## **Prospect Theory**For Risk and Ambiguity

Peter P. Wakker



## Contents

|  | Preface   | page XIII |
|--|---|-----------|
|  | Introduction  | 1         |
| Part I   | Prospect theory   | 2         |
|  | Behavioral foundations  | 2         |
|  | Homeomorphic versus paramorphic modeling                          | 3         |
|  | Intended audience   | 3         |
|  | Attractive feature of decision theory                             | 4         |
|  | Structure   | 4         |
|  | Preview   | 5         |
|  | Our five-step presentation of decision models                     | 7         |
| Part I   | Expected utility  |           |
| 1 The general model of decision under uncertainty and no-arbitrage |   |           |
|  | (expected utility with known utilities and unknown probabilities) | 11        |
|  | 1.1 Basic definitions   | 11        |
|  | 1.2 Basic properties of preferences                               | 15        |
|  | 1.3 Expected value  | 17        |
|  | 1.4 Data fitting for expected value                               | 19        |
|  | 1.5 The bookmaking argument of de Finetti, or the no-arbitrage    |           |
|  | condition from finance  | 22        |
|  | 1.6 A behavioral foundation of subjective probabilities and       |           |
|  | expected value using no-arbitrage and no-book                     | 27        |
|  | 1.7 Discussion of Structural Assumption 1.2.1 (Decision           |           |
|  | under uncertainty)  | 32        |
|  | 1.8 The general nature and usefulness of behavioral foundations   | 34        |
|  | 1.9 Appendix: Natural, technical, and intuitive preference        |           |
|  | conditions, and the problematic completeness condition            | 37        |
|  | 1.10 Appendix: The relation of Theorem 1.6.1 to the literature    | 39        |
|  | 1.11 Appendix: Proof of Theorem 1.6.1 and Observation 1.6.1'      | 41        |
|  |   |           |

| 2 | 2 Expected utility with known probabilities – "risk" – |   |     |  |
|---|--|---|-----|--|
|   | and  | d unknown utilities   | 44  |  |
|   | 2.1  | Decision under risk as a special case of decision               |     |  |
|   |  | under uncertainty   | 44  |  |
|   | 2.2  | Decision under risk: basic concepts                             | 47  |  |
|   | 2.3  | Decision under risk as a special case of decision under         |     |  |
|   |  | uncertainty; continued  | 48  |  |
|   | 2.4  | Choices under risk and decision trees                           | 51  |  |
|   | 2.5  | Expected utility and utility measurement                        | 53  |  |
|   | 2.6  | Consistency of measurement and a behavioral foundation          |     |  |
|   |  | of expected utility   | 57  |  |
|   | 2.7  | Independence and other preference conditions for                |     |  |
|   |  | expected utility  | 63  |  |
|   | 2.8  | Basic choice inconsistencies                                    | 65  |  |
|   | 2.9  | Appendix: Proof of Theorem 2.6.3 and Observation 2.6.3'         | 67  |  |
| 3 | Ap   | plications of expected utility for risk                         | 69  |  |
|   | 3.1  | An application from the health domain: decision tree analysis   | 69  |  |
|   | 3.2  | Risk aversion   | 71  |  |
|   | 3.3  | Applications of risk aversion                                   | 74  |  |
|   | 3.4  | Indexes of risk aversion  | 77  |  |
|   | 3.5  | Parametric families of utility                                  | 78  |  |
|   | 3.6  | Data fitting for expected utility under risk                    | 83  |  |
|   | 3.7  | Multiattribute utility  | 85  |  |
|   | 3.8  | Taxation and welfare theory with cardinal utility               | 91  |  |
|   | 3.9  | Proofs for Chapter 3  | 92  |  |
| 4 | Ex   | pected utility with unknown probabilities and                   |     |  |
|   | unl  | known utilities   | 94  |  |
|   | 4.1  | Fifteen preference questions                                    | 94  |  |
|   | 4.2  | (Subjective) expected utility                                   | 100 |  |
|   | 4.3  | Measuring utility and testing EU for §4.1                       | 103 |  |
|   | 4.4  | A decision process  | 107 |  |
|   | 4.5  | General utility measurement and the tradeoff notation           | 108 |  |
|   | 4.6  | A behavioral foundation of expected utility                     | 110 |  |
|   |  | Further discussion of Theorem 4.6.4 (Uncertainty-EU)            | 112 |  |
|   | 4.8  | Further implications of expected utility                        | 114 |  |
|   |  | 4.8.1 Savage's sure-thing principle                             | 114 |  |
|   |  | 4.8.2 Utility analysis based on t-indifferences                 | 115 |  |
|   |  | 4.8.3 Debreu's additive decomposability and state-dependent     |     |  |
|   |  | utility   | 117 |  |
|   | 4.9  | A hybrid case: subjective probabilities and utilities when also |     |  |
|   |  | objective probabilities are given                               | 118 |  |
|   |  | 4.9.1 A general ("single-stage") approach                       | 119 |  |

|   | Contents  | vii        |  |
|---|---|------------|--|
|   | 4.9.2 A behavioral foundation for the single-stage approach   | 120        |  |
|   | 4.9.3 The multi-stage approach of Anscombe &  | 100        |  |
|   | Aumann (1963) 4.9.4 Comparing the Anscombe & Aumann model with the  | 122        |  |
|   | single-stage approach   | 125        |  |
|   | 4.10 Data fitting for expected utility under uncertainty  | 127        |  |
|   | 4.11 A statistical analysis of the experiment of §4.1, revealing  |            |  |
|   | violations of expected utility  | 131        |  |
|   | 4.12 The Allais paradox: a well-known violation of expected utility   | 133        |  |
|   | 4.13 Appendix: Experimental economics' real-incentive principle   |            |  |
|   | and the tradeoff method   | 135        |  |
|   | 4.14 Appendix: Tradeoff consistency as a generalization of  |            |  |
|   | de Finetti's bookmaking   | 138        |  |
|   | 4.15 Appendix: Proofs for Chapter 4   | 139        |  |
| Part II   | Nonexpected utility for risk  |            |  |
| 5 Heuristic arguments for probabilistic sensitivity and |   |            |  |
|   | rank dependence   | 145        |  |
|   | 5.1 Probabilistic sensitivity versus outcome sensitivity for  |            |  |
|   | single-nonzero-outcome-prospects  | 145        |  |
|   | 5.2 Probabilistic sensitivity for multi-outcome prospects,  |            |  |
|   | and the old way of transforming probabilities   | 149        |  |
|   | 5.3 A violation of stochastic dominance   | 153        |  |
|   | 5.4 Rank-dependent utility: discovering the formula using   |            |  |
|   | psychological intuition   | 155        |  |
|   | 5.5 Rank-dependent utility: discovering the formula using   |            |  |
|   | mathematical intuition  | 161        |  |
|   | 5.6 Calculating rank-dependent utility  | 165        |  |
|   | 5.7 Conclusion  | 168        |  |
| 6   | Probabilistic sensitivity and rank dependence analyzed  | 169        |  |
|   | 6.1 Ranks, ranked probabilities, and rank-dependent utility defined   | 169        |  |
|   | 6.2 Ranks, ranked probabilities, and rank-dependent utility discussed   | 172        |  |
|   | 6.3 Where rank-dependent utility deviates from expected utility:  | 170        |  |
|   | optimism and pessimism  | 172        |  |
|   | 6.4 Further deviations of rank-dependent utility from expected utility  | 176        |  |
|   | 6.4.1 The certainty effect  | 176        |  |
|   | 6.4.2 Further discussion of rank dependence   | 178        |  |
|   | 6.5 What rank-dependent utility shares with expected utility 6.5.1 Measuring utility under rank-dependent utility | 181<br>181 |  |
|   | 6.5.2 A behavioral foundation of rank-dependent utility   | 184        |  |
|   | 6.5.3 An elaborated example   | 185        |  |
|   | 6.5.4 Abdellaoui's method of measuring probability weighting  | 188        |  |
|   | 6.5.5 Further implications of rank-dependent utility  | 188        |  |

|   | 6.6 Appendix: Yet further deviations of rank-dependent utility                      | 190 |
|---|---|-----|
|   | from expected utility   |     |
|   | 6.7 Appendix: Ranking identical outcomes and collapsing outcomes                    | 194 |
|   | 6.8 Appendix: An interpretation of rank-dependent utility using the derivative of w | 103 |
|   |   | 197 |
|   | 6.9 Appendix: RDU for continuous distributions and figures for                      | 100 |
|   | negative outcomes   | 199 |
| 7 | Applications and extensions of rank dependence                                      | 203 |
|   | 7.1 Likelihood insensitivity and pessimism as two components                        |     |
|   | of probabilistic risk attitudes   | 203 |
|   | 7.2 Parametric forms of weighting functions   | 206 |
|   | 7.3 Data fitting for rank-dependent utility under risk                              | 21  |
|   | 7.4 Direct ways to test convexity, concavity, and likelihood                        |     |
|   | insensitivity using violations of the sure-thing principle                          | 214 |
|   | 7.5 An alternative direct way to directly investigate properties                    |     |
|   | of nonlinear decision weights   | 217 |
|   | 7.6 Bad-news probabilities or loss-ranks  | 219 |
|   | 7.7 A formal definition of likelihood insensitivity (inverse-S)                     | 222 |
|   | 7.8 The choice of insensitivity region  | 226 |
|   | 7.9 Discussion of likelihood insensitivity  | 227 |
|   | 7.10 Indexes of pessimism and likelihood insensitivity                              | 229 |
|   | 7.11 Binary rank-dependent utility  | 230 |
|   | 7.12 Appendix: Alternative definition of likelihood insensitivity:                  |     |
|   | first concave and then convex   | 23  |
|   | 7.13 Appendix: Proofs for Chapter 7   | 233 |
| 8 | Where prospect theory deviates from rank-dependent utility and                      |     |
|   | expected utility: reference dependence versus asset integration                     | 234 |
|   | 8.1 A choice paradox  | 235 |
|   | 8.2 A discussion and the real culprit of the paradox                                | 236 |
|   | 8.3 Deviations from a fixed reference point ("initial wealth")                      |     |
|   | as nothing but an alternative way of modeling final wealth,                         |     |
|   | and of incorporating some empirical improvements                                    | 237 |
|   | 8.4 Loss aversion defined   | 238 |
|   | 8.5 Deviations from a variable reference point as a major                           |     |
|   | breakaway from final-wealth models  | 240 |
|   | 8.6 Rabin's paradox   | 242 |
|   | 8.7 Future directions for theories of reference dependence                          | 245 |
|   | 8.8 Appendix: Empirical meaningfulness problems of loss aversion                    | 24  |
|   | 8.9 Appendix: A formal model of initial wealth and reference                        |     |
|   | noints  | 240 |

| 9        | Prospect theory for decision under risk  | 251 |
|----------|--|-----|
|          | 9.1 A symmetry about 0 underlying prospect theory  | 251 |
|          | 9.2 The definition of prospect theory  | 252 |
|          | 9.3 Properties of the prospect theory formula, and calculations                                | 254 |
|          | 9.4 What prospect theory shares with rank-dependent utility                                    |     |
|          | and with expected utility, and one more reanalysis of the                                      |     |
|          | experiment of § 4.1  | 260 |
|          | 9.4.1 Monotonicity, stochastic dominance, and the sure-thing                                   |     |
|          | principle  | 260 |
|          | 9.4.2 Measuring utility, event weighting, and loss aversion                                    | 262 |
|          | 9.5 Empirical findings on prospect theory  | 264 |
|          | 9.6 Analytical problems of power utility for analyzing loss aversion                           | 267 |
|          | 9.6.1 The first problem: loss aversion depends on the  |     |
|          | monetary unit  | 267 |
|          | 9.6.2 The second problem: always $U(\alpha) > -U(-\alpha)$ for some                            |     |
|          | outcome $\alpha > 0$   | 270 |
|          | 9.6.3 Ways to avoid the problems   | 271 |
|          | 9.7 Appendix: Some theoretical issues concerning prospect theory                               | 271 |
|          | 9.8 Appendix: Original prospect theory of 1979   | 273 |
| Part III | Nonexpected utility for uncertainty  |     |
|          |  | 070 |
| 10       | Extending rank-dependent utility from risk to uncertainty                                      | 279 |
|          | 10.1 Probabilistic sophistication  | 279 |
|          | 10.2 Rank-dependent utility defined for uncertainty and without                                | 202 |
|          | probabilistic sophistication   | 282 |
|          | 10.3 Rank-dependent utility and probabilistic sophistication                                   | 286 |
|          | once more 10.3.1 Ellsberg's violation of probabilistic sophistication                          | 286 |
|          | 10.3.2 Further observations  | 287 |
|          | 10.3.2 Further observations  10.4 Where rank-dependent utility under uncertainty deviates from | 207 |
|          | expected utility in the same way as it did under risk  | 288 |
|          | 10.4.1 Optimism and pessimism  | 289 |
|          | 10.4.2 Likelihood insensitivity (Inverse-S)  | 290 |
|          | 10.4.3 Direct ways to test convexity, concavity, and likelihood                                |     |
|          | insensitivity using violations of the sure-thing principle                                     | 292 |
|          | 10.5 What rank-dependent utility shares with expected utility for                              |     |
|          | uncertainty (in the same way as it did for risk)   | 294 |
|          | 10.5.1 Rank-preference conditions  | 294 |
|          | 10.5.2 Measuring utility (and event weighting) under RDU                                       | 295 |
|          | 10.5.3 A behavioral foundation for RDU   | 297 |
|          | 10.6 Binary rank-dependent utility   | 298 |
|          |  |     |
|          | 10.7 A hybrid case: rank-dependent utility for uncertainty when                                |     |

