

Public Disclosure Authorized

THE WORLD BANK

Discussion Paper

EDUCATION AND TRAINING SERIES

Report No. EDT22

*Institutional Development in
Education and Training in Sub-Saharan
African Countries*

J. Auerhan (Unesco)
S. Ramakrishnan (Consultant)
R. Romain (World Bank)
G. Stoikov (ILO)
L. Tiburcio (Unesco)
P. Torres (ILO)
November 1985

Public Disclosure Authorized

Education and Training Department

Operations Policy Staff

Discussion Paper
Education and Training Series
Report No. EDT22

**INSTITUTIONAL DEVELOPMENT IN EDUCATION AND TRAINING
IN SUB-SAHARAN AFRICAN COUNTRIES**

Prepared By: J. Auerhan (Unesco)
S. Ramakrishnan (Consultant)
R. Romain (World Bank)
G. Stoikov (ILO)
L. Tiburcio (Unesco)
P. Torres (ILO)

November 1985

Education Policy Division
Education & Training Department
The World Bank

The World Bank, ILO and Unesco do not accept responsibility for the views expressed herein, which are those of the authors and should not be attributed to these Agencies or to their affiliated organizations. The findings, interpretations, and conclusions are the results of research or analysis supported by the three Agencies; they do not necessarily represent official policy of the Agencies. The designations employed, the presentation of material, and any maps used in this document are solely for the convenience of the reader and do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the Agencies concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city, area, or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its boundaries, or national affiliation.

Abstract

This study forms part of the general Bank effort to intensify and improve its operations in Sub-Saharan Africa. It was prompted by the appearance of a crisis in educational development brought on by the extraordinarily difficult financial situation in which most countries found themselves by 1982. Not all the economy measures being considered or taken in the sector appeared to be in the best long term interest of the countries. Growth and change in the education systems of Sub-Saharan Africa had been achieved during the 1960s and 1970s, but serious problems had arisen in the 1980s regarding how to sustain these expanded systems of education and training. In part the problems were financial; in part they were institutional; but, in the final analysis, the failure lay in resource management and planning. Hence it seemed that what was needed was not yet another set of external recommendations to the countries on how to chart their development, but rather (a) an understanding of why these countries, after decades of Bank lending and other external aid, still appeared to be in need of considerable external participation in the analysis of their problems, in the planning and implementation of development in the sector and in the efficient management of education and training and (b) some idea of the steps to be taken to build up strong permanent national capacity in these areas.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page No.</u>
SUMMARY	(i)
(a) Background	(i)
(b) Main Findings	(ii)
(c) Implications for Policy	(v)
PREFACE	(xii)
PART I: INSTITUTIONAL DEVELOPMENT PROBLEMS AND NEEDS	1
Chapter 1. The Financing of Education and the Current Financial Crisis	1
Chapter 2. Problems and Needs of Planning, Management, and Research in Education in Ministries of Education and Universities	10
(a) A Question of Status	10
(b) Staffing	14
(c) Physical Infrastructure	19
(d) Operations Systems and Organizational Behavior ...	20
(e) Information	23
(f) Conclusion	26
Chapter 3. Problems and Needs of Institution Building in Management Development and Vocational Training	27
(a) Management Development	27
(b) Management of Vocational Training	33
PART II: EXPERIENCE IN INSTITUTIONAL DEVELOPMENT	42
Chapter 4. The Experience of ILO, Unesco and WORLD BANK	42
(a) The Experience of ILO	42
(b) The Experience of Unesco	48
(c) Bank Experience in Education Lending	51
ANNEXES	
Annex 1. Budgeting and Financial Management in the Education Sector, Zambia by Mr. S. Ramakrishnan	56
Annex 2. Patterns of Arrangements for Managing Vocational Training in Sub-Saharan Africa	84
Annex 3. Bank Experience in Education Lending	86
Annex 4. Bank Assistance Included in Projects for Higher Education in Sub-Saharan Africa	109

Abbreviations Used

CEAO	-	Communauté Economique de l'Afrique de l'Ouest (West African Economic Community)
CESAG	-	Centre Africain d'Etudes Supérieures en Gestion (African Center for Higher Management Studies)
CIADGOR	-	Centre interafricain pour le développement de la formation professionnelle (Inter African Center for the Development of Vocational Training)
IIEP	-	International Institute for Educational Planning
ILO	-	International Labour Organisation
IMF	-	International Monetary Fund
NPC	-	National Productivity Center
O & M	-	Organisation and Methods
UK	-	United Kingdom
UNDP	-	United Nations Development Program
Unesco	-	United Nations Educational Scientific and Cultural Organization

(Other abbreviations are explained in the text wherever they occur.)

**INSTITUTIONAL DEVELOPMENT IN EDUCATION AND TRAINING
IN SUB-SAHARAN AFRICAN COUNTRIES**

SUMMARY

(a) Background

1. This study forms part of the general Bank effort to intensify and improve its operations in Sub-Saharan Africa. It was prompted by the appearance of a crisis in educational development brought on by the extraordinarily difficult financial situation in which most countries found themselves by 1982. Not all the economy measures being considered or taken in the sector appeared to be in the best long term interest of the countries. Growth and change in the education systems of Sub-Saharan Africa had been achieved during the 1960s and 1970s, but serious problems had arisen in the 1980s regarding how to sustain these expanded systems of education and training. In part the problems were financial; in part they were institutional; but, in the final analysis, the failure lay in resource management and planning. Hence it seemed that what was needed was not yet another set of external recommendations to the countries on how to chart their development, but rather (a) an understanding of why these countries, after decades of Bank lending and other external aid, still appeared to be in need of considerable external participation in the analysis of their problems, in the planning and implementation of development in the sector and in the efficient management of education and training and (b) some idea of the steps to be taken to build up strong permanent national capacity in these areas.

2. For this study, institutional development was taken to mean the establishment, strengthening or enhancement of the capacity of agencies or institutions to perform their assigned functions efficiently. This means providing a system which includes an unequivocal mandate, goals and objectives, the necessary physical facilities (buildings, equipment and furniture), personnel of sufficient caliber and in the required numbers, a rational organization, well thought out procedures and the necessary authority and financial resources; it also means facilitating the continuous evaluation, maintenance and updating of this overall system.

3. The study reviews selected aspects of institutional development in education and training. It examines the administration of ministries of education, educational planning and educational research. As vocational training is often dealt with outside ministries of education and requires special institutional arrangements for its management, that sub-sector is dealt with separately from ministries of education. Universities were included because of their vital role in preparing high level manpower in certain disciplines considered crucial in management, planning and research in the education and training sector. Management development was included not only because it constitutes an important part of the education and training system but also because it plays, or ought to play, a direct role in the preparation and performance of managerial staff in education and training and other sectors.

4. The report seeks (a) to document the critical problems faced by institutional development in the education sector in this period of financial stringency (b) to examine the problems and needs which have to be addressed in any effort to improve planning, management and research in education and training and the strengthening of management training and (c) to draw lessons from the wealth of experience of ILO, Unesco and the Bank in institutional development in education and training. On the basis of these findings, recommendations are made for strengthening assistance to institutional development in the sector.

(b) Main Findings

5. The Current Financial Crisis. In recent years there has been a financial crisis in the education sector the most important impact of which has been to accelerate a decline in institutional capacity and infrastructure which began some ten years or so ago. This decline needs to be addressed urgently and effectively.

6. In the five selected countries, an already inadequate administrative service is being required to bear a disproportionate share of the cost reduction efforts. Cost reduction efforts in the sector are falling most acutely on administrative overheads and research and on specific items - such as transport and supplies - that vitiate the productivity and effectiveness of administrative staff, ironically, even reducing their capacity to curb waste. These efforts are also having an impact on universities in ways which will restrict institutional development in education and training.

7. Ministries of Education and Universities. Even without specific reference to the financial crisis, the Ministries of Education in these countries encounter various fundamental problems. First of all, the status and reputation of educational management are relatively low, external aid agencies (and even governments themselves) fail to give due recognition to the scope and importance of the planning function and to the place of research in development. Secondly, the ministries lack qualified specialists in key areas such as financial management and planning, educational planning, design and implementation of educational development (projects), statistics, educational research, public administration, business management, and educational administration. Thirdly, the available physical infrastructure for the functions of managing the system is substandard in both central and provincial offices and essential equipment - such as data processing and office equipment and vehicles - is in short supply or non-existent. Fourthly, for reasons that are perfectly valid, the ministries have embarked on geographical decentralization of services; however, they have not been able to provide the necessary staff development programs to assure adequate services in the provinces. In two cases, separate ministries have been created in recent years to attend exclusively to higher education - a measure which entails excessively high administrative overheads. Finally, the information resources needed for efficient management and planning are seriously deficient. The paucity of statistical data and library and documentation services in ministries, universities and in the countries generally offers little basis for well informed decision making.

8. Management Development. In the field of management development and training, overall institutional weaknesses in Sub-Saharan African countries pose special problems. Large corporations look after their own interests but the smaller private sector firms tend not to perceive their interests in organized programs for these purposes. There is urgent need for efficient umbrella institutional arrangements to coordinate initiatives, to promote employer participation in funding (instead of leaving funding entirely to the government), to promote the role of employers in the design and evaluation of training programs, to establish a range of training which has the flexibility to respond to their needs, to ensure the development of adequate information, research and consulting services, and to develop and retain the right kind of managerial personnel required for training institutions. Management development suffers from mandates which are too restricted to (a) training alone, as distinct from a package of measures to strengthen management, (b) programs which can be funded immediately as distinct from what is urgently needed and (c) a very limited range of fields and strategies which neglects, among other things, the social sectors (including education), accounting and financial management, the management of development processes, in plant training and consulting.

9. Management of Vocational Training. The management of vocational training in Sub-Saharan Africa is conducted under a variety of models in which the responsibility is vested in ministries of education or labor or other ministries or dispersed among ministries. Few of these arrangements, however, have the flexibility to respond to the variety of training needs. Problems exist in regard to lack of labor market information, unrealistic wage rates and weaknesses of vocational guidance services, poor coordination of training, a system which insufficiently involves employers in the financing of vocational training and consequently secures only very limited participation of employers and workers in the design of training, the lack of sufficiently qualified personnel for management, planning and research in vocational training.

10. Experience of the Agencies. The study looks at the experience of ILO, Unesco and the Bank in institutional development in education and training in Sub-Saharan Africa.

11. In regard to management development, the strategy which has grown out of the extensive experience of the ILO is (i) to strengthen the institutional framework in regard to policies, planning, research and rationalization of training networks (ii) to improve performance and increase the impact of management development institutions and programs supporting these with preparing essential materials (iii) to address the neglected sectors (iv) to encourage regional, sub-regional and inter regional cooperation among management development institutions.

12. In regard to the management of vocational training, where the ILO experience is also extensive, the agency has observed an interesting sequence in institutional evolution. The first stage usually involves the legal establishment of the management arrangements to bring together the

various participants, some labor market surveys and training needs assessment and usually the establishment of vocational training centers. A later stage includes setting up of trade standards, testing and certification schemes, training within enterprises, apprenticeship, and the expansion of instructor training and of the volume of training programs to cover rural localities and wider range of sectors. ILO has also found that this cannot be accomplished in one project, but usually requires two, three or even four successive projects. One important result, however, of an initial successful project is that this secures the commitment of workers, employers and the government and the success of future projects.

13. Unesco has had long standing experience in institutional development in the sector, not only through its International Institute for Educational Planning but also through its field programs. On the basis of this experience, Unesco^{1/} stresses (i) the importance of government commitment to providing effective counterpart arrangements, (ii) government financial capacity to sustain the effort after withdrawal of Unesco, (iii) the proper adaptation of institutional development efforts to local circumstances, (iv) the need for a long term horizon for institutional development and (v) the need for an adequate local staffing arrangement to service external aid. Unesco has seen its strategy develop toward providing expertise in more specific rather than general skills and through short term rather than long term assignment of experts, toward support for regional efforts such as the Network for Educational Innovation and Development in Africa (NEIDA), networking, Technical Cooperation among Developing Countries and twinning in its search for effective ways of promoting institutional development in a variety of circumstances.

14. The World Bank has invested increasingly in institutional development in the sector, all education projects since FY71 including such components. The principal areas to which institutional development financing has been directed have been (1) project management and educational planning (both areas of interest to the lending program and pipeline) - 47 percent of items, (2) general management, with a view to strengthening central and provincial administration, management training and the management of vocational training (28 percent of items) and (3) technical aspects of educational management, with a view to supporting qualitative changes and improvement in education (26 percent). The means adopted for effecting institutional development involved usually a mix of devices; however it was predominantly that of expert services (in 85 of 87

^{1/} A study of Unesco technical assistance in Bank-financed education projects was done by the World Bank and Unesco in 1983. This report deals extensively with Unesco experience. (World Bank/Unesco Joint Study of Technical Assistance in Bank-financed Education Projects. Report of the Steering Committee to the President of the World Bank and the Director General of Unesco. March 1984). No effort is made here to reiterate the findings of this study. A few points are added here in order to stress some items of particular relevance to Sub-Saharan Africa.

relevant projects), equipment and furniture in 58 projects, fellowships in 48 projects, buildings in 46 cases and support for operating costs in 34 projects.

15. The major deficiencies in the design of these projects, from the institutional development standpoint, were (a) the relatively meager effort on behalf of central administrative capacity as a whole, (b) the general underutilization of fellowships and over-reliance on expert services, and (c) the neglect of development of universities, especially in the "strategic disciplines" and the economic and social sciences - development which would have improved university capacity to provide a better quality of graduates and enhanced their consulting capacity.

16. Some 58 of the 100 projects approved for Sub-Saharan Africa FY64-84 were completed by March 1985. The review of the relevant project completion and audit reports reveals that the institutional development components were an often neglected area, not only in project implementation but also in project evaluation. These reports do show, however, that progress in institutionalizing project management capacity and in developing satisfactory educational planning capacity has been very limited, which appears to be the result of insufficient emphasis on training. Several of the large numbers of studies included in the projects were not done or were changed substantially, for lack of local commitment to them. Assistance to the technical aspects of management of education has yielded several positive results, although the outcomes have been mixed. Efforts to strengthen management, including support for central and district administration and for management training components, have been generally successful. The items concerning management of vocational training encountered some initial difficulties regarding employer support but, in general, outcomes have been good. Implementation experience with experts as a means of effecting institutional development has been largely negative. Often the experts were either not used or were not as effective as intended, ill timed, unsupported by counterparts, or unmindful of training responsibilities.

(c) Implications for Policy

17. Introduction. It is essential to understand the meaning and nature of institutional development. It is the product of several separate ingredients working in harmony to develop and maintain institutional capacity - personnel of the right quality, motivation, skills and attitudes (including good leadership) and in sufficient number, efficient organization and procedures, adequate physical plant and financial resources, possession of a mandate and real authority to perform, access to the minimum financial resources needed for good performance, access to information which is as up-to-date as possible in the broad area of operation, and the ability to evaluate performance and modernize or adjust the overall institutional environment in the light of changing needs. Denial of access to any of these essentials at any given time can thwart institutional development efforts and can even rapidly erode capacities developed over a lengthy period.

18. The second important consideration is that each institution operates in its own social and cultural setting. The institutional needs at any given time will vary according to the mix of deficiencies and superfluities, given the objectives of the institution. Remedies and institutional development efforts, therefore, have to be tailor made. One characteristic of the institutional environment is the interdependence of institutions; excessive weakness in one militates against the achievement of efficiency in another institution, sometimes rendering it necessary to resolve the problem of the Ministry of Education by reaching into the University or the Ministry of Planning, for example. The same holds good for sections of a ministry, where the weak can eventually neutralize the strong.

19. The fundamental institutional problem in Sub-Saharan Africa is that too many of the requirements for institutional capacity are lacking and too many of the institutions are weak, generally requiring a total bootstrap operation over a long period of time. The failures of earlier institution building efforts have arisen because of the limited range of the efforts over aspects of the institutions, over time and over the number of related institutions to which attention was devoted. Under colonialism, by deliberate metropolitan policy, there was widespread denial of access to knowledge, technology, manufacturing and general decision making. Thus the challenge posed by independence was fundamentally an institutional one. Movement toward African institutional strength therefore threatens those whose perception of their interests developed around these institutional weaknesses and incapacities. These may include corporations whose structure and policy have evolved on an assumption that the institutional weaknesses in Africa will be perpetual, and they may include the individual expert who is reluctant to transfer his skills to the local counterpart and so render himself redundant.

20. Specific Recommendations. The following recommendations are put forward to address the particular problems and needs encountered in the course of this study. These fall well within the financial scope of existing operations and programs of assistance to the sector and merely require a change in focus and priorities.

21. 1. Support for Adequacy of Financing for Administrative Services. Two of the most urgent needs in education systems are (a) greater real financial autonomy for Ministries of Education to determine the allocation of the financial resources made available for the sector and (b) the achievement of a realistic balance between the sector resources spent in the schools and the resources allocated to managing the school system.

22. There is need for the analysis of expenditure on education with a view to discovering the amounts and proportions of sector funding spent on administration, the effectiveness of this expenditure and its adequacy. Budget preparation and presentation need to be done in such a way as to highlight these financial ratios. Educational planning units need to address this issue in a more detailed manner and to map out a long

term strategy for correcting any imbalances. The growth of the school system needs to be placed second in priority to the early and rapid achievement of a proper level of expenditure on administration. Investment programs (including Bank lending programs), therefore, would need to address the adequacy of financing for administration of the system as a prerequisite to supporting expansion of the school system.

23. 2. Strengthening the Administration and Planning of Education.
- (a) Focus on Institutional Development. First of all there is need for a stronger and more consistent focus on strengthening capacities of ministries of education to manage, plan and research the sector. This means a greater number of institutional development components of development projects and a greater institutional development orientation of projects. This needs to proceed from recognizing the value of institutionalized management, planning and research instead of relying on the ad hoc (non-institutionalized) project unit or special study or task force, especially where these in effect debilitate existing institutions or obscure the need for permanent institutions. Development planning for the sector needs to include institutional development programs designed to bring about the capacity needed to manage the developing system efficiently.
- (b) Development of efficient organisation and methods. The detailed review of organizational structures, systems and procedures to determine the minimum resources needed for efficient discharge of responsibilities of each unit (including staffing levels, funding and so on) is a continuing obligation in a dynamic institutional setting. It is no longer enough to have a small O&M unit in ministries of finance or establishment ministries. This kind of review is needed at the sector level to help with introducing modernization and adjustment in a systematic, well planned and continuous way; hence small O&M units should urgently be developed for ministries of education. This may mean strengthening O&M in ministries of finance as well and in ministries responsible for the civil service establishment. Essentially, however, this recommendation is concerned not merely with O&M units of the type which only react to proposals for change, but with units which plan and organize change, which conduct their own investigations and research, and which pilot change and suggest new operational methods well before a situation becomes critical. These O&M reviews may reveal staff redundancies in some units and deficiencies in others and major adjustments will be needed as new units or activities are created and old ones abolished or phased out and staff are trained or retrained

for new roles and redeployed. This kind of adjustment entails costs which should be included in capital investment programs and external borrowing.

- (c) Expanded staff training. A staff development policy is needed which attends to induction training of all staff and systematic inservice training at all levels and determines what preservice training programs are needed to produce new recruits in the desired specializations. For ministries of education there will be specific training needs in such areas as educational planning and development, including the management of development programs and projects; selection, procurement and maintenance of equipment; financial management and planning; educational administration and study tours and seminars for senior managers, especially to permit intercountry exchanges. Often these sector specific training needs would require to be supplemented and supported by addressing core ministry training needs (e.g. finance, planning and civil service establishment). Certain staff training needs (such as statistics) would best be approached in a wider national or regional context.
- (d) Provision of buildings and equipment. Within the development programs of the ministries, due attention is required to the inadequacy of buildings, furniture, equipment and vehicles under which the administration now functions. This includes recognizing the need for (i) appropriately designed buildings which take into account growth requirements, (ii) data processing equipment, and (iii) office equipment and supplies. It also includes a resolution of the urgent transport problem. This requires a fleet of diverse types of vehicles, with the necessary garages, maintenance and repair services (preferably at the sector ministry level in order to avoid excessive management problems), a stock of spare parts and initial operating costs and a program of training of drivers and managers in vehicle operation and fleet management and control.
- (e) The provision of information resources. The ministries of education need to be assisted in designing and establishing documentation library, information and services for themselves at central and provincial levels in the planning and implementation of a program of strengthening the national library service and in the collection and processing of statistical data on the sector.

24. 3. Strengthening Management Development. The improvement of training in management and public administration needs to be approached through a variety of means. This involves:

(ix)

- (i) Support for rationalizing the existing institutional base in management development in the public and private sectors and support for coordinating capacity.
- (ii) Careful selection of training institutions to be developed as centers of excellence, which would include strengthening their capacity for training, research and consulting work generally. (To begin with, only institutions which are interested in improving their credibility with their clients and in developing a portfolio of programs that could eventually pay their own way should be selected. One good performance indicator for these programs would be the proportion of the budget of participating institutions being willingly financed by clients in exchange for result-oriented services.)
- (iii) Improvement in both the range of programs so as to cover, inter alia, social sectors, sector development programs and development management, and the quality of programs, supporting these with the preparation and procurement of appropriate training materials.
- (iv) A program to encourage closer collaboration between public and private sectors in financing management development, the assessment of training needs and the design, utilization and evaluation of training programs.
- (v) Development of public administration training to cover induction as well as inservice training to provide regular seminars for senior level staff.
- (vi) A program to train trainers not only in instruction techniques but more importantly in how to define needs, to help client set aims, to follow-up with clients on the adoption of improvements in their organizations and to work with clients to publicize successful programs in order to attract managers.
- (vii) A program to train managers of management development institutions. Such a program would include skills in public relations, leadership and staffing, and cost estimation of training and management development services.

25. 4. Support for the Management of Vocational Training. The efforts in development of vocational training should continue, with intensification of focus on behalf of strengthening institutional capacities to coordinate and manage vocational training in certain respects:

- (i) Establishing coordinating arrangements which give prominence to collaboration among employers, workers and government in the financing, design, management and evaluation of vocational training policies and programs and working toward financial autonomy of the system;

- (ii) Information and research services for labor market data, evaluation of experiments, preparation and production of training materials, and low cost training methods;
- (iii) Training of better qualified managerial personnel and of staff engaged in planning and research, and in equipment selection and maintenance;
- (iv) Adoption of career incentives to retain qualified personnel; and
- (v) Exploring the scope for subregional and regional cooperation.

26. 5. Strengthening Universities. The Bank needs to adopt a new strategy toward universities in Sub-Saharan Africa in which disciplines essential to the welfare of the education sector (as well as other sectors) are strengthened. These disciplines include economics and the social sciences, accountancy or financial management, statistics, architecture and educational management and research. Where applicable, university institutes for business management and public administration should also be included. The aim of such strengthening would be to improve the quality of the graduates by modernizing curricula and equipment and raising the average caliber of teaching and research staff, to establish or strengthen research and post graduate training and to establish or strengthen consulting capacity of the universities in these fields. Essential parts of such improvement would be the upgrading of university library and documentation services and measures to stimulate and support university involvement in research of direct relevance to the resolution of critical national problems.

27. In all of these recommended measures the relevant UN agencies, particularly ILO and Unesco and the Bank, should intensify their assistance to the member countries.

28. 6. In particular, the Bank needs to take the following measures:

- (i) Support as a matter of high priority the above efforts in its lending operations and, to this end, agree with each country on a long term strategy for institutional development and on the need for a series of successive investments, possibly including sector adjustment lending and measures such as financing time slices of agreed sector development programs, to permit fuller realization of institutional objectives. For each lending operation in the sector, therefore, a statement as to the adequacy of administrative and planning resources and capacity for the sector would need to be made as to the existing school system and as to the additional burden of the expansion or improvements envisaged under the project, and any deficiencies noted would need to be addressed, whether within that lending operation or by other specified means.
- (ii) Recruit more appropriate staff (staff with some background in senior management and/or planning) and train existing staff as needed to upgrade their knowledge of institutional development.

- (iii) Include in its policy and research program efforts (a) to determine, for various sizes of school systems, what constitutes a norm or desirable level funding for administration, whether expressed as an amount or as a percentage of overall sector funding, as well as what is a norm or desirable proportion of national resources to devote to education; (b) to learn more about institutional development in education and training - and use the resources of relevant UN agencies in this - and address such issues as the cost and financing of administration, requirements and efficiency of administrative decentralization and the cost effectiveness of separate ministries for higher education.
- (iv) Encourage the Economic Development Institute in its policy of training trainers, in its focus on Sub-Saharan Africa and in establishing collaboration with the International Institute for Educational Planning and other agencies for these objectives.
- (v) Collaborate closely with relevant multilateral agencies, especially ILO and Unesco, in regard to national as well as sub-regional and regional efforts in strengthening education research, planning and management; management development and the management of vocational training, as well as in promoting the exchange and dissemination of experiences and information.

PREFACE

1. In the 1980 Sector Policy Paper on education and training the Bank committed itself to assisting countries in strengthening their capacity to manage, plan and research their systems of education and training. This study was undertaken by the Education and Training Department with a view to a better understanding of the critical problems faced by the Sub-Saharan African countries in this aspect of development and determining how best the Bank could assist.
2. Because of their wealth of experience in institutional development throughout the developing world, ILO and Unesco were asked to assist the Bank in this study. They kindly agreed to do so.
3. For the purposes of a close examination of the country situation, five countries were selected - Cameroon, Madagascar, Mali, Sierra Leone and Zambia. These were selected with a view to a balance between the Regions, the large and small countries and the Anglophone and Francophone countries, as well as to represent a range of income levels and a certain depth of experience with the Bank in education and training. In October/November 1984, visits were made to all of these countries and discussions were held with (a) officials in various ministries, particularly those responsible for education, planning, finance and labor, (b) university officials, (c) representatives of employees and workers, (d) officials of training institutions in the fields of management development, (e) officials involved in managing vocational training and (f) representatives of research institutes. The missions comprised Mr. Paul Torres of ILO, management development specialist (Zambia, Madagascar and Cameroon), Mrs. Gabrielle Stoikov of ILO, vocational training specialist (Madagascar and Sierra Leone), Messrs. Jan Auerhan of Unesco, economist (Zambia, Madagascar and Mali), Luis Tiburcio of Unesco, educational planning and management specialist (Zambia, Madagascar and Sierra Leone), S. Ramakrishnan (consultant) of Harvard Institute for International Development, public finance specialist (Zambia), and Ralph Romain of the Bank, education adviser (Zambia, Madagascar and Sierra Leone). The mission members also held discussions with staff of ILO, Unesco and the Bank. Ms. Mwazwita Mundangepfupfu, Researcher, assisted in the review of the Bank experience in institutional development in the sector.
4. The mission members express their appreciation of the assistance provided by the officials of the countries visited, the staff of ILO, Unesco, and the Bank and the Projects Policy Department of the Operations Policy Staff of the Bank which financed the review of financial management in Zambia (Annex 1).

PART I - INSTITUTIONAL DEVELOPMENT PROBLEMS AND NEEDS

CHAPTER 1. THE FINANCING OF EDUCATION AND THE CURRENT FINANCIAL CRISIS

1.00 Over the past few years there have been dramatic manifestations of the financial constraints faced by the education sector in Sub-Saharan Africa, as the IMF and Bank (Structural Adjustment) missions have discussed the containment of educational expenditure by Governments. It is quite clear, however, that the financial crisis has had greater impact upon the management, planning and research services than upon the schools themselves, and that current trends suggest the likelihood of further and even rapid deterioration in management, planning and research.

1.01 The education sector generally absorbs the largest single sectoral share of government spending. Bank discussion of the problem of financing the sector has tended to focus on how to mobilize more resources by passing some costs to the community directly, how to shed some of the current government responsibilities and which ones should be shed (student boarding, scholarships, for example), reallocating funds from one subsector to another (from higher to primary education, for example) and the reduction of unit costs (considered to be high, especially in higher education). The areas which have received little attention are (a) the adequacy of funding for efficient operation of the education services, which would raise questions as to why some of these countries allocate less than 10% of their national expenditure to education while others allocate over 25%; (b) the management and planning deficiencies which are bound up with the origin and persistence of the crisis in the sector and (c) the extent of the impact of this crisis upon the management and planning of education. One of the consequences of this neglect, by countries as well as by the Bank, has been that data have not been regularly assembled which

might shed light on the funding and capacity of the administration^{1/} -

^{1/} In various ministries of education and over time there will be differences in the range of the functions exercised by what one might call the administration. It is therefore necessary to give a list of the kinds of functions typical of Sub-Saharan African countries:

1. General policy control and formulation - offices of Minister, Permanent Secretary or Director General and Chief Education Officer.
2. Financial and General Administration - budgeting and accounting; procurement, control of stores, payment of salaries.
3. Personnel Administration - staff recruitment and personnel services concerning staff of the administration, teachers and non-teaching staff of the schools.
4. Professional Administration - supervision of the schools, including directorates of primary, secondary, technical, nonformal or adult and higher education, teacher training, examination services, curriculum development, educational publications and educational broadcasting.
5. Planning and Development Services - educational planning (including statistics, evaluation, research, etc.), development program implementation and maintenance of physical plant.
6. External Relations.

This list specifically excludes certain items which may appear under the recurrent administrative budget - the cost of printing or purchasing textbooks and supplementary reading material, cost of conducting examinations (reproducing questions and marking scripts), scholarships and boarding and any forms of welfare payments to students, and the development program itself (costs of new buildings and works and supplies related to regular maintenance of existing buildings). These costs belong either under the heading of the schools, as distinct from the administration, or within capital or development expenditure, as distinct from the recurrent budget; it is important to exclude them since they may distort the picture of total expenditure on management, according to the extent of Government involvement or participation in those aspects.

management, planning and research in education.^{2/}

1.02 To the extent that statistics are readily available and can be analyzed, it appears that the present straitened circumstances of the sector are largely the result of trends over the past 15 years or so, although the more recent depression has exacerbated and dramatized the situation. Education has been receiving about the same or a declining proportion of the national budget since about 1975.^{3/} In real terms, there has been drastic decline in some cases in the funding provided^{4/}, - a problem exacerbated by the extreme scarcity of foreign exchange.

1.03 Within the global figures for the sector, one can discern some trends which hold or will have serious consequences for institutional development. The first is the decline in the already inadequate share of

^{2/} In contrast to the regular collection of detailed information on the school system, data are not collected either by the countries or by the Bank on various aspects of the size and cost of management services in relation to the school system being managed. The available statistics are not always accurate. One may fairly easily obtain the number of posts in the establishment but not the number actually occupied. The budget estimates of expenditure are often so vastly different from actual expenditure that they are of extremely limited value. Even figures of actual expenditure vary from one Government document to another. Some items are grouped together under certain budget headings and cannot be separated out without extremely detailed review of notebooks: for example, in regard to the Department of Technical Education and Vocational Training in Zambia, the technical/vocational schools/training institutions are not shown in the Ministry budget separately from head office administration for the technical/vocational sub-sector, as they are in other subsectors.

^{3/} Calculations made in the Ministry of Education Sierra Leone, for example, give percentages of the national recurrent budget devoted to education as 25.6 in 1965/66, 18.9 in 1970/71, 16.3 in 1975/76 and 14.5 in 1980/81. In Zambia (see Table 2 of Annex 1), the figures regarding total education expenditure as a proportion of total national expenditure for the period 1974-83 show a steady decline 1976-80 with some recovery 1980-83. The Unesco sector study of Madagascar, September 1984, indicated that from 18.5% in 1975 there was an increase to 20.8% in 1977 and 22.7% in 1980, followed by a decline to 15.2% in 1982.

