

Status:
Role:
Gender:
Age:
SSN:
Birth Date:
Email Address:
Phone Number():
Address(Home/Primary Residence):

Not at Risk
Crewmember

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

Comments:

Master, SS FREDERICKSBURG

Report of Investigation

█; Other
█; Other

Response Resources. The following incident response resources were subjects of this investigation.

Other Subjects. The following were subjects of this investigation.

Waterway Segment(s). The following waterway segment(s) were subjects of this investigation.

HOUSTON SHIP CHANNEL

Role: Location

Local Name: MM 40.3-41.7

Description: Phillips Chemical, Enron Gas (Deer Park), BP Amoco, Aristech, Georgia Gulf

Incident Information

Location(s).

<u>Description</u>	<u>Latitude</u>	<u>Longitude</u>
HOUSTON SHIP CHANNEL	29 44.7978 N	095 10.1832 W

Sequence of Events.

11/04/2002 0:00 to 11/04/2002 0:00 (Estimated): All post-casualty drug/alcohol testing negative - no evidence of any drug/alcohol use.

Action Type: Other Actions - Drug and Alcohol Use and Testing

Action Class: Take Drug Test - Post-casualty

Location: Unknown

Subject(s) and Details:

<u>Name</u>	<u>Type</u>	<u>Status</u>	<u>Role</u>
█	Party	Not at Risk	Other

Details Filed: Drug and Alcohol Test Details

Sample Collection

Reason for Sample: Post-casualty

Date/Time Directed: 11/04/2002

Means of Direction:

Directed By:

Organization: Marine Employer

Description:

Directed to get DOT Test: Yes

Chemical Test Sample Provided: Yes

Chemical Test Type: Both

Sample Type: Urine

Date/Time Sample Taken: 11/04/2002

Report of Investigation

Sampling Location:
DOT Protocols Used: Yes
Collection Agent:
Donor Certified: Yes
Irregularities Noted: No
Transferred/Chain of
Custody Complete: Yes

Field Sobriety Test

Field Sobriety Test Performed: No

Alcohol Analysis

Method of Analysis: Breath Test
Instrument Used:
Date/Time Results Obtained: 11/04/2002
Results: [REDACTED]
Agency Conducting Analysis:
Description of Analysis:
Irregularities in Analysis: No

Drug Analysis

Analyzing Laboratory:
DOT Protocols Used: Yes
Test Results: [REDACTED]
Medical Review Officer/Coroner:
MRO/Coroner Conclusions:
Sample Transferred and Chain
of Custody Complete: Yes

Drug Re-Analysis

[REDACTED] Party Not at Risk Other

Details Filed: Drug and Alcohol Test Details

Sample Collection

Reason for Sample: Post-casualty
Date/Time Directed: 11/04/2002
Means of Direction:
Directed By:
Organization: Marine Employer
Description:
Directed to get DOT Test: Yes
Chemical Test Sample Provided: Yes
Chemical Test Type: Both
Sample Type: Urine
Date/Time Sample Taken: 11/04/2002
Sampling Location:
DOT Protocols Used: Yes
Collection Agent:
Donor Certified: Yes
Irregularities Noted: No
Transferred/Chain of
Custody Complete: Yes

Field Sobriety Test

Field Sobriety Test Performed: No

Alcohol Analysis

Method of Analysis: Breath Test
Instrument Used:
Date/Time Results Obtained: 11/04/2002
Results: [REDACTED]
Agency Conducting Analysis:
Description of Analysis:

Report of Investigation

Irregularities in Analysis: No
Drug Analysis
Analyzing Laboratory:
DOT Protocols Used: Yes
Test Results:
Medical Review Officer/Coroner:
MRO/Coroner Conclusions:
Sample Transferred and Chain of Custody Complete: Yes
Drug Re-Analysis

11/04/2002 5:24 to 11/04/2002 5:24 (Known): Houston Pilots on FREDERICKSBURG & ALAM MAKMUR chose a poor location to effectuate an unsafe starboard to starboard meeting in contravention of Inland Navigation Rule 14.

Action Type: Bridge Operations - Shiphandling
Action Class: Maneuver in accordance with sea/river/weather conditions
Location: Known; US Waters
Description: HOUSTON SHIP CHANNEL
Latitude: 29 44.7978 N Longitude: 095 10.1832 W

Subject(s) and Details:

Table with 4 columns: Name, Type, Status, Role. Contains two entries for parties involved in the incident, both with status 'Not at Risk' and role 'Other'.

11/04/2002 5:24 to 11/04/2002 5:24 (Known): Houston Pilots on FREDERICKSBURG & ALAM MAKMUR chose a poor location to effectuate an unsafe starboard to starboard meeting in contravention of Inland Navigation Rule 14.

