# Investigation of Douglas-fir provenance test in North-Western Bulgaria at the age of 24 years 

K. Petkova ${ }^{1}$, M. Georgieva ${ }^{2}$, M. Uzunov ${ }^{\mathbf{1}}$<br>${ }^{1}$ Department of Silviculture, Faculty of Forestry, University of Forestry, Sofia, Bulgaria<br>${ }^{2}$ Department of Forest Entomology, Phytopathology and Game Fauna, Forest Research Institute, Sofia, Bulgaria


#### Abstract

A comparative analysis of growth rate and health condition of 54 Douglas-fir (Pseudotsuga menziesii [Mirb.] Franco) provenances was conducted at the age of 24 years. The provenance test was established in 1990 with 3 -year-old ( $3+0$ ) seedlings planted in a $2 \times 2 \mathrm{~m}$ plot design and two replications. The provenances which were studied originated from North America and were separated into coastal, continental and Western Cascade groups. In 2011 the growth rate was studied in terms of height, diameter at breast height and stem volume. The health condition was assessed by the evidence of symptoms and degree of defoliation caused by the fungi Phaeocryptopus gaeumannii (Rohde) Petrak and Rhabdocline pseudotsugae (Syd.). The provenances Newhalem, Darrington, Idanha and Bremerton were characterized by the most rapid growth, highest productivity and lower susceptibility to both fungal pathogens. These Douglas-fir provenances were recommended for future afforestation in Bulgaria. Ten continental provenances should be excluded from future afforestation because of their lowest growth rate and productivity and high susceptibility to P. gaeumannii and R. pseudotsugae.


Keywords: adaptation; Phaeocryptopus gaeumannii; provenances; Pseudotsuga menziesii; Rhabdocline pseudotsugae; tree growth

Douglas-fir (Pseudotsuga menziesii [Mirb.] Franco) has been cultivated as a valuable coniferous tree species in Europe since 1827. The ecological and economic relevance of the species has been long paid attention all over the world due to its rapid growth and high productivity (Göhre 1958; Fenton 1967; Aussenac 1980; Binkley 1983; Oswald 1984; Hermann, Lavender 1999; Dunbar et al. 2002). In recent years the interest in Douglas-fir has been related to the established theories of climate changes and the possibilities of the species to adapt itself to predicted changes (St. Clair, Howe 2007; Martin 2011; Eilmann, Rigling 2012; Leites et al. 2012; Eilmann et al. 2013; Bastien et al. 2013). The main focus of species investigations was placed on the choice of an appropriate provenance for the specific country sites. As observed in many regions of Central and Southeast Europe during recent decades, the provenances from the western sites of the Cascade Mountains and from coastal seed zones in the states of Washington
and Oregon have been recommended (Lavadinović et al. 2008; Weller 2010; Eilmann et al. 2013).
The introduction of Douglas-fir into Bulgaria began more than a century ago but it became widespread in the late 1950s and during the 1960s. The current area of the species plantations totals about 7,372 ha. The purposeful provenance studies on Douglas-fir initiated in 1987 are based on seed collections from 55 USA provenances. In 1990, 3-year-old seedlings of these provenances were established in plantations in three regions in Bulgaria (Popov 1995, 2001; Petkova 1999). The results from earlier studies emphasized that the coastal provenances and the provenances from the Western Cascade Mountains (Washington and Oregon) had the best growth rate (Popov 1995, 2001; Petkova 1999). At the age of 17 years, damage by needle cast diseases, caused by the ascomycete fungi Phaeocryptopus gaeumannii (Rohde) Petrak and Rhabdocline pseudotsugae (Syd.), was determined in established provenance tests

[^0](Georgieva 2009). Distinct differences between provenances comparing the degree of their susceptibility to both fungal pathogens were observed (GEORgieva, Rossnev 2008; Georgieva 2009).

As it is important to consider sustainable plantation forest production, the objective of the present study was to analyse the growth rate and health condition of 54 Douglas-fir provenances at the age of 24 years in the test which is already established in the north-western part of Bulgaria.

## MATERIAL AND METHODS

The Douglas-fir provenance test is located on the lower northern slopes of the Western Balkan Mountains (Northwest Bulgaria) in the Training Forest Enterprise in Petrohan. The trial was established in a flat terrain facing the east, at an altitude of 600 m , latitude of $43^{\circ} 14^{\prime} \mathrm{N}$ and longitude of $23^{\circ} 09^{\prime} \mathrm{E}$. The soil is Orthic luvisol (FAO), mixed sandy and clay, slightly stony and very deep. The site is medium rich to rich. The climate in the region is temperate with an average annual temperature of $10.2^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ and annual precipitation of $1,004 \mathrm{~mm}$. The duration of the vegetation period is about 6 to 6.5 months.


Fig. 1. Map of the geographic distribution of tested provenances in North America (Georgieva 2009)

The provenance test was established in the spring of 1990 with 3 -year-old seedlings $(3+0)$, which were planted in a $2 \times 2 \mathrm{~m}$ plot design in two replications. Forty to forty-eight seedlings were planted on each plot. The 54 studied provenances originate from natural stands of Douglas-fir in North America (Table 1; Fig. 1) and were classified into three groups: continental (26), Western Cascade Mountain (22) and coastal (6) provenances.
In 2011, at the age of 24 years, the following indices were determined in all provenances: average diameter at breast height (DBH), average height and stem volume. Height and DBH were measured only in the first replication because a lot of individuals in the second replication had been lost due to unfavourable environmental conditions, namely excessive moisture and swamping. The average DBH for each provenance was determined after measuring the diameters of all trees on the plot in the following way. For each tree the mean diameter was obtained as the arithmetic mean of the measured two mutually perpendicular diameters to the nearest 0.1 cm . The obtained values were grouped in diameter classes by 2 cm . The average diameter for each provenance was calculated according to Eq. 1 :
$D=\sqrt{\frac{4 G}{\pi N}}(\mathrm{~cm})$
where:
$G$ - total basal area of the trees in the provenance ( $G=$ $\left.\sum n_{\mathrm{i}} \times g_{\mathrm{i}}\left[\mathrm{m}^{2}\right]\right)$,
$n_{i}$ - number of trees in the respective diameter class (by 2 cm ),
$g_{i}$ - basal area in the respective diameter class $\left(\mathrm{m}^{2}\right)$,
$N$ - number of trees in the provenance.
The average height (H) of each provenance was calculated as the arithmetic mean of the heights of $15-25$ individual trees, distributed into diameter classes (by 2 cm ).
The stem volume was calculated according to Eq. 2:
$V=G \times H F\left(\mathrm{~m}^{3}\right)$
where:
G - total basal area of trees in the provenance $\left(\mathrm{m}^{2}\right)$,
HF - height form factor for Abies alba Mill. (Poryazov et al. 2004).
The statistical program SPSS 11 (IBM, New York, USA) was used for analysing the variable heights and DBH's. Statistical parameters (arithmetic mean, standard deviation and standard error) were assessed for the analyed height and DBH per provenance. The differences between provenances were tested by analysis of variance (ANOVA). In cases

Table 1. Geographical distribution of Douglas-fir provenances

| Provenance group | Provenance number | Seed zone | Provenance name | Geographical coordinates |  | Altitude (m) | Number of trees |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  | (N) | (W) |  |  |
| Continental |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Montana | 3. | Montana | Whitefish | 48.5 | 114.5 | 1,050 | 36 |
| New Mexico | 55. | 840 | Alamogordo | 33.0 | 105.8 | 750 | 14 |
|  | 1. | 612 | Greenwood | 49.0 | 119.0 | 1,350 | 37 |
| Washington | 2. | 600 | Keremeos | 49.0 | 120.0 | 750 | 33 |
|  | 13. | 641 | Naches | 46.5 | 121.3 | 1,050 | 28 |
| East Cascade Mountains | 14. | 661 | Parkdale | 45.5 | 121.5 | 1,650 | 26 |
|  | 15. | 661 | Parkdale | 45.5 | 121.7 | 1,500 | 29 |
|  | 16. | 661 | Parkdale | 45.5 | 121.5 | 1,350 | 26 |
|  | 17. | 661 | Parkdale | 45.5 | 121.5 | 1,200 | 28 |
|  | 18. | 661 | Parkdale | 45.5 | 121.5 | 1,050 | 30 |
|  | 19. | 661 | Parkdale | 45.5 | 121.5 | 900 | 30 |
| Oregon | 20. | 661 | Parkdale | 45.5 | 121.5 | 750 | 28 |
|  | 33. | 662 | Warm Springs | 45.0 | 121.5 | 667 | 34 |
|  | 32. | 662 | Warm Springs | 45.0 | 122.0 | 900 | 28 |
|  | 38. | 675 | Santiam Pass | 44.3 | 121.6 | 1,125 | 32 |
|  | 47. | 681 | Crescent | 43.3 | 121.8 | 1,650 | 28 |
|  | 48. | 681 | Crescent | $43.3$ | $122.0$ | $1,500$ | $30$ |
|  | 21. | 863 | Bates | 45.0 | 118.5 | 1,667 | 18 |
|  | 22. | 863 | Bates | 45.0 | 118.5 | 1,500 | 30 |
| East Oregon | 23. | 863 | Bates | 45.0 | 118.5 | 1,333 | 23 |
|  | 35. | 892 | Canyon City | 44.5 | 119.0 | 1,500 | 29 |
|  | 36. | 892 | Canyon City | 44.5 | 119.0 | 1,350 | 27 |
|  | 37. | 892 | Canyon City | 44.5 | 119.0 | 1,650 | 14 |
| Coastal Mountains | 49. | 501 | Crater Lake | 42.7 | 122.5 | 1,200 | 29 |
| South Oregon | $50 .$ | $\begin{aligned} & 501 \\ & 502 \end{aligned}$ | Medford <br> Medford | $\begin{aligned} & 42.5 \\ & 42.6 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 122.5 \\ & 122.8 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1,050 \\ & 900 \end{aligned}$ | 25 |
| Western Cascade Mountains |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Washington | 4. | 402 | Newhalem | 48.5 | 121,5 | 667 | 22 |
|  | 5. | 402 | Newhalem | 48.5 | 121.5 | 500 | 29 |
|  | 6. | 403 | Darrington | 48.0 | 121.5 | 1,167 | 27 |
|  | 7. | 403 | Darrington | 48.0 | 121.5 | 1,000 | 26 |
|  | 8. | 403 | Darrington | 48.0 | 121.5 | 833 | 23 |
|  | 9. | 411 | Monroe | 47.8 | 121.3 | 525 | 30 |
| Oregon | 24. | 452 | Idanha | 45.0 | 122.0 | 1,050 | 29 |
|  | 25. | 452 | Idanha | 45.0 | 122.0 | 1,200 | 33 |
|  | 26. | 452 | Idanha | 45.0 | 122.0 | 1,050 | 31 |
|  | 27. | 452 | Idanha | 45.0 | 122.0 | 900 | 29 |
|  | 28. | 452 | Idanha | 45.0 | 122.0 | 1,333 | 27 |
|  | 29. | 452 | Idanha | 45.0 | 122.0 | 750 | 32 |
|  | 30. | 452 | Idanha | 45.0 | 122.0 | 750 | 32 |
|  | 31. | 452 | Idanha | 45.0 | 122.0 | 750 | 29 |
|  | 40. | 472 | Oakridge | 44.0 | 122.0 | 1,667 | 24 |
|  | 41. | 472 | Oakridge | 44.0 | 122.0 | 1,500 | 26 |
|  | 46. | 472 | Oakridge | 43.8 | 122.5 | 1,500 | 29 |
|  | 39. | 473 | Santiam Pass | 44.3 | 121.8 | 1,500 | 28 |
|  | 42. | 473 | Oakridge | 44.0 | 122.0 | 1,333 | 28 |
|  | 43. | 482 | Oakridge | 44.0 | 122.0 | 900 | 30 |
|  | 44. | 482 | Oakridge | 43.8 | 122.5 | 1,350 | 31 |
|  | 45. | 482 | Oakridge | 43.8 | 122.5 | 1,200 | 25 |
| Coastal |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Washington | 12. | 12 | Moclips | 47.5 | 124.0 | 600 | 27 |
|  | 10. | 222 | Bremerton | 47.7 | 123.0 | 600 | 30 |
|  | 11. | 222 | Bremerton | 47.7 | 123.5 | 450 | 29 |
| Oregon | 34. | 53 | Toledo | 44.6 | 123.8 | 150 | 32 |
|  | 52. | 82 | Brookings | 42.0 | 124.5 | 833 | 20 |
|  | 53. | 82 | Brookings | 42.0 | 124.5 | 667 | 20 |

