

# PHRENITIS AND THE PATHOLOGY OF THE MIND IN WESTERN MEDICAL THOUGHT

Phrenitis is ubiquitous in ancient medicine and philosophy. Galen mentions the disease innumerable times, patristic authors take it as a favourite allegory of human flaws, and no ancient doctor fails to diagnose it and attempt its cure. Yet the nature of this once famous disease has not been understood properly by scholars. This book provides the first full history of phrenitis. In doing so, it surveys ancient ideas about the interactions between body and soul, both in health and in disease. It also addresses ancient ideas about bodily health, mental soundness and moral 'goodness', and their heritage in contemporary psychiatric ideas. Readers will encounter an exciting narrative about health, illness and care as embedded in ancient 'life', but will also be forced to reflect critically on our contemporary ideas of what it means to be 'insane'. This title is also available as open access on Cambridge Core.

CHIARA THUMIGER is a researcher in the Cluster of Excellence Roots, Christian-Albrechts Universität zu Kiel, Germany. She focuses on ancient Greek and Roman thought and literature, the history of ancient medicine and the history of psychiatry, as well as on comparative approaches to the anthropology of medicine and body history. She is the author of *A History of the Mind and Mental Health in Classical Greek Medical Thought* (Cambridge, 2017).



'A comprehensive account of the history of the concept of *phrenitis* has long been awaited. This monograph by Chiara Thumiger, a leading expert in the study of the history of mental health and illness, admirably fills this major gap.'

Philip van der Eijk, Humboldt University Berlin

'Chiara Thumiger's monumental study of *phrenitis* is not only an astonishingly erudite and refreshingly sophisticated guide to the ancient, post-classical, and even modern evidence for this perplexing, obsolete, but central medical term for mental illness. It never forgets the human patients, in their distress and anxiety, and the human doctors who do their best to understand and help them.'

Glenn Most, Scuola Normale Superiore, Pisa, and University of Chicago

'Chiara Thumiger's extraordinary book examines the history of the disease *phrenitis* from the fifth century BCE to its progressive disappearance in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries CE. Its *longue-durée* approach and its breadth bring to mind Owsei Temkin's *The Falling Sickness: A History of Epilepsy from the Greeks to the Beginnings of Modern Neurology*. The work draws upon a huge array of sources, both medical and non-medical, and deals sympathetically with the suffering of humans and non-human animals.'

Laurence Totelin, Cardiff University



# PHRENITIS AND THE PATHOLOGY OF THE MIND IN WESTERN MEDICAL THOUGHT

(Fifth Century BCE to Twentieth Century CE)

CHIARA THUMIGER

Cluster of Excellence Roots, Christian-Albrechts Universität zu Kiel, Germany







Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781009241328

DOI: 10.1017/9781009241311

© Chiara Thumiger 2024

This publication is in copyright. It is subject to statutory exceptions and to the provisions of relevant licensing agreements; with the exception of the Creative Commons version the link for which is provided below, no reproduction of any part of this work may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

An online version of this work is published at doi.org/10.1017/9781009241311 under a Creative Commons Open Access license CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 which permits re-use, distribution and reproduction in any medium for non-commercial purposes providing appropriate credit to the original work is given. You may not distribute derivative works without permission. To view a copy of this license, visit https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0

All versions of this work may contain content reproduced under license from third parties. Permission to reproduce this third-party content must be obtained from these third-parties directly.

When citing this work, please include a reference to the DOI 10.1017/9781009241311

#### First published 2024

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data NAMES: Thumiger, Chiara, author.

TITLE: Phrenitis and the pathology of the mind in Western medical thought: (fifth century BCE to twentieth century CE) / Chiara Thumiger.

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge ; New York, NY: Cambridge University Press, 2023. | Includes bibliographical references and index. |

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2023018193 | ISBN 9781009241328 (hardback) | ISBN 9781009241342 (paperback) | ISBN 9781009241311 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Mental illness – Europe – History. | Neurology – Europe – History. | Psychiatry – Europe – History.

ISBN 978-I-009-24I32-8 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



#### Contents

List of Figures Acknowledgements		<i>page</i> vii viii
I	Preface and Methodological Issues	I
2	Phrenitis in Classical (Fifth–Fourth Centuries BCE) and Hellenistic (Third–First Centuries BCE) Medicine	21
3	Psychology and Delocalizing Themes: Asclepiades, Celsus and Caelius Aurelianus	58
4	Theoretical Aspects of Imperial Nosology: Localization, Semiotics, Chronology, Aetiology (First–Sixth Centuries CE)	94
5	Phrenitic People: Patients and Therapies in Imperial and Late-Antique Cultures (First–Sixth Centuries CE)	129
6	Quasi phreneticus: Phrenitis in Non-Medical Sources in Imperial and Late-Antique Cultures (First Century BCE–Seventh Century CE)	185
7	The Byzantine and Medieval Periods: Medical Receptions of <i>phrenitis</i> in Greek, Latin and Semitic Languages (Sixth–Fourteenth Centuries CE)	224
8	The Construction of the Phrenitic in Larger Society: From the Medieval to the Early-Modern Period	287
9	Phrenitis in the Modern and Early-Modern Worlds: Anatom Pathology and the Survival of Graeco-Roman Medicine (Sixteenth–Nineteenth Centuries CE)	
	(DIALCCILLI-I VIIICLCIILII CCIILLIICS CE)	315



vi <i>Contents</i>	
10 The Modern Age: The 'Death' of phrenitis	360
***	
Appendix 1 The 'Sun Disease'	370
Appendix 2 Naming, Nomenclatures, Dictionaries	377
Appendix 3 Phrenitis from the Fifth Century BCE to the	
Twentieth Century CE: A Synoptic Table	385
Bibliography	390
Index Locorum	
General Index	