Contents

ix

|    | 10.7.1 A general ("single-stage") approach                      | 299 |
|----|---|-----|
|    | 10.7.2 A behavioral foundation for the single-stage approach    | 300 |
|    | 10.7.3 Schmeidler's and Jaffray's two-stage approaches          | 301 |
|    | 10.8 Bad-news events or loss-ranks                              | 304 |
|    | 10.9 Further observations regarding rank dependence             | 305 |
|    | 10.10 Appendix: An integral representation                      | 309 |
|    | 10.11 Appendix: Ranking states and collapsing outcomes          | 310 |
|    | 10.12 Appendix: Comonotonicity                                  | 310 |
|    | 10.13 Appendix: Proofs for Chapter 10                           | 314 |
|    | 10.14 Appendix: Proof of Theorem 6.5.6                          | 316 |
| 11 | Ambiguity: where uncertainty extends beyond risk                | 317 |
|    | 11.1 The Ellsberg paradox and the home bias as within-subject   |     |
|    | between-source comparisons                                      | 317 |
|    | 11.2 Using rank dependence to analyze ambiguity                 | 318 |
|    | 11.3 Elaborated examples for ranks, ambiguity premiums,         |     |
|    | and hedging in finance  | 322 |
|    | 11.4 The CORE   | 323 |
|    | 11.5 Multiple priors (Maxmin expected utility and α-maxmin):    |     |
|    | basic results   | 324 |
|    | 11.6 Approaches in the literature that we will not take         | 327 |
|    | 11.7 Indexes of ambiguity aversion                              | 328 |
|    | 11.8 Indexes of ambiguity aversion and sensitivity              | 332 |
|    | 11.9 Appendix: Discussion of multiple priors and other models   | 335 |
|    | 11.10 Appendix: Violations of monotonicity for multiple priors  | 338 |
|    | 11.11 Appendix: Möbius transforms and belief functions          | 339 |
| 12 | Prospect theory for uncertainty                                 | 342 |
|    | 12.1 Prospect theory defined                                    | 342 |
|    | 12.2 Where prospect theory deviates from rank-dependent utility |     |
|    | and expected utility  | 344 |
|    | 12.3 What prospect theory shares with rank-dependent utility    |     |
|    | and expected utility under uncertainty                          | 344 |
|    | 12.3.1 Sign-preference conditions                               | 344 |
|    | 12.3.2 Measuring utility (and event weighting) under prospect   |     |
|    | theory  | 345 |
|    | 12.3.3 Measuring loss aversion under prospect theory            | 346 |
|    | 12.3.4 A behavioral foundation for prospect theory              | 347 |
|    | 12.4 A hybrid case: prospect theory for uncertainty when also   |     |
|    | objective probabilities are given                               | 349 |
|    | 12.5 Loss aversion versus ambiguity aversion                    | 349 |
|    | 12.6 Violations of prospect theory and rank dependence          | 350 |
|    | 12.7 Indexes of ambiguity attitudes under prospect theory       | 354 |

|    |   | Contents   | xi  |
|----|---|--|-----|
|    | 12.8 Append   | ix: Some theoretical issues concerning prospect theory |     |
|    | for unce  |  | 356 |
|    |   | ix: Proofs for Chapter 12                              | 357 |
|    |   |  |     |
| 13 | Conclusion  |  | 358 |
|    | Appendices  |  | 359 |
|    | Appendix A  | Models never hold perfectly: how to handle their       |     |
|    |   | deficiencies?  | 359 |
|    | A.1 Nonpa   | arametric measurements and parametric fittings for     |     |
|    | imper   | fect models: general discussion                        | 359 |
|    | A.2 Our di  | istance measure for parametric fitting                 | 361 |
|    | A.3 Discus  | ssion of the distance measure                          | 363 |
|    | Appendix B  | Choosing from multiple prospects and binary choice:    |     |
|    |   | the principles of revealed preference                  | 366 |
|    | B.1 Examp   | ples   | 367 |
|    | B.2 A behavioral foundation of preference relations derived |  |     |
|    | from o  | choice behavior  | 371 |
|    | B.3 Assum   | nptions underlying revealed preference                 | 374 |
|    | B.4 The hi  | story of revealed preference                           | 378 |
|    | Appendix C  | Dynamic decisions                                      | 380 |
|    | Appendix D  | Applications other than decision under uncertainty     | 384 |
|    | Appendix E  | Bisymmetry-based preference conditions                 | 387 |
|    | Appendix F  | Nonmonotonic rank-dependent models and the             |     |
|    |   | Fehr-Schmidt model of welfare evaluation               | 391 |
|    | Appendix G  | Extensions of finite-dimensional results to            |     |
|    |   | infinite-dimensional results: a meta-theorem           | 393 |
|    | Appendix H  | Measure theory   | 395 |
|    | Appendix I  | Related textbooks and surveys                          | 397 |
|    | Appendix J  | Elaborations of exercises                              | 399 |
|    | Appendix K  | Skipping parts and interdependencies between sections  | 455 |
|    | References  |  | 461 |
|    | Author index  |  | 492 |
|    | Subject index   |  | 500 |