Action Type: Bridge Operations - Collision Avoidance
Action Class: Recognize and apply COLREGS
Location: Known; US Waters
Description: HOUSTON SHIP CHANNEL
Latitude: 29 44.7978 N Longitude: 095 10.1832 W

Subject(s) and Details:

Table with 4 columns: Name, Type, Status, Role. Contains two entries for parties involved in the incident, both with status 'Not at Risk' and role 'Other'.

Report of Investigation

11/04/2002 5:24 to 11/04/2002 5:24 (Known): Vessel allided w/ Joe D. Hughes Dock # 2.

Event Type: Allision
Event Class: Head-on
Event Subclass: Full Control
Location: Known; US Waters
Description: HOUSTON SHIP CHANNEL
Latitude: 29 44.7978 N Longitude: 095 10.1832 W

Subject(s) and Details:

<u>Name</u>	<u>Type</u>	<u>Status</u>	<u>Role</u>
FREDERICKSBURG	Vessel	Damaged	Involved in a Marine Casualty

Details Filed: Detail Description
See incident brief.

JOE D. HUGHES INC.	Facility	Damaged and Not Repaired - Operational	Site of Incident
--------------------	----------	----------------------------------------	------------------

Details Filed: Detail Description
see incident brief

V. CAUSAL ANALYSIS

The Initiating Event of the Incident

Initiating Event:

Allision (11/04/2002 5:24:00 AM)

Production Factors

Preconditions

Workplace Factors

LUCs in Operations - Operations not in accordance with rules and regulations

Organization Factors

Defense Factors

Failures of Defense Against Subsequent Events in the Incident

N/A

VI. REFERRAL FOR ENFORCEMENT ACTION

The following referrals for enforcement action have been made as a result of this investigation and represent those instances where the Coast Guard has gathered evidence that indicates one or more alleged violations or offenses may have occurred. Any determinations as to whether or not one or more actual violations or offenses have occurred are documented in the appropriate Coast Guard enforcement activities.

NONE

APPENDIX 1 - EVIDENCE

1701064 - Encl (1): Document/CG-2692 Report of Marine Accident, Injury or Death
Submitted by SS FREDERICKSBURG

Collection Information:

Date/Time: 11/06/2002
Location: HOUMS
Collected By: USCG Gathered; ,
Witnessed By: USCG Witness; ,

Tracking:

Attachments:

1701064 - Encl (10): Document/Course Reader Tape
Course Recorder - S/S FREDERICKSBURG

Collection Information:

Date/Time: 11/04/2002
Location: HOUMS
Collected By: USCG Gathered; ,
Witnessed By: USCG Witness; ,

Tracking:

Attachments:

1701064 - Encl (11): Document/Other Document
Survey Report (ABS) - S/S FREDERICKSBURG

Collection Information:

Date/Time: 11/04/2002
Location: HOUMS
Collected By: USCG Gathered; ,
Witnessed By: USCG Witness; ,

Tracking:

Attachments:

1701064 - Encl (12): Document/Written Statement
[REDACTED] - Master, SS FREDERICKSBURG

Collection Information:

Date/Time: 11/04/2002
Location: HOUMS
Collected By: USCG Gathered; ,
Witnessed By: USCG Witness; ,

Tracking:

Attachments:

1701064 - Encl (13): Document/Written Statement
[REDACTED], 2nd Mate, SS FREDERICKSBURG

Collection Information:

Date/Time: 11/04/2002
Location: HOUMS

Report of Investigation

Collected By: USCG Gathered; ,

Witnessed By: USCG Witness; ,

Tracking:

Attachments:

1701064 - Encl (14): Document/Written Statement

██████████, 3rd Mate, SS FREDERICKSBURG

Collection Information:

Date/Time: 11/04/2002

Location: HOUMS

Collected By: USCG Gathered; ,

Witnessed By: USCG Witness; ,

Tracking:

Attachments:

1701064 - Encl (15): Document/Written Statement

██████████, Deckhand, SS FREDERICKSBURG

Collection Information:

Date/Time: 11/04/2002

Location: HOUMS

Collected By: USCG Gathered; ,

Witnessed By: USCG Witness; ,

Tracking:

Attachments:

1701064 - Encl (16): Document/Other Document
Inspection Report, Joe D. Hughes Dock #2

Collection Information:

Date/Time: 11/04/2002

Location: HOUMS

Collected By: USCG Gathered; ,

Witnessed By: USCG Witness; ,

Tracking:

Attachments:

1701064 - Encl (17): Document/Other Document
General Particulars - M/V ALAM MAKMUR

Collection Information:

Date/Time: 11/04/2002

Location: HOUMS

Collected By: USCG Gathered; ,

Witnessed By: USCG Witness; ,

Tracking:

Attachments:

1701064 - Encl (18): Document/Other Document
Pilot Card - M/V ALAM MAKMUR

Collection Information:

Report of Investigation

Date/Time: 11/04/2002
Location: HOUMS
Collected By: USCG Gathered; ,
Witnessed By: USCG Witness; ,

Tracking:
Attachments:

1701064 - Encl (19): Document/Other Document
Crew List - M/V ALAM MAKMUR

Collection Information:
Date/Time: 11/04/2002
Location: HOUMS
Collected By: USCG Gathered; ,
Witnessed By: USCG Witness; ,

Tracking:
Attachments:

1701064 - Encl (2): Document/CG-2692 Report of Marine Accident, Injury or Death
Submitted by dock

Collection Information:
Date/Time: 11/04/2002
Location: HOUMS
Collected By: USCG Gathered; ,
Witnessed By: USCG Witness; ,

Tracking:
Attachments:

1701064 - Encl (20): Document/Logbook
Deck Log - M/V ALAM MAKMUR

Collection Information:
Date/Time: 11/04/2002
Location: HOUMS
Collected By: USCG Gathered; ,
Witnessed By: USCG Witness; ,

Tracking:
Attachments:

1701064 - Encl (21): Document/Course Reader Tape
Course Recorder Data - M/V ALAM MAKMUR

Collection Information:
Date/Time: 11/04/2002
Location: HOUMS
Collected By: USCG Gathered; ,
Witnessed By: USCG Witness; ,

Tracking:
Attachments:

1701064 - Encl (22): Document/Chart

Report of Investigation

Chart from bridge of M/V ALAM MAKMUR (certified true copy)

Collection Information:

Date/Time: 11/04/2002
Location: HOUMS
Collected By: USCG Gathered; ,
Witnessed By: USCG Witness; ,

Tracking:

Attachments:

1701064 - Encl (23): Document/Depth Sounder Recording
M/V ALAM MAKMUR

Collection Information:

Date/Time: 11/04/2002
Location: HOUMS
Collected By: USCG Gathered; ,
Witnessed By: USCG Witness; ,

Tracking:

Attachments:

1701064 - Encl (24): Document/Written Statement
[REDACTED], Master, M/V ALAM MAKMUR

Collection Information:

Date/Time: 11/04/2002
Location: HOUMS
Collected By: USCG Gathered; ,
Witnessed By: USCG Witness; ,

Tracking:

Attachments:

1701064 - Encl (25): Document/Written Statement
Sworn statements from 5 crewmembers onboard M/V ALAM MAKMUR

Collection Information:

Date/Time: 11/04/2002
Location: HOUMS
Collected By: USCG Gathered; ,
Witnessed By: USCG Witness; ,

Tracking:

Attachments:

1701064 - Encl (26): Document/Other Document
COD, UTV MARS

Collection Information:

Date/Time: 11/14/2002
Location: HOUMS
Collected By: USCG Gathered; ,
Witnessed By: USCG Witness; ,

Tracking:

Attachments:

Report of Investigation

1701064 - Encl (27): Document/Logbook
Official Vessel Logbook, UTV MARS
Collection Information:

Date/Time: 11/14/2002
Location: HOUMS
Collected By: USCG Gathered; ,
Witnessed By: USCG Witness; ,

Tracking:
Attachments:

1701064 - Encl (28): Document/Written Statement
Sworn statements from 3 crewmembers onboard UTV MR JEFF who witnessed allision.
Collection Information:

Date/Time: 11/14/2002
Location: HOUMS
Collected By: USCG Gathered; ,
Witnessed By: USCG Witness; ,

Tracking:
Attachments:

1701064 - Encl (29): Document/USCG VTS Incident Report

Collection Information:

Date/Time: 11/04/2002
Location: HOUMS
Collected By: USCG Gathered; ,
Witnessed By: USCG Witness; ,

Tracking:
Attachments:

1701064 - Encl (3): Document/CG-2692B Rpt of Req Chemical Drug/Alcohol Testing
CG-2692B & drug/alcohol test results for SS FREDERICKSBURG crewmembers
(██████████).