^{4/} See Table 1.1 on page 5 of Annex 1 on Zambia. The decline in real terms was of the order of 34% between 1974 and 1983. In Madagascar the recurrent expenditure on education rose from 30.5 billion FMG in 1980 to an estimated 34.2 billion in 1982 (Unesco sector study). However, over that period there was 69% price inflation which implies a decline in real terms of some 34%.

the total education budget that is allocated to administration.^{5/} The second is the decline in the proportion of total administrative budget which is allocated to supplies.^{6/} These two trends can perhaps plausibly be defended on the grounds of declining resources. The third, however, is the steady and strong growth in the budget for salaries of teachers and scholarships for higher education^{7/} - a trend which confirms that the problem is not a simple one of declining resources, but rather one of resource allocation.

1.04 Discussions with officials established that there were remarkable similarities among the countries in the way in which the resource allocation was approached. Following traditional budgeting practices and budget formats for consideration of each head, subhead and item, the emphasis was not upon reshaping or fundamentally reconsidering the way in which overall resources had been traditionally allocated with a view to their more efficient deployment, but on simply curtailing expenditure. Hence the principal cost-reduction measures consisted of jettisoning or curbing those items least likely to cause immediate public embarrassment by their absence or reduction. Keeping schools staffed and open and accommodating new ones remained of the highest priority, both at budget preparation and at the provision of supplementary budgets. Suppressing the purchase of new typewriters was a line of less resistance than eliminating a typist. Consequently, the areas in which cost containment efforts were

^{5/} In the Sierra Leone estimates, the administration share fell from 5.2% in 1974/75 to 3.5% in 1979/80 and 2.7% in 1982/83 and 1983/84. In Zambia (see Table 3 in para. 3.4 of Annex 1) the percentages fell from eight in 1974 and 1975 to 6+ between 1976 and 1981 and five in 1982 and 1983. In any event, these shares represent hopelessly inadequate administrative overheads for a people-oriented service like education.

^{6/} For example, in Madagascar, the proportion of the total administration budget comprising salaries rose from 72.9% in 1978 to 85.9% in 1982 in the Ministry of Basic and Secondary Education.

^{7/} (a) Teachers' Salaries: In Sierra Leone, if we exclude scholarships and the university subvention and boarding, of the rest of the recurrent education budget, teachers' salaries comprised 77% in 1974-75, 76% in 1979-80 and 93% in 1982-83, leaving 23%, 24% and 7% respectively for school supplies and administrative overheads. In Madagascar, the Ministry of Basic and Secondary Education budget for salaries of teachers rose from 13.9 billion FMG in 1978 to 23.3 billion in 1982.

(b) Scholarships: In Sierra Leone, the budget for scholarships rose from 2.85m. Leones in 1979-80 to 3.35 million in 1982-83 and 6.24 million in 1984-85 (10%, 6% and 8% of the total Ministry recurrent budget respectively in these years). In Madagascar, the Ministry of Higher Education budget for scholarships rose from 195 million FMG in 1973 to 1.4 billion in 1978 and 3 billion in 1983. For primary and secondary education, however, there was a decline from 254 million in 1978 to 134 million in 1982. In Zambia as well, there has been containment of boarding costs in primary and secondary education (Tables 7 and 8 of Annex 1).

concentrated were school supplies, administrative supplies and administrative staff salaries, roughly in that order.^{8/}

1.05 The budget for administration has been subject to stagnation or even attrition in ways which seriously affect the effectiveness and efficiency of staff at all levels, given the fact that even before the onset of the financial crisis these ministries had been well known to be operating inefficiently. First of all, there was a tendency to reduce the staff available for management and planning. The total number of positions available in headquarters and provincial offices to manage and operate the school system showed sluggish growth and even decline in some cases, especially in relation to the number of schools which had to be administered. The general profile of the staff establishment in the administration showed relatively few senior and specialized personnel positions and some of these posts were subject to abolition.^{9/}

^{8/} The school system has had to bear some of the burden of cost containment. As the study of Zambia shows (see Tables 3, 9, 10 of Annex 1), expenditure per student declined in each category (teachers' salaries, administrative expenses, operating expenses and student supplies) between 1974 and 1980 in real terms. This occurred not so much because of a decline in absolute amounts of funds provided as because of the faster growth in student numbers. That average annual student growth (expressed in percentage terms) during the decade of the 1970s, according to Unesco, in the five countries visited was as follows:

	<u>Cameroon</u>	<u>Madagascar</u>	<u>Mali</u>	<u>Sierra Leone</u>	<u>Zambia</u>
Primary	3.8	4.2	5.1	4.8	4.2
Secondary	12.4	4.8	9.6	7.0	6.7
Higher	17.1	12.6	26.3	4.1	3.4

^{9/} (a) Regarding the number of positions:

In Sierra Leone the budgeted positions declined from 412 in 1979/80 to 364 in 1982/83. In the Ministry of Basic and Secondary Education, Madagascar, the ratio of the salary budget for the Ministry administrative staff to the salary budget for the schools supervised was 1:15 in 1978 and 1:18 in 1982. Furthermore, the practice of "freezing" vacant positions was widespread. In Sierra Leone, for example, the management unit for the teacher training colleges at the Ministry of Education was supposed to have a staff of five. Only one was in post in October 1984. In Madagascar, secondary school inspection was not being carried out and the posts vacated by retirement were not being filled.

(b) Regarding the level of posts and provision for specialists:

In Sierra Leone, the already inadequate establishment in the educational planning unit of the Ministry was reduced in recent years by the abolition of senior positions. In most ministries visited by the mission there was an acute shortage of statisticians, professional accountants, and trained education planners.

1.06 In the second place, field work has been severely curtailed by real reductions of per diem allowances and of funding for transport to a level which necessitates that staff subsidize their field work out of their own salaries. Everywhere the mission was told that the number one problem was transport. Ten years ago, vehicles existed but fuel was less regularly supplied; today, vehicles are rare in ministries of education. Staff involved in planning, finance and personnel management could not visit schools and district offices to verify data, check on waste or misuse of funds and support and train their counterparts. Some schools had not been visited by school supervisors for years - up to 10 years was cited in a case in Sierra Leone. Within the offices of the ministries, the mission encountered several instances of more typists than typewriters and a lack of stationery (to an extent that hampers communications) and of paper for printing. Thirdly, the salaries of administrative staff have become increasingly uncompetitive. This has accelerated the attrition of good staff and affected morale in varying degrees, the extreme case being Sierra Leone, where not only are salaries very low but payment is erratic and morale is consequently quite low.^{10/}

1.07 In general, the mission found, to a surprising degree, that the capacity of the ministries to lead and manage the education systems was deteriorating, ironically enough because of management decisions on the allocation of resources to the administration. The relatively small but strategic inputs required to make administration more efficient, and in turn render the school system more accountable and efficient, are not being made. The argument is not that an infusion of money by itself will guarantee efficiency, but that the current low levels of funding of administration effectively militate against the achievement of any reasonable degree of operational effectiveness on the part of the administration.

1.08 The financial crisis has had an impact upon universities in ways which will, in both the short and the long run, hurt institutional development in education and training. Educational research has been

^{10/} The problem of declining morale and discipline in the public service is widespread and is reflected in increased staff absenteeism and reduced productivity.

severely restricted by the shortage of funding for staff, equipment, reading materials, operational costs of field surveys and supplies for dissemination (typing and printing the findings of research).^{11/}

1.09 Despite the fact that the financial crisis has slowed down the growth in the flow of funds to the schools at a time of steady enrollment growth and consequently reduced the costs per student (see Tables 3, 9, 10 of Annex 1), the schools, as distinct from the administration, have had the lion's share of additional funds over the past 10 years. No norms exist to indicate what is a reasonable level of administrative overheads in an education service. Whatever that reasonable level is, some scope undoubtedly exists to improve the efficiency of existing expenditure in administration. Nevertheless, it is clear that the resources being channelled into the vital areas of management, planning and research are quite inadequate and that there will be further deterioration in this respect if corrective measures are not urgently taken.

1.10 Cost reduction measures which reduce the capacity of the management to supervise and control expenditure and the capacity of staff to do their assigned duties are short-sighted and counterproductive from a financial and management point of view.^{12/} In general, the pattern of cost

^{11/} For example, in the University of Sierra Leone Department of Education, student research was being affected by lack of computer access (material was sent to Nigeria for analysis in one case) and reading material (a research topic having to be abandoned for lack of necessary literature). At the time of the mission visit, the library facilities in the Department were in a lamentable condition - a small outdated and dilapidated bookstock and only four usable chairs for an enrollment of 150 students. The teaching strength was relatively low (8 staff) for an institution offering post graduate teaching and research. The professors could conduct only such research as they could fund personally. The Institute for African Studies, which assisted this Department in an education survey, had several completed research manuscripts awaiting funds for printing.

^{12/} In Sierra Leone, for example, drastic reductions have been made in the budget for transport of head office staff; in 1981/82, when it was already grossly inadequate, it was reduced by 20,000 Leones. Lack of supervisory visits means that cases of salary or scholarship payments to ineligible persons are less readily detected and the losses arising from reduction of supervision may far exceed the saving in transport. In Sierra Leone, unlike most countries, the teachers are appointed by the Ministry of Education and the supervisory network to guard against abuses requires transport facilities. Staff predominantly engaged in field work are rendered partly or largely idle. The same principle of rendering staff idle applies in regard to the provision of necessary supplies and equipment such as paper and typewriters.

restraint adopted so far - reduction in supplies and administrative costs - is not conducive to more efficient and effective operation. The immediate problem is, of course, that the school systems have expanded beyond the financial resources available for their efficient support. The immediate need, therefore, is to effect economies, which is different from simply reducing costs. A more efficient and cost-effective education system will come only from strengthened leadership in the sector - a capacity to plan, consult, research, diagnose, generate informed decisions and carry them out. The financial resources to support such strengthening must be part and parcel of the overall allocation to the Ministry of Education, which means, in effect for most countries, either an increase in the overall allocation to this Ministry or a reduction of the proportion allocated to the school system, principally through upward adjustments in the student:teacher ratios over time and the curbing of non-essential expenditure such as direct subsidies (scholarships, boarding) to better off students.

1.11 Some fundamental changes in practices and attitudes are needed if the needs of management, planning and research are to be given due attention. The first is at the level of the national government. The financing of education needs to be restructured so as to ensure that certain minimal resources become available for the management of education, constituting a reasonable proportion of the total resources for the education system being managed. This will require significantly greater autonomy to Ministries of Education in the control of the education budget^{13/} along with large scale improvement in the number and caliber of the staff to deal with financial planning, budgeting, accounting and educational planning.

1.12 The second major change required is at the level of the Bank and other aid agencies. Aid for expanding and updating systems of education implies a continuing commitment on the part of the recipient country to manage the expanded and updated system. If the capacity to manage the existing system is inadequate, then that growth and change being financed will further depress the administration, unless it is accompanied by necessary investment in improving overall management capacity. In some

^{13/} In recent years, both in Zambia and in Sierra Leone, Ministries of Education have been given greater autonomy in deciding how their overall budget amounts should be allocated. However, in both cases, the decision by the Ministries of Finance to delegate this power was accompanied by such an extraordinarily wide gap between original requests and the prescribed budget ceilings, that the discretionary leeway available to the Ministries of Education was virtually nil. Consequently, systematic allocation of resources by the Ministries of Education was impossible without the kind of drastic decisions which Ministries of Education (and especially junior or middle level administrators within them) are not normally allowed to take.

cases the problem may be severe enough to warrant not financing growth and change in the school system until that management capacity has been improved. This appeared to be the case in every country visited. The development of autonomous educational institutions such as universities and institutions for management training would of course not be subject to such a caveat.

1.13 The third change is one of approach. Resources within a ministry are normally so fungible, and the constituent departments or sections so dependent upon one another for their efficient performance, that it is pointless to create oases within the ministry - units excellently housed, equipped and staffed - while the rest of the ministry remains replete with shortages and deficiencies. This piecemeal approach is the logical consequence of designing lending operations around discrete projects concerned primarily with expanding subsectors of the school system and consequently assuming only limited responsibility, if at all, for strengthening the management of these subsectors. A much more holistic strategy is necessary if institutional development efforts are to be effective and, recognizing the limited practical scope for drastic and sudden changes in budgeting, a long range five or six year horizon is needed to phase in significant change in a balanced way.

CHAPTER 2. PROBLEMS AND NEEDS OF PLANNING, MANAGEMENT AND RESEARCH IN
EDUCATION IN MINISTRIES OF EDUCATION AND UNIVERSITIES

2.00 While the immediate problems of the financial crisis are formidable, there are other problems which beset management, planning and research: the low status accorded to these activities, deficiencies in the number and caliber of staff made available to carry out these functions, the inadequacies in the buildings and equipment provided for these activities, inconsistencies and inefficiencies in what might be termed "operational systems" and "organizational behaviour" and the lack of information services to support good management, planning and research.

(a) A Question of Status

2.01 Management. Traditionally, ministries of education, have not enjoyed the highest standing among government ministries. Education has been viewed, especially by core ministries and many economists, as a heavy consumer of national resources (rather than as a producer of wealth or capital) and which needs, therefore, to be under a tight rein. On the other hand, the Ministries employ a large articulate and often formidably organized labor force, touches a large segment of individual and social aspirations, has to respond to some almost irresistible social demands and manages what is well recognized as a socially and politically sensitive sector. Education systems have therefore always been under constant conflicting pressure on the one hand to restrain expenditure growth and on the other hand to expand educational opportunity and improve educational quality at all levels in professionally and socially acceptable ways. For various reasons, these two pincers have grown tremendously sharp in recent years.

2.02 There is some well justified frustration over the sluggishness of the educational response to changing needs. Education systems have their own technology, ways of operating and social assumptions and their environment is complex. Most of its professional administrators are drawn from a teaching background and tend to pursue management, improvement and change in a consultative, gradual and necessarily evolutionary manner. While more radical or expeditious development methods are possible and have successfully been pursued in a totalitarian context (whether for a complete change in the system or simply for a literacy campaign), the education system is one where change must always coexist with preservation, where new practices have to be tested, phased in and adapted and where resistance to change and the struggle against it may originate in parents, teachers, students, the business community or any of several powerful lobbies or pressure groups. In this sector, administrative orders and top-down policy directives can quickly become dead letters. As a result, to those who wish quick change, the managers often appear hidebound, lethargic and even reactionary. Much of this negative perception of educational management is wrong. It is true, however, (a) that educational management, operating under civil service constraints and traditions, has not utilized its full scope available to be more businesslike and enterprising, especially in such areas as procurement, project implementation, textbook production and the management and allocation of resources and (b) that the under financed management staff have generally

been in a reactive rather than a leadership role in regard to the crises which develop over the rapidly growing demands of the education systems.

2.03 Despite the undoubted capabilities of educational administration in dealing internally with the problems of education, the management of education has been remarkably slow to recognise education as an industry with large economic and institutional implications which go beyond its training and educating of manpower. Education accounts for a large slice of the enterprise involved in construction, furniture manufacturing and instructional and sporting equipment and textiles and clothing (school uniforms). Its needs in regard to printed material constitute a dominant part of the publishing, printing and bookselling trades. The predominant pressure on public library services in developing countries comes from the school children. The examinations industry is large and in many cases lucrative. Education generates colossal transport demands. In any country, therefore, the management of education needs to be aware of the scope for economic development (especially import substitution in developing countries) and the impact of management decisions and policies in education upon the economy and upon building national capacities in these various fields whether within the public sector or in the private sector. A more enterprising and activist role by management in using the education system as an engine of economic and institutional development in developing countries would help to change the perception of the sector as a mere passive consumer of national resources.

2.04 Planning. Educational planning was a relatively new discipline in the early 1960s, seeking to reconcile needs and aspirations with anticipated resources. The government efforts of the late 1960s and early 1970s to establish and strengthen planning units or the educational planning function were in keeping with the extensive Unesco support for planning and with the Bank wish that projects be part of sector plans which, in turn, were an integral part of national development plans.^{14/} Not all that passed for educational planning, however, was thoroughly professional and many plans were no more than uninformed statistical projections, insufficiently hammered out at the working level, and poorly thought out in regard to their implementation. The magnitude of the task of effecting qualitative change was very much underestimated. Much of the growth which occurred in the school systems in LDCs in the 1960s may have been welcome; but it was often unplanned. By the late 1960s, governments began to express serious concerns about the quality of education and the relevance of emerging systems to their needs. By that time, with rising unemployment among graduates of the school system and diminishing economic growth rates, planning began to face its sternest challenge.

2.05 Planning suffered from certain subtle but powerful patterns of behavior. The aid community, perhaps without fully recognizing the dangers to educational planning inherent in its actions, designed its very influential aid policies in the sector on the basis of pre-determined

^{14/} In Mali, Cameroon, Sierra Leone, for instance, planning units were assisted in the first Bank Group financed education projects. Zambia was expected to obtain assistance elsewhere to strengthen its planning at the time of its first such project.

criteria. From the 1960s to the present, these aid policies stressed expansion of secondary and higher education and training institutions directly producing manpower for the modern sector; they stressed primary schools since about the mid 1970s. Institutional development is a relatively quite recent area of emphasis. This pattern of priorities distorted actual development in the 1960s away from areas low in the priority list of the aid community, such as primary education and institutional development.^{15/} Secondly, to the extent that these pre-determined criteria had to be adapted to the local situation, aid agencies, especially in the 1970s, tended to place increased reliance on their own sector studies as the basis for designing projects. Thus, even where the needs being met were real needs, the initiative tended to be taken somewhat away from planning units and the planning function devalued.

2.06 Within the ministries, educational planning suffered from a variety of problems. Planning was apparently widely misunderstood and often seen only as a source of statistics and of annual capital expenditure programs. Units were small and grossly understaffed and the few highly trained individuals who became available from time to time proved very mobile. In some countries these units were the hub of development planning and activities (Gabon and Liberia, for example) but, in many others, there was grudging acceptance of their role (Kenya and Sierra Leone, for example). One official of a ministry of planning told the mission that there was need for widespread orientation in sector ministries as to the use and purpose of planning, so that from the highest levels down to the schools there would be a climate in which planning could fruitfully take place. This is a fundamental institutional requirement. In several countries in the 1970s and 1980s, there was a tendency to establish special ad-hoc high-level committees with wide representation to advise the Government on desirable education policy changes.^{16/} These initiatives in providing development perspectives have not always been closely allied with the planning mechanism; thus they have preempted planning and, without the necessary extensive planning input, the resulting prescriptions have left large

^{15/} National education development plans generally contain elaborate statements of projected growth and modernization of the school system but nothing about the strengthening of management, planning and research to cope with the growing and changing system. The central ministries in both Sierra Leone and Madagascar noted that sectoral planning units tend to neglect planning for staff development.

^{16/} For example, in Sierra Leone, the Sierra Leone Education Review (1973-76); in Zambia, the Educational Reform (1977); in Madagascar, the policy committee of the Supreme Council of the Revolution (1984); in Kenya the National Committee on Education Objectives and Priorities (1970s). A not very different task was undertaken by the Project Unit in Sierra Leone in 1979 with Unesco assistance - a sector study; the education planning unit was only marginally involved.

questions open about their implementability. University planning, which emerged somewhat later, has encountered a similar problem of low status.^{17/}

2.07 Research. The research needs of the LDCs have always been vast. The education systems of Sub-Saharan Africa were largely patterned after metropolitan ones and the extent to which they could be successfully adapted to local needs depended upon how well the local situation and needs were known. Each country required far more information about itself than it had on such matters as its socio-economic profiles, the learning process and its problems, the effectiveness of resources used in education, returns to education, the evolving social attitudes to education, the management problem and the size and requirements of the labor market. Meeting these needs, even over the two decades in which most countries have been independent, would have required far more investment, organization and purpose than have been devoted to it. Educational research has owed most of its standing in Sub-Saharan Africa to the universities. Faculties, Departments or Schools of Education have institutionalized their research services to education in the form of an Institute of Education (Sierra Leone), a National Pedagogical Institute (Mali), or a Bureau of Educational Research (Zambia) to meet the needs of the education system, in closer and more active contact with the Ministries of Education. These services, however, have been severely limited by the resources placed at their disposal.^{18/} Ministries of Education have not generally maintained research sections which would be capable of effective evaluation and liaison with the research community and the planning function. Thus there remain vast unmet research needs and these are reflected in the large numbers of studies financed under various projects to provide answers essential for specific decisions.^{19/}

2.08 Research, as an indispensable function of higher education institutions, directed at critical national problems, with direct implications for teaching - both as to its standard and as to its relevance to the needs of

^{17/} In Zambia, the university planning unit (established in 1972) is principally a statistics service. The real planning takes place elsewhere. In the University of Sierra Leone, a planning unit was established in 1977 and has produced a long range 1982-92 plan. It is still very understaffed (one professional who is part time) and not fully accepted. In Madagascar, the responsibility of planning for University development is vested in a unit within the Ministry of Higher Education and this unit, by reason of its separation from the University and shortage of specialist staff, is ill equipped to undertake university planning.

^{18/} In 1984 the Bureau of Educational Research in the University of Zambia had four professionals; the Institute of Education Sierra Leone has a research section which, for several years, comprised one professional.

^{19/} See Annex 3 on Bank Experience. Studies/research were included in some 54 of the 87 projects containing institutional development components. See also para. 4.38.

the students - has taken some time to begin to win some acceptance in Government as well as university circles in Sub-Saharan Africa. The new Sierra Leone university development plan expresses the university wish to be more research oriented. Some Madagascar university officials hope that arrangements could be made to establish institutes for the study of education and for social science research. In the light of the current scarcity of local resources, such initiatives would not be internally self-starting. They would require external aid. As with many other changes, the acceptance of a strong orientation toward research into national problems would be easier after it has demonstrated its usefulness.

(b) Staffing

2.09 The quantity. Many of the section heads in ministries of education interviewed by the mission felt that they were reasonably well staffed in regard to numbers or, at least, that the quantity of staff was low on their list of problems. There were some key exceptions, however, that merit underlining. The inadequacy of the number of school supervisors was noted in Zambia, Madagascar and Sierra Leone. In Zambia and Madagascar, there had been no expansion of the establishment since 1964, even in the face of vast growth in the school system. What was worse, however, was that there had been some decline in the actual number of supervisors over the period - in Madagascar, through attrition (as secondary school academic supervision was abandoned after the revolution of 1972 and vacancies arising from death or retirement have not been filled) and in Zambia, following the abolition of several posts in order to create the senior administrative positions required to establish the new Ministry of Higher Education.^{20/} There was a shortage of staff in educational planning in both ministries in Zambia, in the Madagascar Ministry of Higher Education, and in Sierra Leone. In Madagascar, where the Directorate of financial and administrative services of the Ministry of Basic and Secondary Education comprised some 341 staff positions, there was still some complaint of insufficient numbers. In Zambia, it was found that the financial management staff in both ministries of education was inadequate in number.^{21/} The same was true of the Administrative Services Section of the Ministry of General Education.^{22/}

^{20/} In Zambia as well there was inadequate supervisory personnel for the teacher training colleges in the Ministry of Higher Education. Despite a trebling of enrollment in primary and secondary schools since 1964, the total number of school supervisory positions had declined. In Sierra Leone, a 40% increase in secondary schools provoked no increase in supervisory staff. In the Tamatave provincial headquarters in Madagascar, there were as many school inspectors on the establishment in 1984 as there had been in 1975 despite a growth during this period from 944 to 2,328 primary schools, 16 to 91 lower secondary schools and from four to 13 upper secondary schools to be supervised.

^{21/} See paras. 4.3, 4.4 of Annex 1.

^{22/} This small unit is concerned with transport; maintenance of headquarters buildings; procurement of supplies, office space and housing for headquarters staff; servicing local, regional and national education councils; school discipline; accidents; participation in national celebrations and management of support staff.

Services such as broadcasting and publications, which have been neglected in recent years in both Zambia and Sierra Leone, were also short of staff. In Madagascar, Zambia and Sierra Leone there was an acute shortage of staff in the provinces to respond adequately to special problems of teachers serving in remote areas and the information and administrative requirements of the central ministries in regard to rural schools.

2.10 The quantitative needs clearly depend not simply on the terms of reference of the service or unit concerned but also upon the mode of operation, and the technology involved. Thus norms or standards for numbers of staff cannot be established in isolation from these factors. They proceed from detailed study of each unit within a ministry. Reference to the norms of developed countries would be of little use, since the high administrative cost of effecting change in the developing countries would not be well captured. The mission found that there was no strong unit in Government service responsible for assessing ministerial staffing needs, such as "organization and methods" (O & M) units. Not surprisingly, therefore, the approach adopted by core units (establishment, ministries of finance, etc.) to the financial crisis was one of inaction on requests for new positions in the administration, rather than one of urgently reviewing, trimming, adjusting and redeploying resources to achieve greatest efficiency and economy. In those cases where close study reveals that there are more staff than required, some adjustment time would be needed to retrain the excess for other useful roles. The same holds good for any reorganization - that there are overhead adjustment costs while staff are being redeployed, and while leaner and more efficient units are being prepared and inserted in place of others. These adjustment costs should be eligible for development assistance.

2.11 Quality. The critical issue in regard to the manpower devoted to managing and planning education was one of quality, in the sense of both the dearth of specialists and the shortage of senior positions. In the countries visited, there was a recurring theme of the lack of specialists in certain disciplines which are strategic in educational administration, in particular, accountancy, statistics, planning, architecture and project execution and administration. These are not persons who are in abundant supply in any case. However, the shortage of them in the public service stems partly from the poor salaries offered them by comparison with the private sector and partly from the lack of sufficiently senior posts to absorb them.

2.12 In the finance services in the ministries of education in Zambia and Sierra Leone, there was no professional accountant, despite the large size of the budgets being managed, even though the establishment provides liberally for assistant level staff of some accounting experience. As a result, one does not find a real financial management service in the Government ministry which accounts for a large part of public expenditure; one finds merely a weak accounting function. Financial planning is also absent. The more senior positions, requiring persons with some training in accountancy, were being filled with experienced, but untrained, assistant level staff. In regard to statistics, there was a similar absence of a fully qualified statistician. Some incumbents had received useful short courses, such those from the Zambia Ministry of General Education and Culture who had been sent to Ghana, and the statistician in the Madagascar

Ministry of Basic and Secondary Education who had been trained in France. The situation of so few (or only partly trained) statisticians to control the statistical services for the entire education system is clearly untenable in development management. It is not surprising that in no country could reliable up-to-date education statistics be found.

2.13 Despite extensive training in planning over the years for Sub-Saharan African staff, by IIEP, the Unesco Regional Office in Dakar and bilateral agencies, relatively few trained planners could be found by the October 1984 mission in educational planning positions. In Madagascar, the head of neither of the two ministry planning units was a trained planner. In Zambia, three persons had been trained by IIEP: one was head of the unit in the Ministry of General Education, one had died and one had retired. Some persons were being trained in the UK. In Sierra Leone, only one trained planner was in the unit. Whatever the attrition problems, there was simply no supply of planners on the scale needed. Officials of central ministries of finance and planning, although fully aware of the resource limitations faced by educational planning services, commented on the shortcomings in the analytical and forecasting capacity of the planning and financial management services in ministries of education and on the insufficiency of links among subsectors in the planning function.

2.14 There was a shortage as well of persons trained in management - whether public administration or personnel or business management and educational administration. Several section heads in the professional services expressed the need for their staff and themselves to receive training in modern methods of management or administration.

2.15 The capacity of ministries of education to service and coordinate external aid programs and to design, generate and implement projects was also quite limited. The proliferation of projects in most African projects presents special management problems. Not only are the numbers of projects large but the number of sources of assistance, each with its own requirements for project generation, implementation and reporting is large as well.^{23/} The coordination functions are much more onerous than the ministries appear to appreciate. In Madagascar, an available grant from the European Development Fund for rehabilitation of hurricane damaged schools was lost because the Ministry of Secondary and Basic Education could not cost and prepare a properly justified request. In Zambia, some fellowship offers are not taken up because the Ministry cannot respond in time. With regard to implementing projects, in Sierra Leone and Zambia, despite the interest of these ministries in managing their own projects, the education project implementation units were established outside the ministries of education. In Sierra Leone, local implementation capacity

^{23/} According to the Annual Report on Development Assistance prepared by the Office of the UNDP Resident Representative, in education and training alone there were 52 externally financed projects with 20 separate sources of financing in Zambia in 1983, 22 projects from 13 sources in Mali in 1982 and 16 projects from 11 sources in Madagascar in 1982.

was developed, but in Zambia it was much more limited.^{24/} The need appears quite urgent for services capable of efficiently managing the implementation of development programs and projects in the sector regardless of sources of funding. This will need a new perspective which treats the implementation of development programs as a permanent feature of developing countries regarding its own permanent establishment of qualified and adequate staff.

2.16 Staff development. One of the most urgent prerequisites of institutional development in ministries of education in Sub-Saharan Africa is staff development on a large scale. This study identifies a few disciplines considered strategic to development merely so as to illustrate the problem, not as a brief for staff development planning. The resolution of these problems, with the exception of some aspects of professional educational administration (curriculum development, examinations and so on) which are peculiar to education, would need to be pursued in the context of the overall public service or national need for the kinds of personnel. Indeed, no alternative to such an approach is possible in Zambia where specialists are seconded from a central service - statistical staff from the Central Statistical Office, accounting staff from the Ministry of Finance, architects from the Ministry of Works and personnel officers from the Personnel Department - to the Ministry in which they are assigned and are liable to be transferred to serve anywhere in the public service. This means that a staff development program in these specializations must address public service needs on a whole in order to remedy individual ministry problems.

^{24/} In Sierra Leone, the project unit was located in the Ministry of Finance and has successfully operated without technical assistance after the First Project. In Zambia, it was established outside the Ministry of Education and no systematic staff development for Zambian staff was ever put in place; some training has occurred of two Zambians mainly at their own initiative, but the conduct of project management is still, for the foreseeable future, under NORAD aid personnel. Several Zambian officials were harshly critical of this, especially as they felt that the Bank was to blame. The individual aid staff, recruited on two year contracts, while also deploring the situation, saw their job as an executive rather than a training one, and in a short term rather than long term horizon.

2.17 The longer term solution to the deficiencies in the key areas identified is to develop the universities within the countries, especially in the areas of management, economics and the social sciences.^{25/} Attention to university development in these fields in Sub-Sahara Africa by the Bank-financed projects has been negligible except in management.^{26/} Existing public administration and management training programs need strengthening or supplementing especially for the needs of senior level

^{25/} The weaknesses of the universities in certain disciplines is being felt in various ways. In Zambia, Madagascar and Sierra Leone, statistics is not offered as a specialization, although it is included in the broader fields of mathematics and economics. The countries resort to foreign training and, in the case of Zambia, to large numbers of foreign statisticians. The University of Sierra Leone is seeking to strengthen its training in statistics by creating a new department within either the mathematics or the economics program.

In accountancy, the only professional training in Madagascar is offered in the Center for Training in Accountancy recently established with assistance from a Bank loan. Some accountancy is offered in the Universities of Sierra Leone (as a very minor option in the economics program) and in Zambia (which does not go up to the professional level). Thus a large training void exists in these countries. (See also para. 3.15).

Management is offered in the universities, but is generally weak. In Madagascar, the undergraduate program has 12 nationals on the full time staff and 13 bilateral technical staff to cope with 2500 students - a staff:student ratio of 1:100 - practically no library books, library seating for about 20 students at a time, an almost total absence of textbooks (students generally receiving their text material from the blackboard or stencilled instructors' notes) and insufficient and poor equipment. Employers simply do not regard the graduates seriously as managers. An appropriate higher level management program is yet to be arranged. In Sierra Leone, the Institute of Public Administration and Management has recently begun operations, but has not yet begun to offer higher level training in management. The University of Zambia Business Studies program contained 396 students in 1983-84, all undergraduate.

Economics and the social sciences are mentioned here as the basis for much of the socio economic analysis and research which planning and management of the sector requires but which is not now adequately attended to. Efficiency studies, monitoring, resource allocation and resource utilization, for example, would require personnel with a strong background in these disciplines.

^{26/} See para. 4.38.

managers.^{27/} This means assisting in developing post graduate programs in these fields as well as in educational administration.^{28/} Several university authorities mentioned the lack of opportunities for their staff to keep abreast of developments in their fields. What is happening is that higher education in Sub-Saharan Africa is being redefined through steady attrition of essential resources; with consequent devaluation of output and long term injury to national institutional development.

(c) Physical Infrastructure

2.18 The physical facilities within which Ministries of Education operate were found to be generally sub-standard. On the one extreme, for example in Sierra Leone, there were some unsafe, dilapidated buildings at head office in Freetown, or quite unsatisfactory borrowed buildings for the district office in Bo. On the other extreme, there were the few reasonably good facilities which had been provided under Bank assisted projects.^{29/} Even in some of these new, project-supplied buildings (provincial headquarters in Tamatave, Madagascar, the Educational Planning Unit Office in Sierra Leone) there was already evidence of inadequate maintenance. Despite the valid complaints of staff at central and especially at provincial or district levels about the inadequacies in accommodation, the capital expenditure programs of the ministries neglect this critical need in favor of school expansion. The current conditions of overcrowding, disrepair and discomfort do not augur well for efficient performance. Warehousing facilities for supplies and equipment are generally inadequate.

^{27/} These institutions include the newly established Institute for Techniques of Planning (IMATEP) in Madagascar for training in planning, National Institute of Public Administration in Zambia and the Institute of Public Administration and Management in Sierra Leone.

^{28/} Because of resource constraints, the M. Ed course in Zambia was suspended for the Academic Year 1984-85. Generally, in both Sierra Leone and Zambia, strengthening of these post-graduate programs (through staffing and equipment and information resources) is needed.

^{29/} These included (1) buildings for certain central services such as Audio-Visual Aids, Printing Services, Technical Education and Vocational Training Department provided under Zambia III - The Ministry of Higher Education, created after the loan was approved, occupied the facilities intended for the Department of Technical Education and Vocational Training; (2) provincial headquarters (offices and teacher training and pedagogical centers) provided under Madagascar II, (3) Educational Planning Unit office, provided under Sierra Leone II.

2.19 The equipment needs of the ministries are also neglected. The use of data processing equipment is minimal.^{30/} There is generally a shortage of filing cabinets, shelving, calculators, typewriters and stationery. While the recent shortage of foreign exchange had accentuated the problem, the inadequacy of appropriations for these purposes over several years was to blame. As with buildings, the better off units were so because of external aid projects which had provided these requisites. As noted above (para. 1.06), vehicles for transport are a scarce commodity. Services which, at a minimum, needed a fleet of 30-80 vehicles of various types were operating with less than 10% of their needs. The problem is partly one of the initial supply of vehicles being well below the demand; it is also one of the extraordinarily short life of vehicles which are, on the whole, abused, misused, poorly maintained and insufficiently supported by an inadequate operating budget.^{31/}

(d) Operations Systems and Organizational Behavior

2.20 The problems noted in regard to the deteriorating financial situation and deficiencies in staffing and physical infrastructure are exacerbated by shortcomings in what may be termed "operations systems and organizational behaviour". The most striking of these are the problems of coordination and the tendency toward fragmentation.

2.21 Coordination. One major problem is that of coordination among and within ministries and training institutions. In all countries visited by the mission, officials noted that the problem of cooperation was widespread, but at varying levels of intensity. Many activities proceed in relative isolation from related activities elsewhere.

2.22 The long term objectives of educational development plans, for example, are seldom well reflected in the annual education development programs; the latter appear to be formulated in terms not of long term objectives but of immediate decisions on available means. The overall national development objectives and the objectives of the education and training system are not always well interrelated.

2.23 Ministries and training institutions in Madagascar generally lack information as to how many persons should be trained, in which specializations and to what level. As a result, the intake in any post secondary and training institution is a function more of student

^{30/} A minicomputer was in use in the Planning Unit of the Ministry of Basic and Secondary Education in Madagascar in the statistician's office.

^{31/} Central Government vehicle maintenance centers often do not have the necessary spare parts because of lack of funds or foreign exchange to purchase them. They have generally failed to serve the needs of sector ministries adequately.

demand and the intake capacity than of either the employment situation or the development needs of the country.^{32/} Yet the information resources of the Director-General of the Civil Service and the Secretary General of the Union of Enterprises (Groupement des Entreprises de Madagascar), which represents 80 per cent or more of actual and potential employment for persons with full secondary education and beyond, are not tapped.

2.24 Fragmentation. Another major problem is the tendency toward fragmentation of management structures and of education and training institutions. In Zambia and Madagascar, education is organized under more than one ministry - the Ministries of General Education and Culture and of Higher Education in Zambia; Ministries of Secondary and Basic Education and of Higher Education in Madagascar. This has led in both countries to a considerable diffusion of the national planning effort in the sector among various ministries and institutions^{33/} and the consequent weakness of individual planning units, none of which approaches a level which could be called adequately staffed. The problem is recognized by officials in both countries but the problem of where to locate a common planning unit remains unresolved. The decision to create two separate ministries for education was taken because it was felt that the demands of primary and secondary education were so vast that they prevented attention being devoted to the serious problems of higher education. However, there have been considerable additional administrative overheads involved in establishing a separate administration for higher education and some questions arise as to the financial feasibility of a separate ministry for the operation of higher level educational institutions that are, in any event, largely self

^{32/} This is equally true for the University, for technical schools under the Ministry of Secondary and Basic Education and for the National Institute for Pre-service and In-service Training (Institut National de Promotion Formation - INPF) under the Ministry of Civil Service and Labour.

^{33/} In Zambia, planning for education occurs in four units - the Ministry of General Education and Culture does planning for primary and secondary education and provides a statistical service for the entire school system; the Ministry of Higher Education is responsible for planning teacher training, technical education and vocational training and the University; the University of Zambia has its own planning unit; finally, the Social Development Department of the Ministry of Labor controls and plans for non-formal Adult Education. The interrelationships of primary with teacher training, secondary with teacher training and secondary with university illustrate some of the problems inherent in this division of responsibility, since these logical counterparts are in separate ministries. In Madagascar, the Ministry of Basic and Secondary Education, the Ministry of Higher Education and the University each has its separate planning unit.

administered and in countries where the entire higher education system is fairly small.^{34/}

2.25 In Zambia, Madagascar and Sierra Leone, geographical decentralization of the ministries of education has taken place so as to help in bringing the administration closer in touch with the situation at the local level. However, for each office established, there is a cost (a) in administrative overheads, (b) in delays where the district office must deal with and coordinate its operations with a local government authority in addition to the central ministry of education, and (c) in the major staff training effort which is needed at a local level in services such as planning, statistical data collection and personnel and financial management. A significant part of the already inadequate senior staff resources of the headquarters becomes involved in this training effort. This is most evident in Zambia, where the decentralization process is going on. In Madagascar, where the decentralization dates back earlier, and is greater, the problems are still quite severe. In Sierra Leone, for lack of resources to establish effective links between head office and the districts, the district offices are virtually on their own. Thus these decentralization efforts, undertaken without adequate preparation and a sufficiently strong headquarters nucleus, have resulted in further fragmentation of management structures and worsening of problems of coordination and of communication between the Ministry and its decentralized offices. This needs to be borne in mind by those who routinely advocate decentralizations.

2.26 There has been a trend toward creating a new institution to meet particular new needs instead of strengthening existing institutions. In management training, at least four institutions exist in Madagascar,^{35/} and consideration is being given to creating a Higher Institute of Management. Yet some of the activities covered by these institutions could have been conducted in a more coordinated way, either by establishing a new

^{34/} In Zambia 1984, the numerical ratio of staff at head office to the staff in the schools supervised was roughly 1:30 in the Ministry of General Education, compared to 1:8 in the case of the Ministry of Higher Education, although about 25% of those calculated as school staff in institutions supervised by the Ministry of Higher Education were administrative and clerical. In Madagascar, the comparable ratios in 1982 were 1:25 for the Ministry of Basic and Secondary Education, and 1:6 for the higher education ministry in regard to staff numbers, and 1:18 and 1:7 respectively, in regard to the salary budget. Even so, complaints in Madagascar, where the university is dispersed over the provinces, are that services from the head office of the Ministry do not readily reach the provinces.

^{35/} (1) The National Institute for Pre-service and In-service Training (INPF) which has a management training section and which is under the Ministry of Civil Service and Labour; (2) Business Administration Training Centre (Centre de Formation de Cadres) under the Ministry of Industry and Commerce; (3) Accountancy Training Centre under the Ministry of Finance; and (4) the recently created Madagascar Institute for Techniques of Planning (IMATEP) under the Office of the President.

institution or by strengthening an existing one. In addition, the Faculty of Law, Economics, Management and Sociology of the university offers a specialization in management at the Master's level in Antananarivo and in Tamatave there is a Faculty of Management, admittedly very weak, offering courses up to Ph.D level. This pattern of dispersion poses difficulty in mobilizing, channelling and utilizing efficiently the scarce teaching and research talents available. In addition, to the extent that the university is excluded from these newer developments it is not being assisted to move away from academicism.

2.27 It requires no investment, additional staff and increase in recurrent funds to improve this situation: it needs simply a fundamental change in working habits and management style so that collaboration and consultation become institutionalized. This goes further than establishing coordinating committees which, experience has shown, are often inefficient and rapidly fall into disuse.

(e) Information

2.28 The information resources available to the administration are a most powerful determinant of the quality of its decisions and policies.^{36/} Some decision-making and policy-making can be postponed until good information becomes available; however, given the usual exigencies, decisions and the policies often have to be made on the basis of inadequate information and less than sound assumptions. This critical problem of information was shared by all the ministries visited by the mission. Ironically enough, among the information lacking was where to find various forms of development assistance.

36/ In this context, information resources would include:

- (1) statistical data about the society, the economy and the education system;
- (2) materials (journals, books, articles) on various aspects of education, locally as well as in other parts of the world;
- (3) findings of research and special studies concerning the national education system and relevant aspects of the socio-economic system in which it is set;
- (4) findings of evaluations of the education system;
- (5) views of managers and staff at all levels in the education system as well as, where relevant, views of the rest of the public sector and of the private sector as well; and
- (6) the national policies and plans for the country as a whole and the national education sector plans and policies.

Included as well would be ready access to these resources and this encompasses aspects of retrieval and dissemination.

2.29 The collection of statistical data on the school system is uneven, incomplete and unreliable. Much of this operation depends upon the mail system and upon the quality and standards of the school principals. Responses are slow and need correction. In Sierra Leone, following about a decade of UK and USA volunteer assistance, a statistical unit is operating but is experiencing considerable difficulty in obtaining timely and accurate responses to questionnaires. In Zambia, data are first collected at the provincial level; however with the junior, often untrained clerks involved and the lack of transport for school supervisors or clerks to verify data, the information is unreliable. In Madagascar the problem is similar.

2.30 The stage of processing and analysis of the data presents several problems because of shortage of data processing equipment and qualified personnel. Computer facilities are in short supply.^{37/} Consequently, the processed data are produced late, occasionally too late to be of any current value. In Mali, the latest statistical yearbook available in November 1984 was for the year 1979.

2.31 The ministries of education visited by the mission lacked libraries or book collections for the use of their headquarters and district staff, let alone for the use of teachers. As one school supervisor in a district said to the mission, their task is to provide professional guidance and support for the teachers and yet they have no library that teachers or school supervisors can use, in order to keep abreast of developments in their profession. Materials produced by Unesco, ILO and the Bank are rarely to be seen, even though many of them are available to the countries free of charge. The supply of professional literature and information about educational developments and practices in other parts of the world, along with the services of documentalists and librarians to service such materials, is one of the most pressing needs of institutional development in ministries, institutes and faculties of education. The parlous state of the national library services, which generally fall under the ministries of education, suggests that the dearth of library and documentation services to support Government operations is much more widespread in its effects. Almost universally, Government departments and university departments complain about the lack of documentation services.

^{37/} In Madagascar, there is a small electronic data processing machine in the planning unit of the Ministry of Basic and Secondary Education. The University uses the computer facilities of the National Institute for Statistics and Economic Research (of the Ministry of Finance and the Economy) which also serves other ministries. In Sierra Leone, most of the statistical clerks are temporary and no computer facilities are available for the planning unit which is responsible for data processing.

2.32 The management and planning of education require information about research findings in the sector. The education systems are not research oriented. Monitoring and evaluation systems have been neither established nor institutionalized.^{38/} As indicated above (paras. 2.07-2.08) the national educational research effort is negligible; furthermore, there are formidable obstacles to the printing and dissemination of such research as is done (para. 1.08).

2.33 One of the critical weaknesses of educational planning in the countries visited is its relative isolation from data on such things as national manpower and demographic trends, emerging socio-economic profiles of the community, the changing technologies, overall economic development problems and prospects. This is the result of two separate issues. One relates to the general weaknesses at the national level in these areas of information and research. The other is that the education planning services have not been able to ferret out and exploit the available data for their own purposes.

2.34 The interaction among staff involved in administration is another means by which information might be shared. In Zambia, Madagascar and Sierra Leone, there are periodic meetings of senior education staff from all over the country. In Sierra Leone these meetings occur only once per year. The predominant means of communication tends to be from the top down or the centre outward and by circular through the mail. Apart from the inefficiencies inherent in this means of communication, it does not promote the better informing of decision-making at the centre.

2.35 The modernizing of educational administration will require a revolutionary change in the current approaches to the generation and use of information. In no country visited were there steps taken to establishing

^{38/} There have been occasional tracer studies such as those conducted by the University of Zambia and in the Ministry of Education Planning Unit in Sierra Leone in the late 1970s. However, these have not been kept up. Even such monitoring or evaluative exercises as the analysis of the results of national examinations, with a view to assisting in the diagnosis and investigation of teaching and learning problems, are not now carried out. Information on the cost, size and performance of the administration are not readily available, because systems have not been designed to build the necessary data and track the movement of indices. The Ministry of Higher Education in Zambia hopes to be able to introduce an information system to evaluate management performance. The difficulties of establishing, monitoring and evaluation units in Ministries of Education in Kenya, Tanzania, Sierra Leone and Liberia were reviewed in a report of the Bank in 1979; "Built-in Project Monitoring and Evaluation: A Second Review", Operations Evaluation Department Report No. 2724, November 1979.

a new information system. One experience of Madagascar bears out the extensive need for training in any such endeavour.^{39/}

2.36 (f) Conclusion. The study does not put forward pre-designated priority areas of attention. Nor does it seek to separate levels of management, planning and research. To the contrary it assumes that the fate and effectiveness of each level are inextricably interwoven with those of another level. The role of leadership is to inspire staff; to promote useful collaboration with the parents, other sectors and the private sector generally in education and training; to review, evaluate and streamline procedures; to recruit the competent staff and to deploy them appropriately; to make the difficult choices and win consensus on these and to ensure realism in the development perspectives and consistency and coordination in implementing development. All levels and sections of the agency concerned make their contribution to the effectiveness of the agency. Thus, when the agency is not functioning effectively, the problems may be in the environment or at any level of the agency, and the diagnosis of each case determines the deficiency or need and the consequent remedial priorities.

2.37 Whether the investment required is in training, reorganization, physical plant or information and whether it is in administration, planning or research, the project can address all necessary items, some being spread over a longer time than others. There is no financial or human constraint upon a multi-faceted approach to resolving the problems. Indeed, a major conclusion of this paper is that the approach to institutional development needs to be coordinated and integral - involving the interplay of various types of resources and inputs - or it may wind up being ineffectual.

^{39/} In Madagascar, an external advisory agency designed a new budget procedure at the request of the Directorate of Public Expenditure and Investment of the Ministry of Finance. The new procedure is complex and requires the provision of much information which most ministries lack. Consequently, although a detailed manual of procedures was prepared, only 30% of the information cards, which have to be computer processed, are returned to the Ministry of Finance.

CHAPTER 3. PROBLEMS AND NEEDS OF INSTITUTION BUILDING IN
MANAGEMENT DEVELOPMENT AND VOCATIONAL TRAINING^{40/}

3.00 Any discussion of the problems of institutional development in Sub-Saharan Africa in management development and vocational training would need to recognize the peculiar situation of the private sector. In many countries a clear distinction should be drawn between the large, often foreign-owned, enclave operations in mining, forestry and plantations in various cash crops on the one hand and small scale, largely indigenous, entrepreneurship on the other. The first category tends to look after its own management development and vocational training needs and interacts only marginally with the governments on these. The second category, less well financed and less well connected internationally, tends to be slower to recognize the benefits of management development and vocational training, to invest less in these and to encompass a very wide range of resource levels among its membership. This latter group would ordinarily be far more dependent upon government initiatives and policies in management development and vocational training.

(a) Management Development

3.01 Background. During the past 20 years considerable efforts have been made in most Sub-Saharan African countries to promote management

^{40/} This section deals with the problems involved in institutionalising policy making, the formulation of priorities, strategies and plans, and the co-ordination and delivery of management development and vocational training in a country. The term "institution" is used to mean both (a) the total organisational, legal and administrative environment of management development and vocational training; and (b) individual organisations responsible for particular management development and vocational training services. The context in which each is used will clarify what is meant. Both public and private sector institutions are covered.

development^{41/} and training and to improve management in practice. The policy-making circles in these countries have become increasingly aware of problems with the quality of management in many public and private organisations and of the need for remedial measures. Large numbers of management institutes and centres have been established and a considerable amount of technical assistance has been channeled to this area. Yet the existing institutions are fragile, the programmes for managers are frequently criticised by the practitioners and the real impact of management development efforts on improving management in practice is not easy to demonstrate. In Sub-Saharan Africa, there have been difficulties in establishing strong public and private institutions which can be regarded as centers of excellence. This has limited the impact and effectiveness of management development and training in these areas.

3.02 These institutions have not been able to build up a strong reputation although they provide a full range of services such as conducting courses and undertaking consulting assignments. Managers in government and business are therefore reluctant to use their services for their strategic problems. They will use them only if their services are provided at little or no cost. Hitherto, only a few institutions have been exposed to the market test of being required to sell their services and find clients prepared to pay a full price for these services.

3.03 By its nature, the process of management development is quite different from formal education and vocational training. It is highly diversified and technically demanding and most of it occurs on-the-job. A management development program emphasises the practical needs of individual

41/ Management development is defined as post-education and post-experience formal and non-formal learning experiences which develop the knowledge, skills and attitudes for professional management of both public and private enterprises and other organisations; such organisations may exist at all levels from central/government departments (ministries) to local government.

Management development institutions include management schools, university departments, schools and institutes of public administration, management development institutes and centres, productivity centres, etc. They may be public organisations reporting to a ministry of education or to other ministries such as labour, manpower, public services, industry, commerce and trade, etc., or they may be independent private organisations (such as institutes of management formed by employers' organisations or groups of companies to serve their common management needs).

Institutional development therefore involves a wide array of interrelated items such as capacity building, professional staff development, effectiveness and efficiency of leadership, the institutionalising of operations, institutional linkages, the establishment of systems for national policy making and co-ordination as it relates to developing capacities for improving management in practice.

managerial positions and of persons holding these positions or preparing themselves for future jobs. It is therefore difficult to define what aspects of management development can and ought to be institutionalised, at what level and by whom.

3.04 Views differ on the need to institutionalise management development. One view is that every country and organisation should have a clearly spelled out management development policy and the institutional machinery for implementing this policy. Another view is that it is enough to make certain management development services and facilities available and to leave individual organisations and managers free to decide whether to use them. In practice, an appropriate institutional framework for management development is seldom defined and its elements seldom clearly identified. A systematic approach is seldom taken and countries rather proceed case by case, establishing individual institutions or introducing individual institutional measures (such as creating a national council for management development), as needs are recognised.

3.05 The relationship between the public and the private sector is delicate. In principle, an institutional framework for management development can serve either one of these sectors, or both. In most developing countries, the functions of the government in development also include the provision of institutions and services to the private sector. However, this institutional framework can be effective only if it correctly reflects the needs and aspirations of the private organisations served, if the government and the private sector work in harmony towards commonly agreed goals.

3.06 The efforts made so far in management development have suffered from problems of poor coordination, lack of financial autonomy, deficient staffing and limitations of mandate and scope.

3.07 Coordination. Coordination of institution-building efforts in all sectors, whether supported by the governments or by donor agencies, has been very limited. Too many measures for building institutions and systems in various sectors tend to be undertaken without any co-ordination with parallel or even competing efforts in other sectors. There are very few multi-sectoral and multi-purpose institutions serving various client groups, making optimum use of scarce resources and employing a critical mass of professional expertise. Instead, every ministry and donor agency tends to promote "its own", even small, institution, despite the resource constraints and bleak prospects for surviving without continuing technical assistance. Even the poorest countries of Sub-Saharan Africa have suffered from the proliferation of institutions and governments are reluctant to take the steps needed to co-ordinate, merge or even abolish institutions. Some countries, such as Nigeria in 1973, have established national councils and similar bodies for orienting and co-ordinating management development efforts in various sectors. These bodies have proved to be a useful institutional arrangement and platform for discussing policy issues and reviewing the experience of various sectors and institutions, but their real influence on management development in practice has remained limited.

3.08 Financing and Autonomy. A high, perhaps excessive, dependence on governments has been another prominent feature of the institutional framework for management development in Africa. In most countries, governments have established institutions for training managerial staff in the public sector, including public administration and public enterprises. In only a few cases, such as Nigeria and Kenya, are there independent private institutions providing training and other services to management. As for management development policies, many governments, such as the Government of Mali, have defined policies for public sector training, but little has been done to develop these policies for the private sector. This reflects the fact that in most African countries the employers' organisations do not provide meaningful guidance to members for improving management standards and developing managerial personnel nor establish services to members on a self-financing basis. For example, these organisations rarely send training consultants to their member companies to discuss training needs and seldom refer enquiries directly to management training institutions. They generally try to develop their own management training programmes, despite the shortage of training staff. As was discovered in an ILO 1983 survey of 42 employers' organisations, 12 of which were African, the main reason they give for this is that government-sponsored management institutions offer no training relevant to their needs.

3.09 In addition to dependence upon government funding, several efforts depend upon external aid. Because of poor resource planning and follow-up, the quality and quantity of training usually decline with the withdrawal of outside technical aid. Thus, in Madagascar and Mali, the volume of courses in some national training institutions directly relates to the volume of externally financed assistance. The general absence of management development institutions supported entirely by internal financing deserves study.

3.10 Institutions that do not enjoy decision-making and financial autonomy lack a high degree of motivation, and are not exposed to financial pressures which would stimulate them to make continuous efforts to improve services to clients, and to achieve a reasonable ratio between the costs of these services and the fees charged. Instead, many heads of institutions, such as in Madagascar and Mali, see the solution in further grants and subsidies, and further aid coming from donors, so they can continue delivering their current services, regardless of client acceptance. The total dependence of an institution on a government department means that clients have little influence on the institution that is supposed to serve them. Thus clients rarely feel a sense of shared responsibility for the development of their management institutions. Typically, in several African countries, both private and public sector clients criticise the attitudes and services of public administration and management institutes, but do not feel that they should take any initiative to help these institutes to become more performance oriented and more effective. Experience from other regions shows that without continuous interaction with the clients, and without adapting to the changing needs and demands of clients, management institutes quickly become irrelevant to their environment.

3.11 Staffing. Management institutions suffer serious staffing problems. Rarely can they attract and retain competent staff with both an excellent academic background and practical experience, since such professionals usually command better remuneration and more challenging work opportunities in private or even public enterprises. The Eastern and Southern African Management Institute (ESAMI) which offers professional salaries about 20 percent higher than the best paid civil service in the sub-region (Zimbabwe) and the Centre de Formation Comptable in Madagascar which offers quite good salaries, are exceptions. Leadership is a particularly important aspect of staffing. Few institutions are fortunate enough to be managed by directors or principals who are effective leaders both in the area of relations with the external world, and in orienting and motivating the institution's staff. Leadership could perhaps develop if chief institutional administrators were changed less often.

3.12 Limitations in Mandates and Scope. The narrowness of approach to management and administrative development used in most cases where policies have been defined has limited the services offered to clients. Training is usually treated as a separate and self-contained activity, unrelated to other measures and activities required to develop and implement practical changes leading to improved organizational performance. For example, some training policies foresee regular retraining, or an increase of the total training effort, without defining improvements to be made in career planning and development, staff motivation, planning and control procedures and so on. While effective training can be the first step toward improved performance, if the total effort is confined to staff training only, training produces little practical effect and managers become sceptical about its usefulness.

3.13 On the basis of their broad management development policies, several countries, such as Cameroon, have included in their national plans some targets for developing competent managerial personnel. However, some management training projects are inconsistent with the development goals of the countries and, even where some planning takes place, it is rarely followed through systematically. The actual training tends to be determined rather by short term criteria, and the immediate availability of resources, than by long term needs and priorities. For example, in Sierra Leone and Zambia the Institutes of Public Administration and Management can promote only those courses that its small permanent staff can give, even though other and different training courses are urgently needed.

3.14 Existing management training systems do not cater for significant sections of the national need. In Zambia, public service staff is served by an institute of public administration, but no institution provides induction training for newly recruited civil servants. The civil service training college in Sierra Leone has been closed since mid 1983. In Madagascar, where several institutions offer overlapping programmes, certain training needs, such as in the management of social sectors, are covered insufficiently. In general, managers in public administration and the modern manufacturing and commercial sector tend to be better served by institutions than managers in sectors such as health, nutrition, food distribution, education, rural and community development.

3.15 The importance of accounting and financial management to the efficient investment and control of scarce resources is increasingly recognised. A few countries have established institutions for developing accounting practice and training accounting personnel - the Centre de Formation Comptable in Benin, the College of Accountancy in Malawi, the Institute of Financial Management in Tanzania, or the Centre de Formation Comptable in Madagascar. In many other countries, however, facilities for accountancy education and training are quite inadequate and the governments have not as yet fully recognized the seriousness of the problem.

3.16 Certain institutions suffer from mandates and objectives which are vague and ambiguous. In particular, they view themselves as establishments for providing training courses, and not as institutions whose ultimate objective is to improve the quality of management and administration in practice. This concept of the mandate affects the choice of intervention methods and the ways in which the services are evaluated. There are examples of institutions that have developed results-oriented services in close collaboration with the clients.^{42/}

^{42/} This has been the case with the National Productivity Centre in Ethiopia (NPC) which recently became part of the Ethiopian Management Institute; this Centre has implemented an extensive performance improvement programme in maintenance in collaboration with over 100 client factories. In 1983 for example, managers of over 50 factories were able to credit NPC with helping them implement hundreds of maintenance improvements. Audits showed significant improvements in equipment availability, product quality and foreign exchange expenditures for spare parts in most of the 50 participating factories. Five factories estimated that their improvements had resulted in considerable financial savings in 1983. In exchange for these valuable services NPC was able to increase its fees to its clients annually. See "Training through consultancy to improve maintenance management," Journal of European Industrial Training, September 1983, pages 10-14 for a more complete description of this programme.

In Zaire, the in-house training centre of the REGIDESO (the national water authority) has concentrated on programmes that help improve services to clients, reduce break-down and losses in water supply, and build up internal management services for increasing the efficiency of operations. One market test of the effectiveness of REGIDESO is that since 1983, water authorities in neighbouring countries have been sending trainees to REGIDESO, some paid for by the authorities and some by UNICEF and WHO. However, few other African institutions can claim these sorts of specific, measurable achievements. The recent ILO study of management development carried out by or sponsored by employers' organisations indicated that Kenya and Uganda are among the countries that seek to ascertain out whether managers apply what they learn, while in Europe and Asia many institutions now evaluate whether managers use what they learn.

3.17 Most institutions focus on developing and offering off-the-job training courses of varying duration and for various categories of managers and administrators. Consulting and in-plant training have received less attention and rarely exceed 10-20% of the total volume of work. Research capabilities are weak. Owing to their limited involvement in consulting and research, many institutions lack insight into the day to day realities of management and administration in their country, and see no alternative to teaching courses transferred from other countries, as a rule from those that provided technical assistance.

3.18 In order to respond to the real needs of development administration, public administration training must take a realistic management approach to economic development in each particular country. However, public administration institutions in Africa rarely provide action-oriented courses in the management of development processes. Too often these institutions emphasize laws, regulations, the administrative process and environment, and communication techniques, (especially written ones). The Ecole Nationale d'Administration et de Magistrature in Cameroon is an example of this kind of institution, despite the good technical level of its current programmes.

3.19 Institutions with fully adequate physical facilities for teaching, offices, library, reproduction, lodging (where necessary) and meal services are rare in Africa. In many institutions, in particular in Zambia, Madagascar and Mali, physical facilities are inadequate, or their development did not keep pace with the growth of the services. Often, insufficient provision has been made for maintenance and modernisation. In some African countries, deterioration of facilities is rapid because of reductions made in appropriation for supplies and maintenance. This seriously affects the quality and scope of the training which they can provide. The situation in Sierra Leone, where the Institute of Public Administration and Management was provided with physical plant under the Second Education Project, is generally satisfactory.

(b) Management of Vocational Training

3.20 This section deals with the problems and needs of institutions or bodies charged with administration of non-formal vocational training.^{43/} These problems include (a) a background of relatively recent origin of efforts to organize vocational training and the social attitudes which prevail concerning vocational training, (b) the problem of response to labor market requirements, (c) coordination of vocational training, (d) financial arrangements for vocational training and (e) the scarcity of managerial personnel in this subsector of training.

^{43/} Non-formal vocational training is defined - for the purpose of this paper - as any organized initial and further training or retraining of youth and adults outside the formal education and training system, which is intended to develop capabilities for productive work at various levels of skill and responsibility.

3.21 Background. The need for non-formal training, and consequently for institutions responsible for formulating and implementing policies and plans for it arises from a demand by the labour market for large numbers of workers with knowledge, attitudes and skills which are closely matched to available employment opportunities, and which in many cases cannot be provided by formal education and training institutions. The reasons why the system of formal education and training has not been in a position in many Sub-Saharan African countries to respond to the demands of the labour market for this type of skills are many and varied. The high cost and inappropriateness of many of its programs to the needs of the workplace, its concentration on initial training, its exclusion of adults and its limitation to those who have achieved certain levels of general education are among these reasons. Public perceptions have contributed to a misunderstanding of its purpose - the formal system in the vocational area is often seen as a consolation prize for those who fail to gain entry into the general education streams of the school system and there is widespread belief in a guarantee of employment in the public service for all graduates. Changing such attitudes and expectations is difficult, takes time and requires a change in the conditions which generated these attitudes.

3.22 Another major force responsible for the creation of non-formal training systems is the expectation by governments that these can (a) play a role in stimulating economic development (by enhancing the skills of the labor force), (b) help to replace expatriates by qualified nationals and (c) coordinate the various ad hoc training arrangements organized by government and private bodies, thus maximizing efficiency and avoiding waste. Several sub-Saharan African countries, for example, have established institutions to manage training during the rapid economic growth period of the 1960s and early 1970s (for instance, the Ivory Coast, Kenya, Madagascar, and Zaire), while other countries (for instance, Botswana, Cameroon, Central African Republic and Niger) have created such institutions in the late 1970s and early 1980s, a period of less buoyant growth.

3.23 Present economic difficulties have placed many sub-Saharan African countries in something of a dilemma. On the one hand, vocational training which does not lead to employment appears to be an exercise in futility that these countries simply cannot afford. On the other hand, there is a shortage of trained, skilled workers and technicians to build, repair and maintain the assets for sustained economic development.

3.24 Four major organizational models of institutional arrangements for managing non-formal vocational training in Sub-Saharan Africa can be identified, reflecting the most common patterns of allocation of responsibility for non-formal training. These place responsibility under the Ministry of Labor or Ministry of Education, on another ministry or in several ministries.^{44/}

^{44/} See Annex 2.

3.25 In most countries, institutional arrangements have not had the flexibility needed to adjust constantly to the evolving social and economic environment and the development of such institutions and of the capacity to manage vocational training has been haphazard and not always smooth. Many of the institutions for managing non-formal vocational training are in the midst of a period of transition, searching to break away from old models - often inherited - and to find their own way of planning and implementing cost-effective vocational training that addresses the needs and circumstances of the countries concerned.^{45/}

3.26 It is as yet too early in most cases, to judge how cost effective and efficient these new and reformed institutional arrangements are, whether the schemes, programmes and centres for which they are responsible will attract a sufficient number of potential trainees of high calibre and how smoothly the outputs will be absorbed into employment that contributes to national economic and social development. However, it has been observed that some of the more flexible and efficient national training management arrangements (e.g. in the Ivory Coast and Kenya) offer a range of training schemes at varying levels and duration that go beyond exclusively long-term (about threeyears) broad-based in-centre training and which include, for instance apprenticeship schemes and sandwich courses, tailor-made courses for enterprises or sectoral development projects, short-term upgrading, updating and retraining schemes through evening courses, advisory services to enterprises to assist them in establishing in-plant training, mobile training units, and skill testing and trade certification schemes.

3.27 This variety of training services allows for more rapid adjustment of course content and supply of output, to satisfy demands for skilled labour in a rapidly changing labour market, and therefore generates high returns on investment. However, few of the institutions for managing non-formal vocational training have achieved a sufficient degree of diversification and flexibility.

^{45/} For instance, during the past five years, legislation was passed on vocational training in Botswana (Apprenticeship and Industrial Training Act, 1983), in Gambia (National Vocational Training Act, 1979), in the Ivory Coast (Recurrent Vocational Training Act, 1977), in Swaziland (Industrial and Vocational Training Act, 1982). In recent years a number of countries have set up or changed existing autonomous and semi-autonomous training institutions (Burundi 1979, Benin 1981, Cameroon 1981, Central African Republic 1980, Ivory Coast 1982, Niger 1981, Senegal 1983, Botswana 1983, etc.). During the 1970s and 1980s, legislation concerning training levy systems has also been passed or updated in many countries. In other countries, such as Madagascar, national enquiries or surveys are under way, which may lead in the very near future to major readjustments of the national education and training systems and consequently of their institutions. All these reforms and adjustment efforts show the will of a large number of sub-Saharan African countries to ensure that their training institutions are encouraged to render their skill acquisition system more responsive to specific national, economic and social realities and needs.

3.28 Problem of Response to Labor Market Requirements. An important hurdle to overcome is the lack of reliable data on manpower supply and demand on the basis of which to formulate training priorities, strategies and activities. Hence, many sub-Saharan African countries have been unable to adopt a realistic manpower policy and to elaborate such priorities and strategies.

3.29 Recognition of the extent to which they share these difficulties has led a large number of Sub-Saharan African countries to pool their national efforts under a regional project sponsored by the Inter-African Centre for the Development of Vocational Training - CIADFOR - with which the ILO is associated.^{46/} On the basis of work carried out under this project and country studies prepared on the topic, a number of common needs have been identified:

- improve the systems of collecting data needed for a better knowledge of the labour market and of the training systems;
 - develop ways to analyze the relationship between training and employment;
- coordinate efficiently the work of the various national institutions involved in economic and social development, employment and training;
- train national personnel in this field;
 - conduct surveys and studies to improve knowledge and understanding of the informal and non-formal sectors.

3.30 Present wage structures in many of the countries inadequately reflect the demand and supply of skills in the labour market. This exacerbates the difficulty of adjusting vocational training to labour market needs. Reports of several comprehensive ILO Employment Strategy Missions have concluded that the jobs available in the public sector - in many of the countries the main employer - are, by the inertia of tradition and vested interests, rigidly tied to the amount of education and academic credentials held, rather than to the type of education, training and experience of the individuals and their competence for particular jobs. Consequently the best among the young have no incentive to opt for careers as skilled workers and technicians, and prefer to pursue academic credentials to improve their job competitiveness.

3.31 A further deficiency is that vocational guidance, which ideally creates a link between the world of learning and the world of work by providing information on available training, further training and employment opportunities and conditions, is almost non-existent in most of the countries under study. Relevant and reliable information is lacking and the importance of vocational guidance is not always fully understood. Indeed, the main sources of vocational guidance for young people are family and friends and, in some cases, the general school system, sources which

^{46/} Angola, Benin, Cameroon, Central African Republic, Congo, Ivory Coast, Gabon, Senegal, Zaire.

are often insufficiently informed of available training, employment and career opportunities.

3.32 Coordination. One of the most striking features of vocational training, by comparison with other educational streams, is the fragmentation of its delivery is a task that has to be shared among various ministries, national training institutions, non-governmental bodies and enterprises. No single body could carry out the myriad interrelated functions that go into a smooth and dynamic vocational training system capable of providing the skilled manpower needed in all sectors of a national economy. Proper coordination is complex but necessary in order to avoid duplication of effort and waste of resources.

3.33 There is great variety of interested parties (sometimes with conflicting views) involved at different levels in assessing needs, formulating policy, organising, implementing and evaluating vocational training. The major reasons for this complexity are conflicting interests and competition for government funds among various ministries and those responsible for management of training; insufficiency of authority to existing national coordination bodies and councils and the failure of employers and workers, on occasion, to recognize the extent to which training serves their own best interests.

3.34 Improving coordination at all levels and among all interested parties will be a major area of concern in the years to come for most countries. At this stage, however, no common approach or pattern of coordination is discernible. Uncoordinated systems are particularly vulnerable to conflicting external assistance. Many cases can be found where different donors, working in cooperation with different ministries and institutions within one country, assist in setting up separate training schemes which either duplicate, overlap or contradict one another, or which do not conform to national standards.

3.35 Those responsible for sectoral development and other large investment projects often bypass the national institutions responsible for managing non-formal vocational training. This often leads to underestimation of the potential contribution of human capital and skill development to economic efficiency as well as to training of inferior quality and quantity, which, in turn, results in unsatisfactory productivity levels and low returns on investment. Moreover, there are seldom provisions for the training of manpower needed for the smooth operation, repair and maintenance beyond the actual implementation period of the project. Training within such investment projects is also frequently provided outside the context of national vocational training systems and institutions. Little consideration is given, in the context of such projects, to the potential benefits of investing in institutional development as an alternative to investing in "one-shot training schemes". Strengthened institutions could deliver trained manpower not only for start-up of projects but also for the more permanent requirements of long-term operations, which seem to pose fundamental problems in many Sub-Saharan African countries.

3.36 Although figures on costs of and returns to investments in vocational education and training should be used with the utmost caution, it seems clear that vocational training investments can be quite profitable.^{47/} In the Sub-Saharan African context, therefore, the need is to utilise existing vocational training capacity fully, develop the training potential that exists and explore and utilize low-cost training schemes. The search for low-cost training schemes and methodologies is a trend common to many of the training institutions. Research, experiments and pilot projects in this field are being carried out almost everywhere in Sub-Saharan Africa, with or without external assistance. However, there is very little information on the results achieved. There is a good case for the close monitoring of such results, possibly through a regional effort, in order to establish a flow of information among the countries which could assist them in reproducing successful experiences whenever possible and in avoiding pitfalls. A prerequisite of this international cooperation and coordination, however, will be a national capacity to design, monitor and report upon the various experiments.

3.37 The Financing of Training. In most of the countries under consideration, governments have traditionally had to assume a large share of the responsibility for financing the management of the nonformal vocational training system because enterprises either were unable to finance such training or were unaware of their stake in training. Employers' and workers' organizations, struggling with immediate economic problems, tend to neglect longer term needs such as training and to view it as an expense rather than investment. Recent legislation, however, shows that many of the countries are searching for a more equitable distribution of the financial burden. Several countries have established levy/grant systems of financing which can provide considerable impetus to training activities. Indeed, as experience in industrialising and industrialised countries has shown, the participation of employers in the financing of training invariably leads to their greater involvement in the development of training policies and programmes, and any financing system should be designed to encourage this. The problem in most Sub-Saharan countries is that the number of enterprises which can contribute to the financing of the management arrangements is small.

3.38 There appears to be a relation of cause and effect between the source of financing of agencies established to manage non-formal vocational training and their management style and the type of training they encourage. Those financed entirely from government budgets tend to be structured and behave like public bureaucracies, to concentrate on long-term training provided in centres, which closely resembles formal vocational and technical education provided under the Ministry of Education. In Sub-Saharan Africa, employers' and workers' representatives are seldom involved de facto in the various stages.

47/ G. Psacharopoulos, Assessing Training Priorities in Developing Countries: Current Practice and Possible Alternative, World Bank, (Washington, 1984), p.9 of this paper gives an estimate of about 30 percent.

3.39 Those agencies financed by a mixed system - government and private sector contributions - tend to be answerable or accountable to the groups they are established to serve, thus securing the active participation of employers in all activities. The activities they carry out tend to be more diversified and the training they encourage is highly flexible in duration, location and the methodologies used. These agencies are more to be found in Latin American countries. Extremely few Sub-Saharan African countries have been able, so far, to foster this type of institution.

3.40 Even with mixed financing arrangements, however, the heavy initial investments in training facilities and equipment needed in building up a non-formal vocational training system and its management arrangements would normally require financial contributions from governments initially or through external financing. This heavy initial financing need not become a permanent feature. As training systems become increasingly credible and accountable to their customers, these latter are usually willing to contribute to financing these institutions as well as to participate at the levels of planning, implementation and evaluation of activities. In turn, the participation and commitment of all concerned provide a good guarantee that training would remain on target with actual employment opportunities and development objectives. So far, very few of the countries of Sub-Saharan Africa have training systems which enjoy sufficient credibility to attract the wholehearted participation and commitment of their customers.

3.41 Managerial Personnel. The availability of qualified managerial personnel is an essential prerequisite for the efficient planning, organization, implementation and evaluation of training. In the view of some, managing a training system has more in common with managing a factory than with operating a civil service department. It has all the elements of conducting a teaching establishment, including the purchase, operation and maintenance of capital equipment and consumable supplies, often involving very large expenditures. A further feature is the need to keep in regular touch with the "customers" - the employers - in order to obtain maximum job opportunities for graduates. The types of managers needed are in extremely short supply in Sub-Saharan African countries and tend to be lured into lucrative jobs either at home or abroad. Most managers of training systems in Sub-Saharan Africa tend to come from the ranks of civil servants in the ministry primarily responsible (education or labour) or the ranks of technical school directors. In the light of this situation, training, further training and updating of managers is an area which requires urgent attention, particularly if continuity and efficiency in the management of training systems are to be ensured.

3.42 Many of the countries do not have the facilities for training and further training of this type of management staff. Because of the relatively small numbers of personnel needed at these levels and at the same time because of their vital importance for the development of the systems, most of the smaller countries may consider training abroad (overseas or in the region) a cost-effective proposition. In such cases, however, no effort should be spared to retain such staff in the positions for which they have been trained by offering them acceptable salaries, working conditions and career possibilities.

3.43. A further problem is the difficulty in finding personnel qualified to carry out development tasks and to carry out research of relevance to vocational training: assessing training priorities and requirements and developing plans and strategies to satisfy them, developing curricula and teaching materials, keeping abreast of alternative teaching and learning methods and designing and testing them; continuous evaluation and feedback. Because of the applicability of such research to groups of countries there is a strong case for pooling resources at the regional level and so keeping costs at a minimum. Some promising regional activities have already been launched under the aegis of CIADFOR;^{48/} these experiences suggest that technical cooperation among developing countries (TCDC) is a cost-effective way to researching and solving some of the common problems in the field of vocational training as well as of exchanging information and experiences in this field.

3.44 All Sub-Saharan African countries recognize that non-formal training which closely responds to skill needs in the economy can greatly contribute to improving services and enhancing productivity and product quality in industry and agriculture. Many of the countries have decided to establish services responsible for planning, coordinating, organizing, monitoring and evaluating such non-formal training. However, in the low income countries the strength of these services is negligible and these countries, along with the middle income countries, will require considerable assistance in strengthening these services.

3.45 The development of the capacity to manage training systems requires heavy investments over relatively long periods of time, before adequate levels of self-reliance can be achieved. Under present circumstances it is impossible for most Sub-Saharan African countries to finance entirely the development of their training management capacity. External finance and the provision of international and regional expertise for the solution of some of the major problems could therefore greatly enhance and accelerate the process of institutional development.

3.46 Among the more serious challenges faced by the management of training systems in Sub-Saharan Africa are the lack of adequate buildings for vocational training, the shortage of equipment, use of equipment which is inappropriate to the conditions in the workplace, the poor maintenance of buildings and equipment, inadequate provision of training supplies, and

^{48/} For instance the development of a methodology to assess the adequacy of training systems versus the employment situation and the design of a system for the preparation and exchange of training materials for vocational training purposes appropriate to the conditions, environment and needs of African countries.

the underutilization of installed training capacity.^{49/} This places a premium on the personnel who can make a convincing case for adequate funding of vocational training, who can plan and monitor the procurement of appropriate types and amounts of buildings and equipment and devise related maintenance policies and systems and who can monitor the utilization of buildings, equipment and supplies.

3.46 Conclusion. The provision of efficient and effective management for vocational training systems will require measures to be taken to (i) improve information of labor market and training needs; (ii) formulate national training strategies and priorities with the participation of all concerned; (iii) coordinate the various bodies involved in delivering training; (iv) establish realistic financing arrangements; (v) render existing training institutions sufficiently responsive to changing skill requirements; (vi) provide adequate physical plant as may be needed; and (vii) ensure that training institutions are adequately staffed with qualified managers and teaching staff.

49/ The lack of adequate facilities consistently hampers efficient management and control of training systems throughout Sub-Saharan Africa. For instance, although some countries do have a small network of vocational training centres, these do not offer a sufficient regional coverage nor do they provide training for all skills required by the economy. In addition to the premises which in some cases are unsuitable for training purposes, the equipment found in training workshops is often not commensurate with the equipment in the enterprises which are potential employers of graduates. The fact that trainees are taught the operation, maintenance and repair of machines, equipment and tools which they will not find in real work situations may reduce their immediate employment opportunities and is therefore wasteful. In some cases, equipment and tools are obsolete, in others they may even be oversophisticated in comparison with those used in enterprises. The latter situation is sometimes the result of external aid with poorly planned equipment components. In the case of imported equipment, the frequent difficulties in obtaining spare parts and even adequate consumables and expendable materials further compounds the problem of low returns on large investments in equipment in many countries.

A further aggravating factor is the under-utilization of the installed training capacity. This is particularly so when training centres operate according to the academic calendar. Under such circumstances, for instance, equipment, one of the more expensive inputs of vocational training, tends to be operated below its potential capacity with machines only running a few hours a day and lying idle during long periods of school vacation, to suit rigid scholastic time schedules. In comparison, equivalent equipment in industrial production often works in two or three shifts a day, all year long.

PART II - EXPERIENCE IN INSTITUTIONAL DEVELOPMENT

Chapter 4. THE EXPERIENCE OF ILO, UNESCO AND WORLD BANK

(a) The Experience of ILO

4.01 Management Development. The ILO has been assisting the developing countries to train managers, improve management practice, and build appropriate systems and institutions for management development, since 1952. The field activities started in Asia, the Middle East and Latin America but, over the last 20 years, most projects have been undertaken in Africa. Field work has been oriented and supported by research and programme development activities carried out by the Geneva-based Management Development Branch, in close collaboration with institutions in Member States, both industrialized and developing.

4.02 In the sectors of management and administration, both public and private, the ILO has been only one of the agencies involved in technical assistance. Many projects and programmes (including the establishment of new institutions and the building of their physical facilities) were undertaken without ILO participation. Perhaps the most significant experience concerns the over-all pattern of technical assistance of African countries in institution-building in various sectors. It has been most difficult to overcome sectoral barriers at the national level and to co-ordinate efforts among donor agencies. The growing determination to co-ordinate technical assistance is a very recent phenomenon and many past errors in institution building are due to the fact that donors were not prepared, or not able for technical reasons, to harmonize their efforts with other donors.

4.03 Drawing from the lessons of past experience, the ILO Management Development Programme has oriented its technical co-operation activities in Africa in four main directions.

4.04 Firstly, ILO seeks to examine the institutional framework, develop policies and plans, and suggest measures for rationalizing the national networks of institutions. This has included national surveys of management development needs, programmes and institutions in countries such as Sudan, Zambia, Benin, Malawi, Nigeria, and the member countries of the CEAO. In this area, however, work has hardly started and will need to be expanded in the years to come.

4.05 Secondly, ILO attempts to improve the performance and increase the impact of management development institutions and programmes. In many cases this implies profound changes in the attitudes and work methods of the institutions. Institutions are assisted in undertaking, in close collaboration with their clients, a self-diagnosis of their performance and in developing action programmes for applying more effective intervention methods and reorienting activities towards priority problems experienced by clients. Particular emphasis is placed on the development of consulting

services and of research into local management practices and problems. A major objective is to increase the autonomy of the institutions and their ability to finance an increasing portion of their expenses from their income earned by selling services to clients. Field assistance in these areas has been supported by producing technical guides for institutions, covering topics such as how to manage a management institution, how to do management consulting, and how to carry out research. Guides on further aspects of operating an effective institution are in preparation. Since institutions in developing countries need to be assisted in making management training available to large numbers of people for a relatively low cost, training materials are being developed that meet these criteria. For example, so-called "flexible learning packages" have recently been developed in several subject areas. Programmed texts in financial management and marketing have been developed and widely distributed. A major package on supervisory development has also been distributed.

4.06 Thirdly, increased attention is being paid to the needs of certain important sectors where management development formerly lagged behind the manufacturing, trade and public administration sectors. In the past five years ILO has intensified assistance with the design and introduction of new types of sectoral programmes in construction and small contractor development, road transport, food distribution, environmental management, rural project management and water supply. In all sectors where this is appropriate, particular attention is paid to the need to develop viable small enterprises based on local entrepreneurial talent. Entrepreneurship development and enterprise creation programmes have been started in several countries, including, for example, Uganda, Kenya, Lesotho, Malawi, Gambia, and Congo. On the other hand, both conceptual and field work has been undertaken to assist public enterprises, including public utilities, in devising and implementing systematic programmes for performance improvement. A guide to planning for improved enterprise performance was published and a new guide for performance improvement and management development in public enterprise is under preparation.

4.07 Fourthly, ILO assists in encouraging and facilitating co-operation among management institutions at sub-regional, regional and inter-regional level, and providing technical support to networks of institutions (as distinct from projects working with one institution only). The methods used include collection and circulation of information helping institutions to know one other better and to start co-operating, support to specific co-operation actions involving groups of institutions, support to subregional and other networks, such as associations established by the institutions themselves, and the development of technical guides and training materials that are of interest to the wide public of management institutions. This activity is supported by a UNDP inter-regional project and directly involves a number of institutions from both industrialized and developing countries. The Economic Development Institute of the World Bank provides active support to this effort. ILO also co-operates directly with several regional institutions, helping them to develop their services in support of national management development programmes and institutions rather than competing with them. This has included, for example, co-operation with the Eastern and Southern African Management Institute (ESAMI), and preparatory assistance to the Centre Africain d'Etudes

Supérieures en Gestion (CESAG), whose establishment is being prepared by the CEAO with World Bank support.

4.08 Management of Vocational Training. The long history of the ILO involvement in vocational training within the wider framework of all other aspects of labour (including, for example, employment, conditions of work, safety and health, labour standards and sectoral activities) and the experience it has accumulated in this field, have enabled it, over the years, to enlarge the scope of its training activities. Today, it carries out a wide range of conceptual and operational vocational training activities aimed at all levels of vocational skill for all sectors of the economy through its field structure, at Headquarters, at the International Centre for Advanced Technical and Vocational Training in Turin and through the three Regional Centres (Asia and Pacific Skill Development Programme, APSDEP; Inter-African Centre for the Development of Vocational Training, CIADFOR; and the Inter-American Vocational Training Research and Documentation Centre, CINTERFOR).

4.09 The growth of the programme, however, has not followed a straight line. The programme has often been recast to take account of changing environments, the economic and social and policy priorities of the countries, shifting relationships between and within states and new thinking on objectives and ways of achieving them. For these reasons, and because of the tripartite structure of the ILO, its activities in the field of training have always taken into account the many facets of the world of work in which they take place.

4.10 Operational activities, started after the second World War and reflected the concern of a few independent Third World countries to expand their training programmes beyond the technical and vocational schools. They were interested in systems of training similar to those in the industrialized countries, particularly those which could respond quickly to urgent manpower training needs. However, the institutional and legal infrastructures for vocational training outside the school system were often non-existent. This was the case in the majority of developing countries, with the exception of a number of Latin American countries, where institutional arrangements for managing training had already been established.

4.11 Needs changed very quickly in the period just before and after the independence wave of the 1960s. Shortages of qualified personnel were acutely felt in all the developing countries, inter alia to replace expatriates. Capacity and willingness of employers in these countries to provide training were quite limited, while the few vocational and technical schools were in no position to meet the qualitative and quantitative needs of the economy. Consequently, the need for government intervention to provide training through adequate institutions became apparent. For the ILO's technical co-operation, this can be characterized as the "institution building period" which started timidly during the second half of the 1950s, gained momentum during the 1960s and reached its peak early in the 1970s. Such projects were characterized by large groups of experts, fellowships and significant equipment components.

4.12 A recent study revealed that authorities interviewed in many developing countries felt that the ILO has had a great influence, and in some cases, has been instrumental in establishing national vocational training institutions and in training the national staff to manage them.^{50/} Some remarked that in only a few years their national institutions and systems had achieved a privileged position in the development of vocational training and that this would not have been possible without the assistance of the ILO's technical co-operation projects. These institution building and strengthening projects have helped in devising national policies and strategies, in setting up and developing vocational training infrastructures and in drafting legislation.

4.13 While almost all countries were particularly satisfied with this type of technical co-operation, projects which set out to establish the initial infrastructure for vocational training were particularly difficult, hampered by a great variety of problems, and required more time and money than had been estimated at the outset. These were usually "phase one" projects with ambitious objectives, such as defining national vocational training policies, establishing the required legislation, setting up and manning the national vocational training institutions, structuring the various administrative services, initiating instructor training schemes and starting vocational training operations for a selected number of basic occupations.

4.14 Because such projects are usually pioneering in many respects they have to solve problems such as the co-ordination of existing (very often unrelated) training activities under the responsibility of various bodies, and to cope with difficulties in determining responsibilities, inadequate budgets and allocation of funds, recruitment and training of management personnel for the national training body and the provision of adequate physical facilities. In general, it has not been possible to establish a self-sustained management institution for vocational training or infrastructure in any country in just one project phase. Such projects tend to be extended into second, third and even fourth phases to achieve acceptable self-reliance of the national training management institution. While during the phase one of such projects, it is usually possible to carry out labour market surveys and training needs assessment as well as to lay the foundation for future action, the actual work and impact on a national scale is achieved at later stages. Thus it is, as a rule, during the second, third and fourth phases that ILO has assisted institutions to:

- set up trade standards and skill testing and certification schemes;
- launch training within enterprises and apprenticeship schemes with the support of enterprises;
- increase the volume of training;
- establish schemes for instructor training and upgrading;
- extend training to cover rural areas and the informal sector;
- decentralize training activities to other regions of the country;
- implement training for sectoral development;

^{50/} ILO, In-depth Review of the ILO's Vocational Training Programme, November 1983, Documents GB.224/PFA/10.1, 2, 3 and 4.

- start training operations for special groups of the population;
- devise vocational guidance systems;
- determine evaluation procedures; etc.

4.15 ILO experience also shows that the support and commitment of government, employers and workers to institutional development projects tended to be firmer after the early stages of such projects, when concrete results became more apparent.

4.16 Traditional cost/benefit analysis cannot be applied consistently to training projects, particularly to the institutional development type. Furthermore, calculations of numbers of people trained divided by the cost incurred will not give an accurate measure of the efficiency achieved. There is obviously a case for discarding some of the "non-profit making" attitudes in favour of more competitive and cost analysis oriented thinking in project development and implementation. However, it should not be forgotten that projects which set out to establish a training infrastructure and to change attitudes towards human resources development carry a high price-tag that it is wise to pay, not only on social and political grounds but also for long-term economic reasons. Furthermore, once management arrangements are more or less firmly established, other training projects (national or international) tend to become increasingly efficient, because of the management support they receive.

4.17 An analysis of the ILO's past technical co-operation activities^{51/} has shown that requests for technical co-operation in the field of vocational training bear some relationship to the state of development of the country asking for co-operation. The least developed countries (which is the case for many of the Sub-Saharan African countries) which usually lack strong training institutions and infrastructure, tend to seek exploratory missions or pilot projects. As a general rule, these are followed by comprehensive institution building and strengthening projects which have more than one phase and extend over long periods of time. Within this process, operational activities also tend to follow a certain order, starting with the organization of a national institution responsible for training, including the necessary legal framework; the setting up of pilot training centres and in-plant and apprenticeship schemes and a gradual diversification of the skills taught and the teaching methods used. Only when a certain degree of development of the vocational institution and infrastructure has been achieved - aside from emergency situations - do governments tend to make requests for projects such as co-operation in designing training programmes which are very specific as to skills and sectors of the economy, target groups and purposes. Although the chronological order tends to be the same, the end products do vary in accordance with national characteristics and development requirements.

^{51/} ILO, Review of Operational Activities in the Field of Training, Analysis of Activities (1972-1980) and Future Prospects, G.B.218/OP/1/1, Geneva, November 1981.

4.18 ILO's experience shows that successful institutional development projects have a number of factors in common - strong commitment by the government to the management of vocational training, the relevance of such conditions and the availability of adequately qualified international and national counterpart personnel.

4.19 During the 1970s, a number of African countries requested co-operation from the ILO to assist them in their efforts to improve technical co-operation among developing countries (TCDC) in the field of training. In response to these requests, the African Centre for the Development of Vocational Training (Centre interafricain pour le développement de la formation professionnelle - CIADFOR) was founded in July 1978. CIADFOR has been carrying out a programme which enables its members - about 20 countries at the present time - to co-operate in the field of vocational training. CIADFOR's structure comprises a Ministerial Conference responsible for policy guidance which meets once every two years. It also comprises a Technical Committee (composed of government representatives in charge of vocational training management and of representatives of employers' and workers' organizations), meeting once a year and responsible for the programming and supervision of programme execution. A Secretary General appointed by the Ministerial Conference is responsible for the submission of proposals to the Technical Committee. An Executive Director appointed by the Director-General of the ILO, is responsible for programme execution and the budget.

4.20 Apart from financial contributions provided by the National Agency for Vocational Training (ONPF-Ivory Coast) and the ILO, CIADFOR relies, to the utmost extent, on the contributions in kind which the members put at its disposal. CIADFOR has been conceived to fill a gap which has been felt over the years, namely to train policy makers to enable them to discharge their functions more efficiently. With this in mind, the objectives of CIADFOR are the following:

- developing and fostering the exchange of information, experience, expertise and training materials;
- training of policy-makers responsible for the planning, execution, monitoring and evaluation of vocational training institutions, systems and programmes; and in general;
- enhancing co-operation among members of CIADFOR.

4.21 CIADFOR's performance is very much appreciated as manifested by the interest of its members in taking on the responsibility for executing projects and contributing within the framework of their vocational training institutions. The English- and Portuguese-speaking countries in Africa have manifested their interest in actively participating in the work of this regional centre. The ability to accommodate an expansion of the coverage of CIADFOR's membership in the future, will largely depend on whether additional funds can be obtained for this purpose.

(b) The Experience of Unesco 52/

4.22 Institutional development in education was always an important component of Unesco's activities, although the term "institutional development" was rarely used and the development and strengthening of institutions was considered rather as a useful and desirable by-product than as the main objective.

4.23 Technical assistance in educational planning, administration, statistics, curriculum development and so on was always and still remains an important part of Unesco's activities. For example, in the 1960's and early 1970s the Education Sector in Unesco paid great attention to creation and/or strengthening of Higher Teacher Training Colleges (Ecoles Normales Supérieures), Faculties of Education and National Pedagogical Institutes (Instituts Pédagogiques Nationaux) in Sub-Saharan Africa and in other regions. The objective was to provide a sufficient supply of trained teachers for secondary schools and to create national capacity for curriculum development and education research; although this effort leads to building institutions, the term "Institutional Development" can hardly be found in any of the corresponding project documents. The main objective was the activity to be performed, the institutional aspect being considered as a necessary and welcome by-product. Activities in this field still continue (such as in the Ibadan University Faculty of Education Management in Nigeria) but on a far smaller scale, because in most African countries these institutions already exist and have become an integral part of the national educational system. The effort in this field can be considered a success although, obviously, a one-hundred per cent success of any particular project is extremely rare and many projects experienced problems and difficulties, due to a series of reasons which will be discussed later.

4.24 For more than twenty years, since 1963, the International Institute for Educational Planning established by Unesco has conducted training courses for educational planners. Most of the trainees, according to

52/ The experience with technical assistance in Bank-financed education projects was the subject of a joint Bank/Unesco study in 1983. This study examined Unesco involvement in these projects and included Liberia and Burundi among the six countries examined in detail. That study includes several findings and recommendations accepted by both the Bank and Unesco and there is no need to reiterate them here. This Report therefore does not elaborate upon the technical assistance (expert services and fellowship) activities financed under the projects as these appear to have been adequately reviewed in the Joint Study. (See World Bank/Unesco Joint Study of Technical Assistance in Bank Financed Education Projects. Report of the Steering Committee to the President of the World Bank and the Director General of Unesco. Unesco March 1984).

recent estimates (80 per cent according to a tracer study carried out in 1973^{53/} still work in educational planning and management. The mission found ex-trainees of IIEP in important positions in all countries visited.

4.25 Most of the technical cooperation activities of Unesco were financed by UNDP; however, within the last ten years or so, the UNDP financial crises reduced the funds available for most countries. The share of total funds from this source going to Unesco from projects assisted by the Bank has declined. Thus, in recent years, the total amount of assistance (from regular budget and extra-budgetary sources) has declined.

4.26 With the decline in available funding for technical cooperation activities the composition and character of Unesco assistance is changing to less costly but efficient modes. There is a clear tendency to move away from long-term assignments (two to five years or more) where experts, in many cases, were in fact filling staff positions in Ministries of Education, to short-term (two weeks to three months) assignments which focus on organizing and conducting training programmes, courses, seminars, workshops for senior staff already in service and also on assisting national staff to prepare various studies such as costing and feasibility of an educational reform, manpower assessment, financing of education, and preparation of a new organigramme of the Ministry. Parallel to this trend, UNESCO Technical Assistance is becoming more specialized and covers subjects such as school mapping, university management, cost analysis and so on.

4.27 The switch to shorter, highly specialized and more precisely timed interventions is proving to be successful and contributes more effectively to institutional development than did the previous pattern. Short-term interventions by appropriate specialists do not replace national staff but tend to promote their knowledge in specialized fields and their in-service training. Experts on long term assignments very often just occupy a vacant position in the national structure. Upon completion of their contracts, they leave with their knowledge and experience, leaving behind their position vacant again, sometimes frozen or abolished in the next round of budget restriction.

4.28 Technical assistance - whether it is a separate activity or a component of a major project - contributes to institutional development only when it leaves some additional expertise or improved systems or procedures behind upon completion of the project. This is best done by training counterparts as part of the project activities. Most projects (especially those financed by UNDP, but less so in the past those financed by the World Bank or by regional development banks) require that full-time counterparts be formally appointed by the Governments to work with the expert. However, in many cases, the appointment of a counterpart is a very slow process and one-two years of the presence of the expert may be lost for training; it has also happened that the counterpart was finally appointed one month before the expert's contract expired. In other cases,

^{53/} A tracer study was started in June 1984. The previous study conducted in 1973 found that some 80% were still working in the sector.

counterparts change so often that there is no time to train them properly. Counterparts trained by the experts were often appointed to posts other than those for which they were trained. In one country in Sub-Saharan Africa, the Unesco expert in educational planning and administration trained four counterparts; only one of them remained in educational planning, the three others have been appointed to positions such as Director of Customs, Director of the National Coffee Board, and Ambassador. The same is often the case with persons sent for training abroad within the project; their appointment to the project is not a general rule. While this is not a loss for the country (and it may well be that in the new non-project position the person's qualification and capacity are better utilized), it is a loss for the project and for the activities that the project was designed to assist.

4.29 A recent, and so far successful, initiative is the Network of Educational Innovation for Development in Africa (NEIDA)^{54/}, aims at improving the internal efficiency of education systems by the consolidation and extension of educational research. Conceived as part of technical cooperation among developing countries, assistance is given by UNESCO to regional and sub-regional cooperative programmes for educational innovation. This assistance helps Member States to intensify and extend direct exchanges of information, experience and personnel between research institutions, in the various fields of major interest defined by the participants in the programmes. It also helps to launch cooperative research and development activities and to encourage wider application of innovations which have already been tested. Technical and financial support. At the world-wide level, the International Bureau of Education (IBE) in Geneva - among other activities - sees to the international circulation of information about innovations tested in these networks.

4.30 Given that institutional development is a long-term process, and that the implementation of a project financed by external assistance is a short term undertaking, (four-five years) it would be unrealistic to expect in all cases to create and consolidate an institution within a project. Some follow-up, for example in the form of a subsequent project which could include as one of its components some continuation of the support to the institution created in the preceding project, is usually needed. Several technical assistance projects in which Unesco was involved in Sub-Saharan Africa had to be discontinued before their completion because of financial problems of the UNDP, and their objectives were thus only partially fulfilled.

^{54/} Other similar networks include the Asian Programme of Educational Innovation for Development (APEID), the Educational Programme of Innovation for Development in the Arab States (EPIDAS), the Caribbean Network of Educational Innovation for Development (CARNEID), and the programme of Cooperation in Research and Development for Educational Innovation in South-East Europe (CODIESEE), which will be extended to Central and Southern Europe.

4.31 The experience of Unesco suggests that project design in institutional development needs to pay particular attention to the capacity of the government to meet the investment and recurrent costs involved. This may include ensuring that provision be made in the project and in follow-up projects for supplies and materials to render the institutional development objectives attainable.^{55/} Institutional development project design needs to take into account the intricacies of the local situation, instead of simply transferring or imposing foreign models and standards poorly adapted to local needs and realities. It needs to involve national expertise and national institutions sufficiently in the process of project identification, design preparation and implementation if the commitment of the national authorities is to be secured. Nevertheless there are risks inherent in changes of national officials which may entail changes in priorities.

(c) Bank Experience in Education Lending^{56/}

4.32 Some 100 projects were financed by the Bank in the education sector in Sub-Saharan African countries over the period FY64-84. Fifty-eight of these projects had been completed by March 1985. An analysis of project design in this group of projects reveals patterns of amount and distribution of proposed investments over time and priorities regarding both the areas of the education system selected for support and the means selected to achieve institutional development.^{57/} Experience with implementation in regard to the completed projects highlights the peculiar vulnerability of institutional development components and the need for more consistent attention to these aspects of projects.^{58/} In addition, the experience in the five selected countries provides an insight into patterns of behaviour in both the design and the implementation stages.

4.33 Project Design. In the 1960s the Bank generally left institutional development and software to be financed by bilateral and other agencies. With the broadening of policies in the late 1960s to include financing

^{55/} These supplies may include, for example, transport, gasoline for vehicles, paper for printing, maintenance and spare parts.

^{56/} Annex 3 provides a detailed analysis of the experience with Bank lending in education including a table on the incidence of institutional development components in all education projects in the two Sub-Saharan Regions.

^{57/} Information on project implementation is derived from project completion reports and project performance audit reports on the completed projects.

^{58/} Information on project implementation is derived from project completion reports and project performance audit reports on the completed projects.

for these areas, 85 of the 87 projects approved in the 1970s and 1980s included institutional development. The average cost of institutional development components rose from US\$2.7 million per project in Eastern Africa and US\$1.8 million in Western Africa in the 1970s to US\$3.4 million and US\$6.2 million respectively in the 1980s. In Western Africa roughly 18 percent of total project cost over the period FY64-84 was attributable to institutional development, while in Eastern Africa this proportion was 11 per cent.

4.34 The principal areas of institutional development assistance were project management (in 72% of the projects approved) - mainly for the purpose of ensuring smooth project implementation - and planning related items, such as educational or manpower planning (64%), studies and research (53%) and evaluation (31%), addressing weaknesses or deficiencies in information in areas vital to the identification of future projects. Thus there has been a clear preoccupation in these projects with the vigor of the Bank's lending program rather than with institutional development per se.

4.35 On a significantly lesser scale, assistance was channelled to technical aspects of educational management (mainly textbooks in 38% of projects and curriculum change in 35% of projects) in support of qualitative improvements in the schools. Even less attention was devoted to examinations, educational broadcasting and school supervision.

4.36 The broad area of administration also received relatively little attention - central and district management in ministries of education being assisted in 31% of projects, financial management in 18% and personnel management in 9% of projects. Management training was assisted in 32% and the management of vocational training in 28% of the projects.

4.37 The means adopted to achieve institutional development was overwhelmingly that of providing expert services - in 85% of the projects and indeed in 85 of the 87 projects, FY70-84. Provision was also made for fellowships (48% of projects) physical plant (46% of projects) and support of operating costs (30% of projects).

4.38 A striking deficiency in project design for institutional development has been the lack of emphasis on long range training for the kinds of specialists required in educational development - architects, evaluators, researchers, accountants, procurement and equipment specialists, economists - and the paucity of support for Sub-Saharan Africa universities especially in economics and the social sciences and the "strategic disciplines" noted above (paras. 2.11-2.17).^{59/} The frequent criticisms in appraisal reports of the high enrollments in law and the social sciences has tended to obscure (a) the serious problems of quality and obsolescence which were developing in a rapidly evolving area of knowledge essential for good social and economic planning and (b) the need to help develop local

^{59/} See Annex 4. The extent of support has been lower than in the Asia Regions. Only in Ethiopia in the Fourth Education Project was there assistance toward social sciences.

research and consulting capacity in these fields within universities and university research institutions.

4.39 Project Implementation. The implementation experience of these institutional development components goes a long way to amplify the degree of importance attached to them by Bank and the countries and the thoroughness and effectiveness of their design and preparation.

4.40 Neither in project management nor in planning have strong and effective units emerged on the scale that one would have expected. The extensive project management efforts have had disappointing results, perhaps largely because of priority having been accorded to project implementation as distinct from building-up a permanent local capacity to manage implementation. The lessons of these efforts are that there should be more systematic efforts at promoting local participation in implementation, that permanent posts with adequate salaries should be provided for local staff and that larger training programs are needed. In the case of educational planning, the efforts appeared quite inadequate for long term strengthening of the function. In some cases the emphasis was placed on preparing a plan rather than preparing planners and reinforcing a planning mechanism. On occasion, even this limited objective was replaced by sector or subsector analyses. Only in very few cases did a strong planning function develop. The studies/research items proved to be extremely vulnerable. There was little country commitment to them - many were deleted, not done or changed substantially, some were of limited value as they were seen as having been conceived and conducted by foreigners.

4.41 In the technical aspects of educational management there have been some good results, especially in curriculum development, but poor results in educational broadcasting, where follow-up by the Bank was weak or lacking.

4.42 The components designed to strengthen central and district administration and management training were generally among the most useful and successful. The efforts to bring together employers and government ministries in the management of vocational training were particularly successful in Ivory Coast, Senegal and Liberia but less so in Benin and Congo.

4.43 The means adopted to effect institutional development appeared to be an important determinant of success or failure. Buildings proved valuable, although there appears to have been tendency to underestimate the requirements. Fellowships tended to be too few or absent. The use of experts has been problem-ridden. Strong reactions against their high cost have surfaced, especially in Eastern Africa, and the foreign expert component has been extensively scaled down during implementation and often replaced by local experts and bilateral sources. Such expertise as was used was less effective than anticipated, for lack of good counterparts, poor timing or scheduling of the experts, neglect of the training role, or the preoccupation with tasks other than institutional development.

4.44 Finally, in the project completion and project performance audit reporting system, the institutional development components of projects received very limited attention. Many items related to institutional development are not reported upon at all and the achievements of technical assistance experts, which are often inadequately monitored during project implementation, are often not recorded in the completion reports.

4.45 The five selected countries. The general patterns which are perceptible from the closer look at the five selected countries confirm the general impressions gained from the broader view - the increasing concern with institutional development and the growth of more comprehensive and thorough approaches to achieving it.

4.46 At Loan Signature the projects included the following amounts (expressed in US\$ million) and percentage of project cost for assisting in institutional development in the selected countries.

	First Project	Second Project	Third Project	Fourth Project	Fifth Project
Cameroon	0.9(6%)	0.3(3%)	1.1(4%)	n.a.*	n.a.
Madagascar	0.5(7%)	14.0(73%)	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.
Mali	0.9(27)	3.6(32%)	6.1(35%)	n.a.	n.a.
Sierra Leone	0.4(7%)	3.8(35%)	5.0(21%)	n.a.	n.a.
Zambia	0.0	0.0	3.0(8%)	5.6(24%)	5.0(13%)

* Not applicable

On the whole, there has been usually an increase in absolute amounts and/or percentages of project cost over the sequence of projects.

4.47 In the earlier projects, the institutional problems were diagnosed but the projects themselves offered either nothing or very little in the way of addressing the needs, evidently in the hope that other agencies or the governments themselves would resolve the problems. In the light of the proven inadequacy or feebleness of the measures adopted under earlier projects or, because the Bank recognized that the governments needed assistance and not simply prescriptive covenants to bring about change, the later projects included more ambitious efforts with a wider array of means to promote the desired institutional development.

4.48 Secondly, in these projects there was preoccupation with project implementation units, in which the emphasis was placed rather on "getting the job done" by providing highly trained specialists - architects, procurement specialists, accountants - without real attention to developing local capacities and to institutionalizing them. Madagascar and the Second and Third Projects in Sierra Leone were exceptions to the rule of

dependence upon foreign experts in project units, but only in Madagascar were project implementation arrangements designed to be fully institutionalized. In Sierra Leone and Zambia, the project management units were not even in the Ministry of Education (para. 2.15). In Cameroon II, the extra-institutional step was taken of requiring the unit to be directly responsible to the Minister.

4.49 A third feature was the extensive resort to outside experts for conducting studies and curriculum reform in Zambia, Mali and Cameroon and the minimal resort to universities and local experts for these services. In Zambia, most of the funds provided for experts under the projects were not used because of strong country reaction to this means. In Sierra Leone more of the funds were used for local experts than had been originally expected.

4.50 Apart from the strong support for physical infrastructure in Zambia III and IV, only in the Mali projects was an effort made to confront the problems of central administration and this was plagued by indecision and the small scale on which assistance needs were always conceived. In Sierra Leone III, obvious serious administrative weaknesses in the central Ministry of Education - almost approaching a crisis - were only very marginally addressed in the sense that the administration of primary education was assisted. In no country can it be said that either planning or research capacity had been satisfactorily addressed, although attempts were included in Sierra Leone (Second and Third Projects), where the Second Project efforts were frustrated by the attrition of well qualified and senior staff in these two fields.

4.51 Sector Lending. The Bank has made no sector loans to Sub-Saharan African countries in education and training. The criteria used by the Bank to assess the suitability of a country for sector lending are that the investment program is well designed, the institutions have a demonstrated ability to implement the program, any measures needed to strengthen management and policies have been accepted by the government, the government's criteria for appraising sub-projects will ensure that these sub-projects are justified, and procurement and disbursement procedures for items to be financed by the Bank are satisfactory. The Bank recognizes that sector lending can be an effective means of strengthening sector policies, institutions and operations. Institutional development is precisely one of those areas where the inputs required are so diverse and interrelated that sector lending is more appropriate than project lending. Balanced attention to development of both the school system and the institutional infrastructure would also be better supported through sector lending and the flexibility which that allows.

4.52 Under the present Bank guidelines, the barrier to sector lending in education in Sub-Saharan Africa is principally the institutional weaknesses. Ironically enough, however, it is precisely the sector lending type of operation which simultaneously demands and builds effective institutional capacity. Concentrated attention to remedying these weaknesses is therefore of high priority as a means of creating the conditions needed for sector lending which in turn is conducive to sustained institutional strength.

INSTITUTIONAL DEVELOPMENT IN EDUCATION AND TRAINING
IN SUB-SAHARAN AFRICA

BUDGETING AND FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT
IN THE EDUCATION SECTOR, ZAMBIA

ABBREVIATIONS

MOGEC	Ministry of General Education and Culture
MOHE	Ministry of Higher Education
DTEVT	Department of Technical Education and Vocational Training
MOF	Ministry of Finance (Treasury)
NCDP	National Commission for Development Planning
CEO	Chief Education Officer at Provincial Level
DEO	District Education Officer

Currency (November 1984)

1 US\$ = 1.80 Zambian Kwacha
1 Kwacha = 0.55 U.S. Dollar

GRZ Fiscal Year

1st January - 31st December

BUDGETING AND FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT
IN THE EDUCATION SECTOR, ZAMBIA

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page No.</u>
1. Background	63
2. Overall Performance of the Education Sector	64
3. Financial Resources Flowing Into the Sector.....	65
4. Ministry Organization	70
5. Budgetary Processes in the Government and Ministries.....	72
6. Problems in the Management of Resources.....	75
7. Expenditure Trends in Primary and Secondary Education	78
8. Possible Steps for Improving the Processes	84
TABLES	
1. Expenditure Trends in the Education Sector (1974-1983)	66
2. Share of Education in Government Expenditures	68
3. Recurrent Expenditures in the Education Sector	69
4. Capital Expenditures in the Education Sector	70
5. Supplementaries as Percentage of Original Budgets (Recurrent Expenditures)	76
6. Supplementaries as Percentage of Original Budgets (Capital Expenditures)	77
7. Major Components of Recurrent Expenditures in Primary Education (1974-1983)	79
8. Major Components of Recurrent Expenditures in Secondary Education (1974-1983)	79
9. School Enrollment (1964-1980)	80
10. Real Expenditures Per Pupil in Primary and Secondary Education	81
11. Expenditure on Salaries on Primary School Teachers (1979-83)	83
APPENDICES	
I References	87

BUDGETING AND FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT
IN THE EDUCATION SECTOR ZAMBIA

1. BACKGROUND

1.1 Right now the overall context for institutional development in Zambia could be summed up in the dictum, "do more with less", which is essentially a question of better planning and management of available resources. Zambia was one of the most prosperous economies in Sub-Saharan Africa until 1975, with copper - the principal source of foreign exchange - contributing nearly half of the central government revenues. The period 1965-1973 witnessed a large growth of government expenditures and investments, especially in social services like education and health. In 1975, the unprecedented fall in copper prices led to a serious distortion of Zambia's terms of trade, as export receipts fell by more than 40 percent, and the balance of payments deficit rose to 40 percent of GDP and budget deficit to 24 percent of GDP. From 1975 onwards it has been a period of readjustment, painfully achieved through successive reductions of government expenditures, both recurrent and development.

1.2 The readjustment processes up to 1979 did result in substantial reductions in the budget deficit, but left their impact on capacity utilization. The elimination of the balance of payments deficit also resulted in a sharp decline in the real quantity of imports by nearly 45 percent, leading to a fall in output and real income. By 1979 the per capita income, adjusted for terms of trade, had fallen to only just over half of its 1974 level. The constraints on government expenditures dictated by the macro-economic situation, also constricted the restructuring that was so essential for a longer term recovery.

1.3 The subsequent period up to 1984 witnessed a further compounding of Zambia's problems which was attributable to the second world recession on an unprecedented scale and a further steep decline in copper prices. By 1983, the total foreign debt outstanding reached a peak of US\$2.7 billion and this, coupled with the persistent high value of the dollar and increasing interest rates, has led to further successive declines in real income, output and government revenues. The interactions among these factors call for a major restructuring of policies and programmes and further cuts in domestic public expenditures.

1.4 The impact of macro-economic constraints on the government budgetary systems has been considerable. Since the second half of the 1970s, national budgeting has resulted only in administering real cuts in expenditures, rather than distributing any increases. Subsidies, debt service and other statutory obligations continue to form a major share of government expenditures, reducing sharply the resources available for recurrent expenditures. Capital expenditures are generally spread thinly over many projects, delaying project implementation. These features have been common to all sectors including education.

1.5 Since 1983 the government has initiated a fresh set of measures to further restrain overall expenditures and reduce the budgetary deficit. In 1983 total expenditures were reduced by 15 percent and revenues increased by 20 percent. There have been both some reduction in subsidies and a freeze in government employment and wages. As a result of these measures, the deficit has already declined from 21.5 percent of GDP in 1982 to 7.3 percent in 1983 and the plan is to reduce it further to about 6 percent of GDP in 1985 and to about 5 percent in 1986.

1.6 The policies now being implemented to effectively restructure the economy to bring about medium term economic viability and accelerated development in the long term, have the immediate objectives of restoring financial stability, increasing the efficiency of resource use in general and addressing major constraints in specific sectors. This is the general background against which issues of budgeting and financial management in the education sector need to be assessed.

1.7 The adjustments needed in the education sector to meet the constraints of the overall macro-economic context are painful and pose a special challenge to the ministries as well as to the government. The crucial question is how to plan and implement such adjustments without damaging in the long run the potential that has already been established in the education sector, while at the same time promoting a more efficient education system in the short run. This paper deals with the institutional issues in budgeting and financial management in the education sector in Zambia, namely, the budgeting processes and the impact of adjustment measures adopted so far in the sector. The policies in the sector which have influenced the pattern of expenditure in the past are not addressed in detail, although a brief review of the expenditure trends in the primary and secondary education subsectors is made to provide a context for the review.

2. OVERALL PERFORMANCE OF THE EDUCATION SECTOR

2.1 Zambia's progress in the area of human resource development since independence - over the last two decades - has been very impressive. At independence only one percent had completed primary school and about 1,000 pupils had completed secondary school. There was a very small number of technically trained Zambians and less than 100 university graduates. During a short span of two decades adult literacy has increased to more than 45 percent, the primary school enrollment ratio increased from 50 to 90 percent, with nearly 80 percent completion rates, the secondary school ratio enrollment increased from four to 16 percent and higher education to 1.5 percent, or nearly 500 university graduates every year.

2.2 As of the year 1980, more than 1 million pupils attended primary schools compared to 378,000 in 1964, and 94,595 attended secondary schools compared to 13,853 in 1964. By 1984 there were 12 primary teacher training institutions, 6 secondary training colleges, 14 trade training institutions,

more than 3,200 secondary school teachers and 28,000 primary school teachers. On the whole, the education system has been able to go a long way towards meeting adequately the general needs of Zambia for trained manpower.

2.3 Despite the achievements in terms of numbers, however, Zambia continues to rely heavily on expatriates to fill many of the technical and management positions in the economy. A major weakness of the system appears to be its inability to deal with the critical shortages in management and in specialized technical and professional occupations. This deficiency arises from the fact that the secondary school system has not been able to produce a sufficient number of adequately trained students to pursue higher level education and training, especially in science and technical subjects. Nationally, only about 20% continue beyond grade 7 into junior secondary school.

2.4 In an effort to streamline the system and produce the skills necessary for self-reliance and national development, the government in 1978 drew up Educational Reform Proposals and Recommendations representing a series of measures planned for improving the quality of education and the equity and effectiveness of the system. It was proposed to extend full time universal basic education from a total of seven to nine years and to introduce a three-year second stage comprising the final year (Form III) of the present junior secondary school cycle and two years of senior secondary school (Forms IV and V). It was also intended to provide, through part-time study, continuing education for adults and youths who may have left or never entered full time education.

2.5 The financial constraints now being faced however, do not, permit the full implementation of the reform proposals. According to an estimate made by MOGEC, the implementation of nine years basic education would require an investment of K 509 million at 1982 prices. In view of this, the government introduced an interim structure of the new educational system from January 1983. The new structure will comprise seven years of primary education, two years of junior secondary education and three years of secondary education. MOGEC officials are of the view that the interim structure will reduce the cost of development and of expanding basic education as the available resources will be spread over a two-year instead of three-year junior secondary system. Priority is also being given to the opening of Grade VIII classes in the existing secondary school facilities.

3. FINANCIAL RESOURCES FLOWING INTO THE SECTOR

3.1 Table 1 shows the expenditure trends in the education sector for the period 1974-83 for the recurrent and development expenditures and the corresponding figures for total government expenditures. It is apparent that

there has been a steady decline in the real resources being provided to the sector during this period. Total recurrent expenditures have fallen steadily from K 78 million in 1974 to K 62 million in 1983. The decline has been much greater in capital expenditures.

Table 1
Expenditure Trends in Education Sector, Zambia (1974-1983)
(Constant (1975) prices) (Kwacha million) (a)

	1974		1975		1976		1977		1978		1979		1980		1981		1982		1983	
	Budget	Exp.	Budget	Exp.	Budget	Exp.	Budget	Exp.	Budget	Exp.	Budget	Exp.	Budget	Exp.	Budget	Exp.	Budget	Exp.	Budget	Exp.
Education-Recurrent	79.68	78.08	73.25	75.41	83.06	82.75	71.12	68.44	68.94	67.88	56.98	58.89	59.80	60.31	59.62	64.24	67.47	74.93	65.54	62.75
Education-Capital	32.34	24.31	28.30	22.58	19.92	19.11	13.61	12.63	9.20	6.89	4.00	3.46	6.74	4.18	7.66	2.66	6.75	5.96	8.87	4.92
Education-Total	111.95	102.40	101.54	97.99	102.97	101.86	84.73	81.07	78.14	74.75	63.46	62.35	65.74	64.49	67.28	66.91	74.22	80.89	71.40	67.67
Govt.-Recurrent	549.97	494.28	627.25	609.47	544.00	535.21	488.84	473.72	446.19	446.65	450.34	425.58	356.83	342.04	470.84	541.43	514.31	502.75	390.05	375.00
Govt. Rec (excl. debt service, interest) (b)	346.24	310.63	369.69	345.96	336.29	331.21	293.81	285.91	265.52	253.26	269.81	256.69	354.96	343.48	327.59	311.59	350.53	348.07	259.64	247.69
Govt. Rec. (incl. subsidies salary arrears) (c)	323.46	306.39	283.38	281.91	281.68	280.44	246.57	239.07	235.98	225.81	213.64	202.08	231.38	222.81	240.86	227.73	284.15	284.19	244.61	232.96
Govt. Capital Exp (d)	271.04	217.22	284.56	245.57	163.63	142.94	142.67	114.94	131.34	114.65	104.85	88.97	147.20	110.22	145.00	69.35	179.73	121.66	105.39	67.78
Total Govt. Exp	821.01	711.50	911.81	855.04	707.62	678.15	636.92	588.66	577.54	555.30	555.18	514.55	425.21	652.28	615.84	610.98	694.06	624.43	495.44	462.78
Total Govt. Exp (incl. debt service subsidies/ salary arrears)	594.49	525.60	567.94	527.48	445.30	423.38	388.65	354.00	347.32	339.66	318.49	291.05	378.58	333.03	385.84	297.28	443.90	405.87	350.00	300.68

Notes for Table 1

- /^a Deflated by the deflator for total domestic expenditure, per national accounts. The figures for 1983 and 1984 are provisional.
- /^b The Zambian budgetary system includes interest charges on public debt, amortization and other statutory payments in Recurrent Estimates. These are grouped together as 'Constitutional and Statutory Expenditure'. Since they are not part of operating expenditures for ministries, they have been excluded in the table from total recurrent expenditures.
- /^c The Recurrent expenditures include unusually large items for subsidies to parastatals in the agricultural sector, and also salary increases (due to new wage scales) given to employees in 1975, 1980, 1981, 1982, and 1983. Also during 1974, 1975 and 1976 large amounts were spent as emergency expenditures. These have been excluded to indicate the total actual operating expenses available to ministries.
- /^d The figures exclude non-cash transactions of (i) K164.9 million for the transfer of TAZARA assets from government to Zambia Railways in 1976 and (ii) K 355.6 million for the government assumption of outstanding debts of various companies in the ministry and industrial sector in 1980.

Source: Annual Financial Reports of government.

The fall in real resources being allocated to the sector in the last decade is significant if viewed in the context of increasing demographic pressures on the education system -- population has been growing at 3 percent per annum. Since 1974 real expenditures have fallen as shown below (Table 1.1).

Table 1.1

Indices of Expenditures in Real Terms
(1974 = 100)

<u>Year</u>	<u>Recurrent</u>	<u>Development</u>	<u>Total</u>
1974	100 (100)	100 (100)	100 (100)
1975	97 (91)	93 (113)	96 (100)
1976	106 (91)	78 (66)	99 (80)
1977	88 (77)	52 (53)	79 (67)
1978	87 (73)	28 (53)	73 (64)
1979	75 (65)	14 (41)	61 (55)
1980	77 (72)	17 (51)	63 (63)
1981	82 (74)	11 (32)	65 (56)
1982	96 (92)	24 (56)	79 (77)
1983	80 (75)	20 (31)	66 (57)

(Figures in brackets are indices in real terms for recurrent, development and total expenditures for government. Recurrent expenditure indices for Government exclude debt service, interest charges, subsidies and salary arrears. The index for 1976 recurrent expenditure in the education sector is high because of increases in primary school teacher salaries).

3.2 Compared to the rate of decline of total Government expenditures, the education sector seems to have fared better than government as a whole as far as recurrent expenditures are concerned, while the reverse is true for capital expenditures. The indices for the education sector are consistently higher for recurrent expenditures, while for capital expenditures, the sector seems to have been allocated lesser and lesser amounts from 1978 onwards.

3.3 The pattern of government expenditures (Table 1) also reveals that on an average only 55 percent has been for the actual operating expenses of ministries, that is for goods and services and investments which directly support government activities. A major share of government expenditures has been for non-ministerial purposes such as debt service, interest payments, subsidies and other statutory and constitutional obligations. Thus, although about 14 percent of the total recurrent expenditures have been flowing to the education sector during 1974-1983, if the non-ministerial expenditures are excluded, education sector share has actually been around 28 percent during this period. The average share in actual recurrent expenditures has been somewhat higher up to 1978, while after that year there is a declining trend. The last decade also seems to have witnessed a significant drop in

new investments in the education sector. The relative share of the sector in the total capital expenditures has declined from an average of 10.15 percent during 1974-78 to about 4.70 percent during 1979-1983 (Table 2).

TABLE 2
SHARE OF EDUCATION IN GOVERNMENT EXPENDITURES

	<u>1974</u>	<u>1975</u>	<u>1976</u>	<u>1977</u>	<u>1978</u>	<u>1979</u>	<u>1980</u>	<u>1981</u>	<u>1982</u>	<u>1983</u>
<u>Recurrent</u>										
(a)	15.80	12.37	15.46	14.45	15.40	13.84	11.13	11.87	14.90	16.73
(b)	25.14	20.60	24.98	23.94	26.80	22.94	17.56	20.62	21.53	25.33
(c)	25.32	26.75	29.51	28.63	30.17	29.14	22.07	28.21	26.37	26.94
<u>Capital</u>										
(d)	11.20	9.19	13.37	10.99	6.01	3.89	3.79	3.83	4.90	7.26
<u>Total</u>										
(e)	14.39	11.46	15.02	13.77	13.46	12.12	8.89	10.95	12.95	15.20
(f)	19.48	18.58	24.06	22.90	22.01	21.42	19.36	22.51	19.93	22.51

-
- (a) Share in total recurrent expenditure.
 - (b) Share in total recurrent expenditure excluding debt service/interest.
 - (c) Share in total recurrent expenditure excluding subsidies and salary arrears.
 - (d) Share in total capital expenditures.
 - (e) Share in total expenditures.
 - (f) Share in total recurrent expenditure excluding debt/service/interest/subsidies/salary arrears.

3.4 Table 3 gives the relative shares of the different subsectors in the total recurrent expenditures. Primary and secondary education together, account for nearly 67 percent, on an average, of the total recurrent resources flowing to the sector. Primary education accounts for a relatively stable 45 percent, although during the first half of the decade the average share was somewhat higher than during the second half. There is a distinct decline noticeable in the share of the secondary education sub-sector in the total expenditures, especially since 1980. The average share for the decade has been nearly 21.5 percent for secondary education. The expenditure trends indicate a noticeable decline in the share of technical education in total recurrent expenditures 7.4 percent on an average during the decade, but declining from 8.2 percent during the first half of the period to 6.6 percent during the second half.

TABLE 3
Recurrent Expenditures in Education Sector
(Constant (1975) prices) Kwacha million

	1974		1975		1976		1977		1978		1979		1980		1981		1982		1983		
	Exp.	%	Exp.	%	Exp.	%	Exp.	%	Exp.	%	Exp.	%	Exp.	%	Exp.	%	Exp.	%	Exp.	%	
Headquarters																					
Admin. (a)	2.88	3.7	2.82	3.7	2.16	2.6	1.91	2.8	1.75	2.6	1.59	2.7	1.53	2.5	1.64	2.6	1.62	2.2	1.20	1.9	
Regional Hqs. Admin.	3.18	4.1	3.08	4.1	2.94	3.6	2.34	3.4	2.17	3.2	1.97	3.3	2.04	3.4	2.03	3.2	2.40	3.2	1.87	3.0	
Primary Schools	35.00	44.8	34.16	45.3	39.30	47.5	32.21	47.1	32.12	47.3	27.18	46.1	27.32	45.3	27.72	43.2	33.89	45.2	29.20	46.5	
Secondary Schools	17.61	22.6	16.80	22.2	18.42	22.3	15.55	22.7	15.09	22.2	12.94	22.0	13.51	22.4	12.79	19.9	15.28	20.4	12.61	20.1	
Teachers Training	2.12	2.7	2.13	2.8	2.13	2.6	1.90	2.8	2.09	3.1	1.83	3.1	1.87	3.1	1.90	3.0	2.08	2.8	1.56	2.5	
Other Services (b)	3.80	4.9	3.89	5.2	3.45	4.2	2.75	4.0	2.97	4.4	2.92	5.0	3.19	5.3	4.86	7.6	4.33	5.8	5.72	9.1	
Technical Education	6.32	8.1	6.68	8.9	6.76	8.2	5.32	7.8	5.16	7.6	4.39	7.5	4.39	7.3	4.63	7.2	4.96	6.6	3.83	6.1	
University Education	7.17	9.2	5.89	7.8	7.59	9.2	6.45	9.4	6.54	9.6	6.07	10.3	6.46	10.7	8.67	13.5	10.36	13.8	6.74	10.7	
TOTALS	78.09	100.0	75.40	100.0	82.75	100.0	68.44	100.0	67.88	100.0	58.89	100.0	60.31	100.0	64.24	100.0	74.92	100.0	62.75	100.0	

Notes for Table 3

- /a/ Headquarters Administration includes MOHE and MOGEC from 1983 onwards.
- /b/ Other services include expenditures on curriculum development, audio-visual aids, examination expenses printing services, library services, cultural affairs (from 1980 onwards) and National Council for Scientific Research.

Source: Annual Financial Reports of Government.

3.5 It is apparent from Table 3 that the share of university education in the total recurrent expenditures in the sector has increased considerably during this period, from about 9 percent during 1974-78 to 12 percent during 1979-82. The other increase noticeable is in respect of 'other services', such as curriculum development, examinations, audio-visual aids and library services. The creation of a new department of culture in 1980 and National council for Scientific Research have also contributed to the increases in this group of activities. The ministry headquarters administration and regional offices have accounted for a relatively small and declining share of the total expenditures during this period.

3.6 Table 4 indicates the trends observed in capital expenditures in the various subsectors during this period. The trends do not indicate any pattern except that of an overall decline in the resources available for infrastructure investments. Expenditures have been higher during the first years of the decade, with secondary schools and technical education accounting for large shares. This is a reflection of the expenditures on

Zambia First and Second Education Projects during 1974-77, and the construction of the Zambia Institute of Technology and the Trade Training Institutes during 1975-1977. Investments on secondary schools again have improved during the period 1981-1983 due to the implementation of the Zambia Third Education Project.

TABLE 4
Capital Expenditure in Sub-Sectors of Education (Constant 1975 Prices in Kwacha Million)

	1974		1975		1976		1977		1978		1979		1980		1981		1982		1983	
	Exp.	%	Exp.	%	Exp.	%	Exp.	%	Exp.	%	Exp.	%	Exp.	%	Exp.	%	Exp.	%	Exp.	%
Teacher Housing (a)	0.23	0.9	0.80	3.5	1.28	6.7	1.02	8.1	1.34	19.4	0.87	25.1	0.53	12.7	0.60	22.6	1.08	18.1	0.50	10.2
Primary Schools	4.17	17.2	4.05	17.9	2.49	13.0	2.06	16.3	1.50	21.8	0.61	17.6	1.04	24.9	0.87	32.7	0.41	6.9	0.21	4.3
Secondary Schools	12.94	53.2	8.13	36.0	5.52	28.9	3.32	26.3	1.09	15.8	0.50	14.4	0.47	11.2	0.56	21.1	1.25	21.0	2.71	55.1
Teachers Training	1.49	6.1	1.18	5.2	0.96	5.0	1.15	9.1	0.39	5.7	0.15	4.3	0.26	6.2	0.11	4.1	0.51	8.6	0.05	1.0
Other Services (b)	0.24	1.0	0.65	2.9	0.71	3.7	0.45	3.6	0.44	6.4	0.67	19.3	0.90	21.5	0.37	13.9	0.42	7.0	0.48	9.8
Technical Education	4.15	17.1	4.58	20.3	4.99	26.1	2.15	17.0	0.76	11.0	0.31	8.9	0.86	20.6	0.15	5.6	0.45	7.5	0.36	7.3
University Education	1.10	4.5	3.20	14.2	3.16	16.5	2.48	19.6	1.36	19.7	0.35	10.1	0.12	2.9	0.00	0.0	1.84	30.9	0.61	12.4
TOTALS	24.32	(100)	22.58	(100)	19.11	(100)	12.63	(100)	6.89	(100)	3.47	(100)	4.18	(100)	2.56	(100)	5.96	(100)	4.92	(100)

Notes for Table 4

- ^{/a} Teacher Housing includes all housing projects and improvements to institutional buildings implemented by MOGEC and MOHE and grants to National Council for Scientific Research in 1982.
^{/b} Other services include projects for libraries, adult education centers, and educational service center and projects not falling in other groups implemented by MOGEC.

Source: Annual Financial Reports of Government.

3.7 The relative constancy of expenditure patterns observed in recurrent expenditures during the period 1974-1983 indicates that the resource allocation processes have not been used for assessing the overall composition of expenditures or for shifting expenditures to those services or subsectors considered to be of greater priority in the education system. Given the fact there is little scope for increasing the percentage of government budget devoted to education in the near future, it is necessary to ensure that the budgetary processes followed result in an allocation of resources according to well-defined priorities.

4. ORGANIZATION OF THE MINISTRIES OF EDUCATION (MOGEC AND MOHE)

4.1 Up to 1981, the Ministry of Education and Culture was the central agency in the education sector responsible for primary, secondary, technical and higher education. In 1981, as part of decentralization measures, primary education was transferred to the Regions under the administrative control of the Office of Prime Minister. In 1982 the ministry was reorganized into two ministries - the Ministry of General Education and Culture (MOGEC), dealing primarily with schools, and the Ministry of Higher Education (MOHE), dealing with technical and vocational education and the development of science and technology education. The MOGEC also has offices at the Regions headed by the Chief Education Officer (CEO), with District Education Officers (DEO) at district level. At the field level the District Education Officers have a dual role. For primary education they are administratively supervised by the

Social Secretary of the District Council, while for secondary education they are accountable to the CEO.

4.2 Neither the MOGEC nor the MOHE has a clear organizational arrangement for headquarters staff, identifying precisely the responsibilities for administration, planning, budgeting and technical support. The major units under MOGEC are the following: i) Administration Division (ii) Finance Division (iii) Personnel Division (iv) Development Planning and Research Unit (v) Statistical Unit (vi) Inspectorate of Schools (vii) Department of Continuing Education (viii) Educational Broadcasting Services (ix) Library Services (x) Curriculum Development Centre (xi) Examinations Unit and (xii) Department of Cultural Services. The major units in MOHE, in addition to administration, finance and personnel divisions are: (i) The Department of Technical Education and Vocational Training (ii) Planning Unit (iii) Directorate of Manpower Development and Training (iv) Teacher Training Unit (v) Special Education Unit (vi) Printing Services Unit (vii) Trades Training Institutes Unit and (viii) Technical Assistance Unit.

4.3 In each the Ministry the overall coordination and leadership role is provided by the Permanent Secretary and the small group of administrative officers working under him. There is no record available to show staff strength in both the ministries. According to the Establishment Register (1984) published by the Personnel Division of the Office of Prime Minister, however, the staff strength of both the Ministries is as follows:

<u>Category of Staff</u>	<u>MOGEC</u>	<u>MOHE</u>
Administrative	1035	390
General Professional	11	13
Educational	451	61
Technical Education	-	38
Technical	61	152
Secretarial	227	131
Medical	-	7
Total	<u>1785*</u>	<u>792*</u>

4.4 Compared to the volume of financial resources handled in both MOGEC and MOHE, the finance and planning units are relatively small. The finance units consist of the following:

<u>MOGEC</u>	<u>MOHE</u>
1 Assistant Secretary	1 Senior Finance Officer
1 Senior Finance Officer	5 Accountants
2 Senior Accounts	1 Internal Auditor
1 Senior Internal Auditor	3 Assistant Accountants
9 Accountants	3 Account Assistants
3 Internal Auditors	
11 Assistant Accountants	
15 Account Assistants	

* Some of the staff positions included here are allocated to schools, such as secretaries in educational institutions above the primary level.

The planning units are also staffed very thinly in both the Ministries. In MOGEC the unit consists of Senior Planning Officers, one Senior Statistician, and one Statistician. MOHE has 1 Senior Planning Officer and one Planning Officer.

5. BUDGETING PROCESSES IN THE GOVERNMENT AND THE MINISTRIES

5.1 The budget cycle in the Treasury normally begins in June, when MOF sends a circular to ministries inviting recurrent expenditure proposals for the next fiscal year and the NCDP sends a similar circular to the ministries for the capital (development) expenditure estimates. Ministries generally contact their field officers and departments and, after compiling the information received, forward the proposals to MOF and NCDP. The evaluation of the various ministry proposals begins in September and at this stage the submissions are evaluated for content in terms of authorization for the current year and reasonableness of changes if any, introduced by the ministries. MOF holds detailed discussions with every ministry to arrive at some tentative allocations by early November.

5.2 The second stage of the process begins in November when the revenue estimates are finalized and MOF is able to have an assessment of the total resources likely to be available for the next year. These lead to further budget cuts to adjust the allocations to the total revenues. The proposals are then submitted to the cabinet - the recurrent estimates by MOF and the capital budget by NCDP - and the cabinet approves the total amounts for each ministry's recurrent and capital budgets. This cabinet review could lead to further cuts to scale the ministries' submissions down to the final level. The budget is submitted to Parliament by the last Friday in January and becomes official when the Parliament passes the Appropriations Bill, usually in late March. Government authorizes provisional expenditure by the ministries to cover the interim period January-March, by the issue of provisional warrants for one-quarter of the proposed expenditures.

5.3 Basically well conceived, the current budgetary processes place considerable emphasis on control and accountability for revenues and expenditure. It cannot however be said that they represent a conscious process for the allocation of resources according to well conceived priorities or for securing the maximum benefits from the limited resources available. There are no specific guidelines concerning the acceptable size of each ministry's budget or how to prioritize items in budget submission.

5.4 Since 1983, some changes have been introduced in the budgetary processes which have resulted in eliminating the first round of budget discussions and cuts in the Ministries' proposals. The first round of discussions now starts in November, after the revenue estimates have been finally prepared. Ministries are now being asked to prepare revenue estimates for the next fiscal year in July-August, instead of October. Consequently the Treasury Circular and the NCDP circular, are now issued in September (after the resource situation is assessed) and the ministries required to submit their proposals by the end of October. The second and perhaps more important change is the provision of expenditure ceilings for

each ministry for the recurrent and development expenditures. The recurrent expenditure ceiling is issued by MOF and is broken down into salaries, recurrent departmental charges, grants and subsidies, while the NCDP issues the ceilings for expenditures on capital projects.

5.5 Budget Procedures in MOGEC and MOHE

Consistent with the overall budgetary processes of the Government, the ministry procedures for preparing the estimates usually start with the invitation of proposals from field officers and institutions, soon after the Treasury and NCDP circulars are received. This section describes briefly the actual processes in MOGEC and MOHE for the preparation of development and recurrent expenditure proposals, once the circular is sent out to field officers.

5.6 In MOGEC the basic unit generating budget requests for development expenditures is the CEO. Before the CEOs send their proposals to MOGEC, a lengthy procedure of getting the proposals voted by district, regional and provincial councils of education is followed. The CEO initiates requests for funds under the development vote, which are 'approved' successively by the District and Provincial Councils. After the proposals are approved by the Provincial Council for Education, the CEO forwards the requests concerning secondary schools to MOGEC and the Provincial Commissioner forwards the proposals for primary schools to the Office of the Prime Minister. In the case of MOHE the basic budget generating units are the DTEVT and the training institutions.

5.7 In both ministries the aggregated proposals for the development budget are generally discussed in the Finance Committee, chaired by the Permanent Secretary, and the planning units are responsible for following up on the field proposals and preparing the ministry submissions to the NCDP. However in both the ministries there is no systematic attempt to prioritize the projects or to develop a strategy for completing the on-going projects. The lack of a process to carry out such an exercise was evident in the manner in which both MOGEC/MOHE handled the requests for the 1985 development budget. At MOGEC the proposals received aggregated to K 32.00 million, against the NCDP ceiling of K 16.07 million. The requests included K 10.00 million for the completion of seven secondary school projects and large amounts for construction of housing for teachers. The situation was even more acute at MOHE, where the requests for 1985 amounted to K 36.00 million, against a ceiling of K 3.90 million. The amount required by the MOHE for ongoing projects alone was estimated to be K 18.00 million. Although MOHE had asked the institutions to prioritize the projects, the requirements for the 'first priority' projects alone far exceeded the total ceiling. Ministry officials in both the ministries were not clear as to how the final submissions were put together except to state that the proposals were forwarded to NCDP seeking their guidance.

5.8 At the NCDP, the development submissions of MOGEC/MOHE are not systematically evaluated and there is no announced strategy or guidelines for cutting or for the final inclusion of projects in their recommendations to

MOF. The only guidance appears to be the emphasis on the completion of on going projects. Even such a simple guidance is difficult to implement when the total requests for completing ongoing projects exceed the ceiling.

5.9 There is comparatively less analysis or scrutiny of the proposals to be submitted to MOF for recurrent estimates in both the ministries. The compilation of recurrent estimates is generally considered as a routine exercise handled entirely by the finance units. In MOGEC it is the Assistant Secretary (Finance) and the Senior Finance Officer who compile the submissions from the field, while in MOHE, this responsibility is given to Senior Finance Officer reporting directly to the Under Secretary (Administration). The proposals received from the field officers and institutions are rarely subjected to any detailed analysis except to ensure that the Treasury format and proper itemization of proposed expenditures are followed. The estimates for salaries are prepared independently by the Chief Personnel Officer and since the salaries and wages component is generally assumed to be uncontrollable and obligatory, no serious justification is either called for by the MOF, nor any assessment takes place within the ministries. The budget as finally compiled and submitted to MOF generally exceeds the ceiling and represents, at best, an aggregation of field requests for various items of expenditure.

5.10 At the MOF, the first round of discussions on the ministry's proposals usually results in adjustment of individual line items to ensure that the total recurrent expenditures proposed result in no more than a modest increase over the previous year's approved estimates. In the scrutiny at MOF, item by item, the prime criterion becomes the reasonableness of the marginal increase over the previous year, irrespective of any explanation offered by MOGEC/MOHE. The scrutiny also assumes that all previous items of expenditure that are not new or that are only marginally increased could be continued without any detailed review. The uncontrolled increases in the salaries/wages category result generally in a decline of funds available for other recurrent departmental charges (operating expenses), leading to an underfunding of major items of expenditures like boarding costs, student requisites and service charges for payment of teachers housing bills. These items are deliberately underfunded so that the total budget can still be within the ceiling.

5.11 MOGEC/MOHE are also required to prepare revenue estimates for income received from various services in the education sector. They are now being prepared by July every year on the basis of proposals received from field officers and institutions. This work is handled in a very routine fashion at both the ministries. The finance units simply compile and compare the data with actual receipts and arrive at an estimated figure for the next year. Treasury officials reported considerable under estimation of revenues by MOGEC, especially on examination fees. In 1982 the receipts from examination fees were estimated at K 177,000, which were later increased to K 1.7 million. There is also no regular follow up of the actual realization of revenues. In MOGEC, out of a budgeted amount of K 2.85 million for 1984, the ministry realized only K 1.10 million, or less than 40 percent, up to September.

6. PROBLEMS IN THE MANAGEMENT OF RESOURCES

6.1 It is apparent that the budget processes within MOGEC/MOHE are not well articulated so as to ensure that important aspects of resource allocation are properly analyzed and carried out. As a result, an opportunity for overall financial planning is lost, leading to a misallocation of the limited resources available. The routine treatment of the capital budget has resulted in available resources being spread too thinly over a large number of projects, resulting in implementation delays and cost escalation. The allocation of funds for development projects by the NCDP appears adhoc and the credibility of the entire process is open to question. At the same time, within the ministries no processes are developed to rank the projects in terms of priority and to develop a plan for accommodating the financial constraints. The officials in MOGEC/MOHE have thus no way of deciding which projects to cut or which projects could be completed within the available resources.

6.2 The present methods of preparing budget estimates also do not ensure that enough resources are allocated to recurring costs. The MOF and NCDP circulars provide no guidance for estimating the recurrent expenditure requirements for capital projects. The incremental approach followed in assessing the recurrent estimates proposals by MOGEC/MOHE precludes any specific consideration of the maintenance requirements of newly completed capital projects. Similarly in the capital budgets, as they are being developed now, no assessment is made of the future recurrent costs. Many decisions in the education sector, taken routinely, also have implications for the capital budget. The recruitment of primary and secondary school teachers leads to the requirement of teacher housing on a massive scale. Yet no detailed consideration of teacher recruitment is made during the budget process and there are no mechanisms to coordinate the impact of such decisions on the capital budget.

6.3 Perhaps the most important consequence of the present budgetary processes is the underfunding of essential operating requirements for the efficient delivery of services in the sector. This has come about because of the considerable increase in the salary component in recent years taking place the expense of items like school maintenance, student requisites and boarding costs. At the same time, since the budget processes are not utilized as a means to bring about policy changes in the light of increasing financial constraints, the ministries keep incurring commitments and liabilities on such items, leading to over expenditures and sizeable supplementary votes every year.

6.4 Although the MOF does not encourage supplementary votes and no circulars to ministries are issued, both MOGEC and MOHE prepare supplementary estimates every year. In 1984 the MOGEC had asked for a supplementary vote of K 11.00 million under the recurrent vote and K 7.00 million under the development vote. The process begins in June every year and proposals are sent to MOF in bits and pieces. There is no fixed date for the submission of

supplementary requests to the Treasury, but the general convention appears to be that beyond October every year the MOF does not entertain request for additional funds, as the supplementary vote is required to be approved by the Parliament by December. Both the ministries incur considerable commitments over the budgeted provisions each year, especially on items like boarding expenses, student requisites and service charges due to increase in costs. Tables 5 and 6 indicate the extent to which the ministries have been accommodating over expenditures through supplementary estimates. The high percentage of funds involved, especially in development estimates, indicates that supplementary appropriations have become routine rather than extraordinary and this has eroded the credibility of the budget processes.

TABLE 5
SUPPLEMENTARIES AS PERCENTAGE OF
ORIGINAL BUDGET
(RECURRENT EXPENDITURES)

	<u>1979</u>	<u>1980</u>	<u>1981</u>	<u>1982</u>	<u>1983</u>
1) Headquarters	30.50	1.34	-	9.78	-(0.38)
2) Regional Headquarters	23.19	1.31	-	5.71	5.85
3) Primary Education	-(1.78)	0.23	-	2.49	24.82
4) Secondary Education	-	-	1.60	4.50	19.42
5) Teacher Training	5.46	-	-	2.94	15.06
6) Sundry Services	3.06	1.68	6.59	28.38	4.57
7) Technical Education	-	0.47	-	1.82	6.68
8) Culture	-(1.36)	6.53	2.97	19.90	-
9) Total Budget	1.07	0.49	1.84	8.37	16.17

Source: Annual Financial Reports of Government.

TABLE 6

SUPPLEMENTARIES AS PERCENTAGES OF
ORIGINAL BUDGETS

(CAPITAL EXPENDITURES)

	<u>1979</u>	<u>1980</u>	<u>1981</u>	<u>1982</u>	<u>1983</u>
1) Headquarters	15.93	3.76	25.47	23.25	2.25
2) Primary Education	6.37	5.52	-	2.61	-
3) Secondary Education	58.24	215.32	24.12	(0.07)	140.58
4) Teacher Training	-	13.22	-	52.70	(0.87)
5) Other Services	33.58	194.36	35.96	14.86	94.45
6) Total Budget	18.97	44.45	15.18	15.47	45.63

Source: Annual Financial Reports of Government.

6.5 The actual flow of cash resources to the spending points in MOGEC and MOHE is regulated through the system of financial warrants authorizing expenditures. MOF issues a provisional warrant in January every year authorizing expenditures on salaries and recurrent departmental charges for a period of three months. The final warrant is issued by the end of March or April, after the Parliament has voted the budget. In both the ministries there is a practice of making allocations to CEOs and institutions at the beginning of the year on the basis of which subwarrants are then issued to the spending points. The issue of warrants by the MOF, however, has no relation to the actual release of cash. The cash release is again controlled by the MOF through a system of monthly allocations to the ministries. Earlier, when the resource situation was comfortable, MOF used to issue

annual allocations, which were subsequently made into quarterly allocations. The monthly allocation system has been followed since 1978.

6.6 This system implies that field officers and institutions have no advance knowledge of the funds likely to be available in a given year. The problem seems to be especially acute in capital expenditures, for which the Ministries are required to send requests to MOF for payment of contractors' bills, after the completed works has been certified by the Ministry of Works. MOF releases funds as and when available through the monthly release system. Generally, funds for development are released only towards the end of the fiscal year, leading to an accumulation of commitments and pending bills. For example under the development vote of K490,000 for the DTEVT, only K32,000 had been released as at the end of October 1984. Consequently the implementation of development projects is slowed down. Excluding the two years 1976 and 1977, the average spending on the development vote in the education sector has been around 71 per cent of the voted provisions during the last decade. (See Table 4).

6.7 The cash release mechanism also introduces a time lag in the recurrent expenditures on items other than salaries. The MOGEC/MOHE are required to make monthly requests for the MOF, on each line item of the budget, six weeks before the funds are actually required. Such requests are scrutinized in the MOF, item by item, almost duplicating the entire budgeting process for annual estimates and funds are released selectively on items considered to be important. Such a control by the Treasury, through the system of monthly allocations or "mini budgets", results in a serious distortion of the budget process, leading to an accumulation of debts and carry-overs. MOGEC/MOHE are reported to have bills outstanding which go back several years and credit for local purchases is hardly available to the field officers.

7. EXPENDITURE TRENDS IN PRIMARY AND SECONDARY EDUCATION

7.1 Primary and secondary education sectors account for a major share (67 percent) of the total expenditures in the education sector and an analysis of the expenditure trends in this area presents the typical problems of resource management now being faced in the sector. Tables 7 and 8 present the expenditure trends in these sectors, at constant (1975) prices, for the period 1974-1983, grouped into major categories of expenditure.

TABLE 7
MAJOR COMPONENTS OF RECURRENT EXPENDITURES IN PRIMARY EDUCATION (1974-1983)
 (Constant (1975) prices) (Kwacha 000's)

	1974		1975		1976		1977		1978		1979		1980		1981		1982		1983	
	Exp.	I	Exp.	I	Exp.	I	Exp.	I	Exp.	I	Exp.	I	Exp.	I	Exp.	I	Exp.	I	Exp.	I
Teacher Salaries (a)	28231.32	80.7	26328.72	77.1	32178.36	81.9	27824.78	86.4	28177.19	87.7	24153.35	88.9	24079.92	88.2	25235.37	91.0	30154.43	89.0	26478.16	90.7
Grant Aided Educationists	27.94	0.1	18.73	0.1	66.61	0.2	12.08	0.0	2.39	0.0	8.24	0.0	10.77	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0
Other Salaries/ Allowances	2896.72	8.3	2537.69	7.4	2508.56	6.4	1657.90	5.2	1329.29	4.8	1262.89	4.7	1191.45	4.4	917.11	3.3	1176.73	3.5	1207.12	4.1
General Expenses	261.22	0.8	467.55	1.4	432.56	1.1	273.79	0.9	301.22	0.9	228.24	0.8	435.91	1.6	139.37	0.5	172.57	0.3	113.88	0.4
Service Charges (d)	649.46	1.9	615.74	1.8	566.37	1.4	529.93	1.7	509.80	1.6	451.55	1.7	504.92	1.9	494.52	1.8	744.30	2.2	443.61	1.5
Travel Expenses	278.21	0.8	338.31	1.0	236.07	0.6	193.72	0.6	161.95	0.5	128.21	0.5	218.26	0.8	128.34	0.5	297.90	0.9	186.07	0.6
Total Operating Expenses (e)	1184.69	3.4	1421.60	4.2	1114.14	2.8	769.99	2.4	972.97	3.0	808.00	3.0	1159.08	4.2	762.23	2.8	1214.77	3.6	743.57	2.6
Boarding Costs	186.57	0.5	127.95	0.4	119.18	0.3	119.17	0.4	58.50	0.2	56.93	0.2	39.31	0.1	39.56	0.1	51.55	0.2	49.59	0.2
Student's Requisites (f)	2221.06	6.4	3363.49	9.9	3043.27	7.7	1482.39	4.6	1275.65	4.0	811.66	3.0	782.61	2.9	669.26	2.4	1123.23	3.3	578.91	2.0
School Maintenance (aided schools)	205.15	0.6	316.17	0.9	126.63	0.3	102.65	0.3	94.67	0.3	68.73	0.3	50.61	0.2	77.03	0.3	118.66	0.4	100.90	0.4
School Maintenance (g)	34.76	0.1	48.59	0.1	24.19	0.1	18.05	0.1	7.31	0.0	3.85	0.0	4.30	0.0	20.09	0.1	48.81	0.1	36.95	0.1
TOTALS	34992.41	100	34160.94	100	39301.81	100	32214.46	100	32117.97	100	27175.84	100	27318.06	100	27720.64	100	33888.19	100	29195.19	100

TABLE 8
MAJOR COMPONENTS OF RECURRENT EXPENDITURES IN SECONDARY EDUCATION (1974-1983)
 (Constant (1975) prices) (Kwacha 000's)

	1974		1975		1976		1977		1978		1979		1980		1981		1982		1983	
	Exp.	I	Exp.	I	Exp.	I	Exp.	I	Exp.	I	Exp.	I	Exp.	I	Exp.	I	Exp.	I	Exp.	I
Teacher Salaries (a)	1683.71	9.6	2342.82	14.0	3514.22	19.0	3728.83	24.0	4056.03	26.9	3729.98	28.8	4027.88	29.8	4392.28	34.4	3750.27	37.3	3245.18	41.6
Grant Aided Educationists (b)	2073.89	11.8	1712.58	10.2	1993.84	10.8	1498.42	9.6	1443.58	9.6	1071.59	8.3	1010.47	7.5	822.65	6.4	1122.65	7.4	461.78	3.7
Other Salaries/ Allowances (c)	7804.17	44.3	6762.03	40.4	7048.54	38.1	5670.51	36.5	5202.72	34.5	3849.62	29.8	3800.94	28.1	3083.27	24.1	2873.04	18.8	2238.16	17.8
General Expenses	343.22	2.0	429.32	2.6	409.05	2.2	200.85	1.3	185.95	1.2	172.15	1.3	160.58	1.2	129.23	1.0	212.45	1.4	73.24	0.6
Service Charges (d)	407.27	2.3	408.77	2.4	417.16	2.3	422.31	2.7	384.65	2.6	368.75	2.9	306.99	2.3	303.97	2.4	406.51	2.7	278.37	2.2
Travel Expenses	312.75	1.8	359.92	2.2	477.56	2.6	315.62	2.0	239.49	1.6	319.37	2.3	403.61	3.0	517.81	4.1	582.75	3.8	570.37	4.5
Total Operating Expenses (e)	1063.23	6.0	1198.01	7.2	1303.77	7.1	938.78	6.0	810.09	5.4	860.27	6.7	871.18	6.5	951.01	7.4	1201.71	7.9	921.98	7.3
Boarding Costs	5599.91	20.4	3745.09	22.4	3754.21	20.3	2959.53	19.0	2908.55	19.3	2913.98	22.5	2402.20	17.8	2040.07	16.0	2646.00	17.3	2278.78	18.1
Student's Requisites (f)	1347.7	7.7	908.90	5.4	856.40	4.6	745.54	4.8	663.49	4.4	507.63	3.9	448.16	3.3	403.74	3.2	460.49	3.0	665.06	5.3
School Maintenance (g)	38.18	0.2	79.75	0.5	8.44	0.1	13.32	0.1	7.22	0.1	11.20	0.1	9.34	0.1	2.08	0.0	1.14	0.0	0.27	0.0
Grant Aided Schools (Operating Costs)	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	939.61	7.0	1090.41	8.5	1244.37	8.1	795.20	6.3
TOTALS	17610.80	100	16749.18	100	18479.41	100	15554.93	100	15091.68	100	12944.26	100	13510.00	100	12785.52	100	15279.67	100	12607.40	100

Notes for Tables 7 & 8

/a Teacher salaries include all allowances to teachers such as housing allowance, cash in lieu of leave and other allowances.
 /b Grant aided educationists are teachers in government aided schools.
 /c Other salaries and allowances are salaries and wages for administrative and non-teaching staff including casual daily employees. The figures also include other staff payments such as provident fund contributions and other staff allowances.
 /d Service charges are expenses for teachers accommodation rentals and hotel bills and are like housing allowances for teachers.
 /e Total operating expenses are totals of general expenses, service charges and travel expenses.
 /f Student requisites include all supplies required by schools.
 /g School maintenance includes repairs, practical rooms, furniture and other related expenditures.
 Source: Annual Financial Reports of government.

Primary Education

7.2 The most notable feature is the increase in the share of teachers salaries in the total budget for the sector. This has steadily increased from about 81 percent in 1974 to 91 percent in 1983. It is apparent that the increase in the share of teachers salaries has been taking place at the expense of other operating expenses, most notably of student requisites. The proportion of funds being spent on student supplies, namely books and materials, has gone down from 6.35 percent in 1974 to nearly 2 percent in 1983. The share of administrative expenses has also declined substantially, while the share of operating expenses has steadily declined from 3.4 percent in 1974 to 2.55 percent in 1983. Less than half of the proportion used for school maintenance in 1974 was applied in 1983. It is evident that the reductions in the recurrent expenditures in the primary education subsector have been more on student supplies and operating expenditures than on teacher's salaries. The impact on the quality of services is apparent, as the inputs necessary to enable the existing services to perform effectively are not available.

7.3 The relative changes in the expenditure shares of major groups has to be viewed in the context of two features. First, there has been a steady increase in the number of students during this period. Table 9 shows the school enrollment in primary and secondary schools during this period). Second the total resources available have declined steadily from 1974 to 1983. The decline has been about 17 percent in real terms for primary education. Table 10 indicates the impact in terms of real expenditures per pupil. The total recurrent expenditure on primary education per pupil has declined by almost 37 percent from K40.71 to K26.00 during this period. The decline in the per capita expenditures on student supplies from K2.58 in 1974 to K0.75 is most striking. Although this reduction by nearly 75 percent is due to an increase in the share of teachers salaries, the per capita expenditures on salaries has declined, suggesting larger class sizes on the whole. The per capita expenditures on administrative and operating expenses have also declined, indicating, probably, lower levels of supervision.

TABLE 9
SCHOOL ENROLLMENT 1974 - 1980 (a)

<u>Year</u>	<u>Primary Schools</u>	<u>Secondary Schools</u>
1964	378,417	13,853
1969	661,281	42,388
1974	858,191	65,764
1975	872,392	73,047
1976	907,867	78,805
1977	936,817	83,887
1978	964,475	88,980
1979	996,597	91,795
1980	1,041,938	94,595

(a) Includes government and government aided schools.

Source: Educational Statistics 1980, Ministry of Education and Culture, (Planning Unit), August 1982.

TABLE 10
REAL EXPENDITURES PER PUPIL
IN PRIMARY AND SECONDARY EDUCATION

(Constant (1975) prices)
(Kwachas)

<u>Year</u>	<u>Total Expenses</u>	<u>Teachers Salaries</u> (a)	<u>Administrative Expenses</u> (b)	<u>Operating Expenses</u> (c)	<u>Student Requisites</u>
<u>PRIMARY EDUCATION</u>					
1974	40.71	32.92	3.37	1.38	2.58
1977	34.39	29.71	1.76	0.82	1.58
1980	26.00	23.11	1.14	1.11	0.75
<u>SECONDARY EDUCATION</u>					
1974	267.78	57.14	118.67	16.17	20.49
1977	197.38	66.33	71.95	11.91	9.46
1980	142.25	53.62	40.18	9.20	4.73

Source: Tables 7 and 8

- Notes: (a) Teachers salaries include salaries for government teachers and teachers in government aided schools.
(b) Administrative expenses are expenses on salaries, wages and allowances of non-teaching administrative staff.
(c) Operating expenses are travel and general expenses and include expenses for teacher housing (service charges).

7.4 Secondary Education. The trends observed in the expenditure patterns in secondary education are more or less similar to those in primary education. Here the share of teachers salaries in the total expenditures has more than doubled from 22 percent in 1974 to 46 percent in 1983. This increase has taken place at the expense of administrative expenses and student supplies. The percentage of expenditures on students supplies has

gone down from 7.65 percent in 1974 to nearly 3 percent in 1983. The share of administrative expenses has also declined considerably from about 44 percent in 1974 to about 18 percent in 1983. Thus, in the secondary education sector also reductions in real expenditures have been rather on student supplies and administrative expenses than on teachers salaries.

7.5 The decline in the total real resources being made available for secondary education has been much more by comparison with primary education. The decline in real terms has been about 29 percent during this decade. The per capita expenditure has declined much more from K267.78 in 1974 to K142.25 in 1983, or by nearly 47 percent. The decline in per capita expenditures on student supplies is also drastic from K20.49 to K4.73. As far as teachers' salaries are concerned the trends do not indicate any substantial change in class size, as revealed in the primary education subsector. The administrative and operating expenses per pupil have also been reduced considerably, once again indicating lower levels of supervision.

7.6 The expenditures on school maintenance accounted for a very small proportion of the total recurrent expenditures both in primary and secondary education. Less money is in fact now available for primary school maintenance, whereas for secondary schools there has been a slight increase. Services charges, which represent expenditures incurred on housing of teachers, has accounted for more or less the same proportion in the total expenditures during this period. Another important feature worth noting is the unusually high proportion of expenditures on student boarding in secondary education. Although the proportion has declined from 20.44 to 17.32 percent, it still represents a sizeable part of the hard-to-get resources available to the sector.

7.7 Although teachers' salaries account for a major share of expenditure in the education sector, especially in primary education, the budgeting and management of actual expenditures on salaries have not received enough attention in MOGEC. As a general policy, every student who completes the training course in one of the 10 primary teacher training institutions or in one of the six secondary teacher training institutions is employed, whether he passes the final examinations or not. The primary teacher candidates who fail the examinations are given one chance to re-sit the examinations, while the secondary teacher candidates are given two more chances. In addition to such blanket recruitment, provinces and districts are also allowed to recruit "pupil teachers" or "untrained teachers", if trained teachers are not available. Such recruitment is widespread in rural areas, where trained teachers are unwilling to go because of the shortage of housing. This practice, apart from seriously affecting the quality of education, also has an impact on the expenditures on salaries. Another aspect, which is not properly planned or coordinated with the budgetary process is the introduction of double shifts or triple shifts for teachers or multigrade system in primary schools. Such policy decisions are routinely made for increasing enrollment, although there may be heavy financial implications.

7.8 Despite the fact that MOGEC has been recruiting on an average 1700 primary school teachers and about 500 secondary school teachers during the

last three years, the ministry has no accurate information on the total number of teachers in service, to guide in the estimation of salary requirements. There is no process which allocates the available teachers rationally; this leads to overstaffing in some districts and some disciplines, with simultaneous understaffing elsewhere. There appears to be considerable potential for affecting economies in the salary expenditures and for deploying the available teachers more effectively. The consequences of the lack of proper planning of the recruitment and payment of salaries is reflected in the steep growth of teacher salaries during the last five years and the over-expenditures incurred, which are shown in Table 11. The actual expenditure for primary school teachers has nearly doubled over the period 1979-83, while that for secondary school teachers has increased by nearly 150 percent. Yet in 1979, 454 primary school teachers were recruited compared to 522 in 1983, while 1442 secondary school teachers were recruited in 1979, compared to 1718 in 1983. The rest of the increases have come about through the recruitment of untrained teachers. The high percentage of over expenditures noticed in Table 11 reflects the seriousness of the problem being experienced in MOGEC in the budgeting of teachers salaries.

TABLE 11
EXPENDITURES ON SALARIES FOR PRIMARY AND SECONDARY SCHOOL TEACHERS
(1979-1983)

(CURRENT PRICES)
(K MILLION)

<u>Year</u>	<u>Original Estimate</u>	<u>Supplementary Estimate</u>	<u>Total Budget</u>	<u>Actual Expenditure</u>	<u>Percent Over Budget</u>
		(a)	<u>Primary Schools</u>		
1979	42.396	-	42.396	43.262	2.04
1980	43.473	-	43.473	46.467	6.89
1981	44.333	-	44.333	54.661	23.29
1982	55.872	-	55.872	75.866	35.78
1983	65.800	19.228	85.028	84.547	-
		(b)	<u>Secondary Schools</u>		
1979	7.000	-	7.000	6.849	-
1980	7.700	-	7.700	7.943	3.15
1981	9.000	-	9.000	9.743	8.25
1982	12.457	-	12.457	14.832	19.06
1983	13.848	-	13.848	17.207	24.25

Source: Financial Reports, government.

(The above figures relate only salaries and excludes other allowances).

7.9 The major features observed in the primary and secondary education sectors during the period 1979-1983 could be summed up as follows:

- (i) The real resources being made available have declined by 17 percent for primary and 29 percent for secondary education.
- (ii) As a result of increases in enrollment, the per pupil expenditures have fallen by 37 percent in primary education, by 47 percent in secondary.
- (iii) There has been a substantial increase, especially in secondary education, in the share of salaries in the total expenditures. The increase has, however, not resulted in any changes in the per student expenditures on teachers salaries, suggesting possible reexamination of student teacher ratios in secondary education. In the case of primary education, the per capita expenditures on teacher salaries have fallen considerably, suggesting an increase in average class size.
- (iv) The reductions in real expenditures has had the most serious impact on the per capita expenditures on student supplies in primary and secondary education. This reduction is sizeable in secondary education.
- (v) Administrative and operating expenses have declined, the former much more in secondary education, suggesting perhaps a lowering of the levels of supervision.
- (vi) Despite the fact that teachers' salaries account for a large proportion of recurrent expenditures, MOGEC budgeting of salaries and expenditures has been unplanned and uncoordinated with recruitment and other policies, leading to a rapid growth in expenditures during the last five years.

8. POSSIBLE STEPS FOR IMPROVING THE PROCESSES

8.1 The Zambian budgetary system is basically a well established one with detailed procedures and some trained staff. Its actual working, however, needs improvement, especially in view of the increasing constraint on government expenditures. Since 1983, some changes have been introduced in the MOF procedures, such as the provision of annual financial ceilings and medium term financial planning to ensure that expenditure requirements are matched against the availability of resources, which may lead to a better functioning of the existing budgetary processes. However within the education sector, the expected fall in the level of real resources available in the next four or five years and the increasing pressures on the services being provided, call for a reassessment of both the major policies and assumptions and the budgetary procedures to ensure that the education system is efficiently managed and that the limited funds have a maximum impact. The

need for reforms is particularly crucial in the education sector because of both the large volume of government resources being utilized and the crucial long term needs for human resources development.

Mechanisms for Review of Policies

8.2 This paper has not directly addressed the policies followed in the education sector, which aspect has been dealt with adequately in other reports of the Bank. However the review of expenditure trends observed during the ten year period 1974-83, suggests that there are several major policies and assumptions which need reassessment. Examples are provision of boarding facilities to secondary school students, recruitment and salary levels of teachers, cost sharing for student supplies and school maintenance, the levy of school fees so as to reduce the net budgetary costs to government and adjustments in student-teacher ratios. What is important is that mechanisms should be established within the MOGEC and MOHE which facilitate a continuous review of major policies and their reassessment in the light of continuing financial constraints. The building-up of capacity in the ministry headquarters to collect information and analyze the financial implications of various policies and to present issues for government directives is indeed an essential aspect of development of institutional capacity in the sector. The planning units in both ministries need to be strengthened and appropriate capacity developed for continues review of major policies.

Improving Capacity for Financial Planning

8.3 Past efforts in the sector, as in other sectors, have emphasized building capacity for development planning and for project evaluation techniques. The attention has been on individual capital and development projects and their implementation. The current budget system does not provide an overall financial framework for MOGC/MOGE to plan education sector recurrent and capital expenditures as a whole. Building up capacity for financial planning that balances demands for expenditures against the overall availability of resources is necessary for any form of development planning to be effective. Such financial planning is also necessary to enable the MOGEC/MOHE to assess whether sectoral policies and assumptions about future levels of spending are compatible with the resources likely to be made available.

Improvement in the Budgetary Processes

8.4 Whatever set of policies the MOGEC/MOHE chooses to follow, the budgetary processes will require considerable improvement to translate policies into programs of expenditure and to rank and assign priorities amongst competing projects. The present processes are not well understood by any officials and there is no institutional mechanism to discuss alternative funding possibilities and to decide on allocation of budgetary resources according to any well conceived plan. The mechanism of the Finance Committee has been dealing with capital projects only, and only very briefly before sending the proposals to NCDP. Staff work for the Finance Committee has to be improved so that the Committee might consider and discuss in detail both

the recurrent and capital budget proposals. Analytical skills need to be developed in the ministry headquarters through appropriate training and technical assistance to bring about improvements in the budgetary processes.

Strengthening of Finance Units

8.5 In both the Ministries the finance unit is not adequately staffed with trained manpower. The existing staff view the budgetary process as an accounting function and are too overwhelmed by day-to-day problems to have any time for long term planning. Increasing the staff available and improving their quality through training are likely to be good investment in the sector.

Analysis of Recurrent Cost Implications

8.6 As already mentioned in the present budgetary processes do not ensure that adequate recurrent expenditures are allocated to completed development projects. Both the Ministries should develop procedures to estimate the financial requirements for increasing capacity utilization and ensure that the budgetary processes are utilized to give priority to such requirements. MOGEC has estimated that to absorb the supply of available teachers over the period 1983-86, an additional K30.00 million would be required. In addition such an absorption would also have serious financial implications for provision of teacher housing under the capital budget if the teachers are to be effectively utilized. Issues such as these need to be more thoroughly analyzed and integrated into the budgetary process.

Review of Capital Projects

8.7 A portfolio review of existing capital projects needs to be carried out to provide guidelines on projects that need to be given priority in the allocation of funds. At present there is no systematic review of expenditure reports or implementation record to facilitate funding decisions. The stage of completion and the benefits likely for each project will have to be monitored to utilize the limited development resources effectively. It is also necessary to plan and schedule new capital projects realistically in the light of resources available to complete existing projects and to meet recurrent expenditures overall.

References

- 1) Republic of Zambia "Restructuring in the Midst of Crisis", Consultative Group for Zambia, May, 1984 Volumes I and II.
- 2) World Bank "Zambia: Planning and Budgeting in Zambia", Eastern Africa Regional Office, Volumes I and II, February 1983.
- 3) Republic of Zambia, "Educational Statistics 1980" Planning Unit, Ministry of Education and Culture, August 1982, Lusaka.
- 4) Republic of Zambia, "Annual Report for the Year 1980", Ministry of Education and Culture, 1982, Lusaka.
- 5) Jean-Claude Eicher, "Educational Costing and Financing in Developing Countries" (With Special Reference to Sub-Saharan Africa), Education Department, World Bank, December, 1982.
- 6) World Bank, "Educational Expenditures in the 1970s", Education Department, Washington, June 30, 1982.
- 7) Republic of Zambia, "Educational Reform: Proposals and Recommendations", Ministry of Education, October 1977, Lusaka.
- 8) World Bank, "Financing of Education in Eastern Africa", Volume I: "Controlling the Costs of Primary and Secondary Education" Education and Manpower Development Division, Eastern Africa Regional Office, January 20, 1984.

Patterns of Arrangements for Managing
Vocational Training in Sub-Saharan Africa

1. Four major organizational models of institutional arrangements for managing non-formal vocational training in Sub-Saharan Africa can be identified, reflecting the most common patterns of allocation of responsibility for non-formal training. These place responsibility under the Ministry of Labor or Ministry of Education, on another ministry or in several ministries.
2. Under the first model, which applies to a relatively large number of countries,^{1/} responsibility for non-formal training is given to a national vocational training institution, with varying degrees of administrative and financial autonomy, under the auspices of the Ministry of Labour.
3. The second model is rather unusual - a body under the authority of the Ministry of Education charged with responsibility for non-formal training. Examples of this are the National Office for Vocational Training (Office National de Formation Professionnelle - ONFP) in the Ivory Coast, National Council for Manpower Development in Lesotho and the Department of Technical Education and Vocational Training in Zambia.

-
- ^{1/} Examples of such autonomous or semi-autonomous training management bodies in Sub-Saharan African countries are:
- Benin, Centre for Further Training of Staff in Enterprises (Centre de Perfectionnement du Personnel des Entreprises), 1981;
 - Botswana, National Advisory Board for Apprenticeship and Industrial Training, 1983;
 - Burkina, National Office for the Promotion of Employment (Office National de la Promotion de l'Emploi), 1974;
 - Cameroon, National Centre for Vocational Training (Centre National de Formation Professionnelle - CENAFOP), 1981;
 - Central African Republic, National Interprofessional Organization for Vocational and Further Training (Organisation Nationale Interprofessionnelle de Formation et Perfectionnement), 1980;
 - Congo, Directory for Employment and Manpower (Direction de l'Emploi et de la main de'oeuvre), 1973;
 - Kenya, Directorate of Industrial Training, 1970;
 - Madagascar, National Institution for Vocational and Further Training (Institut National de Promotion-Formation - INPF), 1974;
 - Malawi, Industrial Training Unit, 1966;
 - Niger, Directorate for Vocational Training (Direction de la Formation professionnelle), 1981;
 - Nigeria, National Manpower Board, 1971;
 - Zaire, National Institution for Vocational Training (Institution Nationale de la Preparation Professionnelle - INPP), 1964;
 - Zimbabwe, National Vocational Training Development Centre, 1980.

4. Under the third model, specialized ministries, other than the Ministries of Education and Labour, take on the responsibility for non-formal training such as in Gabon, the National Agency for Vocational Training under the auspices of the Ministry for Vocational Training and for Artisan Promotion (Agence Nationale de Formation et de Perfectionnement Professionnel - ANFPP, Ministère de la Formation Professionnelle et de la Promotion de l'Artisanat). Another example is the Gambia, where the National Vocational Training Board, a semi-autonomous body, is attached to the President's office and to the Ministry of Economic Planning and Industrial Development.

5. In the fourth model, the responsibility for non-formal training is dispersed among various ministries, enterprises and other non-governmental bodies without any specific institution being responsible for overall policy formulation, determination of priorities and strategies, establishment of national standards, etc. Coordination at the national level may be entrusted in such cases to the Ministry of Economic Planning (e.g. Mauritania) or an inter-ministerial committee (e.g. Sierra Leone).

Bank Experience in Education Lending

1. Bank experience with institutional development in education in Sub-Saharan Africa includes the design stage, in its portfolio of 100 projects and the implementation stage, in regard to the completed projects. A summary presentation of the incidence of institutional development in education projects FY64-84 is given in Table 1 of this Annex. Experience with project design reflects patterns of amount and distribution of proposed investments over time, priorities regarding the areas of the education system selected for support and priorities regarding the means selected to achieve institutional development. Experience with implementation shows the peculiar problems of institutional development components and the need for more consistent attention to these aspects of projects. A review of experience in the five selected case study countries provides instructive patterns of behavior in both stages.

(i) Project design.

2. Amounts (see Table 1 of this Annex). Trends are perceptible over time in the Bank-financed education projects in the attention given to institutional development. In the 1960s the Bank assumed no responsibility for financing institutional development and software, leaving this for bilateral and other agencies. Of the 13 projects approved for lending in Sub-Saharan Africa during FY64-69 only two - Madagascar I and Sierra Leone I - contained Bank supported institutional development components. Toward the end of the 1960s, however, the Bank liberalized its lending policies to include institutional development. In the 1970s, 57 of the 59 projects and in the 1980s all of the 28 projects contained some funding for institutional development. The overall growth in estimated costs of institutional development has been very dramatic - from an average per project of US\$2.7 million in Eastern Africa and less than US\$1.8 million in Western Africa in the 1970s to about US\$3.4 million and US\$6.2 million respectively in the 1980s. The estimated percentage of estimated project costs which was devoted to institutional development rose steadily in Western Africa from 0.9 in the 1960s to 12.6 in the 1970s and 21.8 in the 1980s; however, in Eastern Africa (also with a negligible 0.3 percent in the 1960s), there was a decline from 13.6 in the 1970s to 11.7 in the 1980s.

3. Objectives. Table 1 groups the various items addressed in institutional development components into major categories.^{1/} The overwhelming preoccupation in these projects has been with two general areas - (a) project management and (b) planning and studies (which includes preinvestment and feasibility studies, preparation of future projects,

^{1/} These are (a) project management, (b) planning and studies, (c) management and (d) technical aspects of educational management. "Management" covered under (c) includes central/district administration, financial and personnel management, management training and the management of vocational training. The various technical aspects of educational management cover such topics as textbooks, curricula and school supervision.

research, surveys, and evaluation). Project management support has occurred most frequently - in 72 percent of the projects - and the paramount consideration has been to secure smooth project implementation. Aggressive efforts to build up permanent capacity for project implementation have surfaced as a major objective only in a few recent projects.^{2/} The objectives in planning have been generally to reinforce existing planning units, with the goal of having them prepare plans for use in designing future projects. One very commendable strategy was the inclusion of the human resource development section of ministries of planning for strengthening in some of these projects - a recognition of the interdependence of sector planning in the sector ministries and the central planning work.^{3/} The studies and evaluation undertakings have similarly had the goal of answering questions about future possible investment. Thus some 47 percent of the identifiable institutional development items have been broadly in the area of addressing weaknesses of direct concern to the viability of the Bank's lending program.

4. Another area frequently scheduled for investment was the technical aspect of educational management, particularly (a) textbooks and teaching materials, mainly in Eastern Africa, covering textbook preparation and in several cases, printing capacity as well, or simply strengthening the supply and distribution system^{4/} and (b) curriculum development, mainly in the 1970s, in support of the many qualitative changes being pursued in education.^{5/}

5. There has been less emphasis upon the broad area of Management^{6/}, in which only 27 percent of the total items were involved, although the extent of support in these areas has been considerably higher in the 1980s than it was in the 1970s. Assistance has been included for studying the

^{2/} For example, Liberia Third Education Project (FY77), where a structural change was made in the Ministry of Education to absorb a large part of the project unit and institutionalize the function, and in Central African Republic Second Education Project (FY83).

^{3/} Examples of this occur in Liberia I and III, Mali I and Guinea I.

^{4/} Textbook preparation and printing were provided for in 23 components in Eastern Africa and 15 in Western Africa. Examples of assistance to the supply and distribution system occur in Third Education Projects in Uganda and Sierra Leone.

^{5/} Nineteen items in Eastern Africa and 16 in Western Africa.

^{6/} This includes strengthening central/district administration, financial and personnel administration, management training, the management of vocational training and of school maintenance.

reorganization of central administration^{7/} and, in a few cases, district administration, and strong support as well as for various departments or sections of the administration.^{8/} However, there has been very little major support for the administration as a whole.^{9/} Financial management was assisted in only five projects in Eastern and 13 projects in Western Africa.^{10/} What is interesting is that 11 of these 18 projects were in the 1980s. A similarly stepped up pace in Western Africa is noticeable in personnel management where, in contrast to just one project in Eastern Africa, some eight projects were designed to assist this area, five of them occurring in the 1980s.

6. The development of management training was included in about one third of the projects in the 1970s and 1980s. Some of it was directed at establishing or strengthening local management training institutions.^{11/} The management of vocational training was also supported in about the same

7/ Studies of reorganisation and administrative practices in ministries of education (Zaire, First Education Project, Second Education Projects in Mauritius, Mauritania and Liberia).

8/ Cases of support for district administration were Botswana Third Project, Ethiopia Fourth and Fifth Projects, Gambia, and Madagascar Second Project. With regard to sections of ministries, for example: in Central African Republic Second Project the School Construction Unit; in the three Mali projects, various departments; in Sierra Leone Third Project, primary education.

9/ In the Benin First and Burkina Second Projects there was major support for the administrative infrastructure for non-formal education - the 4D clubs national and regional support centers in Benin and the directorate for rural youth and regional offices in Burkina. Liberia II and IV attempted to address a wide area of weaknesses in the Ministry of Education and Zambia III and IV also included major contributions to the overall strengthening of the Ministry of Education.

10/ Eastern Africa - Zambia (FY77) Botswana (FY80 and FY82) and Uganda (FY83); in Western Africa Mali (FY73 and FY84) Senegal (FY74); Ivory Coast (FY75 and FY80), Liberia (FY76 and FY80), Gambia (FY78) Burkina (FY80) Benin and Mauritania (FY82), Central African Republic and Guinea (FY83).

11/ For example, management or public administration training institutions in Somalia, Swaziland, Lesotho, Gambia, Tanzania, Mali, Sierra Leone, Botswana and Senegal; accountancy training institutions in Madagascar and Malawi.

number of projects - in some cases, establishing a new service.^{12/}

7. The objectives were not always stated clearly. Terms such as "to strengthen" "to improve" and "to support" occurred often, without the benefit of a thorough statement of the problem being addressed which would assist the reader in grasping the precise intention. Other more specific terms were used, however, such as "to expand", "to establish", "to initiate" and "to centralize".

8. Means. The means selected for effecting institutional development included physical plant, expert services, fellowships and initial operating costs. Buildings were included in 46 percent of the projects, more particularly in Eastern Africa in the 1970s and 1980s and in Western Africa in the 1980s. Fellowships occurred in 48 percent of the projects and financing for operating costs in 30 percent of the projects. Expert services were almost entirely supplied by other sources in the 1960s; however, in the 1970s and 1980s, despite the incidence of considerable other donor support for experts, 85 of the 87 projects supported experts for institutional development. Thus the institutional development process was generally designed to be dependent in large measure on the quality, acceptability and success of the expert services.

(ii) Project Implementation

9. There have been several development achievements within the implementation experience of the 58 projects which had been completed by March 1985; with few exceptions, these projects had been approved prior to FY78^{13/} and so do not represent the very latest and generally more thorough approaches to institutional development.

10. Perhaps the most important observation about the implementation experience of the institutional development components is that in the Bank's project evaluation system - completion and audit reporting - these components receive very limited attention. Some items, especially studies, are sometimes not accounted for and the achievements of experts are often not recorded.

^{12/} Niger First Project assisted in establishing a training directorate in the Ministry of Labor and the Civil Service. Liberia Third Project assisted in establishing the Board of Agricultural and Industrial Training as well as a unit to supervise and encourage the vocational training system.

^{13/} These 58 (32 in Eastern and Southern Africa and 26 in Western Africa) include 46 (23 in each region) which had institutional development components. The remaining 12 had been approved mainly in the 1960s and did not have such components. Forty eight have had published performance audit or completion reports prepared on them and the remainder have had only draft completion reports prepared on them. The exceptions are Gambia I (FY78) and Lesotho II (FY78) and Guinea I (FY79).

11. Despite its having been the focus of attention at the design stage, the project management experience during project implementation has been mixed. Very few countries now have efficient institutionalized project management systems ^{14/} - quite clearly the result of the priority attached to project implementation as distinct from building up permanent implementation capacity. There have been some implicit warnings emerging from the experience, such as the need to make provision for strong local participation^{15/}, the need for permanent posts^{16/} and for adequate salaries or rewards^{17/} and the need to ensure recruitment of effective managers, not simply senior educators.^{18/} There have been strong efforts to train staff in civil works specialisations, such as in Lesotho II (architectural trainees and engineering technicians), Malawi II (draftsmen) and Liberia III (design and construction staff), but these have been very few. While there have been encouraging trends toward institutionalizing project management in many countries it is not clear that there is full recognition by Bank and countries that the implementation of development programs is not a temporary one-shot undertaking but an integral part of the foreseeable future in the developing countries and should be provided for within the regular permanent establishment of ministries of education. The costs of weak implementation capacity are extraordinarily high, in terms of use of expensive expert services and the cost of delay in implementation at times of rapid price escalation.

12. The very frequent assistance to planning, along with extensive bilateral and other support, has left very few strong planning units. There would no doubt be a unique combination of reasons for failure in each individual case, but at the heart of the problem is the design of the projects. Given the very short term outlook of shoring up a function which was seen as important for future lending operations, in retrospect it is

^{14/} Ethiopia and Ivory Coast are perhaps the best examples of those which have. Sierra Leone has good capacity, but it has not been institutionalized. Liberia is another example of a capable service which, however, has been only partly institutionalized.

^{15/} Zambia III-V.

^{16/} Swaziland.

^{17/} Swaziland; salaries for architects in Burundi and Malawi, Tanzania IV. The cases of Liberia and Sierra Leone where salaries of project unit staff were higher even than ministers were not typical.

^{18/} Kenya III.

clear that the efforts to build up planning were simply inadequate.^{19/} In some cases it was distracted or overshadowed by the direct aim of producing a plan.^{20/} Often either the proposed planning was not done or only sector or subsector analyses were undertaken.^{21/} In a few cases there were positive outcomes where there was a strong core of permanent staff with some stability over a reasonable period of time.^{22/} University planning efforts had mixed results.^{23/}

13. One of the weakest aspects of implementing these institutional development components has been the various studies which have often been added, at Bank suggestion, at a late stage in project generation. During project implementation, the studies have proven to be among the most vulnerable items in the already vulnerable area of institutional development. In many cases the studies were simply deleted or not done; sometimes they were substantially changed, an outstanding example being those studies searching for alternatives to formal primary education.^{24/} Of those which were done, some were seen as having had limited value because they were conceived and conducted by foreigners.^{25/} Generally the studies suffered from low country commitment to them. Among the most

^{19/} In most cases there were a few experts, to a lesser extent a few fellowships and some equipment.

^{20/} Among these cases are Cameroon I, Kenya II, Sierra Leone I and Kenya III. Only in the case of Sierra Leone was a plan produced as expected. A sector report was prepared under Kenya III.

^{21/} In Mauritania I, Mali I (technical/vocational), Senegal II it was not done. In Tanzania V, Sudan II, Mali a sector or sub-sector study was substituted.

^{22/} Uganda and Liberia are good examples and Guinea as well.

^{23/} In Liberia, it was successful in preparing a plan and establishing a unit; in Sierra Leone, it had more limited success in both areas; in Zambia, the item was deleted and the planning function does not enjoy a very high status.

^{24/} Studies were deleted or not carried out in Ethiopia II and III, Madagascar I, Tanzania IV, Ivory Coast II (tracer studies); Zambia IV and Lesotho II (construction industry); and Chad II alternative training schemes for young farmers. The Senegal II, Mauritania I, Mali I studies on alternatives to formal primary education were all drastically modified.

^{25/} This applied to Ivory Coast II (study of rural education and training needs), Mauritania I (Koranic school study), Kenya II (curriculum revision and textbook production studies), Cameroon II and, to some extent, the Ethiopia II Education Review.

successful studies have been those in Tanzania Fourth and Fifth projects (evaluation of management and accountancy training respectively).^{26/}

14. In the more technical aspects of managing education, results have been generally good. New or revised curricula have been extensively developed, but the extent of success in institutional development has not been well documented in the reports. The curriculum development centers in Ethiopia and Sudan were reported to be in operation. In educational broadcasting, however, there have been disappointing results. In Liberia II, the pre-investment study of radio was done but there was no follow-up; in Sierra Leone II, it was not done for lack of follow-up. In Mauritania I, the farmer radio item was deleted.

15. The overall administration or management items were generally successful in that the results were more visible and permanent. Some benefits were perceptible over a broad front, even if not precisely measurable, in Liberia (Second and Third Projects), at least in arresting decline and achieving some improvement. In Benin I, and Burkina I, the management of rural youth training was strengthened, despite a few tensions arising from reorganization in Burkina and the limited technical assistance impact in Benin. In Botswana I, the assistance to the National Brigade headquarters was useful but the future seemed uncertain. In Zaire I, the management reorganisation study was conducted, but appeared to lead directly into nothing more than data processing services provided by the firm which conducted the study. District administration was successfully supported in Ethiopia IV (Awraja Pedagogical Centers) and Gambia I (Regional Education Centers).

16. Management training initiatives were also generally successful, but there were a few limitations. The Ethiopia University Social Science Center was already producing graduates in administration at the time of project completion, the Institute of Public Administration and Management in Sierra Leone was functioning, but focussing on more general courses in administration only. In Lesotho the intended merging of business administration and civil service training in one institute was not achieved, but each separate training center benefitted from the project. Objectives appear to have been realized in the Gambia Management Development Institute assisted under the First Education Project.

17. In the management of vocational training, a strong focus has been on establishing governing mechanisms which bring together employers (both private sector and public sector) and government ministries. There have been successes in Ivory Coast (First and Second Projects), where the necessary legislation was passed and employers participate in both the design and financing of vocational training. In Senegal as well (First and Second Projects) there has been some progress, even though private sector employers felt that the programs of the University Technology Institute were too academic. In Liberia, the Board of Agricultural and Industrial

^{26/} These were successful in that the Government accepted their recommendations and they led to Government conducted programs of accountancy training and to the rationalizing of management training.

Training has been successfully established under the Third Project. Often there has been failure for apparently minor reasons - the lack of financial and administrative autonomy (Benin I) and the failure to promulgate the necessary legislation (Congo I). The intended addition of trade testing has met with mixed results.^{27/}

18. The Social Welfare Training Center in Sierra Leone, financed under Sierra Leone II, was established. However, by 1984 it had trained almost all of the social development workers needing such training and its future was in doubt. This raised serious questions about the wisdom of constructing a center of this kind for such a short-term task without some longer-term view of its role.

19. With regard to the means adopted, for effecting institutional development it appears that considerable success in regard to utilization attended those efforts where buildings were provided.^{28/} There was a tendency to underestimate some building requirements, perhaps from not using a sufficiently long-term horizon at the project design stage.^{29/}

^{27/} Trade testing in Lesotho II had limited impact as the experts left too soon. In Swaziland, the career guidance and testing service was established, but the testing equipment was used more for primary, secondary and university tests.

^{28/} A few examples are Kenya III - storage for school equipment and the Examinations Research and Development Unit; Zambia III and IV - the Educational Services Center; Ethiopia IV the Social Science Center; Swaziland and Ethiopia III - Educational Materials Production Centers.

^{29/} Curriculum development services in Swaziland I and Ethiopia III (an experience not unlike that of Malaysia II); Zambia III (and Madagascar II) especially in regard to printing.

20. In regard to the use of experts, usually expatriate ones, there has been a largely negative outcome during implementation.^{30/} The high cost of experts appears to have prompted a very strong reaction against employing them, especially in Eastern and Southern Africa.^{31/} This was reflected in scaling down the expert provision during project implementation, with the goals being achieved either through a much reduced expatriate role, or through bilateral aid or through the use of local resources.^{32/} In some cases, with this scaling down, the goals were not achieved.^{33/} In any event, large sums were freed to be utilized for other purposes.^{34/} A second aspect has been that such expertise as was used was less effective than had been anticipated, for lack of good counterparts, poor timing or scheduling of the experts, lack of attention by experts to training, or because of inappropriate placement of experts outside the services for which they worked or their preoccupation with other tasks.^{35/} Good success with a series of short term missions of experts in Guinea I was reported.

30/ In this respect many of the problems were similar to those noted in the Bank/UNESCO Joint Study referred to in Footnote 53.

31/ Strongest in Kenya, Tanzania, Ethiopia and Zambia, where either bilateral grants were used for such experts or no use was made of large numbers of technical assistance experts. In Sierra Leone, the reaction took the form of converting the technical assistance provision to the use of local experts instead.

32/ Examples include Ethiopia II, III, IV, Malawi II, Nigeria II, Somalia I, Liberia I, Benin I, Kenya II, Sierra Leone I and II, Zambia III, Swaziland I, and Mali II.

33/ Tanzania III, Benin I (where the training consultancies were the ones deleted) Nigeria III, Kenya III, Rwanda I, Somalia II.

34/ In Kenya III, the amount was US\$0.96 million; in Zambia III, US\$4.5 million and in Zambia IV, US\$3.1 million.

35/ For example Gambia I and Central African Republic I lacked good counterparts.

Experts left before the necessary physical facilities were ready in Botswana I, Sudan II and Mali I. Late recruitment of experts occurred in Mauritius I and Cameroon I and several other projects.

Lack of attention to training was mentioned in Botswana I, Lesotho II - procurement. It was a major issue as well in Zambia III.

In Mali I, the experts were all located in the Project Unit instead of in the units which they were serving.

In Ivory Coast I they were preoccupied with tasks other than those for which they had been recruited.

21. The experience with fellowships has not been thoroughly covered in completion and audit reporting. However, one point which has surfaced is the small size of some fellowship components and the lack of fellowships in others.^{36/}

^{36/} Kenya II, Gambia I, Ivory Coast I and Liberia I, Sudan II provided insufficient fellowships; Uganda II lacked fellowships.

(iii) Institutional Development Efforts Included in Education
Projects in Five Selected Countries

(1) MALI

22. In Mali the perspective is one of some eleven years, three projects in education which cover a wide range of development problems and a rapidly rising amount of project cost devoted to Institutional Development.

	<u>Total Project Cost (US\$M)</u>	<u>Total Cost of ID Items (US\$M)</u>	<u>%</u>
Mali I	5.5	1.46	27
Mali II	11.2	3.6	32
Mali III	17.3	6.1	35

23. Education Management. In Mali I the Ministry of Education (MEN) was seen as needing (a) more trained officials and (b) rationalizing of procedures in budgeting, evaluation and management. The School of Administration (ENA) was stated to be staffed by expatriates and was evidently not considered to be relevant to the solution of the problems of MEN. The proposed solution was for the Management School (IPGP) to conduct on-the-job training for MEN officials (but no project assistance was provided for this) and to include in the project expert services in educational finance and budgeting, program evaluation and administration/management for the General Directorate of Planning, Finance and Administration MEN. Four years later (Mali II), the majority of MEN staff was still considered to lack training in administration/management, but the IPGP was now recognized as requiring assistance. Hence the project allocated some funding for instructional materials, technical assistance and a new building in a better location. During project implementation, for various reasons, this assistance was delayed and eventually scheduled to be provided under a Technical Assistance Credit (Credit 1307). For Mali III, approved seven years after Mali II, the diagnosis encompassed the problems of both staff managerial capacity and administrative organization. Presumably the long awaited assistance from the reinforced IPGP would take care of these problems.

