

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 10085

Title: Extensive calcifications in portal venous system in one Banti's syndrome patient with hepatocarcinoma

Reviewer code: 01221188

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-03-12 09:59

Date reviewed: 2014-03-13 11:48

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This report is very interesting. However, minor revisions are required. Minor revisions 1 HbsAg should be changed to HBsAg. 2.What is "antigen of second liver surface" ? 3. Were these calcifications detected when partial hepatectomy was performed ?

ESPS Peer-review Report**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 10085**Title:** Extensive calcifications in portal venous system in one Banti's syndrome patient with hepatocarcinoma**Reviewer code:** 00926880**Science editor:** Yuan Qi**Date sent for review:** 2014-03-12 09:59**Date reviewed:** 2014-03-13 19:41

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a case report on a patient with extensive calcification in the portal vein, Banti's syndrome and 'hepatocarcinoma'. My comments are: (1) All abbreviations should be defined on first use, e.g. CT, HbsAg, AFP; (2) I am not sure when the authors used the word 'hepatocarcinoma', whether they are referring to 'hepatocellular carcinoma'; (3) I do not understand the phrase "...antigen of second liver surface"; (4) There are a lot of typographical and grammatical mistakes, e.g. 'tenderness'. The English needs to be improved; (5) I am not sure whether the authors follow the format requested by the Journal by using one author followed by et al.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 10085

Title: Extensive calcifications in portal venous system in one Banti's syndrome patient with hepatocarcinoma

Reviewer code: 00502973

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-03-12 09:59

Date reviewed: 2014-03-16 21:30

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript reported a case with calcification of portal system and preexisted Banti's syndrome. Some concerns were present and need to be addressed. Major concerns: 1. Banti's syndrome is also called idiopathic portal hypertension (IPH), is a disorder characterized by non-cirrhotic portal hypertension, pancytopenia and splenomegaly. However, this patient is obviously a case with HBV-related cirrhosis, and therefore cannot be diagnosed as Banti's syndrome. 2. I wonder why the ultrasonography of this patient cannot find the calcification of the portal vein, and "revealed a normal portal vein". What the "anechoic mass of 1.4 cm in diameter" means? Is it the thrombosis of the portal vein or a metastatic lesion? 3. When was this patient admitted? 4. What is "antigen of second liver surface"? I cannot understand it. Please explain. 5. I wonder if this patient received any procedures before he underwent the CT scanning, e. g. transcatheter arterial chemoembolization for his HCC, or endoscopic gastroesophageal variceal obturation or endoscopic gastroesophageal variceal sclerotherapy for his gastroesophageal varices. 6. English needs to be polished. For example, "these dense lines will often be discontinuous...", "Like any conduit, diffuse wall calcification appears as...", and "the our hospital" are not used in English expression. Some minor concerns: 1. HbsAg is usually present as HBsAg. 2. "tenderness" is a typo. 3. "...and an anechoic mass 1.4 cm in diameter." should be "...and an anechoic mass of 1.4 cm in diameter." 4. "...by Moberg al.in 1943, ..." As Moberg was the only author of this report, it should be "...by Moberg in 1943, ..." 5. "Verma al. found..." should be "Verma et al. found..." 6. "...were found on CT imagines" should be "...were found on CT images" 7. "...and abnormal tumor staining(B) were demonstrated clearly" I wonder if



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: editorialoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

it has a NORMAL tumor staining?

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 10085

Title: Extensive calcifications in portal venous system in one Banti's syndrome patient with hepatocarcinoma

Reviewer code: 00537002

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-03-12 09:59

Date reviewed: 2014-03-25 16:24

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors described about extensive calcification in portal venous system in one Banti's syndrome patients with hepatocellular carcinoma. The authors well reviewed the cases reported in the past. Because this paper is unique, interesting and well written, it is suitable for publication in WJG.