Collection Information:

Date/Time: 11/05/2002
Location: HOUMS
Collected By: USCG Gathered; ,
Witnessed By: USCG Witness; ,

Tracking:
Attachments:

1701064 - Encl (30): Document/Other Document
VTS Houston/Galveston Chartlet #22

Collection Information:

Date/Time: 11/04/2002
Location: HOUMS
Collected By: USCG Gathered; ,

Report of Investigation

Witnessed By: USCG Witness; ,
Tracking:
Attachments:

1701064 - Encl (31): Electronic/Digital Photographs

Damage to south end of Joe D. Hughes #2, taken by LT [REDACTED] on 04 Nov 02

Collection Information:

Date/Time: 11/04/2002
Location: HOUMS
Collected By: USCG Gathered; ,
Witnessed By: USCG Witness; ,

Tracking:

Attachments:

- Mvc-006f.jpg; MSO HOUSTON/GALVESTON; [REDACTED].;
12/06/2002;

1701064 - Encl (32): Electronic/Digital Photographs

Damage to port bow of SS FREDERICKSBURG, taken by LT [REDACTED] 04 Nov 02; note chunk of dock lodged into bow!

Collection Information:

Date/Time: 11/04/2002
Location: HOUMS
Collected By: USCG Gathered; ,
Witnessed By: USCG Witness; ,

Tracking:

Attachments:

- Mvc-001f.jpg; MSO HOUSTON/GALVESTON; [REDACTED].;
12/06/2002;

1701064 - Encl (33): Electronic/Digital Photographs

Confluence of Greens Bayou & Houston Ship Channel IVO lights # 151/152

Collection Information:

Date/Time: 11/04/2002
Location: HOUMS
Collected By: USCG Gathered; ,
Witnessed By: USCG Witness; ,

Tracking:

Attachments:

- Mvc-003f.jpg; MSO HOUSTON/GALVESTON; [REDACTED].;
12/06/2002;

1701064 - Encl (34): Document/Written Statement

Captain [REDACTED], Houston Pilot onboard SS FREDERICKSBURG (& [REDACTED] drug/alcohol test results).

Collection Information:

Date/Time: 11/04/2002
Location: HOUMS
Collected By: USCG Gathered; ,

Report of Investigation

Witnessed By: USCG Witness; ,
Tracking:
Attachments:

1701064 - Encl (35): Document/Written Statement

Captain [REDACTED], Houston Pilot onboard M/V ALAM MAKMUR
(& [REDACTED] drug/alcohol test results).

Collection Information:

Date/Time: 11/07/2002
Location: HOUMS
Collected By: USCG Gathered; ,
Witnessed By: USCG Witness; ,

Tracking:
Attachments:

1701064 - Encl (36): Physical/Video Tape

Filmed by LT [REDACTED] @ Joe D. Hughes #2 on 04 Nov 02

Collection Information:

Date/Time: 11/04/2002
Location: HOUMS
Collected By: USCG Gathered; ,
Witnessed By: USCG Witness; ,

Tracking:
Attachments:

1701064 - Encl (4): Document/Other Document

SS FREDERICKSBURG certificates

Collection Information:

Date/Time: 11/04/2002
Location: HOUMS
Collected By: USCG Gathered; ,
Witnessed By: USCG Witness; ,

Tracking:
Attachments:

1701064 - Encl (5): Document/Other Document

Vessel Particulars - SS FREDERICKSBURG

Collection Information:

Date/Time: 11/04/2002
Location: HOUMS
Collected By: USCG Gathered; ,
Witnessed By: USCG Witness; ,

Tracking:
Attachments:

1701064 - Encl (6): Document/Other Document

Crew List - SS FREDERICKSBURG

Collection Information:

Report of Investigation

Date/Time: 11/04/2002
Location: HOUMS
Collected By: USCG Gathered; ,
Witnessed By: USCG Witness; ,

Tracking:
Attachments:

1701064 - Encl (7): Document/Logbook
Bridge/Deck Bell Book - S/S FREDERICKSBURG
Collection Information:

Date/Time: 11/04/2002
Location: HOUMS
Collected By: USCG Gathered; ,
Witnessed By: USCG Witness; ,

Tracking:
Attachments:

1701064 - Encl (8): Document/Logbook
Official Bell Book - S/S FREDERICKSBURG
Collection Information:

Date/Time: 11/04/2002
Location: HOUMS
Collected By: USCG Gathered; ,
Witnessed By: USCG Witness; ,

Tracking:
Attachments:

1701064 - Encl (9): Document/Logbook
Deck Log - S/S FREDERICKSBURG
Collection Information:

Date/Time: 11/04/2002
Location: HOUMS
Collected By: USCG Gathered; ,
Witnessed By: USCG Witness; ,

Tracking:
Attachments:

1701064 -Encl (37): Physical/Audio Tape
VTS Houston/Galveston audio tape of VHF Channel 13, 04 Nov 02

Collection Information:
Date/Time: 11/04/2002
Location: HOUMS
Collected By: USCG Gathered; ,
Witnessed By: USCG Witness; ,

Tracking:
Attachments: