30 NOVEMBER 2016 PAGE: 1 of 198

# WEDNESDAY, 30 NOVEMBER 2016

# PROCEEDINGS OF THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

\_\_\_\_

The House met at 15:03.

The Deputy Speaker took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayers or meditation.

ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS - see col 000.

# QUESTIONS FOR ORAL REPLY

### SOCIAL SERVICES

# Cluster 2

MINISTERS:

Position regarding investigation into awarding of contracts to deliver water pipes to uMkhanyakude District Municipality

30 NOVEMBER 2016 PAGE: 2 of 198

328. Mr M Hlengwa (IFP) asked the Minister of Water and Sanitation:

Whether she will conduct an investigation into the two companies (names furnished) which were awarded contracts to deliver water pipes to the uMkhanyakude District Municipality (details furnished) without the proper processes being followed; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details?

The MINISTER OF WATER AND SANITATION: Deputy Speaker and hon members, the department is aware of the issues that are related to this particular contract. However, with regard to the two companies that were awarded contracts in uMkhanyakude, we have referred this matter to the Minister of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs, since the matter also includes the other sphere of government, which is the provincial government of the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs in KwaZulu-Natal. Thank you.

Mnu M HLENGWA: Sekela Somlomo, Khabazela, inhlekelele yamanzi eMkhanyakude akuseyona nanendaba exoxwayo siyibona ngamehlo.

Abantu baphila usizi ekuseni, emini, ntambama nasebusuku.

Amapayipi ekukhulunywa ngawo lapha ahlezi ehlathini, aneminyaka

PAGE: 3 of 198

ahlala. Nawe ube nemizamo uhambisa amabhala laphayana kuyiyona lendaba yamanzi. Kodwa abantu ngeke baphile ngamabhala. Lolu daba ludinga ukuba nilusukumele ngoba le nkinga yamanzi eMkhanyakude iyaqhubeka. Nedamu laphayana liphethwe uMnumzane othize, unamagunya akhe yedwa manje ngithi angicele kuNgqongqoshe ukuthi ayibe khona imizamo ephuthumayo oyenzayo ngoba njengoba lolu daba uliyise kuNgqongqoshe Kahulumeni Wokubambisana kanye Nezindaba Zezendabuko laqala khona nekomidi lahamba layobheka lawafica lamapayipi u-PLO wakho wayekhona. (Translation of isiZulu paragraphs follows.)

[Mr M HLENGWA: Deputy Speaker, Khabazela [Mkhize Clan name], the water crisis at uMkhanyakude is no longer a rumour, since we can see it with our own eyes. People are suffering, day in and day out. The pipes you are talking about here are in the bushes; they have been there for years. You also have made some provisions by supplying wheelbarrows in that area because of this water problem. But people are not going to survive with only wheelbarrows. This matter needs your serious consideration and action because this crisis at uMkhanyakude is continuing. Even the dam in that area is owned by some man who has his own privileges. So, now, I would like to ask the Minister's intervention, since you are taking this matter to the Minister of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs. It started

there and the committee went for oversight and they saw those pipes; your provincial liaison officer was also there.]

What adds insult to injury here is that it is the husband of the MEC of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs in KwaZulu-Natal who actually got the tender for these pipes. So, on top of referring it, Minister, what other plans do you have of ensuring that the matter is actually fast-tracked? Because the situation has gone beyond desperate now. Can there be other interventions on top of the investigation and the referrals because ...

... izimpilo zabantu lezi esikhuluma ngazo, nemfuyo, nokuhlupheka nosizi lokhu okubangela ukuthi emakhaya, nasezikoleni, nasezibhedlela, nasemtholampilo, kugqoze intuthuko. Ngiyayibonga imizamo yokuthi udaba ulidlulisele phambili kodwa ngibona ungathi nawe khona iqhaza okufanele ulibambe kulolu daba ngoba isimo sesiyaphuthuma. Ngiyathokoza Sekela Somlomo. (Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)

[... we are talking about the lives of people and livestock here. The poverty and suffering slow down the development in the rural areas - at schools, hospitals, and at clinics. We appreciate your effort in taking the matter forward, but I also

PAGE: 5 of 198

think you have a role to play in this matter because it is an urgent matter. Thank you, Deputy Speaker.]

The MINISTER OF WATER AND SANITATION: Hon Deputy Speaker, hon Hlengwa, indeed, the issue of that particular project in KwaZulu-Natal is a matter of serious concern. Hence, both the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs and National Treasury, given the fact that ...

... yonke lemali eyasetshenziswa ukuthenga wonke lawo mapayipi kwakuyimali eyisibonelelo esuka kuMgcinimafa kaZwelonke. Ihamba iyakhona laphayana ngqo ngaphandle kokuthi badlule kuMnyango Wezamanzi. Yingakho thina siwuMnyango Wezamanzi esesikwenza, nanoma lenkinga le isazama ukuxazululwa, thina esikwenzayo ... (Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)

[... all the money that was used to purchase all these pipes came from a grant from National Treasury, it was given directly to the Department of Water and Sanitation. That is why what the Department of Water and Sanitation does, even though this matter is being resolved ...]

... are the following issues. Firstly, there is the regional bulk infrastructure grant that the department has already granted for the Jozini-Ingwavuma Bulk Water Supply Project.

Secondly, the water services infrastructure grant that we have also put aside will provide support in short-term, interim measures, such as drought support, through the drilling of boreholes and spring protection. There are four spring protection initiatives around the area.

Thirdly, water conservation and demand-management measures include programmes that look at sanitation support for the entire uMkhanyakude area.

Lastly, through the Accelerated Community Infrastructure programme, we are currently assisting Mhlathuze Water with the refurbishment of three wastewater treatment plants. We are doing those directly and ...

... okunye esizokucela mhlonishwa uHlengwa ukuthi asisebenzisaneni ukuthi naye umasipala lo ongenalo ikhono avume ukuthi singenelele laphayana kunokuthi bafune izibonelelo ezizofikelela kubona bagcine sebekhethe abantu abangenalo ulwazi. Yingakho thina sisebenza ngaphandle komthetho

nokuvumelana nomnyango wesifundazwe kanye nomasipala. Kepha, sizwile manje ukuthi emuva kokhetho umasipala uthi cha, lemali ayize kuthina sizenzele. Thina sithi cha, sizoqhubeka thina silungise zonke lezinhlelo ezine engikhuluma ngazo. Dankie, ngiyabonga.

PAGE: 7 of 198

Nk M S KHAWULA: Sihlalo, Ngqongqoshe, ngifuna ukwazi ngodaba lwaseNkobongo, eMhlali, lapho abantu abangenawo amanzi okuze kwabakhona inkampani ebafakela amanzi ngo-R20 000 ngenxa yokuthi azikho izingqalasizinda okufanele ngabe sebenawo vele amanzi, sebeze badlale izigebengu. Laphayana uZandile Mdletshe noMakhoba eMhlali banenkinga la, bafuna ukwazi ukuthi uthini ngalaba bantu, ngabe wazini ngalaba bantu ababafakela ngo-R20 000? Kungani abantu bakithi behlupheka? Okokugcina, laphaya kusigceme-29 KwaMashu, kunamanzi ageleza nsuku zonke namathoyilethi, konakele Ngqongqoshe sibe sithi amanzi awekho? Ngiyabonga. Incwadi esasikubhalele yona yaseNkobongo ... Anike nithule ukuphapha nina. (Translation of isiZulu paragraphs follows.)

[... what I would also like to ask the hon Hlengwa is that we work together in making sure that municipalities that do not have capacity do allow us to intervene instead of them asking for grants that will come to them and they end up appointing

PAGE: 8 of 198

people who are not skilled. That is why we are working outside the law together with the provincial department and the municipality. But we heard that after the elections, the municipality is saying that this money must come to them directly and they can use it. We are saying no, we will continue to plan for all the four programmes that I spoke about. Dankie, thank you.

Ms M S KHAWULA: Chairperson and Minister, I want to know about the Nkobongo, in Mhlali, matter, where people did not have water until a company supplied water at a cost of R20 000, because there was no infrastructure. Now, they are the victims of criminals. Zandile Mdletshe and Makhoba at Mhlali have a problem. They want to know what you have to say about these people. What do you know about these people who supply water at a cost of R20 000? Why are our people suffering? Lastly, in Ward 29, KwaMashu, there is water gushing out every day. And the toilets are in a bad state, Minister. At the same time, we are experiencing a water shortage. Thank you. The letter we wrote to you about Nkobongo ... Can you stop being forward?]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Khawula, the Rule is that you ask only one supplementary question at a time, not more than that. So, all members, please, if you are going to ask supplementary

PAGE: 9 of 198

questions, stick to one supplementary question - and it must be related to the original question.

The MINISTER OF WATER AND SANITATION: Deputy Speaker, reticulation, which is the supply of water from a bulk source - uyasazi isiNgesi; makamamele [she understands English; she must listen] - of water supply into somebody's household is the responsibility of a local authority. We do know and we have received this kind of enquiry.

Our response is that this was an individual's initiative. It was an initiative where a private service provider did this work. In the event where a local municipality deals with reticulation within that particular area, there has, then, to be normalisation of that private initiative. It cannot be compensated for by the national Department of Water and Sanitation because ours is about bulk water supply. We do not provide water from a reservoir to somebody's yard. The simplest advice I can give is to let this matter be raised with the municipality. Where there is compensation, municipalities do, actually, do that. The City of Johannesburg has done that in Orange Farm over a long period of time and private property developers there have been compensated. Thank you.

Mr M JOHNSON: Deputy Speaker and Minister, given the fact that your department and the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs work in the same space - that is, local government - what programmes and plans does your department have as collaborative work expected to be done by these two respective departments, so that we do not have a silo approach to tackling issues? Granted, you have bulk and reticulation here but this specific municipality is expected to receive one service, which is water. They do not make any delineation as to whether this is for one department or another. Thank you.

Nk M S KHAWULA: Uxolo kancane, weSihlalo, nginephuzu lesincomo. Sekwenzeke iphutha waze wangena umhlonishwa laphaya. Bengithi ngifuna ukucacisa lapho ngaphambili. Angiyizwa mina lento yesiNgisi ikakhulukazi labantu abangithumile emuva bona? Noma ngingasizwa mina kodwa abasemuva abezwa ikakhulukazi lomndeni wakwaMdletshe. Bafuna isiZulu. Ngiyabonga.

USEKELA SOMLOMO: Ngiyabonga, sizoyixoxa leyo, ma. Qhubeka. (Translation of isiZulu paragraphs follows.)

[Ms M S KHAWULA: Excuse me, Chairperson, I have a concern. There was a mistake here and the hon member has entered already. I wanted to clarify something. I do not understand English, nor,

especially, do the people who sent me here. Even if I understood English, people back home do not understand it, especially the Mdletshe family. They want isiZulu. Thank you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, we will discuss that, hon member.

Continue.]

Ms H O HLOPHE: Deputy Speaker, on a point of order: I rise on Rule 92: I think you must attend to the request of Mrs Khawula. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I said I was going to attend to it. Why are you standing up now? [Interjections.]

Ms H O HLOPHE: People are waiting for their answer.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, no, no ... [Interjections.]

Ms H O HLOPHE: The Minister must speak in the vernacular, isiZulu.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon ... you, yourself, are speaking in English, in the first place! [Interjections.] Hon Minister, please proceed. Hon members, I am going to address this matter.

We have spoken about the use of languages here but members must be consistent across the board, please. [Interjections.]

Mr M S MBATHA: Hon Deputy Speaker ... hon Deputy Speaker, this is a point of order against you: You just come charging down again on the hon Hlengiwe. You should at least have explained how you are going to solve the problem. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, take your seat, please. Please take your seat and listen when we speak from the Chair.

[Interjections.]

Ms H O HLOPHE: Deputy Speaker ... Deputy Speaker ... Deputy Speaker ...

... ikuphi inkinga yakho ngoba ngabe uba nesineke usiphendule kahle ngokwemithetho. Siphakamisa ukukhathazeka la, uthi umama uKhawula ubuze ngesiZulu. Ungqongqoshe wenza izinto zibe nzima, uphendula ngesiNgisi. Sithi, (Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)

[... what is your problem, because you should be patient and respond as per the Rules. We are raising our concern here. The hon Khawula is saying that she asked her question in isiZulu.

The Minister is complicating things by answering in English. We are asking you to ...]

... please correct that thing. People are waiting at home for an answer in isiZulu.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member ...

... awuhlale phansi. Ngithe ngizo ... [Ubuwelewele.] [... please take your seat. I said ... [Interjections.]]

... I will deal with that thing. And stop instructing me, please. Go ahead, hon Minister.

Ms N P SONTI: Deputy Speaker!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, no, we won't allow it anymore. No, no, it is not allowed, please. Take your seat.

Ms N P SONTI: Deputy Speaker!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Ngikulalele ma, mina ngithi cha. [I am listening, hon member, and I am saying no.]

Ms N P SONTI: Deputy Speaker! Deputy Speaker ...

... ndinelungelo. [... I have a right.]

HON MEMBERS: Yes! [Interjections.]

Ms N P SONTI: Deputy Speaker ...

... ndinelungelo! [... I have a right.]

Deputy Speaker ...

... sinalo ilungelo lokuthetha ulwimi lwethu. Ndiyangqinelana noMama uKhawula kule nto ayithethayo. UMphathiswa makamphendule ngesiZulu kuba naye UMama Khawula umbuze ngesiZulu. UThunyiwe uMama uKhawula ngabantu besiZulu, abangasaziyo isiNgesi. Ufihla ntoni le nto eza kuthetha isiNgesi nje, kuba abantu basiZulu abasiva isiNgesi. (Translation of isiXhosa paragraph follows.)

[... we have a right to use our language. I support Mrs Khawula in respect of the statement she made. The Minister must use isiZulu in her reply because Mrs Khawula used isiZulu when she asked her question. She had been asked by isiZulu speakers to do so because they do not understand English. The reason the

PAGE: 15 of 198

Minister is using English is to try and hide something. She knows that isiZulu speakers are not familiar with English.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members! Please take your seats. Yes, hon member?

Ms L M MASEKO: Deputy Speaker, on a point of order: I just want to bring to the attention of the hon members that there is interpretation. So, you can speak in any language. The Minister can speak in English. There is isiZulu interpretation. Thank you, Deputy Speaker. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members ... [Interjections.]

Ms N V MENTE: Order, Deputy Speaker ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members ...

... ngicela nihlale phansi, ngiyacela. [... please take your seats, please.]

Ms N V MENTE: Order, Deputy Speaker!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, please take your seats. [Interjections.]

Ms N V MENTE: On a point of order, Deputy Speaker: You are not being fair to the House. You allow the member of the ANC to speak, whereas you do not allow the member of the EFF to speak. Why are you doing that?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: The hon member spoke without my permission. [Interjections.]

Ms N V MENTE: You did not recognise her. You did not recognise her! Why? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I spoke ... [Interjections.]

 $\label{eq:members} \mbox{Ms N V MENTE: Why are you recognising ANC members?}$ 

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members ... [Interjections.]

Ms N V MENTE: Why are you recognising ANC members and not EFF members?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: I have told you not to speak on the same point. [Interjections.]

Ms N V MENTE: We have equal rights in the House. Do not be like that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Take your seat, hon member.

Ms N V MENTE: No, you should not treat us like that.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Take your seat, hon member. [Interjections.]

Ms N V MENTE: We are not your children. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, please realise that ... I actually think this is an appropriate position to talk about this matter of language. You have to be consistent every time, in every language. You do it here, inside, and outside, there. We will address it. [Interjections.] What are you rising on, hon member?

Ms T STANDER: Deputy Speaker, I have a point of order: Sir, I just wanted to bring it to your attention that the

PAGE: 18 of 198

interpretation services are not working all over the House. So, perhaps that can be corrected.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: We will attend to that, yes.

Ms T STANDER: Thank you, Sir.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Minister, proceed.

The MINISTER OF WATER AND SANITATION: Hon member Johnson, one of the things that we are doing now to co-ordinate our work with the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs is, firstly, to review the Water Services Act and the National Water Act, so as to ensure that we are able to complement one another.

Secondly, there is a programme that was launched a year ago, called Back to Basics. That programme, led by the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs, requires of all of us in the departments that have a responsibility to give support to municipalities to work together in a complementary way.

PAGE: 19 of 198

That is why now, hon member Johnson, we have 27 district municipalities that are priority municipalities, where we have put together turnaround programmes that are making a difference in terms of making sure that we mobilise resources together, we plan together, and most importantly, we capacitate those municipalities. Just like what we have been able to do in Bloemhof in the Dr Ruth Segomotsi Mompati district in the North West where, three days after the elections, we had two babies who died from contaminated water.

As we speak, together with the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs and the provincial government, we have turned around the entire water infrastructure. The municipality has invested in building capacity and that municipality and the district are now one of the few in the North West that have Blue Drop and Green Drop certification because of collaboration and working together. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

Ms T E BAKER: Deputy Speaker, Minister, uMkhanyakude District Municipality has been plagued by allegations of corruption for many years. I am happy to hear that you also mentioned the Mhlathuze Water Board, which is one of the water boards that is owed R3,1 billion by municipalities such as uMkhanyakude.

PAGE: 20 of 198

Now, the Mhlathuze Water Board is not without allegations of corruption, as well. In fact, Minister, it is under your watch that the allegations of corruption are quite rife at the moment and the appointment of the Chairperson of the Mhlathuze Water Board, one Ms Dudu Myeni, is a case in point.

Ms Myeni has been appointed by you as the head of the interim merged boards of Mhlathuze Water and uMngeni Water Board, despite her having served her maximum term of office of 12 years, according to the very National Water Act you have just mentioned. So, how is it that she gets this position, we wonder? And despite this water board ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time has expired, hon member.

Ms T E BAKER: Sorry, can I just ask the question then, Deputy Speaker?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, no, your time has expired.
[Interjections.]

Ms T E BAKER: Is it because of her connections to Mr Zuma, and nothing else, that she is being given this preferential treatment?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, your time has expired.

The MINISTER OF WATER AND SANITATION: Thank you very much, member Baker. uMkhanyakude has had serious challenges. There has also been a challenge ... [Interjections.]

... yokuqinisekisa ukuthi umasipala uba nekhono lokuthi ube nabantu abasebenzela wona umasipala abazokwazi ukuthi babhekane nezinkinga lezi ezikhona. Osekwenzeka, ngoba kunezinkinga kwamasipala kanye nomnyango kusifundazwe saKwaZulu-Natal yingakho siye saletha Umhlathuze Water Board ukuthi kube iwona ozosisiza ukuthi ubheke imisebenzi yethu laphaya eMkhanyakude. Ngempela, kuyiqiniso, umama uDudu Myeni. (Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)

[... of ensuring that the municipality is capacitated by having employees who are able to attend to these challenges. What is happening is that, since there are challenges at the municipality and in the KwaZulu-Natal provincial department, we have brought the Mhlathuze Water Board to help us with oversight at uMkhanyakude. Of course, it is true, regarding mama Dudu Myeni ...]

PAGE: 22 of 198

... I know there is this excitement, this passion to hate, but I want to put it on record: Dudu Myeni has been in the water sector from 1992, even before the democratic dispensation. She played a role in the old period, before 1994, empowering herself to understand the water sector. She has been in Mhlathuze and Mhlathuze has been one of those water boards that have been able to reach out to the majority of the unserved in the deep rural areas of KwaZulu-Natal. In addition, what has also been a success story, small as that water board could have been, is they are amongst the few water boards that have been able to also sustain interventions during this drought period.

On the appointment, now that we are merging both uMngeni and Mhlathuze, hon members, it would be incorrect not to have an existing board. I would have preferred, hon Baker, that you had said she is deputised by the chair of a board whose term has also come to an end. However, we have extended both of them so that they must then be the co-conveners in the transition, as we are now working towards a wall-to-wall water board in KwaZulu-Natal. They report to a transitional management team that deals with these particular issues.

"Allegations", and I am happy, that the hon Baker ...

30 NOVEMBER 2016 PAGE: 23 of 198

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time has expired, hon Minister. I have given you additional minutes. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF WATER AND SANITATION: ... has continuously said "alleged" corruption, not "proven acts of" corruption. Thank you very much.

# Particulars regarding procedure in place to ensure smooth registration process for students at universities and TVET colleges in 2017

- 333. Prof N M Khubisa (NFP) asked the Minister of Higher Education and Training:
  - (1) In light of the recent Fees Must Fall campaign, which affected a number of universities, what are the challenges facing the 2017 registration period of students at both universities and technical and vocational education and training colleges;
  - (2) what systems and procedures have tertiary institutions, working with his department and students, put in place to ensure that the 2017 registration process runs smoothly?

PAGE: 24 of 198

The MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION AND TRAINING: Hon Deputy Speaker, I thank the hon Khubisa for the question.

The challenges facing the 2017 registration of students at universities will mostly be related to funding and student accommodation. No registration challenges are expected at Technical and Vocational Education and Training, TVET, colleges.

With respect to universities, I convened meetings with all stakeholders, including university management and student representative councils, SRCs, to discuss and agree on proposed solutions and a road map for ensuring that universities return to normality, conclude the 2016 academic programme, and prepare for the 2017 academic year.

During December, this year, and January, next year, I will engage further with management and SRC student formations to appraise them of the new developments and ensure agreements are reached with a view to minimise disruptions at the start of the academic year. On 8 December, the department will be meeting with all the university registrars, finance executives, the SA Union of Students, and the National Student Financial Aid Scheme, NSFAS. The meetings will be on, amongst other things, universities' plans for the registration period and issues

PAGE: 25 of 198

linked to fees and the mechanisms for the missing middle, how we implement that, as well as address the issue of financial exclusion and student accommodation challenges.

As a department, we are working at a system-wide co-ordination, although we must also support institutions, because that is where the challenges are - in individual institutions. We have also put in place mechanisms and procedures to deal with TVET institutions. We have set up a monitoring mechanism for all the TVET institutions around registration so that we are able to intervene timeously where there are problems, to observe student registration, monitor the enrolment management processes across the colleges, and also, ensure that colleges are able to execute student registration effectively.

The other details are in my written answer here. I just thought I would give you the highlights in terms of our preparations.

Thank you.

Prof N M KHUBISA: Hon Deputy Speaker, through you to the hon Minister: It is a common knowledge that when universities and TVET colleges open at the beginning of the year, stampedes are a common phenomenon. You have just referred to the fact that you hope that the primary problem will be that of fees and

PAGE: 26 of 198

accommodation. However, we are told at the portfolio committee meetings that, with regard to TVET colleges, some measures have been put in place. For instance, students will be part of the registration process and will be used.

I want to know from you, Minister, whether the same will apply at universities. Also, what is going to happen to those students that owe money to the universities and TVET colleges? Will they be allowed to reregister even if they have not paid? Thank you very much.

UNGQONGQOSHE WEMFUNDO EPHAKEME KANYE NOKUQEQESHA: Kwilungu elihloniphekile uKhubisa kubo bonke abantu abakwazi ukukhokha abanye abakwazi ukukhokha abadla izambane likapondo silindele ukuthi bakhokhe. (Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)

[The MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION AND TRAINING: To the hon member Khubisa, we expect everyone who can afford to pay, especially those who are rich, to pay.]

Mr M S MBATHA: Obani? [Who?]

UNGQONGQOSHE WEMFUNDO EPHAKEME KANYE NOKUQEQESHA: Onxiwa labo ohlala ukhuluma ngabo Mbatha zonke izinsuku. Musa ukwenza

PAGE: 27 of 198

engathi awazi kufanele bakhokhe ngoba lento yenu yokuthi onxiwa bangakhokhi ... (Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)

[The MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION AND TRAINING: The rich ones that you talk about every day. Don't pretend like you don't know that they are supposed to pay; you see, this thing of yours saying that the rich ones must not pay ...]

... it's such a reactionary position.

Ifana ne-EFF ngezinto ezenzayo. [Uhleko.] Umsebenzi omkhulu okufanele siwenze njengoba sibheka ukuthi laba abahola imali engekho ngaphezulu kwezi-50 000 ngenyanga njengoba sithi sizohlangana nababhalisi basemanyuvesi sifuna ukwenza isiqiniseko ukuthi sibabona kanjani labo. Kungabibikho abazothatha lelithuba bathi bahola leyo mali kanti bahola ngaphezulu kwayo ukuze sikwazi ukuthi sizilungise zonke lezo zinto.

Ngishilo kubafundi ukuthi siyafisa ukuthi sisebenzisane, ngacela nomkhandlu omele abafundi. Kwezinye izikhungo bayakwenza lokho ukuthi nombutho wabafundi ubenamadeski lapho bekwazi ukuthi abafundi abanezinkinga beze khona. Yonke lemihlangano ebesinayo nale esizobanayo inhloso yayo enkulu kakhulu ukuthi sonke

PAGE: 28 of 198

asibambisane, kungabibikho abama ngaphandle bajikijele ngamatshe kodwa sisebenze sonke ndawonye ukuze senze ukuthi unyaka ozayo uqale kahle. Nabafundi ikakhulukazi laba abafika bezokwenza unyaka wokuqala bangene kahle bazizwe bemukelekile ukuze izikhungo zethu ziqale ukusebenza kusukela ngosuku lokuqala okufanele ngabe sisebenza ngazo. Siyabonga. (Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)

[It's like the things that the EFF does. [Laughter.] We are meeting with the universities to talk about how we are going to trace people who earn more than R50 000 per month so that there won't be people who claim to earn that amount when, in actual fact, they earn more.

I did say to the students that we want to work together; I also asked the SRCs. Some institutions have service desks where students can seek help. All the meetings we had, and those we are still going to have, are intended to promote working together; there shouldn't be spectators standing on the outside and throwing stones. Instead, we should work together so that the year will start on a good note. The first-year students should also feel comfortable and welcome so that our institutions can start functioning on the first day, as they are supposed to. Thank you.]

Mr Y CASSIM: Hon Deputy Speaker, hon Minister, what plans do you have, if any, to ensure that the missing middle students are not prevented from registering in 2017 due to student debts, and are, thereafter, funded to ensure that they do not accumulate a new debt? So, my question is very specific, Minister, as it pertains to missing middle students: Are there any plans that you may have - and what are they? - to ensure that they are not prevented from registering due to a debt, and to ensure that they are funded so that they do not accumulate a new debt? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION AND TRAINING: Hon Deputy

Speaker, firstly, the hon Cassim is aware ... [Interjections.]

... he is aware. He is grandstanding now, as he always does.

[Interjections.]

Firstly, we have said that all those who come from families who earn up to R600 000 will not be paying any increase. In other words, as regards fees, those students are going to experience a no-fee increase. [Interjections.] That is the biggest intervention we have made.

Secondly, we have said is that universities must be able to work out a system such that students who owe money, including those

from the missing middle, are not excluded because they are in

PAGE: 30 of 198

and how their debt is managed so that we minimise exclusion -

debt. Mechanisms must be set in place on how their debt is paid

even for the missing middle students.

What the DA will have to help us with is to ensure that those students who come from the missing middle and who have got money to pay do not hoard it because they expect that they will be admitted, no matter what happens. That requires co-operation from all of us, including from the Democratic Alliance Student Organisation, Daso ...

... lombutho wenu oluhlaza we-DA ukuthi asibambisane kungathi uma sekunezinkinga laphaya bese niyabaleka nibuye nizogxeka uhulumeni. Umsebenzi wethu sonke lowo ukuze senze isiqiniseko ukuthi izikhungo zethu ziqale unyaka ngendlela eyiyo. Ngiyabonga Sekela Somlomo. (Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)

[... which is a new organisation of the DA that must co-operate. Don't run away and criticise the government when there are problems. This is a role for us all to play to ensure that our institutions start the year accordingly. Thank you, Deputy Speaker.]

Mr M S MBATHA: Mphephethwa [Clan name], I have a feeling that 2017 will be the year TVET colleges show their true colours on the disgusting nature in which they are financing, in particular, the poor students. They have been underserviced. There are poor students who wait for awards of transport and food until the third, fourth, or fifth month.

Can you assure this House that the poor students will receive their travel allowances and their accommodation - irrespective of whether they are in internal accommodation or external accommodation - and most importantly, their food allowances on time? Can you assure us of that? Otherwise, the TVET colleges have learnt how to master the art of protests and they might as well be on the streets. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION AND TRAINING: Hon Deputy Speaker, this is an instigation by the EFF. [Interjections.] We are aware that that is what you want to do with the TVET colleges.

Firstly, we are in discussions with all the stakeholders in the TVET colleges - the principals, students, and governing councils - to ensure that we deal with all the problems that we have.

PAGE: 32 of 198

Secondly, the reason I am saying that you are instigating is you know that none of the NSFAS-qualifying students pay any tuition fees at TVET colleges. However, as of now, we are unable to pay transport or accommodation for any of the TVET college students because the system has increased much more rapidly than the resources that government has. Instead, what we were expecting

... ukuthi njengelungu elihloniphekile lePhalamende sukuma uphakamise isandla uthi amakolishi lawa awanikwe imali ngoba le ekhona njengamanje ayenele kodwa i-15 labafundi kuma-TVET siyalikhokhela uma ngabe kuwukuthi bahlala endaweni ethize ekude ngebanga lamakhilomitha athizeni. Siyakwenza lokho kodwa wonke umfundi ose-TVET okufanele ukuba athole uNSFAS akayikhokhi imali yokufunda ukhokhelwa yilo hulumeni. Bese kuthi lokhu okunye esingakabi nako sibambisane. Siyabonga. Hhayibo Floyd. [Uhleko.] (Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)

[... is that, as an hon member of Parliament, you should stand up and raise your hand and say that the colleges must be funded because the money they currently have is not enough. However, we do pay for 15% of the students from TVET colleges if they come from places which are kilometres away. We do that, but every student from a TVET college who is supposed to be funded by

NSFAS does not pay study fees - those are paid for by this government. Whatever we do not have yet, we must work together towards. No! Floyd. [Laughter.]]

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: Hon Deputy Speaker, on a point of order: I rise on a point of order on Blade because he is saying "Floyd", so we can say that, as well.

It is out of order when an hon member stands up to raise a legitimate question and ask for an assurance that the payments to TVET colleges are not going to be delayed in 2017 and the Minister casts aspersions on him, saying that he is instigating protests and violence in a narrow way. It is also wrong, in terms of parliamentary Rules, to cast aspersions on a Member of Parliament.

So, you must rule on that and call him to order because he is asking for an assurance and that is what is expected to happen here, in Parliament, before the academic year begins. We must be given the clear assurance that there won't be a delay in payments in any of the TVET colleges that exist in South Africa, because there is no consistency and there is no responsiveness in the manner in which the dysfunctional Department of Higher Education and Training has been handling the issue.

PAGE: 34 of 198

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, you have actually used that opportunity to raise a point of order to repeat the question that was asked. Now, that is out of order. That is not how you raise a point of order.

Hon members, can we follow the Rules we have agreed on?

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: Hon Deputy Speaker, we have raised the point of order about the Minister raising and casting aspersions on a Member of Parliament ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member!

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: You must rule on that. Do not take an advantage of the other issues that have ... I have raised the point of order on him casting aspersions. What are you saying about that?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, can I rule? No, hon member, let me tell you. Take your seat. Let me tell you what I think about it. It is a political response to a political statement. That is not casting aspersions. It is a political interpretation of a political statement. Therefore, it is not a point of order, as far as I am concerned. You are debating, you guys.

Hon member Mbatha, what are you rising on?

Mr M S MBATHA: Hon Deputy Speaker, on a point of order: I am rising on ... This is my good self and he is casting aspersions on my good self. [Interjections.] I am here, speaking as an hon member. I am not instigating and you are not protecting me, either.

PAGE: 35 of 198

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, you are here to protect yourself and you have just done it! [Laughter.] You have just done it, hon member. That is not casting aspersions. That is my interpretation. Hon Mokoena, what is your point of order?

Mr L G MOKOENA: Deputy Speaker, you know, the issue of instigating in the climate that we are in now also has criminal interpretations. Because this member here could be charged tomorrow for instigating because you have not ruled on the hon Blade saying that he has instigated. Please rule on the issue of instigation - that he has not instigated anything. He asked a proper question on a proper platform of Parliament. Please rule on the issue of casting aspersions.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Alright, I have ruled on it, hon member. Rule 92(7) states when the presiding officer has ruled, we cannot debate that.

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: No, that is fine.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: What are you rising on, hon member?

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: On a point of order on you, now: You are making an unreasonable and unsound ruling because there are people that are arrested.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, you are violating Rule 92(7).

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: There is a student who was arrested at the University of KwaZulu-Natal on the charge of instigation of violence - more than 60 days in prison for that. You take an unreasonable decision in the manner in which you have done so. We are going to lodge a complaint against you and you are going to cry like the Speaker cried when we lodged a complaint against her. You are following.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, you are out of order and you deliberately violate the Rules, just as I told them you are. Hon members, let us proceed.

Ms C C SEPTEMBER: Hon Deputy Speaker, through you to the hon Minister: It is encouraging to hear that you have set up a lot of meetings with all the different people at the universities.

May I ask, hon Minister, one of the things arising out of the crisis that we had at the universities is the fact that relationships between vice chancellors and students have broken down quite substantially. As part of the meetings that you are having, is there a plan that will bring a proper relationship between vice chancellors and students back on track as part of ensuring that everything will be in place at universities and, indeed, at the TVET colleges next year and for the years ahead? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION AND TRAINING: Hon Deputy Speaker, I thank the hon September, chair of the portfolio committee, for raising the question. This is a very important matter. There are two things that I would like to say in response to that.

PAGE: 38 of 198

Firstly, we had a summit last year on higher education. I have requested all universities to indicate to me how they intend implementing those resolutions at institutional level and also, engaging all stakeholders, because we think that it is very important in addressing the tensions between students and management. We also want to use that process to revitalise and give more teeth to the institutional forums which, now, in terms of the legislation, are passed by this House, such that the recommendations of institutional forums are not ignored by university councils. And if those recommendations are rejected, councils must provide rational reasons for it. That is the first thing which we hope will contribute to improving engagement and relations.

The second thing is that I have requested vice chancellors and student organisations to work towards developing dispute resolution mechanisms at institutional level and where necessary, where we would be involved on a system-wide level. Because one of the big problems we have is we do not have such dispute resolution mechanisms, which we think we need, so that if there is a disputed institution, we know what processes are going to be followed up in order to resolve that. This includes the possibility of mediation, where necessary, so that we do not

leave our institutions vulnerable to endless, unresolved disputes. Thank you very much, hon Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, as we proceed to the next question, I would like to draw the attention of members, which is what I should have done right at the beginning, to Rule 92(8)(9)(10) and (11), so that as we proceed to do our work, we comply with the Rules.

The next question has been asked by the hon Dlomo to the Minister of Sport and Recreation. I am informed that the hon Ralegoma will take over the supplementary question.

## Steps envisaged to be taken to address high levels of doping in sport at university level, through implementation of National Drug Master Plan

288. Ms B J Dlomo (ANC) asked the Minister of Sport and Recreation:

In view of the recent interaction with the Portfolio Committee on Sport and Recreation where the SA Institute for Drug-Free Sport, Saids, noted that it was unable to determine the reason for the high levels of doping at

university level, particularly in rugby, and in view of the fact that the Saids is expected to work very closely with the Central Drug Authority, CDA, to develop, review, and implement the National Drug Master Plan, what steps does he intend to take in collaboration with the Saids and the CDA to address the high levels of doping in sport at university level through the implementation of the National Drug Master Plan?

PAGE: 40 of 198

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Deputy Speaker, may I address you in terms of Rule 138?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: At the Chief Whips' Forum this morning, we were still unsure whether the Minister would be here. This is now the second consecutive session of oral questions in the House that Minister Mbalula has been absent for. The Constitution is very clear that Ministers are accountable, collectively, and individually, to Parliament.

I think that this House should take a particularly dim view of a Minister who has prioritised a trip abroad over his duty to account to the people of South Africa through this Parliament. I

really think that the time of us saying "Yes, alright, well, we hear what you are saying" has to pass.

PAGE: 41 of 198

The Deputy President gave an assurance in this House that we would see an improvement. We have not seen an improvement.

Minister Mbalula has now missed a second opportunity. Ministers often only come three times in a year. The Minister has not been for the last two sessions. So, it's unlikely he has been held accountable.

I really think we need to reach a stage where this House has to pass resolutions expressing its displeasure at Ministers who miss consecutive sessions. We are not being unreasonable. We understand - and it's no disrespect to the Deputy Minister - that Ministers are often taken away from the House on urgent business. But to miss two in a row, I think, is really disrespectful towards this House and disrespectful towards the members who should be holding the Minister accountable.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Alright ...

Mr P J MNGUNI: Hon Deputy Speaker, I rise in terms of the same Rule, Rule 138, to say that what the hon Steenhuisen just raised does not arise from here. Instead, Rule 138(4) does specifically

PAGE: 42 of 198

provide for the Minister or a Deputy Minister to actually respond. So, we think that what he is raising is really not in accordance with the Rule in any manner. Rule 138(4) is very clear and explicit. Therefore, we really move that the point not be considered at all. Thank you. [Interjections.]

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Deputy Speaker ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, hon Shivambu. I will come ...

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: No, look, Deputy Speaker, in the Chief Whips' Forum, we specifically agreed amongst all political parties that Mbalula must stop hobnobbing at the expense of Parliament.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: "Mr" or "the hon member".

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: Mr Mbalula must stop hobnobbing at the expense of Parliament. He travels for things that have no relationship with sports development. He is apparently in Spain now, visiting Barcelona, for what, we do not know. We said specifically, very clearly, to the ANC Chief Whip and the Whippery of the ANC that ... [Interjections.]

Mr P J MNGUNI: On a point of order, Chair, again ...

PAGE: 43 of 198

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: ... at all times ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, let him finish.

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: ... let us have Cabinet Ministers doing the answering of questions here, not Deputy Ministers. A Deputy Minister is not a Member of Cabinet.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, hon member. Hon member ...

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: We want Cabinet Ministers to come and be held accountable on what is happening with regard to sports because the only thing that we see visible from the Department of Sport is those awards, but there is nothing that is happening and we want him to be held accountable directly.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, we have heard your point. Can I rule on that?

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: ... and I agree that we, as Parliament, must now express serious exception to Mr Mbalula's disregard of this institution and lack of accountability for the work that he is doing, currently.

30 NOVEMBER 2016 PAGE: 44 of 198

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Alright. Yes, hon member, go ahead.

Mr P J MNGUNI: Hon Deputy Speaker, while there is a point of order on the floor, we quite find it shameful that the EFF should consistently - and Mr Shivambu, in particular - continue to actually defy the Rules as they stand. He cannot refer to Mr Mbalula as just "Mbalula". In case his home discipline fails him, the House Rules are very clear on how we should refer to each other. He should not be allowed to proceed in that fashion.

Mr T RAWULA: Order, Chair! Chair, I rise on a point of order: I rise on Rule 92. You have just made a ruling and the ruling was complied with. So, the hon member should just have sat down. He can't repeat, because he is undermining your ruling. A ruling is already made and basically, the point has been made about the accountability of Mr Mbalula and that you have noted. So, he must sit down.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, it's alright.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Deputy Speaker ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Take your seat. Can I make a ruling on this matter you raised?

PAGE: 45 of 198

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: I would like to respond, because you have given the EFF a chance to respond to the comments there.

I just want to make the point that no matter what is contained in this green book, it can never supersede what's contained in this little book, called the Constitution. The Constitution, at section 92(3) sets out, very explicitly, that our Ministers are accountable to this House and that they are required to provide full and regular reports considering matters under their control.

So, he can wave the green book as much as he likes. He is not going to save Mr Mbalula with it. Mr Mbalula is held accountable through this book, to this Parliament, and to these members.

[Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, firstly, the Rules are clear that Ministers do have to account to the House and Deputy Ministers will answer on behalf of Ministers or their department if the situation requires it and by agreement with the House, as they often do so, inform us. That's in the Rules. That's accountability.

PAGE: 46 of 198

We will obviously convey the concern of the frequency of Ministers attending, especially Mr Mbalula, who has been mentioned in this case. We will convey that to him - to be present in the House. I think there is no question about their responsibility for accountability. Therefore, hon Oosthuizen, you are in charge. Go ahead, hon member. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF SPORT AND RECREATION: Hon Deputy Speaker ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, no, no, hon Steenhuisen, please!

[Interjections.] Yes. Who is wrong now? Who were you saying is wrong? You see, this is the problem. Stop the screaming across the floor. Go ahead, hon member, please.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF SPORT AND RECREATION: Hon Deputy Speaker, thank you so much. I gladly ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please, let the hon Deputy Minister account to Parliament on behalf of his department. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF SPORT AND RECREATION: Hon Deputy Speaker ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, no, no. He has the responsibility to account, even if he is not a Cabinet Minister. The Rules allow that and you approved those Rules. Go ahead, hon member.

Mr M L W FILTANE: On a point of order, Chair: If the Rules are not congruent with the Constitution, they are, ab initio, invalid.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, they are consistent.

Mr M L W FILTANE: They are not.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Alright, alright.

Mr M L W FILTANE: You have been just informed about the contents of the Constitution and you cannot sit there and support something that is contrary to the Constitution. [Interjections.] In the case of the hon Minister Mbalula, the problem is that he is ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, can I read you the Rule?

Mr M L W FILTANE: This is what bothers us. He is consistent.

PAGE: 48 of 198

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, can I point out to you that I said to you the presiding officers' ruling on a point of order is final and binding and may not be challenged in the House. Can you accept that ruling? You may not accept the ruling itself, but you can't challenge it in the House. You create disorder. Alright, go ahead, hon member.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF SPORT AND RECREATION: Hon Deputy Speaker, thank you so much. I provide the answer gladly, as delegated to me by my colleague, the Minister of Sport and Recreation, the hon Fikile Mbalula.

The answer, hon member, is: Our Department of Sport and Recreation is a member of the Central Drug Authority, CDA. Our department further participates in all the programmes and we do report annually on the sport National Drug Master Plan.

Importantly, our department is responsible for Outcome 3 of the National Drug Master Plan, which mandates our department to provide for recreational facilities and diversion programmes aimed at preventing vulnerable members of society from becoming substance dependent.

PAGE: 49 of 198

The implementation of what the National Drug Master Plan directs our department to deliver on is provided for in the Active Nation programme for the department and through the delivery of active recreation campaigns, school sport, and community sport activities.

The provision of recreation facilities is further implemented under the sport infrastructure programme through the delivery of multipurpose sport combi courts, outdoor gyms and kiddies' play parks.

With regard to collaboration with universities to address the high levels of doping in sport at universities, our department recognises the University Sports South Africa, commonly known as Ussa, as a sport recreation body. This is a controlling body of all sports played at tertiary institutions in South Africa.

As a national federation, Ussa is obliged to accept and abide by the National Anti-Doping Programme and the SA Institute for Drug-Free Sport Anti-Doping Rules, as published in 2015.

Article 1 of the Anti-Doping Rules specifically provides for its application to the national federation under question.

PAGE: 50 of 198

Furthermore, the SA Institute for Drug-Free Sport, Saids, has signed a memorandum of understanding with the University of Witwatersrand and the University of Johannesburg. The memorandum of understanding addresses antidoping education for students in the Sports Science and Human Movement Departments. The agreement also includes education and testing for university athletes o-f various sporting codes, like rugby, football, hockey, and cricket.

The SA Institute for Drug-Free Sport also has an ongoing working relationship with the Dean of Students Office and Campus Security at the University of the North West. The aim is to address steroid and drug supply to students and athletes on the very campus.

In the past year, Saids conducted pre-season education sessions to athletes in the following sporting codes: rugby, football, hockey, and athletics, and to students in Sports Management, Sports Science and Sports Medicine at the Universities of Limpopo, Stellenbosch, Western Cape, KwaZulu-Natal, Cape Town, Witwatersrand, Nelson Mandela Metropolitan, and Johannesburg. I thank you.

PAGE: 51 of 198

Mr S M RALEGOMA: Deputy Speaker, Deputy Minister, in spite of the apartheid legacy that stretches the department, don't you think that the education anti-drug awareness campaign undertaken by Saids needs to be increased to both primary and high school levels?

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF SPORT AND RECREATION: Deputy Speaker, I thank the hon member for a very good question. As you may know, hon member, in the annual performance plan of the department, we are budgeting now for the year to come, to do some smart testing. In terms of that, we will be enabled to do smart-testing with Saids and roll out a programme to include the very institutions, hopefully, on the incremental basis that you referred to.

We are in agreement that this is a scourge that we have to address proactively and we, as the department, are doing so. I thank you for the good question.

Mr M S MALATSI: Deputy Speaker, Deputy Minister, if you look into the Saids annual report for the 2015-16 financial year, you will realise that doping amongst under-18 rugby players is amongst the highest violations in the sporting codes, just behind powerlifting and cycling. So, in light of that, what is

PAGE: 52 of 198

the department doing to curb the levels of doping at under-19 level? Because despite the fact that the numbers are high amongst those that are tested, there are still many that go untested.

So, I want to know: What are the interventions that the department is putting in place to ensure that that is prevented across the board, not just at a later stage, where you rely on testing them when they break into the professional level? Thank you, Deputy Speaker.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF SPORT AND RECREATION: Deputy Speaker, I thank the hon Malatsi very much. As I indicated in my answer, there are memorandums of agreement and understanding that we are rolling out, implementing, to do the testing. I refer, also, to the answer I have given in terms of smart-testing and doping.

More important, however, is the hotline that we want to pursue - like I have referred to - the agreement with the controlling authority so that when you know of something, you can report that. That is the way we are going to address this thing, collectively, and root out this whole scourge, but I will favour you with a copy of my answer which I have given, and I did answer you there.

PAGE: 53 of 198

Mr K P SITHOLE: Deputy Speaker, Deputy Minister, is there any campaign or mechanism running in the department to educate and create an awareness of this doping? Because it is happening to all schools and in all sporting codes. Is there any mechanism or system that the department is running in conjunction with the Department of Basic Education?

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF SPORT AND RECREATION: Hon Deputy Speaker, hon member, I will refer you to the answer, but let me just elaborate a little bit. When we talk about the campaigns that we run - like, we have memorandums of understanding and agreement - yes, we talk about the National School Sport Championships and we are educating students there, in collaboration with Education, on antidoping and the wrongs of doping.

Another thing that we do is create awareness of Saids educational programmes. That's part of the transfer that we do. We do so precisely because we think that we have a clean sport and the department is very vocal about it as it is the way to go, worldwide.

I can also mention that, as a country, we do also contribute internationally to the World Anti-Doping Agency, not only the

funding committee and distribution of funds, but also in terms of educational programmes. So, yes, we are doing that.

Mr A M SHAIK EMAM: Deputy Speaker, Deputy Minister, we are in the process of hosting the next Commonwealth Games. Can you tell us how ready we are for this, whether we have met with the agreement, have we signed the agreement, have we paid the deposit, have we signed the guarantees, and do we have the capacity? Should we be hosting the Commonwealth Games, would we have the capacity to deal with the issue of doping in South Africa? Thank you.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF SPORT AND RECREATION: Hon Deputy Speaker, that's a new question, but in terms of the doping ability, yes, we will be able to do that.

## Particulars regarding support provided to Pan South African Language Board since its dissolution

305. Ms S P Tsoleli (ANC) asked the Minister of Arts and Culture:

What (a) support has his department provided to the Pan South African Language Board since its dissolution in 30 NOVEMBER 2016 PAGE: 55 of 198

January 2016 and (b) plans has his department put in place going forward?  $$_{\rm NO3074E}$$ 

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF ARTS AND CULTURE: Deputy Speaker, the reply is as follows. After the Pan South African Language Board, PanSALB, was dissolved, the Minister sought concurrence from National Treasury to appoint the National Heritage Council of South Africa as the acting accounting authority. Approval was granted but subsequently withdrawn, and it was recommended that an advisory board be appointed.

Prior to the dissolution of the board, the organisation failed to table its five-year strategic plan and annual performance plan for the 2015-16 financial year. The department provided support to PanSALB, and the organisation managed to submit a strategic plan and the annual performance plan for the 2016-17 financial year to the department for tabling in Parliament.

The Minister appointed an advisory committee on 13 May 2016. The duties of the advisory committee were developed to create a turnaround strategy for PanSALB, including developing an updated diagnostic review of the status quo of the organisation, building on existing documents such as the performance and expenditure report produced by National Treasury in 2014,

PAGE: 56 of 198

identifying the skills gap and underutilised resources in the organisation, reviewing legal compliance and governance matters, and implementing findings of the forensic audit conducted by National Treasury.

The department has agreed and also engaged with National Treasury to request that additional funds be made available for the institution to merely cover the litigation matters against PanSALB. National Treasury has since made an additional allocation of R37 million, which will be spread over the Medium-Term Expenditure Framework, MTEF, period as follows:

R10 million in 2017-18, R12 million in 2018-19, and R15 million in 2019-20. I thank you.

Mme S P TSOLELI: Ke a leboha, Motlatsa motsamaisi wa dipuisano, e re ke lebohe Motlatsa Letona le kgabane ka tlhakisetso e totobetseng ntlheng ena ya Ntlo ya rona ya tsa puo. Eh! E re ke botse potso yaka e latelang: (Translation of Sesotho paragraph follows.)

[Mrs S P TSOLELI: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Let me thank the hon Deputy Minister for the clear explanation regarding the entity concerned with our languages. Ehh! Let me ask the following question:]

How will the Department of Arts and Culture ensure that lessons from the past experiences at the Pan South African Language Board result in an improved promotion of multilingualism and development of all 11 official languages without the administrative problems of the past? I thank you.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF ARTS AND CULTURE: Deputy Speaker ...

[Interjections.] ... What is wrong? There is nothing wrong.

[Interjections.]

Ms H O HLOPHE: Deputy Speaker, we have a crisis here.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF ARTS AND CULTURE: What? There's no crisis here.

Ms H O HLOPHE: There is a crisis here.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF ARTS AND CULTURE: You are a crisis!

Ms H O HLOPHE: What happened to your department? You don't know your department! [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF ARTS AND CULTURE: I do ...

PAGE: 58 of 198

Ms H O HLOPHE: You are relying on papers! There is a crisis.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Take your seat, hon member. [Interjections.]

Mr M WATERS: Deputy Speaker, I rise on a point of order in terms of Rule 92: Is the Deputy Minister trying to find the answer to the hon member's question? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF ARTS AND CULTURE: Yes, of course.
[Interjections.]

Mr M WATERS: But you're not ... the member is supposed to get up and ask ...

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF ARTS AND CULTURE: No, no, no.

Mr M WATERS: ... an oral question. It is spontaneous.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF ARTS AND CULTURE: Deputy Speaker, may you have order?

PAGE: 59 of 198

Mr M WATERS: This makes a sham of Questions for Oral Reply and holding the executive to account.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes.

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: Can we be taken seriously?

Mr M WATERS: Yes? You agree with me. Alright.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF ARTS AND CULTURE: Deputy Speaker ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You cannot both be standing. Hon Shivambu?

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: Deputy Speaker, really, can we be taken seriously? We raised the point earlier that we need Cabinet Ministers to come and answer questions. Then we are sent Deputy Ministers who don't even know what the answers are.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Take your seat.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF ARTS AND CULTURE: I do know where they are. It is only that the papers are ...

PAGE: 60 of 198

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: You've been searching for five minutes.
[Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, go ahead.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF ARTS AND CULTURE: May you take your seat?

Anything can happen ... [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Deputy Minister, address the House. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF ARTS AND CULTURE: Alright. Deputy Speaker, the Department of Arts and Culture, working with Parliament, will appoint ...

Mr M WATERS: Deputy Speaker, on a point of order ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: What's the point of order?

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF ARTS AND CULTURE: What is it?

Mr M WATERS: The point of order is: How did the Deputy Minister know what the follow-up question was going to be?

[Interjections.]

PAGE: 61 of 198

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: She will tell you. Let's ask her.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF ARTS AND CULTURE: No! No!

Mr M WATERS: This undermines the entire oral question session!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: How will I know that? Take your seat. Let's ask her.

Mr M WATERS: Are you not concerned that she is reading a reply to a member's question? [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Let's ask her.

Mr M WATERS: Well, ask her then!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You take your seat, then, so that I ask her. [Laughter.] [Interjections.]

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: But Deputy Speaker ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, please be orderly. The Deputy Minister will answer your question. She's heard it. Proceed and answer the question, hon Deputy Minister. [Interjections.]

PAGE: 62 of 198

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF ARTS AND CULTURE: I want to reply to the member.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, you can't scream. You can't scream. You have asked your question. Cool your heels! Hold your heels, hon members. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF ARTS AND CULTURE: May I reply? May I reply to you?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF ARTS AND CULTURE: I have written notes about the whole ... about PanSALB. That's why I am looking for the right one. It is not that I knew about it. [Interjections.] The department has answered. That is why I wrote notes.

[Interjections.] I read all of ... and wrote notes for PanSALB, so I just need to get to that sentence. That is why you saw me looking for the questions.

Alright. The Department of Arts and Culture, working with Parliament, will appoint a competent PanSALB board that will ensure PanSALB adheres to its constitutional mandate.

[Interjections.] Are you ready for the answer or not? Just say "not" if you don't want it. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, hon members! Order, hon members! Yes, hon member? What are you rising on?

Mr L G MOKOENA: Deputy Speaker, this is the reason why arts and culture, as a sector, is not developing.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, what is your point of order?

Mr L G MOKOENA: The Deputy Minister doesn't even know answers to questions. She has to write issues down.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, take your seat, hon member. That is not a point of order.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF ARTS AND CULTURE: I have answered you. I don't know. You were not listening. That's all. [Interjections.]

I was saying that we are working with Parliament, that we will appoint a competent PanSALB board to ensure that PanSALB adheres to its constitutional mandate of promoting multilingualism and developing all 11 official languages, including Khoi, Nama, San,

and SA Sign Language. So, I repeat: I had read the question, and I wrote all my notes. [Interjections.] That is why I delayed. [Interjections.] It doesn't matter how much you shout. That is the truth. [Interjections.] [Applause.]

Mr J A ESTERHUIZEN: Deputy Speaker, through you to the hon
Deputy Minister: You mentioned an additional R37 million in
funding. The deep-rooted problems at the Pan South African
Language Board cannot be solved by merrily throwing additional
funds at its many problems. This statutory body has been plagued
by poor administration and executive leadership for a long time.
When will you or the department say that enough is enough and
look at alternative solutions in order to fulfil the statutory
mandate of the department?

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Deputy Minister, just hold on. Please take your seat. Hon Shivambu, what are you rising on?

[Interjections.]

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: Deputy Speaker, I want to rise in terms of Rule 142(8). This process that we are engaged in now states that a primary question is asked. Yes, because that question has been submitted, you can come with a written response. However, a supplementary question arises out of the House. Then the

PAGE: 65 of 198

Minister must respond, but here, she stands up to look for an answer for more than two minutes. [Interjections.] Subsection 8 states that a supplementary question should not exceed two minutes; even the reply should not exceed two minutes. She spent three and a half minutes searching for an answer to a supplementary question. [Interjections.] It is supposed to be two minutes.

You sit there and don't do anything about it. We have time allocated for the entire question session, and then we have to be delayed by a person who is still searching for the scourge that has been practised in the ANC's Chief Whip's office - that you will ask this question and you will get an answer like this. Then you misplace papers, and then you come and make a joke of us here. You must take Parliament seriously. We understand the mediocrity in the ANC but don't overwhelm Parliament with your own problems. Please!

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon Shivambu, the replies are limited to two minutes - the replies. That is what the clock here records.

[Interjections.] Yes. Once the Deputy Minister rises to answer, and she starts, the clock starts operating. Go ahead, hon Deputy Minister.

Ms H O HLOPHE: Just a point of order, Deputy Speaker: I would just like clarity. Searching for papers is part of answering. She spent two minutes searching for answers in the form of papers.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, you are repeating what has been asked. That is out of order. Proceed, hon Deputy Minister.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF ARTS AND CULTURE: We are quite aware that even if we allocate millions or thousands of rand, money alone cannot solve the problem. So, we have identified the gaps that are there, and we need a good way of governing that money. And, of course, for the staff and right people to be in those places. [Interjections.] We didn't have enough staff members. We have added staff now in positions that were vacant, and they will work with the money. Money alone – you are right: Money cannot answer questions. It won't be able to solve ... it is money and also human resources.

Mr M L W FILTANE: Deputy Speaker, through you to the Deputy
Minister: What we look for, generally, is the effect of all
processes, so my question would be directed to you on that
basis. With everything that is happening and all the promises
that you have here reported on and the efforts, so far, how big

is the impact of the use of the indigenous South African languages in official communication? Thank you.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF ARTS AND CULTURE: Deputy Speaker, as a department, we have requested that all departments follow ... that the indigenous languages be followed. We are monitoring that system. It is happening. Also, it won't just be departments but everyone - not only the departments - we want every organisation to do the same. Thank you.

Mr M L W FILTANE: Chairperson, on a point of order ... a point of order ... Hello? Point of order ... [Interjections.]

[Laughter.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: You literally threw your words into her mouth, and she sits down. What are you rising on, hon member? You mean you couldn't allow her to finish?

Mr M L W FILTANE: Yes, it is because she has gone off on a tangent. [Interjections.] My question was in terms of percentages, not the generic stuff she is giving me - percentages. If, as a department, you have a responsibility of making sure that indigenous languages are being used, you need to know, year on year, what percentages of IsiXhosa, IsiZulu,

PAGE: 68 of 198

whatever, are being used - not generic stuff. This is Parliament.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Alright.

Mr H P CHAUKE: On a point of order, Deputy Speaker: I think it is necessary ...

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: What's that?

Mr H P CHAUKE: No, I want to address you.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: What are you rising on, hon member? Don't say, "No, no". Answer the question.

Mr H P CHAUKE: I am rising on a point of order on the basis that you need to protect the Ministers when they are on the floor.

[Interjections.] You have a responsibility to protect them.

There is no way that any of the members can speak as they want when the Ministers are on the floor.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member! Hon Chauke, you are out of order! Take your seat, and don't repeat that! [Interjections.] Don't tell me what my job is. That is out of order.

[Interjections.] Don't do that. Don't ever do that. [Applause.] Hon Deputy Minister, I have confidence in you that you are able to respond. Please do so.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF ARTS AND CULTURE: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. To the hon member, if you want the exact numbers, I will send them. I will write them out and send them to you. Thank you. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes. Hon members, if the Speaker is of the opinion that a question comprises matters of a substantive, statistical nature, the Speaker may direct that the question be placed on the Question Paper for Written Reply. In future, when you rise to ask a supplementary question, please remember that. You didn't advise the Minister or Deputy Minister that the nature of your question was going to require numbers.

Mr G A GROOTBOOM: Deputy Speaker, through you to the Deputy
Minister: PanSALB has been dysfunctional for a number of years,
which finally resulted in the Minister of Arts and Culture
dissolving the board. What compelling reason still exists for
keeping this entity on the Statute Book, given that it has
failed miserably in the execution of its fiduciary duties to

develop and promote languages? Nobody ever actually sees what PanSALB does.

The DEPUTY MINISTER OF ARTS AND CULTURE: Deputy Speaker, the hon member asks why we should keep it. It has responsibilities. That is why we have dissolved that one - because we could see that it could not deliver what it is supposed to deliver. If they are not able to, it doesn't mean that we must get rid of it and that it should not be there, that PanSALB should not be there. It is supposed to be there. It is only that we need to have people who are able to do their work correctly. We cannot judge. We cannot dissolve the entity. The entity must still be there. It has responsibilities. It was put there because there are responsibilities that it is supposed to do. Thank you.

## Particulars regarding planning for takeover of paying out of social grants by SA Social Security Agency

311. Ms B S Masango (DA) asked the Minister of Social Development:

Whether, with reference to her replies to Question 1657 on 19 September 2016 and oral Question 107 on 1 September 2016, any of the members of the advisory committee

PAGE: 71 of 198

established to plan the way forward for the takeover of the paying out of social grants by the SA Social Security Agency in April 2017 were appointed as work stream leaders to ensure the smooth transition of the specified takeover; if not, why not; if so, what are the relevant details? NO3080E

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Deputy Speaker, hon member, yes, the SA Social Security Agency, Sassa, has retained some of the members of the ministerial advisory committee to assist with the implementation of some of the recommendations that it made. What is important is for this House to know that some of the experts that were in the advisory committee asked to be released because they had not been doing their work for quite some time. Examples are the SA Reserve Bank, which had a representative; another one who was representing the communities; and the one who was dealing with IT issues.

What we also did was to look for more resources from the SA Reserve Bank, which we got. We have another one from the peace and security cluster and someone from the Treasury to assist us to fast-track the process of ensuring that Sassa becomes responsible for the payment of grants. Thank you.

PAGE: 72 of 198

Ms B S MASANGO: Hon Deputy Speaker, let me thank the Minister for the answer. As the Minister has said, she appointed the ministerial advisory committee to put together a plan to take over the institutionalisation of the grants. Some of those committee members were retained to implement their own recommendations and now, coming to the department or to Sassa as companies and not as individuals.

Would the Minister agree that this could be looked at as being an unfair advantage to these people and their companies because they are implementing their own recommendations? This could even be suspected to be corruption. Does the Minister agree?

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZOKUTHUTHUKISWA KOMPHAKATHI: Qha, angivumelani nalokho ngoba uma ngabe sekuwukuthi abanye sebayabuya sebayasebenza, loya msebenzi kumele ugunyazwe ... (Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)

[The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: No, I don't agree with that, if it means that others came back and they are already working, that work must be authorised ...]

... by Treasury. Treasury is here ...

... futhi ibizositshela uma ngabe kukhona into ebheke eceleni abayenzayo, kodwa uma ubheka ezinye zezincomo abazenzile besebenza kuleli komidi uyabona ukuthi bangabantu abazimele vele. Abasabi ukuthi uma bebona ukuthi abakwazi ukwenza into bese bebheka abanye ongoti abangaphezulu kwabo abazoletha izincomo ezingaphezulu kwalezi abazilethile bona. [Ihlombe.] (Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)

[... and they would have told us if there was something illegal that that they are doing, but if you look at other recommendations that they have tabled before this committee, you can see that they are determined people. They are not afraid to consult other experts who know more than they do, who will make better recommendations than they have made, if they see that they are unable to do something. [Applause.]]

Mrs C DUDLEY: Deputy Speaker, Minister, will the new in-house payment of social grants by Sassa necessitate changes to legislation? What process will follow if this is the case, and will there be challenges in terms of timeframes with Parliament rising and not sitting again until February? Thank you.

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZOKUTHUTHUKISWA KOMPHAKATHI: Umsebenzi omningi kakhulu ophathelene nezomthetho wenziwe, kodwa futhi kukhona

PAGE: 74 of 198

ikomidi elibheka ezinye izinto njengemithetho. Imithetho isetshenziwe kakade, njengezindaba zalaba abakhipha imali yabantu bama-grant. Lokho yinto ekumele ukuthi ingene emthethweni, nayo futhi siqalile ukuyisebenza.

Ngakho-ke izinto ezihambisana nomthetho zizoba khona, zizohamba ngendlela efanele. Ukuvalwa kwePhalamende kungaba nomthelela kodwa siyazi sonke ukuthi uma ngabe kunodaba oluphuthumayo, iPhalamende liyakwazi ukubiza umhlangano ophuthumayo ukuze amalungu ekomidi ahlale adingide udaba oluwundabamlonyeni.

Ikomidi lezokuxhumana ikeyakweza lokho, ngakho nathi singakwenza lokho. (Translation of isiZulu paragraphs follows.)

[The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: A lot of work regarding regulations has been done, but there is another committee that looks at other issues such as regulations. Legislation has already been dealt with, like the issues of the people who pay the social grants. That is something that should be regulated, and we have already started to implement them.

Therefore, things that go together with the legislation will be in place and will work in a proper way. The parliamentary recess can have an effect but we know that if there is an urgent matter, Parliament is able to call an urgent meeting so that the

committee members can sit and discuss the urgent matter at hand.

The committee on Communications did that once, therefore we can also do that.]

Ms H H MALGAS: Deputy Speaker, let me thank the Minister for the reply that she gave us - because we were working on this programme the whole morning - and for coming to report back to us. [Interjections.]

How will this move - the institutionalisation of our grants - improve the ANC-led government's social security programme and ensure that the state is reinforced in this regard? Thank you. [Interjections.]

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZOKUTHUTHUKISWA KOMPHAKATHI: Nishaya sengathi yini abongqo shishilizi!

Khona nje ukuthi uhulumeni uyaluthatha lolu hlelo kancane kancane uliletha ngaphakathi kwakhe, kuzokwenza ukuthi akwazi ukuba nezwi ezintweni eziningi. Okokuqala into ehluphile kakhulu ukuthi nje kumane kuthathwe imali yabantu bengashongo; lokhu, uhulumeni uzokubheka.

PAGE: 76 of 198

Okwesibili, ukuthi kuvunyelwe ukuthi abantu bakamasingcwabisane bathathe u-10% kuphela la kugranti kodwa uthole ukuthi banikeza ogogo omosangwabisane abathathu sengathi umuntu ushona kathathu.

Okwesithathu ukuthi kumane kukhishwe imali kagogo ohlala le eMqanduli ongenawo ugesi noma amanzi, lokho sizokwazi ukuthi sikwazi ukukulawula. Futhi lokhu kuzokwenza ukuthi sikwazi ukwenza ezinye izinto ezingcono ezizokwenza ukuthi amalungelo abantu abantulayo ahlonipheke. [Ihlombe.] (Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)

[The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: You behave as if you are in charge!

For the fact that government is institutionalising this programme gradually, it will enable it to have a say in many things. First of all, the most disturbing issue is that they just take people's money without their permission; this will be looked at by the government.

Secondly, it is to allow the funeral schemes to take only 10% from the social grant, but you find that they give an elderly woman three funeral schemes, as if a person dies three times.

Thirdly, it is the fact that they deduct money from an elderly person who stays in Mqanduli, who doesn't have electricity or water; we will also be able to control that. And this will enable us to do better things that will enable the people's rights to be respected. [Applause.]]

Ms L L VAN DER MERWE: Hon Deputy Speaker, hon Minister, I think we need to face the facts. That is, April 2017 is around is around the corner and your department is limping towards this deadline and you will not meet it. In fact, you were frank enough to tell the Standing Committee on Public Accounts, recently, that it was a mere wish of yours that Sassa would be able to meet this deadline. I think, however frank your admission was, we all know now what we can buy you for Christmas - and that is one of the genie lamps so that your wish can come true.

That aside, I would like to ask you why you never considered partnering with the SA Post Office, Sapo. Not only do they actually have the ability to pay out grants but they desperately need government business to stay afloat. Can you also tell this House today whether, because you failed to plan, you will now be forced to simply extend the Cash Paymaster Services, CPS, and Net1 contract? This would actually be a great failure on your

PAGE: 78 of 198

part because it is the same crooks who continue to steal money from our vulnerable grant recipients each month. Thank you.

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Okokuqala siphuma ekomidini manje sabeka izikhathi ezintsha, sakhuluma nange ... [Firstly, we have just come from the committee meeting now and we allocated new timeframes, and we also talked about the ...]

... phase-in, phase-out process.

Okwesibili iposi nathi sasilithanda ngenye indlela kodwa uma ngabe sithi siyaqala ukusebenza nalo, umhlinzeki wezinsiza okhona manje wasiyiza enkatolo. Inkantolo yathi nanoma iposi liyisikhungo sikahulumeni kodwa kumele liqhudelane njengamanye amabhange ... (Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)

[Secondly, we also liked the SA Post Office very much, but when we started partnering with them, the current service provider took us to court. The court ruling stated that, although the SA Post Office is a government parastatal, it must also compete with the other banks ...]

... or other financial institutions.

PAGE: 79 of 198

Phezu kwalokho futhi siqhubekile sasebenza neposi kwezinye izinto zokuposa nezokuthumela izimpahla. Enye into ebalulekile ekuzomele ukuthi siyenze ngoba iposi lona likhona ezindaweni eziningi, ukuthi sivumelane ukuthi abasebenzi baseposini bezwe kahle ukuthi uma sesisebenza nabo, ikakhulukazi uma beteleka kumele kusale labo abazoqinisekisa ukuthi ogogo nomkhulu kanye nezingane ziyazithola izibonelelo zazo.

Enye into ebalulekile ukuthi esinqumeni senkantolo kukhona izindawo eziyisikhombisa ekuthiwe kumele sizibheke. Kodwa uma ngabe sesihlala phansi sibhekisisa sathola ukuthi ziyishumi ezizokwenza ukuthi senze umsebenzi wethu kahle. Ngakho-ke nalokho kube nesandla ekutheni singakwazi ukuthi senze izinto masishane.

Okokugcina ... [Ubuwelewele.] (Translation of isiZulu paragraphs follows.)

[Over and above that, we continued to work with the SA Post Office with regard to other courier services. Another important thing which we are supposed to do, because the SA Post Office is available in most areas, is to come into agreement that the SA Post Office workers should understand that when we partner with them, especially when they go on strike, they must ensure

that they leave those who will make sure that the elderly and the children get their social grants.

Another important thing is that in the court ruling, there are seven areas that we were told to look at. However, when we sat down and looked at it, we found that there are actually 10 that will allow us to do our work properly. Therefore, that also contributed towards us not being able to do our things quickly.

Lastly ... [Interjections.]]

... isinqumo senkantolo sithi ngomhlaka-30 ... [Ubuwelewele.]
[... the court's decision is that on 30 ... [Interjections.]]

Mr M WATERS: Deputy Speaker, may I ask when are you going to enforce Rule 142(8), which limits the Minister's reply to two minutes, and no more? Thank you. [Interjections.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon members, the additional information the Minister was giving in the 30 seconds that she spoke under was legitimate.

Ms M S KHAWULA: Uxolo, Sihlalo ... [On a point of order, Chairperson ...]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, there is a member on the floor.

Ms M S KHAWULA: Kulungile uzangivumela-ke. [It is fine, you will allow me to speak then.]

Mr M WATERS: Deputy Speaker, with due respect, you have the discretion to extend the original reply from four to six minutes, according to the Rules. That is Rule 142(3).

Rule 142(8) does not give any discretion. All we are asking is for the Rules to be implemented fairly and consistently towards the Ministers and the members, which is not happening. You cut members off but you are allowing the Ministers to waffle on.

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon member, you see, when you say that, you must recognise what you are inviting will happen to you, and we will do it with absolute ruthlessness. [Interjections.] No, hon member. You see, you keep conversing even as I am speaking and you are out of order because when you do that, you are encouraging a very nasty habit to emerge in the House there — that every time we say something that you disagree with ...

... jy praat terug soos jy wil. Dis onaanvaarbaar ... [... you talk back any way you wish. That is unacceptable.]

... as if this is not the Chamber of the Assembly.

Jy kan dit nie doen nie. Dit is onaanvaarbaar. Verstaan dit net. [You can't do that. It is unacceptable. Just understand that.]

Nk M S KHAWULA: Sihlalo, kusiphatha kabi la eNdlini uma ngabe kuzothiwa oNgqongqoshe befuna ukuchaza ngezinto ezibalulekile ezithinta abantu emphakathini... Lezi zinto zempesheni, uNgqongqoshe wenza kahle uma ezichaza, kodwa manje akufanele abantu bazothi abasheshe, akasheshe. Ngicela ukuthi lapho ngaphambili ungabavumeli abantu abazibona ukuthi bona abayisebenzisi le nto yempesheni ... [Ihlombe.] ... Ngqongqoshe, sukuma ukhulume, uyinikezwa yimina imvume. [Ihlombe.]

USEKELA SOMLOMO: Qha Ngqongqoshe, ungasukumi kodwa siyakuzwa mama. [Uhleko.] Injalo le nto asiyiyekeni siqhubekele phambili. (Translation of isiZulu paragraphs follows.)

[Ms M S KHAWULA: Chairperson, it saddens us if, in this House, when the Ministers want to explain about important matters that affect the people in the community... The Minister is doing a good thing by explaining these grants matters, but the members must not rush her. Please do not allow members in the front there that are not affected by these grant matters ...

[Applause.] ... Minister, stand up and talk, I am giving you the permission to do so. [Applause.]

The DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, Minister, do not stand up, but we hear you, ma'am. [Laughter.] That is how it is, let us leave it there and move forward.]

## Particulars regarding department's strategy to address challenges of urban migration

- 282. Ms L A Mnganga-Gcabashe (ANC) asked the Minister of Human Settlements:
  - (1) With reference to the 2016 mid-year population estimates, which indicate that 60% of the population is increasingly urbanised, what are the implications of the specified estimates to the current strategy of her department aimed at addressing the challenges of urban migration;
  - (2) whether there will be any policy shifts that need to be undertaken to accommodate the implementation of the Integrated Urban Development Framework co-ordinated by

the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Hon Deputy Speaker, the question comes at a time when the world had gathered in Quito to discuss the issues that are raised by the hon member. The member wants to know with regard to the rate of urbanisation that has reached 60%, internationally, what the implications are for our housing policy or human settlements policy.

Our answer is that the world is experiencing waves of urbanisation, internationally, and the matter seeks urgent attention. We gathered in Quito to deal with exactly this issue for Habitat III, because it is the biggest issue confronting us as we deal with providing our people with shelter.

Actually, it is estimated that we have urbanised at the rate of 60% of our people living in unsanitary conditions, worldwide. It is anticipated that, as we speak, there are 1 billion people living in slum conditions because their urbanisation has not been prepared for. It is also expected that by 2015, this number will have tripled. We will have 3 billion people unless we do something urgently and seriously for these people living in poverty and in slum areas.

We have taken note of all of this and our policies have worked ahead of these developments to ensure that we are able to accommodate the number of people who are urbanising. South Africa is urbanising at a rate of 2,4% on an annual basis. As we speak, we are unable to deal with the informal settlements that we have found. In 1995, the number of people who were living in informal settlements and needing care and attention was 1,5 million families. This was as a result of a combination of the apartheid regime's policies of influx control and growing possibilities of employment in urban areas.

When the new democratic dispensation came into place, we were confronted with these 1,5 million families requiring accommodation. We have now provided 4,4 million houses, but we find that we are chasing a moving target because the more houses we produce, the more people move into the urban areas because they offer better opportunities.

The National Development Plan, NDP, estimates that in South Africa alone, the urban population will grow to 7,8 million people, more than we have right now. That means that by 2030, three out of every five people in South Africa is expected to be living in urban areas. We now have to ensure that between the Department of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs,

PAGE: 86 of 198

the Department of Rural Development and Land Reform, the Department of Water and Sanitation, and all other related departments and ourselves, we can work together to ensure that we can actually anticipate the levels of urbanisation in our country, plan for them, and make sure that we are able to contain this.

Currently, our policies do offer various solutions for dealing with some of the issues we are confronted with, except that we are unable to plan for the percentage of urbanisation beyond our own citizens. We have a situation where neighbouring states are finding opportunities for employment in South Africa. These are not planned for but we have to accommodate them because they become part of our informal settlements.

As for the second part of the question, by working together ...

Thank you, House Chair. [Time expired.]

Ms L A MNGANGA-GCABASHE: House Chairperson, I thank the hon Minister for the comprehensive response. The United Nations says that Africa is expected to be the fastest urbanising region between 2020 and 2050, while here, in South Africa, 71% of South Africans will be urbanised by 2030 and according to the 2050 framework, will be living in urban areas.

Given the statistical data and new policy with regard to the Integrated Urban Development Framework, what are the implications of Human Settlements' programmes in rural areas over the medium term to long term? That's my question. Thank you, Minister.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Deputy Speaker, I thank the hon member very much. We are in the process of revising our policy in line with the new agenda that was adopted by the UN Habitat. We are working together with the Minister of Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs at the UN Habitat to ensure that there is synergy between these two policies.

There will be a shift and it has been accommodated in our White Paper. What we are trying to do is to ensure that we are able to give equal opportunities to people who are in rural areas, the same as what we are giving to people who are in urban areas. The Minister of Rural Development and Land Reform is at the forefront of this and he is very energetic about making sure that he can make the living conditions of people in rural areas as attractive as those that are in urban areas. Thank you.

Mr K P SITHOLE: Hon House Chairperson, hon Minister, in terms of rapid population growth in urban areas, is the Minister working

together with the counter Ministers to stimulate economic growth in our rural areas so as to decrease the rates of urban migration? Thank you, House Chair.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Yes, Chairperson, as I have indicated, we are working together, especially with the Minister of Rural Development and Land Reform to ensure that we can make conditions in our rural areas as attractive as those that exist in urban areas. Indeed, this is something that we work on on a regular basis. Thank you.

Ms T GQADA: Hon House Chairperson, the Minister just mentioned that there is an annual increase of 2,4% in terms of urbanisation. What I want to ask the Minister is: What is your plan to effectively deal with the increase in urbanisation, as thousands of people are moving to the cities? Also, the fact is that municipalities don't have enough budget to cope with the problem. What plan do you have in place? Thank you, Minister.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: House Chairperson, yesterday,

I was at the portfolio committee meeting and the hon Gqada did

indicate that she might have an interest in working for the

United Nations' office for UN Habitat. So, perhaps when she gets

to that office, she will be supplying us with the necessary information.

PAGE: 89 of 198

We are unable to plan for anything beyond what we ourselves are experiencing, which is 2,4% urbanisation. What we are doing is providing the municipalities with the necessary resources to enable them to put in place emergency shelter for people who come in and need emergency support - but beyond that, that is the nature of urbanisation. It is unplanned. It is a mass movement to where economic opportunities open up by people who are living in conditions where they find that they could better their lives by moving elsewhere, and it is very difficult to preplan this.

Now that we know this is happening at the rate it is happening, we have the necessary policies in place, which we have passed on to the municipalities. We work with the municipalities. We meet them at the Minister and Members of Executive Councils, Minmec, meetings and we access the situation on a regular basis. Thank you.

Ms T GQADA: Chairperson, on a point of order: I just want to correct the Minister, because she is making serious allegations about me. I did not say that ...

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: House Chairperson, I was joking ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Minister, let me just hear what the member is saying.

Ms T GQADA: I am still on the floor, Minister, with due respect. Yes, I am still on the floor. I just want to correct this, because it has serious implications for me. You made that joke in the portfolio committee ...

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I know.

Ms T GQADA: So, I want you to retract that because it is not true.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Thank you, hon member. Hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I was withdrawing even before she finished. She knows very well that this was a joke we made yesterday. She is now very embarrassed ...

PAGE: 91 of 198

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Thank you, Minister; you have withdrawn.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: ... that it has been said in front of her.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Thank you.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I completely withdraw.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Thank you, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: It is not a job she has taken.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Thank you.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Ms Gqada, when the job gets advertised, I hope you will apply. [Laughter.]

Mrs C DUDLEY: Hon House Chair, hon Minister, with significant and increasing numbers of people being urbanised, there will be many people amongst this exodus to the cities who will be very vulnerable and in need of special housing. Since the Special

PAGE: 92 of 198

Housing Needs Policy, SHNP, which should address housing needs for these people has not yet been approved, what steps is the department taking to accommodate such people when they move to into urban areas? When can we expect approval of the SHNP? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: House Chair, when we had a session on informal settlements in Pretoria ... we hosted an international conference there, and this is one of the issues that we were discussing. It is very difficult, with informal migration and informal settlements, to immediately identify who the vulnerable people are and who are not vulnerable.

We have the beginnings of an agreement with organisations that deal with informal settlements to assist us to enumerate people who move into informal settlements so that we are able to identify those that are urgently in need of shelter and those who are in vulnerable positions. In this way, we are able to attend to them very quickly. We do have a policy within our framework that deals with emergency shelter, that deals specifically with the powers of municipalities to provide emergency shelter for those people.

## Support given by department to universities to ensure successful completion of examinations

291. Mr M D Kekana (ANC) asked the Minister of Higher Education and Training:

In view of the resumption of examinations at many universities in the country and the attempts to disrupt the examinations at some universities, what support has his department given to all universities in order to ensure the successful completion of examinations?

The MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION AND TRAINING: Hon House Chairperson, the department recognises the enormous repercussions that the failure to complete examinations would have on institutions and students, particularly final-year and prospective students, as well as for the economy. The department has been monitoring the exams at all institutions and is in constant communication with those institutions.

There are some institutions that have concluded their main examinations. These are the University of Venda, University of Limpopo, North West University, and Mangosuthu University of Technology, whose chancellor is here, next to me. At other

PAGE: 94 of 198

institutions, examinations are continuing without disruptions, despite serious efforts by people I won't name for now to try and disrupt the examinations. Some institutions have allowed students to choose to write their exams in January and we will monitor this, as well.

Departmental officials have been visiting some institutions where there were disruptions in an attempt to assist with resolving the issues raised by students. Continuous meetings are held with the peace and security cluster as part of an interdepartmental intervention plan to ensure safety and security at all institutions of higher learning. The department has also met with managers responsible for security risk management at the university, representatives from the National Joint Operational Centre, and representatives from the Private Security Industry Regulatory Authority.

The objectives of these meetings were to debate on the state of safety and security on campuses, to find better ways to deal with violent protest and disruptions, and to ensure the protection of life for the staff and students, as well as protecting university property.

I also wish to take this opportunity, hon Chair, to thank the university management, responsible student representative councils, SRCs, and other student leaders, for the effort they have put into ensuring that the 2016 academic year is properly concluded. Thank you very much.

Mr M D KEKANA: Chair, through you to the Minister: Are you satisfied that the measures taken to protect students who must write examinations are adequate? If not, what more do you think needs to be done? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION AND TRAINING: Hon Chair, so far, I am satisfied that whatever weaknesses may still be there, exams have been written in virtually all of our 26 public universities.

Indeed, there have been serious attempts in some institutions to disrupt exams. We also wish to express our solidarity with those students, small as they may be in number, who have been wanting to write but were unable to because they have been intimidated or upset by some of the tactics used to disrupt our institutions.

Otherwise, we are satisfied. As I said, those 26 of our institutions have finished. We continue to monitor the situation to make sure that all exams are, indeed, successfully concluded for the 2016 academic year.

Noma ngabe uthini Shandu, noma ungangikhomba ngezandla kodwa bayabhala abafundi bakithi. [Ihlombe.] [Whatever you are saying, Shandu, you can even point at me with your hands, but our students are writing. [Applause.]]

Prof B BOZZOLI: Chair, Minister, the delay in exams has seriously affected a very important constituency, that is, students in the medical field. Final-year students who are unable to register by 1 January will not be able to find placements. This will affect them and it will affect the medical system, which is already short of staff.

What are you doing to assist these students to get them on track to become registrars, and are you working with the Minister of Health to see that patient care is not affected by this? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION AND TRAINING: Hon Chair, first of all, as I have said, we are doing everything to ensure that

those who want to finish, who want to write exams and do their practicals, are able to do that. As I have said, so far, the department is satisfied that our institutions have done their best.

Rather than generalising, hon Bozzoli, where you know of medical students who are threatened by the fact that they may not be able to meet some of their requirements, give us the details. I can assure you that we will deal with those, irrespective of which Member of Parliament is actually raising them. Thank you very much.

Prof B BOZZOLI: Chair, could I just ask the Minister to control his testosterone? Thank you. [Laughter.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, hon member, I did not even recognise you. You are now acting contrary to the Rules that you know very well.

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: Hon Chairperson ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Mbatha ...

Mr M S MBATHA: Hon Chairperson, hon Minister ...

PAGE: 98 of 198

... kuthiwa bamba ubudoda bakho. [... they are saying that you should control your testosterone.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Mbatha, may I just give the Minister an opportunity? Why are you rising, hon Minister?

The MINISTER OF HUMAN SETTLEMENTS: I am rising on a point of order: Is the hon Bozzoli able to measure the testosterone of the Minister of Higher Education and Training? Why and where and when? Can we please have all of those answers?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Minister, that is not a point of order. [Interjections.] That is not a point of order. Continue, hon Mbatha.

Mnu M S MBATHA: Kuthiwa bamba ubudoda bakho lapho ngaphesheya Mphephethwa. Mphephethwa, bengithi angibuze ukuthi uyalazi iqiniso lokuthi izinkulungwane zabantu abasha ababebeqala unyaka wokuqala emanyuvesi kanye namanyuvesi wobuchwepheshe. Kubekhona ukushokeka ngokwempilo nxa kuqala isiteleka, okucacayo ukuthi kungenzeka ukuthi abanye baye ukuyobhala benqanqazela. Okubuhlungu-ke ukuthi mhlawumbe kungezeka ukuthi njengabantu bokuqala abazuzayo ku-NSFAS, imibandela ithi uma befeyila

PAGE: 99 of 198

bashona ngaphansi ngoba u-NSFAS akakuthathi okwesibili uma ufeyilile enyakeni wokuqala. Ngithi angibuze mhlawumbe ukuthi kukhuona yini, Mphephethwa, usizo onalo lapho esikhwameni sakho? (Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)

[Mr M S MBATHA: They are saying that you must control your testosterone, Mphephethwa. Mphephethwa, I wanted to say that you know the truth. There are thousands of youth who started their first year at university and at universities of technology. They were traumatised when the strike started, which might mean that some of them went to write shaking. What is sad is that, as first-year beneficiaries from the National Student Financial Aid Scheme, NSFAS, the conditions are that if you fail, you lose the funding, because NSFAS does not accept you twice if you fail your first year. My question is, Mphephethwa, is there any help from your funding?]

The MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION AND TRAINING: Hon Chair, in light of these follow-up questions, perhaps it is not fair. It is unparliamentary what the hon Bozzoli has said. [Laughter.] Can you please ask her to withdraw? Because if I had said a similar thing, I would have been accused of being a sexist.

PAGE: 100 of 198

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Bozzoli ... where is the hon Bozzoli? Hon Bozzoli, please withdraw that remark, please. No, no, will you withdraw it, please? [Interjections.] Hon Bozzoli, just withdraw the remark, please.

Prof B BOZZOLI: I fully withdraw, so to speak.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Thank you. Hon Minister?

UNGQONGQOSHE WEMFUNDO EPHAKEME NOKUQEQESHA: Ngifuna ukuthi kuwena Shandu, njengoba bengishilo ukuthi sibambisene nezikhungo zethu, kodwa ekugcineni yizona izikhungo ezaziyo ukuthi uma ngabe abafundi bebhale ngaphansi kwalezi zimo kwaphaswa kangaka, kuya kube nezindlela zokubhekelela ukuthi cishe bekukhona into eyonakele kakhulu kanye nanokuthi leyo nto ingalungiswa kanjani. Akumina engingama la ngithi ngibhekelele ini. Okwesibili akulona iqiniso ukuthi abafundi abangaphasi unyaka wokuqala ku-NSFAS bakhishelwa ngaphandle. Kuya ngokuthi ufeyile kangakanani bese izikhungu zikwazi ukuthi zibhekelele ukuthi, qha, uma kungekubi kakhulu sisengakwazi ukuthi lo mfundi sibuye simsize. Akunjengoba usho noma singakugcizeleli ukuthi abafundi bangaphasi kodwa kukhona ukubonelela okuye kube khona, kuye ngokuthi umfundi wenze kangakanani. Sihlalo, ngifuna ukusho ukuthi sikhathazekile njengoba bengishilo ukuthi kukhona

PAGE: 101 of 198

abafundi ababhale ngaphansi kwengcindezi. Uyayazi-ke SHandu le ngcindezi engikhuluma ngayo, uyazi kahle kakhulu wena ukudlula wonke umuntu. Ngiyabonga Sihlalo. (Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)

[The MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION AND TRAINING: I want to say to you, Shandu, as I stated previously, that we are working with our institutions, but at the end of the day, it is the institutions that know if the exams are written under these conditions. If there is a low pass rate, they look at that, and if there was a big problem, they look at how that problem can be fixed. I cannot stand here and say that I can fix that. Secondly, it is not true that NSFAS no longer funds those students who fail their first year. It depends on how the student failed; then the institutions see if it is not bad and if the student can be assisted. It is not like you said or we must not promote the students to fail. But there is lenience it depends on how the student did. Chairperson, as I have stated, we are worried about the students who wrote under pressure. You know which pressure I am talking about, Shandu, you know it very well, more than anybody. Thank you, Chairperson.

Mr M S MBATHA: Hon House Chair, I have a point of order: The hon Minister is making an assertion that I have intimate details of all the plans done by students. Can he withdraw that?

PAGE: 102 of 198

The MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION AND TRAINING: There is nothing to withdraw because he knows about this intimately because he is a member of the Portfolio Committee on Higher Education and Training. [Applause.] [Laughter.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Thank you, hon Minister,
I am glad to see that members of that committee are on top of
the situation.

## Particulars regarding tabling of statutory reports in Parliament

312. Mr G R Davis (DA) asked the Minister of Basic Education:

Whether she has found that the tabling of statutory reports in Parliament is important to facilitate public scrutiny of her department and the government; if not, what is the position in this regard; if so, what are the details of the measures that she has put in place to ensure the timeous tabling of all statutory reports under her purview?

PAGE: 103 of 198

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Chairperson and hon members, the answer is yes, the department has ensured that all the statutory reports and plans due to be tabled in Parliament are submitted timeously and in line with the stipulated timeframes of the oversight structures of Parliament. All statutory plans and reports are considered for final quality assurance before they are submitted to the oversight bodies, including the parliamentary structures. The Ministry does table these reports because of their importance and also, appreciating the importance of accountability in this sector. Thank you, Chair.

Mr G R DAVIS: Chairperson, the National Education Evaluation and Development Unit, Needu, was set up in 2009 as an independent unit to evaluate our school system. The Needu produced two excellent reports in 2012 and 2013 that give a very frank assessment of what is going wrong in our schools and how things can be turned around. The problem is that it is now nearly the end of 2016 and the 2014 report has still not seen the light of day.

What has seen the light of day, however, is this e-mail that I hold in my hand, written by the acting chief executive officer of the Needu, in which he tells his staff about a meeting he had with Minister Motshekga. The acting chief executive officer's e-

PAGE: 104 of 198

mail confirms our suspicion that the 2014 Needu report is being suppressed for political reasons. [Interjections.] It states that the Minister told him to stop reporting what is going wrong in the system; that the Minister told him to suspend all school visits; and that the Needu must, in the Minister's words, be brought closer to the department. [Interjections.]

So, my question to the Minister is: Why are you interfering with the independence of the Needu; and will you commit yourself to tabling the 2014 report, an uncensored version of that report, in this House in the next six months? Thank you. [Applause.]

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Chair, it is difficult when people start working on gossip and reports that we have not seen. [Interjections.] This member is a member of the portfolio committee. If he had questions about the Needu reports, he could have asked the commission if he really meant to be quite correct. [Interjections.]

So, just to answer him, Chair, when he says that the Needu reports don't see the light of day, I don't know which light of day they need to see, because the aim of the reports is for the department to get information on what the department needs to do, and we have been implementing the recommendations. They were

PAGE: 105 of 198

commissioned by us to get the information to be used in the department, and not for him to get into gossiping exercises with the acting chief executive officer, who has never spoken to me about our discussion, and I wrote him a letter. So, I can't answer the stories that appeared in the letter.

However, the truth of the matter is that we are using the Needu reports, and the reports don't necessarily have to come to Parliament to be used. Just for the member's benefit, the issue about the closeness of the Needu to the department is an instruction from the Treasury that we should not set up too many parallel structures. Therefore, it is not even my decision.

In order for the member to be really gracious, he should bring the document for us to talk about it. I don't work under his instruction. If he wants a Needu report, he must work through the portfolio committee, or whatever structures. He should not bring me gossiping letters and think that through the gossip, he can instruct me when to bring the report. I think that this is unfortunate, and I won't do it that way. I will do it properly. [Applause.]

uMnu D H KHOSA: Sihlalo, sifuna kubonga eNdvuneni kwekutsi litiko lakhe libonakele lisebenta kakhulu. Ngato tonkhe tikhatsi sikhonile kwendlulisa imibiko lebeyidzingekile futsi ikulelizinga lebeyidzingeke kutsi ibe kulo. (Translation of Siswati paragraph follows.)

[Mr D H KHOSA: Chairperson, we would like to express our gratitude to the Minister, because her department has been working very hard. We were able to submit reports every time and they were of the required standard.]

Apart from the statutory reports, Minister, we have seen the Minister constituting the ministerial task team on a number of issues within the sector. How is the Minister following up on the recommendations of such? Thank you.

UNGQONGQOSHE WEMFUNDO EYISISEKELO: Ngiyabonga, Baba. Njengoba ngicacisile ekuqaleni ukuthi imibiko uma siyithola igunyazwa yithi ngoba kukhona esifuna ukukwazi. Miningi le mibiko esiyigunyazayo. Ngenza umbiko we-Caps basiluleka ngayo zayisebenzisa. Ngenza ukuba kube nkhomishana ngenkathi izibalo zisixaka singazi ukuthi kwenzakalani base basinikeza izincomo sazisebenzisa. Angeke sichithe imali kahulumeni sithi kwenziwe imibiko sigcine singawasebenzisi. Nawo lo mbiko we-Needu kanye noMphathi osehamba ehleba ngakhuluma naye ngathi usitshela izinto esizaziyo. Sitshele into esingayazi ezosisiza ukuthi siye

phambili. [Akuzwakali.] Ufuna ukwenza umathanda asitshele izinto

esizaziyo. (Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)

PAGE: 107 of 198

[The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Thank you, sir. As I clarified before, we are the ones who approve the reports when we receive them because there is something we need to know. We have many reports to approve. I did the Curriculum Assessment Policy Statements, Caps, report; they advised us about it and we used them. I formed the commission when we were struggling with mathematics and we did not know what was happening; they then gave us recommendations, which we used. We cannot waste the government's money by drafting these reports and not using them. This Needu report ... I spoke to their leader, who is now going around gossiping, and I told him that he was telling us what we are already know. I told him to tell us something that we do not know, that will take us forward. [Inaudible.] He wants to do as he pleases and tells us some things we already know.]

Mr T RAWULA: Minister ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, you are not the hon Mashabela.

Mr T RAWULA: I am making a follow-up question on her behalf.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Yes, but you should have indicated that you want to make a follow-up question on her behalf. It is a follow-up question and not a question in her name, but you may proceed, hon member.

Mr T RAWULA: Alright. Minister, do you personally take Parliament as the constitutional institution meant to make the executive account seriously, now? If your answer is yes, why have you not only ensured that the results are tabled in Parliament, but also that you personally attend departmental briefings to the portfolio committee and account here in the National Assembly whenever needed? Thank you.

LETONA LA THUTO YA MOTHEO: Modulasetulo, ke di amohela ditlahelo kaofela ka boikarabelo bo felletseng. Ke tseba ka botlalo hore ha se kgetho ya ka hore ke inkele geto ya hore ke eng e bohlokwa ka Palamente. Mme, ha ke bitsitswe hore ke tlo araba, ke araba ka boikokobetso bo felletseng. Jwale, monghadi kapa yena ntate ya buang mona, mohlomong ke hore ha a tsebe, o eme bakeng sa mme Mashabela mona. Ha a ne a le teng, o ne a tla paka hore ke nka komiti ka tlhompho le boikokobetso bo felletseng ntate.

(Translation of Sesotho paragraph follows.)

[The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Chairperson, I take full responsibility for all the reports. I know full well that it is not my place to take a decision about what is important for Parliament. Therefore, when I am called to answer, I answer with the utmost humility. Now, the gentleman who is speaking, perhaps it's because he doesn't know, he is a stand-in for Mrs

Mashabela. If she were here, she would attest to the fact that I regard the committee with great respect and humility.]

Ms D VAN DER WALT: Chair, the DA is deeply concerned by the Minister's claim that the Jobs for Cash report is not about the SA Democratic Teacher's Union, Sadtu, despite it having been mentioned 694 times in the report, which clearly finds that Sadtu has de facto control in six of the nine provinces. The report must be tabled in Parliament, as required by the National Assembly's Guide to Procedure and section 92 of the Constitution, so that this House can deliberate on the report's findings and recommendations, and agree on a way forward.

When will the Minister table the Jobs for Cash report in Parliament; and if she won't, why not?

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: It's so funny the way you're predictable. Actually, I've written an answer on Jobs for Cash

because I thought that your colleague would raise it. So, that's a curveball coming from you, because I knew that it was an issue.

PAGE: 110 of 198

Mr M WATERS: Just answer the question!

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: No! Just shut up! [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Minister!

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: I withdraw. You can sit down. I withdraw. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Yes! Thank you! Order, hon members! Hon members, let's give the Minister an opportunity to speak.

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: I apologised. Why is he standing?

Mr I M OLLIS: Chair, the point is that she just ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, hon member, I haven't recognised you. What is your point of order?

Mr I M OLLIS: My point of order is that the Minister told the Chief Whip of the Opposition to sit down. The point of the matter ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, hon member, please!

The Minister is withdrawing.

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: I apologised. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Continue, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF BASIC EDUCATION: Chair, as I was saying, the opposition is so predictable, it's not funny. I wanted to say that I knew about the report, and it is not about Sadtu. We raised it in the commission and there is no difficulty in bringing the report. That is all the members had to say. I don't decide which reports must come to the House. If the members, through their committee, say that they want to debate the report, that's fine. So, they should not make an issue because of their obsession and this fixation on Sadtu. The report is not

about Sadtu; it is about the selling of posts, and there is nothing to hide. That is why it is on our website.

## Details regarding water shortage in Swartruggens

285. Mr H P Chauke (ANC) asked the Minister of Water and Sanitation:

What are the relevant details of the shortage of water in  $$\tt Swartruggens?$ 

The MINISTER OF WATER AND SANITATION: Hon Chair, hon Chauke,
Swartruggens and Borolelo are supplied with potable water from
the Swartruggens Water Treatment Plant. Raw water to this plant
is supplied from the dam and augmented from a spring source in
Polkadraaispruit. This source is unreliable. It sometimes runs
dry in periods of extreme drought and farmers are contesting the
water use.

The following alternative water sources have been identified to augment this challenged supply. These are: importing raw water from Lindleyspoort Dam; increasing of the Swartruggens Dam wall and overflow to increase the basin capacity; importing water from the dolomite areas, some 40 km to the south of the town

PAGE: 113 of 198

through our acid mine drainage water purification system; reusing treated sewage effluent, and also taking advantage of some of the dams surrounding Rustenburg, which might provide relief to supply both Koster and Swartruggens. These are the Bospoort, Vaalkop, and Olifantsnek Dams.

To date, the solutions numbered above have taken the situation forward. The dolomitic area has been tested and results are positive in terms of both quantity and quality. Once funds are confirmed, the pipeline will also be constructed with extreme urgency and can be completed within four months of commencement. This is but one of our own rehabilitation programmes of the aged infrastructure in the area of Swartruggens. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

Rre H P CHAUKE: Modulasetilo, ke rata go leboga Tona ka karabo ya gagwe. Swartruggengs ke kwa kgaolotlhophong ya me, ke dira gona bosigo le motshegare. Tona, baagi ba lefelo leno ga ba nal metsi. Re a itse gore Lefapha la Metsi le Kgelelo ya Leš we le tsere boikarabelo jwa go rwala metsi ka diteraka go leka go thusa baagi ba Swartruggengs ka metsi.

PAGE: 114 of 198

Ke rata go itse gore madi a tla tsaya nako e kae go ka fitlhelela Mmasepala wa Kgetlengrivier gore o kgone go tsweletsa pele lenaneo la go neelana ka metsi mo bathong?

Sa bobedi se ke batlang go se itse ke gore a Mmasepala wa Kgetleng, o o ka fa tlase ga tsamaiso ya ANC, o o boneng thuno e e kgotsofatsang mo ngwageng wa gajaana wa ditš helete, o thusa le go dirisana jang le baagi gore ba itse gore go na le sengwe se se dirwang ke puso ya ANC gore ba nne le metsi?

TONA YA METSI LE KGELELO YA LEŠ WE: A ke tseye tš hono eno le nna ke itebogele. Sa ntlha ke gore Kgetleng ke mmasepala o o bontshitseng ditlhabologo mo dingwageng tse di fetileng, ke ka ntlha eo Moruni-Kakaretso a rileng ba itse go tshola ditš helete tse ba di neelwang go di dirisetsa setš haba.

Sa bobedi ke gore ba mo ditekong tsa gore banna le basadi ba ba dirang mo mm asepaleng ono, ba nne le bokgoni le boitseanape.

Tlhokagalo ya metsi mo go bommasepala ba ba tshwanang le

Kgetleng kwa Swartruggens, ke ka lebaka la eng mo dingwageng tse

di fetileng go ne go se na lenaneo la go tlisa metsi a a tswang

mo dipompong go batho ba rona. Mo nakong e e khutshwane re

dirile gore re tsamaise metsi ka ditanka tsa metsi, re baakanye

PAGE: 115 of 198

metswedi ya metsi teng. Se o se buang se botlhokwa gonne fa re ka neelwa madi a re a lopileng go tswa go Matlole a Bosetš haba re ka kgona go nna le maanomagolo gore Mmasepala wa Kgetleng o kgone go baakanya metswedi ya metsi. (Translation of Setswana paragraphs follows.)

[Mr H P CHAUKE: Chairperson, I would like to thank the Minister for her response. Swartruggens is my constituency, and I am there day and night. Minister, Swartruggens residents do not have water. We are aware that the Department of Water and Sanitation has taken the responsibility to help Swartruggens residents with water by delivering water to them by using trucks.

I would like to find out how long it is going to take for the funds to reach Kgetlengrivier Local Municipality so that they can continue with their programme of giving water to the residents.

The second issue that I want to know is: How is Kgetlengrivier Local Municipality, that received a clean audit in this current financial year and is led by the ANC, going to work with the residents so that they can know that there are programmes by the ANC-led government that will ensure that they receive water?

PAGE: 116 of 198

The MINISTER OF WATER AND SANITATION: Let me take this opportunity to also give thanks. The first issue is that Kgetlengrivier Local Municipality has shown improvements over the past few years; hence the Auditor-General has said they know how to use their public funds effectively.

The second issue is with regard to the test that men and women that are working for the municipality should have the skills and expertise.

The shortage of water in municipalities such as Kgetlengrivier in Swartruggens is due to the reason that over the past few years, there have been no programmes to ensure that residents get water from the taps. Within a short period of time, we have ensured that we deliver water through water tanks and upgrade water resources there. However, what you are saying is important because if we are allocated the funds that we requested from the National Treasury, we will have strategies to enable Kgetlengrivier Local Municipality to upgrade their water resources.]

Once National Treasury has confirmed the transfer of the money, we will then overhaul the entire water infrastructure system of Kgetleng. We must commend that municipality. It was one of the

PAGE: 117 of 198

municipalities under the Back to Basics programme and they have, indeed, turned around their capacity under the leadership of the ANC. Thank you very much. [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): The next supplementary question will be asked by the hon Majeke.

Mr M L W FILTANE: I may not be Majeke, Deputy Chair ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, before I allow you, may I just repeat what I said to the member of the EFF, as well? Please make sure that you indicate that you want to take the follow-up question, because the primary question is not in your name.

Mr M L W FILTANE: Thank you, Chair, I pressed the wrong button because I took a position close to the microphone and when I stretched my hand, I pressed the wrong button.

Hon Minister, I hope that you will be most accommodating of my question. In the context of your plausible principle of supplying water, or making water provision in an integrated fashion in South Africa, and considering the fact that water is an economic driver, a source of life, and particularly, in the

PAGE: 118 of 198

poverty-stricken area of O R Tambo, the big thing that has been a big promise there is the construction of the Umzimvubu Dam, which has been in the pipeline for over 10 years, hon Minister.

In September 2015, you made a very healthy and welcome promise that very soon, construction would start. And this was against the backdrop of a promise that had been made a little earlier in 2014 by the hon President. When will this construction actually start? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF WATER AND SANITATION: Chair, I thank the hon member for this question. In fact, Umzimvubu dates as far back as your P W Botha and Matanzima era. What has been a challenge has been the absence of a coherent plan on how to take that project forward. What has since happened is that we now have a professional service provider, who has done designs of the two dams. On those designs, there has been an agreement that we will have to start with the Lalini Dam.

The Lalini Dam will actually assist us in releasing the potential in that part of our country. Because this project stands a possibility of being one of the mega projects in the country, it is one of those projects that constitute a bi-

national agreement between the People's Republic of China and the South African government.

What we have done is to appoint people who are now doing the grading and the clearance of the site. We have now been assisted by Minister Gugile Nkwinti to get the title deeds, because of the different owners of the pockets of land. We have an uptake agreement with the Chinese construction company that is also going to be a co-funder, because it can't only be funded through the fiscus. Part of what we want to do is to inject economic development into that area. We should also include the development of hydro on the second dam.

This is where we are and I appreciate that the hon member has raised this issue. Before the end of this year, we will be meeting. President Zuma has advised us - Minister Nkwinti,

Minister Van Rooyen, and me - to interact with the traditional leaders in the Eastern Cape. I thank you.

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: Chair, when the Minister speaks, you would think that she is making sense and that is exactly how she spoke when we asked a question before, about water in Giyani. She spoke like that and as we are talking here today, there is still

PAGE: 120 of 198

no water. Even on the question of Swartruggens, there is no water and there's not going to be any water there.

In 2014, when we arrived here, we asked the president of the ANC, whose integrity is being questioned by the majority of sensible Ministers in his own Cabinet, when he was going to give water to Giyani and all the affected areas in Jozini and everywhere else. He said by the end of 2014, water would be there.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Shivambu, will you just take your seat, please. Why are you rising, hon member?

Mr B A RADEBE: Hon House Chair, I rise because, in terms of Rule 85(1), there are two things. Firstly, the hon - or Mr; I don't think he is honourable, and that's my opinion - Mr Shivambu is impugning ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, you are also now out of order. Please take your seat. [Interjections.] What is the follow-up question, hon member? You have a few seconds left for your follow-up question.

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: Why should we trust what Nomvula is saying about water when, throughout, we have been told that water is going to come and water has not been going to all these areas? Why should we consider even listening to that? Because throughout ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Shivambu, will you address the hon member correctly?

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: Yes, well, "Mrs Nomvula".

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, let us just address each other properly.

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: Well, "Mrs Mokonyane". Why should we trust her?

Because we are told here, every time, that water is coming

before the end of the year.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Your time has now expired, hon member. Thank you.

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: In 2014, it was said that 2014 water is coming, 2015 water is coming, and all the areas where the commitments are being made, no water has arrived there.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Thank you, hon member.

Hon Shivambu, your time has expired!

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: I think we must take serious action on the people who come and lie here in Parliament about water and do nothing about it. I think that must be taken seriously, Chair.

The MINISTER OF WATER AND SANITATION: Chairperson, I will take serious exception if I can be trusted by the EFF. I refuse to be commended by them; they are the last. Even when I think they are saying hot air, because nonetheless, he assumes he's the only one who knows Giyani. We know Giyani, our people are there. There are communities that have water. We are sorting out the mess we have inherited from some of your own businesspeople who worked in Giyani.

We have even made a commitment that we are not dealing only with emergencies in Giyani. Go and look at that hospital that your leader went to during elections, thinking he would find a surprise. It is functioning; it has water supplied. I am not going to be threatened by you. I know my job and I don't wish to be commended by you, not ...

Mr T RAWULA: Order, Chair!

The MINISTER OF WATER AND SANITATION ... [Inaudible.] ... by yourself. Thank you. [Applause.]

Mr T RAWULA: Chair, I am rising on a point of order on Rule 92:
Mrs Nomvula Mokonyane is referring to other areas. We are
talking about Giyani as a whole. It does not have water. She is
talking about certain areas and she is not responding to Giyani
as a whole.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, hon member, that's not a point of order.

Mr L J BASSON: Chair ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Basson, I see a plethora of hands and the one who is standing up did not put up his hand. I am recognising the member who is sitting next you. His hand was up first.

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: On a point of order, Chair: He is handing over that to me. He is going to do that.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No. He is quite prepared to take it; he was prepared to get up.

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: Tell them, commissar. [Laughter.]

Mr L G MOKOENA: I cede my responsibility to the hon Shivambu!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon members ...

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: On a point of order ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, before you continue, hon Shivambu, let us just make sure that when there is a point of order from any political party that the Whips who are assigned to take points of order do so and that other members do not then decide later to hand it over to the Whip anyway. It looks clumsy. Continue, hon member.

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: Look, we are not here to commend mediocrity and people who come and tell untruths here. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): What is the point of order?

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: We never make any comments to the Minister of Water and Sanitation because there is nothing that is happening ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): What is the point of order?

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: What do we do, as Parliament, when people come into the House and say that there is going to be water in ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, that is not a point of order!

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: ... at the end of the year, and still there is no water? When you ask a follow-up question there is still ... [Inaudible.] ... commitment. What do we do about such people?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, that is not a point of order. Will you now take your seat, please? I am going to take the next supplementary question now.

Ms N V MENTE: No, no, no. Our hands were up.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, you can't raise multiple hands on exactly the same point. I have ruled that it is not a point of order. So, I am just going to give this member the opportunity to hear what she has to say so that if it is in the same line, then it has already been ruled upon

PAGE: 126 of 198

and I am not going to revisit it. Hon member, why are you rising?

Ms N V MENTE: Chairperson, the treatment that we get here is misleading. [Interjections.] Parliament is a place where we have to be honest. We cannot be misled and say nothing.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): What is the point of order?

Ms N V MENTE: The point of order is that the Minister is misleading the House and the nation. There is no water in Giyani, Ncora, Cofimvaba ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member ... hon member, you are now repeating exactly ...

Ms N V MENTE: ... where she went with the President to open a dam. She is misleading the House. We cannot sit back and say she is speaking the truth. She is being dishonest.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, take your seat. Take your seat, please. What you should do is, if you feel the way that you do in terms of misleading the House or not, you

PAGE: 127 of 198

must submit a substantive motion to us so that we can deal with that issue. It is not good enough if you did not hear what you wanted to hear in the reply that you necessarily say the member is misleading the House. Submit a substantive motion, please.

Ms H O HLOPHE: Order, Chair: we are talking about a basic need here, which is water. So, we can't allow her to come and mislead the House. We want water in Giyani, full stop.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, hon member, this is not a point of order. Take your seat, please. I am going to switch off your microphone now. I've made a ruling. The ruling stands and I will not change it. Hon Basson?

Mr L J BASSON: Thank you, Chair. Minister, this is not a new problem and your department was informed, in 2013, that Swartruggens would soon be without water.

The council of Kgetlengrivier Local Municipality declared the area a disaster area on 16 October. I wrote to your directorgeneral on 20 October 2015 to intervene. After the portfolio committee had been for oversight in September this year, you then came up with plans. That's why the portfolio committee sent

PAGE: 128 of 198

away your department, back to Pretoria today, because they don't come up with plans.

Minister, we are fed-up with waiting and listening to plans.

When are we going to get action; and when are we going to see water in Swartruggens? [Applause.]

The MINISTER OF WATER AND SANITATION: Chair, I also get fed-up with people who want to co-govern with us. [Interjections.] I get fed-up but I want to state here that it is per our own advice. [Applause.] The national department only intervenes directly in a municipality once a municipality takes a council resolution and declares that disaster. Just listen! Upon them having agreed ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order, hon members!

Mr L J BASSON: On a point of order, Chair: In my statement, I indicated that the council took that resolution on 16 October 2015. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, let's give the Minister an opportunity to reply to your follow-up question.

PAGE: 129 of 198

The MINISTER OF WATER AND SANITATION: That is precisely the need for him to listen. They took a council resolution on 16 October ...

HON MEMBERS: 2015! [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF WATER AND SANITATION: Listen! Listen! They took a council resolution. They then have to go and do their own plan that will then call upon the MEC for Co-operative Governance and Traditional Affairs to present before their Cabinet so that they can agree, together with their district, on how these issues can be elevated. Throughout, we had to look ... We can't just pour money into the problem. Upon them having sorted this matter ... because he knows very well that municipalities are water service authorities and it is on that basis that you only intervene when everything has been sorted out. Thank you.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Minister, let me just take this point of order.

Ms A STEYN: Hon Chair, is it parliamentary for the Minister to point to a member and say he points out?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon members, we have different mannerisms when we speak but what I would like to do is to request everyone, whether it is a Minister replying to a question or member asking the supplementary question, to address the Chair.

PAGE: 130 of 198

The MINISTER OF WATER AND SANITATION: Presiding officer, everybody knows that a municipality is a water service authority. It has to sit over the authority. It doesn't happen overnight because tomorrow, they will be saying it's unauthorised expenditure. Nonetheless, it is not about whether you come and grandstand here; it is about making interventions.

We have made interim interventions since last year. We now have a plan that we are now implementing. Thank you very much. [Time expired.] [Applause.]

## Measures to address relationship between substance abuse and gangsterism

- 297. Ms N R Capa (ANC) asked the Minister of Social Development:
  - (a) What measures has her department put in place to address the relationship between substance abuse and

30 NOVEMBER 2016 PAGE: 131 of 198

gangsterism and (b) do the specified measures include any intergovernmental structure?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon Chairperson, drugs and gangs are the twin challenges confronting many of our communities throughout the country. Members will agree with me that to successfully tackle these challenges, our interventions must start with the most basic unit in our communities - the family.

Aside from the family, there should also be initiatives from schools and the community as a whole, because everyone should be involved in the fight against substance abuse and gangsterism.

It should be community-driven initiatives, more particularly because the issues of drugs are structural. Sometimes, they thrive where there is poverty.

Based on this approach, the department has developed the Anti-Gangsterism Strategy for secure care facilities to cater for children in conflict with the law. The strategy is built on four pillars, namely human development, social partnership, spatial design, and the criminal justice process.

PAGE: 132 of 198

The overriding pillar of the strategy is the multipartnership approach, aimed at creating safe living spaces within communities. For this reason, we are encouraging municipalities to establish and implement local drug action committees, as such structures empower communities to respond through various initiatives, such as Ke Moja, I am fine without drugs. We also call on young people to come up with grand themes that will be able to catch fire and go with the times because perhaps Ke Moja is as old as Bathabile!

The Central Drug Authority, CDA, committee ... [Interjections.] ... Yes, I was actually in the facility when they said I was drunk. [Interjections.] The Central Drug Authority is a multisectoral structure, established to advise Cabinet on plans and measures to combat the scourge. The National Drug Master Plan 2013-17 is a blueprint endorsed by a number of departments and our partners to ensure that we enhance our national effort in tackling these challenges.

To this end, Cabinet established an interministerial committee,

IMC, to combat the scourge of alcohol and substance abuse in

South Africa. The IMC has developed its programme of action,

which supports the multisectoral approach focusing on prevention

through community mobilisation, because prevention is the most basic and important element of this programme.

We have developed a number of programmes and policies to deal with the twin challenges of drugs and gangsterism. However, we have stated before that policies and programmes, on their own, are not enough. We need greater co-operation and collaboration. Furthermore, the way we talk about the issues of drugs, like using the slogan, War on drugs, has failed. If you talk about a war, people interpret that differently.

We also need to come up with strategies that are going to help us get into the hearts and minds of our communities. We need strategies that are going to help deal with the issues of addiction, gang violence, and so on. Thank you very much.

Nks R N CAPA: Sihlalo, mandibulise iNdlu ngokubanzi ndibulele kakhulu nakuMphathiswa ngempendulo yakhe. Mphathiswa, okokuqala kubonakala ngathi ulutsha luyasabela kweli khwelo lihle kangaka. Okwesibini, ingaba nina ningulo mkhosi olwa nale migulukudu, ninabo kusini na abantu abazingcaphephe abakwaziyo ukuphanda abafana nabaphandi ukwenzela ukuba sazi iintlobo zeziyobisi ezisetyenziswayo. Ndiyabulela kakhulu. (Translation of isiXhosa paragraph follows.)

[Ms R N CAPA: Hon Chairperson, let me greet the House at large and thank the hon Minister for her answer. Hon Minister, firstly, youth seem to like your programme. Secondly, do you as the campaign fighting with these criminals, have professionals who know how to research, like researchers, so that we know the different types of drugs that are used. Thank you very much.]

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZOKUTHUTHUKISWA KOMPHAKATHI: Sihlalo, ongoti esisebenza nabo abalapha ekhaya abanye basebenza ku-Drug Action Committee, abanye basebenza ku-Medical Research Council ngoba ezinye izidakamizwa uma zivela njenge-Nyaope kuthatha isikhathi ukuba zibhaliswe njengezidakamizwa ngoba zifaka i-Rattex, i-Jik ne-Vim. Ngakho ke kufanele nilwe ukuze kuvumeleke ukuthi ngempela isidakamizwa lesi siyababulala abantu bethu.

Abanye abezizwe zonke ababona ukuthi kwenzekani umhlaba wonke. Isinqumo noma isincomo esikhona njengamanje esasidingida esizoya ezweni lonke siyodingidwa eMzansi Afrika ukuthi kuxoxiswane ngemibono emisha ephumayo yokulwa nezidakamizwa - njengokuthi ohulumeni abaningi bathatha imali yabo bondle abantu abasebenzisa izidakamizwa bese bebondla nemindeni yabo. Umbono ovelayo eKomidini lezizwe zonke ukuthi yinindaba labantu bangasebenzi uma ngabe sebezwa ukuthi sebefuna ukuyobhema.

PAGE: 135 of 198

Baphume bayobhema ngaphandle benze imigilingwane yabo bagxize amathe bese beyabuyela bayosebenza. Umbono lowo usazoxoxwa yi-Central Drug Action Committee. Ngiyabonga. (Translation of isiZulu paragraphs follows.)

[The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Chairperson, some of the experts that we work with from here work in the Drug Action Committee, some of them in the Medical Research Council, because when some drugs come out, like nyaope, it takes time to register them as drugs, because they're a combination of Rattex, Jik, and Vim. Therefore, we would have to fight in order for them to be registered as drugs, and they're killing our people.

Other people from all the nations are not aware of what is happening in the whole world. The decision or the recommendation that we are discussing at the moment that will be announced to the whole world will be discussed in South Africa so that there will be negotiations about the ideas on how to fight drugs — like, many governments take their money and support drug users and they then support their families. The idea from the committee is, Why don't these people go and work if they feel that they want to smoke? Instead, they go out and smoke outside and do wrong things, ooze saliva, and then go back to work. This

idea is still to be discussed by the Central Drug Action Committee. Thank you.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon members, I just see one name here for supplementary questions. So, those members wishing to do so must please indicate and press the button in front of them.

Nks N P SONTI: Mphathiswa, ubundlobongela bukhule kakhulu kwaye bubangelwa yindlala, yimfundo engekhosemgangathweni nokunqongophala komsebenzi. Zonke nje ezi zinto ziphelisa ithemba kulutsha. Le ntlupheko ingapheliyo ibanga umsindo kulutsha luphele lungenwa bubundlobongela. Apha kweli leNtshona Koloni iziyobisi zixhaphake kakhulu kwezi ndawo zabantu abahluphekayo. Yonke ke le meko siyayazi ukuba ayihoywanga yi-ANC kunye ne-DA. Umbuzo uthi: Ngaphandle nje ke kokujonga emapoliseni, yeyiphi inxaxheba ongayithathayo nje ngorhulumente, nanjengoko sendisibekile isizathu sokuba indlala ngunobangela wobundlobongela. Enkosi. (Translation of isiXhosa paragraph follows.)

[Ms N P SONTI: Hon Minister, the crime rate has increased and that is caused by poverty, poor education, and unemployment. All these things make youth lose hope. The endless poverty creates

PAGE: 137 of 198

anger amongst the youth, who end up being criminals. Here, in the Western Cape, drugs are found mostly in poor townships. We know that the ANC and DA ignore the whole situation. The question is: Other than depending on the police, what steps have you taken, as government? As I already mentioned, poverty is the cause of crime. Thank you.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Bengingazi ukuthi i-DA usuyibala nathi ngoba nihamba nonke. [Ubuwelewele.] Siyavuma ... [I did not know that you are now counting the DA with us, because you are together. [Interjections.] We agree ...]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Minister, let me find out what this point of order is about.

Ms H O HLOPHE: Chairperson, can you ask the Minister to withdraw that thing? [Interjections.]

Asihambi ne-DA. [Ubuwelewele.] I-ANC ivote neDA eKannaland. [We are not together with the DA. [Interjections.] The ANC voted with the DA in Kannaland.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, that is not a point of order. [Interjections.]

Ms H O HLOPHE: No, Chair, it is! She must withdraw.
[Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, that is a matter of debate. It is a matter of speech. [Interjections.]

Ms H O HLOPHE: No, she must withdraw. The ANC voted with the DA in Kannaland. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): I rule that the Minister does not need to withdraw. It is a political statement, hon member. [Interjections.]

Ms H O HLOPHE: No, she must withdraw. No, she must withdraw that. You, as the ANC, voted with the DA in Kannaland. So, what is the problem now? [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, will you take your seat now? Please, take your seat now.

Mr L G MOKOENA: Chair, on a point of order: It is because the ANC is corrupt that they voted for the DA. [Interjections.] ... those municipalities from the ANC. It is corrupt.

PAGE: 139 of 198

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, please take your seat. I have ruled on this matter. I am now switching off your microphone. Hon member, I am switching off your microphone. I have ruled on the matter. [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Angazi ukuthi kwenzekani eTshwane naseGoli. [I do not know what is happening in Tshwane and Johannesburg.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon members, can we give the Minister a chance to respond?

Ms N P SONTI: Nam ndifuna ukuphendula. [I also want to answer.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Can we give the Minister a chance? You have asked your follow-up question.

[Interjections.]

Ms N P SONTI: Ndicela ukuphendula kule nto ayithethayo uMphathiswa. [I want to answer on what the hon Minister is talking about.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, hon member, the Rules don't allow for that. Can you take your seat, please? [Interjections.]

Ms N P SONTI: Hayi ndifuna ukuphendula kuMphathiswa kuba ndim obethetha le nto. [No, I want to answer the hon Minister because I'm the one who said this.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Take your seat! Hon member, can you take your seat, please? Hon member, please take your seat.

Ms N P SONTI: Uza kundinika ithuba lokuthetha? [Will you give me time to speak?]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Take your seat!
[Interjections.]

Ms N P SONTI: Ndim obethethe le nto. [I'm the one who said this.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Take your seat, hon member. The Minister is busy replying to the supplementary question that you have asked. [Interjections.]

Ms N P SONTI: No, Chairperson.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): I am switching off your microphone now. [Interjections.]

Ms N P SONTI: Hayi, Sihlalo, kodwa unedolo. [No, hon Chairperson, you are biased.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Take your seat, please.

Let us allow the Minister to respond to your question.

[Interjections.]

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZOKUTHUTHUKISWA KOMPHAKATHI: Siyavumelana nokuthi izindaba zobuxhwanguxhwangu zihambisana nendlala. Yiko sithe ezinye izinto zamaqembu ezigebengu nokusetshenziswa kabi kwezidakamizwa zivela lapho kunobuphofu khona. Lezo zinto zihlelekile.

Okwesibili, siyavumelana ukuthi intsha inezinkinga kodwa futhi uma ubheka e-Eldorado Park, Eersterust bese ubheka lapha eWestern Cape noma eCape Town intsha futhi izisukumele. Abanye bazimisela ukuthi balwisane nalokhu. E-Eldorado Park bakhe amakomidi, amakodi esitaladi noma amakomidi endawo. E-Eersterust

PAGE: 142 of 198

bazisukumele bona bacela ukuyiswa kuzikhungo ezilaphayo. Lana e-Western Cape nabo futhi bazisukumele bathi bazimisele ukulwa nezidakamizwa nokubulawa kwabantu. Enye into ebalulekile futhi ukuthi labantwana abasukumayo abasukumi ngoba beyi-ANC, ngoba beyi-DA ... [Kwaphela isikhathi.] (Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)

[The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: We agree that misbehaving is a result of poverty. That is why we said that gangsterism and drug addiction often happen where there is poverty. Those things are organised.

Secondly, we agree that the youth have challenges but if you look at Eldorado Park, Eersterust, and at the Western Cape, or Cape Town, it is new, but they stood up for themselves. Some of them are willing to fight against this. At Eldorado Park, they formed committees, street committees, or local committees. In Eersterust, they volunteered themselves and asked to be taken to rehabilitation centers. In the Western Cape and here, they stood up themselves and said they are willing to fight against drugs and the killing of people. What is important is that these children who are volunteering are not volunteering because they are members of the ANC or the DA ... [Time expired.]]

PAGE: 143 of 198

Ms E R WILSON: House Chair, Minister, it is common knowledge that the Western Cape currently runs six facilities dedicated to providing treatment for alcohol and drug addiction. They run in accordance with the Matrix Model of treatment. The City of Cape Town is also providing clinic and community health centres, which assist with the treatment for the addiction. They have even developed specialised crime prevention units focusing on priority crimes, such as gangsterism.

Yet, in Limpopo, a rehabilitation centre completed two years ago has not opened due to operational costs not being budgeted for. In line with your commitment, last month, to spend three months intensively dealing with these issues and those raised by the CDA, please advise what progress has been made in bringing the other provinces to the same level as the Western Cape. Thank you. [Interjections.]

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZOKUTHUTHUKISWA KOMPHAKATHI: Kumele ngempela ukuthi i-Western Cape ibe nohlelo olunje. Okwesibili, uhulumeni wenze isibophezelo wakha izikhungo iNingizimu Afrika yonke ngoba kukhona izindawo ekade zingenazo izikhungo. Okunye ilungu elihloniphekile uWilson uyasazi isabelo sezimali ukuthi sihamba kanjani. Yilona ikomidi okumele lisincedise ngoba sibikile kulona ukuthi inkinga yokuthi singaqali ngezinhlelo zethu

PAGE: 144 of 198

eLimpopo ukuthi sinikiwe imali yezakhiwo kodwa imali yohlelo lweshakhiwo ayikho. Uma ngabe ungaqala isakhiwo ungalandeli inqubo ekufanele ukuthi ... [Ubuwelewele.] (Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)

[The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: The Western Cape must really have such a programme. Secondly, government has taken up a responsibility to build institutions around South Africa because there were places which did not have institutions.

Another thing, the hon member Wilson knows how the Budget works. The committee is supposed to help us because we reported to them the problem of why we have not started with our programmes in Limpopo. It is because we have been given the money but there is no funding for building the structure. If you were to start a building without following proper procedures that ...

[Interjections.]]

Also, Mrs Wilson ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Minister, just address the Chairperson and do not get distracted by the interjections.

PAGE: 145 of 198

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Sihlalo, okunye okubalulekile ukuthi ngaphezu kwezakhiwo ... [Chairperson, what is also important is that, besides the institutions ...]

... there are organisations that the government is funding that are driving the programme on alcohol and substance abuse throughout the country. What is also important is that

... sifuna wonke umuntu osebenza ngalolu daba abhalise abesemthethweni. Asebenze namaKomidi Alwisana nokusetshenziswa kweziDakamizwa kungakhiwa ezinye izakhiwo ezibheke eceleni ezenza ezinye izinto uhulumeni angavumelani nazo, ezidulayo futhi ezithatha abantwana isikhathi esincane bese bephinda bebuyela emuva. [Kwaphela isikhathi.]

Mnu M HLENGWA: Sihlalo, Malandela bengicela leyo yokusetshenziswa kwezidakamizwa kanye nalemigulukudu okhuluma ngayo yenza omkhulu umonakalo le emphakathini yakithi, ikakhulukazi ezindaweni zasemakhaya lapho zingekho khona nezikhungo zamaphoyisa. Lokhu okwenza ukuthi imigulukudu le bese iyaluza kalula nje nangokushesha. Manje ke inkinga ukuthi emakhaya kukhona ogogo abahlala bodwa nezingane ezihlala zodwa bese bezithuka ke bazithole beyizisulu zokudlwengulwa nodlame. Ngabe uyakuthola yini ukwesekwa okwanele kulezi zinhlelo

okhuluma ngazo zokuqinisekisa ukuthi ezokuphepha ezindaweni zasemakhaya zifike ezingeni elifanele ukuze ikakhulukazi laba abakhulile kanye nezingane ezihlala zodwa bengazitholi sebeyizisulu zodlame? (Translation of isiZulu paragraphs follows.)

[... we want everyone who is working in this project to be registered legally. We want them to work with the Local Drug Action Committee and not establish new institutions that are not in alignment with government, which are expensive, and which cannot be a relief system for a short while and thereafter, the children revert to their old ways. [Time expired.]

Mr M HLENGWA: Chairperson, Malandela [Clan name.], on the issue of drug abuse and the criminals you are referring to, they are a big distraction in our communities, especially in the rural areas where there are no police facilities. This, then, results in these criminals being on the loose easily and more quickly. Now, the problem is that in the rural areas, there are grandmothers who live by themselves and young children who stay on their own and then they are insulted and become the victims of rape and violence. Are you getting enough support on the issues that you are addressing with regard to ensuring that safety in the rural areas reaches the required level so that

especially, the elderly and the children who stay on their own do not become victims of violence?

PAGE: 147 of 198

Secondly, hon Minister, idle hands are the devil's playground and with the increasing level of unemployment in the country, which is at 26,7%, surely, there is a link between the two? What interventions are you making to impress on the government to ensure that the economy grows, it creates jobs, and to deal with this particular problem? [Time expired.]

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZOKUTHUTHUKISWA KOMPHAKATHI: Ngiyabonga kakhulu, lungu elihloniphekile, izinhlelo lezi ilungu elibuza ngazo zokulwa nokungaqashwa kwabantu singabuya singuMnyango sizozethula lapha ngoba sinazo izinhlelo zomasibambisane.

Okwesibili, amaphoyisa uma ngabe sesikhuluma iqiniso yiwona empeleni abambe iqhaza elikhulukazi isibonelo ezindaweni zasemakhaya la sihlala kuzona kunezimboni lapho kubhakwa khona izidakamizwa - amaphoyisa azitholayo. Kodwa futhi naphansi ezindaweni la sixakeke khona amaphoyisa into aseyenzile ejwayelekile uma kunesiteshi samaphoyisa njengase-Eldorado Park yakekwa kwalethwa abantu abakhethekile abazobhekana nayo lenkinga yezidakamizwa. Umsebenzi obalulekile esifanele siwenze sonke ukwenza isiqiniseko ukuthi amaKOmidi Alwisana

PAGE: 148 of 198

nokusetshenziswa kweziDakamizwa akhona yonke indawo lasihlala khona ukuze sizosebenza sonke ukuvikela umphakathi. Kumele sisho nje futhi ukuthi akufuneki vele ukudlwengulwa kogogo nentsha. Yinto okumele kulwiswane nayo kakhulu leyo. Ngiyabonga. [Ihlombe.] (Translation of isiZulu paragraphs follows.)

[The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you very much, hon member, the programmes for fighting the unemployment of people that the hon member is asking about, we, as the department, can come back to present them here because we have the co-operative programmes.

Secondly, if we are being honest, the police are playing a vital role especially, for example, in the rural areas where we stay, there are factories that manufacture drugs — it is the police who discovers them. Again, in areas where we stay, there is now a common thing that if there is a police station, like in Eldorado Park, specialists were brought there to deal with this drug problem. The important job that we must all do is to make sure that we ensure that the Local Drug Action Committees are available in all areas so that we can protect the community. We must say that grandmothers and the youth should not be raped. It is something we must really fight. Thank you. [Applause.]]

PAGE: 149 of 198

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: House Chairperson, I rise on a point of order It is with regard to Question 316: What Rule establishes this trend of not mentioning the names of the people who are being asked about in questions? The detail of the question is about the illegal removal of a certain person, and then it states, "name furnished".

We do not know what is happening. What is the name of the person? If you cannot mention that, it must at least be explained to us what Rule states that we must not mention people's names. Parliament is supposed to be the freest space in terms of asking questions ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Thank you, hon member.

 $\operatorname{Mr}$  N F SHIVAMBU: ... where we are being protected in terms of the Rules.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon members, in terms of the Rules, when it comes to questions of this nature, it is a standard operating procedure in Parliament that the names of those individuals, especially those that are currently under scrutiny and investigation, are not mentioned in the question,

PAGE: 150 of 198

for the specific reason that no final conclusion has been reached on the matter.

It can seriously prejudice the individual, or individuals, or the bodies concerned, if their names are inserted into those questions, and it can even jeopardise the work that is being done by the relevant authorities in finalising the matter.

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: Chairperson, I asked for the specific Rule that establishes that practice. I thought that when we dealt with the Rules process, we were dealing with the principle that we must not rely on people's memories, that this is the memory of how things are done. Can we be shown the Rule that states that names cannot be mentioned?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Thank you, hon member.

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: Then we will, at least, know and understand why you don't mention the names. You are excluding the rest of us, who have not been furnished with their names and the details.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Shivambu, you have made the point.

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: It is wrong to disadvantage us. So, give us the names, or give us the Rule. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Shivambu, you have made your point. Thank you.

Hon members, it is impossible, in the Rules of the National Assembly, or of the Joint Houses of Parliament, to insert all Parliamentary practices. That is why, very often, the Chief Whip of the Opposition refers to the Rules of Procedure and the Guide to Procedure into the Rules. That is succinctly captured in the Guide to Procedure. However, if the hon member feels very strongly about the matter, I suggest that he takes it up with the Rules Committee and argues the point there.

Particulars regarding completion of Public Protector's investigation into alleged illegal removal of person from delegation to Lesotho Highlands Water Project Commission

316. Mr L J Basson (DA) asked the Minister of Water and Sanitation:

Whether, since her reply to Oral Question 103 on 24 August 2016, the Public Protector's investigation into

her alleged illegal removal of a certain person (name furnished) from the delegation to the bi-national Lesotho Highlands Water Project Commission has been completed; if not, by what date will it be completed; if so, (a) why did she allegedly remove the specified person illegally from the specified position and (b) what was the total settlement cost to her department in this regard?

The MINISTER OF WATER AND SANITATION: Uthanda izindaba. [You like gossip.]

Presiding officer and hon members, yes, the investigation by the then Public Protector has since been concluded. Due to the delays attributable to the Office of the Public Protector during Thuli's time, once the report was finalised by the office, said individual actually served her contract until its termination, on 11 October 2016.

The findings of the Public Protector on the compensation payable, retrospective to 5 May 2009, was quantified at a total gross amount of R2,5 million and was found to be due and payable to her. Upon receipt of a tax directive from the SA Revenue Service, Sars, on 14 November, an amount of R1,4 million was paid. Payment of this amount did not constitute a buy-out, as

PAGE: 153 of 198

the member excitedly alleges, but it was obligatory for the department and the Trans-Caledon Tunnel Authority, TCTA, to make the necessary adjustment so that it was consistent with her extra responsibilities. Thank you.

Mr L J BASSON: Chairperson and Minister, documents in my possession state that on 13 May 2015, after a meeting in Durban, it is alleged that Mrs Mashile-Nkosi mentioned and I quote, that you, Minister, were under pressure from Number One - being the President of South Africa - to secure some of the tenders to him on the Lesotho Highlands Project Phase II.

Minister, is it not true that Dr Zodwa Dlamini frustrated you, as you could not implement Number One's instructions to secure tenders, and that is why you removed her as a commissioner?

[Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF WATER AND SANITATION: Chair, I did not institute the investigation. All those issues that you are mentioning here, that you think are exciting, were investigated by Thuli Madonsela. Upon her investigation, she did not find anything warranting any judgment against me or anyone that Dr Dlamini had actually referred to. As I am speaking to you ...

PAGE: 154 of 198

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Minister ... In terms of which Rule are you rising, hon member?

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: Rule 92.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): What is your point of order?

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: Chair, could Adv Thuli Madonsela be referred to as "Adv Thuli Madonsela"? We know you have challenges of school there, but at least, respect people. She is "Adv Thuli Madonsela" and she has brought down a President who cannot be trusted by his own Cabinet. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Can you take your seat, please? Thank you, hon member. Take your seat, hon member. That is not a point of order. [Interjections.]

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: You must respect her. If you people defend Zuma in the national executive committee, NEC ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member! I am now going to switch off your microphone. Can you sit down? Hon

PAGE: 155 of 198

members, order! Hon members! Hon Minister, can you continue? And please address me, hon Minister.

The MINISTER OF WATER AND SANITATION: Chair, they say, desperate times require desperate measures and that is exactly what we are seeing here today. The former Public Protector investigated, the case is closed, there is nothing untoward. Regarding the gossip that is being brought in here, she could not find any wrongdoing on my side, including with those individuals that are referred to. The matter is closed. Desperate times require desperate measures. This is what is happening. [Applause.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Is there a follow-up question from the hon Baker? Hon members, I follow the screen in front of me. If you want to ask a follow-up question, what you should do is indicate as soon as the Minister starts with the primary response. This is the guide that I follow. Hon Baker, continue.

Ms T E BAKER: Thank you, Chair. Minister, this is not gossip.

These are the findings in her report. In actual fact, Minister,

I would say that you are responsible for this fruitless

expenditure.

Will you, Minister, instruct the Auditor-General to determine the amount that you must pay back in the settlement to Dr Zodwa Dlamini? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF WATER AND SANITATION: Chair, desperate times require desperate measures. [Interjections.] There is nothing in that report. It is grandstanding and the peddling of lies. The case is closed.

These members serve in the committee. The report was presented.

I can't come here and reinvent myself and act beyond what the

Public Protector has said. The case is closed. Zodwa has gone.

And we are proceeding with Lesotho. Finished en klaar. [and done.]

Man N K BILANKULU: Mutshamaxitulu, hi ku landzelerisa ndzavisiso wa Thuli Madonsela, khale ka Musirheleri wa Vanhu, ku va wu fikile emakumu, hi yihi dyondzo leyi hi yi kumeke endzhaku ka ndzavisiso lowu? Nakambe, hi lava ku tiva leswaku hi kwihi ku cinca loku nga ta va kona ka matirhelo ku ya emahlweni. Ndzi hetelela hi ku vula leswi Holobye, ndzi huma eGiyani. A hi Giyani hinkwayo leyi pfumalaka mati ku ya hi leswi vanhu va yimaka laha ndzeni ka Yindlu leyi va vulavula hi swona. Hina hi tshamaka eGiyani ha swi tiva leswaku ku na miganga leyi nga na

PAGE: 157 of 198

mati na leyi yi pfumalaka mati. A hi ntiyiso leswaku Giyani yi pfumala mati. Inkomu. (Translation of Xitsonga paragraph follows.)

[Ms N K BILANKULU: Chairperson, following up on former Public Protector Thuli Madonsela's investigation, which has been finalised, what lessons can we learn from it? Furthermore, we would like to know what the changes are regarding operational matters, going forward. Lastly, let me say this, Minister, I am from Giyani. It is not the entire Giyani that lacks water, as some people suggest before this House. We who stay at Giyani know which villages have water and which do not. It is not true that Giyani lacks water. Thank you.]

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: On a point of order! On a point of order!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): What is your point of order, hon member, and in terms of which Rule is your point of order?

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: In terms of how they ... [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): In terms of which Rule are you raising the point of order?

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: I am rising on Rule 92, in terms of how you make follow-up questions ...

PAGE: 158 of 198

... mhani Bilankulu, mi nga jamuki mi vulavula hi le Giyani. Mi fanele mi vulavula hi leswi mi nga vutisa swona ntsena laha. Mi lava ku vulavula hi leswi swi nga ri ki swona. Ku vula leswaku ku pfumala mati eGiyani ... (Translation of Xitsonga paragraph follows.)

[... Ms Bilankulu, don't daydream and talk about Giyani. You should only talk about what you have been asked to, here. You want to talk about something that does not exist. By saying that there is lack of water at Giyani ...]

... you must not take advantage of that platform ... [Inaudible.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Shivambu, that is not a point of order. You can't prescribe to another member how to make a follow-up question. Please, take your seat. Take your seat. I am switching your microphone off now.

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: That is out of order for her to speak of something else ... [Interjections.]

PAGE: 159 of 198

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Take your seat! Hon members... [Interjections.]

Mr H P CHAUKE: Point of order!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Chauke, may you just take your seat, please?

Order, hon member! Hon members, you cannot prescribe to another member. We all cherish the principle of freedom of speech and it applies to all of us. It cannot be selectively applied. That is the view of the member. The Rules allow for the member to either make a statement and/or to ask a question, and that is what the hon member did. Hon Chauke, is it on the same point? Because I have ruled on the matter now.

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: But Chairperson ...

Mr H P CHAUKE: No, it is not on the same matter.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Shivambu, I have ruled on the matter.

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: I am rising on a point of order. You must read the Rules Book.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Take your seat, please.

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: ... but I want to refer to the Rules Book.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, hon member.

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: It says there must be consistency.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Shivambu, take your seat. Please, take your seat.

 ${\tt Mr}\ {\tt N}\ {\tt F}\ {\tt SHIVAMBU:}$  There must be consistency on the follow-up question.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): You can't prescribe to other members. It is completely out of order.

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: ... but you must read the Rule Book. Read the Rule Book!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): You wouldn't want that to happen to you - for another member to prescribe to you how a follow-up question must be asked. You are out of order.

[Interjections.]

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: Read the Rule Book.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Would you take your seat now, please? Please, take your seat. [Interjections.]

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: But we have Rules here.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, please, take your seat! Hon Chauke, are you rising on a different point of order? Because I have ruled on this matter.

Mr H P CHAUKE: That is correct, that is correct.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): In terms of which point of order?

Mr H P CHAUKE: I rise on Rule 92.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): That is just a point of order, it does not say anything.

PAGE: 162 of 198

Mr H P CHAUKE: Can you allow me to speak, please?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): What is the point of order, hon Chauke?

Mr H P CHAUKE: Chairperson, I rise on a point of order: It is unparliamentary for the hon Shivambu to refer to a member to be hallucinating. It is unparliamentary.

Mr T RAWULA: Order, Chair ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, hon member, can you take your seat. I am busy. In terms of the Rules ...

[Interjections.] ... hon members, in terms of the Rules ...

[Interjections.] Don't apply the Rules selectively. The Rules also indicate that when another member is on the floor on a point of order, you can't also get up on a point of order!

An HON MEMBER: He must tell us the Rule. Which Rule is he rising on?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Please, read the Rules and take your seat. Take your seat.

Mr H P CHAUKE: My point of order was in relation to an insinuation made by the hon Shivambu that the hon member here is hallucinating. He was speaking in Shangaan. So, it is unparliamentary to say a member is hallucinating in Parliament. I think it is not correct. I want you to make a ruling on that one.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Shivambu, did you say that? [Interjections.]

Mr N F SHIVAMBU: No, I did not, eh ...

... ndzi te va jamuka. [... I said she is daydreaming.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Alright, the hon member denies that he has said it. We will check the records and we will come back to make a considered ruling in that regard, alright? I want to get on with the question session.

[Interjections.] In terms of which Rule?

Ms H O HLOPHE: Chair, in terms of Rule 92.

PAGE: 164 of 198

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): What in terms of Rule 92? You see, this Rule 92 is just being bandied about and then, you say something else that has nothing to do with Rule 92.

Ms H O HLOPHE: Chair!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): What is it exactly, hon member?

Nk H O HLOPHE: Sihlalo, ngicela ukubuza nje, nawe uthathe isinqumo esingamvuni u-Shivambu ekhuluma isi-Venda. Uzwe ngani wena? Isi-Tsonga. Wena uzwe ngani? (Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)

[Ms H O HLOPHE: Chairperson, may I ask, you also took a decision that does not side with Shivambu when he spoke in Venda. How did you hear it is Tsonga? How did you hear?]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, I have dealt with this matter. I will come back and I will make a ruling.

An HON MEMBER: Tshivenda is one of the official languages in South Africa.

PAGE: 165 of 198

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member! Hon member at the back, you can't sit, grab the microphone, and say what you want to say. You are also in contravention of the same Rules. Order! Hon Minister, continue.

The MINISTER OF WATER AND SANITATION: Member Shivambu must taste his own medicine.

What I want to confirm, again, is that, as member Bilankulu has indicated, just as we have done in other areas, Lesotho is a sovereign country. It supplies water to South Africa. We must respect its sovereignty and its national interests, the same as with South Africa. Anyone who wants to make them junior to South Africa would be acting against our own policies, as the ANC-led government. We are all equals, and therefore, anything that works against that means you cannot be our representative. That is why we have acted on this matter, period.

Mr L J BASSON: Chairperson, I would like to know from the Minister: Why did she intervene and stop the tender process in Lesotho? You can laugh, Minister, but that is what you did. And why did you allow it to go out on tender again? Can you tell us why? Is it because you want LTE Consulting to tender because they did not tender the first time around? [Interjections.]

PAGE: 166 of 198

The MINISTER OF WATER AND SANITATION: Desperate times require desperate measures. [Interjections.] You think you want to cogovern. Firstly, anything, if anything flies against government policy, including the treaty and the regulations that have now been amended, we will not allow it to happen. We will not allow it to happen because we have agreed on a 50/50 policy with the people of Lesotho - that there will be 50% of South African companies and 50% of Lesotho companies.

Secondly, we can't also encourage those big companies that have perpetually benefited without the inclusion of those that are emerging. If you have a passion and an excitement for an individual company, the fact of the matter is that if there are no black-owned companies in any mega project, including emerging companies, we will stop it.

## Plans to ensure consensus between department, universities, and students so as to minimise protests

341. Mr M S Mbatha (EFF) asked the Minister of Higher Education and Training:

With reference to the Fees Must Fall protests of 2016, which demonstrated that his department learnt nothing from

PAGE: 167 of 198

the specified protests of 2015 (details furnished), what plans has his department put in place to ensure that there is consensus between his department, universities, and students to minimise protests for the 2017 academic year?

NO3169E

The MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION AND TRAINING: House Chairperson, the student protests erupted, once again, after I pronounced the government's 2017 fee support to students from poor, working, and middle-class families, and the recommendation on fee adjustments for the 2017 academic year.

It must be noted that students have, in the past, raised concerns around the inconsistencies in the determination of fee increments and demanded that I introduce legislation to regulate and standardise fees in universities.

The pronouncement on the recommended 8% fee adjustment was not an impetuous act. I requested the Council of Higher Education, CHE, which is a statutory body to the Minister, to provide advice on university fees for 2017. The CHE argued for the consumer price index, but I decided, after consulting with all the stakeholders, including university vice chancellors, council chairs, various student organisations, organised labour, faith

communities, political organisations, and government, to make the necessary pronouncement.

PAGE: 168 of 198

In the midst of the protests, and in an attempt to find resolutions, I convened meetings with all stakeholders. Further meetings, as I said, in an earlier question, are planned for December 2016 and January 2017 with all the stakeholders, again. As I have already said, my department will be meeting with the registrars to look into the issue of the beginning of next year.

I also need to say that, despite many attempts by my department and institutions to ensure a smooth start to the academic year, the biggest challenge still remains opportunists and other anarchists, who use legitimate student concerns to destabilise institutions for their own purposes. Thank you, Chair.

Mr M S MBATHA: House Chairperson, I was just wondering whose side the hon Minister was on over the weekend when they were discussing your President, but let's proceed. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order, hon members!

Mr M S MBATHA: You cannot kill the idea whose time has come. In 2017, students will still be demanding free higher education.

PAGE: 169 of 198

How prepared are you? How are you going to respond to them?

Because it is not for your department to defeat their dreams.

They are a generation and this is their struggle. What are you going to say to them?

UNGQONGQOSHE WEMFUNDO EPHAKEME NOKUQEQESHA: Ngiyabonga Sihlalo, ungabobuza izindaba ezingahlangene nawe? Kufana nokuthi ukhonze idlozi lakamakhelwane ubize lona ukuthi lizongena kwakho.

[Ihlombe.] [Uhleko.] Ungabizi idlozi lakwaNzimande ulibizela kwaMbatha ngoba ngeke lize. (Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)

[The MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION AND TRAINING: Thank you, Chairperson. Never put your nose in business that does not concern you? It is like worshipping your neighbour's ancestor; calling upon it to come to your house. [Applause.] [Laughter.] Do not call upon Nzimande's ancestor to come to Mbatha's house, because it is not going to come.]

Hon Chair, I did say that we have a road map. What is important about 2017 is that the Heher Commission is going to conclude its work. That is going to be a very important milestone. Many people have gone to this commission to give their views, and we still urge those who have not yet gone to go and give their

views, which will, hopefully, once the commission reports to the President, and the President, together with government, responds to that and settles, once and for all, the issue of how we finalise the introduction of free higher education for the poor. That is why ...

PAGE: 170 of 198

... sicela kubo bonke abantu bakithi: Abazali, abafundi kanye nabantu abathanda inqubekela phambili ukuthi bayekelele ijaji, umehluleli lo omkhulu ukuthi aqede umsebenzi wakhe. Labo abangafuni ukulinda lokhu yilabo abavele befuna uchuku lokuthi ukuthula kungabikhona ezikhungweni zethu zemfundo ephakeme ngoba sekuseduze la sifuna ukuthi sifike khona ukuze siqedelele wona lo msebenzi ekade sawuqala njengohulumeni kaKhongolose ngo-1994. Ngiyabonga Sihlalo. (Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)

[... we are pleading with all our people: Parents, students, and those who value progress, please leave the judge, the great arbitrator, to finish his work. Those who cannot wait are those who perpetuate the chaos in tertiary institutions, because we are about to finish the work which we, as the ANC-led government, started long ago, in 1994. Thank you, Chairperson.]

Prof B BOZZOLI: House Chair, Minister, it was recently reported that a number of student organisations went away on a luxury

PAGE: 171 of 198

weekend workshop to the Royal Hotel in Durban to discuss organising their protests for next year.

Minister, the presidential commission of inquiry - the Heher Commission, that you mentioned - is only due to submit its final report in July. How do you feel, knowing that the report will be far too late for any of its proposals to be implemented for 2017, or even 2018, and what are you going to do about it? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION AND TRAINING: House

Chairperson, I don't know anything about students gallivanting

at the Royal Hotel. It's not for me to know. Perhaps, the DA has

some details as to who those students are, and what they were

actually planning. [Interjections.]

We have been dealing with this matter, together with the Treasury. For instance, there are a number of measures that we have already taken for the next MTEF. We are acutely aware that we must not allow a gap to develop, but that must not detract from the fact that, because the commission is going to report, it's going to be a very important milestone in itself. Thank you very much, Chair.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon members, the three hours allocated for questions has now expired. Outstanding replies received will be printed in the Hansard.

We will now take the questions that stood over from Wednesday, 16 November, in terms of Rule 138, and questions that were transferred from written to oral, in terms of Rule 146(1). An additional 30 minutes has been allocated for these questions.

## Statutory grounds for inviting National Director of Public Prosecutions to meeting at Luthuli House

266. Mr W Horn (DA) asked the Minister of Justice and Correctional Services:

On what statutory grounds did he rely when he invited the National Director of Public Prosecutions, Mr Shaun Abrahams, to a meeting at Luthuli House in Johannesburg, Gauteng? NO2903E

The MINISTER OF JUSTICE AND CORRECTIONAL SERVICES: Chairperson,

I thank the hon Horn for the question.

PAGE: 173 of 198

Section 179(6) of the Constitution and section 33(1) of the National Prosecuting Authority Act obligate the Minister of Justice and Correctional Services to exercise final responsibility over the National Prosecuting Authority, NPA. The National Prosecuting Authority, NPA, is required, in terms of its prosecution policy, to effectively co-operate with the police and other investigative agencies to enhance efficiency and efficacy of the criminal justice processes.

As the National Director is the head of the National Prosecuting Authority and vested with the constitutional responsibility to institute criminal proceedings on behalf of the state, the Minister deemed it appropriate that the National Director was best placed to brief the meeting on matters relevant to the violence that had erupted at institutions of higher learning in protest against the high fees at tertiary institutions under the Fees Must Fall campaign. I thank you.

Mr W HORN: Chair, through you to the Minister: You say that Mr Shaun Abrahams was best placed to brief this meeting. He, in typical hyperbolic manner, called this situation anarchy caused by the Fees Must Fall campaign. He assured us, and will you assure us that this meeting was not used to discuss the possible charges against the Minister of Finance, as this meeting was

only a day before the press conference where these charges were announced? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF JUSTICE AND CORRECTIONAL SERVICES: Chair, let me start by saying that, like in the Cinderella story, if it does not fit the shoe, it does not matter what you do to the foot. It will still not fit the shoe. The reality is the meeting and the people who were attending that meeting could not possibly have had anything to do with that particular matter.