Table 2. Defoliation classes

| Damage class | Needle loss (\%) | Degree of defoliation |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| 0 | $0-10$ | no needle defoliation |
| 1 | $>10-25$ | slight defoliation |
| 2 | $>25-60$ | moderate defoliation |
| 3 | $>60-100$ | severe defoliation |
| 4 | 100 | completely defoliated |

where there was a significant statistical difference between provenances, the provenances which differed between themselves were determined by using the post hoc LSD test.
In the provenance test, the health condition of 25 randomly selected trees in each provenance was surveyed just prior to bud break, to evaluate the occurrence of symptoms of needle cast diseases. The occurrence of needle cast disease was revealed by the presence of reproductive fungal structures, defoliation and discoloration of needles in the crowns of infected trees. The extent of visually assessed defoliation of trees, as developed by the International Co-operative Programme (ICP Forests) of the Executive Committee for the Convention on Long-range Transboundary Air Pollution in Europe was used (Eichhorn et al. 2010). Five defoliation classes were defined (Table 2). Defoliation of more than $25 \%$ was taken as a threshold for categorizing a tree as damaged.

The average defoliation of each provenance was expressed as the arithmetic mean of the values of defoliation of all 25 trees in percentage per provenance level. According to scored average defoliation each provenance was defined as: slightly susceptible (with no or slight defoliation); moderately susceptible (with moderate defoliation) and heavily susceptible (with severe defoliation or completely defoliated) (Снимакоv 1974).

## RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The overall mean height at the age of 24 years was 14.0 m . The highest was provenance 6 (Darrington) of the Western Cascade Mountains with average height 20.0 m . Provenances 4 and $5(\mathrm{Ne}-$ whalem), 7 (Darrington), 9 (Monroe), 27, 28 and 29 (Idanha) from the Western Cascade Mountains and coastal provenance 11 (Bremerton) were defined as rapidly growing too with an average height of $17-18 \mathrm{~m}$ (Fig. 2a). The value for the height growth of these provenances exceeds the value for the first site index ( 15.5 m at the age of

25 years) according to tables of Bergel (1985). These provenances were characterized as most rapidly growing in height in the same provenance test at 20 years of age (Petkova 2011). The provenances Newhalem, Darrington and Idanha were defined as the most rapidly growing in height for the test in the south-western part of Bulgaria (Popov 2011). The provenance Darrington was described as stable in a wide range of site conditions and was recommended as a seed source for the conditions of Austria (Bastien et al. 2013). Ten continental provenances 1 (Greenwood) and 2 (Keremeos) of Washington, 3 (Whitefish) of Montana, 21, 22, 23 (Bates), 35, 36, 37 (Canyon City) of Eastern Oregon and 55 Alamogordo of New Mexico were registered with the slowest growth in height (Fig. 2a).
The average DBH of the provenance test at the age of 24 years was 16.0 cm . The largest average diameter was measured in provenance 4 (Newhalem) of the Western Cascades - 20.2 cm (Fig.2b). Provenances 15, 16 and 17 (Parkdale), 38 (Santiam Pass), 47 (Crescent) of East Cascade, 50 and 51 (Medford) South Oregon, 5 (Newhalem), 6 and 7 (Darrington), 30 (Idanha) of Western Cascade and coastal provenances 52 and 53 (Brookings) were also characterized by very good growth in diameter (average diameter of about 18 cm and over). Continental provenances 1 (Greenwood) and 2 (Keremeos) of Washington, 3 (Whitefish) of Montana, 21, 22, 23 (Bates), 35, 36, 37 (Canyon City) of Eastern Oregon and 55 Alomogordo of New Mexico were recorded with very low growth in diameter.

By applying the post hoc LSD test a high statistical significance by factor provenance ( $P<0.001$ ) regarding both height and diameter was established (Table 3).

For the entire provenance test, the average value of stem volume was $237 \mathrm{~m}^{3} \cdot \mathrm{ha}^{-1}$. The highest stem volume was calculated for provenances 5 (Newhalem) - $385 \mathrm{~m}^{3} \cdot \mathrm{ha}^{-1}$ and 6 (Darrington) - $376 \mathrm{~m}^{3} \cdot \mathrm{ha}^{-1}$ of the Western Cascade. Provenances 15, 17 and 18 (Parkdale) and 47 (Crescent) from East Cascade,

Table 3. Results of ANOVA analyses

| Source of variation df Mean <br> squares $F$ <br> ANOVA for the height    <br> Provenance 51 79.256 35.753 | 0.000 |  |  |  |
| :--- | ---: | ---: | ---: | :---: |
| ANOVA for the diameter |  |  |  |  |
| Provenance | 51 | 243.471 | 14.016 | 0.000 |



Fig. 2. Average height (a), diameter at breast height (b) of 24-year-old Douglas-fir provenances planted in 1990 in NW Bulgaria

4 (Newhalem), 7 and 9 (Darrington), 27, 29 and 30 (Idanha) and 43 (Oakridge) from Western Cascade and the coastal 10 and 11 (Bremerton) deserve particular attention. Their stem volume exceeded $300 \mathrm{~m}^{3} \cdot \mathrm{ha}^{-1}$, which confirms the great potential and perspective of these Douglas-fir provenances.

According to Popov (2013) provenances 4 (Newhalem), 7 (Darrington) and 29 (Idanha) were the most productive in the other provenance test established in south-west Bulgaria.

Studies of Weller (2012) for Douglas-fir provenance test at the age of 38 years in northwestern Germany demonstrated that provenances Darrington differed in improved establishment and outstanding productivity. The slowest growing
continental provenances in height and diameter had the lowest productivity.
In 2011 symptoms and damage of Swiss needle cast caused by the ascomycete fungi P. gaeumannii were detected on all Douglas-fir trees across all provenances. Damage caused by R. pseudotsugae was recorded only on trees which originated from continental areas. The first observation of these pathogens in the same provenance test was made at the age of 17 years in 2004 (Fig. 3a). The 44 provenances from the coastal area and from the Cascade Mountains were characterized by no or slight defoliation and ten provenances from the continental area were assessed as highly susceptible both to P. gaeumannii and to R. pseudotsugae (Georgieva 2009). The infection rates significantly


Fig. 3. Distribution of average present defoliation defined in 2004 (a), 2011 (b) in 54 provenances
increased with years, and in 2011, the proportion of Douglas-fir trees infected by P. gaeumannii reached $100 \%$ in all 54 provenances (Fig. 3b). All assessed trees were defined as susceptible to the pathogen because of the presence of numerous fruit structures (pseudothecia) detected on needles resulting in yellowing discoloration and an increasing percentage with crown defoliation. During the recent decades, outbreaks of Swiss needle cast have occurred in both native and plantation grown P. menziesii in the Pacific Northwest (Hansen et al. 2000; Manter et al. 2005) and forest plantations in Europe, Turkey (Temel et al. 2003), Australia (Marks et al. 1989) and New Zealand (Hood et al. 1990; Watt et al. 2010). According to Hood et al. (1990) no provenance is immune to the disease but the provenances from the coastal zones are slower to become infected than provenances from continental sites.
A high variability was observed between provenances from the continental area concerning their
height growth (Fig. 2a) and susceptibility to needle cast diseases (Fig. 3b). The seriousness of the needle cast disease complex was emphasized in the ten provenances from continental areas: 1 (Greenwood) and 2 (Keremeos), 3 (Whitefish), 21, 22, and 23 (Bates), 35,36 , and 37 (Canyon City) and 55 Alomogordo. These were characterized by symptoms of increasing defoliation, decreasing vitality after infection, the slowest growth and the lowest productivity (Figs 2 and 3b).
It was observed that the density of pseudothecia increased with needle age, and increasing proportions of stomata occupied by pseudothecia were associated with increasing amounts of defoliation. Severely defoliated trees from the ten continental provenances retained only 1 -year-old needles. The worst health condition of these trees was a consequence of heavy susceptibility to both fungal pathogens - P. gaeumannii and R. pseudotsugae. A major effect of the disease was a reduction of
needle area in moderately susceptible trees and the death of heavily susceptible trees. Similar results of slow growth and heavy susceptibility to needle cast disease were obtained on trees from the same ten provenances as in the other established provenance tests in Bulgaria (Popov 2001; Georgieva 2009; Popov 2012).