### **Figures**

I.I	Regions of the abdomen, illustration. Getty Images/Carol	<i>page</i> 13
	& Mike Werner/Science Photo Library	
1.2	Diaphragm, illustration. Getty Images/SCIEPRO/Science	14
	Photo Library	
1.3	Human respiratory system, illustration. Getty Images/	15
	PIXOLOGICSTUDIO/Science Photo Library	
8.1	'Last scene in the life of Sir John Falstaff' (Shakespeare,	311
	Henry V, act 11, sc. iii). From an etching by George	
	Cruikshank (Robert Brough, The Life of Sir John Falstaff:	
	A Biography of the Knight from Authentic Sources. Illustrated	
	by G. Cruikshank, 1858)	
9.1	Horse with <i>phrenitis</i> . 'Von der Hirnwüthigkeit,	355
	Unsinnigkeit Dollen Coller, zu Latein Phrenitis genannt'	
	(Georg Simon Winters. Wolerfahrner Roß-Arzt oder	
	Vollständige Roß-Artzney-Kunst. Nürnberg, Endter, 1678)	



## Acknowledgements

The list of people to thank for help, assistance and support received over the seven years since I began this project is very long. The bulk of the project was generously financed by a three-year Research Fellowship in Medical Humanities from the Wellcome Trust (Grant Number 108701/Z/15/Z), hosted by the University of Warwick; I am very grateful to both institutions for sponsoring me and for their general support, and in particular to Simon Swain as my primary host there. The Humboldt University (HU) in Berlin and the research group 'Medicine of the Mind, Philosophy of the Body' headed by Philip van der Eijk in the Institut für Klassische Philologie have been a great place to work and have supported me in many practical matters over the past ten years. I should also thank the CMG library, and Roland Wittwer for his kindness and help with my bibliographical needs. Last but not least, the DFG-sponsored Cluster of Excellence Roots at the CAU University in Kiel has been my academic home for the past three years, financing my research and providing support and occasions for lively exchange, for which I am also grateful. The final revisions of this work were done there, and thanks to its support.

I have benefited immensely from a variety of individual conversations and friendships while working on *phrenitis*, and I should mention the most decisive of them. Philip van der Eijk first inspired me to look more deeply into the history of *phrenitis*. Under his supervision, Glenda McDonald had written her PhD thesis on this topic, a thorough study of a selection of authors which provided a firm basis for me to begin my work. I thank her for our initial exchanges. Philip has been a constant presence in my work, as mentor and friend, and my debt to him grows ever greater. Simon Swain at Warwick was decisive with his enthusiastic reception of my research plan, first of all, and with support for my Wellcome application, which he helped to make successful. Throughout the years he has read and closely commented on my drafts at crucial stages and



#### Acknowledgements

ix

provided help on the Arabic sources and on all kinds of questions in the history of ancient medicine, offering important insights, as well as encouragement and practical advice. Individual readers have helped in many ways by looking at my text and offering comments and corrections on particular topics, here in approximate chronological order: Babylonian medicine (Ulrike Steinert); Talmudic medicine (Lennart Lemhaus); the translation of Galenic texts (especially P. N. Singer, and Christine Salazar, who is very much missed); early Christian sources (Jessie Wright, whose new work on the brain and phrenitis in Christian theology I discovered only at a late stage; Ioannis Papadogiannakis on Theodoret and other coeval authors); the Arabic, Hebrew and Syriac translations (Ignacio Sanchez, who closely checked the translations I needed to use; Peter Pormann, Simon Swain, Oliver Overwien and Uwe Vagelpohl for help on various passages; Gerrit Bos, who shared his then unpublished editions of Maimonides and other texts with me); philosophical and medicalhistorical questions, and linguistic points of all kinds, on different chapters (Hynek Bartos, Sean Coughlin, Orly Lewis, Lorenzo Perilli and Amneris Roselli); late-antique and Byzantine materials (Ricarda Gäbel, who shared her work on Aetius of Amida and diseases of the brain with me before publication; Petros Bouras-Vallianatos); medieval sources (Fernando Salmón, without whose help and precious time I would simply not have managed to find my way among the medieval sources on phrenitis, and also for sharing his work on Arnau de Vilanova; Iolanda Ventura, who was also very generous with her time, and whose expert tips and advice made it possible for me to start researching the texts of the Salernitan School; Claire Trenery for more examples from her work on madness in the Middle Ages); modern history of psychiatry (Greg Eghigian and Germán Berrios); history of medicine and ancient intellectual and material history more broadly (William V. Harris, George Kazantzidis, Laurence Totelin, on pharmacological ingredients and much more; Glen M. Cooper on astrology and medicine); finally, the anonymous reader at Cambridge University Press, whom I fear I have not entirely satisfied, but whose sharp criticism, I believe, has still improved the final result and taught me a great deal. Last but not least, I thank S. Douglas Olson for reading my text and improving its English presentation. In the process, Douglas masterfully checked and helped correct a number of Greek and Latin interpretations, saving me from slips and mistakes. Some must surely remain, which is entirely my



Acknowledgements

X

fault, but I know that I am immensely lucky to be able to count on this level of support and feedback.

Several audiences offered comment and insights, and I can only mention them collectively. I benefitted greatly from feedback given at various events where I presented sections of this book, especially and repeatedly in Berlin (HU) as well as at Warwick, London, Durham, New York, Penn State, the University of Pennsylvania, Kiel, Łódź, Rome, Patras, Paris, Utrecht. Michael Sharp at Cambridge University Press, Nigel Hope who carefully copy-edited the manuscript, and the whole team were enormously helpful. Finally, to my family, Rodrigo, Stella, Luna; my parents and sisters; and my friends, many of whom I have already mentioned – thanks for everything else.