The question of decisions to institute prosecution against any person is the preserve of the prosecuting authority, and nobody else. In terms of section 179, I exercise final responsibility, and in that regard, I had, prior to that, already received a briefing from the National Director of Public Prosecutions, NDPP, and, in turn, advised the President of the imminent decision. Thank you.

Adv G BREYTENBACH: House Chair, hon Minister, when you called the National Director to the meeting at Luthuli House, did you give any thought to the fact that you were crossing the line of the separation of powers and seriously compromising the perception, at least, of the independence of the NPA; and if not, why not?

Finally, could you just tell us, hon Minister, did the National Director ever get to his dental appointment?

PAGE: 175 of 198

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon members, I want to remind you, in terms of supplementary questions, you may only ask one supplementary question and not substitute the end with another few subsections.

The MINISTER OF JUSTICE AND CORRECTIONAL SERVICES: Chair, in any case, I didn't hear the second question. However, in relation to the first question, let me indicate that the hon member, who herself is not only a lawyer but a former member of the NPA, knows section 179(6) so well. It is clear and it is in black and white. The Minister responsible for the administration of justice exercises final responsibility over the prosecuting authority.

The Constitution would have, if it deemed it appropriate, not have made that kind of provision in relation to the prosecuting authority. For example, there is no such provision in relation to the judiciary. There is no such provision in relation to Chapter 9 institutions. The Constitution was deliberate in ensuring that the executive exercises final responsibility over the prosecuting authority. Well, you may have preferred

PAGE: 176 of 198

separation, but the Constitution deemed it otherwise. Thank you very much.

Mr M L W FILTANE: Hon Chair, through you to the hon Minister:
You used the words "could not", or "possibly", but I would
counter that by saying there was all the probability of
influence over the decision of the National Prosecuting
Authority. How would you counter that? Thank you.

The MINISTER OF JUSTICE AND CORRECTIONAL SERVICES: Thank you, Chairperson. Once again, may I repeat the Cinderella story? It doesn't matter how much you squeeze your foot into the glass shoe, it will simply not fit. Thank you very much.

Mr W HORN: Minister, in your answer, you refer to the fact that section 33 gives you final responsibility over the NPA.

Section 33, however, delineates your engagements, or your possible engagements, with the NDPP. It gives you the right to ask for information in respect of a specific case regarding any decisions taken by the NDPP or its directors, questions regarding prosecution policy, policy directives, the annual report, and the request for meetings with members of the prosecution services.

Which of these specific subsections of section 33 of the National Prosecuting Authority Act allowed you to request the Minister to a meeting at the head office of your political party?

The MINISTER OF JUSTICE AND CORRECTIONAL SERVICES: Chair, the hon member has just quoted it, saying that one of the subsections relates to specific matters under prosecution. There were instances of arson. There were instances of malicious damage to property of all kinds and many other criminal offences that had been committed under the auspices of this campaign.

The information was necessary to appraise the peace and security cluster of the full extent of the situation in order for government to exercise its responsibility of ensuring that stability was restored in the country. I thank you.

## Particulars regarding local and international travel undertaken by members of departmental delegations

71. Ms E R Wilson (DA) asked the Minister of Social Development: [Written Question No 2158]

30 NOVEMBER 2016 PAGE: 178 of 198

(a) What was the total amount that was spent on (i) local and (ii) international travel by her department in the 2015-16 financial year and (b) what is the breakdown of each trip undertaken in terms of (i) when the trip took place, (ii) the total number of persons who were part of the delegation, (iii) the cost of flights, (iv) the cost of accommodation, including which hotels were used, (v) the total subsistence and travel allowance approved for each member of each delegation on each trip, and (vi) the cost of special vehicles and/or chauffeur driven transport?

NO2478E

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Chairperson, let me, firstly, apologise because we don't have the answer to the first part of the question, which is the financial part. However, the international responsibility and obligations are here.

So, the department ... and we are going to provide the figures requested by the member.

The significant responsibility with regard to the international advancement of social, civil, and political rights ... Yes, that is how they are divided. Therefore, we serve in the

PAGE: 179 of 198

UN Commission on Population and Development because population and development is housed in Social Development.

We also serve on the UN Commission on Social Development. We play a role and negotiate in the international legal instruments which involve civil and political rights, such as the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, the Convention on the Rights of the Child, the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities, the Convention on the Rights of People ...

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: On a point of order ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Minister, please take your seat. Hon member, in terms of which Rule are you rising?

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: House Chairperson, I rise in terms of Rule 92. If you read Question 71, you will see that it specifically asks about information that has been requested.

Now, I understand that it is very difficult for Ministers to give answers to these things on the hop. However, this question was submitted three months ago and has already been held over,

PAGE: 180 of 198

which is why we are dealing with it today. The question deals with the 2015-16 financial year.

I fail to understand how the Minister can come to the House without the information. She's had months to get this information from her department. And now she's reading stuff that has absolutely nothing to do with what the question asks. Can she please give us the answer to the question?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Yes, the hon Minister did indicate that she did not have those figures. However, I am interested ... [Interjections.] No, don't shout at me! Don't shout at me! [Interjections.] If I respect you, please respect me. [Interjections.]

Hon Minister, you have indicated that the first part, in terms of the financial figures, is not available, and you went on to explain what those obligations are.

I am going to allow the Minister to continue. However, it is prudent that the rest of the information is tabled - not only sent to the relevant member, but also tabled to the Office of the Speaker, so that we can publish the reply to that part of

the question. The question is one that has stood over for some time.

Please continue, hon Minister. [Interjections.] Yes, hon member?

Mr M WATERS: Chairperson, I rise on a point of order in terms of Rule 92: This question is quite long. Nowhere in the question is the information requested that the Minister is giving. If I may read it? It asks for financial figures throughout. For example, what the total amount spent on ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, I've read the question.

Mr M WATERS: Well, if the Minister does not have any financial information to give to the hon Wilson, then there is nothing to answer. She has come here unprepared, once again.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon members ... [Interjections.] Hon Minister, is there anything else in your reply that speaks to the question that is on the Question Paper?

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: No, Chairperson. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Alright, we will formally write to the Minister so that we request, in terms of the Rules, that the details be provided to the Office of the Speaker and for that information to be published in the Announcements, Tablings and Committee Reports, ATC.

Mr T RAWULA: Chairperson, on a point of order: I think you must rule on this because the Minister is holding this House in contempt.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): I have just ruled, hon member.

Mr T RAWULA: What was she responding to if she does not have the answer? So, it means ...

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): I have already ruled!

Mr T RAWULA: ... she knew that she was not going to answer!

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon member, take your seat. I have already ruled on the matter.

Mr T RAWULA: Is this how we are being taken for a ride?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): I have ruled on the matter, hon member.

Hon Minister ... [Interjections.] Yes, hon member?

Mr M WATERS: Chair, on a point of clarity: You have asked the Minister to provide the information. Can you set a deadline by when we can expect that information? It has been over three months, and we are still waiting.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Yes, but unfortunately, the Rules are silent on that. However, that reply must reach the Office of the Speaker by the end of this term, which is next week, Wednesday. Hon Minister, please submit that information to the Office of the Speaker and we will publish it in the ATC for the benefit of all members.

Hon members, I will thus move on to Question 74.

Ms E R WILSON: Chair, I rise on a point of order: I appreciate your ruling and I thank you for setting a deadline. However, your ruling now denies us the opportunity to pose a follow-up question on the issue. May we please present a follow-up question?

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): You see, hon member, your own Chief Whip and Deputy Chief Whip have said that the information the Minister is providing is not relevant to the question because the question requires figures as an answer. I therefore do not know on what the follow-up question will be based if that information is not provided. I have also ruled that the reply to the question be tabled in the ATC.

I suggest, hon member, that, once you have read the reply by the hon Minister, you then decide whether you want to ask another question or embark on any other course of action allowed by the Rules to get additional information from the Minister.

I want to move to Question 74.

## Particulars regarding intentions of SA Social Security Agency vis à vis Net1, pending complete takeover of grant payments by Sassa

- 74. Ms B S Masango (DA) asked the Minister of Social Development: [Written Question No 2219]
  - (1) Whether the SA Social Security Agency, Sassa, intends to extend its (a) contract and/or (b) any sections of

its contract for the distribution of grants with Net1 before the specified contract terminates on 31 March 2017; if not, in each case, why not; if so, in each case, (i) have these intentions been communicated to (aa) the contractors and/or (bb) the officials of her department and (ii) what are the further relevant details;

(2) (a) what functions will (i) Sassa and (ii) Net1 carry out until a complete takeover of grant payments by Sassa and (b) who will be accountable for the functions carried out in each case?

NO2548E

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Hon Chair, the ruling of the court on the matter is that on 31 March, the tender will come to an end. Thank you.

The CHIEF WHIP OF THE OPPOSITION: Hon House Chairperson, on a point of order: Again, if one looks at the substance of the question, the Minister's response does not relate to it, whatsoever. There is a specific request in (i) and (ii).

Again, I accept that this is a difficult question in terms of putting it in oral form, but that is why these were written

PAGE: 186 of 198

questions, originally. The Minister did not bother to respond.

She cannot get out of it by now coming into the House and giving this sort of farcical response. It does not speak to the question at all.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon Minister, in terms of your response, is there any additional information that you wish to divulge in terms of this question? Please sit. Hon members it was a written question, as the hon member has said. So, it requires a lot of information. However, hon Minister, I would request you to respond to the gist of the question, please, which deals with the expiry of the contract, and all the subsequent questions, then, are related to that.

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZOKUTHUTHUKISWA KOMPHAKATHI: Sihlalo, okokuqala sichazile lapha ekuqaleni kade siphendula umbuzo ophathelene nalo. Ngokomthetho wenkantolo inkontileka iyaphela mhla zingama-31.

Okwesibili, sasho ukuthi sesiyazi ukuthi kufanele senzeni ngoba inkantolo sasikade siyinikeze izinhlelo eziyisikhombisa zama ... (Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)

PAGE: 187 of 198

[The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Chairperson, firstly, we did explain earlier on when we were replying to a question relating to this one. According to the order of the Constitutional Court, the contract ends on the 31st.

Secondly, we did say that we now know what needs to be done, because we have been given the court programme of seven ...]

... deliverables that deal with integration of systems, biometric verification and authentication, payment processing, payment infrastructure, cash distribution and security, card issuance, special accounts, and payment reconciliation.

Uma ngabe sesiyohlala phansi sesinikezwa imibono yiKomidi Elelulekayo sesibheka nomsebenzi ozokwenziwa ama-work stream, kwavela indaba yengqalasizinda okuyiyona ebalulekile, ukuhlanganisa umsebenzi wemininingwane, ukubhalisa kabusha ababethi yindavundavu kodwa sayenza sayiqeda futhi ... (Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)

[When we were discussing this and recommendations were put forward by the advisory committee and we were considering the work that is going to be done by the work stream, it was clear that the issue of the infrastructure is very important. The

collection of biometric data and the taking over of the enrolment process, which they were saying is useless, but we did it and completed it and ...]

... identity and access management programme of the officials; ways of fraud risk and cyberassurance programme; web-enabled platform programme; biometric enrolment programme; integrated customer care; new and improved process programme; alternative pay point programme; and supply chain management readiness programme.

Emva kwaloko sabona ukuthi ubude besikhathi esasisibekile angeke size sikwazi ukusigcina. Namhlanje sethule kwikomidi lesiShayamthetho ukuthi angeke sikwazi ukugcina ubude bezikhathi ezinye kodwa into esifuna ukuthi sikwazi ukuyenza ukusheshisa uhlelo luhlanganiswe ukuze u-Sassa akwazi ukuqala ukwenza umsebenzi. Okunye sishilo sathi angeke sikwazi ukukwenza okufana nokuvikela imali. Angeke sikwazi thina ukuvikela imali. Kunabanye abantu abaqeqeshiwe ngokuthi bakwazi ukuvikela imali. Kepha njengamanje ama-work streams ahleli phansi ayawenza futhi awubhekile umsebenzi. Yilowo umbiko esinawo njengamanje, ngaphandle kwalokho sizoba nenkinga yokuthi sikhulume la abanye babe nethuba elingelihle nohlelo lwethu lubukisiswe ngeso lokhozi ngoba sesikhulume ezinye ezinto obekufuna ukuthi zibe

yingxenye yezinto esizozenza uma ngabe sesikhangisa ithenda.
Ngiyabonga. (Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)

[After that, we realised that we were not going to meet the set timeframe. Today, we are reporting to the committee that we are not going to meet the set timeframe but also, what we want to be able to do is to speed up the programme formation so that Sassa can begin with the work. We also said that we are not going to be able to do anything with regard to money protection. We cannot protect the money. Currently, the work streams are working and taking care of the job. That is the report we have for now, otherwise, we will have a problem because we will talk here and others will see an opportunity to scrutinise because we will be talking about the things that are supposed to be part of the advertisement of the tender. Thank you.]

Ms B S MASANGO: Hon Chair, as usual, the Minister has not answered the question. [Interjections.] She has not answered the question and this is the reason why we have this question in Questions for Oral Reply today. We have tried many times to ask the very simple question: Is the agency going to allow Cash Paymaster Services, CPS, to continue with the grant payments from 1 April 2017?

That question has been asked in many forums, many times, and at each of those times, no answer has been given. One is hoping that the Minister, today, at least, will be able to do that.

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZOKUTHUTHUKISWA KOMPHAKATHI: Yiziphi izinkundla eziningi. Amaphepha! Ngoba amaphepha akhathazekile ngale nto.

Lapha abantu abamelwe ukuthi sikhathazeke ngabo abantu abampofu.

[Ubuwelewele.] (Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)

[The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: Which "many forums"?

Newspapers! Because the media are worried about this thing. In this case, the people we are supposed to be worried about are the poor people. [Interjections.]]

Ms B S MASANGO: Hon House Chair, on a point of order: I just want to answer the Minister's question about the forum - it is not the media. [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, hon member, you do not have to.

Ms B S MASANGO: She is asking, Chair. She is asking, "Which forums?"

PAGE: 191 of 198

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, no, take your seat, hon member. The Minister is replying.

Ms B S MASANGO: No, she did not answer. She just asked me.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): No, hon member, no. Take your seat, please. Hon Minister, will you conclude, please?

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZOKUTHUTHUKISWA KOMPHAKATHI: Sengiphetha, ngiphetha ngokuthi zonke izinyathelo zohlelo lokukhokha kabusha wonke umuntu uzozazi uma ngabe sizenza. Uma sinenkinga sizoza futhi sizobika ngoba akufuneki sishaye ingathi umsebenzi olula lona. Akuwona umsebenzi olula lona, umsebenzi onzima lona futhi asifuni ukuza nezixazululo ezingeke zisisize. [Ubuwelewele.] Ningabhenguzisa, nisho yonke into eniyishoyo kodwa ... (Translation of isiZulu paragraph follows.)

[The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: I am going to conclude by saying that all the necessary steps for the new payment system will be communicated to all when they are implemented. If we encounter problems, we will also come back and report, because we do not want to act as though this is an easy job. This is not an easy job; this is a difficult job and we do not want to take

resolutions that are not going to help us. [Interjections.] You can shout and say all you want to say but ...]

... the fact of the matter is that we do not want to come here and say things that we will not be able to do. Thank you.

Nks N V MENTE: Sihlalo, umbuzo wam kuMphathiswa ulula kakhulu. Uthethe kuqala nge-phase in kunye ne-phase out. Umntu ohleli ekhaya unexhala, ingakumbi aba basezilalini, lokuba le mali iza kufika kusini na kuye? Ngoko ke, ndithatha ngokuba le ngcaciso ubuyenza ngoku ngu-phase in no-phase out. Kodwa ngolu hlobo ndikumamele ngalo ingathi uthetha ngamaphepha eniwenza ngaphakathi e-ofisini, awuthethi ngomntu oza kuhamba nale mali iye kufika elalini; awuthethi ngoonogada eniza kubaqasha; awuthethi ngabantu abaninzi ekufuneka beqashiwe bokuncedisa, iimoto nayo yonke into ekufanele ukuba nibe nayo. Ungakhe usicacisele ukuba yonke le nto ikhankanywe apha ngasentla seyikhona kusi na. (Translation of isiXhosa paragraph follows.)

[Ms N V MENTE: Hon Chairperson, my question to hon Minister is very easy. Firstly, she spoke about phase in and phase out.

People are anxious at home, especially those in the rural areas.

They do not know whether they will get the money or not.

Therefore, I take it as if the explanation you made was phase in

PAGE: 193 of 198

and phase out. But when I'm listening to you, it's like you talk of documents that you compile in the office; you don't talk about someone who will take this money to the villages; you don't talk about security officers that you will employ; you don't talk about many people who need to be employed to assist, cars, and everything that you will need. Can you please clarify for us whether everything that is mentioned above is available?]

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZOKUTHUTHUKISWA KOMPHAKATHI: Ngithini ngezimoto?

Ngithini ngokuqasha ezokuphepha ngoba angiyena ungcweti

kwezokuphepha. Kungenjalo zonke izinyanga kuzodutshulwa abantu
ngoba izigebengu zifuna ukuthatha imali.

Okwesibili, angisazi ukuthi yini ekufanele siyisho ngaphandle kokuthi amalungu ahloniphekile afuna ukukhipha amanzi etsheni kepha amanzi awaphumi etsheni. Lokhu esizama ukukuchaza umsebenzi esesiwenzile. Ngiyabonga. (Translation of isiZulu paragraphs follows.)

[The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: What must I say about the cars? What must I say about employment for safety? Because I am not a safety expert. Otherwise, every month, we will have cases where people are hijacked and shot by the criminals wanting money.

PAGE: 194 of 198

Secondly, I don't know what else we ought to say because the hon members want to hear what they want to hear and not what we are telling them. What we are explaining here is the progress we have made. Thank you.]

Ms L L VAN DER MERWE: House Chairperson, hon Minister, I think this is a very important issue, because 1 April 2017 is around the corner. Your department is not ready. You have admitted as such. You told the Standing Committee on Public Accounts that you only have a wish that Sassa will be ready to pay out the grants. You are not willing to admit that you will extend CPS's contract.

My question is: If you are not ready to pay out grants and you are not willing to tell us that CPS will continue paying out grants, and then who will be paying out grants? What is your plan of action? What is your fall-back plan?

Also, the problem is that the contract with CPS was declared invalid by the Constitutional Court in 2014. You have had three years to fix this problem but still, you have done nothing. The same company has been stealing our people's money - CPS and Net1. If you extend that contract, they will continue stealing

30 NOVEMBER 2016 PAGE: 195 of 198

our people's money. What are you going to do? What is your plan? [Interjections.]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order, hon members!

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZOKUTHUTHUKISWA KOMPHAKATHI: Inkinga enkulu ukuthi sithanda ukuziphinda. Le nto ilungu elihloniphekile eliyishoyo liyishilo futhi ekuqaleni kade likhuluma. Inkatha yeNkululeko Yesizwe iyazi ukuthi izibonelelo yayizikhokhela ngokheshi - inika abantu ukheshi asiqale lapho. [Ubuwelewele.]

Okwesibili ... (Translation of isiZulu paragraphs follows.)

[The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: The problem here is that we like repeating ourselves. What the hon member is saying, she said earlier when she was talking. Let us start here: The IFP knows that it was paying the social grants as cash - it was giving people cash. [Interjections.]

Secondly ...]

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Order, hon members!

PAGE: 196 of 198

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZOKUTHUTHUKISWA KOMPHAKATHI: ... bekune-Socpan engawa noma yinini. [Ubuwelewele.] Akulona iqiniso ukuthi besihlezi zingenzi lutho. Wonke umuntu ubejabule la ukuthi senze ukubhalisa kabusha kumnandi futhi songa nemali - manje asisasebenzi. Asisebenzi ngoba kumele sikhiphe ukuthi ngubani esizomsebenzisa. [Ubuwelewele.] Kunabasebenzi kahulumeni abangakwazi ukwenza umsebenzi. Ngithe mangiqala ngathi iNkantolo yoMthethosisekelo yathi kuze kube mhla zingama-31. Lokho sizimisele ukukuhlonipha. [Ubuwelewele.]

Nk M S KHAWULA: 31 zayiphi inyanga uDisemba? [Ubuwelewele.]

UNGQONGQOSHE WEZOKUTHUTHUKISWA KOMPHAKATHI: Cha, cha, Ma
ngikuthemba kabi ungenzi lento engiyenziwa yilaba. [Uhleko.]
Into ebalulekile ... (Translation of isiZulu paragraphs
follows.)

[The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: ... there was a Socpan, which can collapse anytime. [Interjections.] It is not true that we were not doing anything. Everybody was happy that we made the enrolment process easy and that we saved money - now we are inefficient. We are inefficient because we must disclose who is going to be the service provider. [Interjections.] There are government employees who are inefficient. When I started, I said

that the Constitutional Court said we have until the 31st. We are willing to honour that. [Interjections.]

Ms M S KHAWULA: The 31st of which month? December, perhaps? [Interjections.]

The MINISTER OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT: No, no, hon member, I trust you; don't do what these people are doing. [Laughter.] What is important ...]

... is that there is work in progress and we are prepared to rise to the occasion. Most of us here know that we have been able to rise to the occasion and we are not arrogant about that. We understand the challenges that we are facing. All of us here understand those challenges. Thank you very much.

The HOUSE CHAIRPERSON (Mr C T Frolick): Hon members, the additional time that has been set aside for these questions has now expired.

The House adjourned at 18:38.

See also QUESTIONS AND REPLIES.

## ANNOUNCEMENTS, TABLINGS AND COMMITTEE REPORTS

PAGE: 198 of 198

Please click on the following link to access the relevant Announcements, Tablings and Committee Reports for this day.

https://www.parliament.gov.za/parliamentary-papers?sorts[date]=-1