The trees of the remaining 16 continental provenances were assessed as being with slight to moderate defoliation, the average percentage of defoliation varying between $20 \%$ and $40 \%$ (Fig. 3b). The 4 -year-old needles on these trees were retained on branches and had very low levels of pseudothecia on the 1-year-old needles.
The provenances from the Western Cascades Mountains and from the coastal area were defined with slight (20\%) to moderate (50\%) defoliation but no significant differences in the average percent of defoliation were ascertained among them. In 2011 an increase in the degree of defoliation was determined in these provenances as compared to the assessment made in 2004 (Fig. 3a). In 2004 all coastal provenances and 17 provenances from the West Cascade Mountains were not defoliated by P. gaeumannii. The trees from the remaining West Cascade Mountain provenances were up to $10 \%$ defoliated (Fig. 3a).

The distribution of damage classes over all trees is shown in Table 4. Nearly one third (31\%) of the trees from continental provenances were dead and $7.7 \%$ were characterized by a degree of defoliation higher than $60 \%$.

The provenances from the Western Cascade Mountains and the coastal area were defined as slightly to moderately susceptible. However, the proportion of damaged trees (degree of defoliation higher than $25 \%$ ) was significant $-90.9 \%$ in Western Cascade Mountains and $66.7 \%$ in coastal provenances (Table 4). According to Hood et al. (1990), Kleinschmit and Svolba (1997), Liesebach (2010), BAStien et al. (2013) the provenances from the Western Cascades Mountains and coastal area were slower to become infected than provenances from continental sites.

Table 4. Frequency of Swiss needle cast damage classes for three provenance groups

| Provenance | Total no. | Damage classes |  |  |  |  |  |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| area | of trees | 0 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 |  |
| Continental | 650 | - | 15.4 | 46.1 | 7.7 | 30.8 |  |
| Western | 550 | - | 2.1 | 90.9 | - | - |  |
| Cascade Mts. |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Coastal | 150 | - | 33.3 | 66.7 | - | - |  |

In 2004 the Douglas-fir trees from all 54 provenances were examined during the period of bud burst and elongation of new needles and shoots (Georgieva 2009). It was found that there are differences between the provenances in terms of their bud-burst phenology. The provenances from the continental area began to burst during the last week of April. With the other origins (from the Cascade Mountains and the coastal areas) bud burst and elongation of new needles began in the middle of May. According to Boyce (1961) the lower susceptibility of the provenances from the Cascade Mountains and coastal areas to needle cast diseases was due to the later development of buds and the formation of new shoots - after the massive dissemination of ascospores of the fungus.
The evidence for growth stress as a primary cause of the decline showed that in many unthinned stands this led to conditions which certainly allowed the fungal pathogen P. gaeumannii to have an increased effect. In order to limit the further dissemination of the disease in 2008 the provenance test was thinned and dead and high affected trees were removed. The purpose of adopting this type of regime was to improve airflow thus preventing the conditions on which the fungus thrives and so making the trees less susceptible to fungal diseases.

## CONCLUSIONS

The provenances Newhalem, Darrington, Idanha from the western Cascade Mountains and coastal provenance Bremerton were characterized by the most rapid growth and highest productivity in Douglas-fir provenance test in NW Bulgaria at the age of 24 years. They were less susceptible to the Swiss needle cast disease caused by P. gaeumannii and Rhabdocline needle cast caused by R. pseudotsugae. From our perspective these provenances can be recommended for the future afforestation with Douglas-fir in Bulgaria due to expectation of their rapid growth, high productivity and lower susceptibility to fungal diseases.

The slowest growth and the lowest productivity were ascertained in the continental provenances Greenwood and Keremeos of Washington, Whitefish of Montana, Bates and Canyon City of eastern Oregon and Alamogordo of New Mexico, which were defined as the highest susceptible to P. gaeumannii and R. pseudotsugae. These provenances should be excluded from future afforestation with Douglas-fir in Bulgaria.