24. Education Planning. The educational planning experience was similar. In Mali I, the diagnosis was lack of trained staff and of the institutionalizing of planning, which was attributed to the fact that the establishment of planning was quite recent. It was suggested that long-term planning should be undertaken. A two-year extension was provided for an expert planner already there in a UNDP/UNESCO post, within the general directorate of Planning, Finance and Administration. Some

strengthening of manpower planning was also provided (2 m.y. of an expert) in the Central Planning Bureau. For the Second Project, the diagnosis was again lack of trained staff; but the newly established educational planning unit was expected to play a crucial role in the control and planning of the system. The Project Implementation Unit (PIU), which was assisted by the project, was expected to be integrated into the Educational Planning Unit, for which the project provided no assistance. The Third Project Appraisal Report mentioned the need to reorganize the Unit, to separate the PIU from it and to train staff. The project provided assistance for (a) a 3-year expert in planning, (b) short term consultancies in statistics, school mapping and manpower planning (to link training better with employment) and (c) a large program of fellowships.

Vocational/Technical Subsector

25. A third area of concern was the planning and management of vocational training. The Appraisal Report for Mali I acknowledged the need to coordinate and upgrade vocational training programs offered by various ministries and agencies and observed, in general, that the quality of middle level training needed improvement. It was felt that establishing a governing body for training which included employees from public and private agencies would help improve the relevance of training to employment. Minimal provision was made to help the Directorate of Technical Education to plan vocational education - a fellowship for study visits for the director and an expert for 1:5 years in the planning of vocational education - and to help centers of technical vocational education and training to rationalize and standardize their programs and equipment (a fellowship for the Director of Practical Work at the main center, to study vocational training). For the Second Project there was silence on this subsector, except to note the lack of knowledge of employers' needs and to provide a covenant requiring that a study of these needs be undertaken and kept updated. The Third Project recognized that both planning and administration for technical/vocational education were poor, that a new division was to be established to administer this subsector and that an advisory committee of employers would also be established; new buildings for the division were included in the project, along with expert services to be furnished by France and fellowships co-financed by France for administration and evaluation.

Curriculum Development

26. Under Mali I, for primary education it was felt that experiments were needed in a search for more efficient alternatives to traditional primary education -- an interest which the Bank pursued in other African countries as well. Provision was made for this to be done by an ad hoc team of expatriate specialists (5-1/2 m.y.) assisted by local specialists (10-1/2 m.y.), in the hope that it would produce a project item for Mali II. The experiment was not designed to be institutionalized. The Second Project provided for a pilot project in more effective formal education (as well as some other non-formal pilot projects). The testing for this pilot project was to be conducted by a local research team under the Literacy Directorate (DNAFLA) supported by expatriate experts, and funding was included for operational costs fellowships and expert services. By the time of the Third Project, it was clearly recognized that there was no

alternative to formal primary education, and given the irrelevance of the curricula to the Malian environment, the aim was to prepare and experiment with new curricula and syllabi in 40 schools in one region. For this the project provided a team of specialists and its installation costs, operating costs, teacher training, furniture and equipment for the project schools and short-term consultancies (in (a) evaluation, (b) ruralization and (c) integration of practical work into general education) and fellowships for persons to visit other African countries. Thus there was a progressive increase in local participation and control but an absence of strong institutionalizing of the effort. In this latter respect there was quite some contrast with the curriculum development efforts for lower secondary schools, where the IPN was centrally involved.

27. Project Implementation. Project management was assisted in all the projects. It appears to have been taken for granted that this assistance was needed; at least no serious institutional analysis appears to have been undertaken. The assistance comprised mainly experts and operating costs, although, in the Third Project, fellowships (to train an accountant and for study tours related to project implementation) were included. The period of assistance originally intended to be financed under these projects was lengthy and raises questions about institutional development objectives; the years of expert services to be provided were as follows:

	<u>Mali</u> <u>I</u>	<u>Mali</u> <u>II</u>	<u>Mali</u> <u>III</u>	<u>Total</u>
Architect	2.5	3.0	5.5	11.0
Accountant	-	3.0	5.5	8.5
Procurement Specialist	-	3.0	2.0	5.0

(2) MADAGASCAR

28. Madagascar is a case of relatively little educational lending activity. Furthermore, the First Project in FY68 (devoting less than 7% of project cost to institutional development) and the Second in FY77 (almost entirely for institutional development) are almost at opposite ends of the spectrum in this regard.

29. The First Project included construction of buildings for the Institute of Research and Pedagogical Training. In the context of this project, the expected research and educational development activities were revision of curricula, a feasibility study of educational television, preparation of low priced textbook and a study of student attrition. These were not financed by the project but merely listed in a side letter as expected activities. The physical provision for this department of Research was a highly important aspect of helping to facilitate this program of activities.

30. The Second Project assisted with a variety of items providing the kind of support indicated in parenthesis:

- (a) establishing regional education centers (physical plant),
- (b) promoting the design and manufacture of instructional equipment (physical plant, expert services and fellowships),
- (c) textbook production (paper),
- (d) project evaluation (consulting services, administrative costs and fellowships),
- (e) inventory of school plant (expert services) and
- (f) establishing a data processing system (expert services).

In the context of its time, the Second Project represented a major step forward for the Bank in regard to strengthening the central machinery for managing the system and moving away from simple provision of school places.

31. Carryover from First to Second was due largely to the consistency of the Government policy on Malagasizing the education system. The actual research emphasis of the First Project was in the area of using the Malagasy language as the medium of instruction.

(3) ZAMBIA

32. The series of education projects in Zambia offers a long sweep of time (FY69-82) and five projects of reasonably wide range. The picture is, however, somewhat complicated by the extensive multi-lateral and bi-lateral aid made available for institutional development, especially in the later projects.

33. The first two projects provided no financing directly for institutional development -- only assurances on the part of the Government that it would take the steps needed to strengthen various units as needed. In the First Project the diagnosis was quite clear - the need for training of regional or district staff, Zambianization, expansion of the educational planning unit, broadening of secondary level inspectorate (to include coverage of technical and pre-vocational subjects) and strengthening university planning. The Second Project, which directly assisted the University, reinforced the emphasis on university planning (a covenant being included). Both projects provided for project management to be done within the key agencies involved -- Ministry of Education for the First and the University for the Second - and this should be seen as a positive step. In view of the understaffed state of the Ministry of Works, for the First Project the employment of a local firm of architects with foreign affiliation was required.

34. The last three projects included almost US\$14 million for institutional development.

35. The Third Project undertook a major institutional initiative of providing physical plant for an Educational Services Center to bring together five educational services which had been poorly housed and too scattered for proper interaction and coordination - curriculum development, audio visual aids, library services, instructional resources (of technical education), correspondence courses. A long range master plan was not required. In addition a special coordinating officer (Chief Education Officer) was to be appointed as head of the complex and a coordinating committee under was expected to oversee and promote cooperation among the services. This project also included arrangements for technical assistance expertise for university planning and management and teaching at the School of Agricultural Sciences as well as fellowships and a director for a special senior training program for preparing senior nurses, nursing tutors and administrators at the School of Nursing at the University. A coordinating committee of five ministries and the University was to be established to oversee project implementation.

36. The Fourth Project recognized that Zambianization was still an issue at the higher levels of administration. The project was wide-ranging, with important institutional implications. First of all coming only four years after Zambia III, it included an expansion of the Educational Services Center to provide for Examinations, Standards and Certification (Technical Education - Vocational Training), Research Evaluation, Guidance, and expansion of Printing and Documentation. This was justified on the basis of benefits which accrue from coordination through better siting. Secondly, at the background of this project was the assumption that Zambia should move toward sector lending -- an institutional challenge -- but that certain steps were needed, such as (a) stronger project implementation capacity, (b) finalizing the education reform (a development which was recognized as having implications for administration and organization of the sector) and (c) clarification of construction capacity. The project financed the study of construction capacity. Extensive assistance (36 years of expert services) was provided outside the project funding for project implementation. The third feature was the support (25 years of expert services and 40 years of fellowships) provided by the project for a college (Evelyn Home) to train accountants, bookkeepers and middle level administrators.

37. Zambia V reinforced an initiative taken in 1980 under Zambia III to devote some resources to establishing a maintenance system for secondary schools with some NORAD financial support as well. This project supplied materials, equipment, transport, and teacher training in maintenance and repair, while NORAD provided technical assistance. This project also provided that the implementation of the Education Reform, and the planning required for this, should be studied in depth, and funding for this was provided by SIDA.

(4) CAMEROON

38. The education projects in Cameroon were perhaps the most typical of their time in coverage of subsectors and issues.

29. For the First Project, the management problems were clearly stated. The expansion of the school system since 1957 had not been matched by organizational, administrative and curricular reforms required in the new political and economic context and in the move toward mass education. The educational planning unit was handicapped by lack of specialized staff and lack of coordination with the Directorate of the Ministry of Education and the State Secretaries of Education. East Cameroon Public Works (unlike the West) had neither the staff nor the organization to provide the technical services for implementing this project. The provisions of the project responded to these needs as follows:

- (a) professional fees for a foreign firm to deal with East Cameroon civil works as well as for a study by the same firm of various items regarding the approach to school construction which were felt to offer possible savings in the future (such studies were required, for example, in Guyana I),
- (b) establishing a project implementation unit in the Ministry of Education to be responsible to the Minister through the Education Planning Department,
- (c) an education planner (two years) and economist (two years), a school building specialist (two years), 1 technical education specialist (one year) and one agricultural education specialist (one year) to conduct school building surveys and studies to lower building costs, and assist the project unit and curriculum development efforts.

40. The Second Project, two years later, found the Federal Education Planning unit still incapable of effective planning and a general shortage of professional services to handle project management. The Appraisal Report highlighted the difficulty of creating an integrated education system out of the former French and English sections. Lack of data on rural training needs and the technical vocational situation in Northern Cameroon were also cited as problems. The project did not respond to all of these problems and not uniformly in institutionalized ways. The government was expected to establish a new Educational Planning Department which First Project technical assistance was expected to assist. The project unit was hived off, made directly responsible to the Minister of Education, expanded and provided with services of an architect and procurement specialist under technical assistance. Architectural services were to be imported. Two preinvestment studies were supported by provision of expert services--for a study of agricultural and rural training and a study of Northern Cameroon needs in technical/vocational requirements.

41. The Third Project institutional development efforts hinged on weaknesses noted in agricultural education -- poor planning, inappropriate curricula, and control divided among Higher National School of Agriculture (ENSA), Ministry of Agriculture and Ministry of Livestock. For this the project aimed at supporting government efforts to centralize management of agricultural education under a National Committee for agricultural and rural education and improve and expand the curriculum development service of ENSA. Experts were provided for the Ministry of Agriculture - 11.5

years of experts in planning, teaching methods, teaching materials for agricultural education and extension and rural sociology ; counterparts were required. A survey of rural information was to be conducted by the Rural Information Unit of this ministry with the assistance of of an expert; expert services were included for unspecified feasibility studies which might lead to future projects. Some assistance in project management -- procurement (two years) architect (two years) and engineering (one year) was also included. The necessary planning for technical education was considered to be within the resources of the Ministry of Education.

(5) SIERRA LEONE

42. The First Project Appraisal team noted several deficiencies in educational planning and administration and proposed that (a) a secondary school inspectorate be established, (b) the planning unit be strengthened by addition of a statistician, (c) an agricultural education specialist be attached to the Ministry of Education to coordinate agricultural training programs at university, secondary and primary teacher training institutions and (d) a team of four specialists be employed to modernize the secondary curricula. The project provided support for an architect for a new Project Unit located in the Ministry of Finance and all specialists identified at (b) (c) and (d) above.

43. The Second Project appraisal team observed that the Ministry of Education was still relatively weak in planning and there was no qualified statistician. The project therefore included provision for buildings, fellowships, equipment and vehicles to assist this planning unit. In support of future possible educational development several studies were proposed, to include primary education, educational broadcasting and publications, adult education and an experimental or pilot effort in village crafts training. Expert services were included only for the pre-investment study of broadcasting and publications.

44. The Second Project also included provision for (a) establishing an Institute of Public Administration and Management attached to the University to serve both the public and the private sectors, (buildings, expert services and fellowships); (b) buildings for the Institute of Education and for Instructional Resource Centers in the regions to strengthen the Institute in its task of educational research, advice and outreach especially in teacher training and financing for local experts in curriculum development; (c) establishing a training center for social development workers (buildings, expert services and fellowships), (d) establishing a university planning service (expert services), (e) local salaries and operating expenses for the project unit.

45. The Third Project was aimed at (a) strengthening the administration of primary schools by training supervisory and administrative staff involved specifically in regard to the publishing, distribution, use and evaluation of primary school textbooks, providing buildings, expert services, training workshops and fellowships, (b) continued support for the Project Unit (salaries, equipment and expenses), which remained in the Ministry of Finance and the Planning Unit, which was in some senses weaker than it had been at the start of the Second Project (expert services, equipment and local staff training) and support for the study of low cost primary school designs.

Bank Experience: Incidence of Institutional Development (ID)
Components in Education Projects FY64-84

	Eastern & Southern Africa				Western Africa				Grand Total
	1960s	1970s	1980s	Total	1960s	1970s	1980s	Total	
A. General data									
1. No. of projects approved	9	32	17	58	4	27	11	42	100
2. No. of projects with ID components	1	31	17	49	1	26	11	38	87
3. 2 as % of 3	11	97	100	84	25	96	100	90	87
B. Items addressed in ID components									
1. Project Management	0	23	13	36	1	24	11	36	72
2. Planning:									
(a) Planning	0	21	12	33	1	20	10	31	64
(b) Studies/research	1	14	11	26	1	20	6	27	53
(c) Evaluation	0	12	5	17	0	6	6	14	31
3. Technical Aspects of Management									
(a) School supervision	0	5	2	7	1	3	2	6	13
(b) Curriculum Development	1	15	3	19	1	11	4	16	35
(c) Examinations	0	7	2	9	0	3	2	5	14
(d) Radio/TV	0	8	0	8	0	5	1	6	14
(e) Textbooks/materials	0	14	9	23	0	7	8	15	38
(f) Supply of equipment/materials	0	2	2	4	0	2	2	4	8
4. Management									
(a) Central/district administration	1	13	3	17	0	9	5	14	31
(b) Financial management	0	2	3	5	0	5	8	13	18
(c) Personnel Management	0	1	0	1	0	3	5	8	9
(d) Management Training	0	11	7	18	1	8	5	14	32
(e) Management of Vocational Training	1	9	4	14	1	9	4	14	28
(f) School maintenance	0	1	2	3	0	1	2	3	6
C. Provision Made for ID									
1. Buildings	1	21	9	31	0	9	6	15	46
2. Furniture/equipment	1	20	11	32	1	15	10	26	58
3. Supplies	0	10	8	18	1	4	4	9	27
4. Expert services	0	31	16	47	1	26	11	38	85
5. Fellowships	0	14	8	22	0	16	10	26	48
6. Operating costs	0	15	4	19	1	7	7	15	34
D. Costs of ID									
1. Total Est. Project Cost US\$m	160.3	521.6	494.2	1176.1	43.2	393.4	311.2	747.8	1923.9
2. Total Est. ID Cost in US\$m	0.5	70.0	57.9	128.4	0.4	49.7	67.8	117.9	246.3
3. 2 as % of 3	0.3	13.4	11.7	10.9	0.9	12.6	21.8	15.8	12.8

Source: Staff Appraisal Reports. Calculations of ID cost made by members of the study team.
The figures given within each Region under A B and C denote the number of projects which contained the particular items or provision.

PROVISION FOR INSTITUTIONAL DEVELOPMENT IN EDUCATION PROJECTS IN SUB-SAHARAN AFRICA (By Region)

REGION: EASTERN & SOUTHERN AFRICA (FY)	PURPOSE																	PROVISION						COSTS		
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16	17	18	19	20	21	22	23	24	25	26
Madagascar I 68		X			X		X					X						X	X					7.2	0.5	6.9
Kenya II 70	X	X		X	X		X	X		X										X	X		X	9.3	.6	6.9
Tanzania III 71	X			X	X																X			4.7	.4	8.5
Somalia I 71				X			X														X			3.7	0.4	10.9
Uganda II 71	X																				X			10.4	0.3	12.5
Ethiopia II 71	X	X		X			X					X	X					X	X		X			18.4	1.73	9.4
Zaire I 72		X			X	X			X			X									X			11.8	.5	4.2
Ethiopia III 73	X	X					X	X						X				X	X		X	X	X	12.7	1.8	14.1
Tanzania IV 73		X	X	X							X							X	X		X		X	14.6	1.5	10.3
Zambia III 73	X		X	X	X		X	X	X		X							X	X		X	X		40.1	3	7.5
Ethiopia IV 75	X			X	X		X	X	X		X	X						X	X	X	X	X		34.7	4.7	13.5
Lesotho I 75				X	X			X	X		X							X	X		X	X	X	8.1	1	12.3
Mauritius I 75				X																X	X	X	X	11.6	0.8	7
Rwanda I 75			X	X	X			X		X								X	X	X	X			9	2.6	28.9
Somalia II 75			X	X														X			X			10.1	1	9.9
Sudan II 75	X			X			X	X			X							X	X		X	X		18.9	1.8	9.5
Swaziland I 75	X			X	X		X	X				X						X	X		X			7.1	.9	12.7
Botswana I 76		X	X	X	X						X				X			X			X		X	15.5	2	12.9
Kenya III 76	X		X	X	X		X		X	X								X	X	X	X	X	X	18	4.3	23.9
Malawi II 76	X	X		X								X									X			15	.77	5.1
Tanzania V 76	X	X		X			X				X	X						X	X		X		X	10.95	1.9	17.4
Zaire II 76	X	X	X	X			X														X		X	48.5	3	6.2
Rurundi I 77	X		X	X			X	X						X				X	X	X	X	X		12.5	2.4	19.2
Madagascar II 77	X		X		X		X											X	X	X	X	X	X	19.2	14	72.9

Key to Columns:

- | | |
|--|--|
| 1. Planning | 14. Purchase & Delivery of Equipment & Materials |
| 2. Studies | 15. Financial Management |
| 3. Evaluation | 16. Personnel Management |
| 4. Project Management | 17. Other |
| 5. Central/District Management | 18. Buildings |
| 6. School Supervision | 19. Furniture & Equipment |
| 7. Curriculum Development | 20. Supplies |
| 8. Production of Textbook & Teaching Materials | 21. Experts |
| 9. Radio/T.V. | 22. Fellowships |
| 10. Examinations | 23. Operating Costs/Salaries |

PROVISION FOR INSTITUTIONAL DEVELOPMENT IN EDUCATION PROJECTS IN SUB-SAHARAN AFRICA (By Region)

REGION: EASTERN & SOUTHERN AFRICA (FY)	PURPOSE																	PROVISION					COSTS			
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16	17	18	19	20	21	22	23	24	25	26
Zambia IV 77	X	X	X		X					X	X				X	X		X	X	X	X	X	X	23.1	5.6	24.2
Kenya IV 78	X			X		X	X	X		X	X							X		X	X	X		31	4.4	14.2
Lesotho II 78			X	X			X		X	X		X						X	X		X	X	X	9.3	1.1	11.8
Mauritius II 78	X				X			X	X			X						X	X	X	X	X		25.2	5.8	23
Somalia III 78	X	X		X		X	X	X	X	X	X							X	X	X	X	X		11.7	4.2	35.9
Swaziland II 78		X		X		X															X		X	6.4	.25	3.9
Malawi III 79	X	X				X		X										X	X		X			26.6	4.8	18
Tanzania VI 79	X	X	X								X	X						X	X		X		X	16	5	31.3
Botswana II 80				X	X		X					X				X		X			X	X		15	1.7	11.3
Burundi II 80	X	X		X														X	X		X			18	1.3	7.2
Swaziland III 80		X	X				X	X			X							X	X		X		X	15.9	1.7	10.7
Ethiopia V 81	X			X	X		X	X					X					X	X	X	X			53.7	9.4	17.5
Kenya V 81		X		X		X					X							X	X		X	X		55	3.8	6.9
Lesotho III 81	X	X	X	X				X			X	X						X		X	X			13.1	1.3	9.9
Malawi IV 81	X	X									X										X	X		53.8	1	1.9
Somalia IV 81	X	X						X			X	X						X	X	X				13	1.1	8.5
Tanzania VII 81	X	X	X	X		X		X		X				X				X	X		X	X	X	55.5	7.5	13.5
Botswana III 82	X			X				X							X						X			30	.3	1
Comoros I 82	X			X				X				X								X	X	X		6.5	.9	13.8
Rwanda II 82		X	X	X														X			X	X		11.6	1.7	14.7
Zambia V 82		X											X						X	X				39.2	5	12.8
Burundi III 83	X			X				X										X	X	X	X			19.3	4.6	23.8

- Key to Columns:
- | | |
|--|--|
| 1. Planning | 14. Purchase & Delivery of Equipment & Materials |
| 2. Studies | 15. Financial Management |
| 3. Evaluation | 16. Personnel Management |
| 4. Project Management | 17. Other |
| 5. Central/District Management | 18. Buildings |
| 6. School Supervision | 19. Furniture & Equipment |
| 7. Curriculum Development | 20. Supplies |
| 8. Production of Textbook & Teaching Materials | 21. Experts |
| 9. Radio/T.V. | 22. Fellowships |
| 10. Examinations | 23. Operating Costs/Salaries |
| 11. Management Training | 24. Total Project Cost (USSM) |
| 12. Vocational Training | 25. Total ID Cost (USSM) |
| 13. School Maintenance | 26. ID Costs as % of Project Cost |

PROVISION FOR INSTITUTIONAL DEVELOPMENT IN EDUCATION PROJECTS IN SUB-SAHARAN AFRICA (By Region)

REGION: EASTERN & SOUTHERN AFRICA (FY)	PURPOSE																PROVISION						COSTS				
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16	17	18	19	20	21	22	23	24	25	26	
Malawi V 83	X			X						X							X	X	X	X	X			42	7.5	17.9	
Uganda III 83	X	X		X	X			X						X	X			X	X	X		X		34	6.3	18.5	
Sudan III 84	X	X	X	X						X		X						X		X	X			18.6	2.8	15	
Totals	33	26	17	36	17	7	19	23	8	9	18	14	3	4	5	1	31	32	18	47	22	19			13.9		
PROJECTS WITH NO ID																											
Ethiopia I 66																									9.3	0	0
Kenya I 67																									9.7	0	0
Malawi I 67																									7	0	0
Sudan I 68																									15.4	0	0
Tanzania I 64																									54	0	0
Tanzania II 69																									7.2	0	0
Uganda I 67																									14.3	0	0
Zambia I 69																									36.2	0	0
Zambia II 70																									7.4	0	0
Totals																									1176.1	129.4	0

- | | |
|--------------------------------|-----------------------------------|
| 1. Planning | 14. Purchase & Delivery of |
| 2. Studies | Equipment & Materials |
| 3. Evaluation | 15. Financial Management |
| 4. Project Management | 16. Personnel Management |
| 5. Central/District Management | 17. Other |
| 6. School Supervision | 18. Buildings |
| 7. Curriculum Development | 19. Furniture & Equipment |
| 8. Production of Textbook | 20. Supplies |
| & Teaching Materials | 21. Experts |
| 9. Radio/T.V. | 22. Fellowships |
| 10. Examinations | 23. Operating Costs/Salaries |
| 11. Management Training | 24. Total Project Cost (US\$M) |
| 12. Vocational Training | 25. Total ID Cost (US\$M) |
| 13. School Maintenance | 26. ID Costs as % of Project Cost |

PROVISION FOR INSTITUTIONAL DEVELOPMENT IN EDUCATION PROJECTS IN SUB-SAHARAN AFRICA (By Region)

REGION: WESTERN AFRICA (FY)	PURPOSE																	PROVISION					COSTS			
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16	17	18	19	20	21	22	23	24	25	26
Sierra Leone I 69	X	X		X		X	X				X	X									X			5.6	.4	7
Cameroon I 70	X	X		X			X														X			14	.9	6
Ivory Coast I 70	X	X	X	X		X	X		X			X						X	X	X	X	X	X	19.1	2.5	14
Chad II 71		X																			X			3.1	.1	3
Congo I 71				X			X					X									X			4.1	.7	17
Senegal I 71				X							X											X		2.5	.2	
Cameroon II 72		X		X																	X			11.4	.3	3
CAR I 72	X			X																	X			5.4	.3	6
Liberia I 72	X			X														X		X	X			9.6	1.5	16
Nigeria II 72				X			X														X	X		27.8	.5	2
Mali I 73	X	X	X	X	X		X				X	X			X			X	X	X	X	X		5.5	.92	17
Nigeria III 74		X		X																	X	X		107.4	0.9	6
Mauritania I 74	X	X	X				X	X													X			4.3	1.	23
Senegal II 74	X	X	X	X	X					X				X	X			X		X				21.2	3	14
Upper Volta I 74		X		X	X																X		X	3.6	0.3	8
Benin I 75	X	X	X	UNDP	X													X	X	X	X			5.3	3.3	62
Gabon II 75	X			X				X		X	X							X		X	X			8.8	.2	2
Ivory Coast II 75	X	X		X					X		X				X	X					X			8.7	1.8	21
Sierra Leone II 75	X	X		X			X	X	X		X	X						X	X	X	X	X		11	3.8	35
Cameroon III 76	X	X		X			X	X										X		X	X			24.9	1.1	4
Liberia II 76	X	X	X	X	X		X	X	X	X		X			X	X		X	X	X	X	X	X	5.4	4.2	78
Congo II 77	X	X		X			X							X				X	X	X	X	X		11.4	5.6	49
Liberia III 77	X			X	X	X					X	X						X	X		X	X		9.5	1.4	15

- | | |
|--|--|
| 1. Planning | 14. Purchase & Delivery of Equipment & Materials |
| 2. Studies | 15. Financial Management |
| 3. Evaluation | 16. Personnel Management |
| 4. Project Management | 17. Other |
| 5. Central/District Management | 18. Buildings |
| 6. School Supervision | 19. Furniture & Equipment |
| 7. Curriculum Development | 20. Supplies |
| 8. Production of Textbook & Teaching Materials | 21. Experts |
| 9. Radio/T.V. | 22. Fellowships |
| 10. Examinations | 23. Operating Costs/Salaries |
| 11. Management Training | 24. Total Project Cost (USSM) |
| 12. Vocational Training | 25. Total ID Cost (USSM) |
| 13. School Maintenance | 26. ID Costs as % of Project Cost |

PROVISION FOR INSTITUTIONAL DEVELOPMENT IN EDUCATION PROJECTS IN SUB-SAHARAN AFRICA (By Region)

REGION: WESTERN AFRICA (FY)	PURPOSE																	PROVISION						COSTS			
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16	17	18	19	20	21	22	23	24	25	26	
Mali II 77	X	X	X	X	X		X	X	X		X	X						X	X	X	X	X	X	11.2	3.6	32	
Chad III 78	X	X		X	X		X												X		X			9.2	2.2	24	
Gambia I 78	X	X		X	X						X		X		X	X		X	X		X	X		7	2.7	39	
Guinea I 79	X	X	X	X															X		X	X	X	8.9	2.1	24	
Senegal III 79	X	X		X							X	X						X	X		X	X		33.1	4.7	14	
Ivory Coast III 80	X	X	X	X				X			X				X				X		X			84.9	5.1	6	
Liberia IV 80	X	X		X	X	X		X		X	X	X			X	X		X	X		X	X		25.1	9	36	
Togo I 80	X	X		X			X	X											X		X	X	X	20	3.9	20	
Upper Volta II 80		X	X	X				X	X						X	X		X	X		X	X	X	25.1	9.6	38	
Niger I 81	X			X							X	X							X		X	X	X	27	2	7	
Benin II 82	X		X	X				X					X		X					X	X	X	X	30.4	8.5	28	
Mauritania II 82	X			X	X						X				X	X			X		X	X	X	15.3	2.4	16	
CAR II 83	X	X	X	X	X		X	X		X			X	X	X	X		X	X	X	X	X	X	12.2	5.1	42	
Guinea II 83	X			X	X	X	X	X				X		X	X			X	X	X	X	X		30.2	11	36	
Sierra Leone III 83	X		X	X				X										X	X		X	X		23.7	5	11	
Mali III 84	X	X	X	X	X		X				X	X			X	X		X	X	X	X	X	X	17.3	6.1	35	
	31	27	14	36	14	6	16	15	6	5	14	14	3	4	13	8		15	26	9	38	26	15	117.7	124.9	17.6	
PROJECTS WITH NO INSTITUTIONAL DEVELOPMENT																											
Chad I 69																									4	0	0
Gabon I 68																									3.6	0	0
Nigeria I 65																									30	0	0

- Key to Columns:
- | | |
|--|--|
| 1. Planning | 14. Purchase & Delivery of Equipment & Materials |
| 2. Studies | 15. Financial Management |
| 3. Evaluation | 16. Personnel Management |
| 4. Project Management | 17. Other |
| 5. Central/District Management | 18. Buildings |
| 6. School Supervision | 19. Furniture & Equipment |
| 7. Curriculum Development | 20. Supplies |
| 8. Production of Textbook & Teaching Materials | 21. Experts |
| 9. Radio/T.V. | 22. Fellowships |
| 10. Examinations | 23. Operating Costs/Salaries |
| 11. Management Training | 24. Total Project Cost (USSM) |
| 12. Vocational Training | 25. Total ID Cost (USSM) |
| 13. School Maintenance | 26. ID Costs as % of Project Cost |

Bank Assistance Included in Projects for
Higher Education in Sub-Saharan Africa

1. The Bank itself has done relatively little in Africa to strengthen university departments of economics, despite its large role in stimulating, through its operations, closer attention to economics in national decision making. In the education sector studies conducted in Sub-Saharan African countries, the references to universities are usually sketchy and concentrated on quantitative data, effectively avoiding such issues as the quality of graduates in economics and the social sciences and the operational problems of relevant faculties.

2. In Sub-Saharan Africa, some 28 of the 100 Bank-assisted education projects in the two Regions FY64-84 have included assistance toward developing higher education institutions.

Table 1. Distribution of Projects in Sub-Saharan Africa
with Higher Education Components

	<u>Total No. of Projects</u>			<u>Total No. of Projects with Higher Education Components</u>		
	E/S Africa	W.Africa	Total	E/S Africa	W.Africa	Total
FY64-69	9	3	12	-	-	-
FY70-74	10	14	24	6	6	12
FY75-79	22	14	36	3	5	8
FY80-84	17	11	28	6	2	8
Total	58	42	100	15	13	28

3. These totals and proportions compare quite unfavorably with the Asia Regions:

Table 2. Distribution of Projects in Asia Region
with Higher Education Components

	<u>Total No. of Projects</u>			<u>Total No. of Projects with Higher Education Components</u>		
	E.Asia	S.Asia	Total	E. Asia	S.Asia	Total
FY64-69	4	3	7	2	3	5
FY70-74	12	3	15	9	3	12
FY75-79	15	5	20	6	3	9
FY80-84	21	9	30	12	2	14
Total	52	20	72	29	11	40

4. The disciplines in which the assistance to Sub-Saharan Africa has been directed were as follows:

Table 3. Distribution of Disciplines Covered by University Components in Sub-Saharan Africa

	<u>Eastern/Southern Africa</u>	<u>Western Africa</u>	<u>Total</u>
Education & Teacher Training	6	8	14
Agriculture	6	4	10
General University			
Rehabilitation	1	0	1
Engineering/Technology	1	1	2
Health/Medical	1	1	2
Science	1	1	2
Public Administration/ Management	-	3	3
Social Sciences	1	-	1
	<u>17</u>	<u>18</u>	<u>35</u>

5. The emphasis has been on education and agriculture.