## References

Aussenac G. (1980): Premiers résultats d'une étude de l'influence de l'alimentation en eau sur la croissance des arbres dans un peuplement de douglas (Pseudotsuga menziesii (Mirb.) Franco). Revue forestière française, XXXII, 2: 167-172.
Bastien J.C., Sanchez L., Michaud D. (2013): Douglas-Fir (Pseudotsuga menziesii (Mirb.) Franco). In: PÂques L.E. (ed.): Forest Tree Breeding in Europe, Current State-of-the-Art and Perspectives. Managing Forest Ecosystems, 25: 325-369.
Bergel D. (1985): Douglasien-Ertragstafel für Nordwestdeutschland. Allgemeine Forst- und Jagdzeitung, 157:49-59.
Binkley D. (1983): Ecosystem production in Douglas-fir plantations: Interaction of red alder and site fertility. Forest Ecology and Management, 5: 215-227.
Boyce J.S. (1961): Forest Pathology. New York, McGraw Hill Book Co: 572.
Chumakov A.E. (1974): General Methods in Plant Pathology. Moscow, Kolos: 189. (in Russian)
Dunbar A., Dhubhain A., Bulfin M. (2002): The productivity of Douglas fir in Ireland. Forestry, 75: 537-545.
Eichhorn J., Roskams, P., Ferretti, M., Mues, V., Szepesi, A., Durrant D. (2010): Visual assessment of crown condition and damaging agents. In: Manual on methods and criteria for harmonized sampling, assessment, monitoring and analysis of the effects of air pollution on forests. Available at http://www.icp-forests.org/Manual.htm
Eilmann B., de Vries S., den Ouden J., Mohren G., Sauren P., Sass-Klaassen U. (2013): Difference in drought tolerance and productivity of coastal Douglas-fir (Pseudotsuga menziesii (Mirb.)) provenances. Forest Ecology and Management, 302: 133-143.
Eilmann B., Rigling A. (2012): Tree-growth analyses to estimate tree species' drought tolerance. Tree Physiology, 32: 178-187.
Fenton R. (1967): The Role of Douglas fir in Australasian Forestry. New Zealand Journal of Forestry, 12: 4-41.
Georgieva M. (2009): Diseases on Douglas-fir (Pseudotsuga menziesii (Mirb.) Franco) and their influence on the species introduction in Bulgaria. [Ph.D. Thesis.] Sofia, Forest Research Institute - BAS: 134. (in Bulgarian)
Georgieva M., Rosnev B. (2008): Resistance of Douglas-fir (Pseudotsuga menziesii (Mirb.) Franco) to Swiss needle cast. Nauka za gorata, 4: 41-50. (in Bulgarian with English abstract)
Göhre K. (1958): Die Douglasie und ihr Holz. Berlin, Akademie-Verlag: 596.
Hansen E.M., Stone J.K., Capitano B.R., Rosso P., Sutton W., Winton L. (2000): Incidence and impact of Swiss needle cast in forest plantations of Douglas-fir in coastal Oregon. Plant Disease, 84: 773-778.
Hermann R., Lavender D. (1999): Douglas-fir planted forests. New Forests, 17: 53-70.

Hood I.A., Sandberg C.J., Barr C.W., Holloway W.A., Bradbury P.M. (1990): Changes in Needle Retention Associated with the Spread and Establishment of Phaeocryptopus gaeumannii in Planted Douglas fir. European Journal of Forest Pathology, 20: 418-429.
Kleinschmit J., Svolba J. (1997): Ergebnisse von Doug-lasien-Provenienzversuchen unter besonderer Berücksichtigung von Douglasienschäden. Mitteilungen aus der Forstlichen Versuchsanstalt Rheinland-Pfalz, 41: 128-144. Lavadinović V., Isajev V., Rakonjac L., Marković N. (2008): Effect of altitude and continentality of douglas fir provenances on height increment in test plantations in Serbia. Lesnícky časopis - Forestry Journal, 54 (Supplement 1): 53-59.
Leites L., Robinson A., Rehfeldt G., Marshall J., Crookston N. (2012): Height-growth response to climatic changes differs among populations of Douglas-fir: a novel analysis of historic data. Ecological Applications, 22: 154-165.
Liesebach M. (2010): Growth performance and reaction to biotic factors of Douglas-fir provenances in northwest Germany. In: Opportunities and Risks for Douglas Fir in a Changing Climate. Freiburg, 18.-20. October 2010. Albert-Ludwigs-Universität Freiburg: 65.
Manter D.K., Reeser P.W., Stone J.K. (2005): A climatebased model for predicting geographic variation in Swiss needle cast severity in the Oregon Coast Range. Phytopathology, 95: 1256-1265.
Marks G.C., Smith I.W., Cook I.O. (1989): Spread of Dothistroma septospora in plantations of Pinus radiata in Victoria between 1979 and 1988. Australian Forestry, 52: 10-12.
Martin S. (2011): Species and provenance choice in a changing climate. Forestry \& Timber News, August 2011: 20-21. Oswald H. (1984): Production et sylviculture du douglas en plantations. Revue forestière française, XXXVI: 268-278.
Petkova K. (1999): Comparative assessment of the height growth of 55 provenances of Douglas-fir (Pseudotsuga menziesii Mirb. Franco). Forestry ideas, 5: 48-59. (in Bulgarian with English abstract)
Petkova K. (2011): Investigation of Douglas-Fir provenance test in NW Bulgaria at Age 20. Forestry Ideas, 17: 131-140. Popov E. (1995): First results of eight years continuing provenance trial with Douglas-fir (Pseudotsuga menziensii (Mirb.) Franco) in the State Forestry Estate "Kostenec". In: Brezin V., Yovkov I., Dinkov B., Pavlova E., Vasilev V., Draganova I. (eds): Proceedings of Anniversary Scientific Session 70 Years Forestry Education in Bulgaria. Sofia, 7.-9. June 1995. Sofia, Higher Institute of Forestry, I: 230-238. (in Bulgarian with English abstract)
Popov E. (2001): First results of eight years continuing provenance trial with Douglas-fir (Pseudotsuga menziensii (Mirb.) Franco) in the State Forestry Estate "Kjustendil". In: Naydenova T., Raev I., Alexandrov A., Rosnev B., Marinov I., Vasilev V., Tsakov H., Petrova R.,

Groseva M., Grigorov G. (eds): Proceedings of the $3^{\text {rd }}$ balkan scientific conference Study, Conservation und Utilization of Forest Resources. Sofia, 2.- 6. October 2001. Sofia, Academic Publishers Marin Drinov, II: 60-68. (in Bulgarian with English abstract)
Popov E. (2011): Height and coefficient of stability of trees in Douglas-fir provenance trial plantation in Kostenets region. Plant Studies, I: 94-99. (in Bulgarian with English abstract)
Popov E. (2012): Study on growth performance and survival in Douglas-fir trial plantation in Kostenets region I. Diameter and Survival. Plant Studies, II: 73-77. (in Bulgarian with English abstract)
Popov E. (2013): Study on growth performance and survival in Douglas-fir trial plantation in Kostenets region II. productivity of stands. Plant Studies, III: 91-95. (in Bulgarian with English abstract)
Poryazov Y., Tonchev T., Dobrichov I. (2004): Handbook of forest measurement. Sofia, Bulvark: 419. (in Bulgarian)

St. Clair J.B., Howe G.T. (2007): Genetic maladaptation of coastal Douglas-fir seedlings to future climates. Global Change Biology, 13: 1441-1454.
Temel F., Stone J.K., Johnson G.R. (2003): First report of Swiss needle cast caused by Phaeocryptopus gaeumannii on Douglas-fir in Turkey. Plant Disease, 87: 1536.
Watt M.S., Stone J.K., Hood I.A., Palmer D.J. (2010): Predicting the severity of Swiss needle cast on Douglas-fir under current and future climate in New Zealand. Forest Ecology and Management, 260: 2232-2240.
Weller A. (2010): Findings from long-termed forest growth inventory data from 14 trial sites in the II. In: In: Opportunities and Risks for Douglas Fir in a Changing Climate. Freiburg, 18.-20. October 2010. Albert-LudwigsUniversität Freiburg: 18.
Weller A. (2012): Douglasien-Provenienzversuch von 1961 in Nordwestdeutschland: Ergebnisse nach 38 Jahren. Schweizerische Zeitschrift für Forstwesen, 163: 105-114.

Received for publication January 28, 2014
Accepted after corrections May 12, 2014

## Corresponding author:

Krasimira Petkova, University of Forestry, 1797 Sofia, Kl. Ochridski blvd. 10, Bulgaria; e-mail: kpet@abv.bg


[^0]:    Presented at the NFZ Summer School 2013: Douglas fir, opportunities and risks for European Forestry. Esthal, 9.-13.9. 2013.

